



1. Project Data:		Date Posted : 06/19/2002	
PROJ ID: P001187		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name: Economic Management TA	Project Costs (US\$M)	20.1	18.5
Country: Cote d'Ivoire	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	17	16.9
Sector(s): Board: EP - Central government administration (85%), Law and justice (15%)	Cofinancing (US\$M)		
L/C Number: C2503			
	Board Approval (FY)		93
Partners involved :	Closing Date	06/30/1999	06/30/2001
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group:
Anwar M. Shah	Ridley Nelson	Ruben Lamdany	OEDCR
2. Project Objectives and Components			
a. Objectives			
The project had three major objectives: (i) promoting long-term improvement in economic management; (ii) strengthening institutional capacity in civil service administration and preparing the ground for reducing the Government wage bill; and (iii) strengthening the legal and judiciary apparatus to improve overall economic development.			
b. Components			
1. For promoting long-term improvement in economic management: i) improve planning, programming and budget cycle (providing advisors); ii) strengthen national system of statistics and national accounts; iii) improve supervision, monitoring and control functions of parapublic enterprises (PE) (prepare inventory of PE legislation, review of cross debts and transfers between PEs and State), improve collection and circulation of PE information, increase autonomy and accountability of PE executive officers and board members (prepare incentive and penalty system to encourage board members' performance and training program); iv) upgrade economic management skills of higher level staff of Ministry of Economy, Finance and Plan (MEFP) departments participating in project (training assessment study of 140 staff and support for training program)			
2. For strengthening institutional capacity in civil service administration and preparing the ground for reducing the Government wage bill: i) initiate civil service reform program with objective of reducing Government wage bill and having more efficient administration (rationalize computer information systems of personnel files and payroll, design and implement systems for control of wage bill, studies for planning of reform of civil service management, assist with "Plan National de Formation" for priority training activities)			
3. For strengthening the legal and judiciary apparatus: i) strengthening judiciary (computers for offices of clerks of various courts, judicial training, collection and dissemination of legal data, training judges), ii) modernize economic legislation (revision of various laws); iii) introduce arbitration (support creation of arbitration center)			
c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates			
Dates: The project closed almost 2 years after the original closing date.			
3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:			
1. Promoting long-term improvement in economic management was partially achieved: <i>i) improve planning, programming and budget cycle</i> : A unified budget was achieved in 1999; <i>ii) strengthen national system of statistics and national accounts</i> : Not achieved; <i>iii) improve supervision, monitoring and control functions of parapublic enterprises (PE)</i> : legal framework was revised but not applied, cross-debts were assessed, computer system for managing PE information not yet put into use due to its complexity, incentive and penalty system for board members not implemented, nor was data base of competencies for selection of PE managers implemented; <i>iv) upgrade economic management skills of higher level staff of Ministry of Economy, Finance and Plan (MEFP) departments</i> : More staff were trained than originally envisaged.			
2. Strengthening institutional capacity in civil service administration and preparing the ground for reducing the Government wage bill was partially achieved: <i>i) initiate civil service reform program</i> : database system constructed,			

but never operationalized; system to manage benefits and allowances was designed, but not adopted; the government staff fell, but the reductions were less than the target; wage bill fell; The ICR did not specify if the last two activities of this component were completed (studies for planning of reform of civil service management and assisting with "Plan National de Formation")

3. Strengthening the legal and judiciary apparatus was partially achieved . Some activities were dropped (although it is unclear which ones specifically): *i) strengthening judiciary* : center set up for juridical documentation and training for staff which were believed to reduce delays in court proceedings and contributed to better dissemination of legislation, some training and equipment was provided; *ii) modernize economic legislation* : Partially achieved--Standard of the OHADA (Organization pour l'Harmonization des Droits d'Affaires) were adopted (relating to commercial law and operation of the judiciary in commercial disputes); *iii) introduce arbitration* : Not achieved

4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:

The government's wage bill was reduced (from 9% to 4.9% GDP or from 49.6% to 36.4% of the budget).

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):

The project encountered significant implementation difficulties and delays and closed two years behind schedule . The achievement of a unified budget was made less meaningful given that the project failed to achieve its objectives in improving the compilation and reliability of national statistics . There were serious problems in the operationalization of the computerized database systems due to an underestimation of the complexity of these components. The components of the project related to parapublic enterprises were for the most part not achieved . The system designed to manage the benefits and allowances for civil servants was not adopted, and staff reductions were less than anticipated. The project also did not achieve its judicial strengthening objectives .

6. Ratings:	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome:	Unsatisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	The ICR also rated the project as "Moderately Unsatisfactory." The project achieved wage bill reductions but was less successful in improving the quality and reliability of national accounts and other statistical series. It was also largely unsuccessful in strengthening judiciary and introducing arbitration.
Institutional Dev .:	Modest	Modest	
Sustainability:	Unlikely	Unlikely	
Bank Performance:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	The Bank's performance was only marginally satisfactory. The project design did not fully recognize implementation difficulties especially inadequacy of planning and support for IT components of the project. The project was not re-oriented at the mid-term review even though it was clear that there were problems. There were 4 different task team leaders during the project.
Borrower Perf .:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	The borrower's performance was only marginally satisfactory. The government commitment for project implementation fell during the course of the project, delaying in the implementation of staff reductions and rationalization of civil servant benefits
Quality of ICR:		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

1. Technical assistance should be complemented with an institutional structure that provides the correct incentives .
2. Implementation of projects should be flexible so that unmanageable components (such as the joint personnel database) can be dropped.

8. Assessment Recommended? Yes No

Why? To understand more fully the difficulties in implementing IT projects in this context .

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

ICR provided good analysis of the institutional impact of the project (on changing incentives in the country), but very limited information on the judicial component of the project. The ICR was not specific about which components of the project were dropped. The ICR was also in error about the original closing date of the project. There was no information about compliance with loan covenants in the ICR.