

Report Number: ICRR10759

1. Project Data:	Date Posted:	08/17/2000	
PROJ ID: P008826	-	Appraisal	Actual
Project Name: Management And Finance Project	Project Costs (US\$M)	51.4	49.7
Country: Russian Federation	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	40	40
Sector(s): Vocational/Technical Education & Training	Cofinancing (US\$M)		
L/C Number: L3824; LP251			
	Board Approval (FY)		95
Partners involved :	Closing Date	12/31/1998	11/01/1999
Prepared by: Reviewed by:	Group Manager: Group:		

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives

The project was to: (a) increase the supply of well-trained, market-oriented practitioners in management development, accounting and finance, banking, and public finance; (b) establish the National Training Foundation, an intermediary organization for mobilizing and channeling resources for market-oriented training programs on a competitive basis; (c) creating the basis for a broader second-phase project by piloting interventions in other key areas, such as small business development, public administration, and market economics for the general population.

b. Components

The project provided funding, equipment, and technical assistance.

c. Comments on Project Cost. Financing and Dates

The project was completed 11 months after the original closing date and disbursed all its proceeds

3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:

The project achieved its objectives. A large number of managers and practitioners in enterprises, banks, and other organizations has been trained, a new profession of training providers and management consultants has evolved.

4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:

Hundreds of books and training materials of high quality and relevant contents have been published and distributed. The multiplication of the training results through training of trainers and the use of modern information technology centers by management trainees and training institutes has been impressive. The National Training Foundation and the three regional Training Foundations have matured into skilled and experienced promoters of modern management training methods. New attitudes were introduced to management and financial training in Russia. A survey indicated that 80% of respondents were very satisfied with the skills they gained and with the quality of training.

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):

Despite success, it is uncertain whether the project's contribution to the creation of domestic training capacity can be maintained. Steps have not been taken to ensure sustainability. The infrastructure and "know-how" gained in organizing and financing innovative management training could be lost or used inefficiently. Dissemination and multiplication of training materials was not as extensive as expected.

6. Ratings:	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Institutional Dev .:	High	High	
Sustainability:	Uncertain *	Non-evaluable	The 'uncertain' rating no longer exists, and more specific information for OED to rate probability is unavailable.
Bank Performance :	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Borrower Perf .:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	

Quality of ICR:	Exemplary			
NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.				
7. Lessons of Broad Applica	bility:			
- Beneficiaries should participate in the design of training programs .				
- Managers and training beneficiaries should become critical consumers of management education so that they				
can evaluate the training they participate in and focus on obtaining the best for their institutions .				
- Dissemination and multiplication of training materials is often difficult, and this may create problems in the				
provision of training.				

8. Assessment Recommended?

Yes ○ No

Why? A first project in a country, which was also highly innovative.

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:
The ICR was exemplary.