



<b>1. Project Data:</b>		<b>Date Posted :</b> 06/12/2002	
<b>PROJ ID:</b> P002889		<b>Appraisal</b>	<b>Actual</b>
<b>Project Name:</b> Education Rehabilitation Project	<b>Project Costs (US\$M)</b>	46.63	19.65
<b>Country:</b> Togo	<b>Loan/Credit (US\$M)</b>	36.6	19.65
<b>Sector(s):</b> Board: ED - Central government administration (29%), Sub-national government administration (29%), Primary education (21%), Tertiary education (21%)	<b>Cofinancing (US\$M)</b>		
<b>L/C Number:</b> C2752; CP752			
	<b>Board Approval (FY)</b>		95
<b>Partners involved :</b>	<b>Closing Date</b>	06/30/2001	06/30/2001

<b>Prepared by :</b>	<b>Reviewed by :</b>	<b>Group Manager :</b>	<b>Group:</b>
Lenor Armstrong	Timothy A. Johnston	Alain A. Barbu	OEDST

**2. Project Objectives and Components**

**a. Objectives**

The Project sought to halt degradation in educational services, and strengthen institutional capacity by: (a) improving the quality of schools through school construction and rehabilitation, textbook provision, and the introduction of a school-based innovation in teaching and learning processes; and (b) developing better education system management, through decentralized recruitment and financing of teachers and development of system management tools.

**b. Components**

The two components were: (a) improvement of school quality, comprising (i) school construction and rehabilitation, (ii) textbook provision, and (iii) quality schools initiative (action research, small grants and in-service teacher training; and (b) better education management comprising (i) the Decentralized Recruitment of Auxiliary Teachers and the Education Support Fund, (ii) information and communication systems, (iii) budgetary programming and monitoring, and (iii) consolidation of the ministerial restructuring. In 2000, an HIV/AIDS awareness and prevention component was added.

**c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates**

At the close of the project, only 63% of the funds were disbursed. In general, the costs were in accordance with estimates; however, the textbook component cost twice as much as allocated, due to increased enrollment as well as the need to provide each of the 80 additional lower secondary schools and teachers with complete sets of texts.

**3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:**

The project failed to achieve its major objectives. Some of the major emergency activities, primarily school construction and provision of textbooks were accomplished, albeit with shortcomings. Poor project design and quality of entry issues have contributed to the unsatisfactory outcome. Suspension of disbursements (November 2000- August 2001) resulted in the cancellation of activities underway or about to be started. These included additional school rehabilitation and research into factors affecting girls schooling.

**4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:**

New classrooms constructed (435) exceeded the target of 360, and the total number of primary teachers recruited was double the original target, thus giving rise to a net increase of 238,000 primary students over the period 1995-2000. The project helped developed a Plan of Action for HIV Aids Awareness, and sponsored an HIV awareness workshop among stakeholders in the education sector.

**5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):**

Both new construction and rehabilitation works were severely deficient. Furthermore, rehabilitation completed was 50% of target and the rehabilitation manual was never finalized. The four-year delay in delivery of primary school books and teacher guides meant that these had little or no impact during the project period. Secondary schools did not receive the correct quantities of books. More than half of the books did not reflect the curriculum, and teachers were not trained in their use. There was no provision for appropriate storage, or establishment of procedures for inventory control, thus leading to loss of books. Moreover, the financial management of the book rental system was inadequate resulting in a loss of credibility for the program, and an inadequate supply of textbooks to maintain the system. The action research and small grants program were not implemented due to a lack of clarity in concept and design, and the in-service teacher training program that was to be based on the findings of the action research as well as use of the new textbooks was not implemented. Auxiliary teachers neither received preservice nor in-service training. The fund for financing

teachers' salaries was inefficiently managed, giving rise to a lack of transparency and lack of viability. The information technology system was not put in place and little was achieved in the areas of school mapping and education statistics. Ministerial re-structuring was not effected. The hiring of 8,600 auxiliary teachers at salaries higher than estimated has resulted in an unsustainable increase in salary expenditure. As a result of IDA intervention, was an agreement that community schools pilot the recruitment and payment of auxiliary teachers. This HIV/AIDS Plan of Action was not implemented due to the Credit suspension and subsequent project closure.

6. Ratings :	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
<b>Outcome :</b>	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	
<b>Institutional Dev .:</b>	Negligible	Negligible	
<b>Sustainability :</b>	Unlikely	Unlikely	
<b>Bank Performance :</b>	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	
<b>Borrower Perf .:</b>	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	
<b>Quality of ICR :</b>		Satisfactory	

**NOTE:** ICR rating values flagged with '\*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

#### 7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

- Implementation support should be in accord with the capacity of the borrower. Project design linked institutional reform components with emergency measures, putting undue strain on already weak institutions. The implementation of emergency measures required concerted and focused effort and resources, and by its nature was accorded priority, thus few resources were available for the enormous task of institutional capacity building
- Sound financial management capacity with proper internal controls is an imperative for projects which involve the collection and allocation of funds ( school fees, book rental fees, community contributions).
- It is difficult to implement decentralization measures in a technical ministry in the absence of such policy for the entire civil service.
- Parent and community support must be based on an assessment of capacity rather than an assumption.
- Where there is weak capacity among small contractors and work supervisors at the national level, technical support should be provided in order to improve the quality of work and more timely delivery.

8. Assessment Recommended?  Yes  No

#### 9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The ICR text provides a fairly good overview of implementation issues; however, it might have been improved through the provision of more detailed information on outcomes in relation to targets, and plans for the operational phase. In commenting on the ICR, the Borrower expressed concern that the ICR was based on a desk review only, and argued that the project's accomplishments were more positive than suggested in the ICR. Finally, there are discrepancies between project costs shown in the annex and the text, and inaccuracies with respect to total project financing.