

Eastern Africa Regional Statistics Program-for-Results (P176371)

Environmental and Social System Assessment (ESSA)

Input/contribution from Ethiopia

**September 2021**

**Addis Ababa**

Strictly Confidential

### **Abbreviations and Acronyms**

CSA	Central Statistics Agency
EFCCC	Environment, Forest and Climate Change Commission
EFCC	Environment, Forest, and Climate Change
MOF	Ministry of Finance
MOLSA	Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs
MoWCY	Ministry of Women, Children and Youth
NPDC	Planning and Development Commission

## Contents

<b>Abbreviations and Acronyms</b> .....	2
<b>Program Institutional Capacity and Performance assessment of Implementing Agencies in managing E&amp;S risks</b> .....	4
<b>Section -1- Institutional Capacity assessment of Ethiopia in managing E&amp;S risks</b> .....	4
1. Environment, Forest, and Climate Change Commission (EFCCC) .....	4
<i>Regional Environment Protection Forest and Climate Change Authority (REPFCCC)</i> .....	7
2. Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MoLSA).....	7
3. Ministry of Women, Children and Youth (MoWCY) .....	9
4. Implementing Agencies -1- Central Statistics Agency (CSA) .....	11
5. Implementing Agency -2- Planning and Development Commission (PDC).....	12
6. Ethiopian Institution of Ombudsman .....	13
<b>Section -2- Performance assessment of Ethiopia in managing E&amp;S risks.</b> .....	13
2.1 Performance of safeguard instrument preparation and implementation (ESIA) .....	13
2.3 Gender and Gender Based Violence.....	15
2.4 Vulnerable and underserved groups .....	16
2.5 Social Conflicts .....	16
2.6 Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM).....	16
2.7 Public Participation/Consultation .....	17
<b>Section -3- Analysis of Environmental and Social Management Systems against Core Principles of PforR Financing</b> .....	17
<b>Section-4 Stakeholders Consultation and Disclosure</b> .....	27
<b>Section -5- Summary of key implementation challenges and Recommended Actions</b> .....	29
5.1 <i>Gaps/ Implementation Challenges in environmental and social risk and impacts management</i> .....	29
5.2 <i>Recommended Mitigation Measures and Program Action Plan (PAP)</i> .....	29
<b>Section 6. Annexes</b> .....	30

## **Program Institutional Capacity and Performance assessment of Implementing Agencies in managing E&S risks**

1. The ESSA team of Ethiopia applied two major methods to conduct the assessment. Desk review including the similar assessments of the Bank financed recent PforR projects and consultative meetings as well as key informant interviews guided by selected proposed questions were the major methods applied in the process. From September 14-17/2021 a total of 5 consultative meetings were conducted in five national level government institutions. These are the two project implementing agencies of Central Statistics agency (CSA) and National Planning and Development Commission and three key program overseeing bodies/ stakeholders including Environment, Forest and Climate Change Commission (EFCCC), Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MoLSA) and Ministry of Women, Children and Youth (MOWCY). As a result, a total of 22 senior officials and experts were consulted. *The list of participant with their contact detail is annexed at the end of the report.*
2. The section below provides the policies, strategies, laws, and regulations relevant and applicable to EA Regional statistics PforR program implementation and designed to manage the environmental and social risk and impacts management systems through environment, Forest and Climate Change Commission (EFCCC) ,Central Statistics Agency ,National Planning and Development commission and key oversight bodies' environmental and social management practice and performance; and analyze the environmental and social management systems against core principles of World Bank's PforR financing.

### **Section -1- Institutional Capacity assessment of Ethiopia in managing E&S risks**

1. Environment, Forest, and Climate Change Commission (EFCCC)
  - 1.1 Policy and Legislative Framework Support
2. *The constitution of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia.* The constitution had been issued in August 1995 with several provisions, which provides basic and comprehensive principles and guidelines for environmental protection and management in the country. The concept of sustainable development and environmental rights are presented in Articles 43- *The Right to Development*, 44 - *Environmental Rights* and 92- *Environmental Objectives*, Article 40: *Land and Natural Resource* of the Constitution.
3. *Regional states constitutions:* Regional states have their own constitution upholding the federal constitution in its entirety and constituting their regional particulars. All the regional state constitutions have addressed land and natural resources management and environmental protection.
4. *Environment Policy of Ethiopia.* The first comprehensive statement of Environmental Policy of Ethiopia was approved by the Council of Ministers in April 1997 that was based on the policy and strategic findings and recommendations of the Conservation Strategy of Ethiopia. The policy is aimed at guiding sustainable social and economic development of the country through the conservation and sustainable utilization of the natural, man-made and cultural resources and the environment at large. The overall policy goal is to improve and enhance the health and quality of life of all Ethiopians and to promote sustainable social and economic development through the sound management and use of natural, human-made and cultural resources and the environment as a whole so as to meet the needs of the present generation without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs. The Environmental Policy provides several guiding principles that require adherence to the general principles of sustainable development.
5. *Climate Resilient Green Economy.* The Climate Resilient Green Economy (CRGE, 2011) is Ethiopia's overarching framework and a national strategy towards a green economy. The Green Economy Strategy is believed to provide an opportunity to promote sustainable development in Ethiopia. Currently, it builds on an investment plan of over 60 initiatives that are, or can be, turned into financed projects. For this to happen, there is a strong need to reform the economy. The CRGE is envisioned to be the main driver for this transformation. The CRGE has three complementary objectives: i) fostering economic development and

growth, ii) ensuring abatement and avoidance of future GHG emissions; and iii) improving resilience to climate change. To achieve these objectives, CRGE sets out to tap into international climate finance, seize opportunities for innovation and new technologies, and create competitive advantages via sustainable resource use and improving productivity.

6. *FDRE National Occupational Safety and Health Policy and Strategy*. The National Policy and strategy on Occupational Safety and Health (OSH) was endorsed by the FDRE Council of Ministers in July 2014. The OSH policy and strategy was prepared to implement the rights of Labour as stipulated in article 42(2) of the Constitution and also implement the requirements of International Conventions on Occupational Health and Safety (No.155) to which Ethiopia is a signatory. The overall objective of the national OSH Policy and strategy is to avoid, prevent or minimize occupational and health hazards by providing effective OSH services in all working places and thereby contribute to the socioeconomic development of the Country. The national OSH policy and strategy is applicable to all types of workplaces and economic activities in Ethiopia.
7. *Environmental Impact Assessment Proclamation (Proclamation No. 299/2002)*. The EIA Proclamation No 299/2002 aims primarily at making the EIA mandatory for categories of projects specified under a directive issued by the EFCCC. It requires predicting and managing the environmental effects of a proposed development activity as a result of its design, sitting, construction, operation, or an ongoing one as a result of its modification or termination, entails and thus helps to bring about intended development. The proclamation is an effective means of harmonizing and integrating environmental, economic, cultural and social considerations in to the planning and decision making processes thereby promoting sustainable development. Moreover, it serves as a basic instrument in bringing about administrative transparency and accountability, to involve the public and the communities in particular, in the planning and execution of development programs that may affect them and their environment. The objective of undertaking the assessment study is to ensure identification of the impacts of a development project and the incorporation of mitigating measures for the adverse significant impacts.
8. *Environmental Impact Assessment Procedural Guidelines Series (Series 1 and 2)*. In order to facilitate the implementation of Environmental Impact Assessment Proclamation (Proclamation 299/2002), the EFCCC had formulated four procedural guidelines, namely, Review Guideline Series 1: Guidelines for Review Approach; Review Guideline Series 2- Guidelines for Contents and Scopes of Report; Review Guideline Series 3- Checklist of Environmental Characteristics and, Review Guideline Series 4- Review Criteria. These widely applied environmental impact assessment guidelines were also under review to update and enhance the documents in light of the experiences gained so far. The review and update process is still ongoing and yet to be completed. Review Guideline Series 1 and 2 will be elaborated to a certain extent and any further updates made to the documents will apply after official publication of the reviewed and updated guidelines. In addition, the EPFCCC have developed two additional sectoral guidelines for mining and irrigation development sectors.
9. *Procedural Guideline Series 1 -Guidelines for Review Approach*. This guideline pointed out roles and responsibilities of EFCCC and Regional Environmental Agencies, the proponent, consulting firm, interested and affected parties, and the licensing agency. In the guideline, the EIA processes and requirements, and comprehensive description of the EA process has been stated. It also outlined projects which may have adverse and significant environmental impacts, and may, therefore, require full EIA (Schedule 1), projects whose type, scale or other relevant characteristics have the potential to cause some significant environmental impacts but not likely to warrant an environmental impact study (Schedule 2) and projects which would have no impact and does not require environmental impact assessment (Schedule
10. *Procedural Guideline Series 2 - Guidelines for Contents and Scopes of Report*. This guideline among others indicates structure and content of the Environmental Impact Study Report and describes the contents including the administrative, legal and policy requirements, assessment and mitigation measures.
11. *Directive No.2/2014 (2006 EC)*: Directive on issuing “professional competence certificate to consultants and firms providing service in Environmental Impact Assessment, Environmental Audit and Climate Change fields”. The Directive has been issued by the MoEFCC (now called EFCCC) and has been in force for the last

four years. It has become an important milestone in the development of the EIA system in Ethiopia. The directive stipulates that EIA and Environment Audits should be conducted by professional consultants and firms that are registered and certified for their competence by the Federal Environment, Forest, and Climate Change Commission. EIAs and Environment Audits prepared by unregistered and certified firms will not be eligible for review and approval. The Regional EPFCCs have also started applying the stated directive of EFCCC. Directive no.2/2014 is also among the guidelines put under review by the EFCCC and is being updated.

12. *Environmental guideline and management plan*. Guideline for Environmental Management Plan (draft), May 2004 outlines measures for preparation of an Environmental Management Plans (EMP) for proposed developments in Ethiopia and institutional arrangements for implementation of EMPs.
  13. *EIA Procedural Guideline (draft), November 2003*: This guideline outlines the screening, review and approval process for development projects in Ethiopia and defines the criteria for undertaking an EIA.
  14. *EIA Guideline, July 2000*: The EIA Guideline Document provides essential information covering the following elements: Environmental Assessment and Management in Ethiopia, Environmental Impact Assessment Process, Standards and Guidelines and issues for sector environmental impact assessment in Ethiopia covering agriculture, industry, transport, mining, dams and reservoirs, tanneries, textiles, hydropower generation, irrigation projects and resettlement
  15. *Waste Handling and Disposal Guideline, 1997*. The Waste Handling and Disposal Guidelines have been in use since 1997. The Guidelines are meant to help industry and local authorities handle medical waste situation at the local level.
  16. *Environmental Pollution Control Proclamation (Proclamation No. 300/2002)*. This proclamation is aimed at eliminating or, when not possible, to mitigate pollution as an undesirable consequence of social and economic development activities. It has also an objective of protecting the environment and safeguarding of human health, as well as maintaining of the biota and the aesthetic value of the environment. The Proclamation, among others has considered control of pollution; management of hazardous waste, chemical and radioactive substances; management of municipal wastes; the importance and need to respect environmental standards; and punitive and incentive measures.
  17. *Solid Waste Proclamation (Proclamation 513/2007)*. Solid Waste Management proclamation aims to promote community participation to prevent adverse impacts and enhance benefits resulting from solid waste management. It provides for preparation of solid waste management action plans by urban local governments.
  18. *Proclamation to Provide for the Establishment of Environmental Protection Organs (Proclamation No. 295/2002)*. The first objective of this proclamation is to assign responsibilities to separate organizations for environmental development and management activities on the one hand, and environmental protection, regulations and monitoring on the other, which is instrumental for the sustainable use of environmental resources. The second objective is to establish a system that fosters coordinated but differentiated responsibilities among environmental protection agencies at federal and regional levels.
  19. *Water Resources Management Proclamation (197/2000)*. The purpose of the Proclamation is to ensure that the water resources of the country are protected and utilized for the highest social and economic benefits of the people of Ethiopia, to follow up and supervise that they are duly conserved, ensure that harmful effects of water are prevented, and that the management of water resources is carried out properly.
- 1.2 Organization and program Structure
20. The powers and duties of the Environment, Forest and Climate Change Commission (FEFCCC) have bestowed per proclamation 916/2015. Despite its devolvement from the level of Ministry headed by a Minister to a Commission headed by a Commissioner during the recent restructuring of the GoE introduced by the incumbent Prime Minister in 2018, the powers and duties of the former MoEFCC remains the same and it is made to be directly accountable to the Prime Minister.
  21. *Hazardous waste management and disposal control (Proclamation no.1090/2018)*: This is one of the recently introduced environmental legislations that specifically deal with hazardous wastes, the

proclamation in its preamble elucidated hazardous waste as one of the most crucial environmental problems in Ethiopia. It stated the importance of prevention and control of these type wastes and emphasized the need for creation of a system to control the generation, storage treatment, recycling and reuse as well as transportation and disposal of hazardous wastes to prevent harm to human and animal health as well as the environmental. The objectives of this proclamation is to create a system for the environmentally sound management and disposal of hazardous Waste and to prevent the damage to the human or animal health, the environment, biodiversity and property due to the mismanagement of hazardous waste. The proclamation within its 24 articles has dealt with all character and management of hazardous wastes.

22. *Expropriation of Land for Public Purposes, Payments of Compensation and Resettlement of Displaced People Proclamation No. 1161/2019*. FDRE House of People’s Representatives has recently rectified Proclamation No.1161/2019 that deals with “Expropriation of Land for Public Purposes, Payments of Compensation and Resettlement of Displaced People”, and replaced the previously active legislation on the matter i.e. Expropriation of Land and Compensation Proclamation No. 455/2005. The new Proclamation gives priority rights to develop Land for the Landholders when the capacity of the Landholders to develop the land as per the approved land use plan; urban structural plan; or development master plan is presented.
23. *Regulation No. 472/2020 on Expropriation and Valuation and Compensation and Resettlement*. Furthermore, FDRE Council of Ministers Regulation No. 472/2020 on Expropriation and Valuation and Compensation and Resettlement was issued. The regulation provides the basis for compensation of affected properties and to assist the displaced or affected persons to restore their livelihood.

## Regional Environment Protection Forest and Climate Change Authority (REPFCCC)

24. At regional level, there are environmental bureaus to implement environment management systems within their respective jurisdictions. Proclamation 295/2002 requires regional states to establish or designate their own regional environmental agencies. The regional environmental agencies are responsible for coordination, formulation, implementation, review and revision of regional conservation strategies as well as environmental protection, regulation and monitoring. Relating to EIA specifically, Proclamation 299/2002 gives regional environmental agencies the responsibility to evaluate EIA reports of projects that are licensed, executed or supervised by regional states and that are not likely to generate inter-regional impacts. Regional environmental agencies are also responsible for monitoring, auditing and regulating implementation of such projects. The institutional standing of regional environmental agencies varies among regions.
25. In some regions, they are established as separate Environment forest and climate change institutions; while in others they are within Regional Sector Bureaus (e.g., Bureau of Land Use Administration). The nine regional states under consideration have established their own Environment Forest and climate change Authorities since long time. The REPA’s in five regional states have expanded their structures down to Zonal and Woreda levels (see table ...). The Gambella regions REPA exists at regional bureau level only and have delegated the woreda office of agriculture and natural resources to act on its behalf.

## 2. Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MoLSA)

### 2.1 Policy and Legislative Framework Support

26. *The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (FDRE) Constitution*. The Constitution recognizes the presence of different socio-cultural groups, including historically disadvantaged and underserved communities, pastoralists, agro-pastoralists, and ethnic minorities, as well as their rights to socioeconomic equity and

justice. The following articles of the constitution that covers the right of the key target group of the sector- Article 41- equal opportunities and full participation of people with disabilities, Article 42 - ‘workers have the right to a healthy and safe work environment’.

27. *Proclamation No. 624/2009 and regulation no. 243/2011.* The Proclamation and regulation serves to protect the safety of the public and workers in the construction sector. Article 31 and 36 state the precautionary measures to be taken during construction and necessary facilities required by persons with disabilities in public buildings.
28. Labor safety and protection activities are handled by different institutions. However, the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MOLSA) is mandated to design mechanisms that ensure the safety and health of workers. In line with this, Proclamation No. 1097/2018, which specifies the powers and duties of the federal ministries has given MOLSA, in article 29(3) to “establish a system to prevent occupational accidents and occupational diseases; issue occupational health and safety standards and supervise their implementation;” under sub-article 4, it also gives power to “set up a system to ensure industrial peace and ensure its proper implementation”. Therefore, MOLSA is better placed to coordinate tasks related to labor safety and health in collaboration with other similar organizations.
29. In addition, the Labor Proclamation No.1156/2019 is enacted to “create favorable environment for investment and achievement of national economic goals without scarifying fundamental workplace rights by laying down well considered labor administration; and determine the duties and responsibilities of governmental organs entrusted with the power to monitor labor conditions; occupational health and safety; and environmental protection together with bilateral and tripartite social dialogue mechanisms; political, economic and social policies of the Country”.
30. *Proclamation No.1064/2017-Proclamation on Federal Civil Servants.* This Proclamation shall be applicable to all offices and employees falling under the definitions of “government institution” and “civil servants”. The objectives of occupational safety and health shall be: a) to maintain the safety and health of civil servants and enhance their productivity, b) to arrange, improve and keep suitable workplace for the safety and health of civil servants; and c) to guarantee high level performance of a government institution based on social wellbeing. The provisions of this section shall also be applicable to temporary workers.
31. *Regulations to support underserved and Vulnerable groups.* The Ethiopian government has designated four of the country’s regions, namely: Afar, Somali, Benishangul-Gumuz, and Gambella as Developing Regional States (DRS). There are a number of overarching laws and additional implementation strategies/guidelines adopted by the government to protect vulnerable groups including women, children and people with disabilities, and ensure their rights to quality, access and equity of educational opportunities.
32. Useful proclamations, regulations and plans of actions were formulated to protect people with disability and the elderly. Among others, the most relevant ones include: (i) National Plan of Action of Persons with Disabilities (2012-2021); (ii) Proclamation No. 568/2008, Rights to Employment for Persons with Disabilities; (iii) Building Proclamation, No. 624/2009 and Regulation 243/2011.
33. *Vulnerable and Disadvantaged Groups: Proclamation No. 1097/2018,* which specifies the powers and duties of the federal ministries under article 29, sub-article 11 has given MOLSA the duty to work in collaboration with the concerned bodies to strengthen the social protection system to improve and ensure the social and economic wellbeing of citizens and, in particular to: a) enable persons with disabilities benefit from equal opportunities and full participation; b) enable the elderly to get care and support and enhance their participation; prevent social and economic problems and provide the necessary services to segments of the society under difficult circumstances particularly the elderly and people with disabilities.
34. The Proclamation No. 1097/2018 Article 13 (1t), which specifies the powers and duties of the federal ministries has given to Ministry of Peace “in collaboration with concerned organs coordinate activities that enable pastoralists and semi-pastoralists to become beneficiaries of social and economic developments.” Besides to this, each ministry is given the power and duties to ensure the aforementioned segments of the society who are vulnerable to social and economic problems benefit from equal opportunities and full participation.

35. *The National Social Protection Policy of Ethiopia*. Ethiopia has formulated National Social Protection policy in 2012 with a general objective to create an enabling environment in which citizens (including special need and other vulnerable segments) have equitable access to all social protection services that will enhance their growth, development. Ethiopia's social protection policy is a central public policy component for addressing poverty, vulnerability, and inequality.
- 2.2 Organization and Program Structure
36. The Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MoLSA) is responsible to ensure industrial peace, maintain employee's health and safety at workplace, improve working condition and environment, promote efficient and equitable employment services; and maintain developmental social welfare of citizens. Implementing Occupational Safety & Health, Public Safety and Social welfare protection activities, prevention of child labor are also among the mandates, roles and responsibilities of their Ministry.
37. MoLSA is responsible for the coordination and implementation of the Social Protection Policy. Given the multidimensional nature of the policy implementation, a Federal Social Protection Council (FSPC) was established consisting of members drawn from the relevant federal offices and other stakeholders. To implement the policy across the federal structure, institutional arrangements and accountability mechanisms were established at regional, zonal, and woreda levels. It also plays an overarching role in the design, amendment, implementation and monitoring of occupational health and safety policies, directives and guidelines, and makes sure that sector ministries and other executive organs perform their responsibilities related to health and safety issues in their respective mandate areas. MoLSA is also responsible for organizing and coordinating support for vulnerable groups. It has the necessary structure at regional, zonal and woreda levels.
38. MoLSA has also a mandate to support vulnerable members of society. This entails assessing and providing technical support to address the social and occupational health and safety related risks and taking appropriate measures to mitigate these risks.
39. The activities of MoLSA are informed by the national social protection policy, which was prepared in 2015. In addition, in 2018, a new proclamation (1097/2018) that states the roles and responsibilities of all federal ministries and offices in relation to the implementation of the national social protection policy, was enacted. In this proclamation under Article 10.4, the role and responsibility of each ministry was stated about disadvantaged and vulnerable groups. Informants from MoLSA argue that there could be duplication of policies, regulations, or guidelines as they are being prepared by different organization without considering what is already existing. This shows the need for coordinated and harmonized way of preparing policies, proclamations and guidelines. Recently, the Attorney General office has given attention to the issue of duplication. Therefore, it has become mandatory for every proclamation and regulation to pass through the Attorney General office.
40. *Bureau of Labor and Social Affairs (BOLSA)*. Regional governments have established bureau/agency responsible to implement the national vision and set mission of the Ministry. Woreda and town administrations have offices whose responsibility is investigation and supervision of establishment (manufacturing plants) to ensure that all stakeholders are adhering to Proclamation 377/2003. Ensuring rights and interest of persons with disabilities and the elderly is included in policies and laws of federal and regional governments and are mainly the duty of the Ministry.
3. Ministry of Women, Children and Youth (MoWCY)
41. The powers and duties of the Ministry of Women, Children and Youth is defined by Proclamation No.1097/2018. The Ministry of Women, Children and Youth (MoWCY) is responsible for follow-up of the implementation of international conventions and national laws pertaining to women, children, and youth, conducting/commissioning research and formulating policies and guidelines, collaborating with organizations working on women and child issues, and providing capacity building support to ensure the equal participation and benefit of women and the protection of children's rights and security.
- 3.1 Policy and Legislative Framework Support

42. *The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (FDRE) Constitution*. There are social issues that require special attention and to assess the adequacy of the social management system, relevant policies, laws, and regulations are summarized. The Constitution recognizes the presence of different socio-cultural groups, including historically disadvantaged and underserved communities including women as well as their rights to socioeconomic equity and justice. The following are major articles of the constitution discuss the right of women and children - **Article 35**- Special attention to the rights of Women, **Article 36**- the rights of children, **Article 41**- equal opportunities and full participation of people with disabilities.
43. *Proclamation No. 1097/2018 on Gender Based Violence* .In relation to Gender Based Violence, proclamation No. 1097/2018, article 28 (f & g) bestow powers and duties to the Ministry of Women, Children and Youth to: “design strategies to effectively prevent and take measures against gender-based violence against women; implement same in collaboration with relevant organs; facilitate the setting up centres for provision of holistic health, psychological, legal and rehabilitation services for women who were victims of violence; and follow up the implementation of same.”
44. *National Children’s Policy of Ethiopia (April 2017)*. Ethiopia is undertaking various measures to promote and protect children’s right and welfare, including signing and ratifying regional and international agreements, incorporating them into national laws and establishing the necessary legal and administrative arrangements. To sustain this commitment the government, formulate a comprehensive National Children’s Policy. The general objective of the Policy is creating a conducive environment for the promotion and protection of children’s rights and welfare in order that they undergo full personality development and become ethical and responsible citizens.
45. *The National Policy on Ethiopian Women (1993)*. It underlines the need to establish equitable and gender sensitive public policies that empower woman, especially in education and property rights, and engaging them in decision making. Improving healthy working conditions, ensuring access to basic services, protecting woman from harmful traditional practices are among the emphasized key issues.
46. *Regulations on Gender and Women Empowerment*. The Constitution under Article 43 provides a foundation for the recognition and protection of woman’s rights and guarantee equal right with men. The Constitution stipulates providing special attention to women to remedy the historical legacy of inequality and discrimination Ethiopian women endured. Women have the right to full consultation, the formulation of national development policies, the designing and execution of projects particularly those affecting the interests of women. Women’s right to acquire, administer, control, use and transfer property; and rights to equality in employment, promotion, pay and transfer of pension entitlements are clearly stated in the constitution. The state shall enforce the right of women including to elimination of the influences of harmful customs and practices that oppress or cause bodily or mental harm to women.
47. *Regulations to support underserved and Vulnerable groups*. A range of policies, action plans and strategies aimed at protecting and promoting the wellbeing, life chances and education opportunities of disadvantaged groups and developing regions are in place. Owing to their limited access to socioeconomic development and underserved status over the decades, the Ethiopian government has designated four of the country’s regions, namely: Afar, Somali, Benishangul-Gumuz, and Gambella as Developing Regional States (DRS).
48. There are a number of overarching laws and additional implementation strategies/guidelines adopted by the government to protect vulnerable groups including women, children and people with disabilities, and ensure their rights to quality, access and equity of educational opportunities. Useful proclamations, regulations and plans of actions were formulated to protect people with disability and the elderly. Among others, the most relevant ones include: (i) National Plan of Action of Persons with Disabilities (2012-2021); (ii) Proclamation No. 568/2008, Rights to Employment for Persons with Disabilities; (iii) Building Proclamation, No. 624/2009 and Regulation 243/2011.
49. Vulnerable and Disadvantaged Groups: Proclamation No. 1097/2018, which specifies the powers and duties of the federal ministries under article 29, sub-article 11 has given MOLSA the duty to work in collaboration with the concerned bodies to strengthen the social protection system to improve and ensure the social and

economic wellbeing of citizens and, in particular to: a) enable persons with disabilities benefit from equal opportunities and full participation; b) enable the elderly to get care and support and enhance their participation; prevent social and economic problems and provide the necessary services to segments of the society under difficult circumstances particularly the elderly and people with disabilities.

50. The Proclamation No. 1097/2018 Article 13 (1t), which specifies the powers and duties of the federal ministries has given to Ministry of Peace “in collaboration with concerned organs coordinate activities that enable pastoralists and semi-pastoralists to become beneficiaries of social and economic developments.” Besides to this, each ministry is given the power and duties to ensure the aforementioned segments of the society who are vulnerable to social and economic problems benefit from equal opportunities and full participation.
  51. *Gender mainstreaming strategy and guideline (2010)*. It stresses the consideration of gender issues in policies, programs and projects implemented by government and development partners. This is to ensure that the outcomes of development are shared equally between men and women. In addition, it gives right for both men and women to enjoy equal opportunities, status and recognition.
  52. *National Five years Action Plans to prevent child labor (2013-2017 E.C)*. The action plan is established based on three basic strategies. These are prevention, protection and rehabilitation and each strategy have basic strategic goals.
- 3.2 *Organization and Program Structure*
53. The ministry has three branches, namely women, children and youth. In all of these, the ministry is responsible for follow-up of the implementation of national and international laws; conducting research and formulating policies and guidelines; collaborating with organizations working on women, child and youth affairs; and providing capacity building support to ensure the equal participation and benefit of women, children and youth in the protection of their rights and security. In the ten regional states and the two city administrations, the ministry has structures organized as bureau.
  54. In order to address the wide-ranging problems of women, children and youth, the ministry has carried out several activities that included gender mainstreaming, reducing Harmful Traditional Practices (Female Genital Mutilation and Early Marriage), children Care and Support, establishing children parliament, reducing youth unemployment rate and increasing Youth Representation in the legislative and judiciary. Even though the tasks of the ministry require working in coordination with other basic sectors and oversight bodies, the coordination is yet to be developed.
  55. MoWCY has bureaus (Bureau of Woman, Children and Youth) in all nine regional states and the two chartered city administrations. In all regions, the bureau is organized around three core processes: gender development, empowerment, and child protection. At woreda level, though similar structures exist, most positions are vacant. All staff members of the bureau are engaged in the issue of women, children, and youth. Therefore, the task of all technical staff members is focused on providing supports such as awareness creation, training, community mobilization, empowerment, legal support, preparing guidelines, strategies and directives.

#### 4. Implementing Agencies -1- Central Statistics Agency (CSA)

##### *4.1 Policy and Legislative Framework Support*

56. Proclamation No .442/2005 is the base for the establishment of the Central Statistics agency .The CSA is the Agency responsible for coordinating, monitoring, and supervising the activities of the National Statistical System (NSS) in Ethiopia and ensuring that international and national standards are adhered. The main objectives of the Agency, among others, are to collect, process, analysis and disseminate the necessary socio-economic and demographic statistical data through censuses, sample surveys, continuous registration, and administrative recording systems. The central statistics Agency of Ethiopia (CSA) is responsible for generating statistical data related to the economic and social condition of the country. The agency offers variety of different reports including price indices, industry reports and employment figures.

57. The Central Statistics Agency is the lead implementing agency responsible for managing the proposed East Africa regional statistics project in Ethiopia. The Agency was established in 1959 under the instruction of the Minister of Trade and Industry. According to proclamation NO.1097/2018 A proclamation to provide for the definition of the powers and duties of the executive organs of the federal democratic republic of Ethiopia article 22 ,the agency become one of the executive organ accountable to National Planning and development commission.
58. *National Strategy for the Development of Statistics.* The Central Statistical Agency designed and implemented the first National Strategy for the Development of Statistics (NSDS I). The NSDS II, whose implementation period expired in 2020, was a comprehensive framework for the development of the National Statistical System (NSS) of the country. The NSDS II, guided by its vision, mission, core values and principles helped the NSS to overcome its challenges and enable the country to meet the ever-growing demand for high quality, timely and accessible statistical information needed for evidence-based policy formulation and decision making.
59. The NSDS II incorporated additional areas obtained from the NSDSI evaluation and sector data needs. It has been designed to enhance the coverage and capacity of data collection by incorporating new surveys in the agriculture and business sectors. The NSDS II is also intended to cover areas of environment and gender. The NSDS II covers the period from 2015/16 to 2019/20. Though NSDS II expired in 2019/20, Ethiopia is planning to define a new strategy.
- 4.2 Organization and Program Structure*
60. Central Statistical Agency of Ethiopia is led by one Director General and three Deputy Director Generals. In addition to the Directorates directly accountable to the three deputy director generals, there are several directorates, work units and departments that are relevant for environmental, social and gender risks and impacts management. These include ethical liaison Unit, legal service department and gender mainstreaming directorate directly accountable for the Director General and agriculture, natural resource and environmental statistics directorate directly accountable to economic and social statistics deputy general director.
5. Implementing Agency -2- Planning and Development Commission (PDC).
- 5.1 Policy and Legislative Framework Support*
61. The Planning and Development Commission is member of the Council of Ministers with the rank of a Minister. It is responsible for preparing development plans and monitoring and evaluation of their implementation. The objective of the Commission shall be to prepare five-year plans of national development in the framework of country wide balanced growth within the context of a long-term perspective plan of fifteen years and conduct periodic evaluation of the implementation of the plans. The compilation of the National Accounts Statistics is in the PDC. Essentially, the PDC is the main user of these macro-economic aggregates. PDC is also the main organization for Monitoring and Evaluation of short-term, medium -term, and long-term development plans, programmes and projects. It is also the institution that is responsible for coordinating and reporting implementation progress on regional and international development commitments such as the AU Agenda 2063 and the UN Agenda 2030.
62. National Planning and Development Commission is established by Proclamation No, 1097/2018 and article 19 is base for its duties and responsibilities. Regarding coordination, at national level, PDC as federal public body gives directions to line ministries and receives reports from each sector ministry regarding the preparation and implementation of development plans. It supports regions in capacity building and has provided training on planning monitoring and evaluation, regional accounts development and population.
- 5.2 Organization and Program Structure*
63. According to the current organizational structure, there are two wings i.e. Macro economy planning and management wing and M&E wing and the agency has more than ten core directorates that are working under the two wings. During the consultation discussion, PDC expressed that most of the existing directorates of the PDC have work unit and manpower (from directorate to officer level) relevant to manage the environmental, social, safety and gender risks and impacts. These includes Occupational health and safety officer under the human resource directorate, Property landscaping and beautification section under the

general services department, Gender department, Ethics department, Conflict management and Women, children and youth department. The ethics department has an established GRM committee of the organization which is also very instrumental in terms of managing the social, environmental and gender related grievance and concerns. Besides, the new structure of PDC have established development projects ESIA and feasibility study Team accountable for Development project Directorate. The PDC has regional counterparts which are not directly reporting to it but have functional relationships.

## 6. Ethiopian Institution of Ombudsman

### *6.1 Policy and Legislative Framework Support*

64. The Ethiopian Institution of Ombudsman (EIO) was established by Proclamation No.211/2000. It is a federal institution accountable to the Parliament, operational outside of Addis Ababa through six regional branches. The institution's main objectives are to ensure that citizens' constitutional rights are not violated by the executive organs, supervise the implementation of functions by the executive organs in accordance with the law, investigate complaints received, and seek remedial measures for administrative malpractices.

#### **Section -2- Performance assessment of Ethiopia in managing E&S risks.**

65. The assessment finding revealed that, the country has a well-established and functional environmental and social risk and impacts management system. In the key implementing agencies and oversight bodies, most of the activities related to Environmental, Social, health and safety and gender management issues are handled as an integral part of the organizations functional units. This section describes existing practice of Environmental and social risk and impact management in the implementing agencies and oversight bodies. Therefore, to help understand what is being done currently, implementations and achievements in the area of environmental and social risk and impacts management, gender and gender-based violence, conflict management, grievance redress, and public consultation and participation are presented as follows.

#### **2.1 Performance of safeguard instrument preparation and implementation (ESIA)**

66. Previously, the EFCCC has delegated its authority to sector institutions (six ministries) to ensure implementation of EIA laws and requirements in their sector and to undertake EIA reviews. These are Ministry of Mines and Petroleum; Agriculture; Water, Irrigation and Energy; Urban Development and Construction; Transport; and Trade and Industry. Now, the delegation is revoked, and responsibility has gone back to EFCCC. However, though EFCCC officially communicated to the sector ministries that delegation is lifted, some sectors are continuing to evaluate the preparation and implementation of environmental and social risk and impact management activities which is believed beyond their mandate.

67. Currently, EFCCC is in the process of amending the 299/2002 proclamation on environmental impact assessment (EIA). The draft document was submitted to the Council of Ministers and feedback was received. The feedback was incorporated and resubmitted to the same. The Council is expected to review and submit the draft document to the parliament. The revised draft proclamation is made to include Strategic Environment and Social Assessment (SESA) as a requirement in developing investment proposals. It also specifies when and by whom the SESA should be prepared. In addition, the revised draft proclamation has included environmental audit as one part with details of when and how it should be carried out. Moreover, equal emphasis is given to social assessment, and amended proclamation will have the title "Environment and Social Impact Assessment". However, earlier than this, the social components of the assessment were overlooked and given limited attention. Besides, usually it is obvious that after proclamation, regulations are prepared. However, the previous EIA Proclamation was not complemented with regulation. But now, the EFCCC has planned to prepare a regulation after the proclamation is enacted.

68. Furthermore, the EFCCC has prepared Integrated Risk Management Guideline in 2020 to complement ESIA. The guideline is prepared as a national general guideline and specific for mines and irrigation. The guideline recommends ESIA to consider additionally the assessment of impact that may happen because of climate change, ecosystem restoration, and disaster. In addition, the EFCCC has prepared public consultation for ESIA guideline in 2020. This was prepared to guide how public consultation should be undertaken during project planning and implementation.

69. Efforts are continuing to be carried by the EFCCC to review the existing EIA Proclamation to update and improve it. There is high expectation by the EPFCCC that the revised and updated draft EIA proclamation will be among the priority legislations to be presented to the upcoming new parliament (FDRE House of Representatives) in 2021/2022 for review and approval.
70. In the context of the Regional Statistics P for R project, where certain subprojects are to be carried Country wide, the Federal and Regional environment protection offices are going to play a major role during the implementation of the ESSA and its associated guidelines. For that reason, it will be more important to focus on the capacities, performances and challenges of the Federal and regional environment protection institutions which will be directly involved in the review and approval of the environmental and social assessment instruments for sub-projects.
71. Overall, the regional environmental agencies are responsible for coordination, implementation, review and updating/revising of regional EIA systems as well as environmental monitoring, protection, and regulation. Specifically, Proclamation 299/2002 gives regional environmental agencies the responsibility to evaluate ESIA reports of projects that are licensed, executed or supervised by regional states and that are not likely to generate inter-regional impacts. Regional environmental agencies are also responsible for monitoring, auditing, and regulating implementation of such projects. The institutional standing of regional environmental agencies varies among regions.
72. Regarding existing experiences, at regional levels, the activities of the regional environment Agencies in enforcing the environmental and social management systems in their respective jurisdictions are increasingly growing over the years. The implementation of multiple World Bank financed programs in the regions have already created practical experiences in the review and approval of E&S screening reports and environmental performance monitoring of ESIA/ESMPs. The awareness and application of ESMF, ESSA, ESMSG requirements from the past and present World Bank financed programs in the head offices of EPAs has comparatively increased. To some extent, the EPAs also conduct environmental and social monitoring of sub-projects based on the approved ESMPs.
73. *Role in the Implementation of the Regional Statistics P for R project:* The Federal and Regional environment protection offices will be responsible to discharge their regulatory services to the proposed East Africa Regional Statistics P for R sub-projects through the review, approval and implementation monitoring of E&S screening reports and ensuing ESMPs as appropriate. Following the E&S screening of Regional Statistics P for R and other related sub-projects, the Federal and Regional environment protection institutions will review and approve it and will issue an environmental permit/clearance where applicable. The Federal and Regional environment protection offices will undertake environmental and social monitoring and audits where required to ensure that the implementing agencies are complying with their Environmental and Social Management Plans (ESMPs).
74. *Practical experience of Implementing agencies in managing environmental and social risks and impacts management.* The Central Statistics Agency has recently implemented a World Bank financed Statistics for Results (SFR) project. The SFR project was aimed to strengthen the Central Statistics Agency's (CSA) institutional capacity and was engaged in the development of office infrastructures and IT facilities. As a result, the CSA has gained experiences in Environmental and Social Risk Management through its practices of implementing the SRF ESMF for all the subprojects implemented. It managed to prepare and implement several ESIA/ESMP instruments for the head and branch office buildings constructed. The SRF PCMU consisted of an E&S risk management specialists, which oversaw ESMF implementation has been disbanded after the termination of the SRF project in September 2019. Besides, CSA has a practical hands-on experience for number of World Bank financed Pfor R projects as a verifier of DLIs. The E&S risk management experiences gained were not institutionalized into the CSA system, and as a result, the CSA currently lacks an E&S risk management unit. However, during the consultations, CSA's readiness to apply similar arrangements for E&S risk management through inclusion of E&S specialists in the PIU to be established for the Regional Statistics PforR was noted.
75. Similarly, in relation to practices related to environmental and social risk management of PDC, it was noted during the consultations that the PDC has gained experiences in E&S management from the works it has done

in partnership with several International and multilateral organizations such as Development Assistant Group (DAG), UNDP, IGAD and CoMESA.

### *2.2 Occupational and community Health and safety performance*

76. Now a day occupational health and safety is becoming a fundamental human right. Most of the activities of related with Occupational Health and Safety/ OHS / and Environmental and Social management/ ESM / issues are handled as an integral part of in several directorates of the government organization for instance in several governmental organizations, safety experts are assigned under human resource section/directorate. Similarly, Gender experts and women, children and youth experts are assigned in several government organizations.
77. Several guidelines that can serve the proper implementation of occupational health and safety issues are prepared by MoLSA and under implementation. HIV/AIDS and COVID-19 prevention at workplace are shared as an experience for public sectors. The organization made possible that in the revised proclamation Labor Proclamation No.1156/2019 revised the minimum age for work from age of 14 to age of 15 years. To this Proclamation, “young worker” means a natural person who has attained the age of 15 but is below the age of 18 years. It is prohibited to employ a person less than 15 years of age. This will help school age children stay in the school.

#### *2.2.1 Implementation Challenges*

78. According to the key informant from MoLSA, the federal civil service and labor law proclamations are employed at all level of the government structure to ensure basic safety of workers, however the law enforcement bestowed to MoLSA to ensure the adherence of the proclamation requirement for occupational health and safety in the public sectors is very limited. The system in place is only responsive to demand for reconciliation between conflicting parties. The only relationship with government organization around safety is sharing experience and encouraging the good practice in the area.
79. Most government organization also focus on insurance as a safety measure for their workers. However, the insurance industry is focusing on compensation payment for damage instead of prevention.

### *2.3 Gender and Gender Based Violence*

80. Several reports indicate the presence of GBV cases in almost all regions of the country. According to the Demographic and Health Survey (DHS), 2016, Central Statistical Agency, Addis Ababa, the prevalence of GBV in SNNP was 29% and in Oromia 38%. This high prevalence of GBV case needs considerable attention. To address/minimize the cases and issues the effort of the country is encouraging. Effort is made to put strong system in place to prevent and respond GBV/SEA/SH. In all government institution there is a department responsible to manage works on women, children, and youth. Most organization, child mainstreaming directorate and Gender inclusion directorates are available in all region.
81. The revised criminal law (Proclamation No.414/2004 the criminal code of the federal democratic republic of Ethiopia) gives major attention for gender issues. In the justice system, responsible departments to follow the issue of women and children are in place from federal woreda level. National taskforce with more than 17 governmental and non-governmental organization chaired by federal attorney general working on issues of women and children are established and working on the issue. The task force is led by memorandum of understanding, strategies, and strategic plan.
82. In addition to these, nationally, more than 37 One stop centers and 22 rehabilitation centers and several three- and four-digit Hotline service are established to prevent and respond GBV/SHE cases and issues. Besides, women and children’s safe space, including child friendly courts are established and operational in several governmental organization at different level.
83. The ratification of the Family Law and amendments made to the criminal code significantly help to fight abuses committed against women and children. Proclamation No. 1156/2019 Labour proclamation gives special attention to woman and young workers. The proclamation provides protection for women in general and pregnant women from hard work and long hours. The law clearly states that women should not be discriminated against as regards to employment and payment based on their sex.

84. Recently, the public sectors periodic strategic plans give major emphasis for GBV prevention and response interventions. According to the information gathered from the consultation with MoWC, including the action/activities to ensure gender equality and GBV prevention and response component in the annual plan of the sectors is becoming one of the criteria of MoFEC to accept and endorse the organization annual plan.

#### *2.3.1 Implementation Challenges*

85. International and national legal frameworks and various national implementation strategies are in place which relate to GBV/SEA-SH such as the National Action Plan for Gender Equality and the National Strategy on Harmful Traditional Practices. Practical measures are also on progress, for instance, to strengthen the criminal justice response (build police and prosecutor capacity to deal with cases) or policies and procedures to tackle GBV/SEA-SH in the education system. Besides, there is a National GBV Working Group/taskforce. However, inadequate protection from domestic violence and the lack of criminalization of marital rape continued harmful traditional practices weak coordination among service providers like medical, psycho-social, legal services etc. are inadequately prepared to deal with GBV/SEA-SH and the social work system remains as a challenge.

#### *2.4 Vulnerable and underserved groups*

86. In addition to the vulnerable groups defined in the national social protection policy, the constitutionally recognized largest historically underserved and disadvantaged category in Ethiopia also includes those living in the emerging or “developing regional states” (DRS), and within them, pastoralists and ethnic minorities (Article 89(4)) as well as the pastoralists and agro-pastoralists residing in some parts of Oromia and SNNP regions. DRS includes the regional states of Gambella, Benishangul-Gumuz, Afar and Somali. All four DRS are borderland regions that are more remote, with less developed roads, infrastructure and communications.

Various measures were undertaken to improve the livelihoods of vulnerable and underserved groups by the government and projects. In most cases, the interventions identify and assess the situation of these groups. Following that targeted support such as direct transfer, employment and income generation schemes were implemented in collaboration with development partners. For example, MOWCY has developed an alternative childcare guidelines to provide appropriate services for vulnerable children through different mechanisms. Moreover, Social Protection Fund was also established in 2020.

#### *2.4.1 Implementation Challenges*

87. Despite these efforts, the following challenges still prevail:

- Inadequate awareness and prevalence of misconceptions about special needs issues.
- Poor adherence of the government standard service guideline during care and support intervention for vulnerable children
- Weak coordination of the support provided for vulnerable groups.

#### *2.5 Social Conflicts*

88. During the last four years, in addition to the prevalence of inter-tribal or ethnic-based conflicts, Ethiopia has experienced various internal conflicts in different parts of the country. Due to security problems some parts of the country, projects as well as regular government activities including national census were not conducted. In addition, the internal displacement of people because of conflicts in different parts of the country resulted in temporary demographics change in the hosting community.

89. Regarding conflicts and conflict resolution mechanisms, The Proclamation No. 1097/2018 Article 13 (1g), which specifies the powers and duties of the federal ministries has given a mandate to Ministry of Peace to, “identify factors serving as causes of conflicts among communities; submit a study proposing recommendations to keep communities away from conflicts and instability and implement same upon approval”. As a result, in most parts of the country where conflicts erupted, the formal and informal institutions with the support of the MOP and in collaboration with the regional and federal security forces helped in resolving the conflicts. This helped to resume most activities, including of projects.

#### *2.6 Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM)*

90. The National Planning and Development Commission have the system in place to address the grievance through the already established GRM committee and through Ethics department.

91. Besides, all regional governments have established their respective Public-GRM structures down to woreda level with focal points located in the Kebeles. At kebele level, GRM committee members are drawn from kebele administration, teachers, DAs, HEWs, and the community. At woreda level, it is composed of representatives from the local administration, education, health, women and child affairs, and the community.

The reporting structure starts from the woreda by the assigned GRM officers reporting to the woreda administrator, who in turn submits regular consolidated reports to the GRM office at the regional level. The head of the regional GRM office is accountable to the regional presidents and provides regionally consolidated reports to the Ethiopian Institute of Ombudsman. Regarding working documents, except Gambella and Afar, all regions have laws that enforces the implementation of GRM.

#### 2.7 Public Participation/Consultation

92. The practice of involving the community and engaging the stakeholders in projects starting from planning to implementation monitoring and performance evaluation is significantly improving. The public consultation guideline for ESIA recently prepared and endorsed by EFCCC will help the effort of the implementing agencies and stakeholders to participate the project affected communities and other stakeholders in the program implementation process.

### **Section -3- Analysis of Environmental and Social Management Systems against Core Principles of PforR Financing**

This section presents the analysis of core principles of PforR financing in light of the consistency of government's environmental and social management systems. The core principles are analyzed considering applicability, strength, gaps, opportunities, risks and the recommended actions.

**Core Principle #1:** Program E&S management systems are designed to (a) promote E&S sustainability in the Program design; (b) avoid, minimize, or mitigate adverse impacts; and (c) promote informed decision-making relating to a Program's E&S effects.

#### **Applicability:** Applicable.

The three result areas identified for the Regional Statistics P for R which are harmonization, quality and dissemination of statistics (Result area-1), extended data for policy package (Result area- 2), as well as infrastructure and institutional development (Result area 3) are anticipated to involve activities that may have environmental and social implications going forward, entailing risks and potentially inducing adverse impacts through disposal of old or used electronic equipment that may result to soil and water contamination through the release of heavy metals and potentially air pollution by release of dioxins and PM10 through melting of materials if not properly managed. Development of office buildings is also anticipated to cause different E&S risks and impacts. Direct social impacts associated with the project may also occur in relation to data protection and use associated with collection of statistics. The project P for R activities will have moderate environmental and social risk and impacts and thus will need to be implemented in compliance with the World Bank core principles (OP/BP 9.0) and country E&S requirements. Thus, the applicability of core principle-1 to the Regional Statistics P for R remains high.

#### **Strengths**

- The Country has adopted the key principles of environmental and social management and sustainable development at different levels of its main legislations and policies including in the FDRE Constitution and Environment Policy of Ethiopia (EPE). The Environment Policy of Ethiopia (1997) is aimed at guiding sustainable social and economic development of the country through the conservation and sustainable utilization of the natural, man-made and cultural resources and the environment at large.
- The Country has put in place EIA Proclamation No.299/2002 which defines the fundamental requirements and procedures for environmental and social impact assessment. The EIA proclamation provides the legal and regulatory framework that guide environmental and social impact assessments applicable at National level. This Federal EIA law has been in force for

nearly two decades and hence its systemic enforcement was growing and expanding over the years. Furthermore, whereas some of the regional states that will be involved in the implementation of the proposed Regional Statistics P for R apply the Federal EIA law as it is in their regions (e.g., SNNPR, Gambella and Benishangul regions) the other regions such as Amhara, Oromia and Tigray states have already enacted their own customized version of EIA regulations based on the Federal EIA law to further contextualize and strengthen the EIA system in their respective jurisdictions.

- Article 4(1) of the Federal EIA proclamation and relevant sections of the subsequent regional EIA regulations highlights some of the main aspects for consideration while carrying impact assessments. These include site location, nature of project, cumulative effects, duration, reversibility or irreversibility of the effects of the project, etc. There are also other provisions in the Federal EIA proclamation such as article 8(1&2) which require to provide sufficient information in EIA reports and outlining the minimum information requirement EIA reports should contain that are essential for informed decision-making during EIA review and approval. The Federal EIA procedural guidelines and Amhara Region EFWPDA EIA guideline also elaborates further on the level of information requirement for acceptable EIA report. Consideration of these aspects by the EIA law would confirm with the principles and key planning elements of Core principle 1 on environmental and social risk management.
- The Inclusion of concerns and opinions of affected communities in the EIA study process is also considered as one important issue in preparing an acceptable EIA both at Federal and Regional levels. The Federal EIA law has also made it clear in article 15(1) (and relevant sections of subsequent regional EIA regulations) by stating that the Authority (i.e., EFCCC) or the relevant regional environmental agency shall ensure that the comments made by the public and in particular by the communities likely to be affected by the implementation of a project are incorporated into the environmental impact study report as well as in its evaluation. In a similar move with the Federal EFCCC, the Amhara, Oromia, Tigray, SNNPR, Gambella and Benishangul Gumuz regional EPAs does not consider an EIA report not consisting of evidence for community consultation as acceptable one for clearance or approval.
- The implementation of the Federal EIA proclamation by the EFCCC is also supported by EIA procedural guideline (2003) and ESMP preparation guideline (2004) which provides the essential procedural steps for carrying out EIA and the required minimum contents of an ESMP. The EIA procedural guideline requires that prior to the commencement of EIA studies, pre-screening consultations, screening and scoping exercises needs to be done in order to categorize the proposed project into one of the three schedules of activities (Schedule I, II or III). The EIA procedural guideline has consisted in its annexes the list of project types that are categorized under the schedules (i.e. I to III). On the other side, the ESMP preparation guideline requires ESMPs to consist of summary of identified impacts, proposed mitigation and enhancement measures, institutional arrangements for implementation of the mitigation and monitoring measures, and preliminary cost estimates to ensure mitigation and monitoring measures are adequately funded for implementation. These guidelines are widely applied not only by the EFCCC at Federal level, but more or less by all regional EPAs (i.e. Oromia, SNNPR, Tigray, Gambella and Benishangul Gumuz Regional states). The Amhara Region EFWPDA have published its own version of an EIA guideline (Directive no.01/2010) which more or less is similar but more elaborate than the Federal EIA guidelines and have distributed it for use by its zonal and woreda branch offices in the region.
- The Country has environment protection institutions at Federal and Regional levels mandated to enforce the EIA Proclamation and other environmental management related policies and legislations. EFCCC is the Federal environment institution responsible to enforce the EIA law at National level. There are also Regional Environment institutions in the regions responsible for enforcing the EIA system. Most of these Regional Environment Forest and Climate Change Authorities have organizational structures that go down to the Zone and Woreda levels (e.g:

Oromia, SNNPR, Tigray, Amhara and Benshangul Gumuz regions). Whereas the Federal EFCCC is responsible for enforcing the EIA law on development projects licensed by the Federal Government and on those that will have trans-regional impacts, the regional environment protection bureaus are generally responsible for enforcing the EIA law on development projects licensed by their respective regional authorities. Within the regional environment protection authorities, though some variation exist between regions, the woreda level offices are usually mainly responsible for carrying out environmental performance monitoring of approved project ESMPs and for review and approval of Schedule III (Category C) sub projects.

- All of the Regional head offices, and many of the zone and woreda level environment protection offices are getting increasingly involved in enforcing the environmental management system in general and in the review and approval process of EIAs, EMPs and E&S screening reports from World Bank financed projects which is helping them gain more experiences on handling environmental and social safeguard instruments.

## Gaps

The analysis identified significant gaps in how the system functions or operates in actual practice, which constrains the ability of the EIA process to be a meaningful tool for utilization in sector-specific development programs/projects. What follows is an analysis that focuses on performance gaps in the application of the national system for environmental management in the context of proposed Regional Statistics P for R.

- There is a gap in systemic functionality in environmental and social management due to absence of an environmental management system in the program institutions, i.e. Central Statistics Agency and National Planning and Development Commission (NDPC), that oversees the compliance of all public or donor financed projects and programs implemented by them.
- The CSA used to have a Project Coordination and Management Unit (PCMU) for ESFRP that consisted of environmental and social safeguard specialists. However, the PCMU was disbanded after completion of the ESFR project, and the E&S management capacity and experiences developed was not retained and institutionalized into the CSA system. Both CSA and NPDC lacks trained and skilled staff in E & S risk managements.
- Gaps in awareness at implementing agencies levels on ESMS which may affect the fulfillment of environmental and social requirements.
- Shortage of budget resources for carrying out site level verification of screening reports and environmental performance monitoring and enforcements by the Federal regional, and zonal environment protection offices.
- There are shortages of basic office logistics in the regional and zonal environment offices such as desktop computers, laptops, printers, cameras and transport facilities which heavily constrain them to carry their routine regulatory activities.
- There is still a gap in the level of awareness on ESSA and screening procedures in program implementing institutions and the environment offices and hence need to provide continued capacity building training on environmental management focused on ESIA methodologies, safeguard instruments such as ESSA and P for R financing mechanisms to ensure presence of adequate capacities in the program implementing institutions and regional environment offices which are affected by high staff turn-over.
- Overall, there is a shortage of environmental and social experts within the regional environment sector offices. Though the woreda environment offices are structurally expected to be staffed well, they are generally found staffed with 1to3 employees in most woredas. Thus, there are insufficient numbers of experts in the woreda environment offices who tend to be easily overwhelmed with small tasks.
- Budget resources dedicated for environmental and social issues management are a serious problem with respect to on time environmental management. Despite the requirement of some

donors for the inclusion of budgets for the environmental management of development activities in Ethiopia, this remains to be far adequate in terms of implementation.

## **Opportunities**

- The Country has put in place various environmental and social management policies, legislations and guidelines that support the development of broader environmental protection and management systems in Ethiopia. It has also been exercising the implementation and enforcement of these environmental protection and management laws through the environment protection institutions it established at federal, regional and zonal levels. Though implementation and enforcement of the environmental protection and management systems in the country has been going for nearly two decades spearheaded by these environment protection institutions, more needs to be done to strengthen the performance capacity of the system especially at regional and zonal levels.

There are opportunities to strengthen the capacity of the Federal, regional and zonal environment protection institutions, agriculture and natural resource offices, and the land administration and utilization institutions by:

- Provision of continuous training on the preparation, review and approval procedures of ESIA and other environmental and social safeguard instruments for CSA and NDPC staff and build upon the existing capacity building trainings to ensure capacity development.
- Strengthening the coordination among Federal and regional level environmental institutions as regulators and the offices of Central Statistics Agency and National Planning and Development Commission offices as program implementers;
- Enhance and share good practices and experiences gained from Ethiopia Statistics for Result (ESFR) implementation in environmental and social management practices, ESMF applications including E&S screening and approval procedures in the Central Statistics Agency and National Planning and Development Commission offices.
- Development of E-wastes recycling and disposal management guideline pursuant to the Electrical and Electronic Waste Management and Disposal Council of Ministers Regulations No. 425/2018 that applies for the E-waste stream to be generated during operation of Regional Statistics P for R project at all levels of the Central Statistics Agency and National Planning and Development Commission offices, as per the national standards and guidelines.
- Putting in place updated written procedure, timely, appropriate and responsive GRM guideline and procedures for grievances.

## **Risks**

Overall, the risk of not complying with the principles and key planning elements of Core principle 1 of environmental and social risk management for the proposed Regional Statistics P for R project is that subproject works will be carried without ensuring that adverse environmental and social effects are addressed. This in turn will risk for the occurrence of unpredicted environmental and social risks that will undermine the program effectiveness. Moreover, the E-waste and related hazardous waste generation associated with the operational phases of the Regional Statistics P for R project will go unchecked for its environmental and social effects and may risk environmental degradation through improper disposal.

Generally, the risk of not addressing the identified gaps above and not capitalizing on the opportunities will potentially result in the proposed Regional Statistics P for R project not being able to operate in a system-based approach which would allow it to effectively manage environmental and social impacts. Thus, there will be no mechanism for addressing the limited potential impacts of the subprojects which will be inconsistent with the principles of PforR financing. Specific risks to the proposed program will be:

- Potential environmental and social impacts of the main components of the Regional Statistics P for R project including office building construction works will not be identified, mitigated, and monitored.
- No mechanism will be in place for safe and environmentally sound disposal of used IT equipment and related hazardous wastes.
- Community and stakeholder concerns will not be consistently taken into account in environmental, social and safety issues identification and mitigation.
- Inadequate or no budget will be allocated for environmental, social and safety management and no environmental and social issues management and precaution will be applied.
- The overall risks are deemed to be **Moderate**

### **Actions**

- Owing to the scale of sub-projects in the Regional Statistics P for R project, there will be a need to recruit environmental and social development specialist in the project management unit in the CSA that serve both program implementing directorates in CSA and NPDC offices. These focal persons will be responsible for providing coordination, guidance and preparing the E&S screening reports, getting environmental clearance for sub-projects. They will also be responsible for supervising the compliance of the Regional Statistics P for R subprojects with the environmental and social management requirements.
- Develop E-waste recycling and disposal management guideline pursuant to the Electrical and Electronic Waste Management and Disposal Council of Ministers Regulations No. 425/2018, that applies for safe disposal of the E-waste stream to be generated during operation of Regional Statistics P for R project at all levels CSA and NPDC offices.
- Provide awareness raising training on Environmental and Social Management Systems, World Bank core principles of P for R financing (OP/BP 9.0) , the ESSA and its associated disbursement linked indicators to the management and relevant staff of the CSA and NPDC offices.
- Provide technical training on the preparation, review and approval procedures of E&S screening, ESMP and ESIA reports, GRM and other environmental and social safeguard instruments including safety management instruments to the relevant CSA and NPDC staff at Federal and Regional levels as well as staff of the environment protection offices in Federal and regional level targeted for Program implementation.

**Core Principle #2:** Program E&S management systems are designed to avoid, minimize, or mitigate adverse impacts on natural habitats and physical cultural resources resulting from the Program. Program activities that involve the significant conversion or degradation of critical natural habitats or critical physical cultural heritage are not eligible for PforR financing

### **Applicability:**

The three result areas identified for the Regional Statistics P for R which are harmonization, quality and dissemination of statistics (Result area-1), extended data for policy package (Result area- 2), as well as infrastructure and institutional development (Result area 3) are anticipated to involve activities that are potentially less significant as to pose adverse impacts on natural habitats and physical cultural resources. This is due to the fact that the activities of the first result area are to improve harmonization and quality of statistics by producing and supporting the implementation of regional guidelines, extending the data quality and comparability framework at the regional level. Activities of the second result area are also to produce poverty-, labor-, enterprise-, agricultural- and other socio-economic statistics. The activities in the third result area will upgrade IT infrastructure including the setup of data servers and equipment to implement tablet-surveys while establishing technology to monitor and analyze incoming data on-the-fly. Subproject activities that would emanate from these result areas are anticipated to have less potential to adversely affect natural habitats and physical cultural resources. Thus, the applicability of Core principle 2 is predicted to be generally low. However, in the event that a subproject activity poses significant

adverse impact on natural habitats and physical cultural resources, the national environmental management system has the following.

**Strengths: -**

The EIA Proclamation (2002) and the EIA procedural guideline (2003) are consistent with Core Principle 2. Specifically, under article 7(1), the Federal ESIA proclamation (and subsequent regional regulations) states that a project proponent shall undertake an environmental impact assessment to identify the likely adverse impacts of projects and incorporate the means of their prevention or containment and submit the environmental impact study report to the Authority (i.e., EFCCC) or the relevant regional environmental agency. Moreover, the kind of adverse impacts a project proponent is required to assess includes any change to the environment or to its component that may affect flora, fauna, natural or cultural heritage, or in general, subsequently alter environmental, social, economic or cultural conditions. Thus, the Federal proclamation on ESIA has provisions by which it considers the issues of conserving natural habitats and physical cultural resources which are the main concerns of Core principle 2 of the environmental and social risk management. Areas where Ethiopia's environmental management system functions well include the following strengths:

- The ESIA proclamation is clear in the objectives of an ESIA to protect the environment (natural systems);
- Annex I of the ESIA procedural guideline (2003) list environmentally sensitive ecosystems that include National parks, forest reserves, wildlife reserves and sanctuaries, wildlife corridors, and areas containing endangered flora and fauna as additional criteria for screening.
- Annex II of the ESIA procedural guideline (2003) list the potential adverse impacts of concern during the screening process which include consideration of effects on cultural, religious, historic, archaeological and scientific resources.
- An Authority for Research and Conservation of Cultural Heritage (ARCCCH) was established by Proclamation No. 209/2000, and one of its major responsibilities is the protection of cultural heritage against man-made and natural disasters.
- The country has well-defined legal/regulatory systems for safeguarding environment and ecologically significant areas from pollution, for excluding activities that are likely to have significant adverse impacts on eco-sensitive areas, forest and hilly areas and wetlands.
- Overall, the analysis confirmed that there are no significant inconsistencies between OP/BP 9.00 and Ethiopia's policies, laws, and regulations related to natural habitats.

**Gaps:**

- There is a gap in capacity to assess the potential impacts of Regional statistics P for R subproject works on physical cultural resources and natural habitats by the CSA and NPDC offices.
- Physical cultural heritages are not well documented or exhaustively listed at regional and woreda levels.
- No awareness and unavailability of resources to implement the chance find procedures, when applicable.

**Opportunities: -**

The opportunities identified for core principle one are also applicable to this Core Principle. Besides environmental and social screenings to be conducted for Regional Statistics P for R subproject sites will have to consider the potential adverse impacts on existing natural habitats and PCRs found within and around the sites and devise mechanisms to avoid those impacts.

**Risks: -**

- Physical cultural heritages are not exhaustively listed and could be lost unintentionally

- Lack of awareness among implementing agencies on existing environmental regulations.
- The overall risks are deemed to be **low**

**Actions: -**

- Include topics on PCRs and its identification, conservation and chance find procedures in the technical trainings on ESMS to be provided to relevant staff of CSA and NPDC offices as well as environment protection offices as recommended in the actions for core principle 1.
- Encourage the participation of communities during subproject screening to benefit from their local indigenous knowledge on PCR identification.
- Include guidance on chance find procedures in the guidelines to be prepared to provide overall guidance on the requirements and procedures for environmental and social screening of subprojects.

**Core Principle #3:** Program E&S management systems are designed to protect public and worker safety against the potential risks associated with (a) the construction and/or operation of facilities or other operational practices under the Program; (b) exposure to toxic chemicals, hazardous wastes, and otherwise dangerous materials under the Program; and (c) reconstruction or rehabilitation of infrastructure located in areas prone to natural hazards

**Applicability: Applicable**

The Regional Statistics P for R project will engage public workers, workers hired by the project (direct workers such as consultants, technical experts, survey data enumerators and other workers), and workers hired by contractors under the project. These involve CSA, PDC and PIU staff engaged in project implementation, as well as staff working in outsourced subprojects. The Extended Data-for-Policy package result area (Result area 2) is also anticipated to create temporary jobs and employment for many enumerators during surveys. While most of the workers involved are public workers governed by the government civil service proclamation, other workers hired by the project (PIUs, consultants, etc) and project contractor need to be contracted in line with the requirements of Core principle-3 in relation to labor and working conditions, occupational health, and public safety. Thus, Core Principle 3 is applicable to the Program as it finances activities to upgrade IT infrastructure including the setup of data servers and equipment to implement tablet-surveys. The provisions in Core Principle 3 are considered as part of the ESIA process analyzed under Core Principle 1

**Strengths**

Worker's safety issues are addressed in conformity with P for R financing, through Labour and Social Affairs sector proclamations and guidelines, namely the Labour Proclamation (No. 1156/2019) and Federal Civil Servants Proclamation No. 1064/2017.

- Proclamation No. 1156/2019) is the prevailing law that is applicable at Federal and in all the regions the P for R program will be implemented. The Federal and Regional Labor and Social Affairs offices are responsible to ensure the health and safety of workers and the public is protected.
- The Federal Civil Servants Proclamation No. 1064/2017 also provides for occupational safety and health protection with the objectives to maintain the safety and health of civil servants.
- Based on the Civil Servant proclamation requirements for occupational safety and health protection, both CSA and NPDC have a staff for occupational health under its general service sections of HR Directorates that exercise OHS protection for employees.
- Building Proclamation no.624/2009 and regulation no. 243/2011 serves to protect the safety of the public and workers in the construction sector. These laws and guidelines are enforced by the Federal Ministry of Construction and the Urban Development and Construction Bureaus in the regions.
- The EIA proclamation and its regulations contain several provisions for public and worker safety, which are consistent with and aligned with core principles 3.

## Weaknesses/Gaps

Public and worker safety aspects are adequately covered through the aforementioned proclamations and directives. However,

- No/limited capacity with technical person, safety materials provision, and budget to conduct regular supervision on the compliance of national and international safety standards.
- No/limited experience or devotion to and enforcement of safety rules such as use of personal protective equipment.
- Weak or no supervision on safety management
- Lack of awareness on public health and safety issues,

## Opportunities

The analysis identified several Program level opportunities to be considered and treated in the ESSA Action Plan through capacity building elements, including:

- Provision of adequate budget, logistic facilities and technical persons for regular supervision,
- Develop procedures for providing safety orientation and briefings to be given to workers during induction to subproject activities.
- Provide training in workplace health and safety procedures for relevant CSA, PDC and related staff members.
- Develop a system for regular monitoring and inspection for timely prevention and remedial actions.
- Aware the community on safety issues.
- Ensure that measures on occupational health and safety and natural hazards are integrated within the program;
- Provide training on early warning systems design to experts and local communities in areas prone to hazards.

## Risks

If the gaps and opportunities identified are not addressed, there will not be a program-based approach for addressing the OHS issues nor would it be consistent with the guiding principles of P for R financing. In addition, the following specific risks will be highlighted during program implementation period:

- No or limited availability of Safety protection materials at work site
- No or limited PPE available for workers
- Weak adherence of COVID prevention and control measure by data collector during data collection
- No or limited awareness on safety precautions and management among staffs and officials
- Inability to ensure public and worker safety can result in injuries and loss of life. In addition, the risks identified for strengthening the system for Core Principle 1 are applicable to Core Principle 3. The overall risks are deemed to be **‘moderate’**.

## Actions

- Provision of adequate budget, logistic facilities and technical persons for regular supervision,
- Develop procedures for providing safety orientation and briefings to be given to workers during induction to subproject activities.
- Provide training in workplace health and safety procedures for relevant CSA, PDC and related staff members.
- Develop a system for regular monitoring and inspection for timely prevention and remedial actions.

- Aware the community on safety issues.
- Ensure that measures on occupational health and safety and natural hazards are integrated within the program.  
Provide training on early warning systems design to experts and local communities in areas prone to hazards.

**Core Principle #4:** Program E&S systems manage land acquisition and loss of access to natural resources in a way that avoids or minimizes displacement and assists affected people in improving, or at the minimum restoring, their livelihoods and living standards.

**Applicability: Applicable**

The proposed interventions such as upgrading IT and statistical infrastructure will involve construction activities that will require land acquisition and cause involuntary resettlement and restriction of access to natural resource. Considering this fact, the assessment found the analysis of Core Principle 4 is applicable.

**Strength:**

- The availability of Government of Ethiopia’s Legislation (Proclamation No 1161/2019, Regulation No. 472/2020) and regional proclamation on land administration and use for most of the regional states with clear articles that stipulate the process of land acquisition, resettlement, and compensation processes for public service. Most of the articles of the legislations are consistent with the requirements of core principle.
- Availability of Public Consultation Guideline for ESIA (2020) by EFCCC.

**Gaps:**

- Absence of dedicated safeguard units in the implementing agencies that will oversee ESRM related issues from environmental and social risks and impacts screening to implementation of mitigation measures.
- Lack of experience in proactively planning and implementation of land acquisition and resettlement.

**Opportunities:**

- Previous experiences in the world Bank supported Statistics project for result to build on and capitalize for better implementation of the program

**Risks:** Though it is anticipated the project will involve improvement of institutional set up, it may not result major resettlement issue. The proposed program activities that involve land acquisition are not only anticipated to be small in scale but also mostly impact land owned by the public (government’s offices existing premises). Moderate

**Recommended Actions:**

- Ensure sub projects are passing through proper environmental and social risk and impact scoping and screening.
- Ensure the availability of adequate and proper consultation with stakeholders and affected communities.
- In the few instances where land acquisition, resettlement, or loss of access to resources is necessary, the concerned organs should ensure that PAPs received compensation and are properly resettled before the land is expropriated.
- Ensure the availability of project specific functional GRM system.
- Ensure that the acquired land for construction of branch offices have followed acceptable procedure and free from right of way issue.

**Core Principle #5:** Program E&S systems give due consideration to the cultural appropriateness of, and equitable access to, Program benefits, giving special attention to the rights and interests of Sub-Saharan African Historically Underserved Traditional Local Communities, and to the needs or concerns of vulnerable groups.

**Applicability: Applicable**

In Ethiopia, there are vulnerable and underserved groups that need special attention. Given the nature of the Regional Statistics P for R Project and the three result areas intervention/ application will have an impact on the areas where the Indigenous Peoples/Sub-Saharan African Historically Underserved Traditional Local Communities (IPs/SSAHUTLC) present or have collective attachment. For instance, the emphasis given for inclusion of underserved traditional local communities as a target group during the production of poverty- labor and other socio -economic statistics will be minimal. Besides, the gap in conducting free prior and informed consultation and getting consent from UTLC during project implementation and data collection, gaps in full adherence of the standard and acceptable ethical consideration during data collection and absence of system to ensure the buy in of the census and research findings by UTLC are also a risks of the project that requires attention. Since the statistical results / findings of the proposed project are fundamental for policy and program formulation that will result exclusion of the group and decision making that will expand the existing gap and discrimination the core principle is applicable, and the gaps needs to be properly addressed.

**Strengths:**

- The policies, strategies and constitution clearly emphasis the rights of vulnerable individuals and groups as well as Underserved Traditional Local Communities to have access to services.
- Interest to improve social and gender inclusion as well as equality outcomes across Ethiopia.
- Presence of special support in the to coordinate and provide technical support to disadvantaged areas.
- Most regional governments have commitments to support disadvantage group

**Opportunity:**

- Policy framework supported by political commitment is in place to address the needs of vulnerable groups including gender mainstreaming in various institutions.
- Availability of several directorate in government organization to ensure the inclusion of vulnerable and disadvantaged groups.

**Gaps:**

- Shortage of skilled human resource in social and gender inclusion of disadvantaged group in the development interventions
- Weak coordination of the support provided for vulnerable groups and Underserved Traditional Local Communities

**Risks: moderate**

**Recommended Actions:**

- Ensure the application of the legal frameworks designed and in place to support vulnerable and Underserved Traditional Local Communities across the region and constantly follow the adherence.
- Establish strong coordination between oversight bodies working on vulnerable groups including children, youth and women.
- Strengthen the work units working for mainstreaming of the issues of underserved and vulnerable groups.
- Ensure the proper participation and consultation of vulnerable and Underserved Traditional Local Communities during planning, implementation, and monitoring

**Core Principle #6:** Program E&S systems avoid exacerbating social conflict, especially in fragile states, post-conflict areas, or areas subject to territorial disputes.

**Applicability: Applicable**

The assessment found the analysis of Core Principle 6 is applicable because of two major reasons.

1. The proposed program by its nature will exacerbate social conflict, however since Ethiopia has been included in the FY 22 FCS list the operation of the program will be considered in a fragile state context.
2. Besides the current conflict situation in various part /regions of the country that includes Tigray, Amhara , Afar , Benshiangul Gumuz and Oromia regions will have an impact the implementation of some project activities in the area i.e. some components of result area -2- Extended Data for policy package -produce poverty-, labor- and other socio-economic statistics through household budget and labor force surveys, produce enterprise statistics with details on labor demand and productivity and producing agricultural census information and agricultural productivity statistics will be affected. Similarly, the proposed activities of improving institutional set up at sub national/region level will be affected.

**Strength:**

- The formal and informal institutions with the support of the MOP and in collaboration with the regional and federal security forces help in resolving conflicts.

**Gaps:**

- Inadequate attention to the informal conflict resolution practices

**Opportunities:**

- The existence of the legal frameworks that can serve as a basis to address complaints and conflicts related to program implementation.

**Risks:**

- If the current security situation prevails during the proposed program implementation, the implementation will be impacted.

**Recommended Actions:**

- Strengthen the useful experiences in resolving the recently observed social conflicts through blending the formal and informal institutions.

**Section-4 Stakeholders Consultation and Disclosure**

93. The ESSA team of Ethiopia has carried consultative meetings as well as key informant interviews with the main stakeholders of the Regional Statistics PforR in Ethiopia from September 14-17/2021. The consulted stakeholder institutions consist of the two project implementing agencies, i.e. Central Statistics Agency (CSA) and National Planning and Development Commission and three key program oversight bodies/ stakeholders including Environment, Forest and Climate Change Commission (EFCCC), Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MoLSA) and Ministry of Women, Children and Youth (MOWCY). A total of 5 consultative meetings were conducted in five national level government institutions. In this process a total of 22 senior officials and experts were consulted. *The list of participant with their contact detail is annexed at the end of the report.* The consultation meetings and interviews were guided by selected proposed questions adopted from the ESSA preparation methodology guide customized for the present Regional Statistics PforR-Ethiopia. The main issues and concerns discussed during the consultation consisted of the following points:
94. The CSA, as it is the practice with all other government institutions, have both the authority and responsibility to plan, request and utilize financial budget from the national treasury (i.e. Ministry of Finance) for all its activities and programs including for Environmental, Social , Occupational Health and Safety aspects. It was expressed during the consultative meeting that the CSA had been able to commission an ESIA study from its own budgetary resources for the head office building project whose construction was financed by the Government. The PDC, being a government institution, also have similar authority and responsibilities in allocating resources for E & S management when deemed necessary.

95. Both the CSA and PDC have a belief that their main stream work activities are related to data collection, processing and dissemination which they consider to have low or insignificant potential environmental and social impacts. Consultation participants from the PDC underlined that most of the data exchanged with sector MDAs for national planning and to compute national accounts are usually in soft copy and the upcoming capacity building support activities including the present P for R are expected to strengthen further automation of these activities. From this perspective, the CSA and PDC do not have a unit or section that is directly responsible for handling E & S risk management works routinely in all their areas of operation. However, they have firm commitment that E & S risk management activities would be managed either by the existing related departments in the institutions or by special arrangements such as forming PIU, adhoc committees, commissioning of consulting experts, and through interagency collaboration.
96. CSA consultation participants expressed that the Agency has recently concluded the implementation of a World Bank financed project: The Statistics for Results (SFR) project. As a result the CSA has gained experiences in Environmental and Social Risk Management through its practices of implementing the SRF ESMF for all the subprojects implemented. It managed to prepare and implement a number of ESIA/ESMP instruments for the head and branch office buildings constructed. The former SRF PCMU consisted of an E&S risk management specialists, who were in charge of ESMF implementation, has been disbanded after the termination of the SRF project. The E&S risk management experiences gained was not institutionalized into the CSA system, and as a result, the CSA currently lacks an E&S risk management unit. However, during the consultations, CSA's readiness to apply similar arrangements for E&S risk management through inclusion of safeguard specialists in the PIU to be established for the Regional Statistics PforR project was noted.
97. It was noted during the consultations that the PDC has gained experiences in E&S management from the works it has done in partnership with several International and multilateral organizations such as Development Assistant Group (DAG), UNDP, IGAD and CoMESA. As a result, though there is no unit or section directly responsible to manage the environmental and social risk and impact management in its current organizational structure, PDC expressed during the consultation discussion that most of the existing directorates of the PDC have work unit and manpower (i.e. from directorate to officer level) relevant to manage the environmental, social, safety and gender risks and impacts. These include Occupational health and safety officer under the human resource directorate, Property landscaping and beautification section under the general services department, Gender department, Ethics department, Conflict management and Women, children and youth department. The ethics department has an established GRM committee of the organization which is also very instrumental in terms of managing the social, environmental and gender related grievance and concerns.
98. The Human resource directorate of the CSA has a responsible section that administers issues related to Occupational Health and Safety. Certain workplaces and activities are studied by the section and recommended PPEs distributed accordingly (e.g. for Printing workers). However, the OHS protection activities do not cover all operational areas of the CSA including survey data collection workers.
99. Both the CSA and PDC expressed that they have a tradition of conducting consultations with their stakeholders. The CSA operational directorates including the Agriculture and Business Directorates, often conduct consultations with stakeholders during planning of surveys on methodologies and survey tools to be applied as well as data processing and dissemination mechanisms. The mechanisms applied for such stakeholder consultations consist of workshops, forums, meetings and by involving stakeholders in technical teams. These stakeholder consultations are understood to have been largely used for technical discussions and exchange of technical issues of concerns and would also need to consist E & S discussions.
100. In a similar manner the PDC also conducts consultations with its stakeholders. The PDC identifies a wide range of institutions as its stakeholders that consists of all Government organizations, NGOs and CSOs. Stakeholder consultations are carried during planning process, implementation as well as monitoring and evaluation. The mainstreaming of Environment and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in to the national plan is carried by PDC in collaboration with the Federal Environment, Forest, and Climate Change Commission (EFCCC).
101. Participants of the consultation at PDC raised questions on the scope of the ESSA assessment, by querying whether it is focused on National systems level, Organizational level or Project level? In response to the query, the consultants explained that the ESSA assessment is focused both at National ESMS level and Organizational (i.e. Institutional) levels. It was further explained that, the proposed project being a P for R, it will be implemented in compliance with the country E&S requirements, which is being assessed for its compatibility with and fulfillment of the World Bank OP/BP 9.00 core principles. Thus the ESSA assessment will look at the laws and policies defining the ESMS system at national level and also at the existing

mechanisms and capacities of the institutions engaged in its enforcement. The ESSA is also focused on assessing PforR project implementing institutions such as CSA and PDC to understand the existing environmental and social risk management systems, practices, mechanisms, capacities and gaps and to recommend necessary capacity building measures in the program action plan to fill in the gaps.

102. During the consultations held with MoLSA representative, it was noted that the Occupational Health and Safety provisions found in the labor law of Ethiopia (Proclamation No.1156/2019) essentially applies for work places in profit making organizations. However, the scope of application for the National OSH policy and strategy published by MoLSA in 2014 is explained to have stated it to be “in all work place and economic activities”. The OHS protection for work places in public service institution (i.e. Government Institutions) is provided by the Proclamation on Federal Civil Servants (No.1064/2017). It was also explained that there are more than 578 OHS inspectors throughout the Country enforcing the OHS rules and regulations derived from the labor law. The present number of OHS inspectors is insufficient to cover the enforcement of OHS in all working places throughout the country. Though the legal provisions for OHS in both the Federal labor and civil servant laws are elaborate, it was also explained that its enforcement is constrained by shortage of resources both in MoLSA and the civil service institutions.

### **Section -5- Summary of key implementation challenges and Recommended Actions**

#### *5.1 Gaps/ Implementation Challenges in environmental and social risk and impacts management*

103. Inadequate capacity /absence of dedicated safeguard units /to manage safeguard related issues in the implementing agencies. However, there are experts in several directorates that are accountable to manage, gender, safety, GRM and other safeguard related activities.
104. Low law enforcement. Most of the time ,organization are not accountable for unaccomplished activities /non discharged responsibilities related with environmental, health, safety and gender requirements including prevention and responding of GBV/SHE in the workplace, inclusion of underserved and vulnerable group and ensuring their benefit in the development intervention, prevention of workers safety at workplace and preventing child labor and abuse .
105. Lack of prevention centered OHS system in organizations. Most organization have safety experts in human resource department and workers have work-related insurance. However, the attention provided for prevention is still very minimal.
106. Lack of strategies in place to prevent GBV/SHE in workplace. Most government organization have no gender action plan and GBV COC that serve temporary project workers that will not be governed by civil servant proclamation like Data collectors.
107. Inadequate coordination between program implementing agencies with key oversight bodies /sectors on the environment, social, safety and gender related risks and impacts management.

#### *5.2 Recommended Mitigation Measures and Program Action Plan (PAP)*

1. The following key actions are formulated from the assessment find as mitigation measures to enhance implementing agencies capacity to properly identify and address environmental, social, safety and gender related risks that may occur during the implementation of the proposed project in Ethiopia.
1. Establish and strengthen country level Environmental and Social Management System (ESMS) in implementing agencies.
2. Put system in place to prevent and respond GBV/SEA/SH.
3. Put in place prevention centered OHS measures at the workplaces
4. Ensure the consideration (Inclusion) of vulnerable groups and Underserved Traditional Local communities at all stage of the program’s development and implementation or from planning to performance evaluation.
5. Establishes and strengthen coordination platform among implementing agencies and over sighting bodies
2. The annexed table below presents the suggested Program Action Plan (PAP) that will help to improve the management of environmental, social, safety and gender impacts and risks of the proposed project is in the report.

**Section 6. Annexes**

**Annex-1- Table 1:** Recommended Program Action Plan (PAP) of Ethiopia on Environment and Social Management

<b>No</b>	<b>Action Items</b>	<b>Activities/Actions</b>	<b>Progress Indicator</b>	<b>Level of application</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Output</b>
1	Establish national level Environmental and Social Management System (ESMS) for implementing agencies.	i) Establish environmental and social management unit at the CSA by deploying one environmental and one social safeguard specialists within the PIU who will serve both CSA and PDC.	Availability of functional environmental and social management unit with qualified E&S experts in both implementing agencies.	National level	CSA and PDC	Prior to program implementation	Functional ESRM unit with qualified and skilled manpower
		ii) Organize need based capacity building training on Bank ESRM standards, requirements, and related issues for selected experts of relevant directorates working on ESRM related issues.	Trained and skilled experts on environmental and social risks and impacts management	Federal and regional levels	CSA and PDC	Through out the program period	Experts with better knowledge about ESRM
		iii) Produce and communicate annual and semiannual ESMS (including the performance of GRM system) implementation report.	Periodic report produced and timely communicated	Federal level	CSA and PDC	Through out the program period	
2	Put system in place to Prevent and respond GBV/SEA/SH	Prepare and use COC for GBV for temporary workers (data collectors, enumerators, labor and contract workers on IT infrastructure	COC signed by temporary workers involved in data collection activities of the planed project intervention.	National and region level	CSA and PDC	Through out program period	Workers understand and committed to prevent GBV/SEA/SH

No	Action Items	Activities/Actions	Progress Indicator	Level of application	Responsibility	Timeline	Output
		improvement and other construction activities.)					
		Put in place reporting mechanism for GBV case in a timely manner (within 48 hrs)	Reporting mechanism	National and region level	CSA and PDC	Through out program period	
3	Put in place prevention centered OHS measures at the workplaces	Fulfil required PPE for staffs /temporary workers assigned IT infrastructure improvement and other construction activities.	PPE	National and regional level	CSA and PDC	During program implementation	System in place
		ii) Ensure availability of first aid kits, COVID 19 protective devises, and fire extinguisher	Use of first aid kits and COVID 19 protective devises and fire extinguisher	National and regional level	CSA and PDC	Through out program period	Accidents reduced
4	Ensure the consideration (Inclusion) of vulnerable groups and Underserved Traditional Local communities at all stage of the program's development and implementation or from planning to performance evaluation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Prepare and utilize comprehensive and inclusive and gender sensitive data collection tools and reporting formats to address the inclusion of vulnerable groups including underserved communities.</li> <li>• Ensure the consent of the underserved communities during data collection.</li> </ul>	Number of comprehensive and crosscutting issues sensitive data collection tools and reporting formats	National level	CSA and PDC	During program implementation	Inclusion improved and benefit sharing of the vulnerable groups and underserved communities equally represented in the development intervention ensured



*Annex -2- Partial view consultative meetings with stakeholders and key informant interviews.*

*Figure 1Consultative meetings and key informants interview conducted during ESSA preparation.*



Annex-3- Participant's attendance sheet.

**Eastern Africa Regional Statistics Program-for-Results (P176371)**  
**Environmental and Social Systems Assessment (ESSA)**  
**Stakeholder Engagement/Consultation Process Attendance Sheet, Ethiopia**

Date: 08/09/21 - 17/09/21

No	Name	Institution/Organization	Responsibility	Telephone(Mob)	Signature	E-mail
1	Biratu Yigezu	CSA	BC	0930078404		
2	Aberakh Tahiru	CEA	Deputy Director	0912910662		
3	Zemari Adane	PD C	Advisor	0837927025		
4	Hille Gebre	CSA	IT	0811409817		
5	<del>Yohannes</del>	CSA	H. R. M	0913988222		
6	Releabon H/qiys	CSA	Business	0911982002		
7	Ahmed Faramin	SS	Ami	0811488533		
8	Mesfin yilma	MOLSA	Director/CSH	0911611894		mesfin.yilma@gmail.com
9	Totora Yedessa	EFCC	Director/BIH	0913754222		
10	Lealem Bismaw	MAMUCY	Team leader	0983312355		mylaleo@gmail.com
11	Dereje Tegzebelu	"	Director	0911486460		maucy@isd.gov.et
12	YealemZewed Yehyes	"	Officer	0910548824		yealemzewed@gmail.com
13	Kura Semawet	Mamucy	Officer	0910471664		kuraos1047@gmail.com

**Eastern Africa Regional Statistics Program-for-Results (P176371)**  
**Environmental and Social Systems Assessment (ESSA)**  
**Stakeholder Engagement/Consultation Process Attendance Sheet, Ethiopia**

Date: 15 September 2021

FDRE PLANNING & Development Commission  
 E-mail

No	Name	Institution/Organization	Responsibility	Telephone(Mob)	Signature	
1	Zerdie Adane	PlantDev.com.	Advisor	0937927021		Zerdiadane@yaho
2	Mosen Seido	Berkelley Research	Director General	0811915192		mesoseido@gmail.com
3	Eshetu Admasu	Planning & Dev'com	Director	09113-796345		eshetnadmasu@gmail.com
4	Adnot Teudla	Planning & Dev'com	Team leader	091151962		astarni69@gmail.com
5	Lishan Sibhat	Adman h. s youth (OROS)	Team leader	0913143316		lishansibhat@yahoo
6	Krist Bekele	PLG/Dev'com	PLG leader	0919032808		kristbekele@gmail
7	Tamiru Terese	PDC	Director	091166444		tamirte@gmail
8	Tefera Demiss	PDC	SS	0915810117		teferedemiss@gmail
9	Solomon Tefekelacie	PDC	Advisor	0911804680		solontsrf@gmail
10	Walden Negash	PDC	Director	0978922936		walden@yaho
11						
12						

**Annex -4- Lists of Participants for ESSA stakeholder engagement consultation**

S/N	Name	Institution /organization	Position/responsibility	Telephone	Email
1	Biratu Yigezu	CSA	DG	0930078474	
2	Aberash Tariku	>>	Deputy Director	0912210662	
3	Kifle Gebre	>>	IT	0911409817	
4	Gizachew	>>	H.A.M	091388290	
5	Zelalem H/Giworgis	>>	Business	0911982007	
6	Ahmed Ibrahim	>>	AM	0911485353	
7	Zewdie Adane	PDC	Advisor	0937927021	Zewdieadane@yahoo.com
8	Wosen Seido	>>	Director General	0911915597	wosenseido@gmail.com
9	Eshetu Admasu	>>	HR Director	0913796345	eshetuadmasu@gmail.com
10	Asrat Telela	>>	Team Leader (M&E)	0911154962	<u>Astarni69@gmail.com</u>
11	Lishan Sibhatu	>>	Team Leader (WCY)	0913143316	lishanseb@yahoo.com
12	Kidist Bekele	>>	General Director (Planning)	0912072808	kidistbekele@gmail.com
13	Tamiru Terefe	>>	Director	0911661441	TamirE @yahoo.com
14	Feleke Demsie	>>	Director	0913810517	felekedem@gmail.com
15	Solomon Tesfaselassie	>>	Advisor	0911904620	solomontss@yahoo.com
16	Whiden Negashi	>>	Director	0978923436	negashmuhiden@gmail.com
17	Mesfin Yilma	MOLSA	Director/OHS	0911611884	mesfinyilma@gmail.com
18	Tolosa Yadessa	EFCCC	ESIA Director	0913754227	tyterfa2011@gmail.com
19	Lealem Birhanu	MoWCY	Team Leader	0983312355	mylalexo@gmail.com
20	Dereje Tegrebelu	>>	Director	0911486460	Mocya15d@gmail.com
21	Yalemzewed Yeheyes	>>	Officer	0910549924	Yalemzewedyiheyes10@gmail.com