



1. Project Data:		Date Posted : 06/25/2002	
PROJ ID: P010486		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name : Northwest Frontier Province Primary Education Project	Project Costs (US\$M)	320.01	161.78
Country: Pakistan	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	150.0	83.21
Sector(s): Board: ED - Primary education (93%), Tertiary education (3%), Central government administration (2%), Other social services (2%)	Cofinancing (US\$M)	44.50	29.41
L/C Number: C2687			
	Board Approval (FY)		95
Partners involved : GTZ, DFID, NEDA, KfW	Closing Date	12/31/2000	12/31/2000
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group:
Lenor Armstrong	Anwar M. Shah	Alain A. Barbu	OEDST
2. Project Objectives and Components			
a. Objectives			
<p>The objectives were to improve (i) access, equity and efficiency in primary education, particularly for girls; (ii) the quality of the learning environment for all schools (iii) the organizational framework and the planning, management, assessment and monitoring capacity of the provincial education system; and (iv) village-level beneficiary involvement in all phases of primary education service delivery. The project (PEP) was restructured (see below) but the primary objectives were not changed.</p>			
b. Components			
<p>The four components were: (a) improving access equity and efficiency with sub-components of school planning and construction management, school development, and private sector participation (b) improving the learning environment which included instructional materials, teacher training; (c) improving organizational framework, planning and management through strengthening the Directorate of Primary Education, research, development and evaluation, and institutional improvement incentives; and (d) promoting beneficiary participation. The project was restructured in 1997, as part of a Pakistan-wide effort to restructure the social sector portfolio and align provincial projects with the national Social Action Program. The following elements were added: (i) scholarships for 20,000 rural girls to attend secondary school to improve teacher supply ; (ii) creation of a performance award scheme for female teachers and head teachers; (iii) support of female supervisors for school visits; (iv) development of an interactive radio program; and (v) creation of a fund for innovative pilot activities. Although desirable, these additional activities were unrealistic, given the inattention to the capacities, systems and structures to implement them.</p>			
c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates			
<p>Project cost was US\$342.m. At the closing date (December 31, 2000) 74% of the revised credit amount (59% of the original amount), had been disbursed. Counterpart funding was not available on a timely basis, particularly during the first 3 years of the project.</p>			
3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:			
<p>The major objectives and restructured targets were partly realized. Classroom capacity was increased by 45%, through the provision of 16,000 new classrooms (90% of the revised target) This has facilitated improved access, leading to a 19% increase in student enrollment. The increase in enrollment for girls' only is 38%, while the national annual increase is 1%. The learning environment has improved through</p>			

the upgrading of teacher trainers and teachers, and improvements in instructional materials. More than 3,000 teacher trainers and 56,000 teachers were trained. New textbooks (more than 10.9 million), teacher guides, and supplemental materials were developed and distributed. Furniture was provided only to grades 4-5 children in 4 divisions. Grades 1-3 did not receive furniture, because of difficulties with prototype designs, and delays with procurement. The percentage of schools in need of rehabilitation was reduced from 37% in 1994/95 to 25% in 1999/00, through rehabilitation of 819 schools.

Impact assessment studies indicate improvements in student achievement ranging from 3 -30% points in Urdu and 3 - 41% points in math. However, The planning, management, assessment, and monitoring objectives were partly achieved. The district level management training, although initially successful, was suspended by DFID, following the change in government in 1999. Village level beneficiary involvement has proven to be feasible; however, further action is required to promote sustainability. Over 17,000 Parent Teacher Associations, were instituted and members trained. This has had a positive impact in the community; however, the pilot activities promoting community participation have not yet been absorbed in the government system. There was agreement in favor of support for female supervisors; however, various administrative blockages prevented the provision of the funds. There was no system put in place to administer the scholarship fund for girls, nor the award scheme for female teachers and head teachers, and there was insufficient interest in establishing a program of radio instruction. The research, development and evaluation activities were understaffed and under-funded and therefore achieved little. The Frontier Education Foundation (FEF) aimed at promoting private sector and NGO involvement did not fully realize its aims, primarily due to weak administration and limitations of its charter, and there is no clear policy on public-private partnership and the specific role of the FEF. The target of establishing 60 schools per year in the rural areas and urban slums was not met, and the activities of FEF were sometimes frozen; 90 Rural Community-Based Schools for girls, were established with grant funds and technical assistance from DFID, but three closed due to religious objections. Overall, there was little interest or capacity to implement the activities added under the re-structuring.

4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:

The increase in classrooms (45%) will enable 629,600 children to gain access to education annually. Female enrollments grew by 35,000 per year. In-service teacher training with a focus on priority areas was successfully developed and delivered. The quality of primary level textbooks, workbooks and teachers guides is notable, and textbooks have been formally adopted by federal and provincial statutory bodies. Studies of the impact of in-service training and textbooks indicate improved learning.

There has been improved capacity in the Department to carry out high quality construction work with adequate supervision.

Government's allocation of non-salary funds on a per classroom basis to ensure adequate provision of learning materials has been found successful, and is now part of the provincial recurrent budget. School authorities will manage these funds.

Guidelines for strengthening district level management have been developed, and the proposal to combine middle and primary school administration has been ratified.

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):

PEP as a fully integrated donor program was ambitious relative to capacity and generated greater than anticipated difficulties in implementation. No school furniture was provided for grades 1-3 due to procurement disagreements and delays. Supplementary reading materials were procured but not utilized, perhaps due to the lack of training and follow-up support for their use. No research was conducted during the life of the project, and staff of the Research Development and Evaluation Unit remain underutilized. The proposed Frontier Education Foundation to promote private sector and NGO involvement failed to realize its aims, primarily due to lack of clear policies, limitations of its charter, and administrative shortcomings. The activities added following re-structuring were never fully incorporated into the project and essentially ignored by the client.

6. Ratings:	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome:	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	There were significant shortcomings with respect to the organizational framework and beneficiary participation sub-components. OED's moderately satisfactory rating has no equivalent in the ICR's 4-point rating

			scale.
Institutional Dev .:	Modest	Modest	
Sustainability .:	Likely	Likely	
Bank Performance .:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	There were shortcomings in project design;however improved supervision performance following project re-structuring contributed to moderately satisfactory outcomes. The overall performance was moderately satisfactory.
Borrower Perf .:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Although additional activities were not implemented,there was evidence of greater commitment to attaining the revised objectives. Overall performance was moderately satisfactory.
Quality of ICR .:		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

- An objective implementation capacity assessment is an imperative for large, complex projects, particularly in the areas of financial management and procurement.
- Beneficiaries need to be involved in design and re-structuring to avoid the non- implementation of programmed activities.
- Mechanisms to improve public-private partnership need to be established within a context of clear policy and an enabling environment, if they are to be effective.
- Project design should provide clear benchmarks and performance indicators if project objectives are to be operationalised and monitored.
- Effective supervision entails a proactive approach which would enable the borrower to find solutions to problems rather than merely identifying them.

8. Assessment Recommended? ☒ Yes ☐ No

Why? The innovative components of this project merit study and consideration at an appropriate time

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The report is thorough, providing detailed analysis most aspects of preparation and implementation. More substantial information might have been provided on the activities added following re-structuring. The lessons learned are clearly outlined and deserve careful attention.