



RESTRUCTURING PAPER
ON A
PROPOSED PROJECT RESTRUCTURING
OF
EC IBARRA TRANSPORT INFRASTRUCTURE IMPROVEMENT PROJECT
APPROVED ON JANUARY 27, 2016
TO
MUNICIPALITY OF IBARRA

TRANSPORT

LATIN AMERICA AND CARIBBEAN

Regional Vice President:	Carlos Felipe Jaramillo
Country Director:	Marianne Fay
Regional Director:	Franz R. Drees-Gross
Practice Manager/Manager:	Nicolas Peltier-Thiberge
Task Team Leader(s):	Roger Gorham



ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

CMU	Country Management Unit
COVID-19	Novel Coronavirus 2019
DDO	Deferred Drawdown Option
EA	Environmental Assessment
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
ESMP	Environmental and Social Management Plan
GADI	Ibarra Municipal Government (<i>Gobierno Autónomo Descentralizado de Ibarra</i>)
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MEF	Ministry of Economy and Finance
Movidelnor	Public Transport Regulator
MS	Moderately Satisfactory
MU	Moderately Unsatisfactory
NICH	National Institute of Cultural Heritage
OP	Operational Policy
PAD	Project Appraisal Document
PDO	Project Development Objective
PIU	Project Implementation Unit
RAM	Road Asset Management
RAP	Resettlement Action Plan
S	Satisfactory
TA	Technical Assistance
TOR	Terms of Reference



Note to Task Teams: The following sections are system generated and can only be edited online in the Portal.

BASIC DATA

Product Information

Project ID P147280	Financing Instrument Investment Project Financing
Original EA Category Partial Assessment (B)	Current EA Category Partial Assessment (B)
Approval Date 27-Jan-2016	Current Closing Date 30-Jun-2021

Organizations

Borrower Municipality of Ibarra	Responsible Agency Municipality of Ibarra UGP
------------------------------------	--

Project Development Objective (PDO)

Original PDO

The Project Development Objective (PDO) is to improve mobility of Ibarra and the use of recreational spaces in the Yahuarcocha lagoon area.

Summary Status of Financing (US\$, Millions)

Ln/Cr/Tf	Approval	Signing	Effectiveness	Closing	Net Commitment	Disbursed	Undisbursed
IBRD-85790	27-Jan-2016	22-Dec-2016	28-Mar-2017	30-Jun-2021	52.50	27.51	24.99

Policy Waiver(s)

Does this restructuring trigger the need for any policy waiver(s)?

No



Note to Task Teams: End of system generated content, document is editable from here.

I. PROJECT STATUS AND RATIONALE FOR RESTRUCTURING

A. Project Status

1. The Project was approved by the Board on January 27, 2016 and became effective on March 28, 2017 with an expected closing date of June 2021. The Project was restructured in October 2020 to allow Project resources to finance land compensation, and to adjust allocation of resources across eligibility categories. The Project Development Objective (PDO) is to improve mobility in Ibarra and the use of recreational spaces in the Yahuarcocha Lagoon area, through the following components (resources in parentheses reflect current loan allocations following 1st restructuring in October 2020):
 - (a) Component 1: Improve mobility in the city, through construction of:
 - (i) 1a: Northern section of Ring Road (US\$22.3 million, 100% IBRD-financed) (Phase I)
 - (ii) 1b: Southern section of Ring Road (US\$23.6 million, 40% IBRD-financed)
 - (b) Component 2: Improve public and tourist spaces (US\$3.0 million, 100% IBRD-financed)
 - (c) Component 3: Technical assistance (US\$1.4 million, 100% IBRD-financed)
 - (d) Component 4: Project management
 - (i) Project administration (US\$1.0 million, 100% IBRD-financed)
 - (ii) Land compensation payments (US\$1.2 million, 100% IBRD-financed)
2. With just over 52 percent of loan resources disbursed (\$27.5) as of April 13, 2021, activities under Components 1a (Northern section of Anillo Vial) and 2 (Improvements in Yahuarcocha recreational lagoon area) have been completed. Component 1b has not yet been initiated, and because of fiscal constraints exacerbated by the COVID pandemic, the municipality will likely not have the resources to implement the works and supervision of Component 1b (Phase II), with its 40 percent counterpart co-financing requirement, as elaborated upon in Paragraph 6. Component 3 had not been initiated by the previous Mayoral administration because of the extended time to agree on prioritization of activities under this component (though some resources had been spent to develop the procurement package to contract these studies once that prioritization was agreed). Under the new administration which began in May 2019, priorities for this Technical Assistance (TA) have shifted. Three separate packets of assistance have now been prepared, two of which are undergoing final technical review by Bank staff, and one of which is in the initial phases of procurement. They will be completed by May 2022. (See paragraph 7 for more discussion.)
3. Overall Implementation Progress (OIP) of the Project is currently rated Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU). Implementation progress has improved substantially in recent months. Project monitoring has improved, with key updates to the Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) tables, and progress has been made in documenting the indicators underlying the data populating the revised M&E framework. Compliance with OP 4.12 has been restored, following diligent efforts by the whole municipal administration (not just the PIU) to collaborate in meeting the bureaucratic requirements needed to make the outstanding compensation payments for the construction of the Northern Ring Road (Component 1a) that had led to the non-compliance situation. As a result, the performance rating for compliance with OP4.12 has been upgraded from MU to S in the most recent ISR. In addition, preparatory and procurement processes to enable key contract activities to begin have improved and



advanced in the last several months. These efforts have put the project on a substantially stronger footing than was the case in December 2020. Notwithstanding these efforts, until contracts are actually signed and the substantive work begins on some of the key pending studies, OIP rating remains MU. For the same reason, Project Component 1 is also rated MU.

4. The other project components are all rated Moderately Satisfactory (MS) or Satisfactory (S), and all of the fiduciary ratings are MS. Nevertheless, the overall project risk is considered High, and progress toward achieving the PDO is MU, primarily because implementation of some key activities to achieve the PDO – namely the Phase II investment of component 1, Improve mobility in the city, and Technical Assistance – are dependent on extending the project closing date, one of the key objectives of the present Restructuring Paper. As noted, however, the recent performance of the Borrower has improved substantially, and the Bank and the Borrower have agreed on actions to be undertaken by the Borrower to complete the Project.
5. There are no pending Financial Audits. Financial audits received to date have been considered satisfactory.

B. Rationale for restructuring

6. **Expected counterpart contribution to Component Phase II no longer realistic.** The original Project called for a total investment of US\$91.02 million, of which US\$ 38.52 million was to have been provided by counterpart funds from the Ibarra Municipal Government (GADI), or nearly 42 percent of the total Project. Of this, US\$7.1 million would cover VAT, US\$10.5 million would cover land acquisition, resettlement, and related costs, and the remainder, about US\$21 million, would be for counterpart contribution to cover 40 percent of the costs under Component 1b (Phase II). However, Ecuador's financial crisis resulted in a sharp decline of intergovernmental transfers, combined with emerging needs related to the COVID-19 outbreak. Consequently, the resources planned for the counterpart's contribution to the Project became out of reach. Indeed, the Project was previously restructured (with a Vice-Presidential policy exception) to allow the Project to finance land compensations because even those resources were not available. There is thus a need to rescale Component 1 Phase II resource requirements to be in line with GADI's current fiscal situation.
7. **Change in Mayoral administration and investment priorities under Component 1b necessitates modification to Component 1 definition.** The Project originally envisioned investing in a fully orbital ring road around the city of Ibarra (Northern and Southern segments under Components 1a and 1b, respectively). However, following municipal elections in May 2019, the new mayoral administration has prioritized the need to strengthen the connection between the existing city center and the low-income neighborhoods in the northern section of Ibarra with the recreational opportunities in the newly renovated Yahuarcocha Lagoon area a route that requires crossing a steep gorge at the Rio Tahuando. The GADI has proposed to reorient the resources for infrastructure investment finance under Component 1b from the southern segment of the Ring Road as originally designed, toward a connection between the existing city center and northern ring segment of the Ring Road with the Yahuarcocha Lagoon area. While this shift in investment priority is consistent with the Project's PDO and therefore warrants consideration by the Bank, it needs to be subjected to the same level of scrutiny as any other Bank-financed investment during appraisal. The technical, economic, social and environmental feasibility of doing so has yet to be demonstrated before a final decision to finance this investment under the current operation can be taken.
8. Notwithstanding this shift in priority for use of Bank-financing resources under this component, clarifications and improvements to the design of the southern section of the ring road still need project support. Challenges during implementation of the northern section of the Ring Road revealed some weaknesses in the detailed designs that had been developed prior to the Bank's involvement, and had necessitated revisions by the Supervision Consultant and cost-adjustments to ensure the quality of the result. In order to ensure that the same problems do not affect the Southern



segment of the Ring Road when it is implemented, the previously prepared detailed designs will need to be scrupulously examined and likely revised, ensuring the addition of previously excluded components such as street lighting and bus stop placement. In addition, analysis by the Bank team and the Project Implementation Unit has suggested that there may be a need to adjust some of the Right-of-Way reservation. The Mayor has requested the Bank to support this revision to the detailed designs of the Southern section of the Ring Road, even if project finance will not be used to support the implementation of this section. In order to support both the feasibility study for the connection to between the city center and Yahuarcocha, the subsequent detailed designs and preparation of bidding documents for the same, and the revision to the detailed design of the Southern section of the Ring Road with project resources, the definition of Component 1 needs to be modified to clarify their eligibility.

9. The changes in the project investment and phasing under consideration are shown in the Project Area Map in the Annex to this RP. The map shows the original project and the changes under consideration. The red line section represents the northern Ring Road, which has already been built under Component 1a. The purple line represents the original intent of Component 1b of the project, to develop the southern Ring Road. The green lines represent the possible alternatives under consideration if the resources under Component 1b were to be re-oriented to strengthen the connection between the City Center and the Yahuarcocha Lagoon area. The yellow lines represent the road facility inside Yahuarcocha Lagoon area that was rehabilitated under Component 2 of the project.
10. **Extension of Project closing date needed to carry out technical, economic, environmental and social evaluation under Component 1b.** The consultancy to carry out the feasibility study of the connection to Yahuarcocha, the detailed design of the selected alternative and preparation of the necessary bidding documents, and revise the detailed design of the southern section of the ring road will require about six months to complete, in two phases. In phase I, the design engineers will examine alternative configurations to meet the objective of connecting the city center to Yahuarcocha Lagoon Recreational area, and develop recommendations based on economic, environmental, social and cost criteria. The overall recommendations will be presented to the Bank, the GADI administration and the Ministry of Finance for decision on the way forward. It should be noted that the connection between Ibarra city center and Yahuarcocha is also a critical link on the national road network, as it is part of the principal corridor between Quito and the Colombian border. The Terms of Reference of the design engineer consultancy, therefore, has also included a task to estimate national benefits separately from benefits to the municipality. The Analysis of Alternatives to be carried out under the proposed restructuring includes the requirements for conducting an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) for the recommended alternative together with the obtaining of the respective administrative authorization from the Ministry of Environment and Water. It is possible that the selected alternative would require the upgrade of an existing bridge or the building of a new bridge. The EIA would establish the environmental and social baseline for the recommended alternative and detail preventative, mitigation, and compensation measures for the construction and operations phase of the selected alternative. Also under phase I, the consultants will study the existing detailed design of the southern section of the Ring Road and propose modifications to optimize and adjust the design at critical points. The EIA for the southern segment of the Ring Road will also be updated under this consultancy. The EIA update will determine whether the optimized alignment will impact the existing Guayabillas Protected Forest (Bosque Protector Guayabillas) and to what degree the Protected Forest would be impacted with the aim of ensuring that any planned activities are carried out in accordance with the Environmental and Social Management Plan (ESMP) for the Guayabillas Protected Forest and national legislation requirements. The EIA will also consider possible impacts to physical cultural resources and detail the corresponding preventative and mitigation measures, which shall reflect the provisions established by the National Institute of Cultural Heritage (Instituto Nacional de Patrimonio Cultural - INPC). The results of Phase I will be available 60 days



after the initiation of the study and will enable the GADI, the Bank, and the Government of Ecuador to make a determination about the way forward and whether a further extension is warranted.

11. Phase II of the study will involve the development of detailed design for the road and bridge connection to Yahuarcocha Lagoon area, development of bidding documents for same, and development of detailed design for the right of way optimization and adjustment for the Southern section of the ring road determined in Phase I. This Phase will take about 120 days to complete. Because of the need for the GADI, the Bank, and the Ministry of Finance to agree on the way forward following the presentation of the recommendations under Phase I, the Terms of Reference also include a “pause” period of up to 120 days in between Phase I and Phase II. The entire study, therefore, would take between six and ten months to proceed. Because it is at an advanced stage of procurement at present, an extension of the project closing date of 12 months is considered warranted.
12. **Extension of Project closing date is also needed to carry out planned Technical Assistance activities under Component 3.** The activities the new Mayor proposed to be financed under the TA component have been packaged into three procurement packets, corresponding with the institution which is the primary beneficiary of the activity. Two of the activities – support to the Planning Department on improving planning processes, and support to Movidelnor on improving public transport services – will contribute to the PDO of improving mobility in Ibarra if the recommendations resulting from the activities are implemented, but not in any way directly measurable by PDO-level indicators under the Project, since their impact is contingent on recommendation implementation which may occur after the Project ends. However, existing intermediate indicators do measure and track progress and outcome of these activities. The third activity packet – support to public works in developing and implementing asset management – will contribute to the sustainability of mobility improvements over time. The Terms of Reference for the first two packets are undergoing final revision. The third package is at Request for Expressions of Interest stage. All three consultancies will take about six months to complete.
13. **Modification of results framework.** At the Project’s Mid-Term Review, agreement was reached on modification of the results framework to incorporate indicators better able to reflect the PDO. Because of a series of administrative challenges (electoral campaign, change in administration, disruptions to the PIU, and COVID lockdown), however, the agreed upon modifications to the results framework have not been able to be formally incorporated into the Project until now. The present restructuring will therefore formally adopt the revised results framework agreed at Mid-Term Review.
14. **Additional Project extension may be requested.** The engineering study will generate detailed designs, bidding documents, and implementation schedule for civil works intended to improve the road connectivity between Ibarra City center, the Northern Ring Road, and the Yahuarcocha Lagoon area under Component 1b. Depending on the construction costs associated with the activity selected by the borrower based on the results of the *Analysis of Alternatives, Feasibility, and Detailed Design Study*, support for the implementation of the works designed under the present operation will be considered. If at that time it is agreed to provide support under the present operation, then a further extension of the Project will most likely be needed. The PIU has estimated a critical path showing that it is possible that procurement and implementation of these works can occur within a 23 month extension of the original closing date of the Project, but only the detailed engineering study would be able to realistically make such a determination.
15. **The PDO remains highly relevant and achievable.** The PDO, to improve mobility of Ibarra and the use of recreational spaces in the Yahuarcocha lagoon area, directly support key objectives of the Country Partnership Framework (2019 – 2023), particularly Objective 2 (improve conditions for private sector development) by enhancing local, regional , and



national tourism and the livelihoods of service providers in this sector, and by improving logistics through enhanced travel time reliability in the key export corridor between Quito and the Colombian border. Furthermore, the alternatives analysis study to be supported through this restructuring supports in a small but direct way Objective 1 (Enhance efficiency of public spending) and Objective 6 (Strengthen evidence-based policymaking and transparency) by supporting a medium-sized city in decision-making for resource allocation for a major infrastructure investment project.

16. The achievability of the PDO is evidenced by results already achieved by the project. Component 1a has already delivered substantial improvements to mobility in Ibarra, by providing enhanced accessibility to residents generally, and particularly to low-income neighborhoods in the northern part of the city previously underserved by public transport services. It has also reduced travel time for many residents as well as through traffic between Quito and the Colombian border. Component 2 has already improved the use of recreational spaces in the Yahuarcocha recreational area, at least as far as could be measured prior to COVID-19-related lockdown. The reorientation of Component 1b has the potential to tie these two parts of the PDO together, by further improving mobility in ways that specifically enhance access to the recreational spaces in the Yahuarcocha lagoon area.

II. DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED CHANGES

C. Extension of Project closing date

17. The Project closing date will be extended from June 30, 2021 to June 30, 2022. This extension will allow time to complete the *Analysis of Alternatives, Feasibility, and Detailed Design Study* for a proposed potential re-orientation to Phase II of component 1. If it is decided to proceed with this reorientation on the basis of this study outcome, the Project will be further restructured to account for these changes, including a likely request for a further extension the Project closing date. If it is decided not to proceed with this reorientation, the Project will close on June 30, 2022, and may require partial cancellation of funds. During this period, the Project will continue with TA activities under Component 3 related to improvement in planning processes, public transport improvements, and street asset management.

D. Modifications to the results matrix associated with measuring progress toward the Project Development objectives.

18. The results matrix will be modified as identified in detail in the Results Indicators section of this Restructuring Paper. The key changes include:
 - Change in name and unit of measure of PDO indicator 1, whereby cardinal rather than proportional changes will be captured. The description of the methodology is also being adjusted to reflect these changes.
 - A new indicator to capture travel time to city center by beneficiary populations is being added as PDO indicator 2. This better captures the “improve mobility in Ibarra” part of the PDO statement compared with the indicator it replaces (Share of project beneficiaries expressing satisfaction with Ring Boulevard infrastructure and mobility options), since the original indicator measure *perception* of mobility, rather than mobility improvements themselves.
 - Share of project beneficiaries expressing satisfaction has been reassigned as an Intermediate Results Indicator and citizen engagement benchmark.
 - The name and definition of PDO indicator 3 is being changed to remove ambiguity in previous phrasing implying that access to and egress from Yahuarcocha was what was being measured.



- A new PDO indicator 4 is being included as “Share of business owners in Yahuarcocha Lagoon Area whose monthly income level is at or exceeds the minimum wage” to better measure the improved use of recreational spaces in the Yahuarcocha Lagoon Area and to explicitly link that goal to the World Bank’s twin goals.
- Intermediate Results Indicator 5 (Number of road km constructed on Ring Boulevard) has been replaced by the Corporate Indicator with the same name. The ambition of the target has been reduced, reflecting the likelihood that the Southern section of the Ring Boulevard will not be constructed under the project. The ambition of this indicator may need to be further adjusted when decisions are taken in response to Phase I of the alternatives analysis study.
- Wording of several other Intermediate Results Indicators have been adjusted to better reflect activities being undertaken or to better align with descriptions in the Project Appraisal Document.

E. Modification to the description of Component 1.

19. The definition of component 1 will be modified to read as follows: Improve mobility in the city Provision of support for infrastructure investments in the City of Ibarra, including: (i) the construction of a four lane Ring Boulevard in the City of Ibarra, comprising of: (a) the Northern Segment (approximately 9.5 km), (b) the Southern Segment (approximately 12.0 km)¹; (iii) evaluation and preparation of investments to improve the connection between the Northern Ring Road and City center to Yahuarcocha recreational area; and (ii) the redesign (as needed) and supervision of any associated work.

F. Adjustment of resources assigned under the various Project categories

20. Expenditure ceilings assigned to each category will be adjusted to reflect current needs of the Project, as follows. Category 1 ceiling will be increased by 0.43%. Category 2 ceiling will be decreased by 3.52%. Category 3 ceiling will be decreased by 0.12%. Category 4 ceiling will be increased by 31.03%. There will be no change to the Category 5 ceiling (Component 4b – Land Compensation Payments). These category ceiling allocation adjustments do not affect the overall level of financing of the Project.

G. Adjustment to the disbursement estimates

21. The disbursement profile of the Project will be adjusted to reflect actual disbursements and projections through the close of the Project.

H. Environmental and social management

22. The proposed restructuring does not require an update to the existing safeguards instruments for the Project. However, the proposed Analysis of Alternatives under Component 1b (Phase 2) will include: 1) the development of an EIA for the recommended alternative for the connection between the Ibarra city center and the Yahuarcocha Lagoon as well as an update to the EIA for the optimization of the southern section of the Ring Road, taking into account the requirements of OP 4.01 and international good practice on ESIA; and 2) support GADI in the preparation of a Resettlement Action Plan (with timeline and budget) for land acquisition in Phase II of the project, so that the land acquisition process can be undertaken before the start of the Phase II construction works.

Note to Task Teams: The following sections are system generated and can only be edited online in the Portal.

¹ The Mayor has requested to consider using the resources of the IPF to support the connection between Ibarra city center and Yahuarcocha Lagoon as a priority over supporting the southern segment of the Ring Road. Consequently, depending on the outcome of the Alternatives Analysis study, the next restructuring may eliminate the Southern Segment from the project definition entirely. Because this remains uncertain at this point, however, the team proposes to leave this part of the definition of the project intact in this restructuring.



III. SUMMARY OF CHANGES

	Changed	Not Changed
Results Framework	✓	
Loan Closing Date(s)	✓	
Reallocation between Disbursement Categories	✓	
Disbursement Estimates	✓	
Implementation Schedule	✓	
Implementing Agency		✓
DDO Status		✓
Project's Development Objectives		✓
PBCs		✓
Components and Cost		✓
Cancellations Proposed		✓
Disbursements Arrangements		✓
Overall Risk Rating		✓
Safeguard Policies Triggered		✓
EA category		✓
Legal Covenants		✓
Institutional Arrangements		✓
Financial Management		✓
Procurement		✓
Other Change(s)		✓
Economic and Financial Analysis		✓
Technical Analysis		✓
Social Analysis		✓
Environmental Analysis		✓

IV. DETAILED CHANGE(S)



LOAN CLOSING DATE(S)

Ln/Cr/Tf	Status	Original Closing	Revised Closing(s)	Proposed Closing	Proposed Deadline for Withdrawal Applications
IBRD-85790	Effective	30-Jun-2021		30-Jun-2022	30-Oct-2022

REALLOCATION BETWEEN DISBURSEMENT CATEGORIES

	Current Allocation	Actuals + Committed	Proposed Allocation	Financing % (Type Total)	
				Current	Proposed
IBRD-85790-001 Currency: USD					
iLap Category Sequence No: 1		Current Expenditure Category: GO,CW,CS,NCS - Part 1.1(i)(a)			
	22,286,896.00	21,228,950.88	22,383,476.76	100.00	100.00
iLap Category Sequence No: 2		Current Expenditure Category: GO,CW,CS,NCS - Part 1.1(i)(b)			
	23,620,676.00	0.00	22,788,704.76	60.00	60.00
iLap Category Sequence No: 3		Current Expenditure Category: GO,CW,CS,NCS - Part 2			
	3,030,613.00	3,027,111.14	3,027,111.14	100.00	100.00
iLap Category Sequence No: 4		Current Expenditure Category: GO,CS,OP,TR - Parts 3 & 4			
	2,381,250.00	1,155,439.14	3,120,142.34	100.00	100.00
iLap Category Sequence No: 5		Current Expenditure Category: Land Expenditures			
	1,180,565.00	618,517.54	1,180,565.00	100.00	100.00
Total	52,500,000.00	26,030,018.70	52,500,000.00		

DISBURSEMENT ESTIMATES

Change in Disbursement Estimates



The World Bank

EC Ibarra Transport Infrastructure Improvement Project (P147280)

Yes

Year	Current	Proposed
2016	2,200,000.00	0.00
2017	10,500,000.00	77,725.00
2018	14,500,000.00	9,843,938.57
2019	11,300,000.00	15,029,820.33
2020	10,000,000.00	1,131,628.22
2021	4,000,000.00	1,422,118.95
2022	0.00	24,994,768.93



Results framework

COUNTRY: Ecuador

EC Ibarra Transport Infrastructure Improvement Project

Project Development Objectives(s)

The Project Development Objective (PDO) is to improve mobility of Ibarra and the use of recreational spaces in the Yahuarcocha lagoon area.

Project Development Objective Indicators by Objectives/ Outcomes

Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	End Target
Improve mobility in Ibarra			
Average travel time by private transport to area hospitals from select low-income areas influenced by the Ring Road. (Minutes)		34.11	24.11
<i>Action: This indicator has been Revised</i>	<i>Rationale: There are three key proposed modifications to the indicator. The definition has been changed to account for the fact that the Anillo Sur will not likely be built under the project, so that the measurement of “routes across the city” is no longer relevant. The scope has been changed to clarify that this indicator refers to “private” transport – that is, the travel time that would be expected if e-hailing services were used. This change was necessary because of the need identified during the Mid-Term review to have separate indicators for public transport accessibility and travel time reductions for other traffic. This indicator, therefore, becomes the indicator specifically for travel time reductions for other traffic. Finally, the ambiguity of the previous wording’s reference to “primary services” has been eliminated, replaced by explicit reference to “area hospitals”.</i>		
Share of project beneficiaries expressing satisfaction with the Ring Boulevard infrastructure and mobility options (disaggregated by gender) (Percentage)		0.00	75.00
<i>Action: This indicator has been Marked for Deletion</i>	<i>Rationale:</i>		



Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	End Target
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>This indicator has been marked for deletion because the team considers it should be an Intermediate Results Indicator, given that this indicator only measures satisfaction with the Ring Boulevard, but does not consider phase II of the project as per the expanded description of Component 1 proposed in this restructuring. It does not consider the improvements in Yahuarcocha (Component 2) either. Since we already have two other indicators that measures PDO outcome 1 (improve mobility in Ibarra), the team is proposing to consider it as an intermediate result indicator.</i> 	
Number of people in Azaya-Alpachaca neighborhood who can access the city center by public transport in 25 minutes or less. (Number)		500.00	6,000.00
Action: This indicator is New	Rationale: <i>This indicator provides a direct measure of improved mobility in Ibarra by gauging changes in accessibility of residents of a key low-income neighborhood affected by the development of the Northern Ring Road and likely highly dependent on public transport services. .</i>		
Improve the use of recreational spaces in the Yahuarcocha Lagoon Area			
Percentage of visitors who use a bicycle and walk in Yahuarcocha (Percentage)		18.00	24.00
Action: This indicator has been Revised	Rationale: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>This indicator was maintained the same, although the name was slightly modified to be more accurate in the definition.</i> 		
Share of business owners in Yahuarcocha Lagoon business area whose monthly income level is at or exceeds the minimum wage (Percentage)		0.00	20.00
Action: This indicator is New	Rationale:		



Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	End Target
	<i>A new indicator was included to better measure PDO outcome 2 (Improve the use of recreational spaces in the Yahuarcocha Lagoon Area)</i>		

Intermediate Results Indicators by Components

Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	End Target
Component 1: Improve mobility in the city			
Optimized bus route network implemented (Yes/No)		No	Yes
<i>Action: This indicator has been Marked for Deletion</i>	<i>Rationale: Bus route optimization is not a priority in post-COVID environment</i>		
Number of road kms. constructed (ring boulevard) (Kilometers)		0.00	21.50
<i>Action: This indicator has been Marked for Deletion</i>	<i>Rationale: This indicator is replaced with a corporate indicator of similar structure, to ensure it is aggregated to corporate level. Given that the project may no longer finance the whole Ring Boulevard, the target objective of this indicator has been adjusted accordingly.</i>		
Direct project beneficiaries (Number)		0.00	35,000.00
<i>Action: This indicator has been Marked for Deletion</i>	<i>Rationale: This indicator no longer reflects corporate indicator, and has been deleted and replaced with new Transport GP corporate indicator.</i>		



Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	End Target
Female beneficiaries (Number)		0.00	65,928.00
Action: This indicator has been Marked for Deletion	Rationale: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>This indicator has been slightly modified to update the target value as per the original value in the PAD.</i> 		
Share of Project beneficiaries expressing satisfaction with the Ring Boulevard infrastructure and mobility options (Percentage)		0.00	75.00
Action: This indicator is New	Rationale: <p><i>This indicator has been reclassified as an intermediate results indicator, having previously been a PDO-level indicator in the PAD.</i></p>		
Share of female beneficiaries expressing satisfaction (Percentage)		0.00	75.00
Action: This indicator is New	Rationale: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>This has been included as a new result indicator, although it was a PDO indicator in the PAD.</i> 		
People with enhanced access to transportation services (CRI, Number)		0.00	200,000.00
Action: This indicator is New			
People with enhanced access to transportation services - Urban Transport (CRI, Number)		0.00	200,000.00
Action: This indicator is New			
Roads constructed (CRI, Kilometers)		0.00	9.50
Action: This indicator is New	Rationale: <p><i>Corporate indicator</i></p>		



Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	End Target
Roads constructed - non-rural (CRI, Kilometers)		0.00	9.50
<i>Action: This indicator is New</i>	<i>Rationale: Corporate indicator</i>		
Component 2: Improve public and tourist spaces			
Number of yearly visitors to Yahuarcocha (Number)		663,600.00	729,960.00
<i>Action: This indicator has been Revised</i>	<i>Rationale: This indicator has been revised to update the baseline and target values, as the current team in the PIU and the Municipality disagree with the numbers reported in the PAD.</i>		
Progress of construction and restoration of tourist spaces works on Yahuarcocha Boulevard (Percentage)		0.00	100.00
Component 3: Technical Assistance			
Road asset management plan prepared (Yes/No)		No	Yes
<i>Action: This indicator has been Revised</i>	<i>Rationale: The name of this indicator has been slightly modified to reflect the original name in the PAD. Methodology has been updated to reflect the current activities planned under the project.</i>		
Study for the improvement of sustainable mobility in Ibarra prepared (Yes/No)		No	Yes
<i>Action: This indicator has been Revised</i>	<i>Rationale: Name and methodology have been updated to reflect the current activities planned under the project.</i>		
Preparation of multi-annual maintenance plan (Yes/No)		No	Yes



Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	End Target
<i>Action: This indicator has been Marked for Deletion</i>	<i>Rationale: The indicator on preparation of road asset management plan is a better indicator of this intermediate result.</i>		
Component 4: Project Management			
Proposed organization chart adopted (Yes/No)		No	Yes



Note to Task Teams: End of system generated content, document is editable from here. *Please delete this note when finalizing the document*

Map of Ibarra Transport Infrastructure Project as designed at project appraisal and with proposed connection to Yahuarcocha

