



1. Project Data:		Date Posted : 05/19/2004	
PROJ ID: P037834		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name: Northern Education	Project Costs (US\$M)	36.00	31.89
Country: Pakistan	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	22.80	17.13
Sector(s): Board: ED - Primary education (56%), Tertiary education (15%), Other social services (15%), Sub-national government administration (14%)	Cofinancing (US\$M)	5.60	7.50
L/C Number: C2992			
	Board Approval (FY)		98
Partners involved : DFID	Closing Date	06/30/2002	09/30/2003
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group:
Howard Nial White	John R. Heath	Alain A. Barbu	OEDST
2. Project Objectives and Components			
a. Objectives			
<p>The Northern Education Project (NEP) was to support the program for the development of the elementary school sector in Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK) and Northern Areas (NA). The objectives were: "a) to improve the quality of education, increase learning achievement and improve completion rates in elementary education; (b) to increase access, equity, and retention of students, particularly girls; (c) to strengthen institutional capacity to plan and manage education programs; and (d) to encourage greater community and NGO participation" (SAR, p.15). NEP was designed to cover education from Katchi (kindergarten) to grade 8, with particular emphasis on the primary years and girls' education.</p>			
b. Components			
<p>1. Improving the quality of education (US\$8.2 million) by : (a) changes in teacher recruitment and training; (b) curriculum and educational materials development; and (c) development of assessment capacity .</p> <p>2. Increasing equitable access (US\$16.3 million) by: (a) reconstruction of dangerous schools and construction of new school buildings for shelterless schools; and (b) in NA, participatory construction of buildings for community schools .</p> <p>3. Strengthening institutional capacity (US\$4.4 million) by: (a) strengthening the management capacity of the Directorates of Education through organizational changes, the provision of limited additional staff, training, and technical assistance; (b) improving the information base for planning and management decisions through the conduct of baseline studies, rationalizing information flows and developing information management systems at the local level; and (c) conducting regular monitoring and evaluation of the five -year program. Monitoring and evaluation impact studies were incorporated into the project's design .</p> <p>4. Community participation (US\$3.8 million) through: (a) in AJK, the establishment of school committees in existing Government schools through an NGO-led pilot scheme in a single district; and (b) in NA, continued support to and improvement of the existing community schools program started by the Directorate of Education under the Social Assistance Program.</p>			
c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates			
<p>Cost: cost shortfall because of (1) exchange rate fluctuations, and (2) cancellation of one major civil works project which was delayed because of a land dispute . Project extension was required due to slow start up, with slow progress in first two years of project.</p>			
3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:			

Objective 1: improving the quality of education . Achieved

Quality of education is measured directly by test scores (criterion reference test, CRT) and indirectly by inputs for higher quality (teacher training and curriculum development). The CRT in 2003 found a modest improvement compared to the base line in 1999/2000 - this is a rather short period to expect a substantial change .

At the input level, in-service teacher training was provided to 11,000 teachers in AJK, with a study showing that over half (58%) were subsequently using teaching materials prepared under the project . In NA the target of 1,000 teachers receiving a 5 month training program was exceeded, with a study showing that these teachers went on to make "widespread use of teaching materials". In NA the project covered approximately 80 percent of government primary school teachers. Improved quality was also supported by the development of learning materials .

Since inputs for improved quality were delivered attribution of better learning outcomes to the project interventions may be inferred.

Objective 2: increasing equitable access to education . Partially achieved

Targets were specified in terms of absolute enrolments, and the percentage of female enrollments . In NA the achievements were substantial, with enrollment increases well in excess of the targets . By contrast, achievements in AJK were very modest.

In NA primary enrollments increased by nearly 60 percent (74,087 in baseline to 118,032, exceeding the target of 102,150). The female share rose from 30 to 43.6 percent, a substantial increase albeit less than the target of 50 percent. At middle school level enrollments increased by 48 percent, overshooting the target of a 23 percent increase. In AJK primary enrollments actually fell by 8 percent, though there are doubts about data quality; the share of girls in total enrollments rose from 36 to 47 percent. Middle school enrollments rose by 7 percent, rather less than the target of 27 percent.

The project supported higher enrollments through increasing the quantity and quality of schooling . In AJK 455 school buildings were completed (compared to target of 350) and furniture provided to 337 schools constructed in earlier phases. In NA 381 schools were constructed or rehabilitated, another 55 schools were not constructed as planned as a result of land disputes or because in a border area which has been affected by the border dispute with India .

As a result of these project-supported improvements, NA is close to achieving UPE . AJK is some way off, though may do so by 2015.

Objective 3: strengthening institutional capacity . Achieved

The project has strengthened the Education Management Information System (EMIS) and brought it to a situation in which EMIS data are requested by other government departments . There was also support to monitoring and evaluation which has enabled satisfactory M&E of project activities . Finally, managers in the education Directorates have received training .

Activities in support of this objective suffered somewhat from DFID's suspension of all aid activities in response to Pakistan's nuclear testing.

Objective 4: promoting community participation . Achieved

In both AJK and NA the project supported the formation and strengthening of School Management Committees/Parent Teacher Associations (SMCs/PTAs) In AJK 160 SMCs were formed, with training for 642 members and 160 chairpersons. In NA 1,465 SMCs were formed, well in excess of the target of 800. An evaluation in AJK showed that SMCs following the project guidelines function more effectively than other SMCs . In NA the SMC system has provided the community infrastructure for community school construction and delivery of support to schools, including scholarships, resulting in improved performance .

4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:

The main outcomes of the project have been :

1. Substantial increase in primary and middle school enrolments in NA .
2. Greater gender equality in enrollments in both NA and AJK .
3. Improvement in test scores (albeit modest).

4. Institution of Education Management Information System
5. Creation of a large number of active community-level school management organizations (SMCs)

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):

- Neglect of poverty perspective
- Poor performance in improving enrolments in AJK

Overall, the performance in the two project areas was very uneven . NA over-fulfilled ambitious targets, whereas AJK failed to meet targets . Judged separately the NA activities are satisfactory or even highly satisfactory . But those in AJK were rather less satisfactory . This case illustrates the possible difficulty of awarding a single rating to a project carrying out somewhat different activities in different areas .

6. Ratings :	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome :	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Institutional Dev .:	Substantial	Substantial	
Sustainability :	Likely	Likely	
Bank Performance :	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Borrower Perf .:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Quality of ICR :		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

1. A realistic assessment of implementation capacity, especially for project start -up, should be made to avoid delays in project implementation.
2. Although the activities in NA and AJK had the same objectives, the activities themselves were different . The benefits of combining them in a single project are not evident . Project management may have benefitted from separate projects.
3. It is advisable to have back up plans for co -financed activities essential to project design, lest the co -financier should not deliver.

8. Assessment Recommended? Yes No

Why? Relevance to on-going OED studies on both CDD and Primary Education

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

Satisfactory overall. However, the SAR classified this project under the Program of Targeted Interventions and the ICR makes no mention of this nor does it report on direct or indirect poverty impacts of the project . The only use made of Pakistan Income Household Survey data is for the rate of return analysis .