

**1. CAS Data**
**Country:** Ghana

**CAS Year:** FY03

**CAS Period:** FY04 – FY07

**CASCR Review Period:** FY04 – FY07

**Date of this review:** June 11, 2007

**2. Executive Summary**

This Review examines the implementation of the FY04-07 Ghana CAS and evaluates the FY04-07 Ghana CASCR. The CAS set forth three pillars closely aligned with the Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy (GPRS): (i) growth and employment; (ii) service provision for human development; and (iii) governance for empowerment.

Lending was higher than planned, with a focus on support to the Multi-Donor Budget Support (MDBS) Framework through a series of Poverty Reduction Support Credits (PRSCs), which made up 42 percent of actual lending. The lending envelope was raised because of a strong policy performance responding, *inter alia*, to the incentives for HIPC completion, and some improvements in portfolio performance.

IDA's lending and complementary AAA were successful in achieving most expected CAS outcomes under pillars 1 and 3, including success in many challenging public sector reforms that had not been previously possible despite considerable effort and resources applied. IEG rates these outcomes as *satisfactory*. IDA's support to pillar 2 helped exceed expectations in some areas, but produced less than expected results overall. Among the reasons for this were project performance issues and inadequate investment in AAA. IEG rates pillar 2 as *moderately unsatisfactory*. IFC lending and non-lending activities also contributed to both CAS pillars 1 and 2 through support to private sector development, small and medium enterprises, infrastructure, financial sector, education, and improving the business climate. The overall CAS outcome is rated *moderately satisfactory*, as is the Bank's performance.

IEG agrees with the lessons drawn by the CASCR, and supports proposed steps to improve the results framework and the effectiveness of sector budget support operations, and heightening use of stronger cross-sectoral approaches. IEG supports the lesson on strategic positioning of AAA, but also endorses other QAG recommendations to find ways of deepening AAA in real sectors and human development. The latter would hopefully build momentum for the design and implementation of human resource development strategies by the Government to address severe capacity constraints in many key sectors. The lesson on aligning regional projects better with country context is supported by recent IEG findings in this area, which stress the need for clear delineation and coordination of roles and accountable governance arrangements.

CASCR Reviewed by:	Peer Reviewed by:	Group Manager
Clay Wescott Consultant	Helena Tang Lead Evaluation Officer	Ali Khadr Senior Manager, IEGCR

### 3. CASCR Summary

#### Overview of CAS Relevance:

The three pillars of the CAS were in line with the GPRS: (i) growth and employment (GPRS pillars 1 and 2); (ii) service provision for human development (GPRS pillars 3 and 4); and (iii) governance for empowerment (GPRS pillar 5).

Designed in 2003 amidst deteriorating macro balances, it appropriately focused on restoring macroeconomic stability, and enhancing poverty reduction. It was based on wide-ranging consultation with government, development partners, and civil society organizations in Ghana's ten regions. The proposed lending appropriately had a focus on support to the Multi-Donor Budget Support (MDBS) Framework through a series of PRSCs with clearly spelled out triggers and prior actions. There were also investment operations covering, *inter alia*, education, health, water, sanitation, energy, transport, and public sector reform.

The program of AAA services was envisaged to inform, *inter alia*, corporate governance, public financial management, financial sector, energy, telecommunications and health insurance policies. Overall, these studies were appropriate to inform processes leading to HIPC completion status, and to support the continued channeling of resources through the MDBS Framework. Sectoral work on energy policy, national health insurance, natural resources management, and telecommunications was conceived to contribute to relevant policy debates and positive changes in key sectors. However, given the focus on growth and poverty reduction, more AAA could have been planned in real sectors and the drivers of growth, and on human development.

IFC's objectives were to: (i) improve the investment climate and business environment; (ii) support the provision of infrastructure; (iii) help expand services of financial institutions, enhancing micro, small, and medium enterprise development (MSMEs); and (iv) promote non-traditional exports.

Most expected CAS outcomes capture key Bank interventions, and are monitorable within the time period. However, some indicators do not capture key Bank interventions, some indicators lack data, and indicators measuring targets set for 2007 cannot be measured at the stage of the CASCR.

#### Overview of CAS Implementation:

Actual lending of \$1,182.4 million<sup>1</sup> fell between planned base-case lending of \$1,055 million and the high case of \$1,370 million. The higher than planned lending has been brought about by improved policy performance, with an increase in the CPIA rating from 3.5 in 2002 to 3.9 in 2005. Ghana met the base case triggers including macroeconomic framework and external financing plan, share of poverty-related spending, and public financial management (PFM) and portfolio improvements. Some high case triggers were only partially met (energy, private sector development) or not met (improvement in IEG project evaluations). However, starting with IDA14, Ghana's IDA Country Performance Rating was high enough to justify the higher allocation. Two unplanned projects were approved by the Board during the CAS period (Land Administration, and HIV/AIDS Treatment Acceleration (Regional)), and three unplanned projects are scheduled for Board discussion in June (Urban Transport, Health Insurance, Nutrition and Malaria Control for Child Survival). All five of the unplanned projects were introduced in response to new priorities of GPRS II (2006-2009). Four projects were approved in the year after the one planned. In most cases (PRSC 2, Community-Based Rural Development, PRSC 3,) approval was delayed only one or two months into the subsequent year. In one case (Micro Small and Medium Enterprise Support) approval was delayed until the seventh month of the subsequent year. One project planned for FY07 (Decentralization for Community Empowerment) will become a series of three development policy operations (DPOs) and an FY09 investment loan. An energy project planned for FY06, is now scheduled to become the Ghana Energy Development and Access Project (GEDAP) in FY08.

IFC had an active program in Ghana during the CAS period. IFC lending and non-lending activities contributed to both CAS pillars 1 and 2 through support to private sector development, small and medium enterprises, infrastructure, financial sector, education, and improving the business climate. Six committed projects were approved during FY04-07 (4 loans and 2 guarantees) for a total commitment of \$153.5 million. IFC's overall investment portfolio grew fourfold from \$40 million to \$176 million since the last CAS, higher than the expected \$80 million to \$120 million increase. This was largely due to four large-scale investments approved in FY06-07: a \$75 million mining loan, a \$40 million telecom equity investment, as well as two \$15 million guarantees under the IFC global trade finance program. IFC was unable to realize any investments in agribusiness or non-traditional exports during the CAS period. However, during FY08 there were two export-oriented agribusiness projects, a palm oil and a fruit (pineapple and mango) project respectively. IFC was also unable to make a power plant investment approved in 2004 effective due to the sluggish pace of reforms in this sector. IFC's advisory services in support of private sector development also grew considerably during the CAS period with assistance provided in education, housing finance, leasing, and capacity building for MSMEs.

There were some improvements in portfolio performance over the CAS period. The number of projects at risk dropped from 21 percent in FY04 to 14 percent in FY07, which is now better than the Bank-wide average (16.5 percent). The number of commitments at risk dropped from 17 percent to 15 percent in the same period, albeit with a worrying increase to 29 percent in FY05 and FY06. If the FY07 figure (15.4 percent) can be sustained, it is in line with the Bank-wide average. Furthermore, disbursements rose from \$144 million in FY04 to \$443 million in FY06, and the ratio of disbursements to commitments went up from 25 percent to 30 percent over the same period. Portfolio performance improved due to, *inter alia*, the implementation of recommendations of the FY06 Country Portfolio Review, and the posting of a Senior Operations Officer in Accra.

And yet, ratings on completed projects were lower than desired. Out of ten completed projects evaluated, seven were rated satisfactory or moderately satisfactory, five rated sustainable, and three had a substantial institutional development impact. These composite ratings are all below Africa and Bank averages, and little changed in comparison to ratings during the previous CAS period.

The sectoral distribution was broadly as planned. The increase in the program from the planned base case came mainly in the information communication technology (ICT), and health, nutrition and population sectors.<sup>2</sup>

The CAS envisaged an ambitious program of AAA services to inform, *inter alia*, corporate governance, public financial management, financial sector, energy, telecommunications, and health insurance policies. The majority of the proposed work has been delivered at a cost of \$3.356 million.<sup>3</sup> The proposed PERs became the External Reviews of Public Financial Management (FY04, 05 and 06), with the latest one including the Public Expenditure and Financial Accountability (PEFA) Performance Measurement Framework. A CFAA and CPAR (FY04) also contributed to public sector reforms. Overall, these studies helped to justify HIPC completion status, and supported the continued channeling of resources through the MDBS Framework. AAA on energy policy, national health insurance, natural resources management, and telecommunications have contributed to policy debates and positive changes, and helped facilitate a common infrastructure investment framework among donors. Eight planned AAA products were not delivered (Poverty and Social Impact Analysis, Capacity Building for Sustained Subnational Regional Development, Communications Review, Public-Private Partnerships, Community Empowerment, Disability in Ghana, CFAA (FY06), and CPPR (FY07), three AAA products were forwarded to FY08 (Poverty Assessment, CEM, and FY07 External Review of Public Financial Management), and eight unplanned AAA products were delivered (FSAP Update, Pension Dialogue, Kumasi-Preparing for CDS, Financial Literacy Capacity for Women, Energy Policy Part 2, Procurement Law Implementation, Growth Workshop, and Urban Sector Development and Growth). These divergences from plan were due to the need to inform the priorities of the new GPRS II, and due to the Region's commitment to only pursue AAA with strong country ownership, and thus likely to influence policy debates.

A 2004 QAG multi-country review of AAA concerning agriculture and rural development (ARD) raises the absence of an ARD AAA program in Ghana as a critical weakness, since the sector is crucial for addressing poverty and diversifying exports, and features in five policy objectives and fifteen indicators in the GPRS. A 2006 QAG review of all Ghana's AAA rates the program moderately satisfactory overall, with good consultation, analytical rigor, excellence in building partnerships, and some impact on government policies, Bank and donor programs. However, it points out a lack of AAA in real sectors and the drivers of growth, and on human development. The share of spending on AAA on Ghana country services is well below Africa and Bankwide averages. The Region explains that this is because it only proceeds with AAA when there is strong country ownership.

The Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy, 2006-2009 (GPRS II) was adopted by the Government in November 2005. Since then, the Bank has worked to adapt implementation of the CAS to meet the needs and opportunities expressed in GPRS II, and as set out in the prioritized results matrix in the joint Ghana Partnership Strategy (GPS) adopted at the November 2005 Consultative Group (CG). This new work beginning in 2006 has included a comprehensive analysis of the sources and constraints to growth, extensive consultations, preparation of a new Country Economic Memorandum with strong government participation, and new investments added to the lending program for FY07.

#### **Overview of Achievement by Objective:**

##### **Pillar 1: Sustainable growth and employment**

The projected economic growth target of 5 percent was exceeded (average of 6 percent, 2004-06). Between 2005-06, cocoa exports went up by 30 percent and non-traditional exports went up by 25 percent; these increases contributed to the higher than expected growth. The impact of this growth on overall employment is unknown due to the lack of data.

Five of eleven expected CAS outcomes under this pillar have been met; these are: domestic debt reductions, increase in poverty related non-wage expenditure,<sup>4</sup> improvements in road quality, increase in non-traditional exports, and increase in telephone call completion. Two expected outcomes were exceeded; these are: expansion of forest cover and increased access to internet services. Three expected outcomes were partially met; these are: reducing the time to register land, reducing the backlog of pending civil cases, and reducing the time for business registration and approvals. Only one of the targets, significant reduction in power system losses, was not achieved.

##### *a. Managing public finances for macroeconomic stability and poverty reduction*

In addition to financial support (PRSCs) to macroeconomic (reduction in domestic debt) and PFM (increased share of budget allocations to poverty-related programs) reforms, AAA on the energy sector informed the PRSC conditions on reducing subsidies to petroleum consumption and the import of crude oil and refined products under an independent regulatory agency. The subsidy reduction, along with debt reduction supported by the PRSCs, helped free up funds for poverty related non-wage expenditure increases and other service improvements.

##### *b. Removing constraints to private sector investment*

Ghana was recognized in 2006 as a leading business environment reformer in the Bank's "Doing Business Report." Although the target of reducing the time for business registration and approvals is credited as only partially met, the time has been reduced from 129 days in 2002 to 81 days in 2005, and perhaps much more (target is 30 days in 2007).<sup>5</sup> The Bank has supported improvements in the business environment through the PRSCs, agriculture and transport projects, and through AAA in

energy and telecommunications. Bank TA helped reduce the backlog of pending civil cases from 17,000 in 2002 to 14,577 in 2005 (target is 13,000 in 2007), and a Bank trade project has helped modernize the Customs Department, and reduced the time to clear Customs from 2.5 days to less than 6 hours. The same project has helped increase customs revenue by 49 percent in the first year of operation, and by 45 percent in the second year. The Bank also took advantage of rapid improvement in internet access (1.5 million users in 2006 vs. expected CAS outcome of 100,000 in 2007) to redesign the FY07 planned infrastructure investment to build on Ghana's improving e-readiness as the e-Ghana Project. About one-half of this project's resources will finance e-government systems, with computerization of the Internal Revenue Service a flagship. This, along with the customs revenue increases already achieved with Bank assistance, will support the governance reforms under pillar 3.

During the CAS period the business climate in Ghana improved from a high-risk to a non-high risk environment (based on Institutional Investors' Country Risk ratings), which helped increase private sector investments and business opportunities for IFC. IFC's investments supported large foreign-sponsored projects in mining, telecoms, and other sectors.

IFC's approach for supporting SMEs shifted from a retail approach (under the Africa Project Development Facility) into a sector wide approach through the Private Enterprise Partnership Program (PEP-Africa) that enabled it to have greater influence on the broader environment for SMEs. PEP-Africa's leasing program, intended to increase the financing options for SMEs, had initial staffing problems, although more recently, has implemented some training initiatives, has attracted new investments and created significant public awareness. PEP-Africa's housing initiative, aimed to improve the regulatory framework for housing finance, is currently underway. However, the timeline has been extended to allow more consultation due to the difficulty in achieving a stakeholder consensus. IFC also continues to provide direct capacity building assistance to SMEs through the joint IFC-IDA multi-country program (the SME EDI multi country initiative), which has provided training to a significant number of SMEs that will help them develop business plans and access finance for project development, expansion or modernization of their business. This multi-country facility has conducted 13 trainings, reached 327 participants and financed 383 SMEs. This compares to a target of 35 trainings, 70 participants and 45 financed SMEs.

The Road Sector Development Project, *inter alia*, has contributed to improvements that have increased hospital trips by 20 percent and maize prices to farmers by 23 percent, and lowered the cost of traveling to market by 65 percent, and to welfare facilities by 41 percent. The increase in the fuel levy has more than doubled the size of the road fund during 2001-2006, thus facilitating a near doubling of the road network over the same period, and helping to finance improved maintenance now almost entirely contracted to the private sector.

The target for reducing the time to register land titles was only partially met (from 4 years in 2004 to 382 days at end-2005, vs. target of 4 months by 2007); a better indicator would have been the time taken to register land deeds, reduced from 36 months in 2004 to 7 months in 2007, since the Bank's Land Administration Project is focused on this. The project has also reduced deed costs, and increased access to land by women. The one CAS target not achieved, significant reduction in power system losses, stems from slow and uncoordinated implementation of the power sector reform framework since 2003, and weaknesses of the Volta River Authority. Notwithstanding Bank support through the PRSCs, investments and guarantees in regional power projects, further reforms are essential. The Bank has scheduled the Energy Development and Access Project to support this effort for FY07 approval.

### *c. Harnessing sources of growth*

Improvements in agricultural policy (including fiscal space for crop spraying, increased farmer's share of cocoa price) were supported through the PRSCs, and increased crop yields were supported through the Agriculture Services Sub-sector Investment Project, although the CAS did not have outcome indicators on this front. The target for an increase of at least 10 percent p.a. in non-traditional

exports was met largely through expansion of processed and semi-processed goods, including wood products and frozen fish. The target for forest cover (80,000 hectares by end of 2007) was exceeded (over 93,000 hectares in 2006), while ensuring food security by allowing rural farmers to enter degraded forest reserves and grow food crops until the forest canopy was closed. The Bank supported this through the PRSCs and AAA, laying the foundation for a multi-donor approach in the next CAS. However, the lack of real sector and drivers of growth AAA pointed out by QAG in 2004 and 2006 is a serious concern that needs to be addressed.

*d. Overall Performance*

IEG rates progress under this pillar as satisfactory. Although there were minor shortcomings with a few targets only partially met and one not met, there has been substantial progress in laying the foundation for macroeconomic stability and poverty reduction, removing business constraints, and harnessing new sources of growth. The Bank has been a key supporter of these reforms through the PRSC series, other investments, and AAA. The first two PRSCs to be evaluated so far have received satisfactory ratings. The biggest disappointment is slow progress in power sector reforms, but progress with other challenging reforms in the energy sector has built momentum for future headway.

**Pillar 2: Service provision for human development**

One of nineteen CAS expected outcome indicators has been met (reducing HIV prevalence), and four have or will be exceeded (access to potable water, and declines in headcount poverty, child malnutrition, and under-5 malaria mortality). Three of the expected outcomes have been partially met; these are increasing gross enrollment ratios for girls in deprived districts, and in most deprived districts, and increasing births attended by skilled health personnel. Two expected outcomes were met but not sustained: primary completion rates for all students, and for girls. Four expected outcomes were not met: improving student exam performance in most deprived districts, rural sanitation, urban water, and immunization coverage. Five expected outcomes cannot be measured for lack of data.

*a. Key accomplishments and challenges*

Most notable is the faster than expected reduction in poverty headcount (declined from 40 percent in 1999 to 28.5 percent in 2006, vs. target of 32 percent in 2007), on track to achieve the MDG target of halving poverty by 2015. The strong economic growth has helped contribute to this; in addition, the Bank has facilitated the translation of this growth into poverty reduction by helping government channel additional resources to poverty related expenditures through support to CAS pillars 1 and 3.

Although the target for community water will be exceeded (potable water to 580,000 people vs. target of 500,000), targets for urban water and urban and rural sanitation have not been met. While the Bank's Village Infrastructure and Community Water II Projects had satisfactory ratings, the Urban Environmental Sanitation Project was rated by IEG as only moderately satisfactory, with unlikely sustainability, modest institutional development impact, and two out of three objectives only partially achieved. The FY05 Urban Water Project has experienced delays.

The CASCR notes that Ghana exceeded the target for reducing HIV prevalence among pregnant women (2.7 percent in 2005 vs. a target of 5 percent in 2006). However, trends in HIV prevalence are not a valid measure for changes in the number of new infections (incidence). A decline in HIV prevalence could conceivably be the result of high AIDS mortality or unsuccessful treatment efforts, while an increase could signal more widespread and successful treatment. Three additional HIV targets could not be measured for lack of data. The CASCR suggests alternative indicators for the next CAS. The tracking of high-risk behaviors among the general population and among high-risk groups would be a reasonable proxy for reductions in HIV incidence and thus would provide an indication of the efficacy of prevention efforts. Rather than counting the number and types of services provided to target populations (people living with HIV/AIDS and orphans), indicators that would track

the coverage, quality and impact of such services would provide better indication of achievement of the project and program objective of mitigating the impact of HIV/AIDS on these different groups.

IEG has rated the Ghana AIDS Response Project as unsatisfactory with unlikely sustainability and modest institutional development impact. The unsatisfactory rating was grounded in the modest relevance of the design, which did not facilitate the prioritization of the highest-impact activities or the strategic use of public sector and civil society actors. It was also grounded in the modest efficacy of the project which showed scant evidence of achievement of objectives, and in its modest efficiency, both in terms of the quality and nature of activities financed and in terms of institutional weaknesses.

Bank support through the PRSCs and the Education Sector Project contributed to progress in education, including reaching the poorest communities and improving girls' access. However, CAS expected outcomes were only partially met. For example, Gross Enrollment Rates (GER) in most deprived districts increased from 80 percent in 2004 to 84 percent in 2006, falling short of the target 93 percent in 2007. Girls GER in most deprived districts increased from 66 percent in 2002 to 72 percent in 2003, vs. the target of 93 percent in 2007.

IFC's FY06 education project (Ghana School Finance Facility) supported the second CAS pillar. This project provided a partial guarantee of up to \$1.1 million to The Trust Bank to give loans to eligible private schools that offered kindergarten through 12<sup>th</sup> grade education. The facility has been 90 percent disbursed and is being used to finance construction of educational facilities and purchase of educational materials. Since demand has been stronger than expected, a new guarantee has been approved, bringing IFC's risk participation to \$3.5 million. Technical assistance under PEP-Africa has been provided as part of these investments. The technical assistance was to help expand educational facilities and improve school management skills. Early results already show partially met outputs and outcomes from the completion of schools sector-wide workshops. The integrated investment-technical assistance effort appears to be an effective approach to address both the lack of access to finance and poor school management skills in private sector education.

PRSCs have also been crucial in improving budget execution in health, along with a health sector SWAp, contributing to exceeding CAS outcomes on reducing child malnutrition (to 17.8 percent in 2006 vs. target of 20 percent in 2007), and under-5 malaria mortality (to 2.4 percent in 2006 vs. target of 3.5 percent in 2007). However, three other outcomes have only been partially met, not met, or cannot be measured. Immunization coverage increased from 80 percent in 2002 to 81 percent (DPT3) and 78 percent (Measles) in 2006 vs. a target of 90 percent by end of 2007. Births attended by skilled health personnel increased from 45 percent in 2003 to 54 percent in 2005 vs. a target of 60 percent in 2007. No data are available on reduction of under-5 diarrhea-related and water borne mortality reported in health centers, targeted to drop by 25 percent between 2002 and 2007. IEG agrees with the CASCR that health outcomes could have improved by, *inter alia*, stronger cross-sectoral approaches linking related issues of water, sanitation, nutrition, decentralization, and capacity building.

Health outcome data should indicate sources or definitions, which can change over time and affect the comparability and reliability of data and trends. Finally, there were shortcomings in AAA. Challenges in the health sector might have been better understood had there been greater analysis of the incidence and effectiveness of health expenditures. In addition, analytic work on the impact of decentralization on health sector delivery would have been useful in providing a stronger evidence base for such advice.

#### *b. Overall Performance*

IEG rates progress under this pillar as moderately unsatisfactory. There were significant shortcomings in achieving CAS outcomes, with nearly half of them either not met or not measurable. Although PRSCs and some projects made important contributions, many relevant completed projects were rated less than satisfactory, and the critical urban sector project subject to delays. The lack of

relevant human resource development strategies by the Government pointed out in an IEG study,<sup>6</sup> and corresponding lack of human development AAA highlighted by the 2006 QAG, both contributed to problems in this pillar.

### **Pillar 3: Governance and empowerment**

While Ghana performs better than its peers (countries at similar levels of human development, urbanization and population, e.g., Nepal, Papua New Guinea, and Republic of Congo) on some governance indicators such as the Kauffman's indicators on Voice and Accountability and Government Effectiveness, the GPRS sets out to strengthen Parliament, the civil service, the judiciary, the police service, and to ensure greater transparency and accountability.

#### *a. Supporting Ghana's efforts to build a transparent, accountable, and inclusive state*

Three of the four expected CAS outcomes under this area have been achieved. First, Parliamentary Committees have held regular and effective meetings, and presented 237 reports to the Parliament since 2004. The Public Accounts Committee submits its report to the House within six months of receiving the Auditor-General's report. The Bank, along with other donors, has supported this effort through dialogue with PER and PEFA teams, and training from WBI. Second, there have been major improvements in access to information. Ghana's first PEFA assessment in FY06 found that the transparency and comprehensiveness of the Budget Statement had improved over the previous two years, although in-year reporting on budget execution is less comprehensive than the PEFA standard, and hampers reporting on budget execution. The PEFA assessment also praised timely completion of the Auditor General's report and greater Parliamentary scrutiny of the budget, but indicated the need for more remedial action by the Executive to address problems raised in audit reports. Civil society has also increased its monitoring of allocations and expenditures, particularly at the local government level. The Whistleblowers Act has been enacted. Third, the CAS outcome of implementing Citizens Report Cards in 40 districts has been achieved with support from Bank lending.

The final CAS outcome is on track to being achieved: two Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys (PETS) in health and education will be completed as planned in 2007 and will, *inter alia*, assess the impact of corruption, updating earlier work published in 2000.

#### *b. Improving public sector management for better service provision*

Ghana met all HIPC completion point triggers in FY04, including strengthening procurement, internal audit, reporting on cash expenditures and commitments, and devolution of responsibilities to local governments. The PFM system progressively improved in meeting HIPC PFM benchmarks, from 1 out of 15 in 2001 (the worst of all countries surveyed), to 7 in 2004, and 8 in 2005, which exceeds the average of 6 for the 24 HIPC countries surveyed. The PEFA assessment in 2006 confirmed this progress.

Four out of seven expected CAS outcomes were met: strengthening internal and external audit, training, and fiscal decentralization. Although targets on procurement and payroll system reform were only partially met, substantial progress has been achieved, and is underway, in these challenging areas. Bank support through the HIPC exercise, the PRSCs, and AAA has been critical to this success.

Although the target of an HR Management Policy and staff surveys by 2005 was not met, both are on track to be completed by 2007. Further, after disappointing progress on civil service reform despite extensive support from the Bank, DFID and other partners since the mid-1980s, there has been encouraging recent progress, including the Government's establishment of the Ministry of Public Sector Reform (MoPSR) in FY05. Progress in the functioning of the Ministry included draft performance based contracts, reflecting job descriptions for all Chief Directors (27) and Director (200) positions in the civil service, the adoption of the Subvented Agencies Reform Act, and the signing of MOUs for restructuring the Office of the Head of Civil Service (OHCS) and the Parliamentary Service



Commission (PSC). In addition, the PSR communication strategy was completed, focusing on three broad areas: advocacy, social mobilization, and program communication. The momentum of new initiatives is encouraging, driven by an energetic Minister of PSR, and the incentive to complete as much as possible before the 2008 election. The Bank has supported this work through the PRSCs.

*c. Overall Performance*

IEG rates progress under this pillar as satisfactory. Although there were minor shortcomings with a few targets only partially met and one not met, there has been major progress in public financial management, improved transparency, and accountability. This progress, and the new momentum in civil service reform, is particularly noteworthy in light of the weak traction of previous efforts by the Bank, including the Public Financial Management and Public Sector Management Projects, rated by IEG as unsatisfactory and highly unsatisfactory. The extent and robustness of Ghana's recent work in this area is confirmed by the Africa Peer Review Mechanism, although it points out that many challenges remain to be addressed, including aid dependence. Of the 23 countries that agreed to be rated, Ghana, along with Rwanda and Kenya, were the first to release preliminary reports to the public in 2006.

Achievement of CAS Objectives			
Objectives	CASCR Rating	IEG Rating	Explanation / Comments
Sustainable growth and employment	NA	Satisfactory	Major progress helped by higher than expected economic growth, with minor shortcomings and disappointing performance in the power sector.
Service provision for human development	NA	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Significant shortcomings in achieving CAS outcomes, some projects rated less than satisfactory, lack of sufficient AAA.
Governance and empowerment	NA	Satisfactory	Major progress in challenging reform areas, with minor shortcomings/delays mainly in civil service reform.

**Comments on Bank Performance:**

The CAS was highly relevant due to its close alignment with the GPRS, and subsequent adaptation to GPRSII. It benefited from higher than expected economic growth. The incentives for HIPC completion support from PRSCs contributed to a strong policy performance by government which—along with some improvements in portfolio performance through greater supervision efforts—raised the lending envelope during the CAS period. Attention was paid to fiduciary issues in key fiduciary assessments (annual External Reviews of Public Financial Management, the Country Financial Accountability Assessment, and the Country Procurement Assessment Review) that helped underpin many improvements in PFM system performance.

With the Bank as the leading donor in Ghana (the Bank provided nearly 25 percent of net disbursements of external assistance in 2005-2006), the CAS built on the Bank's continuing success in helping to build strong donor partnership around the MDBS (comprising 25-30 percent of aid flows) and increasingly harmonized procedures. The Ghana Joint Assistance Strategy (G-JAS) is expected to further deepen such partnership, and the Bank's role in promoting this is also commendable.

IDA's lending and complementary AAA were successful in achieving most expected CAS outcomes under pillars 1 and 3, including success in many challenging public sector reforms that had not been possible previously despite considerable effort and resources applied. IDA's support to pillar 2 helped exceed expectations in reducing headcount poverty, but produced less than expected measurable results overall. Inadequate investment in AAA in these areas was among the factors.

Although development effectiveness is broadly favorable, there are areas where design and supervision could be improved. Many projects have unrealistic timetables leading to multiple extensions. Most expected CAS outcomes capture key Bank interventions, and are monitorable within the time period. However, a few indicators do not capture key Bank interventions, some indicators lack data, and indicators measuring targets set for 2007 are difficult to measure at the stage of the CASCR.

There are remaining challenges in procurement, monitoring and evaluation. IEG composite ratings on completed projects are all below Africa and Bank averages, and little changed in comparison to ratings during the previous CAS period. However, there are some indicators that project quality improved: specifically, a reduction in projects and commitments at risk, and an increase in disbursements. These improvements stem in part from the work of joint Government-Bank teams on improving both implementation support and quality at entry, with a particular emphasis on implementation readiness, M&E arrangements, safeguards compliance, clearer formulation of development objectives and outcomes, and greater realism regarding risk assessment. These initiatives help to explain the good performance in meeting expected CAS outcomes under pillars 1 and 3, and partly under pillar 2.

#### 4. Overall IEG Assessment

<b>Outcome:</b>	<i>Moderately Satisfactory</i>
<b>Bank Performance:</b>	<i>Moderately Satisfactory</i>

Although CAS outcomes under pillars 1 and 3 were satisfactory, the moderately unsatisfactory rating under pillar 2 brought down the rating to an overall CAS outcome rating of moderately satisfactory.

The Bank's performance is also rated as moderately satisfactory. The Bank's strong performance in many areas is diminished by less than satisfactory ratings on key projects, project delays and unrealistic timetables, poorly specified indicators, as well as indicators that could not be measured in time for informing the new CAS, and lack of sufficient and relevant AAA.

#### 5. Assessment of CAS Completion Report

Although the CASCR does not rate outcomes, it provides a thorough and frank assessment of accomplishments and challenges. It provides evidence that the Bank has played an important role in financing progress towards GPRS goals, and has met most expected CAS outcomes under pillars 1 and 3. It is frank in pointing out that some indicators do not capture key Bank interventions, some are poorly specified, and some require end of 2007 data not available at this stage. To address these shortcomings, it provides alternative measures to manage Bank performance, and promises to provide more relevant, monitorable indicators in the next CAS. IEG agrees with the lessons drawn by the CASCR, with caveats given in the next section.

The CASCR has limited references to IFC despite the CAS being a joint Bank/IFC CAS. IEG-IFC's review was informed by additional material provided by IFC. While IFC undertook investment and

advisory operations in line with meeting the CAS objectives, most of these operations, particularly investments, have not yet reached early operating maturity, making it difficult to assess overall results at this time. IFC's recently implemented Development Outcome Tracking System (DOTS), and TAAS/PCR self evaluation system, would partly address these shortcomings in the current and future approved operations. Additionally, the CASCR has only a limited discussion as to how the World Bank and IFC cooperated on private sector development. Given that this was a joint WB/IFC CAS and that there were several instances of cooperation laid out in the CAS and CAS progress report, the CASCR could have provided more detail on cooperative activities. Also, greater IFC-focused CASCR discussion of what worked, what did not work, and what can be replicated would also have been useful.

## 6. Findings and Lessons

IEG supports proposed steps to improve the results framework, the effectiveness of sector budget support operations predicated on strong government and donor partner co-leadership at the sectoral level, and heightening use of stronger cross-sectoral approaches for sector operations. In support of the last point, AAA could assess, for example, the positive contributions to health outcomes of related investments, and the constraints to improved health outcomes attributable to other sectors. IEG supports the lesson on strategic positioning of AAA, but also endorses other QAG recommendations to find ways of deepening AAA in real sectors and human development. The latter would hopefully help to build momentum for design and implementation of human resource development strategies by the Government to address severe capacity constraints in many key sectors. The lesson on aligning regional projects better with country context is supported by recent IEG work in this area,<sup>7</sup> stressing the need for clear delineation and coordination of roles and accountable governance arrangements.

<sup>1</sup> Based on estimate from CASCR, including projects scheduled for Board approval, excluding GEF contribution.

<sup>2</sup> NB. PRSC 2 is classified "public sector governance" while PRSC 3, 4 and 5 are classified "economic policy;" yet the content of all these PRSCs is broad in similar areas.

<sup>3</sup> Including Urban Sector report (\$475,000) expected to be completed in FY07.

<sup>4</sup> According to the Region, this indicator is the correct one, not the ones given in the CAS, which are, in turn, different in the main text and results matrix, both of which are wrong.

<sup>5</sup> The Government argues that "Company Seal," takes 40 days which is included in the total, but is not required for business registration.

<sup>6</sup> NB. World Bank. (2005). *An Independent Review of World Bank Support to Capacity Building in Africa: The Case of Ghana*. IEG.

<sup>7</sup> World Bank (2007). *The Development Potential of Regional Programs*. IEG.



<b>Annex Table 1 :</b>	<b>Actual vs. Planned Lending</b>
<b>Annex Table 2 :</b>	<b>Analytical and Advisory Work: actual vs. planned</b>
<b>Annex Table 3 :</b>	<b>IEG Project Ratings</b>
<b>Annex Table 4 :</b>	<b>Portfolio Status Indicators by Year</b>
<b>Annex Table 5 :</b>	<b>IBRD / IDA Net Disbursements and Charges</b>
<b>Annex Table 6 :</b>	<b>Net Aid Flows (net or gross, ODA or ODA+OOD, as relevant)</b>
<b>Annex Table 7 :</b>	<b>Economic and Social Indicators</b>
<b>Annex Table 8 :</b>	<b>Millennium Development Goals</b>



**Annex Table 1a: Ghana Planned vs. Actual Commitments (US\$ Millions) FY04-07**

FY	Project	Planned	Actual	Board Date
2004	PRSC 2	125	Delayed to FY05	
	Education Sector Development	78	78	9-Mar-04
	Second Urban Environment and Sanitation	62	62	29-Apr-04
	Community-Based Rural Development	50	Delayed to FY05	
	<b>Additional Projects</b>			
	Land Administration		20.5	31-Jul-03
	HIVAIDS Treatment Acceleration (Regional)*		14.9	
	<b>Subtotal FY04</b>	<b>315</b>	<b>175.4</b>	
2005	PRSC 3	125	Delayed to FY06	
	Micro Small and Medium Enterprise Support: Joint IDA/IFC (MSME)	25	Delayed to FY06	
	Community Water and Sanitation 2 (2) (Small Town Water Supply and Sanitation)	25	26	27-Jul-04
	Urban Water	100	103	27-Jul-04
	West African Gas Pipeline (Regional) *	25	8	
	West Africa Power Pool (Regional) APL (Phase 1)*	15	40	
	<b>Additional Projects</b>			
	Community-Based Rural Development		60	29-Jul-04
	PRSC 2		125	13-Jul-04
	<b>Subtotal FY05</b>	<b>315</b>	<b>362</b>	
2006	PRSC 4	125	140	15-Jun-06
	Multi-Country HIV/AIDS Program (MAP) 2	20	20	15-Nov-05
	Energy	40		
	Public Sector Reform and Capacity Building (Econ Management and Capacity Building)	20	25	15-Nov-05
	<b>Additional Projects</b>			
	PRSC 3		125	25-Aug-05
	Micro Small and Medium Enterprise Support: Joint IDA/IFC (MSME)		45	5-Jan-06
	West Africa Power Pool (Regional) APL (Phase 2)*		45	
	<b>Subtotal FY06</b>	<b>205</b>	<b>400</b>	
2007	PRSC 5 **	125	110	24-May-07
	Infrastructure ( E-Ghana)	40	40	
	Agriculture	20		
	Decentralization for Community Empowerment	35	Delayed FY09	
	<b>Additional Projects</b>			
	Urban Transport Project SIL **		45	21-Jun-07
	Health Insurance Project **		15	21-Jun-07
	Nut. & Malaria Ctrl Child Survival **		25	21-Jun-07
	Small Towns WS&S Supp SIL **		10	21-Jun-07
	<b>Projects pending approval for FY07 in CASCR, but are in FY08 in Business Warehouse</b>			
	Agriculture SWAp (AgSSIPII) (West Africa Agricultural Productivity Program)		10	21-Aug-07
	<b>Subtotal FY07***</b>	<b>220</b>	<b>245</b>	
	<b>Grand Total***</b>	<b>1055</b>	<b>1182.4</b>	

Source: BW 2a1, 2a7, 2a8 as of 5/25/07. Planned Lending from CAS 2004, CASCR 2007

\* Actual Lending to Ghana according to CASCR, Annex3 Table2

\*\* Pending Board approval

\*\*\*Actual lending in FY07 includes projects pending board approval in FY07

a: The lending amount does not include GEF.

**Annex Table 1b: Ghana Planned vs Actual Lending by Sector, FY04-FY07 \***

	<b>Planned</b>	<b>Actual</b>
Economic Policy	375.0	375.0
Education	78.0	78.0
Environment		20.5
Energy	80.0	93.0
Financial Sector	20.0	25.0
Global Information/Communications Technology		40.0
Health, Nutrition and Population	20.0	74.9
Private Sector Development	25.0	45.0
Public Sector Governance	160.0	125.0
Rural Sector	70.0	60.0
Transport	40.0	45.0
Water Supply and Sanitation	187.0	201.0
<b>Total</b>	<b>1055.0</b>	<b>1182.4</b>

Source: BW 2.a.1 as of 5/25/07, and CASCR for regional projects. Planned Lending from CAS 2004

\* actual lending includes approved projects and the ones pending approval within CAS period;



**Annex Table 2: Planned and Actual Analytical and Advisory Work, FY04-FY07**

	<b>Planned Product</b>	<b>Delivery Status</b>
<b>FY 2004</b>	CEM on Growth, Poverty, Budgeting	Actual
	Energy Policy Note	Forwarded to FY05
	Public Expenditure Review (PER)	Actual
	Country Procurement Assessment Report (CPAR)	Actual (delivered FY03)
	Trade Study*	Forwarded to FY05
	Energy PSIA	Actual
	National Health Insurance Implementation	Forwarded to FY05
	Post Financial Sector Assessment Prog. Follow-up	Actual
	Country Financial Accountability Assessment Update	Actual
	A&A ROSC	Actual
	Ghana Corporate Governance Assessment	Forwarded to FY05
	Poverty and Social Impact Analysis	Dropped
	Capacity Building for Sustained Subnational Regional Development Compet.	Dropped
	HIPC AAP *	Actual
	HIPC Completion Point *	Actual
		<b><u>Additional Actual Deliveries</u></b>
		FSAP Update
<b>FY 2005</b>	Monitoring and Evaluation Readiness Assess.	Actual
	Investment Climate Assessment	Forwarded to FY06
	Country Environmental Assessment (CEA)	Forwarded to FY06
	Country Portfolio Performance Review (CPPR)*	Forwarded to FY06
	Telecommunications Sector Policy Dialogue	Forwarded to FY08
	PER Update (External review of Public Financial Management)	Actual
	Benchmarking Study (MIGA)*	Forwarded to FY06
	Communications Review	Dropped
		<b><u>Additional Actual Deliveries</u></b>
		Energy Policy Note
<b>FY 2006</b>	Public-Private Partnerships	Dropped
	Urban Strategy Note	Forwarded to FY07 (underway)
	Natural Resources Management (NRM Economic Valuation)	Actual delivered FY05
	Community Empowerment	Dropped
	Disability in Ghana	Dropped
	PER (External review of Public Financial Management)	Actual
	CFAA	Dropped
		<b><u>Additional Actual Deliveries</u></b>
		Country Environmental Assessment (CEA)
		Investment Climate Assessment (Ghana Productivity Analysis)
<b>FY 2007</b>	Employment and Youth Study	Actual (delivered FY06)
	Poverty Assessment	Forwarded to FY08
	Country Economic Memorandum (CEM)	Forwarded to FY08
	PER (External review of Public Financial Management)	Forwarded to FY08
	CPPR	Dropped
		<b><u>Additional Actual Deliveries</u></b>
		Urban Sector Development and Growth

Sources: Ghana CAS 2004, CASPR 2006; BW Tables 1.4 for ESW and TA as of 4/13/07, and IRIS

\*According to CASCR. Not in BW (no cost charged)

Products indicated "dropped" are neither in BW nor in CASCR table

Products in Italics are TA

**Annex Table 3a: IEG Project Ratings for Ghana, Exit FY04-07**

Exit FY	Project Name	Total Evaluated Net Commitments (\$M)	Evaluation Type	IEG Outcome	IEG Sustainability	IEG ID Impact
2004	Urban Env Sanitation 1 (BD FY06)	63.8	ES	Moderately Satisfactory	Unlikely	Modest
2004	Village Infrastructure	28.3	ES	Satisfactory	Likely	Substantial
2004	Public Enterprise/PR	24.1	ES	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Likely	Modest
2004	Pub. Fin. Mgmt. TAP	19.0	ES	Unsatisfactory	Unlikely	Modest
2004	Pub.Sector Mngt.Prog	13.1	ES	Highly Unsatisfactory	Unlikely	Negligible
2004	Uurban5	11.2	ES	Satisfactory	Non-Evaluable	Modest
2005	Community Water II	26.6	ES	Satisfactory	Likely	Substantial
2005	PRSC 2 DPL (FY05)	127.5	ES	Satisfactory	Likely	Substantial
2006	Com Based Pov Reduct SIL (FY99)	5.3	ES	Moderately Satisfactory	Likely	Modest
2006	AIDS GARFUND Response Proj (FY01)	25.7	ES	Unsatisfactory	Unlikely	Modest

Source: BW 4.a.6 as of 04/25/2007

**Overall Ratings for Exit FY04-07**

	Total Evaluated (\$M)	Total Evaluated (No)	Outcome % Sat (No)	Inst Dev Impact % Subst (No)	Sustainability % Likely (No)
Ghana	344.6	10	60.0	30.0	55.6
Africa	7,153.6	169	70.5	49.1	69.2
BankWide	44,608.1	722	80.0	56.3	81.6

Source: BW 4.a.5 as of 04/25/2007

**Annex Table 3b: IEG Project Ratings for Ghana, Exit FY01-03**

Exit FY	Project Name	Total Evaluated Net Commitments	Evaluation		IEG Sustainability	IEG ID Impact
		(\$M)	Type	IEG Outcome		
2001	Community Water & Sanitation	20.7	ES	Satisfactory	Likely	Substantial
2001	Vocational Skills & Informal Sector Proj.	7.9	ES	Unsatisfactory	Unlikely	Negligible
2002	Non-Bank Fin Ins Asst	15.1	ES	Unsatisfactory	Unlikely	Modest
2002	Health Sector Support	32.7	ES	Moderately Satisfactory	Likely	Substantial
2002	High Sector Invest Prog	90.0	ES	Moderately Satisfactory	Likely	Substantial
2002	Mining Sec. Dev & Env	10.2	PAR	Moderately Satisfactory	Unlikely	Substantial
2003	Local Govt Dev.	36.8	ES	Satisfactory	Likely	Modest
2003	Nat. Res. Management	9.0	ES	Moderately Satisfactory	Non-Evaluable	Modest
2003	Fisheries	7.8	ES	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Unlikely	Modest
2003	Basic Education Sector Improvement	45.2	PAR	Moderately Satisfactory	Likely	Modest
2003	ERSO II	178.8	ES	Unsatisfactory	Unlikely	Negligible
2003	ERSO III	111.2	ES	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Likely	Modest
2003	PRSC I	128.2	ES	Satisfactory	Likely	Modest

Source: BW 4.a.6 as of 04/25/2007

**Overall Ratings for Exit FY01-03**

	Total Evaluated (\$M)	Total Evaluated (No)	Outcome % Sat (No)	Inst Dev Impact % Subst (No)	Sustainability % Likely (No)
Ghana	693.6	13	61.5	30.8	58.3
Africa	7,759.4	213	66.5	39.7	59.6
BankWide	64,188.3	835	74.7	48.7	73.4

Source: BW 4.a.5 as of 04/25/2007

**Annex Table 4: Ghana - Status Indicators by Year, FY04-FY07 (In US\$ millions)**

Country	Fiscal Year	2004	2005	2006	2007
<b>Ghana</b>	# Proj	14	16	16	14
	Net Comm Amt	860.3	1,024.3	1,079.3	844.7
	# Proj At Risk	3	3	3	2
	% At Risk	21.4	18.8	18.8	14.3
	Comm At Risk	149.5	293.1	315.6	140.0
	% Commit at Risk	17.4	28.6	29.2	16.6
<b>Nepal</b>	# Proj	9	12	12	14
	Net Comm Amt	302.0	424.5	421.5	524.7
	# Proj At Risk	1	1	3	2
	% At Risk	11.1	8.3	25.0	14.3
	Comm At Risk	75.6	75.6	145.2	100.1
	% Commit at Risk	25.0	17.8	34.5	19.1
<b>Papua New Guinea</b>	# Proj	5	4	3	2
	Net Comm Amt	99.6	82.3	72.3	102.6
	# Proj At Risk	3	2	1	1
	% At Risk	60.0	50.0	33.3	50.0
	Comm At Risk	82.6	65.3	40.0	77.3
	% Commit at Risk	82.9	79.3	55.4	75.4
<b>Republic of Congo</b>	# Proj	5	6	6	4
	Net Comm Amt	112.0	157.0	157.0	87.0
	# Proj At Risk	4	2	3	1
	% At Risk	80.0	33.3	50.0	25.0
	Comm At Risk	71.0	49.0	69.0	7.0
	% Commit at Risk	63.4	31.2	43.9	8.0
<b>Africa</b>	# Proj	334	334	351	351
	Net Comm Amt	16,387.7	16,364.8	18,310.4	19,639.8
	# Proj At Risk	76	97	77	80
	% At Risk	22.8	29.0	21.9	22.8
	Comm At Risk	3,174.5	4,300.9	3,241.0	3,746.9
	% Commit at Risk	19.4	26.3	17.7	19.1
<b>Bankwide</b>	# Proj	1,346	1,332	1,345	1,323
	Net Comm Amt	92,554.3	93,211.7	92,888.8	93,564.0
	# Proj At Risk	228	224	188	222
	% At Risk	16.9	16.8	14.0	16.8
	Comm At Risk	14,742.1	12,552.7	10,849.8	14,462.8
	% Commit at Risk	15.9	13.5	11.7	15.5

Source: BW 3.a.4 as of 5/3/07

**Annex Table 5. Ghana: IBRD/IDA Net Disbursements and Charges, FY03-FY07**

FY	Disb. Amt.	Repay Amt.	Net Amt.	Charges	Fees	Net Transfer
FY04	143,311,508.13	54,137,238.41	89,174,269.72	29,064,108.09	1,193,133.56	58,917,028.07
FY05	324,520,308.45	61,933,775.64	262,586,532.81	31,535,758.88	2,352,524.52	228,698,249.41
FY06	437,299,305.32	68,164,601.42	369,134,703.90	31,237,933.91	1,811,473.36	336,085,296.63
FY07*	90,459,912.84	367,686.79	90,092,226.05	4,154,159.03	1,294,917.35	84,643,149.67
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>1,224,530,060.16</b>	<b>227,550,377.93</b>	<b>996,979,682.23</b>	<b>122,075,751.40</b>	<b>6,652,048.79</b>	<b>868,251,882.04</b>

Source: Client Connection as of 4/12/07

\* Covers the period July 06-April 07

**Annex Table 6: External Assistance to Ghana, Total Net Disbursements 2003-2005**  
(in US\$ Million)

	2004	2005	Total
Australia	0.26	0.2	0.46
Austria	0.47	0.51	0.98
Belgium	2.68	2.9	5.58
Canada	48.54	51.73	100.27
Czech Republic	0.06	0.06	0.12
Denmark	59.72	56.07	115.79
Finland	0.18	0.26	0.44
France	74.52	39.15	113.67
Germany	65.56	66.44	132
Greece	0.03	0.37	0.4
Ireland	1.13	1.24	2.37
Italy	2.74	3.52	6.26
Japan	115.42	44.22	159.64
Korea	4.04	13.7	17.74
Luxembourg	0.05	0.05	0.1
Norway	1.73	1.09	2.82
Netherlands	152.58	70.49	223.07
New Zealand	0.07	0.12	0.19
Poland	0.02	0.02	0.04
Spain	19.08	38.86	57.94
Sweden	0.46	26.68	27.14
Switzerland	7.63	12.26	19.89
Turkey		0.01	0.01
United Kingdom	263.53	119.74	383.27
United States	80.41	66.81	147.22
<b>All Bilateral Donors</b>	<b>900.91</b>	<b>616.5</b>	<b>1,517.41</b>
AfDF (African Dev.Fund)	47.67	53.34	101.01
Arab Agencies	23.93	9.6	33.53
Arab Countries	5.12		5.12
DAC Countries, Total	896.79	602.71	1,499.5
DAC EU Members, Total	642.73	426.28	1,069.01
EC	63.52	77.42	140.94
G7, Total	650.72	391.61	1,042.33
GEF	1.82	5.65	7.47
Global Fund (GFATM)	5.07	23.03	28.1
IDA	288.03	318	606.03
IFAD	7.69	4.23	11.92
Non-DAC Bilateral Donors, Total	9.25	13.86	23.11
Nordic Dev. Fund	4.08	2.15	6.23
Other Bilateral Donors	0.01	0.07	0.08
SAF+ESAF+PRGF(IMF)	-4.84	-14.64	-19.48
UNDP	4.08	4.17	8.25
UNFPA	4.18	3.69	7.87
UNHCR	4.61	6.18	10.79
UNICEF	3.9	4.51	8.41
UNTA	1.76	2.7	4.46
WFP	0.75	3.33	4.08
<b>Multilateral, Total</b>	<b>456.25</b>	<b>503.36</b>	<b>959.61</b>
<b>All Donors, Total</b>	<b>1,362.29</b>	<b>1,119.93</b>	<b>2,482.22</b>

Source: OECD DAC as of 4/12/07

**Annex Table 7: Economic and Social Indicators for Ghana, 2000-2005**

Series Name	Ghana						Average				SSA
	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	Bangladesh	Cambodia	Pakistan	Uganda	
GDP growth (annual %)	3.7	4.2	4.5	5.2	5.8	5.8	5.4	6.8	4.7	5.4	4.1
GNI per capita, PPP (current international \$)	1,840.0	1,920.0	1,990.0	2,090.0	2,220.0	2,370.0	1,820.0	2,105.0	2,051.7	1,351.7	1,769.5
GNI per capita, Atlas method (current US\$)	330.0	290.0	270.0	310.0	380.0	450.0	410.0	316.7	543.3	248.3	549.0
GDP per capita growth (annual %)	1.4	1.9	2.2	3.0	3.6	3.7	3.4	4.7	2.2	2.0	1.8
Agriculture, value added (% of GDP)	36.0	35.9	36.0	35.8	37.9	38.8	22.6	35.2	23.6	33.8	17.9
Exports of goods and services (% of GDP)	49.0	45.2	42.4	40.3	34.5	30.4	15.0	57.2	15.3	12.7	32.4
Imports of goods and services (% of GDP)	67.5	64.7	54.5	52.2	54.4	49.5	20.7	66.9	16.2	25.9	32.2
Industry, value added (% of GDP)	25.4	25.2	24.3	24.9	24.7	24.6	26.4	26.3	23.6	20.9	30.8
Services, etc., value added (% of GDP)	38.6	38.9	39.7	39.3	37.4	36.6	51.0	38.5	52.8	45.3	51.3
Current account balance (% of GDP)	-7.8	-6.1	-0.5	3.3	-2.7	..	-0.1	-6.8	2.3	-5.0	..
Total debt service (% of GNI)	8.0	5.4	3.0	6.1	2.8	..	1.4	0.6	4.2	1.3	3.7
External debt (% of GNI)	126.6	121.9	115.4	101.2	80.0	..	33.2	74.0	44.6	68.9	60.4
Gross domestic savings (% of GDP)	5.4	7.0	7.7	11.0	8.0	10.5	18.0	11.7	16.2	7.6	18.8
IBRD loans and IDA credits (PPG DOD, current US\$) (millions)	3,139.5	3,177.8	3,476.0	3,953.8	4,311.8	..	7,390.0	323.6	7,989.6	2,672.7	43,334.3
Gross national expenditure (% of GDP)	118.5	119.6	112.0	111.9	119.9	119.1	105.7	109.7	100.9	113.0	..
Inflation, consumer prices (annual %)	25.2	32.9	14.8	26.7	12.6	15.1	3.3	2.1	5.0	4.0	..
Real effective exchange rate index (2000 = 100)	100.0	100.6	99.8	100.5	99.4	109.5	..	..	93.9	91.0	..
Official exchange rate (LCU per US\$, period average)	5,455.1	7,170.8	7,932.7	8,677.4	9,004.6	9,072.5	58.0	3,958.5	58.5	1,792.1	..
Immunization, DPT (% of children ages 12-23 months)	84.0	80.0	80.0	80.0	80.0	..	84.2	63.6	64.8	71.8	56.6
Improved sanitation facilities (% of population with access)	..	..	..	..	18.0	..	39.0	17.0	59.0	43.0	37.0
Improved water source (% of population with access)	..	..	..	..	75.0	..	74.0	41.0	91.0	60.0	56.2
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	56.7	..	56.6	56.9	57.2	..	62.6	56.0	64.2	47.1	46.0
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	68.0	..	..	..	68.0	..	61.2	96.2	82.6	82.6	101.9
Population growth (annual %)	2.2	2.2	2.2	2.2	2.1	2.0	1.9	2.0	2.4	3.4	2.3
Population, total (millions)	19.9	20.3	20.8	21.2	21.7	22.1	135.3	13.4	146.8	26.5	702.3
School enrollment, preprimary (% gross)	40.1	38.3	41.2	44.7	46.4	41.6	14.0	8.2	51.9	3.5	15.0
School enrollment, primary (% gross)	80.5	77.1	79.7	77.1	81.4	88.4	107.8	125.5	75.0	127.9	88.9
School enrollment, secondary (% gross)	37.4	35.6	37.5	38.9	41.8	43.6	51.2	22.4	25.5	17.3	30.6
Literacy rate, adult total (% of people ages 15 and above)	..	..	..	..	57.9	..	..	73.6	49.9	66.8	..
Urban population (% of total)	44.0	44.8	45.5	46.3	47.0	47.8	24.1	18.3	34.0	12.4	34.0

Source: DDP as of 4/13/07

**Annex Table 8: Ghana- Millennium Development Goals**

	1990	1995	1998	2001	2004
<b>Goal 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</b>					
Income share held by lowest 20%	..	..	6	..	..
Malnutrition prevalence, weight for age (% of children under 5)	..	27	25	..	22
Poverty gap at \$1 a day (PPP) (%)	15	..	17	..	..
Poverty headcount ratio at \$1 a day (PPP) (% of population)	45	..	45	..	..
Poverty headcount ratio at national poverty line (% of population)	..	..	40	..	..
Prevalence of undernourishment (% of population)	..	..	18	..	12
<b>Goal 2: Achieve universal primary education</b>					
Literacy rate, youth total (% of people ages 15-24)	82	..	..	..	71
Persistence to grade 5, total (% of cohort)	80	..	..	63	..
Primary completion rate, total (% of relevant age group)	62.8	..	62.7	63.1	65.4
School enrollment, primary (% net)	54	..	57	56	58
<b>Goal 3: Promote gender equality and empower women</b>					
Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament (%)	..	..	9	9	9
Ratio of girls to boys in primary and secondary education (%)	78.5	..	88.3	90.9	90.6
Ratio of young literate females to males (% ages 15-24)	85.5	..	..	..	86.2
Share of women employed in the nonagricultural sector (% of total nonagricultural employment)	57	..	..	..	..
<b>Goal 4: Reduce child mortality</b>					
Immunization, measles (% of children ages 12-23 months)	61	70	73	81	83
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	75	67	..	68	68
Mortality rate, under-5 (per 1,000)	122	110	..	112	112
<b>Goal 5: Improve maternal health</b>					
Births attended by skilled health staff (% of total)	..	..	44.3	..	47
Maternal mortality ratio (modeled estimate, per 100,000 live births)	..	..	..	540	..
<b>Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria, and other diseases</b>					
Children orphaned by HIV/AIDS	..	..	..	..	170,000
Contraceptive prevalence (% of women ages 15-49)	..	..	22	..	25
Incidence of tuberculosis (per 100,000 people)	222.6	..	..	..	206.5
Prevalence of HIV, female (% ages 15-24)	..	..	..	..	1
Prevalence of HIV, total (% of population ages 15-49)	..	..	..	..	2
Tuberculosis cases detected under DOTS (%)	..	15.6	32.4	41.2	36.9
<b>Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability</b>					
CO2 emissions (metric tons per capita)	0.2	0.3	0.3	0.3	..
Forest area (% of land area)	33	..	..	27	24
GDP per unit of energy use (constant 2000 PPP \$ per kg of oil equivalent)	5	5	5	5	5
Improved sanitation facilities (% of population with access)	15	..	..	..	18
Improved water source (% of population with access)	55	..	..	..	75
Nationally protected areas (% of total land area)	..	..	..	..	5.6
<b>Goal 8: Develop a global partnership for development</b>					
Aid per capita (current US\$)	36.3	36.7	36.9	31.7	62.7
Debt service (PPG and IMF only, % of exports of G&S, excl. workers' remittances)	36	22	22	11	6
Fixed line and mobile phone subscribers (per 1,000 people)	2.9	3.9	9.2	24	92.7
Internet users (per 1,000 people)	0	0	0.3	2	17
Personal computers (per 1,000 people)	0	1.1	2.1	3.4	5.2
Total debt service (% of exports of goods, services and income)	38	24	18	11	7
Unemployment, youth female (% of female labor force ages 15-24)	..	..	..	19.4	..
Unemployment, youth male (% of male labor force ages 15-24)	..	..	..	12.7	..
Unemployment, youth total (% of total labor force ages 15-24)	..	..	..	15.9	..
<b>Other</b>					
Fertility rate, total (births per woman)	5.7	5.1	4.8	4.4	4.2
GNI per capita, Atlas method (current US\$)	380	350	370	290	380
GNI, Atlas method (current US\$) (billions)	5.8	6.3	7.1	5.8	8.2
Gross capital formation (% of GDP)	14.4	20	23.1	26.6	27.9
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	56.2	56.8	56.8	56.6	57.2
Literacy rate, adult total (% of people ages 15 and above)	58.5	..	..	..	57.9
Population, total (millions)	15.5	17.7	19	20.3	21.7
Trade (% of GDP)	42.7	57.4	80.6	109.9	88.9

Source: World Development Indicators database, September 2006