JSDF BZ Promoting Sustainable Natural Resource-based Livelihoods (P132098)

LATIN AMERICA AND CARIBBEAN | Belize | Environment & Natural Resources Global Practice | Recipient Executed Activities | Technical Assistance Loan | FY 2012 | Seq No: 6 | ARCHIVED on 17-Oct-2016 | ISR24957 |

Implementing Agencies: Belize Enterprize for Sustainable Technology

Key Dates

**Key Project Dates**

- Bank Approval Date: 05-Jun-2012
- Effectiveness Date: 31-Jan-2013
- Original Closing Date: 15-Nov-2016
- Revised Closing Date: 15-Nov-2016

Project Development Objectives

Project Development Objective (from Project Appraisal Document)
The PDO is to promote viable and sustainable natural resource-based livelihoods for Participating Communities in Belize and thereby reducing anthropogenic pressures on key natural resources.

Has the Project Development Objective been changed since Board Approval of the Project Objective?
No

Components

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Overall Ratings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Previous Rating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Progress towards achievement of PDO</td>
<td>Moderately Unsatisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Implementation Progress (IP)</td>
<td>Moderately Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Implementation Status and Key Decisions

The mid-term review (MTR) mission was conducted jointly by the Government of Belize, Belize Enterprise for Sustainable Technology (BEST) and the Bank on August 22-26, 2016. The objectives of the MTR were to verify the progress reported in the MTR report prepared by BEST and to discuss any adjustments necessary to implement the remainder of the Project.

**Relevance of PDO:** The Government confirmed that the Project’s objective remains relevant to Belize’s current development strategy (Growth and Sustainable Development Strategy (GSDS) 2016-19). The Project is also aligned with the Bank’s Systematic Country Diagnostic (SCD) which is the
basis for the next Country Partnership Framework for FY2017-2020 under development.

**Project Design:** The project components and scope were reviewed and deemed adequate to achieve the PDO. However, some indicators need revision to reflect the reality on the ground that were not anticipated at the design stage and/or to use adequate measuring units. Details are described in the comment section for each indicator.

**Project Performance:** The implementation has been slow during the first two years and catching up in the third and fourth years. This was because the beneficiary communities had limited capacity and required a lot of assistance to organize themselves, to build basic capacity, and to develop their investment proposals. There was also an impact of the general elections in November 2015 and the subsequent realignment of the ministries, which resulted in re-constituting the Project Steering Committee (PSC) and slowing their approval process of sub-projects.

Component 1 - The mobilization and capacity building of the beneficiary groups have mostly completed as planned (97.4% disbursed). Community coordinators have been appointed in each of the eight geographic locations. Ten initial community mobilization meetings were held in the targeted communities. A gender analysis on livelihood plans was completed. A total of 61 workshops and training have been held across the communities, participated by 775 persons, in topics such as monitoring and evaluation, business management and organizational development, and recordkeeping. On-going activities include training of the community-based Natural Resource Awareness Teams and community to community exchange of knowledge.

Component 2 and 3 - The implementation of Component 2 and 3 (livelihoods sub-projects) has been slow (20% disbursed) due to (i) the need to provide extensive support prior to investments to the beneficiary groups; and (ii) the lengthy review and approval process. There is likely to be a significant improvement in disbursement levels given that support for group organization and the sub-project approval process have completed. An action plan to ensure timely implementation of the sub-projects has been developed and agreed.

Component 4 - The PIU with a Project Coordinator, Technical Officer, Procurement Officer, and Accounting Officer has been functioning well. Baseline surveys have been conducted in all 8 locations. Two peer-to-peer exchanges have been held; one between the honey producing groups and another between the tourism development groups. Dissemination of results and lessons learned at national level will be held later during the implementation.
## Risks

### Overall Risk Rating

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risk Category</th>
<th>Rating at Approval</th>
<th>Previous Rating</th>
<th>Current Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>• Moderate</td>
<td>• Moderate</td>
<td>• Moderate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments
No changes nor additional risks have been identified.

## Results

### Project Development Objective Indicators
### Increase in the household income of participants in all 8 locations through sustainable community- and natural resource-based alternative livelihoods (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>36.00</td>
<td>14.40</td>
<td>25.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>31-Jan-2013</td>
<td>22-Jun-2016</td>
<td>22-Aug-2016</td>
<td>15-Nov-2016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comments**

The actual 14.4% reported in this ISR is an average of 17 sub-projects as opposed to the previous ISR where the data was based on just one sub-project that reported a revenue.

At the time of the MTR, there are three sub-projects that reported to have made revenues:

- **Trio Pineapple Production** has made a revenue of BZ$30,121 so far, which translates to BZ$1,338/household* and 121.6% increase in household income from the baseline (BZ$1100.73). The third sales to the local juice company is expected in October 2016 in the amount of 200,000 lb.
- **San Miguel Pig Rearing Group** has sold 8 pigs from 4 families and made BZ$5,365 (BZ$4,173 for meat and BZ$1,192 for live mass), which translates to BZ$417/household* and 97% increase.
- Both **San Felipe and Sarteneja Honey producers** have harvested 50-55 gallons of honey each. Sarteneja made BZ$3,696 for 28 cases, which translates to BZ$296/household* and 26.9% increase.

An average increase across 17 sub-projects is 14.4%.

*All sub-projects retain 20% of revenue for reinvestment.

### Overall Comments

The earlier sub-projects are making progress steadily, three of which are making revenues. The rate of implementation, especially for those approved in March this year, needs to be ramped up.

### Intermediate Results Indicators

#### In all 8 locations, increase in the area effectively managed by communities under co-management mechanism (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>6789.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>30.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>31-Jan-2013</td>
<td>22-Jun-2016</td>
<td>22-Aug-2016</td>
<td>15-Nov-2016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comments**

This indicator intended to measure how much impact the project made in terms of anthropogenic pressure on the natural resources in the project area. The previous ISR reported the area (acre) covered by the sub-projects. However, the unit is percentage to measure an increase.

Percentage is not adequate when the baseline is zero. Additionally, co-management mechanism turns out to be not applicable to the participating communities in relation to the nearby protected areas. Therefore, it is proposed to change the indicator to measure the change in the project participants' awareness toward the importance of sustainable natural resource management. This is to measure if the Project's approach to promote viable and sustainable natural resource-based livelihood models changes the behavior of the target communities toward their environment, thereby reducing the chances of engaging in unsustainable practices.
### Increase in other communities interested in community-based sustainable use of natural resources models (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Value</strong></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>75.00</td>
<td>75.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Date</strong></td>
<td>31-Jan-2013</td>
<td>22-Jun-2016</td>
<td>22-Jun-2016</td>
<td>15-Nov-2016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comments**
The measuring unit is not adequate where the baseline is zero. Therefore, it is proposed to change the unit to number and the target is at least 10 non-target communities are interested in sustainable natural resource-based livelihood models. Currently, 3 non-target communities have submitted applications and more communities expressed their interest in participating in the business development.

### 1 national dissemination event organized attended by 150 target audiences (Yes/No, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Value</strong></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Date</strong></td>
<td>31-Jan-2013</td>
<td>22-Jun-2016</td>
<td>22-Jun-2016</td>
<td>15-Nov-2016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comments**
This is not due yet.

### Direct project beneficiaries (Number, Core)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Value</strong></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>1528.00</td>
<td>3277.00</td>
<td>3250.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Date</strong></td>
<td>31-Jan-2012</td>
<td>22-Jun-2016</td>
<td>22-Jun-2016</td>
<td>30-Nov-2016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comments**
This indicator measures the number of people who benefitted from all the project interventions including training and technical support. In the JSDF proposal, the measuring unit (%) is not adequate where the baseline is 0. Therefore, "number of people" is used in the ISR and the target is "at least 3,250 beneficiaries benefitted from the project in developing sustainable natural resource-based livelihoods and new knowledge and skills" as described in the proposal. The following data on female beneficiaries (%) are only those participating in sub-projects. Those in training and workshops will be reported by the PIU.
### Female beneficiaries (Percentage, Core Supplement)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>40.00</td>
<td>46.00</td>
<td>30.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Overall Comments**
The number of beneficiaries reflects the Project’s achievement in mobilizing the communities and providing critical training and assistance. Awareness of the communities toward sustainable natural resource management has also been raised through these activities as reported in the MTR report.

### Data on Financial Performance

#### Disbursements (by loan)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan/Credit/TF</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Currency</th>
<th>Original</th>
<th>Revised</th>
<th>Cancelled</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
<th>Undisbursed</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P132098</td>
<td>TF-12901</td>
<td>Effective</td>
<td>USD</td>
<td>2.80</td>
<td>2.80</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>1.29</td>
<td>1.51</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Key Dates (by loan)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan/Credit/TF</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Approval Date</th>
<th>Signing Date</th>
<th>Effectiveness Date</th>
<th>Orig. Closing Date</th>
<th>Rev. Closing Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

#### Cumulative Disbursements
Restructuring History

There has been no restructuring to date.

Related Project(s)

There are no related projects.