



1. Project Data:		Date Posted : 07/15/2003	
PROJ ID: P050714		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name: Secondary Education 3	Project Costs (US\$M)	170.0	173.2
Country: Argentina	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	119.0	118.5
Sector(s): Board: ED - Primary education (53%), Secondary education (44%), Tertiary education (2%), Central government administration (1%)	Cofinancing (US\$M)	0.0	0.0
L/C Number: L4313			
	Board Approval (FY)		98
Partners involved : none	Closing Date	12/31/2001	12/31/2002
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group:
Lenor Armstrong	Ronald S. Parker	Alain A. Barbu	OEDST
2. Project Objectives and Components			
a. Objectives			
The objective was to improve secondary education in grades 7 to 9 (lower secondary) and 10 to 12 (upper secondary). Specifically, the project aimed to: (a) increase the completion of secondary education; (b) improve the learning process at the school level; and (c) improve the skills of graduates of secondary schools to facilitate entry into the labor market.			
b. Components			
The original three components were: (a) expansion of access to secondary education (US\$141.0m, 83% of total costs), including construction of new classrooms for the 9th grade, rehabilitation of all schools which had adopted a nine-year education cycle; (b) improvement of quality and relevance of secondary education (US\$ 27.4, 16.1% of total costs), including institutional strengthening to help transition to upper secondary education for approximately 200 underprivileged schools, restructuring of 40 technical and agricultural secondary schools, and development and implementation of school-based extracurricular programs in participating schools; and (c) project administration (US \$1.5m, 0.9% of total costs). During implementation, the project was amended to focus on the upper secondary levels, and to expand the number of restructured technical schools from 40 to 244.			
c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates			
The project was estimated to cost US\$ 170 m equivalent of which US\$ 119 m (70%) were to be financed by the Bank loan and US\$51m (30%) from provincial counterpart funds. Actual total project costs were US\$173.2 m equivalent (1.9% over-run), of which US\$118.5 m (68% of costs), was financed by the Bank. A total of US\$487, 544 (0.4%) of the loan was undisbursed and cancelled. US\$54.7 m (31.5% of costs) were financed with counterpart funds. This amount is 7.2% above estimated costs.			
The shift from construction of 9th grade classrooms to those for the upper secondary level which included science and computer laboratories, and multimedia learning resource centers resulted in a 3.4% over-run, and the extension of the project by one year from December 31, 2001 to December 31, 2002) increased project administration costs from US\$ 1.5m equivalent to US\$2.5m equivalent (66.7% over-run).			
3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:			
Overall, project objectives were achieved . In 1998- 2001, completion rates at the upper secondary level increased from 14 to 53.7% in the 198 high-risk project schools Completion rates in the province as a whole were 50.2% in 2001, up from 18.5% in 1998. Transition rates from lower to upper secondary level rose from 88% to 98% in project schools. This increase compares favorably with the transition rates of public and private schools in the province which increased from 93% to 97%. Repetition rates in project			

schools declined by 66%, from 15.6% to 6.6%, whereas overall rates remained at 13%. Learning achievement results in Spanish and mathematics at grade 12, were above the provincial average, though, lower than the appraisal targets. This is partially explained by the fact that project interventions to improve the learning process were only implemented in 2001.

It is unclear whether the skills of secondary school graduates now facilitate their entry into the labor market, since the first graduates only completed the upper secondary level in December 2001, and no tracer studies have been carried out yet. At the time of their completion, Argentina was experiencing an economic crisis, and the unemployment rate was 18%. Nonetheless, stakeholders noted that teaching practices have improved and technical schools provide more relevant skills. These improvements are expected to contribute ultimately to better prepared graduates.

4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:

The curriculum for upper secondary level has served as a model for other provinces. As a result of mainstreaming project activities, the province of Buenos Aires has adopted new construction and supervision procedures, standards and design, and schools maintenance procedures. There is also a teachers' roster, and students' roster in use. The schools' cooperative associations were strengthened as a result of their involvement in the implementation of the construction of civil works and the procurement of learning equipment and supplies. Linkages between schools and communities have been strengthened by the implementation of the extracurricular activities program.

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):

The piloting of a high standard curriculum equivalent to the international baccalaureate in 5 project schools was not undertaken because of financial constraints.

Participants considered the quality and relevance of training for school managers and teachers inadequate, partly due to shortcomings in the institutional environment.

Collaborative linkages between project schools and the private productive sector were not fully realized due to labor market crisis. Only about 50% of the schools established some linkages.

6. Ratings:	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Institutional Dev.:	Substantial	Substantial	
Sustainability:	Likely	Likely	
Bank Performance:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Borrower Perf.:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Quality of ICR:		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

An incremental approach to the implementation of curricula, and a thorough diagnosis of individual school issues may create an environment more likely to result in greater effectiveness rather than abrupt changes.

It is important to do appropriate targeting to reach the population at risk. Projects aimed at improving equity are likely to be more effective when repetition rates, attrition, learning achievement, family and school location, are given adequate attention during design and implementation.

School-based diagnosis involving stakeholders serves to empower stakeholders, increase ownership, promote improved school-community linkages, and ensures the relevance of interventions.

8. Assessment Recommended? Yes No

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The ICR provided a detailed and comprehensive analysis of implementation issues, and highlights important lessons which have broad applicability.