



1. Project Data:		Date Posted : 04/12/2002	
PROJ ID: P007311		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name : Ht- First Health Project	Project Costs (US\$M)	33.7	29.1
Country: Haiti	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	28.2	26.3
Sector(s): Board: HE - Health (87%), Central government administration (13%)	Cofinancing (US\$M)	2.4	
L/C Number: C2085			
	Board Approval (FY)		90
Partners involved : CIDA	Closing Date	06/30/1996	03/31/2001
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group:
Ronald G. Ridker	Timothy A. Johnston	Alain A. Barbu	OEDST

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives
To assist GOH improve health status by reducing the central administration expenditures of the Ministry of Health (MSPP), reducing the ratio of salaries to operating expenses, improving cost recovery, strengthening key management and technical functions of MSPP, reducing maternal and child mortality and countering the devastating effects of AIDS and TB.

b. Components
Project components included (appraisal estimate/final cost):
 (1) institutional development (\$3.6 m/1 m) mostly technical assistance to rationalize and decentralize staff and improve key management and technical functions of MSPP,
 (2) service delivery (\$17.6 m/17 m) to improve facilities, services and supplies in priority fields and integrate the private sector into delivery system, and
 (3) epidemic control (\$7.5 m/10 m) for HIV/AIDS prevention and TB control.

c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates
Originally IDA was to provide \$28.2 million and the government \$3.1 million. CIDA was to co-finance on a parallel basis \$2.4 million. Project revisions reduced the funds provided for institutional development and service delivery and increased those provided for epidemic control, the net effect being a final disbursement figure of \$29.1 million. Due to a change in the US\$/SDR exchange rate, there was an undisbursed balance of \$1.3 mil., which was cancelled. In the end, after 11 years, the project disbursed 95.2 percent of the original credit amount.

3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:
The project failed to achieve most of its objectives. Public health did not improve during the last decade; while the project may have helped avoid a deterioration, there is no evidence to this effect. Virtually all the institutional development objectives were abandoned during implementation. After revisions, the project did have some positive impacts on core public health functions (see below).

4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:
Progress was made in applying standardized therapeutic protocols for TB and use of essential drugs. The availability of drugs appears to have improved, though it may not be sustainable without continued external assistance. The public-private partnership developed under the TB program significantly increased institutional capacity in that area, and modest improvements were ultimately made in cost recovery for drugs. There are some indications that the HIV/AIDS subcomponent improved awareness, testing and counseling

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):
All Bank projects in Haiti were severely affected by instability, civil unrest, political crises and frequent budgetary

crises. Among other things, they led to periodic suspensions of Bank and other donor assistance programs. In addition, the project was adversely affected by lack of commitment within the Ministry of Finance, and often in the Ministry of Health as well, to any of the institutional reforms initially agreed to, by high turnover of administrations and ministers, lack of basic management skills in the public sector, and by periodic public health crises due to breakdowns in delivery of services and supplies. This project was revised and the closing date extended three times, each revision pairing down support for institutional reforms and works projects and focusing more on providing drugs and supplies to avoid a total breakdown.

6. Ratings:	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome:	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	
Institutional Dev .:	Modest	Modest	
Sustainability:	Unlikely	Unlikely	
Bank Performance:	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	
Borrower Perf .:	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	
Quality of ICR:		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

Under the right conditions, public-private partnerships can help to mitigate institutional constraints.
 Supply-driven public sector projects cannot overcome systemic constraints.
 Basic governance and implementation capacity is essential for the success of a Bank operation.
 Changes in public sector employment practices cannot be brought about within one sector; they can only be realized on a government-wide basis.
 Future lending in Haiti should focus on simple, well-defined operations, not on complex reform efforts.

8. Assessment Recommended? ☐ Yes ☒ No

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The ICR is clear, concise and persuasive .