

Date Posted : 09/03/2003				
		Appraisal	Actual	
Supply And	Project Costs (US\$M)	12.7	21.2	
	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	10	10	
Water supply national administration ation (6%), ernment on (3%)	Cofinancing (US\$M)			
	Board Approval (FY)		98	
an), CFD ECF (Japan)	Closing Date	12/31/2001	12/31/2002	
		0		
	Supply And Water supply national administration ition (6%), ernment on (3%)	Date Posted : Supply And Project Costs (US\$M) Loan/Credit (US\$M) • Water supply national administration ition (6%), ernment on (3%) Board Approval (FY) Board Approval (FY) an), CFD ECF (Japan)	Date Posted : 09/03/2003 Appraisal Supply And Project Costs (US\$M) 12.7 Loan/Credit (US\$M) 10 Water supply national administration (tion (6%), ernment on (3%) Cofinancing (US\$M) Board Approval (FY) Board Approval (FY) Colosing Date 12/31/2001	

2. Project Objectives and Components

Ronald S. Parker

a. Objectives

Kavita Mathur

The objective of the project was to improve the access to safe drinking water for rural populations in order to: (i) improve the health and productivity of rural population, particularly children who have poor access to safe water; and (ii) reduce the burden for girls who are traditionally involved in fetching water over long distances.

Alain A. Barbu

OEDST

b. Components

The project had four components.

- Rural Water Supply (RWS) This component consisted of construction and rehabilitation of water supply facilities. The General Directorate of Hydraulics (DGH) was to implement the project in communities, villages and groups of villages with populations from about 250 to 3,500 people. The National Potable Water Authority (ONEP) was to focus on larger rural centers and villages located near existing ONEP regional water pipelines.
- Rural Sanitation This component consisted of construction of household latrines, block latrines for schools, small-bore sewerage systems collection and communal septic tanks, as well as lagoon type wastewater treatment facilities.
- 3. Local Institutional Strengthening This component included the creation, training and operation of Mobile Participation Teams (MPT), responsible for implementation of the participatory, demand-responsive approach and hygiene education.
- 4. Central and Provincial Support This consisted of technical back-stopping, monitoring and evaluation for decentralized project implementation.

c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates

For the first phase of the project, the total project costs were estimated at US\$ 57 million (including parallel financing of US\$ 35 million) and the loan amount was US\$ 10 million. The total project cost in the provinces covered by the Bank at appraisal, was US\$ 12.7 million. The actual project cost is US\$ 21.2 million. The Bank loan was fully disbursed in May 2002 and closed in December 2002 after a one-year extension.

3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:

The ICR describes the project outcome relating *only* to the Bank financed portion of the project as the projects financed by the German, Japanese and French have not been completed. Of the 27 priority provinces identified at appraisal, 6 were financed by the Bank. OED ratings for this project are based on the achievement of the objectives

(Section 2a) by the Bank financed portion of the loan.

The objective of improving the access to potable water was achieved. In the six provinces supported by the Bank, the project increased the access to potable water for about 304,000 people by constructing or rehabilitating 284 RWS systems. This is more than twice the appraisal targets, namely 134,000 people and 144 RWS systems. Access rates have increased to 50%. A total of 9,614 household latrines and 24 block latrines were constructed under the project thereby providing improved access to sanitation. These figures are slightly higher than the appraisal targets (8,900 household latrines and 4 block latrines).

The objective of improving health and productivity was achieved. Reported cases of diarrhea among young children in rural areas went down by 24% from 1995 to 2000. No cases of cholera were reported in recent years and the incidence of other waterborne diseases (typhoid, viral hepatitis) has dropped significantly. This can be partly attributed to improved access to potable water and sanitation.

The objective to reduce the burden for girls who are traditionally involved in fetching water over long distances was achieved. Time spent fetching water by women and young girls was reduced by 50% to 90%. Primary school attendance in the six provinces financed by the Bank went up from an average of 42% in 1997/98 to 58% in 2001/02. Specifically for girls, it went up from 30% to 51%. Increase in schooling, particularly of girls, can be attributed, at least in part to the fact that girls are spending less time fetching water.

4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:

The project introduced a new demand driven, community-based participatory approach for the provision of rural water supply and sanitation services. Water User Associations (WUA) were created to take the responsibility for Operations and Maintenance (O&M) and to improve cost recovery in RWS sector.

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):

- The capacity of WUAs is weak in some areas especially where public fountains were provided. This is also due to inadequate training for the operation and maintenance of RWS systems. SMTs concentrated on getting construction underway, and provided little support to WUA once the schemes were operational.
- One reason for the weak WUAs is that SMTs are themselves poorly trained in O&M, and financial management.
- Only one SMT out of six had successfully retained a female member (only for about two years as long as United Nations Development Program (UNDP) grant funds were available). Therefore, there was little direct participation of women in project design and management.
- Collaboration with the Ministry of Public Health (MOH) was weak and activities under its responsibility (monitoring of water quality and sanitary conditions of water points and hygiene education) were only partially undertaken.
- The initial full quality control of the water resource (i.e. bacteriological, physical and chemical analyses) was not always carried out.
- The eligibility criteria for individual house connections (HC) were not always enforced. In some cases, when extensions for HC were left to the beneficiaries, the development of the distribution system was often chaotic and inefficient.

6. Ratings:	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome:	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	[The ICR's 4-point scale does not allow for a Moderately Satisfactory rating]. OED rates a project as moderately satisfactory when it is expected to achieve most of its relevant objectives but with significant shortcomings. The shortcomings listed under 5 are consistent with this rating.
Institutional Dev .:	Substantial	Substantial	
Sustainability :	Likely	Likely	The sustainability of house connections is likely. However, the sustainability of stand pipes is uncertain as the capacity of

			some WUA's for O&M of public standpipes is weak. As 50% of the schemes constructed or rehabilitated are equipped with house connections, the overall sustainability is rated likely.
Bank Performance :	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Borrower Perf .:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Quality of ICR :		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

- 1. Projects cofinanced and even parallel financed by multiple donors require exceptional donor coordination during appraisal to ensure that the various players will be on the same schedule. Of course, coordination efforts are required throughout implementation to ensure a successful outcome for the project and that all communities are treated in a similar manner.
- 2. Beneficiary participation in O&M of RWS schemes is possible provided that: (i) the system is simple to operate and maintain (simple technology covering a limited number of people and villages), and (ii) the WUA/local organizations receive sufficient training and support during the operational phase until they are capable of managing the scheme both technically and financially. This approach requires that the government be committed to invest a significant amount of resources in social capital building, i.e. SMT should be created in adequate numbers; have adequate participation by women, well trained in both social mobilization, O&M of the schemes including financial management, sanitation and hygiene education; and provided with sufficient means to operate (vehicle, per diem etc.).
- 3. Different water supply technologies and management models need to be considered according to local conditions. The approach successfully adopted under the project based on a local source of groundwater and a simple RWS system serving and managed by a WUA is reaching its limits. This model is appropriate for small communities, with an easily accessible water resource, and where social cohesion is strong. Where easily accessible groundwater is scarce, more complex RWS systems and multi-village management models will need to be considered.
- 4. The Bank needs to move beyond the first step of mandatory representation of women (i.e. in the SMT and WUA) and include more systematic gender awareness and women's leadership training programs to raise the voices of women.

8. Assessment Recommended? • Yes 🔿 No

Why? To assess the overall project outcome once all the works financed by all of the parallel financiers are completed.

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The overall quality of the ICR is satisfactory. It covers all the relevant and important issues pertaining to the Bank financed/managed components of the project given the data available (the Bank had little information on the actual costs and outcome of the project components parallel-financed by other donors). The ICR did not adequately address the sustainability aspects of the rural water schemes.