IEG	CASCR Review
	Independent Evaluation Group

1. CAS Data	
Country: Yemen	
CAS Year: FY2006	CAS Period: FY2006-FY2009
CASCR Review Period: FY2006-FY2009	Date of this review: May 19, 2009

#### 2. Executive Summary

i. This review examines the implementation of the FY2006-09 CAS and evaluates the FY09 CASCR. The CAS covered only the activities of IDA, although the CASCR also reviewed the activities of IFC and WBI. The objective of the CAS was to help the Government of Yemen in the implementation of its development programs in four critical areas: increasing non-oil growth; improving human development outcomes, improving fiscal sustainability, and addressing the resource sustainability crisis. As a results-based CAS, it included under each pillar, up-front actions to address economic governance issues, which needed to be implemented immediately despite the likelihood of their medium-to-long-term impact. The Bank's CAS aimed to help achieve its objectives by providing US\$459.8 million in 15 operations to Yemen, supported by analytic and advisory activities (AAA), such as the Country Social analysis, Development Policy Review, Investment Climate Assessment, Social Protection Strategy and the Qat Survey and Policy Note.

ii. The review rates the outcome of the implementation of the CAS as *moderately satisfactory* on the basis of the timely relevance of the Bank's intervention in helping address the key development issues facing the economy and supporting them with financial resources and analytic inputs. The development issues identified in the CAS corresponded with the Government's key priorities as identified in its PRSP (that is, achieving accelerated economic growth and employment generation, of which the Bank's focus was on the non-oil growth; and intensifying poverty reduction efforts, in which the Bank helped by addressing issues of resource constraints).

iii. With respect to the first pillar on the diversification of growth, the GDP growth of 3.5 percent per annum during 2006-08 fell short of the target of 7 percent per annum. Nonetheless, substantial progress was made in improving the conditions for new business registrations; however, there was modest progress in strengthening the institutions for roads and power infrastructure development, and in making appropriate public investment in key sectors. Bank contribution to these efforts is rated moderately satisfactory.

iv. Bank support for improvements in human development outcomes through more efficient service delivery and the strengthening of safety nets is also rated moderately satisfactory. Only modest contributions were made by the Bank to outcomes relating to the access, equity and quality of basic education, access and quality of health, improvement in water supply and sanitation, and in upgrading safety net programs (including support for children, youth and gender issues). On the other hand, Bank support for the Social Development Fund is seen as being especially substantial as it included analytic work on social safety nets, TA for developing social protection strategy and for establishing cash transfer mechanisms to mitigate the impact of price shocks and to allow for the eventual reduction of energy subsidies.

v. Improving fiscal sustainability through strengthening public expenditure management was a critical area of support for the Government in light of the declining oil revenues and rising need for government intervention on rising food prices and fuel subsidization. With Bank support, a critical milestone in revenue transparency was achieved when Yemen formally joined the Extractive

CASCR Reviewed by:	Peer Reviewed by:	CASCR Review Coordinator
James Sackey	Fareed M. A. Hassan	Jaime Jaramillo-Vallejo
Consultant, IEGCR	Sr. Evaluation Officer, IEGCR	Lead Economist, IEGCR

Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI). Bank support for procurement reform and public finance management also yielded substantial outputs in the form of trainings, etc. although their impacts are yet to be felt (as procurement delays still plague project implementation). Similarly, only modest outcomes were achieved for assistance in expenditure management and public sector reform, although substantial output targets were met. Overall, Bank assistance is rated moderately satisfactory.

vi. Finally, moderately unsatisfactory rating is provided for Bank assistance to the fourth pillar which aimed at helping Yemen to increase resource sustainability through improved management of water resources and reduced population pressure. While Bank support for the water sector has resulted in some institution-building, the results of the pricing/subsidy reforms and their impact on water conservation is likely only of modest effect. Bank support for dealing with population pressure has many facets (including promoting the use of contraceptives with only marginal effect and supporting increased secondary enrolment for girls where some progress has been made), but the principal channel for dialogue in population (the need for ESW) remains weak and only met the outcomes established in the CAS in a negligible way.

vii. In terms of findings and lessons, IEG concurs with the findings and recommendations of the CASCR, especially with respect to the conclusion that the Bank Group's convening role is becoming increasing important in Yemen which is experiencing expanding donor support while the Government's administrative capacity for such coordinating role remains limited. IEG also recommends that (i) the treatment of population issues be given a higher prominence in the Yemen program to supplement efforts at resource conservation, and (ii) effort be made to help improve Yemen's capacity for M&E by ensuring that program level M&E systems are integrated into a national M&E structures.

#### 3. CASCR Summary

#### **Overview of CAS Relevance:**

- 1. The CAS was relevant because:
  - Although prepared in parallel with the Government's Second Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP), the priorities in the CAS were consistent with the strategic focus of the anticipated Second PRSP (2006-10), which was clustered around three themes: diversifying economic growth, improving human development, improving governance and dealing with resource (water and population) and fiscal sustainability. The CAS was sequenced to follow the Second PRSP (or the Third Socio-Economic Development Plan for Poverty Reduction – DPPR, 2006-10) preparation process.
  - It addressed the key development constraints facing Yemen: inadequate policy environment, including business, public sector management, infrastructure and regulatory, which serve as impediment to growth and poverty reduction; the continuing limited role of the private sector as an engine of growth, especially in the non-oil sector; and the need to restore transparency and accountability in public service.
  - It used appropriate instruments to design Bank intervention, based on lessons learnt from the 2003-06 CAS. This included a lending program blending ongoing and new projects and updated annually on the basis of policy and portfolio performance, analytic and advisory activities (AAA) targeted at the key issues facing the economy and including continuing WBI involvement; a CAS Results Matrix, which defined achievable results during the CAS period for which the Bank expected to influence through its interventions; and a partnership framework to promote donor coordination, with the Country Office playing a substantial role.

2. The strategy and goals were, nevertheless, ambitious. Aiming at GDP growth in excess of seven percent in an environment of declining output of the country's main source of growth was far fetched in the absence of clear growth options. Similarly, the poverty reduction targets in a resource poor environment would have required substantial effort at income redistribution (a phenomenon which seems to have occurred nonetheless, given the deterioration in urban poverty during 2006-08, while improvement in rural poverty occurred during the same period). In the event, many of the key monitoring indicators and targets turned out to be partially achieved, thereby calling for realism in defining goals. Selectivity also remains an issue in an environment in which the needs are large and resources are limited. Developing a strategic focus will help tailor Bank assistance to those sectors where the needs are greatest.

#### **Overview of CAS Implementation:**

Lending. At the start of the new CAS period (July 2005), there were 17 active IDA credits in 3. Yemen with an undisbursed balance of US\$567 million. In addition, IDA Bank delivered 15 new operations as proposed in the CAS, but included eight investment operations that were not originally programmed, replacing six operations dropped or postponed to a later year in the program. Total commitments were US\$459.8 million, compared to the CAS proposal of US\$415 million (this does not include the Rural Energy Access project proposed for FY09). The increase in commitments included two supplemental (US\$29 million), four additional financing (US\$84.8 million), two unplanned projects (Water Sector Support and Flood Protection and Emergency Reconstruction for US\$125 million), and higher than anticipated commitment for Girls Secondary Education in FY08 (from US\$15 million to US\$20 million) (see Annex Table 1). Two of the proposed operations were to be DPLs but only one (the Institutional Reform Credit of US\$ 50.9 million) was delivered with the PRSC dropped. The other proposed projects postponed or dropped were the proposed Rural Energy Access, Yemen Population II, and Port Cities APL, which were not replaced by comparable operations as in the case for the proposed social development, and water sector support projects. The CASCR provided no commentary with respect to these changes and in the absence of a CAS Progress Report; it was not clear what the motivating factors behind the portfolio changes were.

4. The performance of the portfolio improved during the CAS period; the percentage of projects at risk (estimated at 5.6 and 10.5 percent respectively for FY06 and FY07) was reduced to zero by FY08, although in FY09 two more projects were deemed at risk as noted by the CPPR. For a small portfolio (of about 20 ongoing operations at any given time), fluctuations in risk assessment are not unusual. The percentage of the portfolio at risk, on average, was better than that of the MNA Region. On the other hand, IEG ratings of projects that exited during FY06-09 ware generally below average for MNA and the Bank. Of the 5 projects that exited the portfolio during FY06-09, 2 had unsatisfactory outcome ratings and the remainder had satisfactory ratings (see Annex Table 3a). A redeeming factor is that all three projects that recently (FY07) exited have had satisfactory outcome ratings.

#### Non-Lending Services.

5. Nine of the 16 ESWs planned in the CAS were completed. An additional 5 un-programmed ESWs were delivered to make up for the shortfall, and three un-programmed ESWs are ongoing. The completed ESWs included critical analytic works such as the Country Social Analysis, Development Policy Review, Investment Climate Assessment, Poverty Assessment, Social Protection Strategy and the Qat Survey and Policy Note. However, some important ESWs pertinent to the objectives of the CAS were dropped or have slipped. They include the Gender Report, the CPAR and the CFAA, which have been dropped and the PER and the Transport Sector Policy Note, which have been rescheduled for FY09. Non-programmed ESW (and a number of technical assistance activities) responded to timely client request and included analytic pieces for PEFA Assessment, Mineral Sector Review and National Disability Study. The CASCR does not explain the factors behind the choice of the unprogrammed ESW and why a number of key studies were dropped, but highlighted responses to changing environment and client demand. The quality of analytic work (ESW) was generally high, although it could have benefited from improved timeliness.

#### Overview of Achievement by Objective:

6. The overall progress on the Government's key priorities as identified in the DPPR (achieving accelerated economic growth and employment generation; and intensifying poverty reduction efforts) was below expectation. Average GDP growth of 3.5 percent during 2006-08 was below the target of 7.1 percent; real non-oil GDP averaged 5.3 percent over the past 5 years, compared to the target of 10.1 percent; and progress on poverty reduction was slow (30 percent of the population is below the national poverty-line in 2008 compared to the target of 19.8 percent). Performance indicators for promoting private sector development, increasing school enrolment, reducing maternal mortality and controlling population growth were also below target set, although some progress was made in expanding access to safe water for the rural population. Several exogenous factors (including volatile international oil prices, the spike in international food prices, and devastating floods in the Hadramout and Al-Mahara governorates) influenced the overall performance and the current assessment is that Yemen is unlikely to meet most of the MDG targets by 2015.

#### Pillar I: Diversifying growth through better governance and better delivery of public services.

7. The Bank's objective under this pillar included improving the business and regulatory environment, supporting road and power infrastructure, help develop technical education, vocational training and higher education; assist in setting up regulatory frameworks and making appropriate public investment in key sectors. In addition to eight ongoing projects in support to government efforts in this area, Bank support was given in the form of Second Rural Access Project, Fisheries Resources, Management and Conservation Project, Power Sector, Rain-fed Agriculture and Livestock, Second Vocational Training Project, Institutional Reform Credit and Additional Financing for Groundwater & Soil Conservation Project. Significant AAAs included the Investment Climate Assessment, Development Policy Review and Financial Sector Reform.

Improving the business regulatory environment

8. Good progress was made in improving the conditions for new business registrations (with additional support by IFC and FIAS). The minimum capital requirement for business registration was eliminated; in addition, the time to register new businesses was reduced from 63 days in 2006 to 13 days in 2008. On tax policy and administration, the hidden turnover taxes were replaced by a 5 percent sales tax, though full implementation of the law is still pending. The total tax rate as percent of profits fell from 195.3 percent in 2006 to 47.8 percent in 2008. Despite signifying a reduction in the tax burden that firms face, there is no information on whether these changes have translated in an increase in revenues reported for tax purposes. On customs and inspections, a new customs management system was introduced but is not fully operational and indicators on efficiency in customs administration remain unchanged during 2006 to 2008 (time for import, 28 days; cost to import, US\$1475 per container). There was no evidence that the environment of weak property rights protection has improved, although a new land registration law was approved in 2007. Overall, the Bank's support to the government's reform effort was substantial.

#### • Improving road and power infrastructure

9. A key objective of supporting government effort to expand road infrastructure is to help reduce the isolation of people living in the rural areas. Substantial progress was made in helping reduce travel time and transport cost by an estimated 30 percent since 2006 and in helping increase investment in rural roads by an estimated 50 percent since 2006. Furthermore, the support for the Road Maintenance Fund and the Social Development Fund helped improve access to markets and social services by the rural communities, while strengthening institutional development and road maintenance, albeit very slow because of capacity limitations within government. In contrast, limited progress has been made in promoting higher customer satisfaction, lower voltage fluctuations and reduced supply failures in the power sector, in part because of implementation setback experienced by



the Bank's program. Procurement delays and unsatisfactory consultant performance have been cited as key constraints. Bank support for procurement remains constrained by personnel shortage and the ongoing PFM program did not adequately substitute for the postponement of the planned CPAR and CFAA. While the rural electrification strategy and associated legal instrument have been completed with Bank support, there has been no significant investment yet to support the expected improvement in the access to power in the rural areas. The net effect of Bank support for road and power development was modest.

# Improving skills through technical education and vocational training and higher education

10. The Bank's support for skills development in Yemen followed a two-prong approach: improving skills through technical education and vocational training, and improving skills through higher education. In both approaches, only modest results were achieved, in part because of weak government commitment (delays in credit effectiveness with respect to the vocational training project) and limited capacity to implement wide-ranging reforms. As a result the anticipated strengthening of the private sector capacity to identify, finance and promote in-service training has not materialized. Similarly, the expectation with respect to the completion of strategic plans for the seven universities (only two are ready) is yet to be realized in order to complement the higher education strategy developed for 2006-2011. While the Bank's support has informed the policy debate in the sector, the overall outcome has been close to modest.

# Improving regulatory framework and making appropriate public investment in key sectors

11. The Bank focused its support for irrigated agriculture, rain-fed agriculture and livestock, fisheries, the gas sector and urban manufacturing. The wide-ranging support emphasized institution-building and capacity development in which short-term outcomes are not likely. Satisfactory progress had been made towards sustainable water use under irrigated agriculture but there is limited evidence of an increase in productivity for the targeted 90,000 hectares of spate irrigated lands. Under rain-fed agriculture and livestock development, Bank support has helped in the ongoing construction of a central veterinary laboratory, the creation of a veterinary association, and ongoing mobilization of community participatory learning groups, expected outcomes in terms of increased revenues have not yet been realized. The same could be said for support to fisheries development in the form of the creation of fisheries authorities in costal governorates, the fish research authority and fish port authority and rehabilitation of a number of fishery infrastructures.

12. Bank support for the gas sector took the form of improved legal and regulatory framework. Contract sharing models, licensing frameworks for investment and TA programs to support resource mobilization have been completed or underway. A similar model has been employed by the Bank in its support for urban manufacturing in improving the regulatory environment. Support has been given in drafting regulatory framework, undertaking feasibility studies and preparing bidding documents, adopting a national ports development strategy, and initiating city development strategies in three major port cities. Expected outcomes are in the medium-term, and overall Bank support could be rated as modest.

# Pillar II: Accelerating human development through more efficient service delivery and improved safety nets.

13. Bank support under this pillar had contrasting characteristics. On the one hand, the objectives to help improve access, equity and quality of education; improve access and quality of health; and improve water supply and sanitation were overly ambitious. On the other hand, support for improving safety net programs and operational streamlining of gender issues was modest. The expected outcomes of the latter depended mostly on the achievements of critical outputs envisaged under the programs for education, health and water supply. The inputs expended by the Bank to support the process (ongoing eleven projects, supplemented by six new projects, including additional financing and AAA) were appropriate for the objectives outlined in the CAS.

#### Improving access, equity and quality of basic education

14. Access and equity concerns at the basic education level were essentially gender oriented. Actual outcomes of targeted interventions were below expectation – the ratio of girls enrolled in basic education increased to 42 percent but below the target of 45 percent, anticipated improvement in teacher-student ration was not achieved, and the grade 9 female completion rate reached 29 percent but below the anticipated 50 percent. A number of process requirements, such as increasing the nonwage expenditures relate to recurrent spending and retrofitting schools for the handicapped were met but overall the results achieved were modest.

#### • Improving access and quality of health

15. The Bank's objectives under health had relatively better results than in education. Immunization objectives were largely met, and so were efforts to increase access for maternal and child health care, although utilization is yet to be assessed. Also, while availability of contraception has improved, there is no data to assess the level of contraceptive prevalence. The Bank played a substantial role in coordinating development partners, but donor fragmentation in the sector is an issue.

#### Improving water supply and sanitation

16. The Bank supported substantial institutional-building, including the establishment of local water and sanitation corporations in Sana'a, Taiz, Hodeidah and Mukallah; the development of rural water supply and sanitation strategy along with a long-term national investment program; and the establishment of water user association in five governorates. But the outcome targets were relative too ambitious in a water-scarce environment like Yemen resulting in partial achievement of outcome goals: access to urban water supply increased from 47 percent in 2003 to 56 percent in 2007, but below the 20 percent increase target; and access to improved urban sanitation services increased from 25 percent in 2002 to 31 percent in 2007, also below the 10 percent target.

• Improving safety net programs (including children, youth and gender)

17. Bank support for improving the safety net programs especially through the Social Fund for Development (SFD) project is seen as being very substantial. Support has included analytic work on social safety nets, TA for developing a social protection strategy and for establishing cash transfer mechanism to mitigate the impact of price shocks and to allow for the eventual reduction of energy subsidies. Assessment of the SFD project indicates that pro-poor targeting has improved and that 69 percent of the resources is reaching people in the lowest three income deciles. Past Bank support for children and youth programs had negligible impact but a youth strategy was recently adopted. The Bank has also attempted to mainstream gender issues in all its programs and projects, but paying special attention to access issues in education and health.

#### Pillar III: Improving fiscal sustainability through improved public expenditure management.

18. Bank support for improving fiscal sustainability aimed at revenue transparency, expenditure management (including reduced fuel subsidies), public sector reforms, procurement reform and public financed management. The Bank largely met its lending targets (except the inability to deliver on the planned PRSC, the water supply APL Phase II and the Port Cities APL Phase II). On the other hand, the delivery of the supporting AAA had mixed results – planned analytic works on the CPAR, CFAA, PRSP Support, Statistical Master Plan, and Strategic Communications were dropped, but these were replaced by additional AAA on social protection strategy (Phase II), anti-corruption and PEFA assessments.

G CASCR Review

19. A key milestone in improving revenue transparency was achieved when Yemen formally joined the EITI. Support for expenditure management, however fell short of planned targets. Work on improving the MTEF is partially completed, improvement to the periodic evaluation of outcomes of public expenditures is ongoing, and the effort to reduce fuel subsidies was not met as a result of political resistance to potentially higher domestic prices in the presence of recent decline in global fuel prices. Overall, progress on expenditure reduction has been modest despite increased TA support on the part of the Bank.

20. Modest outcomes have also been realized in the critical public sector reform program, which aimed at a net reduction of government employment by 5 percent, improved service delivery in seven ministries, and strengthening of the institutions managing the public sector reform process. While some progress has been made in institutional reforms (including the use of biometric verification of workers, retrenchment of civil servant and training of staff), there is no evidence that the target of 5 percent net reduction of government employment was met. Furthermore, there is no evidence that the total wage bill has been reduced. The CASCR notes that capacity has improved, especially in the Ministry of Civil Service and Insurance (MOCSI), which is responsible for implementing the reform, but there is no evidence that service delivery improvements have occurred in the seven targeted ministries.

21. A number of output and process targets were identified under the Bank's support for procurement reform, including the enactment of a new procurement law and restructuring the High Tender Board. But while these have been achieved and the ongoing procurement reform is on track, there are no clear outcome effects. Similarly, with respect to improving public financial management, a number of process reforms (PEFA assessment, GFS/COFOG budget classification/AFMIS system in place in four central government ministries) had been completed or ongoing, but their impact on the performance of the public finance management is not clear.

# Pillar IV: Increasing resource sustainability through improved management of water resources and reduced population pressure.

22. Bank support for water management was wide-ranging and included execution of seven ongoing projects, a commitment of one new project, supplementation of three ongoing operations with additional financing, and support through analytic reports and trust funds. On the other hand, efforts to promote reduced population pressure was guarded, with one ongoing project in health sector reform, a new project on secondary education development an girls' access, both supplemented by a health sector consultation and dialogue and a short note on secondary education strategy. The anticipated Population II project is now planned for FY2010 and the PRSC, which could have focused on the issue of population pressure, was replaced by the Water SWAp to be committed in FY09.

#### • Improved water resource management

23. The focus of the Bank's water management support has been in the area of promoting groundwater savings through pricing, improved irrigation and institutional and organizational reforms. While substantial progress has been made in institutional reform, the results of the pricing/subsidy reforms and their impact on water conservation remains modest. The role played by agriculture has still not been resolved (especially since the issue about whether the production of qat is associated with a disproportional use of water is still being debated. Furthermore, following the Bank's support through a Qat Survey and Policy Note in 2007, the planned TA for 2008-09 was dropped because of competing need for resources). Sustainability of the program is questionable, which has triggered efforts in bringing international assistance towards a comprehensive multi-donor SWAp to be lunched in 2009.

#### Improved control over population growth

24. The Bank established a credible strategy in dealing with the issue of high population growth in Yemen through appropriately tackling gender issues and promoting use of contraceptives in a conservative society. The milestones established in the CAS with respect to girls education were largely met: the secondary education strategy was adopted, the share of girls in grade 10-12 enrollments increased to 37 percent (no base line established) and modest increase in female teachers in the rural areas occurred. But although contraceptive prevalence rate increased by 5 percent (compared to the baseline of 23.1 percent in 2004), progress was only marginal and could not be attributed to Bank assistance as the planned population project and PRSC did not materialize. The Bank's dialogue and assistance on population remain indirect and weak and only met the outcomes established in the CAS in a negligible way.

Objectives	CASCR Rating	IEG Rating	Explanation / Comments
Pillar I: Diversifying growth through better governance and better delivery of public services.	MS	MS	Substantial progress was made in improving the environment for private sector development. However, there was only modest progress in strengthening institutions supporting infrastructure and investment
Pillar II: Accelerating human development through more efficient service delivery and improved safety nets	MS	MS	Only modest contributions were made by the Bank to outcomes related to education, health, wate supply and sanitation. However, substantial progress was made wit respect to the Social Development Fund.
Pillar III: Improving fiscal sustainability through improved public expenditure management	S	MS	While key milestones in improving revenue transparency were met (especially through procurement reform), modest outcomes were realized in meeting the objective of improving fiscal sustainability.
Pillar IV: Increasing resource sustainability through improved management of water resources and reduced population pressure.	MS	MU	The support for water management exhibited many unfinished results yielding only modest results. On the other hand, Bank's dialogue on population is limited and was not supported by the planned AAA and hence of negligible impact.

U : Unsatisfactory

#### Comments on Bank Performance:

25. Bank assistance to Yemen helped address the key constraints faced by the economy, which included the need to reduce poverty, improve fiscal management, promote governance and public sector management, and facilitate growth through support for private and sectoral development (especially agriculture and fisheries, human development, infrastructure and environmental sustainability). Bank assistance was relevant as it used the appropriate instruments to design its interventions, which were based on the country's second PRSP. The country office played a facilitating role and drew in appropriate support both from Washington and the regional office in Cairo.

26. The focus of the lending program was also appropriate, timely and flexible. The Bank's response to crisis, such as the Avian Flu, the 2008 food crisis and Hadramout flood reflected the flexibility of its programming. The use of additional financing as an instrument facilitated timely response to government request and was associated with reduced cost of project preparation (the average cost of lending preparation was US\$66,000 during FY05-08, compared to US\$472,000 for a new projects during the same period). Bank assistance through AAA was also appreciated for underpinning the policy dialogue, although the failure to complete a number of important ESWs pertinent to the objectives of the CAS was a poor miscalculation. The Bank could also do more in the area of donor coordination, where its convening power (through the co-chairing of the Consultative Group and taking leadership in establishing SWAps) could be used to organize the development partners around a common policy agenda.

27. The CASCR highlights two areas of concern that would require special attention moving forward: The slow project implementation and weak monitoring and evaluation (M&E) systems. Slow project implementation could be attributed to complex design structure relative to country capacity (including low capacity for procurement), inadequate preparedness at approval leading to late effectiveness, and inadequate assessment of government ownership in a changing political environment. The concern with M&E derives from the limited local capacity in generating relevant data to support analysis of the results framework. The weaknesses of the M&E system is also reflected in the individual projects supported by the Bank which were associated with uneven quality of monitoring framework that are systematically aligned with the CAS outcomes, making it difficult track to outcomes.

# 4. Overall IEG Assessment Outcome: Moderately Satisfactory Bank Performance: Satisfactory

28. The outcome rating reflects an overall assessment of the relevance of the Bank's strategy to Yemen, as well as its contribution to the development outcomes in the areas of Bank intervention during the period under review. The Bank's strategy and interventions were relevant in addressing the key development issues facing Yemen. Satisfactory outcomes were realized in Bank support for improving the business and regulatory environment, as well as in establishing and running the safety net program (including dealing with issues of children, youth and gender). Moderately satisfactory outcomes characterized all other key support elements, except the assistance for improved control over population growth, where more may need to be done.

29. The rating of Bank performance takes into account the flexibility exhibited in the CAS implementation, the effort made to meet the CAS target in the most cost effective manner (the use of supplemental and additional financing), and support provided through the Bank's office in Yemen and Egypt. The effort devoted to supervision through increased resources (average supervision grew from US\$ 54,000 in FY03 to US\$110,000 in FY08) helped in improved portfolio quality.

#### 5. Assessment of CAS Completion Report

30. The CASCR provides a comprehensive and frank assessment of the implementation and outcomes of the Yemen country program during 2006-09. It defined the assessment methodology, which focused on the Results Matrix in the CAS (although this was heavily biased towards outputs instead of outcomes) and used the Results Chain contained in the CAS to discuss progress on each key outcome identified with the four strategic pillars. This is a good practice approach which highlighted the key findings of the assessment and helped to derive lessons and recommendations for the next CAS. The CASCR, however, could have benefitted from a better explanation of the deviation between the proposed lending and non-lending programs as contained in the CAS and the actual implementation as key programs such as the PRSC and the special study on population did not materialize. A discussion of the role played by other development partners could benefit from an assessment in order to highlight the Bank's continuing leadership role in policy dialogue vis-à-vis other partners even with IDA and IFC pledges representing only 8 percent of the 2006 CG donor commitments (compared to about 50 percent share of Yemen's aid resources provided by the Bank in the previous CAS). The key message is that the Bank would need to continue to play a leadership role in aid alignment and harmonization, especially given the structure and composition of development partnership in Yemen. This is a key lesson identified by the CASCR.

#### 6. Findings and Lessons

31. IEG agrees with the findings and the lessons identified in the CASCR, especially the conclusion that the Bank Group's convening role is becoming increasingly important in an environment where aid resources and the partnership structure are growing while the Government's administrative capacity for such coordinating role remains limited. In addition, two issues are identified by IEG:

- First, the treatment of population issues in the implementation of the last CAS was weak. High population growth constituted a constraint to efforts to improve household poverty situation in Yemen. In this respect, the conduct of an analytic assessment of the factors underlying the high population growth and the medium-to-long-tern options available for dealing with the issues (as planned in the last CAS) should be undertaken. This may also open an outlet for dealing with gender issues.
- Second, to ensure the outcome of poverty reduction interventions could be monitored more regularly, establishing a good M&E system, which outlines the frequency of key surveys and data sources to be tapped, is imperative. The CASCR noted that limited local capacity (particularly in statistics management) constrained the collection of accurate and detailed data. Program level M&E systems needs to be linked to a national M&E structure.

Annexes 11

Annex Table 1: Actual vs. Planned Lending, FY06-09

Annex Table 2: Analytical and Advisory Work: FY06-09

Annex Table 3a: IEG Project Ratings for Republic of Yemen, FY06-09 Annex Table 3b: IEG Project Ratings for Republic of Yemen and Comparators, FY06-09

Annex Table 4: Portfolio Status Indicators by Year, FY05-09

Annex Table 5: IBRD/IDA Net Disbursements and Charges

Annex Table 6: Net Aid Flows net ODA and Official Aid, 2003-2007

Annex Table 7: Economic and Social Indicators, 2000-2007

Annex Table 8: Millennium Development Goals

Annex Table 9: Summary of Achievements of the CAS Objectives

Annex Table 10: People Met During CASCR Review Mission



#### Annex Table 1: Planned and Actual Lending, FY06-09

13

	Proposed FY	Approval FY	Proposed Amount	Approved Amount
Programmed projects				
Second Rural Access Improvement	2006	2006	40.0	40.0
Fisheries Res. Mgt & Conservation	2006	2006	25.0	25.0
Power Sector	2006	2006	50.0	50.0
Rainfed Agriculture and Livestock	2007	2007	20.0	20.0
Second Vocational Training Project	2007	2007	15.0	15.0
Social Development	2007	dropped	15.0	dropped
Institutional Reform Credit	2007	2008	50.0	50.9
Urban Water Supply APL Phase II *	2008	dropped	50.0	dropped
Rural Energy Access	2008	Slipped to FY09	35.0	Slipped to FY09
Girls Secondary Education	2008	2008	15.0	20.0
Yemen Population II	2009	Slipped to FY10	25.0	Slipped to FY10
Port Cities APL Phase II	2009	Slipped to FY10	35.0	Slipped to FY10
First Poverty Reduction Support Credit	2009	dropped	40.0	dropped
	Total Programme	d projects CAS FY06-09	415.0	220.9
Non-programmed projects				
Social Fund for Development 3 (supplem.)		2007		15.0
Civil Service Modernization Supplemental		2008		14.0
Rural Water Supply Add. Financing		2008	-	20.0
Public Works III Add. Financing		2008		29.8
Taiz Mun Dev Add. Financing		2008		20.0
Groundwater & Soil Conserv. Add. Financing		2009		15.0
Water Sector Support		2009		90.0
Flood Protection & Emergency Reconstruction		2009		35.0
	Tota	projects CAS FY06-09	415.0	459.8

Source: Republic of Yemen 2006 CAS and WB Business Warehouse Table 2a.1, 2a.4 and 2a.7 as of 03.25.09.

\* Integrated in the FY09 Water Sector Support Project.



Annexes

14

#### Annex Table 2: Planned and Actual Analytical and Advisory Work, FY06-09

	Proposed FY	Delivered to Client FY	Output Type
Economic and Sector Work			
Planned (CAS FY06-09)			
Country Social Analysis	2006	2006	Report
Development Policy Review	2006	2006	Report
Investment Climate Assessment	2006	2006	Report
Poverty Assessment	2007	2007	Report
Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys	2007	2007	Policy Note
Taiz Urban Poverty Analysis & Strategy	2007	2006	Policy Note
Social Protection Strategy	2007	2007	Report
Qat Survey & Policy Note	2007	2007	Report
Gas Sector Incentive Framework	2007	2007	Policy Note
Public Expenditure Review	2008	slipped to FY10	Report
Overall Education Strategy	2008	dropped	
Country Procurement Assessment Review	2008	dropped	
Country Financial Accountability Assessment	2008	dropped	
Transport Sector Policy Note	2008	slipped to FY09	Policy Note
Gender Report	2009	dropped	
Early Childhood Development Review	2009	dropped	
Non-planned			
Secondary Education		2006	Policy Note
GCC Integration		2008	Policy Note
Social Protection Strategy (Phase II)		2008	Policy Note
Financial Sector Reform		2008	Report
PEFA Assessment		2008	Report
Land Tenure for Social and Economic Inclusion		ongoing	Policy Note
Mineral Sector Review		ongoing	Report
Financial Sector Reform Strategy		ongoing	Report
Technical Assistance		an andaren ara	·····
Planned (CAS FY06-09)		•	
PRSP Support	2006-2009	delivered	
Statistical Master Plan	2006-2009	dropped	
Qat	2008-2009	dropped	
		aloppou	

Strategic Communications	2007-2009	dropped	
Procurement	2006-2009	delivered	
PFM Action Plan	2006-2009		
Public Financial Management		2006	Institutional Development Plan
Public Financial Management		2008	"How-To" Guidance
Public Financial Management		ongoing	"How-To" Guidance
EITI (Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative)	2007-2009	delivered	



#### Annex Table 2: Planned and Actual Analytical and Advisory Work, FY06-09 (continued)

Land Management & Urban Upgrading Pilots	2008-2009	dropped	
Private Sector Support	2007-2009	delivered	
Health Sector Review	2006-2007	slipped to FY09	<b>Client Document Review</b>
Children & Youth Strategy	2006-2009		
Children and Youth Strategy		2006	"How-To" Guidance
Implementation Children & Youth Plan		2008	"How-To" Guidance
National Water Strategy	2006-2009		
Assistance on Water Strategy Implementation		2006	"How-To" Guidance
Water Sector Strategy Support		2007	Knowledge-Sharing Forum
Environment	2006-2009	dropped	
Non-planned			
Environmental Health		2006	Model/Survey
Social Protection Workshop Aden CDS (City Development Strategy) for Local Economic		2006	Knowledge-Sharing Forum
Development		2007	Institutional Development Plan
National Disability Study		2007	Institutional Development Plan
Yemen Health Sector Consultation & Dialogue		2007	"How-To" Guidance
Petroleum Governance TA		2008	"How-To" Guidance
Anti-Corruption		2008	"How-To" Guidance
Yemen Cash Transfer Targeting Assistance		2008	"How-To" Guidance
CDM (Clean Development Mechanism) TA for Yemen		2008	"How-To" Guidance
GAC Diagnostic Survey		ongoing	Institutional Development Plan
Yemen FIU Mentor		ongoing	"How-To" Guidance
Anti-Corruption		ongoing	"How-To" Guidance
Public Finance Management		ongoing	"How-To" Guidance
Inst Framework for Energy Efficiency		ongoing	Institutional Development Plan

Source: Republic of Yemen 2006 CAS and WB Business Warehouse Table ESW/TA 8.1.4 as of 12/04/2008.



#### Annex Table 3a: IEG Project Ratings for Republic of Yemen, FY06-09

Exit FY	Project Name	Total Evaluated (US\$M)	IEG Outcome	IEG Sustainability *	IEG ID Impact
2006	Southern Governorates Agriculture Privatization	20.1	Unsatisfactory	Likely	Modest
	Child Development	21.1	Unsatisfactory	Highly Unlikely	Negligible
	Second Social Fund For Development	76.2	Satisfactory	Likely	Substantial
2007	Basic Education Expansion Project	60.2	Satisfactory	#	#
	Rural Access Improvement Program	51.4	Satisfactory	#	#

Source: WB Business Warehouse Table 4a.5 and 4a.6 as of 12/05/08.

\* With IEG new methodology for evaluating projects, institutional development impact and sustainability are no longer rated separately.

#### Annex Table 3b: IEG Project Ratings for Republic of Yemen and Comparators, FY06-09

Region	Total Evaluated (\$M)	Total Evaluated (No)	Outcome % Sat (\$)	Outcome % Sat (No)	Inst Dev Impact % Subst (\$)	Inst Dev Impact % Subst (No)	Sustainability % Likely (\$)	Sustainability % Likely (No)
Republic of Yemen	229.1	5	82.0	60	33.3	20	51.3	60
MNA	1,985.5	36	92.4	75	53.3	38	86.3	67
World Bank	39,151.9	556	87.6	79	66.7	57	89.1	83

Source: WB Business Warehouse Table 4a.5 and 4a.6 as of 12/05/08.

Note: MNA and World Bank totals don't include values of Second Social Fund for Development as the system incorrectly considers this project as exited in FY05.



#### Annex Table 4: Portfolio Status for Republic of Yemen and Comparators, FY05-09

Fiscal year	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009
Yemen, Republic of					
# Proj	17	18	19	19	19
# Proj At Risk	1	1	2	0	2
% At Risk	5.9	5.6	10.5	0.0	10.5
Net Comm Amt	687.0	747.7	711.7	846.5	980.2
Comm At Risk	27.5	21.3	155.3	0.0	70.0
% Commit at Risk	4.0	2.8	21.8	0.0	7.1
Cameroon					
# Proj	7	9	8	10	10
# Proj At Risk	2	1	1	1	1
% At Risk	28.6	11.1	12.5	10.0	10.0
Net Comm Amt	192.6	249.1	247.6	345.9	345.9
Comm At Risk	77.7	56.4	18.2	18.2	18.2
% Commit at Risk	40.4	22.6	7.4	5.3	5.3
Nigeria					ι
# Proj	17	19	23	24	26
# Proj At Risk	7	8	7	9	11
% At Risk	41.2	42.1	30.4	37.5	42.3
Net Comm Amt	1503.1	1824.1	2574.1	2944.1	3584.1
Comm At Risk	643.3	480.5	420.1	789.4	1494.8
% Commit at Risk	42.8	26.3	16.3	26.8	41.7
Pakistan					
# Proj	14	17	18	20	20
# Proj At Risk	1	0	1	2	5
% At Risk	7.1	0.0	5.6	10.0	25.0
Net Comm Amt	966.8	1830.0	2034.8	2493.9	2484.5
Comm At Risk	61.1	0.0	102.9	164.0	592.6
% Commit at Risk	6.3	0.0	5.1	6.6	23.8
Senegal		-		-	
# Proj	15	15	17	16	15
# Proj At Risk	1	1	4	4	1
% At Risk	6.7	6.7	23.5	25.0	6.7
Net Comm Amt	632.2	631.4	731.7	701.7	590.2
Comm At Risk	45.0	20.0	166.0	171.0	46.0
% Commit at Risk	7.1	3.2	22.7	24.4	7.8
MNA					
# Proj	89	95	93	86	82
# Proj At Risk	12	6	16	11	15
% At Risk	13.5	6.3	17.2	12.8	18.3
Net Comm Amt	5365.3	6494.3	5860.8	6203.2	6633.8
Comm At Risk	419.9	211.3	1087.7	598.5	928.4
% Commit at Risk	7.8	3.3	18.6	9.6	14.0

Source: WB Business Warehouse Table 3a.4 as of 3/30/09.

IEG CASCR Review

Annex Table 5: IBRD/IDA Net Disbursements and Charges Summary Report for Republic of Yemen	ו (in US\$ million)	
--	---------------------	--

FY	Disb. Amt.	Repay Amt.	Net Amt.	Charges	Fees	Net Transfer
2004	93.12	25.10	68.02	11.56	1.27	55.19
2005	96.57	26.96	69.61	12.39	2.49	54.73
2006	147.87	28.41	119.46	12.43	1.80	105.22
2007	148.98	32.49	116.49	14.11	1.13	101.25
2008	111.85	37.29	74.56	7.33	8.68	58.54
Total (2004-08)	598.39	150.25	448.14	57.82	15.38	374.93

Source: WB Loan Kiosk, Net Disbursement and Charges Report as of 12/08/08.

IEG CASCR Review

Annex Table 6: Total Net Disbursements of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid, 2003-2007 (in US\$ million)

Donor	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2003-2007
Bilaterals						
Austria	0.04	0.04	0.02	0.04	0.03	0.17
Belgium	0.11	0.08	0.47	0.07	0.01	0.74
Canada	0.53	0.58	1.05	1.5	1.59	5.25
Denmark	0.06	0.81	2.65	2.47	3.59	9.58
Finland				0.01	0.01	0.02
France	4.08	3.67	6.25	6.1	5.83	25.93
Germany	32.96	35.83	41.81	41.4	60.81	212.81
Greece	0.04	0.08	0.08	0.05	0.06	0.3
Ireland		0.04		0.25	0.1	0.39
Italy	0.69	4.19	2.91	1.06	7.08	15.93
Japan	24.54	18.18	8.44	5.55	9.82	66.53
Netherlands	28.73	29.84	31.86	28.67	31.67	150.77
New Zealand		2010 1	0.09		•	0.09
Norway	0.31	0.43	0.45	0.26	0.08	1.53
Spain	8.6	2.63	0.12	0.20	0.15	1.0
Sweden	0.33	0.32	0.55	0.59	0.8	2.59
Switzerland	0.00	0.02	0.00	0.00	0.46	0.46
United Kingdom	 2.87		20.29	 15.03	25.31	76.16
United States	22.7	43.29	15.86	31.79	19.94	133.58
DAC Countries, Total	126.59	152.67	132.9	134.84	167.34	714.3
Czech Republic	0.34	0.27	0.32	0.92	1.36	3.2
	0.34	0.27	10.03			3.2 10.5
Hungary			24.1	 7.88	0.15	35.14
Korea	0.15	1.31			1.7	
Poland	0.05	0.06	0.02	0.01	0.03	0.13
Slovak Republic	0.02	0.01				0.0
Turkey	0.01	0.03	0.1	0.04	0.08	0.20
Arab Countries	-2.77	-2.04	-9.69	-8.62	-8.52	-31.64
Other Donor Countries, Total	0		0.03	0.25	0.31	0.5
Non-DAC Countries, Total	-2.19	0.01	24.91	0.48	-4.89	18.3
Multilaterals	-					
Arab Agencies.	0.85	10.8	12.4	11.11	2.02	37.18
EC	26.2	23.75	27.05	22.71	17.74	117.4
GEF	0.13	0.38	0.29	0.77	0.09	1.60
Global Fund	0.2	1.46	5.19	4.12	3.85	14.82
IDA	66.07	66.17	102.16	129.24	87.92	451.50
IFAD	2.07	2.73	2.66	1.07	3.88	12.4
IMF (SAF,ESAF,PRGF)	-12.32	-31.39	-44.31	-47.07	-73.01	-208.
UNAIDS			0.08	0.1	0.16	0.34
UNDP	4.63	5.51	5.83	4.17	4.03	24.1
UNFPA	2.24	2.07	1.98	1.93	1.33	9.5
UNHCR	2.95	2.42	3.04	3.69	1.07	13.1
UNICEF	3.5	3.56	5.33	5.18	5.72	23.2
UNTA	3.64	3.16	3.77	3.13	3.45	17.1
WFP	9.15	7.45	7.14	6.56	4.66	34.9
Multilateral Agencies, Total	109.31	98.07	132.61	146.71	62.91	549.6
All Dopore Total	233 71	250 75	200 42	282.03	225 36	1 282 2

All Donors, Total233.71250.75290.42282.03225.361,282.27Source: OECD DAC Online database, Table 2a. Destination of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid - Disbursements, as of 12/08/08.

	<b>CASCR Review</b>	Independent Evaluation Group
(		)
L	Ĭ	

Annexes 20

> and Comnarators 2000-2007 Annex Table 7: Economic and Social Indicators for Republic of Yerr

Annex lade /: Economic and Social Indicators for Redublic of Yemen and Comparators, 2000-200	cators for I		ot Yemen		nparators	. 2000-20	2								
				Yeme	e e				Yemen	Cameroon	Nigeria	Pakistan	lsgene2	ANM	World
Series Name	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007			Av	Average 2000-2007	200		
<b>Growth and Inflation</b> GDP growth (annual %) GDP per capita growth (annual %) GNI per capita, PPP (current international \$) GNI, Atlas method (current US\$) Inflation, consumer prices (annual %)	- 4.4 1.710 4.00 4.6	4.6 1.5 1,750 440 11.9	3.9 0.9 470 12.2	3.1 0.1 480 10.8	4.0 0.9 560 12.5	5.6 2.5 1,990 660 11.8	3.2 0.1 770 20.8	3.6 0.6 870	4.0 1.0 581 12.1	3.7 1.4 1,804 2.2	6.1 3.5 1,413 526 12.4	5.3 2.9 638 5.7	4.2 1.5 613 2.0	4.3 2.4 5,978 2,017	3.2 3.2 8,118 6,252
<b>Composition of GDP (%)</b> Agriculture, value added (% of GDP) Industry, value added (% of GDP) Services, etc., value added (% of GDP) Gross fixed capital formation (% of GDP) Gross fomestic savings (% of GDP)	- 10.3 46.5 18.6 25.2	11.5 41.6 46.9 20.9 20.0	11.1 40.1 20.5 20.2	14.3 40.3 45.4 23.1 20.9		: : : : :	: : : : :	: : : : :	11.8 42.1 46.1 20.8 21.6	20.9 31.7 17.9 18.7	37.1 39.0 23.8 :	22.4 25.4 17.0 15.9	16.7 23.9 59.4 10.3	12.4 40.1 23.1 25.6	3.4 28.0 68.5 20.9 21.3
<b>External Accounts</b> Exports of goods and services (% of GDP) Imports of goods and services (% of GDP) Current account balance (% of GDP) External debt, total (% of GNI) Total debt service (% of GNI) Total reserves in months of imports	42.3 36.6 14.2 57.4 8.3	36.7 38.7 7.1 58.5 3.0 10.2	38.9 40.3 5.4 1.9 11.1	38.0 41.4 54.2 1.8 10.8	:: 1.6 1.8 1.8 10.7		31.6 1.3 9.7		39.0 39.3 4.9 2.0 10.1	21.3 -3.7 -3.7 -4.1 1.7	43.0 32.2 11.5 55.5 7.1	15.1 -0.4 3.6 3.4 8.8	26.9 -6.2 -6.2 3.7 3.7	31.1 31.8 33.5 4.3	25.1 25.1 7.9
<b>Fiscal Accounts</b> <sup><i>n</i> <sup><i>z</i></sup> Revenue and Grants (% of GDP) Total Expenditure (and net lending, % of GDP)</sup>	- 37.8 31.7	33.3 30.5	30.2 30.8	31.1 35.3	32.0 34.2	35.0 36.8	36.4 35.6	::							

Annexes

21

	ł
f	١
e	
Ē.	
Ē	
હ	
2	
ğ	
З	ļ
Š	
ត	
S	
B	
ar	1
ğ	
5	I
2	
g	I
Ja	I
ē	I
e	l
2	ļ
0	I
i≓	I
đ	I
e	1
ñ	I
ē	I
Š	I
월	
<u>.</u>	ł
P	I
=	I
Cia.	I
Š	I
ğ	I
a	I
<u>ಲ</u> .	I
Ĕ	I
Ĕ	I
ы	۱
	I
e 7	I
ą	ŀ
Ę	I
ĕ	I
Ĩ	I
A	I
	l

						1000									
Overall Balance, commitments (% of GDP)	6.1	2.8	-0.6	-4.2	-2.2	-1.8	0.8	:							
Overall Balance, cash basis (% of GDP)	6.7	2.3	1.1	-4.7	-2.2	-1.8	0.8	:							
Public Sector Gross Debt (% of GDP)															
Social Indicators	,														
Health															
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	59.4	:	60.3	: -	:	61.7	62.2	:	60.9	50.3	46.8	64.5	62.0	68.8	67.6
months)	76.0	76.0	69.0	66.0	78.0	86.0	85.0	:	76.6	68.7	37.1	69.6	71.0	90.5	76.0
with access)	39.0	:	:	:	:	:	46.0	:	42.5	49.0	29.0	53.0	27.5	74.1	58.5
Improved water source (% of population with access)	70.0	:	:	:	:	:	66.0	:	68.0	66.5	48.0	89.0	74.5	89.0	84.3
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	81.0	:	:	:	:	76.0	75.0	:	77.3	87.3	101.9	80.6	62.3	36.8	51.8
Population															
Population, total (in million)	18.2	18.7	19.3	19.9	20.5	21.1	21.7	22.4	20.2	17.2	136.4	150.3	11.3	294.8	6345.2
Population growth (annual %)	2.9	3.0	2.97	2.98	2.98	2.97	2.97	2.95	2.97	2.24	2.46	2.33	2.62	1.83	1.23
Urban population (% of total)	26.3	26.8	27.34	27.86	28.38	28.90	29.48	30.06	28.14	52.96	45.08	34.42	41.32	56.29	48.09
Education															
School enrollment, preprimary (% gross)	0.6	0.6	0.7	0.8	0.8	0.9	1.0	:	0.8	15.8	13.5	51.9	5.0	19.4	37.4
School enrollment, primary (% gross)	74.3	<i>T.T</i>	79.9	83.0	85.8	87.3	87.3	:	82.2	102.7	93.5	76.8	73.7	101.0	102.4
School enrollment, secondary (% gross)	43.1	45.0	:	46.0	46.8	45.6	45.6	:	45.3	27.7	32.6	28.7	18.9	70.6	63.4
1/ IMF. Republic of Yemen: Article IV Consultations 2007, 2004.	s 2007, 2004.														

2/ 2006 data are preliminary.

Source: WB World Development Indicators (September 2008 update) for all indicators excluding those noted.

#### Annexes

## IEG CASCR Review Independent Evaluation Group

22

#### Annex Table 8: Republic of Yemen – Millennium Development Goals

Annex Table 8: Republic of Yemen – Millennium Development Goals	1990	1995	2000	2007
Goal 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger				
Employment to population ratio, 15+, total (%)	44	45	46	47
Employment to population ratio, ages 15-24, total (%)	32	31	32	32
Income share held by lowest 20%	6.1		7.4	7.2
Malnutrition prevalence, weight for age (% of children under 5)		47.6	•	
Poverty headcount ratio at national poverty line (% of population)	••	••	41.8	
Prevalence of undemourishment (% of population)	34	36		•1
Vulnerable employment, total (% of total employment)			31	
Goal 2: Achieve universal primary education				
Literacy rate, youth female (% of females ages 15-24)		35		
Literacy rate, youth male (% of males ages 15-24)		83		
Persistence to last grade of primary, total (% of cohort)			80	
Primary completion rate, total (% of relevant age group)			55	60
Total enrollment, primary (% net)			59	
Goal 3: Promote gender equality and empower women				
Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament (%)	4	1	1	0
Ratio of female to male enrollments in tertiary education			28	37
Ratio of female to male primary enrollment	35		63	74
Ratio of female to male secondary enrollment			42	49
Ratio of young literate females to males (% ages 15-24) Share of women employed in the nonagricultural sector (% of total nonagricultural		43	••	
employment)			7	
Goal 4: Reduce child mortality				
Immunization, measles (% of children ages 12-23 months)	69	46	71	80
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	98	89	81	75
Mortality rate, under-5 (per 1,000)	139	122	110	100
Goal 5: Improve maternal health			-	
Adolescent fertility rate (births per 1,000 women ages 15-19)		104	-90	73
Births attended by skilled health staff (% of total)	16	22		
Contraceptive prevalence (% of women ages 15-49)	10	21		
Matemal mortality ratio (modeled estimate, per 100,000 live births)				430
Pregnant women receiving prenatal care (%)	26	34	•	
Unmet need for contraception (% of married women ages 15-49)	••	. 39		
Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria, and other diseases				
Children with fever receiving antimalarial drugs (% of children under age 5 with fever)			•	
Condom use, population ages 15-24, female (% of females ages 15-24)				••
Condom use, population ages 15-24, male (% of males ages 15-24)			••	
Incidence of tuberculosis (per 100,000 people)	120	119	101	78
Prevalence of HIV, female (% ages 15-24)			• ••	
Prevalence of HIV, total (% of population ages 15-49)				
Tuberculosis cases detected under DOTS (%)	••	1	54	43
Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability				
Annual freshwater withdrawals, total (% of internal resources)			161.7	
CO2 emissions (kg per PPP \$ of GDP)	0.6	0.5	0.5	
CO2 emissions (metric tons per capita)	0.8	0.8	0.9	

Annexes 23

## IEG CASCR Review Independent Evaluation Group

\_

#### Annex Table 8: Republic of Yemen - Millennium Development Goals (continued)

Annex Table 6. Republic of Temen - Millennum Development Goals (continue	u)			
Forest area (% of land area)	1		1	1
Improved sanitation facilities (% of population with access)	28	34	39	46
Improved water source (% of population with access)		72	70	66
Marine protected areas, (% of surface area)				
Nationally protected areas (% of total land area)		*1		
Goal 8: Develop a global partnership for development				
Aid per capita (current US\$)	32	11	14	13
Debt service (PPG and IMF only, % of exports of G&S, excl. workers' remittances)	7.1	4.1	5	2.7
Internet users (per 100 people)	0	0	0.1	1.4
Mobile phone subscribers (per 100 people)	0	0.1	0.2	13.7
Telephone mainlines (per 100 people)	1	1.2	1.9	4.5
Other				
Fertility rate, total (births per woman)	8	7.1	6.3	5.6
GNI per capita, Atlas method (current US\$)	400	270	400	870
GNI, Atlas method (current US\$) (billions)	5.4	4.2	7.3	19.4
Gross capital formation (% of GDP)	14.6	21.9	19.5	
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	54	57	59	62
Literacy rate, adult total (% of people ages 15 and above)		37		
Population, total (millions)	12.3	15.5	18.2	22.4
Trade (% of GDP)	34.4	108.8	79	

Source: World Development Indicators database as of 12/08/08.



#### Annex Table 9: Summary of Achievements of the CAS Objectives - Pillar 1

	<u>RY CAS 06-09: Pillar 1</u> g growth through better governance and better delivery of public services	Actual Results (as of March 2009)	Comments
)bjectives	1. Improving the business regulatory environment.		
	2. Improving road and power infrastructure.		
	3. Improving skills through technical education and		
	vocational training and higher education.	1	
	4. Improving regulatory frameworks and making		
	appropriate public investments in key sectors.		
Major	1. Improving the business regulatory environment.		
Outcome	a. New Business Registration:		
Measures	Reduction of minimum capital requirements to	Yemen: 0% of GNI per capita in	Good progress.
	regional average. (from 2700% of per capita GDP)	2008	Source: Doing Business 2009.
	······································	MNA: 336% of GNI per capita in	
		2008	
	Reduction of time to register to less than 30 days	13 days in 2008.	Good progress.
	(from 63 days in 2006)		Source: Doing Business 2009.
	b. Tax Policy and Administration		
	Increase in revenues reported for tax purposes	Not available.	Not ratable.
	(from 52.16% in 2006 ICA)	, tot arailable.	CASCR reports 45%. Latest version of ICA
			(May 12, 2006) shows a 52.16%.
	c. Customs and inspections	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
	Increased efficiency: 4 days customs clearance.	8 days in 2008 (from 8 days in	No progress.
	moreased enviency. 4 days castorns clearance.	2006)	Source: Doing Business 2009.
		2000)	Source. Doing Duaineas 2009.
	Increased efficiency: 50% reduction in number of	Not available.	Not ratable.
	days of inspections (from 15.31 in 2006 ICA)	Not available.	Not lacable.
	d. Land titling and registration		
	20% increase in land registration capture rate	Not available.	Natratable
			Not ratable.
	20% decrease in land related court cases in two	Not available.	Not ratable.
	pilot cities		
	2. Improving road and power infrastructure.		
	a. Road Infrastructure	0.40.000	
	Reduced isolation for 250,000 persons in rural	240,000 persons in 2008	
	areas.		
	b. Power infrastructure		
	Higher customer satisfaction: Efficiency/Quality of	None	1
	supply reported as satisfactory by 80% of the		
	consumers. (from 49% in 2006)	]	
	O see likes the stars to be the second		
	Smaller fluctuations: Terminal voltage at <200	Not available.	1
	volts at only 5% of measured points. (from 3.5% in	1	
	2006)		handler and towards
	Ball and an art fall and f		baseline and targets.
	Reduced supply failures: Average no. of supply	None	No progress.
	failures/week reduced to 2. (from 10.5 in 2006)		Source: Power Sector Project PAD and ISR
			CAS Matrix refers to Power Project for
			baseline and targets.
	Improved electrifications rates for rural areas (from	20%	No progress
	20% in 2006)		
	Demonstrated use of renewable energy	None	No progress
	3. Improving skills through technical education and		
	vocational training and higher education.		
	a. Technical Education and Vocational Training		



#### Annex Table 9: Summary of Achievements of the CAS Objectives - Pillar 1 (continued)

Annex Tabl	e 9: Summary of Achievements of the CA	S Objectives – Pillar 1 (contin	uea)
	Employer-responsive training programs in public training institutes: Increase of at least 2.0 points in the overall employer's satisfaction rating of [x] on scale of 1-5 (No baseline)	Not available.	No progress CAS Matrix refers to Second Vocational Training Project for baseline and targets. The Credit effectiveness deadline has been extended to January 4, 2009 due to delays in the passing of the SDF Law.
	Strengthened private sector capacity to identify, finance and meet in-service training needs: Increase of at least 2.0 points in the overall employer's satisfaction rating of [x] on scale of 1-5 for pre-service, [x] for in-service (No baseline) b. Higher Education	Not available.	No progress CAS Matrix refers to Second Vocational Training Project for baseline and targets. The Credit effectiveness deadline has been extended to January 4, 2009 due to delays in the passing of the SDF Law.
	Higher education reform strategy developed with changes in finance, governance and quality assurance mechanisms fully articulated.	National Strategy for Higher Education approved and disseminated. Seven universities engaged in developing plans; two were completed. Plans not linked to program budgets.	Some progress.
	<ol> <li>Improving regulatory frameworks and making appropriate public investments in key sectors.</li> </ol>		
	a. Irrigated Agriculture		
	Increased productivity of irrigated agriculture in 90,000 hectares of spate irrigated lands:	Not available.	Not ratable. Source: IIP PAD and ISR. CAS Matrix refers to Irrigation Improvement Project for baseline and targets.
	b. Rainfed Agriculture and Livestock		
	Increased household revenues for supported rural families through cash or in kind benefits from agriculture & livestock	Not available.	Not ratable. CAS Matrix refers to RALD Project for baseline and targets. Baseline survey on household revenues through agriculture & livestock to be implemented in June 2009.
	c. Fisheries		
	No reduction in average fish weight for key species. [Baseline 2005: Cuttlefish (0.8 to 1.0 Kg), Rock lobster (250 to 300g.), Costal Shrimp (50 to 70 g.), Yellowfin tuna - inshore (12Kg), Yellowfin tuna - offshore (50Kg)]	No reduction (2008)	Good progress. Source: Fisheries Project PAD and ISR. CAS Matrix refers to Fisheries Project for baseline and targets.
	Increase over the baseline by 5% for domestic prices. (Baseline 2005: YR320/Kg for Cuttlefish; YR850/Kg for Rock Lobster)	Not available.	Not ratable. Source: Fisheries Project PAD and ISR. CAS Matrix refers to Fisheries Project for baseline and targets.
	Increase over the baseline 10% for average F.O.B export. (Baseline 2005: YR250 /Kg for Cuttlefish, Yr1100 for Shrimp and YR.130 for Fresh yellow fin tuna) d. Gas Sector	Not available.	Not ratable. Source: Fisheries Project PAD and ISR. CAS Matrix refers to Fisheries Project for baseline and targets.
	Improved legal and regulatory framework	Model production sharing contract revised, opening new acreage for exploration and production of gas. Licensing framework for investment in oil and gas reviewed.	Good progress.
	e. Urban Manufacturing Private sector commitment to developing at least on industrial estate	Not available.	Not ratable.
Ongoing pro	Southern Governorates Agriculture Privatization	Approved EV09 Closed EV06	IEG outcome rating: Unestinfectory
Ongoing pre		Approved FY98. Closed FY06.	IEG outcome rating: Unsatisfactory.
CAS 06-09	Irrigation Improvement	Approved FY01. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (12/19/2008).
IDA Support	Rural Access Improvement Program Higher Education	Approved FY01. Closed FY07. Approved FY02. Closed FY08.	IEG outcome rating: Satisfactory. Latest PDO rating: Moderately Unsatisfactory (06/28/2008). Project is a Learning and Innovation Loan.
1	Port Cities Development Program	Approved FY03. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (06/11/2008).
	Sana'a Basin Water Management	Approved FY03. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Moderately Satisfactory (07/31/2008).
	Groundwater & Soil Conservation Project	Approved FY04. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (06/02/2008).

#### Annex Table 9: Summary of Achievements of the CAS Objectives - Pillar 1 (continued)

New IDA Lending Support	Second Rural Access Improvement	Approved FY06. Active.	Quality at Entry Overall Rating: Moderately Satisfactory (09/12/2007). Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (12/09/2008).
	Fisheries Res. Mgt & Conservation	Approved FY06. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Moderately Unsatisfactory (03/02/2009).
	Power Sector	Approved FY06. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Moderately Unsatisfactory (01/21/2009).
	Rainfed Agriculture and Livestock	Approved FY07. Active.	Quality at Entry Overall Rating: Moderately Satisfactory (05/14/2007). Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (08/01/2008).
	Second Vocational Training Project	Approved FY07. Active.	Quality at Entry Overall Rating: Moderately Satisfactory (09/24/2007). Latest PDO rating: Moderately Satisfactory (11/09/2008).
	Institutional Reform Credit	Approved FY08. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (11/21/2008).
	Rural Energy Access	Slipped to FY09.	
	Port Cities APL Phase II	Slipped to FY10.	
	Groundwater & Soil Conserv. Add. Financing	Approved FY09. Active.	ISR not available for Supplements
Planned	Development Policy Review	Delivered FY06.	
AAA	Investment Climate Assessment	Delivered FY06.	
	Gas Sector Incentive Framework	Delivered FY07.	
	Transport Sector Policy Note	Slipped to FY09.	
	PRSP Support	Delivered.	
	Statistical Master Plan	Dropped.	
	Strategic Communications	Dropped.	
	Land Management & Urban Upgrading Pilots	Dropped.	
	Private Sector Support	Delivered.	
Additional	GCC Integration	Delivered FY08.	
AAA	Financial Sector Reform	Delivered FY08.	
	Land Tenure for Social and Economic Inclusion	Ongoing	
	Mineral Sector Review	Ongoing	
	Financial Sector Reform Strategy	Ongoing	
	Aden CDS for Local Economic Development	Delivered FY07.	· · ·
	Petroleum Governance TA	Delivered FY08.	
	CDM TA for Yemen	Delivered FY08.	
	Inst Framework for Energy Efficiency	Ongoing.	



#### Annex Table 9: Summary of Achievements of the CAS Objectives - Pillar 2

Improving hu	<u>RY CAS 06-09: Pillar 2</u> man development through more efficient service delivery and improved safety nets	Actual Results (as of March 2009)	Comments
<b>Objectives</b>	1. Improving access, equity and quality of basic education		
	2. Improving access and quality of health		
	3. Improving access and quarty of realth		
	4. Improving water supply and sanitation		
Malar			
<u>Major</u> Outcome	1. Improving access, equity and quality of basic education		
Measures	Increasing gross enrollment ratios to 84% (from	74% in 2007/08	Not ratable.
<u>measures</u>	87.3% gross primary enrollment in 2006)	74% 112007/06	(CASCR reports lack of reliability of baseline measures)
	Increasing ratio of girls to 45% of enrollments	41.8% in 2008	Some progress.
	Grade 9 female completion ratios increased to 50%	28.5%	Limited progress.
	2. Improving access and guality of health		
	% of fully immunized children 12-23 months	BCG =64 %; Measles =74%; Polio	Good progress.
	increased by 5% (from a baseline of 50%)	= 90.3%; Penta=90.6%	
	Contraceptive Prevalence Rate increased by 5%	Not available.	Not ratable. CAS Matrix refers to HRSP for baseline and
			targets.
	3. Improving safety net programs		
	Amount of resources transferred to lowest three income deciles and improved targeting categorization (69% of SFD resources, Impact Evaluation 2006)	Not available.	Not ratable. Source: Social Fund for Development III ISR (baseline).
	Strategic framework to address disability issues.	Not available.	Not ratable.
	4. Improving water supply and sanitation		
	Improving access to urban water supply and	56% in 2007 (about 3.6 million	Some progress.
	sanitation services by 20% [47% in 2002 (2.4 million people)]	people)	
	Access to improved water services increased from 68% to 73% in rural areas.	Not available.	Not ratable.
	Access to improved sanitation services increased from 20% to 30% in rural areas.	Not available.	Not ratable.
Ongoing pre	Child Development	Approved FY00. Closed FY06.	IEG outcome rating: Unsatisfactory.
CAS 06-09	Second Social Fund For Development	Approved FY00. Closed FY06.	IEG outcome rating: Satisfactory.
DA Support	Rural Water Supply & Sanitation	Approved FY01. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (06/19/2008).
	Rural Access Improvement Program	Approved FY01. Closed FY07.	IEG outcome rating: Satisfactory.
	Basic Education Expansion Project	Approved FY01. Closed FY07.	Quality of Supervision Overall Rating: Highly Satisfactory (09/28/2006). IEG outcome rating: Satisfactory.
	Health Reform Support Project (HRSP)	Approved FY02. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Moderately Satisfactory (06/21/2008).
	Higher Education	Approved FY02. Closed FY08.	Latest PDO rating: Moderately Unsatisfactory (06/28/2008). Project is a Learning and Innovation Loan.
	Urban Water Supply & Sanitation APL	Approved FY03. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Moderately Satisfactory (05/02/2008).
	Social Fund For Development III	Approved FY04. Active.	Quality of Supervision Overall Rating: Moderately Satisfactory (08/22/2006). Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (07/28/2008).
	Third Public Works	Approved FY04. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (06/03/2008)
	Basic Education Development Program	Approved FY05. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Moderately Satisfactory (07/09/2008).
<u>New IDA</u> Lending Support	Second Rural Access Improvement	Approved FY06. Active.	Quality at Entry Overall Rating: Moderately Satisfactory (09/12/2007). Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (12/09/2008)
	Second Vocational Training Project	Approved FY07. Active.	Quality at Entry Overall Rating: Moderately Satisfactory (09/24/2007). Latest PDO rating: Moderately Satisfactory (11/09/2008).
	Social Development	Dropped.	



#### Annex Table 9: Summary of Achievements of the CAS Objectives - Pillar 2 (continued)

	Urban Water Supply APL Phase II	Dropped.	Integrated in the FY09 Water Sector Support Project.
	Rural Energy Access	Slipped to FY09.	Project in pipeline.
	Girls Secondary Education	Approved FY08. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (06/30/2008).
	Yemen Population II	Slipped to FY10.	
	Social Fund for Development 3 (supplem.)	Approved FY07. Active.	ISR not available for Supplements
	Rural Water Supply Add. Financing	Approved FY08. Active.	ISR not available for Supplements
	Public Works III Add. Financing	Approved FY08. Active.	ISR not available for Supplements
Planned	Country Social Analysis	Delivered FY06.	
AAA	Development Policy Review	Delivered FY06.	
	Poverty Assessment	Delivered FY07.	
	Taiz Urban Poverty Analysis & Strategy	Delivered FY06.	
	Social Protection Strategy	Delivered FY07.	
	Qat Survey & Policy Note	Delivered FY07.	
	Overall Education Strategy	Dropped.	
	Transport Sector Policy Note	Slipped to FY09.	
	Gender Report	Dropped.	
•	Early Childhood Development Review	Dropped.	
	PRSP Support	Dropped.	
	Statistical Master Plan	Dropped.	
	Qat	Dropped.	
	Strategic Communications	Dropped.	
	Health Sector Review	Slipped to FY09.	
	Children & Youth Strategy	Delivered FY06, FY08.	· · · ·
Additional	Secondary Education	Delivered FY06.	
AAA	Social Protection Strategy (Phase II)	Delivered FY08.	
	Environmental Health	Delivered FY06.	
	Social Protection Workshop	Delivered FY06.	
	National Disability Study	Delivered FY07.	TA – Institutional Development Plan. Two reports were produced: "Recommendations fo the Development of a National Strategy on Disability" and "Living with Disability in Yemen a qualitative study"
	Yemen Health Sector Consultation & Dialogue	Delivered FY07.	
	Yemen Cash Transfer Targeting Assistance	Delivered FY08.	



Annexes

29

#### Annex Table 9: Summary of Achievements of the CAS Objectives - Pillar 3

	: Summary of Achievements of the CAS <u>RY CAS 06-09: Pillar 3</u> scal sustainability through Improved public expenditure management	Actual Results (as of March 2009)	Comments
<b>Objectives</b>	1. Improving revenue transparency		
	2. Improving expenditure management		
	3. Public sector reform	Ì	
	4. Improving public procurement		
	5. Improving public financial management		
lajor Outcome	1. Improving revenue transparency	Ì	
<u>Measures</u>	Publication of oil and gas revenue data in line with EITI requirements	Yemen formally joined the EITI in August 2007. National EITI council established and work plan for 2007-08 adopted.	Some progress. Source: Institutional Reform Credit ISR.
	2. Improving expenditure management		
	Medium-term expenditure framework consistent with PRSP	Some components of MTEF developed and consistent with DPPR	Some progress.
	Improved budget comprehensiveness and	Fairly comprehensive budget	Limited progress.
	transparency [B. Comprehensiveness and Transparency 5. Classification of the budget (C) 6. Comprehensiveness of information included in budget documentation (A) 7. Extent of unreported government operations (B+) 8. Transparency of Inter-Governmental Fiscal Relations (A) 9. Oversight of aggregate fiscal risk from other	process has evolved, with volumes of budget documentation presented to Parliament, including economic, functional, and administrative classification based on GFS/COFOG standards.	CAS Matrix refers to PEFA indicators. The 2008 PEFA Assessment covers the period FY 2004, FY 2005, FY 2006.
	public sector entities (C) 10. Public Access to key fiscal information (C)] Reduced subsidies in line with macro-economic	Subsidies increased to about 11	No progress.
	framework in PRSP.	percent of GDP	
	3. Public sector reform		
	Improved ability to manage human and financial resources through the development of a medium- term human resource strategy.	Implementation of an early retirement plan and definition of a national wage strategy.	Good progress.
	Net reduction of government employment by 5%.	Not available.	Not ratable.
	Improved service delivery in seven ministries measured through service delivery surveys	Not available.	Not ratable.
	Strengthened institution managing public sector reform process	MoCSI has hired its entire high- level staff using competitive and merit-based selection. Restructuring and reengineering of Civil Service Ministry nearing completion; reengineering diagnostics finalized in 4 pilot ministries	Some progress.
	Improved local administration planning capacity as measured by preparation of plans for 2007 and availability of administrative premises by 2007	Masterplans prepared in Taiz and Aden in 2006; in Hodeidah and Mukalla in 2007. 15 Local Council Buildings built in 2006-7; furnished and operational in 2008.	Good progress.
	4. Improving public procurement		
	Legally established and well functioning restructured and autonomous HTB	National Procurement Manual and Standard Bidding Documents adopted and being rolled out. HTB restructured.	Some progress.
	UNCITRAL type arbitration provisions adopted	Not available.	Not ratable.



30

#### Annex Table 9: Summary of Achievements of the CAS Objectives - Pillar 3 (continued)

	Public disclosure of procurement decisions and financial disclosure by procurement officials.	Disclosure Law passed by Parliament in July 2006; being implemented in phases; financial disclosures received from 5,237 persons out of 10,333.	Some progress.
	5. Improving public financial management		
	Account preparation and internal auditing	AFMIS system in place in four central government ministries; expansion into all central ministries underway.	Some progress
	Strengthening of Accountancy and Auditing Profession [C (iv) External Scrutiny and Audit 26. Scope, nature and follow-up of external audit (B+) 27. Legislative scrutiny of the annual budget law (C+) 28. Legislative scrutiny of external audit reports (D)]	Not available.	Not ratable. CAS Matrix refers to PEFA indicators. The 2008 PEFA Assessment covers the period FY 2004, FY 2005, FY 2006
Ongoing pre CAS 06-09 IDA Support	Civil Service Modernization	Approved FY00. Active.	Quality of Supervision Overall Rating: Moderately Satisfactory (10/12/2006). Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (09/23/2008).
······································	Taiz Municipal Development & Flood Protection	Approved FY02. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (06/29/2008).
	Port Cities Development Program	Approved FY03. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (06/11/2008).
	Urban Water Supply & Sanitation APL	Approved FY03. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Moderately Satisfactory (05/02/2008).
New IDA	Institutional Reform Credit	Approved FY08. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (11/21/2008).
Lending Support	Urban Water Supply APL Phase II	Dropped.	Integrated in the FY09 Water Sector Support Project.
	Port Cities APL Phase II	Slipped to FY10.	
	First Poverty Reduction Support Credit	Dropped.	
	Civil Service Modernization Supplemental	Approved FY08. Active.	ISR not available for Supplements
	Taiz Mun Dev Add. Financing	Approved FY08. Active.	ISR not available for Supplements
Planned AAA	Development Policy Review	Delivered FY06.	
	Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys	Delivered FY07.	
	Social Protection Strategy	Delivered FY07.	
	Public Expenditure Review	Slipped to FY10.	
	Country Procurement Assessment Review	Dropped.	
-	Country Financial Accountability Assessment	Dropped.	-
	PRSP Support	Delivered.	
	Statistical Master Plan	Dropped.	
	Strategic Communications	Dropped.	
	Procurement	Delivered.	
	PFM Action Plan	Delivered FY06, FY08.	
	EITI	Delivered.	
Additional AAA	Social Protection Strategy (Phase II)	Delivered FY08.	
	Social Protection Workshop	Delivered FY06.	
	Anti-Corruption	Delivered FY08.	
	PEFA Assessment	Delivered FY08.	
	GAC Diagnostic Survey	Ongoing.	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	Yemen FIU Mentor	Ongoing.	
	Anti-Corruption	Ongoing.	
	Public Finance Management	Ongoing.	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·



#### Annex Table 9: Summary of Achievements of the CAS Objectives - Pillar 4

<u>RY CAS 06-09: Pillar 4</u> Increasing resource sustainability through improved management of water resources and reduced population pressure		Actual Results (as of March 2009)	Comments	
Objectives	1. Improved water resource management			
	2. Improved control over population growth	İ		
Major Outcome	1. Improved water resource management		······································	
<u>Measures</u>	Increased number of water basin committee and community-level user associations participating in water conservation (0 in 2004)	50 in 2008	Good progress. Source: Sana'a Basin Water Management ISR. CAS Matrix indicates that baselines and targets to be computed during the CAS cycle through on-going lending activities.	
	Increased investment in irrigation improvement technologies in all basins	Irrigation modernization implemented under Bank- assisted projects has yielded groundwater savings of over 40 million cubic meters. More-crop- per-drop" on-farm technologies successfully implemented on 4,005 hectares in Tuban and Zabid; rehabilitation of spate irrigation and flood protection works completed in the two wadis, irrigating additional (average annual) 15,000 hectares.	Good progress CAS Matrix indicates that baselines and targets to be computed during the CAS cycle through on-going lending activities.	
	No injuries, deaths and damages to city residences and businesses in Taiz. (Baseline 2002: 6-10 casualties avg/yr; 129 demolished houses avg/yr; 165 damaged businesses avg/yr)	0 casualities in affected area; 0 demolished houses; 0 damaged/destroyed businesses within project area (2008)	Good progress Source: Taiz Mun. Dev. & Flood Prot. Project ISR. CAS Matrix refers to Taiz Mun. Dev. & Flood Protection Project for baseline and targets.	
	2. Improved control over population growth			
	Contraceptive Prevalence Rate increased by 5% (23.1% in 2003)	Not available.	Not ratable. CAS Matrix refers to HRSP for baseline and targets.	
	Share of girls in grade 10-12 enrollments increased to 37%	Not available.	Not ratable.	
Ongoing pre	Taiz Municipal Development & Flood Protection	Approved FY02. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (06/29/2008)	
CAS 06-09 IDA Support	Sana'a Basin Water Management	Approved FY03. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Moderately Satisfactory (07/31/2008).	
	Groundwater & Soil Conservation Project	Approved FY04. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (06/02/2008)	
<u>New IDA</u> Lending Support	Rainfed Agriculture and Livestock	Approved FY07. Active.	Quality at Entry Overall Rating: Moderately Satisfactory (05/14/2007). Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (08/01/2008)	
	Girls Secondary Education	Approved FY08. Active.	Latest PDO rating: Satisfactory (06/30/2008)	
	Yemen Population II	Slipped to FY10.		
	First Poverty Reduction Support Credit	Dropped.		
	Taiz Mun Dev Add. Financing	Approved FY08. Active.	ISR not available for Supplements	
	Groundwater & Soil Conserv. Add. Financing	Approved FY09. Active.	ISR not available for Supplements	
	Water Sector Support	Approved FY09. Active.		
	Flood Protection & Emergency Reconstruction	Approved FY09. Active.		
Planned AAA	Development Policy Review	Delivered FY06.		
	Qat Survey & Policy Note	Delivered FY07.		
	PRSP Support	Dropped.		
	Statistical Master Plan	Dropped.		
	Qat	Dropped.		
	Strategic Communications	Dropped.	1	
	National Water Strategy	Delivered FY06, FY07.		
	Environment	Dropped.	J	



Annexes

32

#### Annex Table 10: List of People Met

Government		
Jalal Omar Yaqoub	Deputy Minister, External Financial Relations Ministry of Finance	
Ahmed Abdulrahman Al-Samawi	Governor, Central Bank of Yemen	
Abdulla M. Al-Thary	Deputy Chairman, National Water Resources Authority, Ministry of Water and Environment	
Abdui-Muamen Mutahar	Chair, Public Electricity Corporation Ministry of Electricity & Energy	
Abdussalam Al-janad	Manager of the Renewable Energy Department, Public Electricity Corporation Ministry of Electricity & Energy	
Anis Nasser Assamawi	Chairman, Road Maintenance Fund Ministry of Public Works and Highways	
Abdul Wahab Yahya Al-Hakem	Deputy Minister Roads Sector Ministry of Public Works and Highways	
Nabila H. As-Serri	General Director, Road Maintenance Fund Ministry of Public Works and Highways	
Hakim Aghbari	Program Director, Central Management Office of Rural Access Program Ministry of Public Works and Highways	
Ibrahim Omar Hugari	Minister of Technical Education & Vocational Training	
	Deputy Minister for Planning & Projects Sector	
Mohamed Awadh Bin Rabiah	Ministry of Technical Education & Vocational Training	
H.E. Abdulkarim Al-Arhabi	Deputy Prime Minister Ministry of Planning and International Cooperation	
Adbulmalik Althawr	Deputy Minister of Agricultural Production Development Sector Ministry of Agriculture & Irrigation	
Jamil A. Albadani	General Director of General Relation & International Cooperation Ministry of Agriculture & Irrigation	
Mohammed Y. Al-Ghashm	Deputy Minister Agricultural Services Sector Ministry of Agriculture & Irrigation	
Ebtihag A. Al-Kamal	Deputy Minister for Standards and Quality Ministry of Technical Education & Vocational Training	
Kaid A. Al-Darwish	Project Director, Second Vocational Training Project PIU Ministry of Technical Education & Vocational Training	-
Khaled Mohamed Saeed	General Manager, General Directorate for Agriculture & Fisheries Ministry of Planning & Development	
Nafisa Al-Jaifi	General Secretary The Higher Council for Motherhood & Childhood – Presidency of Council of Ministers	
Mohammed Saleh Shamlan	Minister of Fish Wealth	
Nabil A. Shamsan	Vice Minister and Director of Civil Service Modernization Project Ministry of Civil Service (MOCSAI)	
<u>Academia</u> Husnia A. Al-Kadri	Director, Gender-Development Research & Studies Center – Sana'a University	
<u>Embassies</u> Michele Cervone D'Urso	Chargé d'Affaires a.i., Delegation of the European Union	
<u>World Bank - Yemen</u> Benson Ateng Samra Shaibani	Country Manager, World Bank Sana'a Senior Communication Office, Country Team in Sana'a	
<u>World Bank - Washington</u> Xavier Devictor Fabrice Houdart	Country Program Coordinator Operations Analyst	