



<b>1. Project Data:</b>		<b>Date Posted :</b> 08/07/2001	
<b>PROJ ID:</b> P006089		<b>Appraisal</b>	<b>Actual</b>
<b>Project Name:</b> Bb- Human Resources	<b>Project Costs (US\$M)</b>	15.6	8.29
<b>Country:</b> Barbados	<b>Loan/Credit (US\$M)</b>	8.4	4.6
<b>Sector(s):</b> Board: ED - Vocational training (57%), Primary education (30%), Central government administration (13%)	<b>Cofinancing (US\$M)</b>		
<b>L/C Number:</b> L3634			
	<b>Board Approval (FY)</b>		93
<b>Partners involved :</b>	<b>Closing Date</b>	12/31/2000	12/31/2000
<b>Prepared by :</b>	<b>Reviewed by :</b>	<b>Group Manager :</b>	<b>Group:</b>
Robert C. Varley	John R. Heath	Alain A. Barbu	OEDST

**2. Project Objectives and Components**

**a. Objectives**

The project's broad objective was to strengthen the country's human capital base by expanding the availability of skilled manpower and more specifically to:

1. Strengthen the quality and efficiency of basic education, with a view to raising student achievement .
2. Improve the effectiveness, efficiency and responsiveness of technical, vocational and educational training (TVET.)
3. Reinforce employment services and labor market information

The project was designed within the context of a 1993-2000 Education Development Plan which focused on TVET and established a TVET Policy Coordinating Council .

**b. Components**

Project costs of \$8.29 million comprised:

1. **General Education Support (33%)** - Staff Training, Upgraded Learning Resources and Policy Development .
2. **TVET Development (50%)** - Quality of TVET Instruction, Instructional Materials and Library Resources, Curricula and Program Development , Selective TVET Training and TVET Policy Coordination Council .
3. **Labor Market Support (9%)** - Employment Services and Labour Market Information .
4. **Project Preparation and Administration (8%)** .

Following the election of a new government, the policy development sub -component of General Education was dropped at the Mid-Term Review in 1997. This sub-component had focused on cost recovery, cost-efficiency and implementation of a national examination and certification system . The cost-recovery part of the project was out of line with the White Paper priorities. The White Paper did support cost-efficiency measures but limited them to TVET and tertiary education.

**c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates**

A major risk identified at appraisal was that the uncertain medium -term macroeconomic environment could adversely affect counterpart funding . During negotiations the project was scaled back from the size planned at appraisal and phased over a 7-year period, with relatively low disbursements during the first several years .

**3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:**

Development objectives (other than policy development, which was dropped ) were satisfactorily achieved and the project realized its core objective of improving the way the TVET system in Barbados was planned, designed and delivered. There were however delays and reductions in project effectiveness caused by the deteriorating implementation capacity of the EPIU (Education Implementation Unit), and the weak decision-making capacity of the IMC (The Inter-Ministerial Committee.) It is too early to assess the full impact since owing to the delays, most project activities were only implemented from mid-1997. No economic rate of return was calculated but there is superficial evidence that the impact on efficiency was limited - education per pupil increased substantially (by 50% in real terms) between 1991/92 and 1999/2000 "without a commensurate increase in the CXC [Caribbean Examination Council ] passing rates." Analyzed by component:

1. **General Education** - teacher training quality was appreciably strengthened and learning resources upgraded . Provision of training was more successful than the provision of equipment, due to poor procurement performance by EPIU. Available data on passing rates for the CXC exams show increases of 24% and 19% in English and Math between 1993 and 2000. However the increase in passing rates was a common objective with the IDB Third Education and Training Project (a \$14.5 million project), thus making it difficult to distinguish the individual impact of each project. The dropping of the policy component was a shortcoming as the Memorandum Of the President had stressed the rationale for Bank support of the project as being that it would be "instrumental in the design and implementation of pivotal reform measures ", which included cost-efficiency and cost-recovery. The former has not been introduced in the primary/secondary sector and the latter not at all .
2. **TVET Development** - this was the major component and the objectives were largely achieved . Program design and expertise in curriculum development were strengthened in the two main TVET institutions in the country . Reliable statistics on placement rates and further passage of time will be necessary to fully evaluate impact . Two Media Teacher Resources Centers were established although only one is fully operational owing to unresolved procurement problems. There has been a considerable improvement in curriculum development skills and program review expertise has been strengthened . Selective TVET programs were strengthened . Particularly successful were the Language Center, Arts and Crafts Youth Training Program and a newly established Pilot Industry Service Unit . The Training Administration Division of the Ministry did not benefit from the project as planned owing to unforeseen circumstances . The TVET Council had a number of major achievements including a National Training Plan, management of an Employment and Training Fund and definition of training standards for hospitality, IT and Customer Services .
3. **Labour Market Support** - a labour market information system was partially implemented because of hardware and software problems, and expanded employment counselling services were implemented .
4. **Project Preparation** was thorough and appreciated by the client as were all the services of the consultants . The EPIU had significant problems which affected the speed and scope of achievement of project benefits .

#### 4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:

1. The establishment of a TVET Council and the development of occupational standards and national vocational qualifications were significant achievements . The National Plan and occupational standards set by the council applied best international practices .
2. TVET teacher professionalization within a multi-certification system was enhanced by the successful introduction of the Bachelor of Education and application of teacher appraisal mechanisms . Total enrollment of 47 by September 1999, exceeded the target by 140%.

#### 5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):

1. The project design was excessively complex and had a broad scope, partly a reflection of the need for "ambitious" projects in countries on the verge of graduation . The institutional arrangements adopted to manage the risks could have been improved and the project was "at risk" at one time. The IMC, established for oversight and coordination between ministries, lacked a strong political profile and institutional mandate . The EPIU, which had the management capacity (much derived from experience on previous Bank projects ), became overburdened with other tasks and effectiveness declined . Towards the end of the project the government became heavily committed to an IDB funded Edutech 2000 Project, which weakened EPIU capacity for the project and induced massive use of multimedia and information technology in schools .
2. No monitoring system was put in place, indicators were not specific enough and no baseline values were given . Attempts to use specific examination results as a proxy for national passing rates, and employment placement rates as a direct measure, were not possible as the relevant institutions did not keep records .
3. The Bank should have been more flexible and creative about the policy in its negotiations with the new government. Government could have been more pro-active rather than adopting the same "wait and see" type of behavior as the Bank. Difficulties, focussing on the EPIU, earned the Borrower a rating of "unsatisfactory" on implementation performance. Nonetheless government is now supportive of the restructured project and the policy environment is favorable to the sector .

6. Ratings :	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
<b>Outcome :</b>	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
<b>Institutional Dev .:</b>	Substantial	Substantial	
<b>Sustainability :</b>	Likely	Likely	
<b>Bank Performance :</b>	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
<b>Borrower Perf .:</b>	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	While its rating of overall Borrower Performance was satisfactory, the ICR qualifies this rating as "partially satisfactory", with which OED concurs.
<b>Quality of ICR .:</b>		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '\*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

**7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:**

1. The project should have been limited to TVET and labour market support, leaving the IDB project to focus on general education. Project implementation would then have been more timely and effective .
2. When multiple educational innovations are introduced in two institutions, there should be a formal coordination function to ensure shared learning and review processes .

**8. Assessment Recommended?**  Yes  No

**9. Comments on Quality of ICR:**

Satisfactory. The ICR gives a nuanced and balanced account of project implementation .