

# Kingdom of Morocco

## Improving Service Delivery for Social Protection TA (P157495)

### Completion Report

June 2017

GSP05  
MIDDLE EAST AND NORTH AFRICA



**June 15, 2017**

**Standard Disclaimer:**

This volume is a product of the staff of the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/ The World Bank. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this paper do not necessarily reflect the views of the Executive Directors of the World Bank or the governments they represent. The World Bank does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this work. The boundaries, colors, denominations, and other information shown on any map in this work do not imply any judgment on the part of the World Bank concerning the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

**Copyright Statement:**

The material in this publication is copyrighted. Copying and/or transmitting portions or all of this work without permission may be a violation of applicable law. The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/ The World Bank encourages dissemination of its work and will normally grant permission to reproduce portions of the work promptly.

For permission to photocopy or reprint any part of this work, please send a request with complete information to the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA, telephone 978-750-8400, fax 978-750-4470, <http://www.copyright.com/>.

All other queries on rights and licenses, including subsidiary rights, should be addressed to the Office of the Publisher, The World Bank, 1818 H Street NW, Washington, DC 20433, USA, fax 202-522-2422, e-mail [pubrights@worldbank.org](mailto:pubrights@worldbank.org).

## List of Acronyms

CCT	Conditional Cash Transfer
CNIE	National Identity ID Card ( <i>Carte Nationale d'Identité Electronique</i> )
CNSS	National Social Security Fund ( <i>Caisse Nationale de Sécurité Sociale</i> )
DNCR	Digitalization of the National Civil Registry
ENCDM	National Household Consumption Expenditure Survey ( <i>Enquête Nationale sur la consommation et dépenses des ménages</i> )
EXT	External Affairs
HCP	High Planning Committee
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
ILO	International Labor Organization
INDH	National Initiative for Human Development ( <i>Initiative nationale pour le développement humain</i> )
ITSP	Identity and Targeting for Social Protection
MAGG	Ministry of General Affairs and Governance ( <i>Ministère des Affaires Générales et de la Gouvernance</i> )
MNEVT	Ministry of National Education and Vocational Training
NPR	National Population Registry
ONDH	National Observatory for Human Development
PMT	Proxy Means Testing
POM	Project Operational Manual
RAMED	Medical Assistance Regime ( <i>Régime d'Assistance Médicale</i> )
SP TA	Social Protection Technical Assistance
SR	Social Registry
SSN	Social Safety Net
TOR	Terms of Reference
UIN	Unique Identifying Number
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund

**MOROCCO: Programmatic Technical Assistance Package  
Improving Service Delivery for Social Protection in Morocco (P157495)**

**Completion report**

**June 2017**

1. This completion report summarizes the activities conducted in FY16/FY17 under the programmatic Improving Service Delivery for Social Protection technical assistance (SP-TA). The SP-TA program mainly benefited the Ministries of Interior, General Affairs and Governance (MAGG), Health, High Planning Committee (HCP) and Education in Morocco. The main objective of the TA was to support the Government of Morocco in the preparation of the Identity and Targeting for Social Protection (ITSP) Project (P155198) and to continue the policy dialogue in the areas of social protection reform. The ITSP Project aims to support the government of Morocco to develop information systems to better assess the identity of residents and wellbeing of households, to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of social protection programs. This objective is envisioned to be achieved through the establishment of: (i) a National Population Register (NPR) with a Unique Identifying Number (UIN); and (ii) a Social Register (SR).
2. The activities financed under this task have served to better prepare the components of the operation, with a main focus on assessing the feasibility of developing the NPR and SR systems, as well as assessing current targeting practices and developing a better targeting tool to be embedded in the SR.
3. The dialog and activities completed under the SP-TA prompted the Government of Morocco to request the ITSP Project, which was approved by the Board on March 2017, and is expected to become effective in 2017.

**I. CONTEXT**

4. The current system of social service delivery in Morocco remains largely fragmented, which translates into burdensome and redundant administrative processes that citizens have to endure in order to benefit from existing programs. In the case of social safety nets (SSNs) in particular, Morocco has introduced over the years a multitude of different social programs implemented by several sector ministries and agencies. A recent report by the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) quote about 140 such programs. Coordination across institutions remains very scarce, the mandates of institutions usually overlap, different public institutions and agencies provide similar programs, and collaboration between programs at central and local level remains limited. The costs of such fragmentation can be compensated by robust management information systems that help identify existing and potential beneficiaries and allow connections between different public programs. In the case of Morocco, such bridges are nonexistent, which limits coordination, depletes limited fiscal resources, and undermines the effectiveness of Government action to reduce poverty and foster social inclusion.
5. Improving the effectiveness of social service delivery, and especially of SSNs, requires a revision of the methods used to identify the population eligible to benefit from existing programs. Morocco has introduced three flagship social programs targeted to the poorest segments of the population in recent years such as RAMED, Tayssir Conditional Cash Transfer (CCT) and DAAM. While these programs are intended to reach the poor, simulations have indicated that a significant share of resources reaches non poor households and many poor households are excluded from these programs. Current deficiencies in program targeting, and thus in allocating resources to the poorest segments of the population, are largely due to the

fact that most SSN programs in Morocco, including the Tayssir CCT program, are targeted geographically to the so-called National Initiative for Human Development (INDH) communities (403 communities nationwide). These communities have been identified, mainly, using poverty maps produced by the HCP in 2007 (i.e. communities displaying poverty rates above 30%) and were later revised based on 2015 data. While this approach is better than not targeting at all, it involves high errors of exclusion and inclusion for programs that mainly target individuals and households. While RAMED uses a more sophisticated targeting methodology (combining proxy means testing and community targeting methods), its scoring formula displays high targeting errors and the data used is out of date [World Bank and the National Observatory for Human Development (ONDH), 2015].

6. In this context, the government sought to develop information systems that would allow a more robust, efficient, and equitable allocation of social spending. The Government of Morocco has the opportunity to develop a more robust system for the identification of potential beneficiaries of social programs and services, and notably of SSNs. Currently, the main social programs (RAMED, Tayssir, social security, INDH) have their own identity system and database, most of which are not interoperable with each other and/or with other databases (World Bank, 2015). This myriad of identity systems, in fact, does not allow for a robust identification of program beneficiaries; leading to program double-dipping and fraud, especially for programs involving children. In addition, the information that has accumulated over the years in various program databases contains errors and duplicates. At a more granular level, this fragmentation in the identity landscape mainly results from the lack of established mechanisms for linking the same identity across the different repositories. Furthermore, none of the existing databases (registries) contain the necessary socio-economic information to assess the welfare conditions of individuals and households in the different repositories.

7. Many individuals, especially the poor, find it hard to register in available SSN programs as the requirements needed to prove their identity are complex. Despite substantial efforts to develop a national identity card that would attribute citizens a Unique Identifying Number (UIN), the card excludes the population under 18 years, adults in remote areas, and has a cost of emission which may render it inaccessible for the poor (World Bank, 2014). For individuals without a national identity card, birth certificates are often the main document required by social programs to verify an individual's identity. Nonetheless, registration at birth is estimated at 89 percent. As such, many children, especially from poorest families, do not effectively register at birth, creating significant identity gaps that limit their capacity to access some of services provided by the state. Moreover, the civil register is not yet digitized so citizens are required to provide a paper copy each time they submit an application to be considered in a social program. This complex ID environment results in a heavy administrative burden for potential service users and citizens, who often interface with several different public sector agencies that work in silos and require burdensome administrative processes and the compilation of documents to prove identity in order to benefit from available social programs. Besides, the complexity of the system undermines the development of more efficient methods of transfer allocation (such as direct bank payments, e-payments, etc.).

8. Given the above, the Government requested the World Bank to provide a package of technical financial support to build information systems to support the development of a more efficient, equitable, and integrated system of social service delivery. Specifically, the government requested the Bank to provide technical and financial assistance to establish two critical elements that, given the gaps mentioned above, would contribute to the improvement of social service delivery in the country: (i) a NPR with a Unique Identifying Number; and (ii) a SR as a platform to better target SSNs and other social programs in the future. In response, the World Bank prepared the ITSP Project to support the development of such a system over a period of five years.

## II. OBJECTIVE AND SCOPE OF ACTIVITIES COVERED BY SP-TA

9. The main objective of the TA was to support the Government in preparing the ITSP Project, while continuing the broader SP dialogue. To achieve this objective, the TA was envisaged as a flexible instrument that would respond to the needs of the government during the process of project preparation, given that not all the needs could have been clearly anticipated at concept stage. Moreover, the SP-TA task had, by design, complemented the project preparation code.

10. Taking into consideration these priorities, and following internal and external consultations (including, the Ministries of General Affairs and Governance, Interior, Health, Education, and the World Bank sectors such as Information and Communication Technology (ICT), Governance, Health, Education, HCP, and External Affairs (EXT)), the SP-TA program included the following activities:

- (i) **Building the Government’s capacity to design and develop the National Population Register (NPR) and the Social Register (SR).** The main outputs envisaged at Concept Note included a series of: (i) inputs and/or technical notes for the development of the NPR; and (ii) inputs or technical notes for the development of the SR.
- (ii) **Support the government in designing and implementing a reform of current targeting practices.** The main outputs envisaged at Concept Note included: (i) options for the development of a new targeting formula to estimate household’s socio-economic conditions based on the latest available household survey data of the HCP; (ii) a draft questionnaire for the applicants to the programs administered via the SR; and (iii) a policy note assessing the targeting system performance of RAMED and Tayssir using 2012/2013 ONDH data and options for reform/improvement.

## III. COMPLETED ACTIVITIES

### 2.1. Prior Activities financed during the previous SP-TA task (FY14/FY15)

11. **Policy Dialogue:** The SP-TA partially financed four technical assistance missions that contributed to the preparation of the ITSP Project, during February 10-14, 2014; June 23-27, 2014; November 10-14, 2014; and February 9-19, 2015.

### 12. Analytical and Advisory

- (i) **Report on the Evaluation of Identification systems in Morocco:** The assessment included identification systems of the National Identity System (CNIE), the education database (MASSAR), the RAMED registry, the social security registry (CNSS), and the civil registry, among others. The instrument used was the recent social protection assessment tool-identification module, developed by the World Bank, UNICEF and the International Labor Organization (ILO). This evaluation resulted in the Morocco Country Report “Delivery Systems Assessment- Identification Module”. The results of this report were disseminated during the following missions and served anchoring some of the components of the technical assistance program.
- (ii) **Evaluation of the Targeting performance of RAMED and Tayssir:** As a part of the second component of the SPR-TA program, the evaluation of targeting performance of RAMED and Tayssir was conducted in close collaboration between the World Bank team and the ONDH from November 2014 to April 2015. The results of the evaluation were disseminated early May 2015 to an inter-sectorial team of government counterparts.

13. **Capacity building and exchange of experience:**
- (i) **Training:** a 3-day training workshop (November 10-12, 2014) to present different methods to assess targeting performance, develop of poverty profiles, and evaluate the performance of social protection programs.
  - (ii) **Colombia Study Tour** to learn about the implementation of Colombia's unique social registry (SISBEN), May 11-16, 2014: The team included a Moroccan delegation composed of counterparts for the Ministries of Interior, Governance, Education as well as staff from the ONDH.
  - (iii) **Support to ONDH International Conference on Poverty:** International Conference on Human Development Measurement Methods and Evaluation Approaches Focused on Equity in favor of the New Generations, June 4-5, 2015.
  - (iv) **Marseille and Belgium Study Tour:** The objective of the tour was to: (i) provide participants with an overview of social safety nets in the region, and the various aspects of their design and implementation SSN systems based on international best practices; and (ii) to expose a team of Moroccan counterparts to the Belgium unique identifier and national population registry (considered one of the best systems in the world using a unique identifier as a point of entry (and ID verification) for the delivery of most social services provided by the state (March 23-27, 2015).

## 2.2. Activities completed during FY16/FY17

### Activity 1: Building the Government's capacity to design and develop the NPR and SR

14. **Policy Dialogue:** The SP-TA financed in part six technical assistance missions that contributed to the preparation of the ITSP Project, during October 5-16, 2015; Feb 22-March 4<sup>th</sup>, 2016, May 16-27, 2016, January 25-27, 2017, and April 10-14, 2017; as well as a South-South Learning exchange between Morocco and India during March 27-31, 2017. The three missions carried out during CYs 2015 and 2016 have contributed to the preparation and appraisal of the ITSP project, including the development of a draft Project Operational Manual (POM) and the successful negotiation during December 2016. The draft POM consolidated the inputs on the NPR and SR, which at the concept stage have been envisaged as technical notes. The three missions that were carried in 2017 served to support the government in advancing towards the achievement of select DLIs prior to project effectiveness (when the government did not have access to the TA and investments from the project), especially in two areas related to the largest DLIs for FY2017 (i.e. the development of the NIU generator and the development of the proxy-means tested (PMT) eligibility formula for the SR) and the finalization of the TORs for: (i) the development of the UIN Generator; and (ii) the acquisition of TA services for the design of the NPR.

15. **Analytical and Advisory Services.** The SP TA contributed to two advisory pieces: (i) the collection of administrative data on SP programs in Morocco; and (ii) technical support for a joint Ministry of Interior-HCP team to calibrate a first round of PMT models.

- (i) **SP ASPIRE:** The SP-TA task financed the cost of a consultancy service for a consultant to carry out an inventory of SP programs in Morocco, which was used as input to the World Bank maintained SP ASPIRE database. The information was collected from 47 social protection programs: subsidies, social assistance programs, social care programs, labor market programs, and social insurance. The information collected included metadata such as type of SSN program, targeting method, assistance unit, presence and type of conditionality, benefit level or formula, frequency of payment, financing source, implementing agency, number of

beneficiaries and budget. This information enabled the World Bank to update the knowledge on the number of SSN programs and their magnitude in Morocco, as well as to position Morocco relative to their international benchmarks. *Inter alia*, the information was useful to emphasize the high level of fragmentation of the SP system in Morocco, which could benefit from the introduction of a SR.

**(ii) Advisory support for the design and implementation of a reform of current targeting practices. The output, which was financed by a combination of funds from the SP-TA as well as other sources, included the estimation of a new targeting formula to estimate households welfare based on the latest available household survey data of the HCP. The output involved the following activities:**

- *Development of TORs for the estimation of a PMT formula* using the latest consumption survey by the HCP. The TORs spelled out the rationale of the work, data requirements, main analytical models, sensitivity analysis, as well as a framework (set of indicators) used to select among different prediction models<sup>1</sup>.
- *Distance-learning workshops with key staff from HCP and the MI* (during April 5-6 2017). The objective of these workshops was to expose a team of HCP and MI staff to the analytical models used to estimate household welfare under a PMT approach; and the utilization of the ADePT SP software to carry out benefit incidence analysis for existing programs (e.g. RAMED) or for simulated ones (e.g. those resulting from the estimation of different PMT models). The presentations made by the World Bank team covered the following topics: (i) a review of the main targeting methods; (ii) an example of a successful reform of the targeting systems (Georgia, 2006) that covered both the analytical choices and practical aspects; (iii) a review of the methodological choices made during the calibration of a PMT model; (iv) a presentation of the ADePT SP software, including hands-on exercises.
- *Mission to initiate the technical work for the calibration of the PMT model, Rabat, April 10-14, 2017*. The objective of the mission was to: (i) help HCP experts estimate the first few PMT regression models using the 2014 ENCDM data, (ii) evaluate the benefit incidence of these models; and (iii) compare them with the benefit incidence of RAMED. The main outputs of this work included: (i) the calibration of a national PMT model using OLS regression model; (ii) the calibration of another national model using quantile regression; (ii) the estimation of a PMT model with separate specifications for urban and rural areas. The respective models were used to simulate programs targeting the poorest 2, 5, 10, 15 and 20% of the population. These

---

<sup>1</sup> The calibration of a PMT formula requires the estimation of household welfare (e.g. per capita consumption of a household) based on a set of simple, observable characteristics using a recent representative household survey. In the case of Morocco, the survey is ENCDM 2014. The typical list of characteristics used to predict household well-being include family size and composition, education and occupation of adults, characteristics of the dwelling and endowment with durable goods. Once this formula is finalized, applicants to social protection programs complete a questionnaire with information on these characteristics, and this formula is used to estimate their per capita consumption. The process of model calibration requires: (i) running a series of regression models to estimate per capita consumption of the households, searching for the model with the lowest inclusion and exclusion errors; (ii) selecting the regression models that use characteristics that are easy to observe, hard to misreport and/or easy to verify through databases crosschecks; and (iii) checking the performance of the PMT model on a number of vulnerable subgroups with characteristics that typically differ from the “average poor household”. To arrive at the best model, the estimation team has to calibrate a few tenths of regression models and compare their performance using a set of indicators, which are spelled out in the draft TORs prepared by WB. The marginal value of carrying out an extensive PMT model search is typically high. Any improvement in the PMT model will result in lower inclusion and exclusion errors, hence in higher efficiency and effectiveness of the social protection spending.

simulated programs, as well as the information on households with RAMED cards (e.g. health fee waiver coverage) from the *Enquête Nationale sur la consommation et dépenses des ménages* (ENCDM) 2014, have been then processed with the ADePT SP software to assess their targeting performance. The technical assistance for the calibration of the PMT formula was timely and well appreciated by the technical team from HCP and MI. During the mission, the HCP team has calibrated few PMT models and has assessed the targeting performance of RAMED, the health waiver program put in place to cover the poorest quintile of the population. The preliminary results suggest that the targeting performance of RAMED is quite weak (only 28% of the cards go to the poorest quintile), which provides an excellent rationale for the Social Registry and the new targeting formula. The preliminary PMT formula would increase the RAMED coverage of the poorest quintile from 28% to about 60%. Thus, while there is more analytical work to be done, the early results are very encouraging. An Excel file with the key results is available on request from the TTL. The mission was instrumental to expose the MI and HCP teams to the methods for PMT calibration, and to the software ADePT SP that could be used to assess the relative performance of different PMT models.

16. **Capacity building and exchange of experience.** The SP-TA partially financed the following activities:

**1. TA to design and implement a Unique Identifier Number (UIN)**

- *Context.* The Ministry of Interior of Morocco launched a project to digitalize a National Civil Register in the next 5 years. This project aims to improve service delivery to citizens and lay the foundation for the development of a NPR. The roadmap of the project Digitalization of the National Civil Registry (DNCR) has been defined as of 2015 and is currently under development. In the context of the DNCR project, the Ministry of Interior aims to establish a unique ID generator, which will be first used to attribute a Unique Identifying Number (UIN) to newborns as well as to new foreign residents in Morocco. This unique generator will also be used to attribute each citizen in Morocco a UIN during the development of the NPR, and co-financed under the results-based component of the ITSP Project.
- *Task and resulting outputs.* The MI requested the World Bank to assist in the identification of international best practices for the development of a unique ID motor generator (functional, technical specifications, and ICTs system architecture). In response, the Bank selected an international consultant who assisted a multidisciplinary MI in the development of the design of the UIN generator. **The main output of this work included a workshop, a series of presentations and two reports (on the functional specifications and, respectively, the system's architecture of the UIN generator),** available upon request from the TTL. The reports spell out best practices to develop an algorithm to generate random numbers and control keys, and rules/process assuring good quality of the resulting ID numbers. These reports served as building blocks for the TORs for the development of such a module.
- Additional support for the development of the NIU generator were provided by an Aadhaar volunteer (cooperation with the Identify for Development (ID4D team) and during the SS Learning Exchange with India described below.

**2. Workshop on India's Aadhaar program, Rabat, April 11-13, 2016.**

- *Context.* The Moroccan counterparts requested information about successful reforms in the area of identity verification, e.g. NPRs underpinned by modern technologies, accessible and inclusive, that could improve the efficiency and effectiveness of public programs, as well as stimulate private

enterprise. Within this context, the SP-TA task financed a workshop on the Aadhaar project (NPR) of India, the largest biometrically-based NPR in the world which helped India advance identity authentication into the 21<sup>st</sup> century.

- *Content.* The workshop was led by one of the architects of the Indian reform, Dr. Ram Sharma, Chairman of the Telecom Regulatory Authority of India. Through a series of 5 presentations, the speaker covered a number of areas, such as: (i) an overview of the Aadhaar program, including its genesis, coverage, strategy, value-added, utilization, main technical characteristics, financing model, and institutional and legal framework; (ii) the technology architecture of Aadhaar and its principles (transparency, vendor-neutrality, open-source software, security, confidentiality); (iii) the implementation of the Aadhaar program (the role of the Unique ID Authority of India, or UIDAI; enrolment and deduplication); (iv) the role of biometrics in Aadhaar (the authentication services, the authentication modules, and the ICT infrastructure underpinning the program); and (v) the implementation of the Aadhaar program (the institutional, legal, financial and communication frameworks. The PPTs, available in English and French, are available on request from the TTL.
- *Results.* Following this successful workshop, the Government has requested the team to revise some of the elements of the ITSP Project to include a number of design features inspired by the Aadhaar program.

### **3. South-South Learning Exchange Visit, Morocco to India, March 27-31, 2017**

- a. *Context.* A Moroccan delegation from the Ministry of Interior travelled to India to learn about the largest biometrically based identity system in the world, Aadhaar, which serves as inspiration for their new National Population Registry.
- b. *Main objectives.* The main objectives of the knowledge exchange with India have included: (i) to better understand the key principles underlying UIDAI and Aadhaar strategic vision, as well as the design and implementation issues your organization faced during the roll out of the program; (ii) to understand the elements and structure of the Aadhaar system (functionalities of the system; and the conceptual, operational, technological, organizational, financial, and legal mechanisms); (iii) to learn from the team that has designed and implemented the Aadhaar program; (iv) to understand the program operation, challenges, constraints; (v) to understand the enrollment process in Aadhaar (collection of biometrics by frontline units); (vi) to learn about the potential of the ecosystem of Aadhaar-based services; (vii) to identify the main lessons learned from the Aadhaar program during the past 7 years of implementation and its prospects; (viii) to identify the key success factors for a biometric UID – NPR for Morocco.
- c. *Results.* The mission equipped the counterparts with in-depth knowledge on the functioning of the Aadhaar program, which in turn helped them finalize some of the bidding documents for the NPR and jumpstart the first component of the World Bank financed project. The information collected during the visit helped the Moroccan government to design their NPR, and to introduce biometric deduplication and authentication. The counterparts also learned and experienced first-hand the ecosystem of applications developed using the Aadhaar biometric authentication system for payments, banking, mobile SIM registration, public servants' attendance, distribution of subsidies, and attendance for the public works programs.
- d. The Bank also helped counterparts collect and organize a set of documents covering many facets of the Aadhaar program such as presentations; initial reports (on biometric and demographic standards); technical reports on technology strategy, technology architecture and product documentation; key bidding documents; documentation of key APIs; and training manuals. In total, about 2000 pages of documentation were provided to the client. Over the short term, these

documents have enabled them to revise and improve some of the TORs for the NPR. Over the medium term, the documents collected during the visit will equip the counterparts with a better understanding of the services that can be built on top of a biometrically supported identity platform. Among these, the Moroccan officials were particularly interested in the use of Aadhaar authentication in reducing waste in the largest subsidy programs in India, such as LPG and PDS (by eliminating duplication and ghost beneficiaries, and by enforcing subsidy quotas). The Moroccan delegation plans to reach out to their own ministries administering the gas butane (LPG) and food subsidies and share with them these relevant documents. Though these activities fall outside the ITSP Project, they have helped to broaden the engagement on SP in Morocco.

- e. A follow up high-level exchange is planned for September-October 2017, at the ministerial and/or general secretary level.

### **III. LINKS TO THE CPS**

17. The importance of improving social service delivery in Morocco is highlighted in the Country Partnership Strategy 2014-17. The CPS indicates strong World Bank commitment to support the government's vision to promote access and effectiveness of social protection programs. This vision is primarily framed within the CPS's strategic outcome 1.7 in Results Area 1 (promoting competitive and inclusive growth) aiming to "improve access to and effectiveness of social protection programs". The ITSP Project will also contribute to strategic outcome 3.2 "more transparent and accountable management of public resources", within the CPS's Results Area 3 (strengthening governance and institutions for improve service delivery).

18. The ITSP Project, and the SP-TA supporting it, is also linked to the recent World Bank's sector dialog in the areas of social protection, health, energy, and transport sectors and builds closely on the policy dialogue recommendations resulting from the FY12-15 programmatic Social Protection Reform technical assistance program. Finally, SP-TA task was framed within "The World Bank 2012-2022 Social Protection and Labor Strategy," which advocates the development of integrated and efficient social service delivery systems to address poverty, inequality, and other social risks.

19. Finally, the SP-TA and the ITSP Project are aligned with the new MENA Regional Strategy which orients its actions to promote peace and stability in the region. Particularly, improving the system of service delivery for social protection programs is consistent with the two pillars of the new strategy that seek to (i) renew the social contracts through strengthening performance and transparency of SSN programs; and (ii) increase the resilience through strengthening institutions as well as capacity for SSN delivery especially at the local level.

### **IV. TEAM COMPOSITION**

- Diego F. Angel-Urdinola, Sr. Economist (GSPDR)
- Setareh Razmara, Lead SP Specialist (GSPDR)
- Carine Clert, Lead SP Specialist (GSPDR)
- Kathy A. Lindert, Lead Economist (GSPDR),
- Phillippe Leite, Senior Economist (GSPDR)
- Najat Yamouri, Sr. Social Development Specialist (GSURR)
- Aissatou Maisha Dicko, Operations Analyst (GSPDR)
- Fatima El Kadiri, Consultant (GSPDR)
- Joseph Atick, Consultant (GSPDR)

- Emil Daniel Tesliuc, Sr. Economist (GSP05) (TTL)

## **V. OWNERSHIP AND COUNTERPARTS**

20. The primary counterparts for this TA program have been the Ministries of Interior (MI), General Affairs and Governance (MAGG), Education (MENFP), Health (MoH), Social Development (MFFDS), and the High Planning Commissariat (HCP).

21. After initial technical meetings with the Secretary Generals of these institutions (held between February and July 2015), the team identified strong ownership and interest from the Ministries of Interior, MAGG and Education for the proposed TA activities. In the context of the preparation of the ITSP Project, the World Bank advised the Government to constitute an inter-ministerial technical team piloted by the MI to work on project preparation. This technical team was also tasked to oversee the implementation of the activities to be supported by the SP-TA program.

22. The primary audiences for the TA were: (i) the Ministries of Finance, Planning (HCP), and General Affairs and Governance; and (ii) the beneficiary government entities (Ministries of Economic and General Affairs, Interior, education, Social Development and Health, as well as the ONDH). Indirect audiences included national/regional/local government agencies as well as governmental and non-governmental organization working in the areas of social protection/social assistance in Morocco.

## **VI. DISSEMINATION / OUTREACH**

23. Outputs have been disseminated across government agencies, serving to inform policy discussions in different venues, including but not limited to Government and World Bank-sponsored events.

## **VII. BUDGET (FY16/17)**

<b>Cost Element</b>	<b>Labor</b>	<b>Travel</b>	<b>Other</b>	<b>Total</b>
FY16	119,719.87	25,587.69	25,292.78	170,600.34
FY17	47,535.76	6,025.99	25,316.29	78,878.04
<b>Total</b>	<b>167,255.63</b>	<b>31,613.68</b>	<b>50,609.07</b>	<b>249,478.38</b>

## **VIII. LESSONS LEARNED AND NEXT STEPS**

24. The ministry of interior (MoI) in Morocco plays an important role in the design and delivery of social policy in Morocco and is capable of mobilizing other line-ministries. This occurs because the ministry has local delivery capacity, political and technical leverage, and it is perceived as politically neutral. This is particularly important to consider for the design of policies that span several ministries.

25. South-south exchanges (Colombia and India) and North-South exchanges (Belgium) were key to develop a technical consensus to the reforms supported by the TA and included in the IDT4SP project. In particular, a study tour to France (Marseille) and Belgium was organized in March 2015 and allowed counterparts to be exposed to these countries' unique identifier and national population registry - considered among the best systems in the world using a unique identifier as a point of entry (and ID verification) for

the delivery of most social services provided by the state. Moreover, thanks to the support of the ID4D team, the India Chairman of the Department of Electronics and Information Technology and former Director of the Unique ID Authority of India visited Rabat in April 2016 to share with high-level MoI officials India's technical and operational experience for the design and the implementation of the country's UIN (known as the Aadhaar ID program). These activities have contributed to incorporating important design elements for Component 1 of the IDT4SP project. Furthermore, a study tour to Colombia was organized (May 2014) to expose Moroccan counterparts to the design and the implementation of Colombia's social register (SISBEN). This study tour contributed to incorporating important design elements for Component 2 of the IDT4SP project.

26. Interactions with other Global Practices (GPs) were fundamental to the success of this TA program. The TA program capitalized from close interactions with the World Bank's ICT and ID4D teams as well as the Social Protection System's Global Thematic Group. ICT inputs have been crucial for the design of Component 1 of the IDT4SP project (Development of an NPR with a UIN and Establishment of a NIA) and to capitalize on international best practices in the design and roll-out of UINs. The Social Protection System's Global Thematic Group, under its communications for SP reform initiative (COSMOS), has also provided support by providing counterparts with best practices on communication campaigns to introduce Social Registers to the population in Brazil and Indonesia (Component 2 of the IDT4SP project). These interactions have provided several lessons that have been incorporated in the IDT4SP project's design.

27. High level government leadership was fundamental to support the take-up of policies supported by the TA program and will be required to assure the sustainability of the reforms supported by the TA program. First, there was a strong technical and political ownership of the policies supported by the TA, which contributed to important reforms currently supported by the IDT4SP project. The TA program benefited from high-level strategic leadership of the MoI and is also supported by other sectoral ministries such as the MAGG, MEF, MNEVT, MoH, and MoSWFSD as well as the prime ministry and the HCP. The Government is fully committed to accompany the technical development of the project with adequate legal and financial frameworks to ensure the use and the sustainability of the information systems, processes, and institutions that will be developed under the proposed reform.

28. Access to micro-data is important for the design of informed social policies. Having developed a technical partnership with the HCP and the ONDH was a key aspect to provide quantitative evidence supporting the needs to reform, especially pertaining to the current targeting methods used by important social assistance programs, such as Tayssir and RAMED.

## **NEXT STEPS**

29. Since the World Bank is committed to support Morocco to improve its service delivery system for Social Protection, future support to the SP sector in the near future should also focus on the needs to partner with line ministries (such as health) to make sure the reforms that are currently supported (NPR / SR / UIN) are used and capitalized.

30. In the near term, this includes the need to further capacity enhancement in partnership with line ministries beyond MoI to improve the delivery of services; as well continuous interactions with other GPs in the Bank to further coordination to ensure synergies and complementarity.