



<b>1. Project Data:</b>		<b>Date Posted :</b> 03/21/2003	
<b>PROJ ID:</b> P006872		<b>Appraisal</b>	<b>Actual</b>
<b>Project Name:</b> Co Urban Transport	<b>Project Costs (US\$M)</b>	141	183.9
<b>Country:</b> Colombia	<b>Loan/Credit (US\$M)</b>	65	65
<b>Sector(s):</b> Board: TR - General transportation sector (54%), Roads and highways (37%), Sub-national government administration (9%)	<b>Cofinancing (US\$M)</b>	0	0
<b>L/C Number:</b> L4021			
	<b>Board Approval (FY)</b>		96
<b>Partners involved :</b>	<b>Closing Date</b>	12/31/2001	12/31/2001
<b>Prepared by :</b>	<b>Reviewed by :</b>	<b>Group Manager :</b>	<b>Group:</b>
Kavita Mathur	Laurie Effron	Alain A. Barbu	OEDST

## 2. Project Objectives and Components

### a. Objectives

The overall objectives of the Bogotá Urban Transport Project were to:

- improve major transport corridors by rationalizing vehicle flows and upgrading environmental conditions for users;
- promote the use of public transport and non-motorized transport modes;
- facilitate public transport access to areas of low income population;
- extend the life of the road infrastructure; and
- strengthen the Borrower's institutions in charge of planning, managing and maintaining transport infrastructure.

### b. Components

The project consisted of four components:

- 1. Traffic Management and Transport Corridors:** (a) works, equipment, and consultant services to carry out corridor subprojects consisting of an integrated program of least-cost investments, to improve transport flows (including dedicated lanes for buses, car traffic and non-motorized transport) in major transit corridors and their areas of influence, and (b) equipment, training and consultant services to assist the entities to carry out their mandate. The areas of focus include: a citizens education program; computers, software, equipment and vehicles for the Traffic Safety Fund (FONDATT); training of the traffic police and other transport sector professionals; and traffic count and transport surveys.
- 2. Access Roads:** (a) investments comprising designs, works, and supervision to pave and upgrade 30 km of roads to improve public transport access into low-income areas; and (b) strengthen the overall project-execution and financial-planning capabilities of the Urban Development Institute of Bogota (IDU).
- 3. Road Maintenance:** (a) road rehabilitation works comprising designs, civil works and supervision to repair or rebuild about 400 lane-km of arterials and secondary roads used by public transport; and (b) planning, management and quality control of the rehabilitation program, development and implementation of pavement information system; and development of standards and manuals for pavement design and maintenance.
- 4. Institutional Support:** (i) assist with on-going borrower's transport sector reform to: (a) reorganize the transport authority, (b) define functional organization and participation of the private sector, (c) implement the new sector organization; and (d) train the borrower's professional staffing in connection with their activities under the new system; (ii) support the Environmental Department of Bogota (DAMA) in developing and establishing local environmental guidelines for such problems as noise pollution and

disposal/recycling of used tires, batteries and waste oil, and to design and implement the required regulations; (iii) support to the Finance Secretariat of Bogota (SHB), in auditing, monitoring and coordination of the project; development of an information system for investment budgeting and monitoring; and upgrading of the tax collection system.

### **c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates**

At appraisal, the project cost was estimated at US\$ 141 million. The actual cost was US\$ 183.9 million, about 30% more than the original estimate. This was mainly due to higher land acquisition cost for Calle 80 which was originally estimated at US \$ 3.7 million versus an actual cost of US \$26.7 million. This cost difference is due to an increase in the number of properties affected (from 175 estimated in 1995 to 235 in 1999) and to Bank guidelines for payment of commercial, as opposed to owner-declared value for taxes, which the City had been using.

### **3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:**

The project fully achieved its stated objectives:

- The access to public transport by low income residents in Bogota has increased. The project constructed 22.3 km of access roads (compared to 22 km envisaged at appraisal). It reached about 98% of beneficiaries with income classification in strata 1-2 (compared to SAR goal of 90%). Also, a bus-operated public transport system - Transmilenio was developed. The ex-post surveys shows that about 53% of the users of the Transmilenio system belong to the first two lowest income strata and about 95% are within the lowest three income strata.
- The project promoted the use of non-motorized transport by providing assistance in preparation of the non-motorized master plan for Bogota. The plan identified the origin and destinations of the users and designed the bicycle routes to be constructed. About 250 km of the bicycle paths have been constructed on the rehabilitated roads.
- To improve road rehabilitation, a road management information system (Pavement Plus) was developed. IDU (Bogota Urban Development Institute) has fully integrated the system in its operation for planning its long-term rehabilitation program. Rehabilitation works on 378 kms of arterials and secondary roads used by public transport were carried out (compared to the SAR target of 400 kms).
- The project strengthened the capacity of institutions in charge of planning, managing and maintaining urban transport infrastructure. Sector institutions are now leaner and technically, administratively and financially able to address the needs of Bogota Transport sector. Sector administration costs have decreased from 17% in 1996 to 10% in 1998. The cost of road maintenance have dropped by 77% even though the maintainable network has increased sevenfold between 1996 and 1999.
- Technical assistance and training was provided to develop and establish local environmental guidelines and to design and implement the regulations to address such problems as noise pollution, discarded tires, batteries and waste oil. For the discarded tires and batteries, studies were undertaken which dimensioned the problems and prepared proposals for addressing the issues. For the noise pollution problem, both the diagnosis and acquisition of monitoring and enforcement equipment's were financed under the project. The system is operational and it is expected to have a positive impact on residents in the city.

### **4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:**

- The project promoted Transmilenio, a low-cost and very efficient bus-operated public transport system, which is regarded as a "Best Practice" regionally and internationally. Bogota received the Stockholm Partnership prize for this system. Within Colombia, Barranquilla, Pereira and Cali have discarded plans for expensive rail mass-transit systems in favor of the Bogota model. Internationally, there have been delegations from Chile, Peru, Ecuador, Mexico, San Salvador, Panama, Dominican Republic and Japan that have visited Colombia to learn from Transmilenio.
- Mainstreaming of non-motorized transport - the Government is promoting the use of bicycles by constructing bicycle paths. Also, the Government has launched several creative initiatives aimed at discouraging use of cars such as car-free day, fuel surtax and license-plate restrictions which have taken about 40% of the cars out of circulation during peak hours.
- Adoption of Bank's resettlement guidelines for non-Bank investment.
- Improvement in traffic accident reports and data analysis procedures. An accident reporting analysis system (MAAP) was implemented for Bogota and a five-year road safety action plan for the city was developed. While several elements of the action plan have not been fully implemented, STT (District Secretariat for Traffic and Transport) is currently strengthening its Traffic Safety unit in order to address problems in a more

comprehensive way.

**5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):**

There are no major shortcomings, however, it should be noted that the first roads built under the access road sub-component were over-designed (in width, sidewalks, material, etc.) when considered in light of the available vehicle demands and the population density of the areas. However, after reviewing the initial results, greater emphasis was placed upon making these access roads more site specific in terms of configuration and other design elements and more emphasis was placed non-motorized transport, pedestrian facilities and public spaces.

6. Ratings:	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome:	Highly Satisfactory	Highly Satisfactory	
Institutional Dev.:	High	High	
Sustainability:	Highly Likely	Highly Likely	
Bank Performance:	Highly Satisfactory	Highly Satisfactory	
Borrower Perf.:	Highly Satisfactory	Highly Satisfactory	
Quality of ICR:		Satisfactory	

**NOTE:** ICR rating values flagged with '\*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

**7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:**

The ICR identified following well known lessons of broad applicability:

- It is critical that project activities should be well integrated into regular operation of the agencies. Creation of special project units may help in overcoming initial implementation problems due to weak capacity, however, in long run it creates problems.
- Maintenance is key element for project sustainability and special efforts have to be made to ensure that road investments are not lost due to inadequate maintenance.
- It is important to ensure community involvement in project design and implementation.

**8. Assessment Recommended?** ● Yes ○ No

**Why?** To verify the project ratings and to draw lessons from the successful implementation of the urban transport project

**9. Comments on Quality of ICR:**

The quality of the ICR is satisfactory. It is clearly written and covers all the relevant and important issues. The main shortcoming is that the table on key performance indicators/Log Frame Matrix is incomplete.