



1. Project Data:		Date Posted : 03/23/2004	
PROJ ID: P057953		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name: Education	Project Costs (US\$M)	5.5	5.0
Country: Tajikistan	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	5.0	4.8
Sector(s): Board: ED - Secondary education (38%), Primary education (38%), Central government administration (14%), Tertiary education (10%)	Cofinancing (US\$M)		
L/C Number: C3214			
	Board Approval (FY)		99
Partners involved :	Closing Date	12/31/2002	12/31/2003
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group:
Helen Abadzi	Christopher D. Gerrard	Alain A. Barbu	OEDST
2. Project Objectives and Components			
a. Objectives			
The project was a learning and innovations loan (LIL) to improve access to high quality education as well as to raise learning achievements of students. A pilot project was carried out whose objectives were: (a) develop and pilot enhanced teaching and management strategies, (b) rehabilitate 20 schools in two regions, (c) reform the textbook development and distribution system to improve the availability of good quality textbooks, (d) build implementation capacity in the Ministry of Education and the administrations of two pilot regions, and (e) learn from the pilot experience to apply the lessons to broader reforms of the sector.			
b. Components			
(a) To build capacity by training teacher trainers and providing in-service training in teacher methodologies in pilot school, supporting parent meetings, and providing management training in methodology for the education ministry and school administrations (US\$0.52 m); (b) to reform the system of textbook development, publishing, and distribution to improve the availability of good quality textbooks, refurbish educational institutions and the ministry and provide school equipment, and funds civil works and teacher-training centers (US\$4.06 m); (c) to pilot project management, finance local consultant services, equipment, and project audits as well as project monitoring and evaluation (US\$0.92 m).			
c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates			
The project was completed after one-year extension. Government contribution was expected to be US\$500,000 but eventually was minimal. Two subcomponents on student assessment and community-based activities were introduced during the project.			
3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:			
The project objectives were mostly achieved (see below). However, the larger goals were only partly achieved. Though significant efforts were made towards improving the quality of education, learning achievement did not increase significantly during the life of the project.			
4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:			
- Enhanced teaching and management methodologies (US\$0.52 million). 20 trainers and 900 teachers were trained on child-centered, effective teaching methods through a school-based strategy. Ministry of Education officials, regional officers, and 40 principals were trained in the basics of school-based management. Teacher training institutions participated in the activities.			
- Rehabilitation of 20 schools (US\$4.06 million). 18 of the 20 schools were rehabilitated and equipped, as planned. Despite many problems, textbooks were printed from existing manuscripts and distributed. Student assessment instruments were developed and tests were administered in pilot and 'control' schools.			
- Building management capacity in the Ministry of Education and regional offices (US\$0.92 million). A textbook rental scheme was introduced and managed by regional offices and communities. Monitoring was introduced, though many indicators proved hard to monitor.			
5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):			
This was the first education project of Tajikistan, and staff were not familiar with procurement rules or administration; the project suffered severe setbacks at mid-term when the PIU director was replaced. The private sector was limited and inexperienced, so school repairs and textbook printing were carried out with great difficulty. Few contractors			

were qualified. Parents were expected to contribute 10% of construction costs, but they often did not have the required means, and sometimes they lacked money to pay for textbook rental fees. Efforts to build a management information system were not successful.

6. Ratings :	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome :	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Specific objectives were met. However, student test scores did not improve during the life of the project despite inputs designed to increase achievement.
Institutional Dev .:	Modest	Modest	
Sustainability :	Unlikely	Unlikely	Though the government cannot support recurrent expenditures, the benefits of the inputs are likely to endure in the long run; however, there is no evidence available yet.
Bank Performance :	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Borrower Perf .:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Quality of ICR :		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

- Communities are often unable to pay for school construction costs. It may be more useful to request school monitoring activities from them than cash.
- Learning and Innovation Loans (LILs) loans can be useful instruments to introduce significant reforms on a minor scale in difficult countries and to enable learning before scaling up good-practice outcomes. Supporting client 's initiatives through technical assistance to scale up pilots even as they are being implemented can help to replicate good ideas.
- Under post-conflict circumstances, a first time operation in a sector may be most effective if it finances only some key interventions and does not include all pressing needs in the operation.
- Complex components such as Education Management Information System and student assessments typically require time to design, implement, fine-tune and evaluate. Ideally, these aspects should be implemented after a country acquires experience in implementing simpler components.

8. Assessment Recommended? Yes No

Why? This is the first education project in Tajikistan, it is a LIL, and important lessons may be derived from it.

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

As an intensive-learning ICR, the document was very detailed and presented important information for the rather unusual conditions related to Tajikistan.