



1. Project Data

Project ID P174166	Project Name Togo COVID-19 Education Response (GPE)	
Country Togo	Practice Area(Lead) Education	
L/C/TF Number(s) TF-B3360	Closing Date (Original) 31-Dec-2021	Total Project Cost (USD) 6,839,172.46
Bank Approval Date 18-Aug-2020	Closing Date (Actual) 30-Jun-2022	
	IBRD/IDA (USD)	Grants (USD)
Original Commitment	6,850,000.00	6,850,000.00
Revised Commitment	6,850,000.00	6,839,172.46
Actual	6,839,172.46	6,839,172.46

Prepared by Rosen Asenov	Reviewed by Eduardo Fernandez Maldonado	ICR Review Coordinator Eduardo Fernandez Maldonado	Group IEGHC (Unit 2)
------------------------------------	--	---	--------------------------------

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives

As stated in the Grant Agreement (GPE Grant Number TF0B3360, dated September 04, 2020, between the Republic of Togo (“Recipient”) and the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (“Bank”), acting as Grant Agent of the Global Partnership for Education Fund (“GPE”), p. 5), the Project Development Objective was “...to increase access to distance learning in grades 1-9 and support the safe and effective re-opening of schools.” The Project Appraisal Document (PAD, p. 11) and the Project Restructuring Paper (p. 1) articulated the same objective. The PDO remained unchanged throughout the life of the project.



b. Were the project objectives/key associated outcome targets revised during implementation?

No

c. Will a split evaluation be undertaken?

No

d. Components

Component 1: Ensuring Education continuity (Original allocation: \$1.13 million; Actual expenditure: \$0.59 million). Component 1 aimed to ensure education continuity in order to prevent learning losses during school closures by: (i) supporting multimodal distance learning for grades 1 to 9 students; and (ii) providing support to teachers, parents and caregivers for effective distance and home-based schooling.

Component 2: Supporting safe schools re-opening and student re-entry (Original allocation: \$4.90 million; Actual expenditure: \$5.22 million). Component 2 aimed to support the safe re-opening of schools, as well as learning assessment and recovery plans by providing safe and healthy learning environments for students, teachers, and school staff; providing targeted school grants to support readiness and functioning of School Management Committees (SMC) while awaiting the transfer of Government-allocated school grants; and carrying out back-to-school media campaigns and remedial programs for at-risk students.

Component 3: Project Management, Capacity building and Monitoring and Evaluation (Original allocation: \$ 0.82 million; Actual expenditure: \$1.03 million). Next to Project management and M&E, Component 3 - based on consolidated and build upon lessons from the Covid-19 crisis - provided (i) technical assistance to The Ministry of Primary, Secondary, and Technical Education and Crafts / Ministère des Enseignements Primaire, Secondaire, Technique et de l'Artisanat (MEPSTA) for developing a multimodal distance learning approach that takes into account the Togolese context and the education sector's needs; and (ii) the equipment of a remote working platform, including a video conference system, to support the MEPSTA's capacity to work remotely.

e. Comments on Project Cost, Financing, Borrower Contribution, and Dates

Cost. The total actual cost of the project was \$6.84 million, or over 99 percent of the original estimate of \$6.85 million. The actual cost of Component 1 was around half of its original allocation due to unutilized amounts for purchasing software for the remote learning platform, and the lower actual amount spent on supporting teachers, parents, and caregivers for effective distance/home-based schooling. The unutilized amounts under Component 1 (around \$0.5 million) were used under Components 2 and 3, which enabled the full utilization of the Project grant and contributed to achieving or surpassing envisaged project outputs and outcomes. The actual cost of Component 2 was around 7 percent higher (or \$320,000 more) than the original allocation due to: (1) almost a third higher than expected cost of purchasing handwashing stations, as due to local capacity constraints suitable materials for some of the handwashing stations came at a higher cost as they had to be imported; and (2) higher than planned cost of school grants as by the time the project became effective the number of basic education schools in Togo had grown from 10,521 to 10,613.



Component 3's actual cost was 22 percent higher (or \$200,000 more) than the original estimate due to the higher actual cost of project management activities (sub-component 3.1).

Financing and Borrower Contribution: The project was financed by a Global Partnership for Education (GPE) grant. Of the original grant in the amount of \$6,850,000, \$6,839,172 (99.8 percent) were disbursed. No contribution from the Borrower was planned or delivered.

Dates: The Project became effective on October 9, 2020, less than two months after its approval on August 18, 2020. The mid-term review took place on May 17, 2021. The project was restructured on December 22, 2021 a few days before the original closing date of December 31, 2021, at which time an amount of \$6.01 million had been disbursed, or 88 percent of the total actual disbursements (\$6.84 million). The Restructuring involved a six-month extension of the closing date (from December 31, 2021 to June 30, 2022) to allow completing pending activities so to ensure the achievement of all envisaged outputs and outcomes of the operation, as well as the full disbursement of the Project's outstanding balance of \$840,000. This change was reflected in the Project's results framework, loan closing date, disbursement estimates and implementation schedule.

3. Relevance of Objectives

Rationale

The PDO is relevant to current country conditions. In March, 2020, the government of Togo (GoT) in its efforts to reduce the spread of the coronavirus closed all preschools, primary and secondary schools, vocational training centers and universities, leaving over 2.6 million children out of school and 75,413 teachers unable to teach. This could negatively affect the country's education system and human capital formation in many ways, among which: increasing learning inequalities, deterioration of children's nutritional and health status, higher dropouts, especially among girls and disadvantaged children, increased school repetition, decrease in parental and government spending on education, poorer quality of teaching and a decline in the overall quality of education. To reduce the negative impacts of the Covid-19 pandemic on Togo's education system and human capital, the GoT adopted a sector national preparedness and response plan with three objectives: (i) ensure continuity of learning; (ii) prepare for school re-opening and support safe practices in schools; and (iii) reinforce system resilience (PAD, p. 9). This GPE-funded Project is in line with Togo's national preparedness and response plan, as it aims to support continued learning during the Covid-19 pandemic, support safe and effective re-opening of schools, contribute to learning recovery, and contribute to strengthening the resilience of Togo's education system to the ongoing Covid-19 crisis and future crises.

The PDO is relevant to Togo's current development priorities. The Project objectives are in line with the objectives set out in Togo's National Development Plan (NDP) for 2018-2022 - which provides a framework for integrating and implementing the Sustainable Development Goals – namely, increasing access to and quality of education; addressing social exclusion; increasing access to drinking water and sanitation services; and strengthening the performance of the public administration.

Moreover, the PDO is relevant to the Bank's Country Partnership Framework (CPF) for FY 17-20 (extended to FY22) in place during the Project's (extended) life. The Bank's CPF identifies weak governance, poor human development and inequality as key constraints to reducing poverty and helping



the country shift from a low-income fragile state to an emerging economy with a robust, inclusive and sustainable growth. The Project attempts to address these constraints by addressing emergency needs for equitable learning continuity and recovery, and disease prevention, as well as strengthening institutional capacities in the education sector. Specifically, the Project objectives are aligned with CPF's: (i) Second Focus Area: Inclusive Public Service Delivery, which aims to address the weak quality of education services and the skills mismatch, with special attention to gender, particularly in secondary and higher education, and (ii) the cross-cutting theme of governance and institutions (i.e. the CPF supports the strengthening of key government institutions involved in delivering results under each Focus Area). Additionally, the Project is well aligned with the Bank's commitment to support countries in managing the impact of the Covid-19 crisis on the education sector, and GPE's goals of: (a) ensuring that all children master basic literacy and numeracy in early grades; (b) building national systems that have capacity and integrity to deliver, support and assess education quality; and (c) targeting the most marginalized groups, including schools in rural and remote communities.

Rating

High

4. Achievement of Objectives (Efficacy)

OBJECTIVE 1

Objective

To increase access to distance learning for grades 1-9.

Rationale

The theory of change (results chain) was built on the premise that increasing the access to distance/home-based schooling for grades 1-9 students can enable these students to continue learning during the school closures caused by the Covid-19 pandemic (ICR, p. 7, and Figure 1, p. 8; and PAD, p. 12, and Figure D, p. 18).

To this end, the theory of change (results chain), as stated in the ICR (pp. 7-10), consisted of the following:

- Supporting multimodal remote learning for grades 1-9 to reach most learners in Togo - given the context of inequitable access to connectivity and basic technologies - considering equity factors, such as age group, education levels, geographical location, place of residency, socioeconomic status, gender, learner with disabilities (PAD, p. 12) through: (i) delivery of remote learning lessons via local radios and national televisions; (ii) provision of printed materials, including braille materials developed for visually impaired students; and (iii) acquisition of the necessary software for establishing MEPSTA's distance learning platform.
- Training primary and secondary teachers and school inspectors in distance learning content development and/or teaching methods.



- Supporting parents and caregivers to be involved in home-based schooling and able to monitor children at home so to ensure effective distance/home-based schooling and relay gender-based messages through sensitization campaigns aimed to increase awareness on the importance of girls' education and spread gender-based messages aimed to reduce the negative impacts of school closures. These messages targeted all community members, with a focus on girls.

Outputs and intermediate results

- **A total of 1,298,581 children received learning kits, stationary packages and printed materials, surpassing the target of 982,507.** Printed learning materials were distributed to all targeted students, except for grades 6 and 9 students, who during the schools' partial re-opening in June, 2020 received in person support for the preparation of end-of-cycle exams. Distribution of printed materials was the most effective remote learning modality, reaching over 59 percent of the targeted students. However, the insufficient budget, the project envisaged printed learning materials to be distributed only once.
- **Remote learning content was delivered to students (grades 1-9) via national and community radios and televisions** (i.e., TVT and NEW WORLD TV). At the primary level (grade 1 to 5), one French lesson was broadcasted in national television twice a week (i.e., 10 French lessons per week); at the secondary level (grades 6, 7, 8, and 9), one lesson was broadcasted once a week in French, Mathematics, English, Physics, Chemistry and Technology. The use of radio and TV to support remote learning started shortly before schools' re-opening and continued for six months from June to December, 2020 with the same frequency as before schools' re-opening. **A total of 368,785 of the targeted students (16.8 percent) were reached through radio and TV programs.**
- **A total of 311 teachers were trained in using distance learning methods and/or provided materials to support distance learning, exceeding the target of 261 teachers.** The breakdown of the trained 311 teachers by primary and secondary education teachers was not provided in the ICR.
- While not specified as an output in the results framework, **a total of 118 school inspectors were trained in distance learning content development and teaching methods, attaining the target.** As noted at the interview with the Project's Task Team Leader (TTL), dated March 7, 2023, while not part of the Grant Agreement, this activity was included in the PAD based on the discussions and agreement between the Bank and the GoT about the need for a systemic approach to distance education in order to ensure its effectiveness, which required in addition to training teachers, school inspectors to be trained in using technology for providing guidance and support to teachers in delivering distance learning.
- **Technical assistance was provided to MoE for the expansion of distance learning across all education levels, taking into account equity factors and the Togolese context.**
- **The MEPSTA was equipped with a remote working platform, including a VC system, for virtual meetings and more effective remote work.** A reliable internet and video conference (VC) connectivity, remote access and laptops for senior officials were provided.
- **a Health-SABER diagnostic was carried out to help the GoT to assess the state of its school health and feeding policy.** The findings from this diagnosis were to be leveraged under the follow-on project, Improving Quality and Equity of Basic Education Project - PAQEED (P172674).

Note: The envisaged support for the establishment of the MEPSTA distance learning platform by financing the acquisition of the necessary software was not delivered based on a mutual agreement between the GoT and the WBG that it was over-ambitious given the insufficient Project timeframe and budget and it would be supported under the follow-on project, PAQEED (P172674).



Outcomes

- **Almost 75% of grades 1-9 children were supported with distance learning/home-based learning in 2022, far exceeding the target of 50%.**
- **Around 75% of female students in 1-9 grade were supported with distance/home based learning in 2022, significantly overachieving the target of 50%;**
- **The percentage of children supported with distance learning/home-based learning in the region of Lomé reached 69.50 in 2022, thus surpassing the target of 50 percent;**

Component 1's objective was to ensure education continuity during school closures by increasing access of 1-9 grades students to distance learning through radio, television and printed learning materials (sub-component 1.1) and supporting teachers, parents and caregivers for effective home-based schooling (sub-component 1.2). The targeted students, however, had limited access to the multimodal distance learning opportunities supported by the project. Only about 17 percent of the targeted students were reached through radio and television education programs. The distributed printed learning materials in Mathematics had a far greater outreach (about 60 percent of the targeted students). However, due to insufficient budget, printed materials in Mathematics were planned to be delivered only once during the life of the project, which happened with a delay. Also, due to the need to adhere to social distancing measures, the training of 115 secondary teachers in distance learning content development and teaching methods was delayed (Restructuring Paper, p. 5). In November, 2021, a month before the project end, about 35 percent of the envisaged 50 percent of the students in grades 1-9 were supported with distance learning (ISR 2, p. 10, dated 12/9/2021). By the extended project end, this target was exceeded and around 75 percent of grades 1-9 students benefited from remote learning activities but the delays in the delivery of these activities resulted in their implementation around school reopening, instead of during school closures as planned (ISR 4, p. 2, dated 7/8/2022). Notwithstanding the challenges related to the delayed delivery of and limited access to multimodal distance learning activities, in an interview (dated March 7, 2023), the task team noted that remote learning activities remained relevant to the learning continuity's PDO level objective, as they could be used to mitigate learning losses stemming from further disruption to education caused by the Covid-19 pandemic and they also contributed to learning recovery after schools reopened by complementing school-based learning.

While the objective of Component 1 was fully achieved given that all outcome targets were achieved or exceeded by the (extended) end of the project, the expected under Component 1 education continuity during school closures was not implemented in a sufficiently prompt and effective way, as indicated by implementation delays and limited outreach of multimodal distance learning activities during school closures. The ICR does not discuss whether and to what extent the students with access to multimodal distance learning took advantage of it to continue learning while schools were closed. For home-based schooling to be effective, the Project provided support to parents and caregivers to ensure their involvement in home-based schooling and ability to monitor children at home. Specifically, this support included carrying out awareness raising campaigns on the availability and importance of participating in distance learning, and the importance of education continuity and girls' education during the crisis (sub-component 1.2). While not offering a more detailed assessment of the efficacy of the support provided to parents and caregivers for effective home-based schooling during school closures, the ICR reports a lesson of this project that without proper support – beyond the awareness raising campaigns implemented under sub-component 1.2 - it was hard for parents and caregivers to engage in effective home-based schooling during school closures (ICR, p. 29). While Objective 1 was achieved by the extended end of the project, implementation delays, limited access to and unclear effectiveness of both the remote learning activities (sub-component 1.1) and the support provided to



parents and caregivers (sub-component 1.2) for ensuring education continuity during school closures results in a substantial rating.

Rating

Substantial

OBJECTIVE 2

Objective

Support the safe and effective re-opening of schools

Rationale

The project's theory of change envisioned that re-opening of schools and keeping learners safe can be achieved through: (a) provision of access to water, sanitation, and hygiene (WASH) services; (b) equipping schools and staff with prevention tools and measures such as distribution of masks and disinfecting schools; (c) the payment of three months salaries to volunteers' teachers (EVs) to ensure the schools' re-opening with all teachers present in schools; (d) provision of targeted school grants to support readiness and functioning of the school management committees (SMCs); (e) the undertaking of post-crisis student learning assessments that inform follow-on remedial programs for at-risk students; and (f) the implementation of back-to-school campaigns, as well as a communication campaign to raise awareness for the Covid-19 prevention (PAD, p. 13, Figure D, p. 18 and ICR, p. 7, and Figure 1, p. 8).

Outputs and intermediate results

- **Ensured schools re-opening with all teachers present through payment of the salary for three months of 8,849 volunteer teachers not supported by the cash transfer platform put in place by the GoT during the COVID-19 crisis.** This represented an equivalent of FCFA 422 million (US\$767,272), around FCFA 22,000 (US\$40) per teacher per month.
- **School grants provided to 6,095 primary and general secondary schools for a total amount of USD 1.22 million exceeding the target of 5,700 schools.** SMCs were trained in the management and use of school grants, and monitoring of school activities. They played a key role in managing and monitoring Project activities in beneficiary schools, including the management of school grants and WASH activities, and maintenance of handwashing stations. According to the Project beneficiary survey, 94.5% of respondents attested that school grants were efficiently managed by SMCs.
- **Back-to-school media campaigns were carried out.** SMCs played a key role in relaying gender-based messages aimed at raising awareness on the importance of girls' education and minimizing the negative impacts of school closures.
- **A communication campaign was implemented to raise awareness on the importance of girls' education and Covid-19 prevention** targeting parents, teachers, students, school staff and the community (distributed 598,230 posters and flyers to relay important messages on disease prevention, audio spots were produced in French and 18 national languages and broadcasted on 36 community radio stations, along with interactive programs hosted in radio stations across the country).
- **A total of 2,195,149 children accessed the sensitization campaigns aimed at minimizing the negative impacts of school closures such as gender-based violence and issues related to unequal social norms, exceeding the target of 1,965,014.** The project experienced delays in the



implementation of sensitization campaigns due to Covid-19-related restrictions and the need to adhere to social distancing protocols.

- **The share of schools that re-opened was 98.9 percent, exceeding the target of 90 percent.**
- **Simple school-based learning assessments were conducted for grades 1-9 students at schools' re-opening** to identify at-risk students. Of the targeted schools, 98.2 percent took part in the assessment, 80.7 percent of students from grades 1-7 were assessed, 55 percent of students were found to be "at risk" students (55.1 percent boys and 54.8 percent girls).
- **The share of schools that offered remedial programs once the school system was re-opened reached 87.6 percent, surpassing the target of 70 percent.** The remedial programs focused on foundational competencies (reading and numeracy) at the lower primary level (grades 1-3), Math and Language at the upper primary level (grades 4, 5), and Math, French, English, and Physics, Chemistry, Technology at the junior secondary level (grades 6-9).
- **In 2021, a total of 2,195,149 students benefited from direct interventions to enhance learning, attaining the target.** All students enrolled in grant-supported schools (i.e., schools that received school grants) under the Project benefited from direct interventions to enhance learning.
- **A total 1,059,600 female students benefited from direct interventions to enhance learning, attaining the target.**

Outcomes

- **A total of 10,613 grants-supported schools were equipped with minimum hygiene standards for prevention of Covid-19, exceeding the target of 10,528.** The Project supported the provision of sanitary protocols, masks, hand soap and sanitizers in all targeted schools. This included the installation of 10,118 handwashing stations in beneficiary schools (all targeted schools used the school grants to acquire artisan-made handwashing stations); distribution of 2,000,000 sanitary protocols; provision of 120,000 liters of soap and hand-washing kits, as well as 1,200,000 face coverings for students, teachers, and school staff).
- **Almost 98 percent of the targeted children (2,195,149) returned to school once the school system was reopened, exceeding the target of 80 percent.**
- **Around 98 percent of the targeted girls returned to school once the school system was reopened, exceeding the target of 80 percent.**
- **Of the targeted students with disability, 99,3 percent returned to school once the school system was reopened, exceeding the target of 80 percent.**
- **Teachers and school heads reported a positive impact from administering learning assessments followed by a remedial program.** According to the ICR (p. 37), although learning assessments and remedial programs were implemented with some delays, "at risk students" that participated in the remedial programs were performing above expectations in upper grades, and the Ministry intends to adopt the administering of regular simple school-based learning assessments followed by remedial programs throughout the school-year.

The objective is assessed as fully achieved since all of the envisaged outcomes were either achieved or exceeded by the project end.

Rating



High

OVERALL EFFICACY

Rationale

Each of the two objectives (increase access to distance learning for grades 1-9 and support the safe and effective re-opening of schools) was met and all PDO targets were either achieved or exceeded by the Project's (extended) end - contributing to, among others, low dropout rates and high percentage of student re-entry at school re-opening. Almost 98 percent of the targeted basic school students (2,151,246 out of 2,195,149) returned to school against the target of 80 percent and, as indicated by the national survey conducted under the project, the dropouts were mainly due to illness, pregnancies, and/or family relocation. The Project also contributed to strengthened institutional capacities and better preparedness of the education sector to provide equitable access to continued education during times of crises.

According to the ICR (pp. 20-21), in addition to achieving the PDO, the Project contributed to institutional strengthening, which increased the education system's resilience to the ongoing pandemic and future crises. This included:

- **Increased capacity of the Ministry of Education to design equitable remote learning programs.**
- **Improved capacity of teachers and inspectors to develop remote learning resources and teaching methods.**
- **Enhanced national, regional and school-level capacities for designing and administering formative learning assessments and implementing remedial programs informed by these assessments.** According to the Project's beneficiary survey, 97 percent of respondents were satisfied with the quality of training received, although due to its short duration (i.e., one day) some teachers were still unable to effectively administer learning assessments, pointing to the need for additional support in this area. Further strengthening for all of these activities was expected under the PAQEEB (P172674), which supports strengthening of the National Learning Assessment System as well as the National Learning Assessment Unit's capacity to measure and monitor learning outcomes.
- **Improved ability of School-Based Management Committees to manage and use school grants, and monitor school activities.** The Project's beneficiary survey showed that school grants were efficiently managed by SMCs and they considered the respective training to be beneficial.
- **Strengthened capacity of the Ministry of Education to work virtually and more effectively,** including through its good appropriation of the Geo-enabling method for monitoring and supervision (GEMS) that enables carrying out remote real-time M&E activities. The Project supported capacity-building activities online or in-country for relevant MEPSTA and Project Coordination Unit (PCU) staff. A total of 383 MEPSTA' officials from the regional directorates of education and school inspections, PCU staff, and Project implementation leads, received training in monitoring of activities using GEMS.

While Togo still needs to improve significantly on its human capital development in order to reach its full economic potential, further reduce poverty and increase shared prosperity (ICR, p. 21), the Project contributed to mitigating the negative effects of the Covid-19 pandemic on Togo's human capital. And since human capital development is a prerequisite for poverty reduction and economic growth, the Project's achievements if not directly contributing to these ends, helped reducing the negative impact of the Covid-19



crisis on Togo's human capital gains achieved before the pandemic and thus contributed to Togo's ability to stay on the path to growth and shared prosperity.

Attribution

Urgent actions under the Government's Covid-19 Response Plan were implemented not only through this GPE-funded project but also with support from the Government and – to a much lesser extent – other international partners such as UNICEF, UNDP, Humanité & Inclusion, and Help and Action (ICR, p. 17). As indicated by the TTL, compared to other international partners that were engaged in Togo, the GPE-funded Project had the greatest outreach as it targeted all basic education schools and introduced remote learning across the entire country, and therefore, the bulk of the reported achievements in the education sector under the Government's Covid-19 Response Plan is to be directly attributed to this Project and the Government-supported interventions. Furthermore, this was a forward-looking project that went above and beyond a typical emergency project by supporting not only the Government's short-to-medium term emergency response to the crisis that affected the education sector but also contributing to increasing the education sector's resilience to future shocks by strengthening the country's capacities to deliver remote learning, develop and administer large-scale learning assessments and use their results to inform remedial programs that were introduced under the Project, which the Government intends to mainstream.

Counterfactual

Learning outcomes in Togo were low before the Covid-19 pandemic and even worse among students from poor, rural, and marginalized households. Around 2,6 million children were out of school when schools closed due to the Covid-19 pandemic. As reported by the TTL, due to the uncertainty and risks related to the Covid-19 pandemic, many parents were afraid to send their children back to school. If no actions were taken to ensure uninterrupted learning and safe and effective re-opening of schools, learning outcomes would have deteriorated and learning inequalities would have deepened because, as noted in the ICR (p. 49), only students from wealthier and more educated families were likely to have the support to learn at home. The TTL noted that the Project played an important role for mitigating the risks of learning loss, school dropout and repetition due to the Covid-19 crisis through the support it provided for ensuring learning continuity and recovery, and safe re-opening of schools which helped the parents overcome their fears, as demonstrated by the fact that almost 98 percent of the targeted children (2,195,149) returned to school once the school system was re-opened. All this suggests that the Project contributed to mitigating the negative impact that the Covid-19 pandemic could have had on Togo's education system and the country's already weak human development and limited inclusion. Furthermore, a learning assessment would not have been undertaken, nor the evidence-based remedial programs to raise the performance of students who were not performing to grade level, nor the capacity or path to institutionalizing this very important aspect of Togo's education sector.

Overall Efficacy Rating

Substantial

5. Efficiency



Economic efficiency. A cost-benefit analysis was conducted at the time of project appraisal. The cost of higher repetition rates due to school closures was estimated under two scenarios: (1) the public sector would incur the equivalent of CFA 352.6 million (about US\$0.6 million) in losses and households would incur inefficiency-related costs equivalent CFA 805.5 million (about US\$1.37 million) at primary and secondary levels under the first scenario of 0.5 percent increase in repetition rates; and (ii) under the second scenario, a 1 percent increase in repetition rates, could cost the public sector about CFA 1,058.8 million (about US\$1.80 million) at the primary and secondary levels, and would cost households about CFA 1,610.9 million (about US\$2.73 million) at the primary and secondary levels (PAD, p. 24). As benefits of investments in education in Togo were identified higher returns on education and better employment opportunities to individuals and households, as well as reduced inequality in access to education and post-education labour market outcomes (PAD, p. 24). At the national level, one additional year of schooling was found to increase income by 13 percent. The rate of return on education ranged from 67 percent for individuals with some primary education to 217 percent for individuals with higher education when compared to individuals with no education. Also, compared to individuals with no education, those with some primary education and those with TVET education were respectively 62 percent and 160 percent more likely to find wage employment. (PAD, pp. 58-59).

An ex-post economic analysis was undertaken as part of ICR preparation, which measured the quantifiable benefits of Component 1 and sub-component 2.3 through the impact of additional remote learning opportunities and remedial program on lifetime income. The percent of targeted basic school students with access to remote learning increased from a baseline of 0 percent to 79.7 percent (1,298,581 students) at the end of the project. A conservative assumption was made that this had increased the targeted students' expected years of schooling by a year (please see the Note below). Multiplied by the returns to one additional year of primary or secondary schooling, the project impact was estimated as increasing lifetime earnings by 13 percent for each project beneficiary. The analysis concluded that the project's quantifiable benefits had a positive net present value (NPV) and an internal rate of return (IRR), thereby demonstrating the project's efficiency and strongly supporting the investment on the project. The present value of the overall project benefits was estimated to be US\$ 971.4 million while the present value of costs was estimated to be US\$ 174.2 million. The corresponding NPV of the intervention benefits was US\$ 797.2 million. The IRR associated with this NPV was 28.7 percent (ICR, pp. 52-54). Annex 4 of the ICR provided underlying assumptions and other details.

Note: While a year of remote schooling may not be directly equivalent to a year of in-person schooling, this remains a conservative assumption. It accounts for the increase in the quality of remote teaching and learning, as well as bearing the fixed cost of implementing many of these new remote technologies, as this project will likely benefit many more than the 9 cohorts studied in this analysis.

Implementation Efficiency. Due to delays associated mostly with Covid-19 restrictions, remote learning activities were only implemented around the time of school re-opening, instead of during school closures. Nevertheless, they remained relevant to the learning continuity's PDO-level objective. Training in distance learning content development and teaching methods for the 115 secondary school teachers that remained to be trained was delayed mainly due the need to adhere to Covid-19-related social distancing measures, and, as reported at the TTL interview, partly because this was an innovative training and there was a need for more time to adjust to it and prepare training materials in distance learning. Due to the high expense of printed materials for all learners (grade 1-9), which exceeded the budget, the distribution of printed learning materials was delayed (Restructuring paper, p. 5). The implementation of simple school-based learning assessment to students (grades 1-9) and condensed remedial programs were also delayed because it had taken longer for the learning assessment tool to be adapted to the Togolese context. The project implementation period was extended by six months, which enabled the implementation of pending activities: (i) the development of the strategy for the establishment of the distance learning platform; (ii) the distribution of handwashing stations in



the remaining 5,395 targeted primary and secondary schools; (iii) the payment of volunteer teachers' (volunteer teachers not covered by the NOVISSI's platform due to lack of required identification documentation); and (iv) the deployment of the Systems Approach for Better Education Results Assessment on school health and feeding (Health-SABER).

Above-cited delays notwithstanding, implementation efficiency was substantial. Considering the obstacles associated with Covid-19 restrictions, the implementation of all pending activities and achievement of all envisaged outputs and outcomes within that six-month extension, as well as the full disbursement of the Project's outstanding balance of US\$840,000, represents a notable achievement. GPE funds were fully utilized, with the GPE grant of \$6,85 million fully (99.8 percent) disbursed. Outcome targets were achieved or exceeded, and positive impacts beyond the PDO were reported. For two of the three project components, actual component costs remained close to original estimates. The exception was lower than the estimated cost of Component 1: Ensuring Education Continuity (estimated \$1,13 million versus \$0,59 million approved at project closing), which was partly due to a modification to the planned project activity under sub-component 1.1 related to acquiring a software to support a distance learning platform. The activity was not delivered as it was considered overambitious given the Project's insufficient budget and timeframe. It was agreed that the project would focus only on the development of the strategy for the establishment of the distance learning platform, while the remote learning platform was going to be established under PAQEEB (P172674) through the acquisition of the necessary software and hardware (ICR, p. 15).

Efficiency Rating

Substantial

a. If available, enter the Economic Rate of Return (ERR) and/or Financial Rate of Return (FRR) at appraisal and the re-estimated value at evaluation:

	Rate Available?	Point value (%)	*Coverage/Scope (%)
Appraisal		0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable
ICR Estimate		0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable

* Refers to percent of total project cost for which ERR/FRR was calculated.

6. Outcome

The PDO was highly relevant to the current country situation, the government's development priorities and its Covid-19 Response Plan, as well as the WBG's current strategy in Togo and the Bank's commitment to providing a fast and flexible response to the Covid-19 pandemic. Efficacy is rated as substantial. By the Project's end both objectives embedded in the PDO were achieved, targets were achieved or exceeded, and institutional strengthening impacts beyond the PDO were reported. However, there were delays with regard to some outputs that had to be delivered within the Project's short-to-medium term response, resulting in the targeted students' limited access to remote learning during school closures. The project timeline had to be



extended in order to implement pending activities. Delays in implementation notwithstanding (due largely to Covid-19-related restrictions), the project completed all planned activities and was fully disbursed within the six-month extension. Project efficiency was also substantial overall. The strong economic rationale for investing in education and the robust results of the cost-benefit analysis before and after the project implementation, provide convincing evidence that the project was economically viable and efficient. The delays in the implementation of some activities were mainly due to Covid-19-related restrictions and country capacity constraints. These findings are consistent with a satisfactory overall outcome rating, reflecting only minor shortcomings in the project's preparation, implementation, and achievement.

a. Outcome Rating
Satisfactory

7. Risk to Development Outcome

Improved institutional capacities were sustained and extend beyond the current emergency, as they would be useful for future crises affecting the education sector. Capacity risks identified at the project's outset were mitigated through (i) providing greater access to remote and hybrid education; (ii) ensuring better quality education through the improved capacity to conduct formative learning assessments and remedial programs; and (iii) improving MoE's capacity to work virtually. These institutional capacities are going to be maintained and further improved under PAQEEB (P172674), which will end in October, 2026 and aims to: (i) expand distance learning interventions through the deployment of a multimodal distance learning platform; and (ii) carry out remedial programs with the support of performance-based school grants. As reported at the TTL interview (dated March 7, 2023), schools in Togo have already developed harmonized school improvement plans which envisage administering formative learning assessments and conducting remedial programs, expected to take place during the 2023-2024 school year. This suggests that the development outcomes achieved under the GPE-funded Project will likely be sustained and further improved at least until 2026, when the successor project - PAQEEB (P172674) is expected to end.

As indicated by the task team, there are two major risks to sustaining the development outcomes achieved under this GPE-funded project: (1) the learning loss risk that stems from the ongoing Covid-19 pandemic; and (2) the Government's ownership of the innovations in the education sector introduced by the GPE-funded project. The GoT's commitment to increase access to and quality of education was reaffirmed in GoT's new national 2025 roadmap. Furthermore, the GoT has indicated its intention to provide performance-linked funding for maintaining regular administration of learning assessments and hybrid learning programs, and has already developed a clear agenda on digitalization and ICT-based distance learning. Still, it is yet to be seen whether and how effectively these will be implemented, also given that such activities are expensive to maintain and the public expenditure on education declined from on average 18 percent of the total expenditure over the period 2009-2019 to below 15 percent in 2022.

8. Assessment of Bank Performance

a. Quality-at-Entry



The Investment Project Financing funding modality of this GPE-funded project was suitable as it allowed Togo's education sector to implement the needed response to the Covid-19 crisis, and included technical assistance and institutional strengthening to support the implementation of remote education and learning recovery activities, which Togo's education sector was insufficiently prepared to design and implement. The Project design was based on emerging international good practices on the education sector's response to Covid-19 that could be applied to the Togolese context to mitigate the negative effects stemming from the Covid-19 pandemic on the education sector. The Project's theory of change was sound and evidence-based, the selected activities were logically linked to the Project's overarching objectives, and fully aligned with the Education Sector Covid-19 Response Plan and the ESP (2020/30). The Sector's Covid-19 Response Plan was based on the GoT's commitment to mitigate learning losses and reduce the risk of school dropouts and repetitions. The Project was designed with a view not only to provide an emergency response in the education sector to the Covid-19 crisis, but also to go beyond that by strengthening the education system's resilience and ability to effectively respond to the ongoing and future shocks to Togo's education sector. The original project design was well aligned with the Bank's CPF (FY17- 22) and GPE's goals on mitigating the negative impact of Covid-19 on education systems. The design quality was enriched by consideration of WBG and GPE peer reviewers' recommendations. Preparation for the Project was a highly collaborative and consultative process with strong participation by both the GoT and the Local Education Group (LEG), led by UNICEF and including education partners and civil society within the already existing partnership framework (PAD, pp. 21-22).

The design teams identified risks and activities for their mitigation, and relevant technical expertise was brought to the design process. The overarching risk was the Covid-19 pandemic itself, as when the Project was prepared, the negative effects of Covid-19 were still unfolding and threatening to deepen existing challenges faced by the education sector. The main mitigation measures included: (a) the development and implementation of multimodal distance learning programs, taking into account children with disabilities; (b) providing minimum sanitary and hygiene standards in schools to prevent and reduce the spread of the Covid-19 disease; and (c) administering learning assessments followed by remedial programs to further mitigate the learning loss. Risks associated with Project design included: (i) MEPSTA's limited capacity to develop necessary distance learning programs; (ii) low teachers' capacity to teach remotely; (iii) limited access to basic technologies; and (iv) connectivity challenges especially in rural and disadvantaged areas. Moreover, once schools re-opened, there was a risk that students would not return to school. Mitigation measures included, among others, ensuring strong ownership by MEPSTA and national ad hoc committee in place, with dedicated leaders and appropriate technical staff involved in implementation and monitoring. Implementation arrangements were adequately prepared, including institutional arrangements, financial management, procurement and social aspects, and grievance redress services (PAD, pp. 21-31).

A PCU in the MEPSTA had the overall responsibility for the management of the Project. An Interdepartmental Committee for the Management of the Covid-19 Pandemic Crisis in the Education Sector (ICMCES) was established with the responsibility to provide strategic guidance and coordination among line ministries and donors and review the implementation progress of this project and other interventions that were part of the country's Covid-19 education sector response. Additionally, a Project Steering Committee (PSC) for the GPE Covid-19 Education Response Project under the MEPS was set up. The project's institutional and implementation arrangements were built on the implementation of the Education and Institutional Strengthening Project 2 (PERI-2) that closed in 2019. The project design was informed by lessons learned from the previous GPE-funded projects (PERI-1 (2010-2014) and PERI-2 (2015-2019), P146294) and other recent education projects in Togo, particularly the AFD-funded Education for All project and UNICEF's education program (PAD, p. 19). Given the relevant and recent



experience of the PERI-2 team and the Project's urgency and short duration, members of the PERI-2 team were included in the Covid-19 PCU. It was also envisaged decentralized education authorities and communities to play a key role in the Project (PAD, pp. 20-21).

Quality-at-Entry Rating

Satisfactory

b. Quality of supervision

Key factors affecting project implementation on the GoT's part included the challenges associated with the Covid-19 pandemic, particularly the need to adhere to social distancing measures, and difficult remote working conditions for the implementing agencies, mainly related to internet connectivity challenges. As already mentioned, during implementation, the MEPSTA/PCU experienced challenges related to setting up a distance learning platform, which was not delivered as it was considered to be over-ambitious, and the acquisition and distribution of handwashing stations in schools were delayed. Additionally, the Project had to be restructured and extended by six months so that pending activities could be implemented and the unused funds fully utilized (ICR, pp. 23-24).

In regard to factors subject to the Bank's control, the Bank's supervision and implementation support were reportedly proactive and of high quality, which allowed early identification of implementation bottlenecks and measures to address them. A total of five supervision missions were carried out throughout the project properly staffed with education specialists, fiduciary and safeguards staff, and also an EdTech specialist for the first three missions. In addition, the Bank's team conducted virtual supervision missions, given the Covid-19 restrictions. Progress was documented in aide memoires, back-to-office reports, and ISRs. The Bank's task team consistently and regularly reported on financial management, procurement, and safeguards progress and compliance, and worked with the PCU and other implementation agencies to build their capacity in these areas. The task team maintained good communication with the PCU and project stakeholders, and weekly meetings were held to provide additional guidance to help solve urgent matters and bottlenecks as they arose (ICR, p. 24). The Bank's approval of the government's request for project extension and the proactive and supportive Bank task team enabled the completion of the few pending activities at the project's original end, which ensured the achievement of all envisaged project outputs and outcomes. For example, through holding unplanned weekly and bi-weekly supervision meetings, the Bank's task team contributed to overcoming the delays in the delivery of handwashing stations in targeted schools by the (extended) end of the project (ICR, p. 28).

Quality of Supervision Rating

Satisfactory

Overall Bank Performance Rating



Satisfactory

9. M&E Design, Implementation, & Utilization

a. M&E Design

The PDO was clearly stated. Indicators were measurable and with defined targets. M&E design and arrangements were well embedded institutionally, enabled robust and systematic tracking of project outputs and outcomes and included regular monitoring and reporting by the PCU. The Project's M&E system was strengthened by simple school-based learning assessments; a Geo-enabling Method for Monitoring and Supervision; a Systems Approach for Better Education Results Assessment on school health and feeding (Healthy-SABER); and a beneficiary survey (ICR, p. 25).

The project's results framework included an indicator measuring the number of students who received printed learning materials but did not include other aspects such as frequency and duration of this remote learning modality. The TTL clarified that printed learning materials were distributed only once during the project's life due to insufficient budget. The ICR's results framework did not indicate whether and how the duration and frequency of remote learning broadcasted via TV and radio as part of the newly adopted hybrid learning changed after schools re-opened. At the TTL interview, it was clarified that remote learning lessons via TV and radio were delivered for six months between June and December, 2020 with the same frequency regardless of schools' full re-opening in November, 2020.

Although the ICR notes that trainings for 118 school inspectors were held and all students in grades 1-9, including "at risk" students were targeted by the Project, no indicators and targets were included in the ICR's results framework for: (i) the school inspectors that were trained under the Project; (ii) other "at risk" groups of students that accessed multimodal distance learning under Component 1, such as students with disability, students from rural and urban areas, or students from poor families; (iii) the share of printed and digital learning content broadcasted via TV and radio that was adapted to the needs of students with disability; and (iv) the share/number of targeted students broken down by region – although the Results Framework includes such indicator and related target but only for one region (i.e. the region of Lomé). At the TTL interview, it was confirmed that all at-risk students – including those with disability and those in rural and urban areas across the country - were targeted by the Project and data on the number of project beneficiaries disaggregated by at-risk group were collected but the GPE required only some of the at-risk students, namely, female students and students with disability to be included in the ICR's Results Framework. Also, the TTL reported that the region of Lomé was selected to be included in the Results Framework because it was easier to collect data for that region as compared to the other regions. The task team confirmed also that printed materials adapted to the needs of students with vision impairment were distributed but their share in the total share of distributed printed learning materials was not required to be included in the ICR's results framework. Additionally, the TTL noted that the GoT has a policy of inclusive classrooms.

b. M&E Implementation

The project performance and outcome data were collected regularly. The results framework's indicators and targets related to multimodal remote learning were not revised after schools' reopening to reflect the duration and frequency of using remote learning as part of the newly adopted hybrid learning. The MEPSTA agencies at all levels monitored the return of students to school once schools re-opened. The



use of Geo-enabling method for monitoring and supervision (GEMS) enabled remote real-time M&E data-collection and supported the roll out of the beneficiary survey. Additionally, the Project conducted a Systems Approach for Better Education Results Assessment on school health and feeding (Healthy-SABER). Also, a school-based learning assessment was carried out to identify the number of at-risk students. The assessment results informed the remedial programs that followed on (ICR, p. 25).

c. M&E Utilization

M&E findings were used for regular monitoring and progress tracking, updating the results framework, directing the project, and informing supervision, ISRs, including the MTR, and the ICR. The results of the simple school-based learning assessment were used to identify students at risk after schools re-opened, develop remedial programs for these students, and train teachers to help them to catch up on learning. Additionally, the Health-SABER diagnostic tool assessed the current state of the school health and feeding policy and was expected to inform government actions for improving education results. Follow-up on these results were to be implemented under the Improving Quality and Equity of Basic Education Project - PAQEEB (P172674) financed by the Bank and the GPE, which was designed to support the GoT in the implementation of critical policy recommendations of the Health-SABER diagnosis, in collaboration with the World Food Program and the Health, Nutrition, and Population Global Practice. (ICR, p. 25-26).

M&E Quality Rating

Substantial

10. Other Issues

a. Safeguards

The Project's environmental and social risks were assessed to be Moderate at the time of appraisal. Most of the Project-related potential adverse environmental impacts and risks were ranked from minimal to negligible. The Project included mainly capacity building investments and no construction or rehabilitation activities. Among social risks identified at appraisal were: (i) the potential exclusion of students from the poorest families living in rural and remote areas from distance learning provided through TV and radio due to these students' more limited access to such technology; (ii) increased violence against children observed during the Covid-19 pandemic, including sexual exploitation and abuse/sexual harassment and other forms of gender-based violence, (iii) potential mild tensions within local communities over accessing project resources; and (iv) a risk of project benefits such as school grants reaching ineligible and less-deserving locations and individuals (PAD, pp. 27-28).

According to the ICR (p. 26), an Environmental and Social Review Summary (ESRS), an Environmental and Social Commitment Plan (ESCP), a Labor Management Plan (LMP), an Environmental and Social Management Plan (ESMP), and a Stakeholder Engagement Plan (SEP) were prepared and disclosed. The Project was prepared under condensed processes and the additional safeguards instruments were prepared and disclosed within thirty days following Project effectiveness (i.e., ESMP, LMP, an updated SEP, and Sexual Exploitation and Abuse and Sexual Harassment (SEA/SH) Action Plan). Safeguards were supervised and monitored on a regular basis throughout project implementation, consistently receiving



ratings in the satisfactory range (moderately satisfactory or satisfactory). Additionally, a Project's code of conduct for Project stakeholders was prepared and implemented. A grievance redress mechanism was prepared and became operational with a delay (i.e., 6 months before Project's closing). All quarterly environmental and social monitoring reports were produced on time and reviewed by the WBG's environmental and social safeguard (ESS) colleagues. In addition, capacity building trainings were provided to PCU, stakeholders (COGEP/COGERES, teachers, inspectorates, etc.) and workers to increase their awareness, commitment and participation in identifying and implementing effective management measures against negative environmental and social impacts related to the Project. At the end of the Project, the environment and social performance of the Project and the Environmental and Social Risk Classification (ESRC) were rated Moderately Satisfactory due to the following reasons: (i) the Grievance Redness Mechanism (GRM) was established and became operational in December 2021, only 6 months before the Project's closing; and (ii) although the ESMP for the management of waste, nuisances and risks had been in place, no monitoring of the waste management actions was undertaken.

The PCU received a complaint through the GRM about the non-payment of artisans who produced some parts of the handwashing stations. The MEPSTA/PCU settled the payment before Project closing. An environmental and social monitoring and control mission of the Project by the national environmental agency (ANGE) and a mission to monitor the appropriation and implementation of the health protocol took place during Project implementation. No accident / incidents were registered as of Project closing (ICR, pp. 26-27).

b. Fiduciary Compliance

Financial Management (FM).

At appraisal, a financial management assessment was conducted. The overall FM risk for the project was assessed to be Moderate contingent on the undertaking of several mitigation measures: (i) using existing FM and disbursement arrangements of the closed GPE-funded PERI-2 project, which met the minimum fiduciary requirements under Bank Policy and Directive for IPF (with some adjustments to be made for the specific needs of this project), (ii) improving the FM capacity of the PCU, and (iii) ensuring the audit of project annual accounts by an independent external auditor (PAD, p. 25).

According to the ICR (p. 27), the Project's Financial Management performance was rated Satisfactory. Regular reporting, internal controls, and timely completion and transmission of internal audit reports supported the Satisfactory rating of the Project's FM performance. All of the Project's submitted interim financial reports (IFRs) and audit reports were deemed acceptable to the WBG. There was no pending IFR and audit report for this Project. At Project's closing, the Project disbursed a total of US\$6.84 million and the remaining US\$102,045.56 were fully disbursed by the end of the grace period extended from October 31, 2022 to December 31, 2022. The rationale for the two-month extension was acceptable to the WBG because it enabled the GoT to submit the final justification of the payment made for the voluntary teachers' allowances following the authorization for direct payment and to submit final payment requests for activities completed prior to the Project's closing date in order to avoid any risk of loss of funds due to the ineligibility of payment (ICR, p. 12). The amended contract for the external audit was approved. An external audit covering the period of the Project from its start to June 30, 2022 was carried out and considered



acceptable by the Bank. In a meeting with IEG on March 7, 2023, the task team confirmed reception of the final audit and its unqualified/clean opinion.

Procurement

At project approval, the Project Procurement Strategy for Development and Procurement Plan were prepared on time and approved by the WBG, and the Procurement Plan was updated and submitted to the WBG as required throughout the Project. The Bank team conducted regular procurement performance assessment missions, with ratings in the satisfactory range throughout the project period. The Bank procurement staff provided training to the PCU to ensure compliance with the procurement guidelines. The PCU used the WBG’s Systematic Tracking of Exchanges in Procurement for uploading procurement documentation. There were some challenges related to the contract management that required ongoing capacity development support. The planned activities were implemented in compliance with procurement standards and regulations, except for the delayed acquisition of handwashing stations due to low capacity of the contracted firm. This delay was eventually overcome and handwashing stations were provided to all beneficiary schools by the end of the Project (ICR, p. 27).

c. Unintended impacts (Positive or Negative)

None reported.

d. Other

11. Ratings

Ratings	ICR	IEG	Reason for Disagreements/Comment
Outcome	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Bank Performance	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Quality of M&E	Substantial	Substantial	
Quality of ICR	---	Substantial	

12. Lessons

As reported in the ICR (pp. 29-30), the following key lessons were generated during the Project’s implementation:

- The education system’s resilience to future shocks requires the availability of both remedial programs for at-risk students and alternative teaching and learning options that can ensure education continuity in times of crises and complement teacher-led instruction.



- To be effective, distance/home-based schooling requires proper support to parents and caregivers that goes beyond communication campaigns to raise awareness about the availability of distance learning modalities and the importance of education continuity during the crisis, especially for girls.
- Performance-based school grants can strengthen school autonomy and accountability and improve the quality of educational services. Experience has shown that school grants are most effective when they are aligned with school improvement plans.
- Regular administration of simple school-based learning assessments can strengthen the national learning assessment system capacity to assess children throughout the school year and inform recovery plans for improved results.
- Strengthening sectoral coordination around school health and school feeding can help the government design effective policies to improve the framework for the establishment of school health and feeding programs.

Also, IEG, in its review of this ICRR offers an additional lesson:

It is possible to include in an emergency operation, designed to respond to acute needs caused by a crisis, a medium-term sector development perspective that builds capacity and contributes to sector resilience. In the case of this project, the Ministry of Education was able to lay a strong foundation for remote/home-based learning that addressed immediate needs, continued to be utilized for remedial purposes once schools re-opened, and made the education sector better prepared to respond to future crises.

13. Assessment Recommended?

No

14. Comments on Quality of ICR

This ICR is well-written and provides a clear and coherent storyline. The quality of the evidence is strong, relying on the M&E system that was strengthened by simple school-based learning assessments; a Geo-enabling Method for Monitoring and Supervision; a Systems Approach for Better Education Results Assessment on school health and feeding (Healthy-SABER); and a beneficiary survey. The ICR is generally results-oriented, stressing and highlighting how activities inform outcomes, although given the Project's emergency nature and short duration, the ICR's results chain and results framework provided intermediate outcomes rather than outcomes. The ICR presents a strong economic rationale for investing in education based on the robust results of the cost-benefit analysis before and after the project implementation. The proposed ratings for Relevance of Objectives, Efficacy, Efficiency and Bank Performance are appropriate and consistent with the evidence presented in the ICR. Also, the ICR is candid about implementation delays and provides a generally adequate critical assessment of the Project's main achievements and shortcomings. The lessons learned are informative, relevant and evidence-based, reflecting the Project's specific experiences and findings.

This was a Project that, among other things, aimed to provide equitable access to multimodal remote learning. The ICR, however, included indicators and targets disaggregated by vulnerable group only for some of



the targeted vulnerable groups such as female students and students with disability, while indicators and targets for the other targeted vulnerable groups, such as students living in rural and remote areas or those living in poverty were not included in the ICR's results framework. The Project design envisaged training school inspectors in addition to teachers as part of a systemic approach to implementing multimodal remote learning, however, the ICR's results framework does not include indicators and targets on the school inspectors that were trained. The TTL clarified that the ICR's results framework included only key indicators and targets that were required by the GPE and were less challenging to monitor.

a. Quality of ICR Rating
Substantial