



1. Project Data:		Date Posted : 08/20/2001	
PROJ ID: P007479		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name: Jm- Reform Of Secondary	Project Costs (US\$M)	40.7	37.9
Country: Jamaica	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	32	29
Sector(s): Board: ED - Secondary education (70%), Central government administration (18%), Tertiary education (12%)	Cofinancing (US\$M)	2.7	2.6
L/C Number: L3580			
	Board Approval (FY)		93
Partners involved : Netherlands	Closing Date	12/31/2000	12/31/2000
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group:
Helen Abadzi	Roy Gilbert	Alain A. Barbu	OEDST
2. Project Objectives and Components			
a. Objectives			
The Reform of Secondary Education (ROSE) project objectives were to:			
1. Improve the quality, efficiency and equity of lower secondary education (grades 7-9) with particular emphasis on the schools serving the poorest students .			
2. Strengthen the capacity of the Ministry of Education and Culture (MOEYC) to plan and monitor the impact of the reform through improved evaluation and management systems .			
3. Strengthen the Government's capacity to undertake sophisticated social policy analysis and use the results in formulating more effective and targeted social programs .			
b. Components			
The total project cost of \$37.9 million comprised:			
1. Secondary Reform Support (81%) - (a) introduction of a common curriculum for grades 7-9; (b) training of teachers and administrators; (c) textbooks; (d) educational support materials; (e) building improvements and new construction; (f) studies and pilots for improving upper-secondary education (grades 10-13.)			
2. Evaluation and Management Strengthening (12%) - (a) rationalization of the examination system by developing a new Grade 9 Test; (b) establishing a ROSE team in the MOEYC (not a PIU); (c) public awareness campaigns; (d) developing an evaluation system to measure project impact on student achievement; (e) Preparing a second five year phase of reform.			
3. Social Policy Analysis or SPA (7%) - (a) establishing a Social Policy Analysis Unit; (b) in service training in research methodology and policy analysis; (c) upgrading of University of West Indies training in policy analysis and establishment of a Databank; (c) support to the Statistical Institute of Jamaica to implement the Survey of Living Conditions (SLC.)			
The SPA component was funded by the Government of the Netherlands and Government of Jamaica - the operational staff's role was purely administrative . For evaluation purposes this component should be treated as if it were a separate project. SPA performance is of marginal importance in assessing the ROSE project which primarily comprises components 1 and 2. The 7% of costs accounted for by SPA and its objective have been included for consistency with other OED and Bank databases .			
c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates			
Infrastructure costs were 60% of components 1 and 2 compared to an SAR targets of 53%.			
3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:			
Project objectives, as expressed in the SAR, are considered substantially achieved .			
1. The reform was substantially implemented, but qualitative improvements are mixed .			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> While ICR Table 1 shows an increase in the share of the poorest quintile enrolled in the elite secondary high category, it also shows no change in the share attending technical high . Among the upper quintile, the share attending both types of higher quality schools increased . Outcomes as measured by academic achievement are unclear . The positive evidence of improved quality was 			

that: (a) for the maths and language exams of the JHSC (Junior High School Certificate) the "percentage correct" did not decrease despite an increase in enrollment; and (b) the decline in percentage correct in 1999 was due to increasing difficulty of the test while equated scores were stable .

- According to one study, teacher training and teacher attitude had no statistically significant impact on student performance, once prior achievement was introduced as a control . Seemingly acknowledging lack of efficacy, the ICR concludes "these analyses showed that raising the overall academic achievement and reducing the variability of learning outcomes remain the most important challenge for ROSE II ."
- Targets for instructional materials, textbooks, and infrastructure improvements were achieved but, with the significant shortcomings of poor quality and inadequate cost control . The support for preparation of Phase II of ROE was successful .

2. Achievement of the second objective was mixed :

- Institutional capacity was strengthened but there were significant problems with project record -keeping and accounting, contract writing and procurement .
- The achievements rest on (a) strengthened capacity through organizational improvements (a non-PIU approach steered by a Reform Management Committee has been established); and (b) the improved performance of a Student Assessment Unit and introduction of a new "progressive" curriculum for grades 7-9. The SAR makes clear that objective 2 included the development of a "reliable measure of learning output for policy analysis" but this was not achieved .

3. Satisfactorily achieved - discussions of poverty now rely on data from the Jamaica SLC and the need for further improvements in analytical capacity has been recognized .

4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:

1. Adopting a management approach based on existing institutions and the oversight of a Reform Management Team gained strong institutional support .
2. The project contributed significantly to developing technical capacity for curriculum development, planning and student assessment .
3. The use of the SLC poverty analysis is an important achievement and the culmination of 14 years of effort which has in the past been supported directly by the Bank .
The government, with Bank support, has continued its commitment to reform .

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):

1. The implementation working paper contained indicators but no targets were set, the indicators were not used, and the extent to which objectives were met could not be clearly evaluated .
2. There is no consensus on whether the ROSE methodology is conducive to high performance on the CXC (Caribbean Examination Council) exam, and whether this matters or not .
3. Scores on the Mathematics and Language Arts are persistently low .
4. Civil works were expensive and of questionable quality .

6. Ratings:	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Institutional Dev .:	Substantial	Substantial	
Sustainability:	Highly Likely	Likely	More likely than unlikely overall but more time will be needed to ascertain whether the modest achievements are robust and how sustainable they will be .
Bank Performance:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Good identification and preparation while supervision did improve in the latter part of the project. The Borrower commented that "The monitoring by the World Bank was rigorous and demanding."
Borrower Perf .:	Satisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Goals were unrealistic and Government did not follow through on commitments in a sufficiently strong and timely manner .
Quality of ICR:		Unsatisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

Lessons were difficult to elucidate given the inconclusive evidence to date .

8. Assessment Recommended? ● Yes ○ No

Why? Could be clustered with another Caribbean education project in Barbados to provide a comparative analysis of different approaches in small open island economies with significant structural adjustment problems .

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

Unsatisfactory::

- The ICR has insufficient background information and cannot be understood without a parallel reading of the SAR. This substantially reduces its utility. It should be a stand-alone document.
- While lots of data from the project are mobilized to examine the ROSE project component outcomes, the data are not used appropriately. Often data are presented for a single period -- 1999 -- from which one cannot infer trends in the critical outcome variables. No evidence is presented on the change in gap in enrollment between the rich and poor over the life of the project, a measure of equity impact. No evidence is presented on the change in repetition and retention rates that are indicators of efficiency. The results on achievement test trends as presented cannot be interpreted in terms of program impact or changes in outcomes associated with the project. Unlike other projects, this one had lots of data to work with, and improving the capacity of Jamaica to monitor the impact of ROSE was a main objective. Thus, it is very disappointing that the available data were not used appropriately to shed light on project outcomes in the ICR.
- The quality of the ICR on the SPA component is satisfactory.