



1. Project Data :		Date Posted : 06/27/2000	
PROJ ID: P003940 OEDID: L3448		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name : Primary education improvement project	Project Costs (US\$M)	53.9	46
Country: Indonesia	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	37	28.32
Sector, Major Sect .: Primary Education, Education	Cofinancing (US\$M)		
L/C Number: L3448			
	Board Approval (FY)		91
Partners involved :	Closing Date	09/30/1997	03/30/1999
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group:
Helen Abadzi	John Heath	Ridley Nelson	OEDST

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives
The project aimed to introduce policies and mechanisms to improve primary education quality in order to raise students' completion rates and achievement through : (a) improving school learning; (b) providing special assistance for underserved schools; (c) enhancing capacity to manage a quality improvement program . It focused on the underserved schools of six of the poorest provinces .

b. Components
Components were: (a) teacher professional development program, (b) better quality textbooks and related policy issues, (c) special assistance for underserved schools, (d) improvements in financial planning and budgetary processing, monitoring, evaluation, studies . The project financed educational equipment, computers, vehicles, technical assistance, and training .

c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates
The project was extended by 18 months. A total of US\$8.68 million were cancelled

3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives :
Most project activities were carried out, and physical outputs, such as equipment, were provided, as well as training . Overall, teachers in project schols have become professionally more capable . However, these achievements did not always result in meeting learning objectives . The project overlapped with others, and it was unclear whether some achievements were carried out due to this project or to others .

4. Significant Outcomes /Impacts :
Evaluation of project impact on classroom processes indicated that the project improved the quality of teachers and principals. Teachers have better mastery of subject matter and classroom management, while the quality of interactions in classes improved . Principals became better able to allocate and manage school resources more effectively. Schools received much instructional equipment and learning materials, though their impact on the quality of instruction has been limited .

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non -compliance with safeguard policies):
Implementation moved very slowly . The institutional capacity of the implementing agency was overestimated; too many activities were carried out, many of which did not focus on teaching and learning proceses or outputs . Administrative support and budget planning were not coordinated, partly due to dual management of primary education by the Ministries of Education and Home Affairs . Equipment and materials were not used in schools to the extent expected, due to their complexity and limited training in their use . Much training and technical assistance were provided late in the project, reducing benefits . Despite teacher training, student achievement In many schools, measured through achievement tests, was found to be low . (Testing details not available in the ICR.) Long-term financial sustainability of teacher training and items to enrich schools is unlikely due to high cost .

6. Ratings:	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments

Outcome :	Satisfactory	Marginally Satisfactory	Though activities were carried out, learning outcomes did not significantly improve.
Institutional Dev .:	Partial	Modest	
Sustainability :	Uncertain	Uncertain	Much instructional equipment and teacher training functions may not be sustainable .
Bank Performance :	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Borrower Perf .:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Quality of ICR :		Satisfactory	

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability :

- Training is more effective when it is based on analyses of teacher needs rather than what centrally based trainers or administrators want to provide .
- Good teachers are instrumental in establishing good schools, and training for teaching staff should be integrated to establish common understanding of curricula and instructional methodologies .
- Parental participation in schools should extend beyond the provision of money and labor, to achievement .

8. Audit Recommended? Yes No

Why? To study the extent to which a quality-oriented project was able to increase performance in class and in learning outcomes .

9. Comments on Quality of ICR :

The ICR is marginally satisfactory . It has many unfamiliar acronyms, which are not indicated on the list of abbreviations, and several syntactical errors, all of which make comprehension difficult at times . Very few quantitative data are mentioned as evidence that school quality has improved .