
People's Republic of China

**Guangxi Poverty Reduction Program
Environment and Social Systems Assessment (ESSA)**

Final

**May, 2018
Prepared by the World Bank**

Acronyms

AWS	Administration of Work Safety
APs	Affected Persons
CARF	Consolidated Rural Poverty Reduction Fund
DAGR	Department of Agriculture of Guangxi Region
DLI	Disbursement – Linked Indicators
DRC	Development and Reform Committee
LA	Land Acquisition
LD	Land Donation
LT	Land Transfer
EPB	Environmental Protection Bureau
EA	Environmental Assessment
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
EPL	Environmental Protection Law
ESSA	Environmental and Social System Assessment
GRM	Grievance Redress Mechanism
Guangxi Region	Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region
Guangxi REPB	Department of Environmental Protection of Guangxi
GPDF	Guangxi Regional Department of Forestry
GRERAC	Guangxi Regional Ethnic and Religious Affairs Committee
MEP	Ministry of Environmental Protection
MLR	Ministry of Land Resource
MOA	Ministry of Agriculture
PRCDP	Poverty Rural Community Development Project
PforR	Program for Results
PC	People's Congress
SC	State Council
SA	Social Assessment
WF	Women's Federation
WRDGR	Water Resources Department of Guangxi

CONTENT

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
SECTION I: INTRODUCTION.....	12
1.1 Objective and Scope of the ESSA.....	12
1.2 Methodology	12
SECTION II: PROGRAM DESCRIPTION	13
2.1 National and Regional Context.....	13
2.2 Guangxi Consolidated Poverty Reduction Program (the “Program”)	14
2.3 Institutional Arrangement	15
SECTION III: POTENTIAL ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL EFFECTS.....	16
3.1 Environmental and Social Screening	16
3.2 Potential Environmental Benefits and Risks.....	18
3.3 Potential Social Benefits and Risks	20
SECTION IV: ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT SYSTEM.....	23
4.1 Legal Framework Applicable to the PforR	23
4.2 Implementation of Environmental Management Systems	27
4.3 Environmental Management Agencies and Capacity Assessment.....	35
SECTION V: SOCIAL MANAGEMENT SYSTEM	40
5.1 Legal Framework Applicable to the Program	40
5.2 Implementation of Social Management Systems.....	50
5.3 Performance of Social Safeguards Management Agencies and Capacity.....	59
SECTION VI: ASSESSMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL SYSTEM AGAINST PforR POLICY AND DIRECTIVE.....	65
SECTION VII: STAKEHOLDERS CONSULTATION.....	76
7.1 First Round Consultation	76
7.2 Second Round Consultation.....	77
SECTION VIII: RECOMMENDATIONS	78
Annex 1:Initial screening of poverty reduction activities.....	79
Annex 2: List of Applicable Environmental and Social Law, Regulations and Guidelines.....	86
Annex 3: Summary of Consultation Workshop	91

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Guangxi Poverty Reduction Program will contribute significant social and environmental benefits in a sustainable way for Guangxi region by 2020 through lifting 4.52 million poor people out of poverty; lifting 5000 villages out of poverty status and lifting 54 counties out of poverty status as well. The Program of the Bank will directly benefit 1.74 million poor people of 0.42 million households from 28 poor counties, among which, 67.64% are poor ethnic minorities and 40.48% are poor women.

The environmental and social risk associated with the program is moderate. The program will increase the direct social benefits on job opportunities creation and income generation targeted poor households through the measures to be supported, including agricultural industrialization (chanyefupin), government-directed rural finance programs; infrastructure, related technical training on farmer cooperatives and farmers. A huge number of rural poor labor will have relatively stable and reliable income channels and revenue sources through the program implementation. The increase of income per capita of poor will reach the average level of Guangxi by 2020. In addition, the program will create the labor employment for poor people to realize the transfer of employment. Through the development of industry, impoverished people will be driven out of poverty through job opportunities provision, each poor will master 1 to 2 practical technologies to enhance the development capacity of impoverished areas. The environmental benefits are deemed extensive in the 28 program counties in terms of improving sanitation conditions of poor villages and improving human health of villagers and ameliorating the traffic safety in rural areas.

The activities supported under the Program are not expected to take place in environmentally sensitive areas (e.g., natural habitats, protected areas, or natural forests) and have no significant land acquisition impacts or social risks; or to have adverse impacts on physical cultural resources. Activities will not involve dams, or be located in disputed areas.

Nonetheless, some of the activities supported under the Program have potential negative impacts and risks associated with construction and operation of the activities, particularly the development of livestock farms and planting activities. The potential environmental risks identified during the assessment include the livestock waste issues associated with the livestock development activity, as well as pest management issues associated with the crop planting and cash tree planting activities. In terms of social risks, small size service facilities and infrastructures improvement may induce land acquisition or voluntary land donation; agricultural industrialization or afforestation activities may induce land transfer or lease; and lack of effective participation and information disclosure mechanism under government programs and grievance redress measures. The above effects in operation phase have been regarded as concerns of high level for further assessment.

This Environment and Social Systems Assessment (ESSA), prepared by the Bank team, provides a comprehensive review of relevant environmental and social management systems and procedures in China and Guangxi region, identify the extent to which the state/ local systems are consistent with PforR Bank Policy and Directive, and recommend necessary actions to address potential gaps as well as opportunities to enhance performance during the PforR implementation.

Potential Environmental and Social Effects and Risks

Environment

The potential environmental and social effects and risks of the program activities have been screened and further analyzed so as to identify the effects of high level concern for further assessment. The environmental effects and risks of high level concern are livestock waste associated with livestock development activity, pest management in agricultural and forestry sectors.

All of the 28 program counties are promoting the development of “ecological” livestock activity in the format of leading agribusiness enterprises plus cooperatives and household livestock farms. The activity of livestock and poultry farming could produce the animal waste and related water and air pollution, if not properly managed, the surface water and groundwater as well ambient air could be polluted. The waste management can be compromised owing to the poor quality of the design and construction of the environmental facilities; lack of training on the operation of the

environmental facilities; and lack of supervision over the operation of the environmental facilities by the relevant government departments.

The program will support the activities that will change the pest management or pesticide use practice through establishment of agricultural plantations as well as planting of cash trees. Thus, improper use of the pesticides may cause the environment pollution and health treat. The risk related to the pest management may arise from the aspects of improper management of production, labeling, storage and sale, use of pesticides, inadequate training/adoption of integrated pest management (IPM hereinafter) approach, and inadequacy of supervision by government agencies.

The program will support the development of rural tourism and agricultural products processing industry, which will produce general wastewater and solid waste in operation phase. These wastes are bio-degradable and can be readily mitigated by available techniques. In addition, the rural tourism development is intended to provide the tourists with the experience of rural life-style through catering and scene seeing/fruit picking, the impact on the local culture of rural villages is little.

The Program includes upgrading, rehabilitation and/or new construction of infrastructures in designated poor villages. The scale of the physical structure may range from small rural drinking water supply structures to rehabilitation or upgrading of access roads to natural villages (below Grade IV). Potential environmental and social effects associated with the construction of physical structures include: dust, noise, soil erosion, non-hazardous solid waste, wastewater, and social disturbance such as traffic safety and congestion. These impacts are envisaged to be minor, temporary, and site-specific and can be mitigated with readily available measures. Additionally, there will be no labor camps given the small size of the activities, thus the influx of labor will not be present.

Social

The assessment of social risks of the activities to be supported under the Program, concluded that there would not be significant social conflicts caused by those activities. However, the Program would have limited social risks in terms of land acquisition or land donation¹ and land transfer, poor ethnic minority communities involving and development, effective participation and consultation, and grievance redress mechanism.

Land acquisition. The social risk assessment concluded that any land needed for the upgrading or rehabilitation of village roads , which are part of the PforR boundaries, will be obtained through land donation rather than land acquisition process. However, being conservative, the ESSA approached any potential land requirement for such road rehabilitation and upgrading works through land acquisition and resettlement approach, in order to minimize potential social risks associated with such infrastructure activities should small size land acquisition be required. Therefore, ESSA includes the description of the land acquisition assessment.

Land donation. In addition to potential land acquisition, extension or new facilities or utilities construction which belong to or directly benefit local villages will have small size of land occupation in village unused wasteland or collective construction land. The land use for village facilities or utilities is about 0.3mu-3mu, which will be obtained through land donation by village collective or individuals. However, land donation procedure needs to be embedded by a participatory and inclusive approach in order to ensure poor people interests protection.

Land transfer. In terms of poverty reduction through industrialization and afforestation or reforestation activities could cause voluntary land use right transfer. In such, land-leases or land use rights transfer (LURT) contracts is necessary to ensure land transfer is voluntary, transparent, fair, and beneficial to farmers.

Ethnic minority. Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region is a multi-ethnic autonomous region with 12 resident nationalities including Zhuang, Han, Yao, Miao, Dong, Maonan, Hui, Jing, Yi, Shui, Mulao and Gelao. In addition, there are more than 40 other ethnic elements. According to the main data bulletin of the Sixth National Census in 2010, the minority population in Guangxi Region was 19.58 million, accounting for 37.94% of the total population. The

¹ According to the “Land Administration law of the People's Republic of China”, Land in rural belongs to villagers collectively, and land in urban belongs to state. Here, the land donation refers to rural collective land use right readjustment through the procedures of villagers’ consultation and participation.

minority population of Zhuang nationality ranks first in the country; it occupies 31.39% of the total population in Guangxi region. Guangxi Region has a total of 12 ethnic autonomous counties.

The activities to be supported under the Program cover 28 poor counties, 0.42 million poor households and 1.74 million poor people, of which, there are 1.17 million poor ethnic minority people (accounting for 67.64% of the poor population) and 9 poor minority autonomous counties. The Program should give special attention to ethnic minorities and vulnerable groups, including the disabled, women and the elderly, in order to promote equitable access to their benefits.

Participation and consultation. The Program aims to contribute significant social and environmental benefits. At various stages, both beneficiary population and affected people (AP) should be consulted about the likely positive and negative impacts of the Program. Public consultations and education program for poor villages are necessary to increase their awareness of participation, and ensure their needs or demands be considered and incorporated into the Program. Community participation and education can help lift people out of poverty, increase poor people awareness, and improve their ability for self-development.

Grievance redress. If the poor people had any dissatisfaction and wish to express their demands to protect their rights, the Program would deal with the problems in accordance with the complaints system established in the procedure, managing the potential social risks. An appeal can progress through a number of stages if the appellant is not satisfied with the initial response. The procedure should remain valid throughout the Program's implementation period.

Assessment of Legal and Institutional Framework applicable to the PforR

A comprehensive review of the legal and regulatory framework for social and environmental management relevant to the activities supported under the PforR was conducted, including their institutional arrangement, procedure, implementation, institutional capacity and performance, and comparison with the World Bank PforR Policy and Directive.

China has established a comprehensive system for the management of environment, land acquisition and social issues, which consists of laws, regulations, guidelines, specifications and standards. This system provides a reasonable basis for addressing the environmental and social issues related to activities supported under the PforR.

Consultations of government departments and site visits in Guangxi at provincial, municipal, county, township and village levels, have demonstrated that the institutional arrangement at the program level has been clearly established and the procedures, e.g. approval, examination and supervision, and grievance redress, have been operated and maintained.

Environment

China Government is devoted to reforming its environmental management system by enhancing the law enforcement and prevention approach. A set of laws, regulations, technical guidelines are being or have been updated or issued, e.g. Environmental Protection Law, Environmental Impact Assessment Law, Pilot Method for Public Participation for EIA, Technical Guideline for EA-General Program, etc.

EIA system has been well established and practiced in China and Guangxi. It covers, among others, the criteria for EIA categorization which is based on the nature, location, sensitivity and scale of physical projects, and thus providing reasonable basis for identifying the high-risk activities in terms of environmental impacts. The environmental exclusionary/limitation criteria established for the Program boundary, e.g. natural forests, physical cultural resources, natural habitats, etc. is fully consistent with the criteria for EIA Report in China. Namely, any activities that might potentially affect above sensitive areas will be automatically categorized into the high risk requiring EIA Report in China. Hence, these exclusions/limitations are expected to be conducted through the current EIA system, by which the activities of high risk can be excluded from the Program.

Specific to the livestock sector, a set of laws and regulations, technical policies, specifications and standards addressing environmental issues have been enacted in China and Guangxi. The system for livestock waste management has been established in place for review and approval of new livestock farms in terms of their

environmental impacts, locations and environmental facilities. The procedure has already been set up for supervision over the operation of the animal waste management facilities and the recycling of wastes into farmland, training for the farmers on the design and operation of the environmental facilities

For the health issues related to pest management, the relevant laws and regulations are comprehensive. The whole cycle of pesticide management, e.g. production, labeling, packaging, transportation, storage, sale and use, is clearly and stringently regulated by the system. This system places emphasis at the program level on the qualification of the wholesalers and dealers, pest forecast, use of IPM approach, supervision and training.

Institutional Responsibilities. The key PforR stakeholders involved in the environmental management include EPB, agricultural department, livestock and aquaculture bureau, and forestry department at various levels. The assessment finds that the responsibilities and accountabilities of these PforR stakeholders and institutions are clearly designated. In general, the government agencies are capable of fulfilling their duties, i.e. review and approval of environmental documents, supervision and examination, training and grievance redress. The procedure for review and clearance, and supervision and inspection, is well designed. Regular monitoring and inspection by the government agencies are performed. The technical capacity of the government organizations is found to be adequate to handle the review of various documents, action plans and advises on decision making at the program level. However, the capacity of staff at the county livestock department need to be further strengthened to provide adequate technical guidance and support to farmers, as well as to guarantee satisfactory environmental performance.

In the perspective of the assessment of the performance of livestock waste management and pest management, the ESSA has the following observations:

Livestock Waste Management: Livestock waste management is almost always handled by individual farmers. The scaled livestock farms (annual marketed pigs more than 100) or livestock plots (annual marketed pigs more than 300) in Guangxi usually adopts the technical route of recycling animal waste into farmland after composting solid waste and treating wastewater in retention tank respectively. It is found that the farmers heavily rely on their limited experience and knowledge to design and operate the livestock farms, particularly the waste management facilities, and they do not receive adequate training from government departments. As a result, the farmers are facing technical challenges of proper design and operation of their livestock farms in an “ecological” way.

Through site visit, the main technical issues what require improvements include the design of hydraulic layout, design and operation of composting facilities, design of retention tank, and proper disposal of carcasses; these issues need to be addressed under the technical support of livestock bureau.

As the size of small household livestock farm is very small, up to 3 pigs or 3 beef cattle, the livestock waste will not pose a challenge. The farmers usually compost the waste before applied into the farm.

In Guangxi, it is noted that local EPB and livestock department conduct regular supervision on the effectiveness and performance of the on-site environmental facilities in scaled livestock farms and livestock plots. However, inadequate technical capacity of the staff in the county livestock department may impediment the performance of the livestock management system.

Pest Management: Government plays a crucial role in the pest management, which successfully guarantees that the practice of pest management in Guangxi comply with the international good practice.

The mandatory system for production permit and sales permit for pesticide has been established and managed by the agricultural department in Guangxi. At the township and village levels, the branches of agricultural department have been in place to supervise the compliance of the pesticides on sale in the wholesalers and dealers.

The pest disease monitoring and forecast is well carried out by both the agricultural and forest departments. In the program areas, the trainings for farmers are regularly provided by the county governments free of charge and extensively provided by the technical representatives of the pesticide makers or of the professional institutions.

The IPM theory and practice is widely promoted in Guangxi and the farmers are aware of the IPM approach and willing to adopt it. In the farming seasons, the plant protection station with the agronomic-technical centers will jointly

visit the fields and supervise the use of the pesticide. There is an increasing shift towards the use of low toxicity low residue bio-pesticides in Guangxi. The amount of pesticide used in Guangxi has shown a trend of declining since the government of Guangxi has developed and is implementing the program of “zero” incremental use of pesticide. In the forestry sector, similar institutional arrangement has been made in place to take the similar duties for cash trees.

In summary, the assessment of the whole environmental management system at the program level identified the inadequacy in performance of the livestock waste management: (i) the quality of design and operation of the environmental facilities could be sometimes inadequate due to lack of experience and technical guidance from livestock bureau; (ii) the capacity of local livestock bureau needs to be strengthened to guarantee the good performance of the system.

Social

In general, the legal framework and implementation performance of land acquisition activities, land use right transfer, ethnic minority development and redress mechanism in State and Guangxi region are broadly adequate. The legal framework of laws, regulations, policies and standards and implementation mechanism provided are in overall consistent with Bank PforR Policy and respective Bank PforR Directive.

Land acquisition. The current legal framework on land acquisition in both national and Guangxi region has been well established to ensure that affected people are assisted in improving or at least restoring their livelihood and living standards. The local government mechanisms use sufficient multiple compensation and livelihood approaches during implementation to restore or maintain the land acquisition affected farmers’ welfare levels. In addition, relevant regulations on consultation and information disclosure related to land acquisition has been developed.

Land donation. Village roads, drinking water treatment or cultural/training centers within the poor villages are generally updated or improved based on the existing facilities areas and do not involve the occupation of new construction land. If a new infrastructure is to be built in a poor village and the ownership belongs to village collectives, the construction land is voluntarily donated by the village collective or farmer individuals. However, procedure for consultation and information disclosure in the process of obtaining village-level public service land and utility land is not stipulated in policy basis. There is not a unified way on voluntary land donation in the infrastructure projects of poor villages in practice, some villages provide the land without compensation, others paid compensations or provided lands elsewhere. And there are rarely land donation contracts, payment certificates or record backups as well.

Land use right transfer. There is an increasing land transfer market in Guangxi region and China in general as rural population continues to migrate to urban areas. The State and Guangxi region have established a policy system or framework which has standardized the principles, subjects, procedures, transactions, contract management and management agencies on land use right transfer. The policies stipulated that the transfer of the rural land contractual management right should abide by the principle of equal consultation, legal, voluntarily, and paid on the basis of insisting on the household contract management system and stabilizing the rural land contract relations.

The Agriculture Departments at all levels in Guangxi region have been established, and equipped with qualified staff and sufficient work expenses to standardize and manage the land transfer behavior. Guangxi region has set up a land transfer service platform such as Land Transfer Service center and land transfer network. The Rural Land Contract Arbitration Commission has been set up to settle the disputes of rural land contract in time and safeguard the lawful rights and interests of the parties.

Ethnic minority development. The activities under the Program cover 28 poor counties, 0.42 million poor households and 1.74 million poor people, of which, there are 1.17 million poor ethnic minority people (accounting for 67.74% of the poor population) and 9 poor minority autonomous counties. The state and Guangxi region have formulated a series of policies on ethnic minority development, including respecting for minority views, safeguarding the political equality of ethnic minorities, respecting the customs of ethnic minorities, supporting the development of ethnic minorities, and planning the economic and social development of ethnic communities.

Implementation of the 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty alleviation in Guangxi region concerned about the poor groups of ethnic minorities. The members/headquarters of the leadership group at all levels include the Women's Federation and Bureau of Ethnic and Religious Affairs. Ethnic and religious affair management institutions have been established

in regional, municipal and county level in Guangxi region, with special staff, work place and good equipment. The staff has a college degree or above and receives policy training every year, they worked closely with the Poverty Alleviation Office on poverty alleviation in poor ethnic minority villages and groups on the basis of the policies of poverty alleviation and ethnic minorities development in Guangxi region.

All sectors and departments have been integrated funds for the development of ethnic minorities. More than 50% of the minority development funds were invested into 54 impoverished counties to help the minorities get out of poverty. The poverty reduction activities implemented in poor ethnic villages are identified and determined through free, prior, and informed consultations approaches. The cadres of the Ethnic and Religious Bureau have been arranged to serve as the first secretary to help minority villages off poverty, especially serve for those aged 40 or over and uneducated EM people.

Women Development. The Program covers 1.74 million poor people of 0.42 million households from 28 poor counties, among which, 40.48% are poor women. The Women's Federation has issued *Notice on promoting the work of micro-finance in poverty alleviation* in cooperation with Poverty Alleviation and Development Office, the Finance Department and Rural Credit Cooperatives Union. At the same time, guide poor women to be resolute in poverty alleviation through publicity, organizing employment skill training, promoting small loans and full coverage of medical treatment. Women's federations at all levels work closely with the Poverty Alleviation Office on poverty alleviation.

Participation and consultation, and grievance redress mechanism. The 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty alleviation in Guangxi region and counties, as well as the special poverty alleviation programs, have clearly put forward the establishment and improvement of the participation mechanism of poor groups, project information disclosure mechanism and democratic decision-making system, required establishing and perfecting the benefit and demand expression mechanism of the poor people to respect the masses' opinions and respond to their needs. However, during the investigation, the Poverty Alleviation Office of all counties proposed to lead the poor people to change their mindset and improve their ability for self-development. The idea of "asking me to lift myself out of poverty" into "I want to get out of poverty" is an issue faced by the poverty alleviation work.

Guangxi has implemented public comments on petition matters as national and Guangxi policies. In particular, Guangxi region has set up a system of letters or calls for poverty reduction program at all levels. In addition, the Legal Adviser participates in the petition work, mainly provides the legal consultation, answers the legal question, raises the legal opinion and assists the petition person to solve the problem through the legal way. In the investigation of the poor village, poor households expressed that they know and welcome petition mechanism, when they have problems with poverty alleviation, they usually go to village cadres or stations in the village team instead of going directly to the township for petition.

Consultation and Disclosure

During the preparation of the ESSA, the World Bank assessment team carried out consultations with representatives from regional environment protection, livestock bureau, agricultural department and land resource bureaus. In addition, the Bank team made field visits to livestock farms and plantations. The discussions and visits were held with staff managing the facilities, and created the basis for the development of this ESSA.

Recommendations

Recommendation 1: Enhance the technical capacity of staff in county livestock bureau and enhance technical training and support to farmers

Enhanced trainings on design and operation of ecological livestock farms for farmers should be listed as a priority agenda in the county livestock bureau which should possess adequate technical details and results evaluation procedure. Thus the capacity of the staff in county livestock bureau should be further strengthened. In view that the regional stock bureau is experienced and making studies on the specifications and standards for ecological livestock farms, the regional livestock bureau is suggested to play an active role to disseminate the concept and prototype design of the ecological livestock farm, as well as the trainings for the county livestock bureau.

Recommendation 2: To develop a community participation and consultation manual to initiative to lift people out of poverty and increase poor people ownership, in particular, encourage poor people participating in the design, implementation and management of community services facilities and infrastructure.

The “No.1 central document “emphasizes to increase the ownership of rural/poor people. The 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty alleviation in Guangxi region proposes the participation mechanism of poor groups, in order to give full play to the self-management capabilities of poor villages and enhance the support from poor people. It is recommended that the regional PRO develop a community participation and consultation manual including i) poor people awareness education program to increase poor people support and participation, and ii) poor people participating in the design, implementation and management of community services facilities and infrastructure. (PAP action)

Recommendation 3: Standardize the community consultation and contract signature procedures of voluntary land donation.

There is not a unified way on voluntary land donation in the infrastructure projects among villages. While some villagers provide land without compensation, others have received compensations or substitute land elsewhere. However, there are rarely land donation contracts, payment certificates or record backups. It is recommended to further standardize the community consultation procedures, contract signature and record backups.

Other Consideration(s)

Considering the geographical coverage and the nature of the PforR activities, OP 7.60 Disputed Territories are not applicable to the PforR.

SECTION I: INTRODUCTION

1.1 Objective and Scope of the ESSA

The proposed Guangxi Poverty Reduction Program for Result (the PforR) is intended to eliminate rural poverty in the targeted PforR geographic areas in Guangxi Province. The proposed PforR is expected to contribute to three Results Areas:

- Results Area 1: Improved Income Generation for Rural Poor. The types of measures to be supported under the PforR include agricultural industrialization and skills training.
- Results Area 2: Improved Infrastructure for Rural Poor. This PforR Result Area will support only the activities related to rural transport and water supply infrastructure provision to designated poor households and villages in the targeted counties.
- Results Area 3: Institutional Enhancement for PforR Implementation.

The implementation of this Program will rely on the existing country and local legal framework and institutional system for managing environmental and social safeguards issues. The purpose of this ESSA is to provide a comprehensive review of relevant national and local environmental and social safeguards systems and procedures in China and the three project provinces; identify the extent to which the country/local systems are consistent with the core principles and elements of World Bank Policy for PforR; and recommend necessary actions to address gaps, as well as opportunities to enhance performance during implementation. Specifically, the main tasks of ESSA are to:

- Review the national and provincial legal policy framework related to environmental and social safeguards applicable for the PforR;
- Review management and implementation procedures of environmental and social safeguards systems in the province of Guangxi with regards to the activities supported under the PforR;
- Review and assess the institutional capacity of various relevant agencies involved in the environmental and social impacts management during implementation; and
- Recommend actions to improve the performance of existing systems in line with country system requirements as well as the core principles of PforR.

1.2 Methodology

The ESSA is a World Bank requirement for PforR investment operations. It is prepared by Bank staff, with consultant support as necessary, through a combination of reviews of existing government program materials and available technical literature, interviews with staff or representatives of government at various levels, and facilities and poor people, and consultations with key stakeholders and experts. The findings, conclusions, and opinions expressed in the ESSA document are those of the World Bank. The draft ESSA report was shared with counterparts prior to the ESSA consultation meetings held in Guangxi Province in April, 2018. Comments received from the public consultations will be incorporated into the final ESSA report as appropriate.

The methodology involved: (i) identification of the potential impacts from the activities to be supported by the PforR; (ii) a desk review of the laws, regulations, requirements, and guidelines on the EHS and social management to prevent or mitigate the identified potential impacts; (iii) meetings and interviews with key stakeholders involving environment protection and land resources bureaus, livestock bureau, agricultural bureaus, forestry bureau at provincial, municipal, county, township and village levels; and (iv) visits to a number of livestock farms, plantations in Longsheng, Teng and Du'an Counties of Guangxi Province. Observation and discussions during these visits provided a greater understanding of the potential environmental and social impacts associated with these types of activities, procedures and capacity of government departments in dealing such impacts, including relevant measures currently adopted in accordance with relevant laws and regulations.

SECTION II: PROGRAM DESCRIPTION

2.1 National and Regional Context

China's success in reducing extreme poverty since the economic reform period is widely recognized as an event of global significance. Based on the international poverty line of \$1.90 per day (expressed in 2011 purchasing power parity), the World Bank estimates that the incidence of poverty in China declined from 877.8 million in 1981 to 87.4 million in 2012 (or from 88.3 percent to 6.5 percent of the total population). These World Bank estimates indicate that about 790 million Chinese escaped poverty during this period, representing about 72 percent of global extreme poverty reduction. In fact, China is the first developing country to achieve the United Nations Millennium Development Goal (MDG) of reducing the number of its people living in extreme poverty and hunger by half. These monetary estimates of declining poverty have been matched by broad-based improvements in nutritional status, educational attainment, longevity and other health outcomes, as well as other indicators of well-being.

Guangxi has experienced an important reduction of rural poverty in recent years. Between 2010 and 2015, rural poverty headcount fell from 10.12 to 4.52 million people, while the rural poverty rate declined from 24.3 to 10.5 percent. However, during this period, Guangxi's share within total rural poor in China rose from 6.1 percent to 8.1 percent. This is due to Guangxi having a slower poverty reduction rate than the national average. While China had a poverty reduction rate of 20 percent per year, Guangxi had only a 15 percent annual decrease for the same period. Consequently, Guangxi is still one of the 8 provinces in China with rural poverty rates above the 10 percent mark and, given its population size, is one of the six provinces with more than 4 million rural poor (as of 2015).² Guangxi is certainly an important area in the battle to eradicate poverty in China by 2020.

As of 2016, the selected counties account for 10.9 million rural population, which represents approximately 43 percent of the rural population in the province; and for 1.6 million rural poor, which represent approximately 41 of the rural poor in the province.³ Moreover, the selected counties include 9 out of the 12 autonomous counties (which sit specific ethnic minorities). The geographic distribution of the counties includes counties near the border with Vietnam, and counties in the mountain ranges of the north of the province (bordering Yunnan, Guizhou and Hunan provinces), as well as one county bordering Guangdong province to the east. No counties -however- are included limiting the gulf of Tonkin, which is perhaps the most prosperous area of the province. Most selected counties are in mountain areas, and a few in the river plains at the center of the province. The three counties selected for this technical assessment also exemplify this geographic diversity: one autonomous county (Du'an), one county in the mountain range (Tianlin) and one county in the river plains (Teng). As will be explained later, these three counties are also diverse in terms of their ethnic minority composition.

Children in poverty in most of the 28 counties represent between 20 and 30 percent of the poor population, a percentage that is not systematically different from the share of children in other poor counties. Similarly, the share of elderly among the poor ranges between 10 and 15 percent for most counties, without systematic difference between selected and non-selected poverty-stricken counties. There is no evidence of age composition having an association with poverty rates in the 28 counties, vis-à-vis other poverty counties in Guangxi.

The share of adult females represents between 25 and 30 percent of the poor in all poverty counties, which involves that the share of adult men is on average 7.8 percentage points higher. The male/female ratio in poverty counties is 112.3, which is slightly higher than the province average of 111.61, as of 2016. This evidence seems to indicate that there are no gender imbalance differences between selected and non-selected poverty counties, although poverty counties seem to have a slightly more imbalanced gender ratio than the rest of the province.⁴

² Data for 2015 from National Bureau of Statistics of China (2016), *Poverty Monitoring Report of Rural China 2016*, tables 8-1-2 and 8-1-3.

³ World Bank Staff estimates based on poverty data provided by Guangxi Poverty Reduction Office.

⁴ World Bank Staff estimates based on poverty data provided by Guangxi Poverty Reduction Office. Provincial male/female ration comes from Guangxi Statistical Yearbook 2017 (table 2.1). The staff did not have access to the sex distribution of children in poverty. Assuming a 50-50 distribution we compute the 112.3 male/female ratio among the

Only 5 out of the 28 counties have a proportion of minorities below 10 percent (Teng is one of them). Another 5 have ethnic minorities representing around half the poor (Tianlin is one of them). The rest of the selected counties have ethnic minorities representing more than 80 percent of the poor, and in some cases even more than 90 percent (Du'an is a case). However, many non-selected poverty counties have very high proportions of ethnic minorities in its poverty population, which indicates that ethnic composition is not a determinant of poverty rate, nor selection of poverty counties (**Error! Reference source not found.**, bottom right panel).⁵ The proportion of ethnic minorities among the poor in the 28 counties is 67.6 percent, slightly higher than in non-selected counties (63.9 percent).

2.2 Guangxi Consolidated Poverty Reduction Program (the “Program”)

As proposed by the Guangxi Poverty Reduction Office, the geographic boundary of this program for results operation (P4R) is circumscribed to 28 counties (xiàn). Guangxi province has a total of 14 prefecture-level districts sub-divided into 110 county-level divisions. Of these, 54 are defined as either national-level or province-level poverty-stricken counties. These are the 54 counties that are the focus of the “Guangxi Tackling Poverty Thirteen Five Year Plan”. Among the 54 poverty-stricken counties, a subset of 28 has been chosen as the target of the P4R. The selection of these 28 counties is based on the county having at least three out of the following five criteria: (i) the county is a designated poverty-stricken county, (ii) the county has a poverty rate above 11 percent, (iii) the county has a poverty headcount of more than 60,000 people, (iv) the county has a good foundation for industrialization policy and/or (v) the county’s local government has expressed willingness in participating in the program. **Error! Reference source not found.** below lists the selected counties and their main characteristics

To ensure the sharper focus on achieving the Government 2020 poverty reduction targets, the Result Areas of this PforR cover a key subset of the Government program, which are to the extent feasible aligned with the government’s own targets. The result areas were selected considering that they: (i) make a strong contribution to achieving the government’s 2020 poverty alleviation targets; (ii) must be linked to specific measurable results; (iii) provide “value added” in terms of interventions that are innovative, scalable or expand upon on-going and planned piloted initiatives; and (iv) incentivize behavioral changes. Given these criteria, the focus of the activities to be covered under this PforR would fall into three Result Areas, which aim to balance the increased access to rural income enhancing investments, and contribute directly or indirectly to the achievement of the 2020 poverty eradication goals, and related systems improvement actions needed to enhance the delivery of the CPRP and evaluation of its results. Specifically, the proposed PforR will focus on the following Results Areas (for further detailed boundary of the activities please refer to Table 3-1, Section 3.1):

- **Results Area 1.** Improved Income Generation for Rural Poor. The goal is to contribute to enhancing the impact of the CPRP in raising rural incomes, including poor households. The types of measures to be supported under the PforR include: (i) Supporting poverty reduction through industrial development (Chanye Fuping) (i.e. support to enterprises, farmer cooperatives and households who participate in Chanye Fuping activities); (ii) Strengthening the institutional capacities of farmer cooperatives; and (iii) Supporting skills training activities (i.e. skills training activities for rural poor for improved productivity).
- **Results Area 2:** Improved Infrastructure for Rural Poor. The goal is to ensure that poor households have adequate access to infrastructure projects funded under the CPRP which is one of the eight plus one criteria to lift poor households from poverty status. The types of measures to be supported under the PforR include: i) the upgrading of the roads to natural villages and rehabilitation of the related infrastructure (i.e. small bridges, road safety facilities, etc.) and; ii) upgrading and/or renovation of village-level drinking water supply infrastructure.
- **Results Area 3:** Cross-cutting Issues for Enhanced Program Implementation. The goal is to support improvement of the institutional arrangements and capacity for the delivery of the poverty reduction outcomes by enabling the region to monitor and evaluate the PforR implementation and the results achieved

poor. A more imbalanced gender population for children would lead to a higher index among the poor in general, making our estimate conservative.

⁵ A linear regression of rural net income on ethnicity renders a R2 of 0.03 and a non-significant correlation coefficient. The Pearson correlation coefficient between the two variables is -0.179.

in a timely manner. The types of measures to be supported under the PforR include: i) support improvement of the institutional arrangements and capacity by enabling Guangxi to plan, monitor and evaluate the PforR implementation and the results achieved by county governments in a timely manner; ii) motivating county governments to achieve poverty eradication targets; and enhancing their implementation capacity.

2.3 Institutional Arrangement

At the provincial level, overall coordination of the GPRP is carried out by the Provincial Leading Group comprised of the governor (the Group Leader), the vice governors responsible for sectors covered in the plan (Deputy Leaders), and the leaders of relevant departments. The Leading Group's Office (LGO) has been established within the Guangxi RPRO serving as the secretariat to the Leading Group for day-to-day management and coordination of the GPRP. To address the additional coordination and support required by the Program, the following seven thematic working groups have been established: (i) general program coordination; (ii) financing; (iii) infrastructure; (iv) industrialization (Chanye Fupin); (v) ecological resettlement; (vi) public services; and (vii) institutional safeguards. The RPRO leads two of these working groups -- general program coordination and infrastructure; Finance Department leads the financing group; DoA leads the industrialization; DRC leads ecological resettlement, and Organization Department leads the one of institutional safeguards.

At the municipal/prefectural level, the Party Committees and mayors have overall responsibility for the poverty reduction work within their jurisdictions, integrating their counties to the provincial level plans, undertake supervision and inspection work, and oversee their counties' exit from poverty.

Counties bear the main responsibility for the day-to-day poverty reduction work, and the county Party Secretary and magistrate are explicitly tasked with primary responsibility and accountability for achieving Guangxi's 2020 poverty reduction targets. The county Poverty Reduction Leading Groups and Poverty Reduction Offices (CPRO) undertake the detailed scheduling of poverty reduction actions, organize the delivery of specific projects, and orchestrate funding use and manpower deployment. Each county has set up a Funds Consolidation Office (FCO), which directly reports to the county Poverty Reduction Leading Group. Jointly with the county Finance Bureaus, the FCOs develop annual fund use plans for the allocation of the annual CARF budget. Each activity defined in the annual fund use plan is assigned to a specific county-level line agency which leads the implementation of their respective activities.

Designated poor county township Party Committees and governments also play an important role in the implementation of the agreed poverty reduction actions. In addition to the crucial task of assembling and digitally entering the household and village data into the NPRS system, the township governments are also responsible for the following tasks: (i) manage human, financial, and material resources; and (ii) organize and implement projects which are undertaken at the township and lower levels. Most townships in the designated poor counties have six to seven full time staff working on their poverty reduction activities. Finally, Guangxi's Regional 13th 5YP for Poverty Reduction explicitly emphasize the important roles of cadres at the village level in poverty reduction work at the grass-roots level. These cadres promote the work of the poor village supervision committee, and play a leading role in community mobilization. The NPRS system assigns specific individuals from the public sector agencies who are responsible for assisting each poor household at the village level. In addition to this, government staff are also sent down from the county and higher levels to reside in the poor townships and designated poor villages for extended periods of time to actively support and guide the poverty reduction work within the townships and villages.

SECTION III: POTENTIAL ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL EFFECTS

3.1 Environmental and Social Screening

The PforR supports a portion of the existing government programs (13th Five Year Plan for Poverty Reduction in Guangxi Province, 13th Five Year Plan hereinafter) in Guangxi Province. During the PforR preparation, initial environmental and social screening was conducted based on the 13th Five Year Plan to in order to provide insights for the definition of the PforR boundary. Activities with potential significant adverse environmental and social impacts are initially excluded from the boundary of PforR, such as major infrastructure construction projects (class 4 and higher roads railway etc.), extractive activities, disaster relief and preparedness, and returning farmlands to forests etc. In addition, there are some activities subject to limitations, such as rural tourism development which is only limited to guest rooms, catering and agricultural tour without involving any physical cultural resources etc. The results of environmental and social screening are summarized in the Annex 1.

The PforR is defined by the consolidated poverty reduction funds for the targeted 28 counties, less excluded activities. Table 3-1 provides the details of the activities within PforR boundary.

Table 3-1 Activities within the PforR Boundary

Activities	Description	Limitation/exclusion
Result Area 1: Improved Income Generation for Rural Poor		Activities subject to EIA Report
Agricultural Industrialization (Chanye Fupin).	1) Crop, vegetables and fruit production (xxx: planting of fruits of high value, e.g. vines, passion fruit, etc.	None
	2) livestock development (cattle, pigs, goat and poultry)	Less than 5,000 pigs at yearly marketed rate ⁶
	3) Tree crops: planting of local species in disused hills, such as oil tea, walnuts, mangos	Should not in or near natural forests and physical cultural resources at/above county level
	4) agriculture products processing: subsidies to village collectives and farmer cooperatives; micro-credit loans; construction of facilities for processing, fresh keeping, refrigeration and storage of farm crops	None
	5) agri-production: construction of agricultural bases for local crops and handicrafts, such activity is of very small scale based on households	None
	6) e-commerce: enhancing construction of telecommunication in rural poor areas	None
	7) rural tourism development: mainly focused on small-scale home stay tourism; construction of tourism center, rural guest rooms and related small infrastructure (sanitation, walking paths, etc.)	Should not in or near physical cultural resources at/above county level and significant natural habitats.
	8) PV: distributed roof-top PV	None
Skills training	9) Agricultural production training	None
	10) Improving the skills of the poor households through	None

⁶ in order to simplify the pollution control in the EA and associated standards and specifications for livestock and poultry farms, the number of the livestock and poultry is usually converted to the number of pigs based on the ratio of waster generation, namely 30 laying hens equivalent to 1 pig, 60 broiler chicken equivalent to 1 pig, 1 dairy cattle equivalent to 10 pigs and 1 beef cattle to 5 pigs (Discharge standard of pollutants for livestock and poultry breeding, GB 18596-2001)

	vocational training programs	
Results Area 2: Improved Infrastructure for Rural Poor.		
Transport	11) construction/rehabilitation/upgrading of village roads;	Should not involve construction/rehabilitation of rural roads with technical class higher than IV; and should not in/near physical cultural resources at/above county level or significant natural habitats.
	12) construction/ rehabilitation of small damaged bridges associated with village roads in rural area;	
	13) embedding road safety facilities for rural roads;	
	14) construction/rehabilitation of rural production roads.	
Water supply	15) supporting safe drinking water: providing water storage tanks, including rain collectors to provide water to rural population scattered in the mountainous areas;	Should not involve dams
Results Area 3: Institutional Enhancement for PforR Implementation.		
Better poverty M&E systems	16) streamlining the institutional structures for poverty planning, budgeting, reporting and M&E of poverty reduction programs;	None
	17) enhancing the use of integrated digital poverty databases.	None
More efficient and effective program budget plan, execution and monitoring	18) developing a guideline for county governments on result-oriented budget plan of CPRP;	None
	19) developing a digital-based budget execution reporting to enable timely tracking and analyzing the progress of budget execution at sectoral/sub-programs level;	None
	20) improving projects selection for enhanced poverty reduction outcomes.	None

The limitations/exclusions applied to the activities in Table 3-1 have been extensively discussed and agreed with the stakeholders throughout the preparation of the ESSA. It is well noted that the activities proposed by each of the poverty county possess very specific details so that the location and scale of each activity can be identified to avoid the natural forests, significant natural habitats, and physical cultural resources:

- Natural Forests. The activities that could potentially affect the quality and health of natural forests are identified as planting of cash trees inside natural forests. In the consolidated fund plan of the program counties, the size and location of the cash trees planting activity has been determined which is small and local species, and the natural forests have been carefully avoided by the county governments. In addition, any project that potentially affects natural forests will be automatically classified into high risk activity requiring EIA Report in China. Thus, exclusion of the cash tree planting activity subject to EIA Report can adequately avoid the natural forests. In each village in Guangxi, a forest guard is hired by the county forestry bureau to take regular patrol in forests according to the forestry management procedure, any planting of cash trees that will cause infringement of natural forests can be immediately found and reported directly to county forestry bureau by the forest guard. The county forestry bureau then will take law enforcement action to stop the illegal planting.
- Natural habitats. The activities that could potentially cause impact on natural habitats are planting of cash trees and rehabilitation of rural roads/bridges. Any of these activities that will affect significant natural habitats, e.g. natural reserves, natural forests, wetland, important waters, are automatically subject to EIA. Thus, any activities subject to EIA Report should be excluded from the Program to avoid the significant natural habitats. In addition, non-significant natural habitats to be affected by the Program are limited to small rivers on which small bridges will be rehabilitated (less than 10 meter), such small size works will not cause significant conversion or degradation of the rivers;
- Physical cultural resources. The activities that could potentially cause impact on physical cultural resources

are planting of cash trees and rural tourism development. The physical cultural resources with the significance at or above county level are in line with the definition of the World Bank, and these assets are registered in government for special protection. Any activities in or near the physical cultural resources above county level are automatically subject to EIA Report, thus any activities subject to EIA Report should be excluded from the Program to avoid the physical cultural resources at or above county level. The physical cultural resources with the value at the level of village or community are being well preserved by the villagers themselves in Guangxi which are thought to be an integral part of local culture (“Feng Shui”), so the physical cultural resources at local level will be well preserved and not affected by the PforR;

- OP 7.50 on International Waterways is triggered as the PforR activities could potentially involve water extraction for rural water supply systems and irrigation from Pearl River Basin, which is regarded as an international waterway, as certain tributaries of the basin originate or flow through Vietnam. China is the downstream riparian of Pear River Basin. In addition, in two out of the 28 counties under the PforR, namely Jinxi and Napo counties in Baise City, there are the following international waterways: Pingmeng River, Yandong River, Kuilan River, Baidu River and Lingai River (in Napo county); Nantan River, Podou River, Qilong River and Longbang River (in Jingxi county). These rivers are the most upstream tributaries of the Pearl River. By supporting rural water supply activities (and without precluding the potential occurrence of irrigation activities within the CPRF), the PforR will improve existing schemes for higher efficiency of irrigation and safe drinking water for rural population. The ESSA confirmed that impact on the transboundary basin and any associated water pollution from the proposed PforR activities is minor. This is because the estimated incremental use of water as a result of the water supply activities under the PforR would be about 0.002% of the water resources available under the basin. Furthermore, the targeted counties under the PforR are located in the downstream of the Pearl River Basin. Therefore, the proposed investments will not affect the water quality or flow in the upstream riparian countries. In addition, with the exception of the international waterways in Napo and Jingxi county, the remaining portion of the Pearl River Basin within the PforR geographical scope consists only of tributaries of a transboundary basin, and said tributaries run exclusively within China, which is also the lowest downstream riparian.
- Generally, any activities subject to EIA Report should be excluded from the Program to avoid the activities located 1) in natural forests; 2) in or near physical cultural resources at/above county level; 3) in or near significant natural habitats.

The provincial implementing agency is well staffed with adequate knowledge and rich experience in project management with regards to IBRD loans, will take the lead responsibility for identifying the activities triggering the limitations/exclusions. Besides, the consolidated fund which the IBRD loan will be mainstreamed into at the level of the counties can be tracked down to the specific activity. Thus, through the financial management of the consolidated fund, all the activities triggering the exclusion/limitation criteria can be excluded from the Program.

The activities to be supported by the PforR are small-size given the limited land area available in the 28 poverty counties where the rocky mountainous landform dominates about 90% of their land area. With the limitations/exclusions, the activities within the boundary are expected to be suitable for the PforR.

3.2 Potential Environmental Benefits and Risks

3.2.1 Potential Environmental Benefits

Improved sanitation and traffic safety: The proposed PforR is anticipated to create positive environmental and public health benefits in terms of improving sanitation conditions of poor villages and improving human health of villagers through the implementation of the activities of rural water supply (village-level water and sanitation). Through provision of clean drinking water to villagers will effectively reduce the morbidity rate of water-borne diseases, largely improving the health conditions of the villagers in poor rural area; The traffic safety in rural areas will be greatly improved through implementation of the activity of transport. The accidents of traffic should be reduced and the quality of life and the livelihood of rural people should be improved.

3.2.2 Potential Environmental Risks

Certain limited environmental risks are expected as part of the implementation of activities supported under the PforR. In the order of level of concern, these potential environmental risks with mitigation measures are described below:

- **Dust, noise, general solid waste, wastewater, and waste gas:** Construction of physical works will cause the impacts of dust, noise, solid waste and wastewater. Given the limited size of these activities, the intensity of the pollution source is quite weak. Such effects are site-specific and can be effectively mitigated by measures such as water spray, dust-net, site-fencing, vehicle cleaning; use of low-noise equipment and prohibition of construction during nighttime, and collection and transportation of general solid waste in a timely manner. It is noted that these measures are readily available and compulsory and well implemented in the Guangxi Province.
- **Non-point pollution:** the program will largely promote the development of high value vegetable, fruits and cash trees. Given the limited water resource in the 28 poverty counties, water conservation techniques, e.g. drip irrigation, will be used and the application of fertilizers will be scientifically adopted. Thus the pollution from the agricultural activities would become minor.
- **Vegetation clearing and soil erosion:** construction of the physical works will cause vegetation clearing and soil erosion. Given the geological features of the PforR where the 90% of its land area is dominated by rocky mountainous landform, the shallow soil horizon is prone to disturbance. However as most of the activities will take place in flat area where the soil horizon is thick and the activities will not cause severe disturbance, the vegetation clearing and soil erosion is even minor given the very small size activities of the PforR. It is expected that only tree crops and rural roads will be developed on the stony mountainous areas. Planting tree crops will require excavation of individual pits and clearing of surface vegetation and may result in certain extent of soil erosion. While, such surface disturbance is limited to the small scope of each individual tree, and the impact is temporary and only occurs during tree plantation stage. In the long term, the tree crops will help conserve the soil and water in the stony mountains. Rural roads works are only limited to construction or rehabilitation of small roads with lower grade. Such small works will not involve much earth work and will be completed within very short period. Typical measures for soil erosion control widely used in transport sector in China, such as boundary ditches, settling tanks, retaining walls, can adequately mitigate the impacts.
- **Social disturbance, including traffic safety and congestion, and construction safety:** Construction of physical works, e.g. rehabilitation of roads and rural water supply, under the Results Area 2; and construction of the facilities for the Agricultural Industrialization under Result Area 1, will cause such effect of social disturbance. Given the very small size of the activities, the engineering is simple without causing any high safety risk and may not cause large demand for labor. In addition, the traffic flow in the rural roads is very low, and the works of such small size will be completed very soon. Thus, the effect of social disturbance is very limited and temporary, and can be easily mitigated by carefully designed traffic management plan prepared by the contractor.
- **Solid waste and wastewater:** operation of the agricultural products processing facilities and rural tourism development will generate solid waste and wastewater requiring treatment. The agriculture products processing is largely centered on the production of raw agricultural products, e.g. walnut, tea, or vegetable oil. The solid waste produced during the operation is degradable and recyclable, and can be easily mitigated by available measures. The wastewater is treated by small on-site wastewater treatment facilities; and the by-products of oil processing include the spent bleaching earth which could be used as fertilizer or recovered to produce non-food-grade oil.
The rural tourism sector is limited to small scale rural household caterings/guest rooms, and rural tourism demo bases. The wastewater and solid waste are in the same nature of household wastewater and household solid waste respectively. They are easily mitigated by measures such as small wastewater treatment facility and collection and transportation for landfill respectively. In Guangxi Province, the septic tank with bio-gas device is widely used in rural households which is also used to deal with the wastewater from household guest rooms or catering service.
- **Health issue related to pest management:** the activities of high quality crops and fruits, as well as the economic forests, will involve the use of pesticides, which may cause the concern on public and occupational health. It is noted that the list of pesticides allowed to be used in China is compatible with international ones and there is well established management system for pest control chemicals in China and Guangxi Province. With comprehensive laws/regulations, established institutional system and implementation mechanism, the safety of pest management practice is well managed.
- **Livestock and poultry waste management:** The activity of livestock and poultry farming will generate waste feed, animal waste and carcasses, and wastewater, which need to be properly managed. Livestock and poultry waste contains nitrogen, phosphorus, and other excreted substances which may result in air emissions of ammonia and other gases and may pose a potential risk of contamination to surface or groundwater

resources through leaching and runoff. It is noted that the activities of livestock and poultry in the 28 poverty counties are of very small size due to the limited land available. For instance, the size of household livestock farm average 3 pigs, and of the cooperatives average less than 5,000 pigs.

In addition, these activities might cause minimal risks that do not need further assessment:

- Health and safety risk: as the activities are small-size and labor-intensive, without using large machinery or equipment, or hazardous chemicals (except for pest management), the risk of health and safety is minimal;
- Influx of workers: there will be no labor camps as the works are of small size and simple structure, the number of workers will be quite limited, the risk of influx of workers causing safety, health and cultural shocks is minimal;
- Cultural impact: the rural tourism development is intended to provide the experience of rural life-style for small number of tourists, e.g. catering, rural scene seeing and fruit picking; the core part of the ethnic culture, e.g. ceremonial and traditional performance that is vulnerable to cultural impact, is not to be performed in the tourism activities. The cultural impact is thus minor.

In summary, the proposed PforR activities are simple and small, and will not have significant environmental impacts and risks. Potential adverse impacts are minimal, minor or otherwise moderate and limited to specific sites, and can be effectively mitigated by following the existing technical regulations for environmental management in China. The overall environmental risk for the PforR is moderate.

3.3 Potential Social Benefits and Risks

3.3.1 Potential Social Benefits

The Guangxi Poverty Reduction Program aims to contribute significant social and environmental benefits in a sustainable way for Guangxi by 2020 through lifting 4.52 million poor people from 5000 villages and 54 counties out of poverty. In particular, the PforR will directly benefit 1.74 million poor people of 0.42 million households from 28 poor counties, among which, 67.64% are poor ethnic minorities and 40.48% are poor women.

The Program will increase the direct social benefits through job opportunities creation and income generation targeted poor households through the measures to be supported, including agricultural industrialization (chanyefupin), government-directed rural finance programs; infrastructure, related technical training on farmer cooperatives and farmers. A huge number of rural poor people will have relatively stable and reliable income channels and revenue sources through the Program implementation. The increase of income per capita of poor will be reached the average level of Guangxi by 2020. Through the development of industry, approximately 0.5 million impoverished people within 28 counties will be driven out of poverty through job opportunities provision, each poor will master 1 to 2 practical technologies to enhance the development capacity of impoverished areas.

3.3.2 Potential Social Risks

The assessment of social risks of the activities to be supported by the Program, concluded that there would not be significant social conflicts caused by them. Some social issues are well addressed by the Program technical assessment, such as poor farmer cooperative benefit sharing mechanism/modules (see DLI 2), poor family access to affordable rural water supply, the rural roads operation and maintenance. However, there are some social potential risks/issues to be assessed, such as land acquisition, land donation and land transfer, ethnic minority development, public participation and grievance redress measures.

Land acquisition, land donation and land transfer

Land Acquisition. The social risk assessment concluded that infrastructure delivery activities to be supported under the Program are small scale, which will be improved or upgraded in existing right of way in village level. Field survey confirmed that any land needed for the upgrading or rehabilitation of village roads will be carried out through land donation rather than land acquisition process. Therefore, there may have not any land acquisition and resettlement impacts under the PforR boundaries. However, the ESSA takes more conservative approach and includes the description of the land acquisition assessment considering any potential land

requirement for such road rehabilitation and upgrading works through land acquisition, in order to minimize potential social risks associated with such infrastructure activities should small size land acquisition be required. **Land donation.** If the rural new facilities or infrastructure ownership belongs to the poor village collective, such as village roads, water supply facilities, the land occupation is small size, about 0.3mu- 3mu and will be acquired through land donations manner. In general, the donated lands are allocated from village collective reserved land or farmer individuals, which is decided by village councils. However, land donation procedure needs to be embedded by a participatory and inclusive approach in order to ensure poor people interests protection.

Land use right transfer. In terms of poverty reduction through industrialization, some agriculture economic activities such as agri-production, livestock, economic crops, including tree crops, will require voluntary agriculture of forest land use right transfer between households and cooperatives or enterprises. Land transfer applies to households' rural land use rights, either through land rental or as a contribution of land as shares for farmer cooperative membership which is basis for the payment of dividends. In the latter case, there are generally two prevailing models: (i) land owner joins cooperative using its farmland as shares but continues to farm it individually (prevailing model in sample counties); and (ii) land owner joins cooperative using its agriculture land as shares, and land will be put under unified management (e.g. through farm mechanization, etc.). In the latter case, the land owner may or may not be actively involved in the cooperative work, depending on its household situation (e.g. land owner may be working in urban areas but wishes to participate in cooperative work as shareholder, or land owner may be working for the cooperative as employee). As such, land use rights transfer (LURT) assessment is necessary in order to ensure that the land transfer process is voluntary, transparent, fair, and beneficial to farmers. However, given the potential social risks associated with land transfers from farmers to enterprises and taking into consideration the principles of the development oriented poverty reduction focus of the proposed PforR, which requires active participation of targeted poor in agriculture-related economic activities, the technical assessment has excluded land transfers from farmers to enterprises for the purpose of expanding enterprise own production base from poverty reduction leading enterprise accreditation criteria under the DLI1. The purpose is to encourage a larger share of purchases of agriculture raw materials from farmers and farmer cooperatives under DLI3.

Ethnic Minorities

The Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region is a multi-ethnic autonomous region with 12 resident nationalities including Zhuang, Han, Yao, Miao, Dong, Maonan, Hui, Jing, Yi, Shui, Mulao and Gelao. In addition, there are more than 40 other ethnic elements, such as Manchu, Mongolian, Korean, Bai, Tibetan, Li and Tujia. Zhuang nationality is the most populous minority in Guangxi Region. According to the main data bulletin of the Sixth National Census in 2010, the minority population in Guangxi Region was 19.58 million, accounting for 37.94% of the total population. The minority population of Zhuang nationality ranks first in the country, it occupies 31.39% of the total population in Guangxi region. Guangxi Region has a total of 12 ethnic autonomous counties⁷ (not including Zhuang nationality). There are 56 ethnic townships in Guangxi region (not including Zhuang nationality), among them, there are 48 Yao Townships, 8 Miao Townships, 1 Dong township, 1 Hui Township, 1 Yao and Miao Township and 1 Mulao Township. There are 62 towns with above 30% minority population and 30 towns with above 80% minority population.

The activities under the government program have 3.4 million poor people in 2016, of which, there are 2.11 million poor ethnic minority people. The ethnic minority population accounts for 62.17% of the total poor population.

The activities under the PforR cover 28 poor counties, 0.42 million poor households and 1.74 million poor people, of which, there are 1.17 million poor ethnic minority people (accounting for 67.64% of the poor population) and 9 poor minority autonomous counties. Table 3-2 shows specific data.

According to the data provided by the regional Poverty Alleviation Office, the main causes of poverty were: lack of funds (accounting for 29.38%), education costs (18.59%), illness costs (17.22%), lack of technology (8.10%), labor shortage (7.67%), disability (7.55%) and so on. The situation provided by the Ethnic and Religious Committee and

⁷ They are Longsheng Autonomous County, Jinxiu Yao Autonomous County, Rongshui Miao Autonomous County, Sanjiang Dong Autonomous County, Longlin Autonomous County (approved on January 1, 1953), Du'an Yao Autonomous County, Bama Yao Autonomous County, Fuchuan Yao Autonomous County, Luo Cheng Mulao Autonomous County, Huanjiang Maonan Autonomous County, Dahua Yao Autonomous County and Gongcheng Yao Autonomous County.

the Poverty Alleviation Office shows that the causes of poverty among ethnic minorities and non-ethnic minorities are basically the same.

Table 3-2 Population data of Guangxi region, impoverished counties and Project counties

Areas	Total population (million)	Poverty population (million)	Ethnic population (million)	Ethnic poverty population (million)	Poverty proportion of ethnic minorities (%)
Guangxi region	48.38	3.40	17.81	2.11	62.17
28 program counties	12.61	1.74	/	1.17	67.64

Data resource: 2016 data provided by regional poverty alleviation office.

Ethnic minorities basically speak both Mandarin Chinese and Muttersprache. All the 11 native ethnic minorities in Guangxi region have their own languages except the Chinese dialects of the Hui nationality, the ethnic languages are called Zhuang, Jing, Yao, Miao, Dong, Mulao, Maonan, Kinh, Yi, shui, Gelao and so on. The population of using shui and Gelao languages is in a declining trend, these two languages are already endangered. Besides, the Chinese dialect has 6 kinds of dialects, they are the Cantonese, the southwest Mandarin, the Hakka dialect, Pinghua, Xiang and Min dialect, etc. Some nationalities such as Zhuang and Miao nationality has its own writing.

Poor ethnic minority communities are equally identified and enjoy benefits through the 13th Five-year plan implementation. However, it is necessary to assess whether the 13th FYP of poverty alleviation in Guangxi Region required respect for ethnic minorities' cultures and customs and benefit ethnic minorities in a culturally adaptable manner.

Public participation and grievance redress measures

The PforR will contribute to lift all poor rural households out of poverty regardless of their gender, ethnic or vulnerability status. At various stages, both beneficiary population and affected people (AP) should be consulted about the likely positive and negative impacts of the Program, in particular ethnic minorities, women and other vulnerable groups. Public consultations and education program for poor in poor villages are necessary to increase their ownership, and ensure their needs or demands can be considered and incorporated into the Program.

In addition, complaints or grievances of the poor people will be handled in accordance with the grievance redress procedure established under the Program if any. An appeal can progress through a number of stages if the appellant is not satisfied with the initial response. The procedure will remain valid throughout the Program's implementation period.

SECTION IV: ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT SYSTEM

4.1 Legal Framework Applicable to the PforR

Based on environmental and social screening as described in Chapter 3, the main environmental management for the proposed Program will involve environmental protection system, especially for pest management and livestock waste management.

4.1.1 Environmental Protection Legislations

Since the promulgation of its first Environmental Protection Law in 1979, China has gradually established a comprehensive environmental management legal framework, becoming one of the region's most dynamic environmental law frameworks. The current framework includes more than 80 laws and statutes, 120 regulations and over 1,000 standards and technical guidelines at national level primarily addressing pollution control, public health issues, natural resource conservation and management of the environment. China is currently reforming its environmental management system by enhancing preventive approach, implementation of action plans and law enforcement. Since 2014, China government is enacting or updating many laws and regulations. A selective list of main laws, regulations and guidelines are included in **Annex2**.

Environmental Protection Law (NPC, 2014)

This law (lastly amended in April 2014) is known as the most stringent environmental law ever in China, thus becoming the umbrella law for environmental protection system. It lays out general principles for environmental protection and describes key instruments for environmental management. It requires enterprises, public institutions and any other producers/business operators shall prevent and reduce environmental pollution and ecological destruction, and shall bear the liability for their damage caused by them (Article 6). It also requires that compilation of development plans and construction of projects with environmental impacts shall be subject to environmental impact assessment (Article 19). This statute divides environmental management functions between national and local environmental administrations with powers to enforce environmental legal requirements. In addition, the EPL states that the state adopts regulatory instruments such as environmental protection target accountability and performance evaluation system (Article 26), establish ecological protection compensation mechanism (Article 31), "Three Simultaneousness" system⁸(Article 41), total emission control system for key pollutants (Article 44), and pollution permit system (Article 45) etc. The EPL includes stipulations on information disclosure and public participation (Chapter 5) and recognize the right of citizens, legal persons and other organizations to report and complain environmental pollution and ecological damage activities of polluters. The new EPL authorizes environmental departments with power to stop or shut down non-compliance production and enterprises, and enforce cumulative non-compliance penalty on daily basis without capping limit. It also provides provision on personal detention for those responsible for violation (but not up to the level classified as criminal charge). It also requires consideration of environmental impacts during the formulation of economic and technological policies by central, provincial and municipal governments.

The EPL establishes a number of key implementation systems which are being used as main instruments in China for environmental safeguards. These systems are supported by a large number of regulations, implementation rules, standards and guidelines. The main systems include:

- **Environmental Impact Assessment System:** All construction projects and relevant development plans are subject to regulation of EIA system. Depending on the significance level of impacts, the government uses the categorization method to manage the EIA for construction projects. More is discussed below under the EIA Law.
- **"Three Simultaneousness" system:** Pollution control facilities must be designed, constructed and operated simultaneously with the main project. The implementation of "Three Simultaneousness" is enforced by relevant levels of environmental protection bureaus (EPBs) which review and approve the EIAs, and carry out the verification inspection upon the completion construction and commencement of operation.

⁸Pollution control facilities must be designed, constructed and operated as the same time with the main project.

- Max. pollution load control system: The State adopts a Max. pollution load control system for key pollutants. The total emission quota is allocated to all provinces which will further allocate down to enterprise level. All enterprises are required to meet both the emission standards (national and local) and the pollution load control target. Areas failing to meet the pollution load targets are banned from approving new construction projects with additional emission of regulated pollutants.
- Pollution permit system: All entities discharging pollution are required to apply for permit for pollution emission. The permit specifies the types of pollutants, ways of emission and total emission quota, and period of validity. The permit system is regulated by local EPBs which will review, approve the permit and supervise the compliance.

Environmental Impact Assessment Law (NPC, 2002, amended in 2015)

Most of the physical activities to be supported by the PforR are required to conduct EA, in the form of either EIA Form or EIA Registration Form, which are managed by the EIA Law. This law is a subset of the nation's larger Environmental Protection Law. In October 2002, the former EIA Regulation was upgraded to a new national EIA law, which entered into force in September 2003. Since then, the EIA law has been amended in 2015 and being implemented since Sept. 2016. The amended EIA law is centered on the simplification of the project approval procedure and enhancing the penalty for illegal activities violating the EIA Law.

The EIA Law, together with a set of technical guidelines, provides a comprehensive EIA system that addresses the full range of environmental issues related to construction projects and plans.

The development projects are classified as either Full-assessment (significant environmental impacts, requiring a full-scale EIA, similar to category A of the WB), Partial-specific EA (limited adverse environmental impacts in scope and severity, requiring a simplified EIA report known as EIA Form, similar to Category B of the WB), or EA filing (likely to have minimal or negligible adverse environmental impacts, requiring filling an EIA registration form only for record in the EPB, similar to Category C of the WB). The categorization of EA is based on the nature, location, sensitivities and scale of the projects. The *Inventory for EA Categorization for Construction Project issued by the MEP* (updated 2017) specifically provides the criteria to classify the EA documents for different projects. This inventory defines specifically the sensitive areas and the categorization for projects in different sectors, based on which the explicit category of EA for the project can be determined. Following is the summary of the sensitive areas, if any project has the potential to adversely affect them, the project should be automatically classified as significant risk requiring EIA Report:

- Sensitive Area One: natural reserves; famous scenery; world heritage sites; marine special protection zones; protection areas for drinking water source;
- Sensitive Area Two: basic farmland; basic grassland; forest park; geological park; important wetland; natural forest; significant natural habitats; breeding place for key wild animals and vegetation; sites for spawning, feeding, wintering and migratory for key aquatic species; natural fishing waters...;
- Sensitive Area Three: areas with the main function zoned for residential, health care, education, scientific research, administrative, as well as cultural heritage protection.

As part of the EIA system, the *Interim Measures for Public Consultation in EIA* (SEPA, 2006.) provides further detailed requirements and procedures of public consultation and information disclosure. In summary, these include:

- Two rounds of information disclosure: (1) Project owner shall issue public notice within 7 days of hiring EA institute, announcing the start of EIA preparation, project brief and key issues requiring public opinions; (2) Project owner shall carry out second round of information disclosure before submission of EIA report for approval, disclosing the key findings of EIA in terms of impacts and mitigation measures, as well as the ways to get simplified version of EIA report and provide feedbacks. The project owner is obliged to disclose the simplified version of the EIA report in public places, or internet, or through other ways convenient to public.
- Public consultation: Project owner or EA institute shall, after public announcement and disclosure of simplified EIA report, carry out public consultation through public survey, consultation with experts, public meetings, discussion workshop or hearings etc. to seek public opinions.

It should be noted that public consultation requirement only applies to those projects requiring EIA Report (equivalent to Category A of the WB safeguards OP). For projects that subject to EIA Form (Category B), consultation by project

proponent is not mandatory, except when special impact assessment for certain environmental elements is required as annex. The MEP or local EPBs shall announce, (through their website or other ways convenient for public accessibility) the receipt of EIA documents for review, and disclose the reports as well as the decision results after review.

Water Conservation and Erosion Control Law (NPC, 2010): This law is to prevent water pollution and soil erosion from activities that may disturb the ground. All projects that may cause soil erosion are required to prepare a water conservation and soil erosion control plan (as part of overall EIA package), a prerequisite for approval of the project. The plan is approved by relevant water resources authority before the full EIA package is submitted to environmental authority for approval.

Air Pollution Control Law (NPC, 2015): This law is a fundamental legislation for air pollution control. It requires all air pollution emission entities must comply with national or local emission standards (Article 13), and must report to local environmental departments on their air pollution emission control facilities and pollutants types, amount and emission concentration (Article 12). All new construction, renovation and expansion are subject to air pollution impact assessment, and approved and verified by relevant environmental departments (Article 11). It requires environmental authority (MEP) of State Council to establish air pollution monitoring network. It allows local governments to develop local environmental standards which must be stricter than national standards (Article 7).

Solid Waste Pollution Control Law (NPC, 2004): This law requires the environmental authority to establish solid waste pollution monitoring system. All projects that generate solid wastes are subject to environmental impact assessment (Article 13) and “Three Simultaneousness” requirements (Article 14). It includes general solid waste control provisions, as well as specific provisions for industrial solid waste, domestic garbage and hazardous waste (Chapter 3). More specifically, it requires proper collection, use and disposal of livestock waste (Article 20).

Other laws and regulations related to general environmental protection issues in the activities to be supported by the Program include:

- Water Conservation and Erosion Control Law (NPC, 2010)
- Wild Animal Protection Law (NPC, 1988)
- Wild Plant Protection Law (NPC, 1998)
- Regulations on Nature Reserves (SC, 1994)
- Regulations on Strengthening Protection of Ancient and Famous Trees (National Greening Committee, 2016)

4.1.2 Livestock Waste Management

The legal system related to livestock sector consists of laws, regulations, policies, technical specifications and standards. The system stipulates the responsibilities of each concerned party and the requirements for pollution control. It also provides guidance on livestock waste management in the technical policy, standards and technical specifications. But the waste management of household livestock farms in small size (less than 100 pigs at annual marketed rate in Guangxi) is not covered by the system. However, given the specific context of the livestock development in Guangxi where the scale of small household livestock farms is constrained by the limited land available and the livestock development policy of Guangxi, this gap is not substantial. The current system covering standards, norms and policies, is sufficiently comprehensive and considered adequate to handle the livestock waste management issues for livestock farms larger than 100 pigs.

Livestock Law (NPC, 2005, amended in 2015):

This law requires the owners of livestock farms fulfill the obligation of the environmental protection, and accept the supervision and inspection conducted by relevant government authorities. The government authority in charge of livestock and veterinarian is responsible for supervising and managing the livestock sector within its jurisdiction area. This law also stipulates the criteria for permitting the business license for livestock farm and livestock community as follows: 1) production facilities commensurate with its scale; 2) veterinarian staff in service; 3) animal epidemic prevention conditions; 4) established environmental facilities to treat the wastewater and animal waste. In addition, this law prohibits the livestock activity from the following areas: 1) protection zone for drinking water source, scenic area, core area and buffer zone of nature reserve; 2) densely populated areas; 3) other prohibited areas.

Pollution Control Regulation for Scaled Livestock and Poultry Farms (State Council, 2013):

The criteria for defining the scaled livestock farms will be decided by each provincial government. Government at various levels should enhance the livestock and poultry pollution control, and devote more resources to stimulating the pollution control and integrated use of the wastes (Clause 4). It also defines the responsibilities of the relevant government departments in the pollution control of livestock farms:

- The EPB is responsible for the overall supervision and management of the pollution control in livestock farms;
- The livestock bureau is responsible for guidance and service for integrated use of livestock wastes;
- township governments should assist the relevant government authorities in the livestock pollution control (Clause 5);

This regulation further technically requires that the focus of EA be placed on the types and amount of wastes, integrated use and sanitary treatment of wastes, the information on the land application of animal waste, disposal or direct discharge of animal waste, and the potential impacts on water body, soil and human health; this regulation also promote the preferable technical pathway for livestock treatment and disposal through land application, composting, or bio-gas generation.

Livestock and Poultry Farms and plots Registration Methods in Guangxi Zhuang Nationality Autonomous Region (Guangxi Regional Government, 2007):

the criteria for scaled livestock farms in Guangxi: pigs ≥ 100 (annual standing population); beef cattle ≥ 20 (annual standing population), and; the criteria for livestock plot: pigs ≥ 300 (annual standing population), and beef cattle ≥ 60 (annual standing population). This means that the smaller size household livestock farms to be supported by the program may not be subject to the Pollution Control Regulation for Scaled Livestock and Poultry Farms, thus not further covered by the technical system, including the technical specifications and the Pollution Discharge Standard for Livestock and Poultry Farms (GB 18596-2001).

Given that this PforR will be focused on the scaled livestock farms owned by cooperatives and the size of household livestock farms will be typically very small, such gap is considered to be minor.

4.2.2 Pest Management

Pesticide Management Rule (SC, 1997, amended in 2001 and 2017): China adopts the pesticide registration system (Clause 7). The pesticide production should be in compliance with the national policy (Clause 16). The country implements the production permit system for pesticide production. (Clause 17). The package of pesticide should be labeled and comply with the national requirements. The label should show the name, type, gradients and content, toxicity and identification, applicability, application method and dosage, technical requirements and warnings, date of production, and e-code (Clause 22). The country implement the business permit system for pesticide. The business operators once have the following capacities, they are eligible for pesticide business permit: 1) their staff should acquire the knowledge on pesticide and pest management, well know the pesticide management rule and be capable of providing guidance on safe and reasonable use of pesticide; 2) they possess the business place and storage facility which are effectively segregated from the drinking water source, residential area and other commodities. Such place and facility should be equipped with protective facilities; 3) they have the established system on quality management, record keeping, protection, emergency response and storage management (Clause 24). The agricultural department at or above county level should enhance the guidance and service on pesticide use, and establish complete system for safe and reasonable use of pesticide; and should organize the promotion of pesticide safe use technique and regulate the use of pesticide. The departments of forestry, food and health should enhance the technical guidance on safe and reasonable use of pesticide in forestry, food storage and health sectors respectively. The EPB should enhance the technical guidance on the pollution control and environmental protection during the use of pesticide (Clause 30). The users should properly store the pesticide and take protective measures during the making up and use. The agricultural department at or above county level should survey and make statistical information periodically on the production, sale and use of pesticide and report to the government of the same level in timely manner.

Regulations on Prevention and Control of Forest Pests and Diseases (SC, 1989)

This regulation sets out the pest control principle of “Prevention first, combined with comprehensive treatment”. It requires an Integrated Pest Management practice, with priority of forest structure operation and a combination of physical, biological and chemical measures. It specifies that forestry bureaus at county (and above) level are responsible for the forest pest control within their jurisdictions, with pest control units under the forestry bureaus as specific implementation units. Forestry Work Stations (FWS) at township governments are responsible for organizing pest control in their townships.

It specifies pest prevention measures requirements for forest owners to take in afforestation, tending and cutting operation. Anyone finds pest deceases should timely report to local government or local forestry bureau, which shall organize timely pest control actions and report to municipal/provincial forestry bureaus. County (and above level) forestry bureaus are required to develop forest pest control plan and conduct periodic monitoring.

The regulation requires that pesticide application must be conducted following relevant regulations and specifications to prevent environmental pollution, and safety of human and ecosystem.

Rule of Safe Use of Pesticide (1982, Ministry of Agriculture): this rule categorizes the pesticides into three categories based on toxicity, namely high toxic pesticide, moderate toxic pesticide and low toxic pesticide; and stipulates the applicability of the three categories. It stipulates the requirements for purchase, storage and transportation of pesticides, and the personal protective requirements for users.

Rule of Limited Use of Pesticide (2002, No. 17 Order, Ministry of Agriculture): it stipulates the conditions for permits the limited use pesticides and the procedure for request review and clearance.

Inventory of low toxic and low residue pesticides for planting sector, 2014, issued by the Ministry of Agriculture: the inventory lists totally 91 types of pesticides broadly used in agriculture. Most of the types are being supported by the government subsidies and preferable purchase. Among the 91 types, there are 29 types of insecticide, 40 types of bactericide, herbicide and 7 types of plant growth regulator. In addition, it should be noted that there are 33 types of biological pesticides being listed in the inventory.

Other regulations related to the pest management include:

- Management Method for Pesticides registration (2017, MOA);
- Management Method for Pesticides Production Permit (2017, MOA);
- Management Method for Pesticides Sale Permit (2017, MOA);
- Management Method for Pesticides Test (2017, MOA); and
- Management Method for Labeling and Instructions of Pesticides (2017, MOA)

Assessment

Overall, there is a well established legal framework in China governing the general environmental protection and especially the livestock waste and pest management. The related risks and impacts on generation, collection, storage, treatment and disposal of livestock waste; as well as on formulation, production, test, labeling, sale, and use are well covered by a series of national and local laws, regulations, procedures and technical specifications, which are consistent with key principles of PforR Policy and Directive.

In addition, both China and Guangxi have established sound Pest Management system which is consistent with the requirements of the IBRD and WHO. If effectively implemented, this system can prevent or mitigate potential impacts caused by this sector.

4.2 Implementation of Environmental Management Systems

There are mainly three types of activities that may involve physical investments: Agricultural Industrialization, Transport and Water Supply. The activities under the PforR are small size physical works with little or limited

environmental impacts. Addressing such impacts would involve the following main environmental management systems:

Table 4-1 Environmental Activities and Related Environmental Management System

Program Activities	Potential Adverse Environmental Effects	Environmental Management System
Agricultural Industrialization (<i>Chanye Fupin</i>)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Wastewater; - Solid waste, e.g. livestock waste, general waste; - Vegetation clearing and soil erosion; - Noise; - Dust; - Health issue related to use of pesticide 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Environmental Assessment - Pest Management - Livestock Waste Management
Transport	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Solid waste; - Vegetation clearing and soil erosion; - Noise; - Dust 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Environmental Assessment
Water Supply	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Wastewater; - Solid waste; - Soil erosion; - Noise; - Dust 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Environmental Assessment

4.2.1 Environmental Assessment System

The environmental assessment system in China consists of environmental impact assessment, mitigation implementation, monitoring and supervision.

Screening

According to the *Categorized Directory for Environmental Management of Construction Projects (MEP, 2017)*, the following activities under the PforR will have the potential impacts that will trigger the environmental impact assessment process:

Table 4-3 EIA Category of Program Activities (MEP, 2017)

Activities	Full EIA Report	EIA Form	EIA Registration
Livestock and poultry farms, and livestock plot ⁹	X Scale more than 5,000 annual marketed pigs (or equivalent, or in sensitive areas)	-	√(all Others)
Crop cultivation ¹⁰	-	X(involving sensitive areas)	√(all Others)
Other agricultural products (including medicinal herbs)	-	X(involving sensitive areas)	√(all Others)
Economic Forests	-	X (involving sensitive areas)	√(all others)

⁹ The household livestock farms of small size are not subject to the EA

¹⁰ Including farmland renovation project

Grain or forage processing	X Using fermentation technology	√(all Others)	
Vegetable oil processing	-	√	
Tourism	X Construction of cable car; marine-based recreational activity; marine aesthetic works	√(all Others)	

In addition, the Guangxi Regional Department of Environmental Protection issued an Inventory of Projects Exempted from EA in 2015, which specifically defines the such small activities to be free of EA:

Table 4-4 Activities Exempted from EA (Guangxi Regional Department of Environmental Protection, 2015)

Activities	Limitations
Small household livestock farms/aquiculture farms; upgrading of livestock plots	The size should be below that provided in <i>Livestock and Poultry Farms and Plots Registration Methods in Guangxi Zhuang Nationality Autonomous Region (Guangxi Regional Government, 2007)</i>
Rural roads at grade less than IV	None
Rehabilitation of existing bridges	Should not involve drinking water sources
rural drinking water safety works	None

The activities to be supported by the PforR are not in sensitive areas. They are small in scale, which are thought to have moderate, minor or minimal environmental impacts, and therefore are not subject to further EA actions beyond filing an EIA registration or preparing EIA Forms in local EPBs, or no EA requirements applicable at all.

According to the classification of environmental authority, managing the EIA for the types of activities under the PforR fall into the authority of county/district EPBs.

EA Review and Approval

The EA review and approval in China is classified into different levels, so the review and approval body will be either MEP or local (provincial, municipal, or county) EPBs, depending on thresholds of investment, level of approval for the project proposals as well as environmental sensitivities.

As currently structured, the EAs for the program activities mentioned-above are all managed by district/county level EPBs. Municipal EPBs will only review and approve projects with heavy pollution or cross-district/county borders. It is envisaged that none of the program activities would require approval from provincial EPB.

Upon receipt of EIA documents, the district/county or municipal EPBs will announce the receipt and commencement of review process, and disclose the full reports to public for soliciting public's comments and feedback. The EIA review process is implemented by an independent expert panel system organized by EPBs. These experts are selected from an expert pool established by Guangxi EPB. Normally, for the review panel organized by city/county EPBs, at least 3 experts are selected. Based on satisfactory results from the expert panel review, the district/county EPBs will issue the final approval documents.

The current arrangement for processing EIA Registration Form in Guangxi Province, requires the owners of the projects to go to the county EPB office to fill out the EIA Registration Form. The EPB will complete the registration within 2 days and grant the evidence of registration to the owners. During the processing of the EIA Registration Form, the completeness of the information provided is the focus of the process.

Preparation and Implementation of EA

Preparation and implementation of EA is the responsibility of the owners. In the template EA Registration Form for different sectors, typical mitigation measures are provided, including the site selection criteria, for the owners to use as an easy reference. For example, the EIA Registration Form for livestock sector provides the typical requirements for site selection, separate system of clean water and wastewater, treatment and disposal of livestock waste. The EIA Form is often prepared by an experienced institute/person which highlights the practical mitigation measures. In the EIA Form, the estimated budget for implementing the mitigation measures and monitoring plan are mandatory.

During construction stage, the mitigation measures are implemented by contractors, and supervised by the project owners. Upon project completion, the project owners need to contract an independent institution to carry out the monitoring and prepare the completion acceptance report, which needs to be disclosed to the public. A project can only formally start operation after completing the procedure for the environmental acceptance examination.

For the projects subject to EIA Registration Form, the environmental acceptance examination is not required.

Supervision

The construction and operation process of the projects, including the projects subject to EIA Registration Form, will receive random on-site supervision from local EPBs (through their supervision and enforcement teams, normally known as Environmental Enforcement Squad). In addition, the telephone hotline has been established in the local EPB which are open to the public complaints. A procedure of the public complaints response has been established covering recording, reporting, and responding.

Performance Review

The ESSA team visited four sample counties of Longsheng, Teng, Tianlin and Du'an in Guangxi, and reviewed some EA documents for the activities similar to those under the PforR. During the site visit, the team also held discussion with the staff from county EPBs. It is found that the staff of county EPB are fully capable of reviewing the EIA Forms and giving reasonable comments; and the Environmental Enforcement Squad is capable of handling the environmental issues regarding the noise, general wastewater and solid, waste gas, and soil erosion that are associated with the activities similar to this PforR. For the activities that are not required for EA documents, the EPB staff also conduct site visit to supervise and support the environmental performance. For any public complaints on environmental pollution as a result of such small activities, it is usually under the coordination of the deputy head of township, who is in charge of environmental affairs in the township.

Assessment

The procedure for EA implementation has been clearly established. The responsibility arrangement for the whole process of environmental management is clearly assigned to each stakeholder. For this PforR, the procedure is practical and adequate to manage the potential impacts, and the performance of the system can be satisfactorily capable of handling the environmental issues associated with the PforR.

4.2.2 Livestock Waste Management System

Review and approval procedure

The livestock waste management system is co-managed by EPB and livestock department from the government side. EPB's responsibility is to take lead in supervision and management of the pollution control in livestock farms; while the livestock department responsible for guidance and service for integrated use of livestock wastes. In practice, there is a close cooperation in Guangxi between the EPB and the Livestock Department in the procedure of review and approval of new livestock farms where the EA and livestock epidemic prevention certificate imbedded, as the environmental facilities for waste management is considered as an integral part of the epidemic prevention. The typical steps for obtaining the epidemic certificate for a new livestock farm are summarized below:

- The farmer needs to firstly go to the county/township animal epidemic prevention and quarantine station to get the application form for animal epidemic prevention certificate;
- Then the farmer needs to go to the deputy head of township government, who is also in charge of environmental protection, to go through the procedure for land use, to ensure the farm site is not located within the livestock prohibition/limitation area;
- The county livestock bureau will work jointly with county EPB within 20 days after receiving the request and visit the site and inspect the conditions of the environmental facilities in the livestock farm;
- After the county EPB issued the evidence of filing the EA Registration Form, the county animal epidemic prevention and quarantine station will stamp the request form with comments, and establish a record for this livestock farm.

Design and Operation

Although the livestock waste management in rural areas is mostly handled by individual farmers, the government departments however are playing a very important role in regulating and supervising the development of livestock sector. The government of Guangxi has realized the importance to preserve the ecological value of its brilliant natural assets and is making efforts to promote ecological livestock policy throughout the region. The prevalent approach for poverty reduction is to introduce several national level or provincial level leading agribusiness enterprises to address poverty reduction under the Agricultural Industrialization (*Chanye Fupin*) program in the format of leading enterprise plus farmer collectives and small household livestock farms. The farmer cooperatives and household livestock farms are formed from poor families.

However, it may be very difficult for the poverty counties to attract large enterprises into their territory, as they cannot provide adequate land. The current policy for livestock development in Guangxi is to enhance the scaled livestock farms through cooperatives under the technical and marketing support of the leading enterprises. Lack of such leading enterprises may lead to a situation where the farmer cooperatives have to shift to more relying upon the government's support and guidance in the design and operation of ecological livestock farms.

The livestock waste management system provides a comprehensive technical framework for the design of the livestock waste management facilities. For the scaled livestock farms at the size more than 100 pigs and livestock plots, there are two alternate technical routes to treat the animal wastes: one is for recycling into farmland and the other is for direct discharge into the environment. The standard for recycling of animal waste into farmland is based on hygiene indicators¹¹; while the direct discharge standard is more complex and stringent¹², thus incurring higher cost. The scaled livestock farms or livestock plots in Guangxi usually adopts the technical route of recycling into farmland after composting solid waste and treating wastewater in retention tank respectively. Besides, some farmers are operating bio-tanks to treat the livestock wastewater. The bio-tanks were built under the government subsidies with the design by the Energy Office of Forestry Bureau. However, the subsidy currently becomes seldom.

Once the livestock farms are completed, the local EPB and livestock bureau will send its staff jointly to carry out the examination of the environmental facilities in line with the procedure of the Three-Simultaneous. In Guangxi, there is a generic checklist for determining the ecological livestock farm, thus becoming a useful tool available for the staff of county livestock bureau for the environmental examination. However, this checklist is too general to give technical details for design, operation and examination of a "ecological" livestock farm, and the staff of the county livestock bureau are not capable of using it to supervise and support the implementation of the system.

Supervision and Training

In Guangxi, the scaled livestock farm and livestock plot is under the regular supervision by the County EPB at least twice a year. The municipal EPB supervises them at random time by staff randomly selected by EPB at the sampling

¹¹ Hygienic requirements for harmless disposal of night soil, GB 7959-2012

¹² If the treated wastewater is used for agricultural irrigation, should meet Standards for irrigation water quality, GB 5084-2005; if treated wastewater is directly discharged into natural waters, should meet the Discharge standard of pollutants for livestock and poultry breeding GB 18596-2001.

ratio of 5%. The livestock bureau constantly uses a generic checklist for livestock sector developed by the Ministry of Agriculture. In addition, the supervision results often provide very general instructions without too much technical details.

Trainings on the livestock breeding and animal waste management are organized by county livestock bureau for the farmers. The frequency and quality varies largely in different counties.

Performance Review

During the preparation of the ESSA, the environmental team visited several livestock farms at various sizes and discussed with the farmers and the local EPB and livestock bureaus. Through site visit and discussion, it is found that the farmers of the cooperatives heavily rely on their limited experience and knowledge to design and operate the livestock waste management facilities, as they do not receive adequate training and technical guidance from local livestock bureaus; while the staff at the county livestock bureau do not have adequate technical capacity and experience, so they cannot provide adequate training for farmers and cannot perform satisfactory supervision. Thus, the current situation in Guangxi needs to be improved to ensure the satisfactory environmental performance of the scaled livestock farms.

Following are the summary of the main technical findings regarding the performance of livestock waste management system on site:

- The hydraulic layout design for the separate system over the whole livestock farm area needs to be improved, taking into account the segregation of dirty area with clean area, silage storage area with surface run-off area, and urine from solid manure;
- Design of the whole system of composting needs to be improved to reduce the moisture content and to facilitate composting operation;
- The farmers are willing to use the compost in agricultural planting, but the application rate of the compost for crops are not provided, which may lead to a concern on the phytotoxicity by heavy metals excreted from livestock;
- The volume of the retention tank should be properly calculated to provide the adequate retention period or sufficient space to accommodating the waste water generated during the Max. interval of applications to farmland. This may result in over-application of the waste water contaminating the soil and groundwater, and potential health risk;
- The environmental facilities in the livestock farms are seldom designed and constructed in compliance with the standard of seepage-proof¹³. This may cause severe leakage into groundwater;
- On-site burial is commonly used to dispose of animal carcasses, given the very limited capacity of centralized facility in Guangxi. However, the farmers are not aware of the specific requirements for the location and process for burial. Given the unfavorable geological structure in these poverty counties where karst formation prevails, the local geology may be unable to provide desirably impermeable layers;
- With regards to the minimization of livestock waste, the government is investigating the macro organism additives to increase the digestion rate of forage, and is promoting the water conservation techniques;
- The forage suppliers frequently visit and provide training on the formation of feed content which is matched to the specific nutritional requirements of the animals in their different production and growth, use low-protein, amino acid-supplemented diets and use low-phosphorus diets with highly digestible inorganic phosphates, etc;

In addition, the typical household-based livestock farms as created to generate supplementary income for poor families. The size of such farms is typically small, up to 3 pigs or 3 beef cattle. This is because the Guangxi government requires that the size of the household livestock farms be no more than 3 pigs or 3 beef cattle in the poverty counties. Through this requirement, Guangxi government promotes the scaled livestock farms which environmental facilities are reasonably cost-effective. Constrained by the limited land in the Guangxi Province, especially in mountain areas, where the arable land per capita in the 28 poverty counties is only about 500 m², rural settlements are relatively small

¹³ Design specifications for waste water storage facility of animal farm, GB/T 26624-2011

and scattered. This low density of settlements means that pollution intensity of livestock waste is relatively limited. In addition, the arable land in these areas has poor soil nutrition properties which is being compensated traditionally with recycling of livestock waste. The farmers of household livestock farms in Guangxi usually practice the traditional composting method to recycle livestock waste. Thus, it is expected that the gap of livestock farm size less than 100 pigs at annual marketing rate is manageable under the current environmental regulations in the context of Guangxi Province.

It is learned that the provincial livestock department is investigating the technical specifications and standards for ecological livestock farms. It is suggested that the provincial livestock bureau should focus on the proper design at the aspects of the wastewater tank, manure storage yard, drainage system, composting and seepage prevention, and carcasses disposal. Landfill wells are strongly recommended for the farmers cooperatives to dispose of carcasses. In addition, it is also strongly suggested that the training on the design and operation of the environmental facilities for both the farmers cooperatives and staff of county livestock bureau should be further enhanced.

Assessment

The livestock waste management system has been established and it has clear arrangement of institutional responsibilities covering the review and approval, design and operation, and supervision and training. The established system covering the technical standards, norms and policies in Guangxi is considered quite comprehensive, thus providing reasonable basis for handling the issues associated with livestock waste. However, the performance of the system needs to be improved at the aspects of the technical capacity of the county livestock bureau and the technical guidance and training for farmers.

4.2.3 Pest Management

Production and Sale Management

Government plays a crucial role in the pest management. The mandatory system for production permit and sales permit for pesticide to be used in agriculture and forestry has been established and managed by the agricultural department in China. Ministry of Agriculture regularly updates its inventory for pesticides which categorize the pesticides into three categories, namely limited use, banned use and normal use. Only the pesticide products in compliance with the national and sectoral standards and is not prohibited by the inventory are permitted by the government. Such national or sectoral standards are fully in line with that of the WHO, and in some cases much stringent than the WHO's standards.

In addition, the wholesalers and dealers should request for the sales permit from the agricultural department. The qualification criteria for the wholesalers and dealers are comprehensive and stringent. It requires that the wholesalers and dealers should have professional knowledge on pesticide and pest management, and have the capability of guiding the users to safely and reasonably use the pesticide. It also makes specific requirements on the conditions and procedure for purchase, storage and sale of pesticide.

This system also set up a very stringent scrutiny over the operation of the wholesalers and dealers. They are required to transfer the statistical information of pesticide business, e.g. sales, to a special website of government quarterly. And the agricultural department or its branch, visit the wholesalers and dealers regularly to supervise the sales record and check their stock. In each store for pesticides, a bar code scanner connected with the website of the MOA is required by the government. The personnel of the wholesaler or dealer are required to use the scanner to scan the bar code on the package of pesticide to identify its compliance each time when they replenish their stock.

Pest Forecast and Control

Under the context of the PforR, the system regarding the pest management mainly involves two line government authorities and institutions: agricultural department takes the overall responsibility for the pest management in agricultural planting; and the forestry department for the pest management in economic forests.

The government departments at different level are designated with different assignments for pest forecast and control: at and above the municipal level, the government departments are designated to develop and make public the medium and long term pest forecast and associated control plan; while the department at lower level to predict the pest situation in the short and medium term and make associated pest control plan.

The county plant protection and quarantine station (hereinafter plant protection station) play a major role in forecasting the pest situation in agricultural sector. In each township, the plant protection station assigned a people to run the equipment and report the statistical information to the station at the frequency of once a week. The pest forecast is released to

The agricultural technology promotion center and the plant protection station at county level are designated to practice the pest control plan on ground. Similar institutional setting is also established in the forestry sector. Their pest control plans highlight the “prevention first” by means of integrated approach designed for specific vectors in different stages of plant growth. Implementation of the plan is supported by the government budget, with the use clearly designated to monitoring, vehicles, training and subsidy for specific pesticides.

Training and Supervision

The plant protection stations of agricultural department and forestry department respectively are responsible for providing trainings for the farmers. Under the budget support from the county government, such training including materials is free. In the program areas, the trainings are extensively provided by the technical representatives from the pesticide makers. In addition, in each deep poverty county in Guangxi, qualified agronomic experts from agricultural/forestry institutes are assigned by the government to provide free guidance on the pest management and pesticide use. Often, the farmers of the cooperatives invite the experts from professional institutions to provide hand-to-hand training on the pest management

In the farming seasons requiring application of pesticide, the plant protection stations will visit the fields and supervise the use of the pesticide. In forestry sector, similar institutional arrangement has been made in place to take the similar duties within their sectors.

Performance Review

The site visit and discussion found that the farmers are well aware of the integrated pest management, and if use of pesticide is necessary on occasion, they prefer to use the pesticide listed in the *Inventory of Low Toxic and Low Residue Pesticides for Planting Industry* under the guidance of their experts, and they also learned the personal protection knowledge from the trainings.

The wholesalers and dealers of pesticides is under stringent scrutiny in Guangxi. The synthetic pesticide with high toxicity is banned, and the ecological pesticides with low residue is preferably used in Guangxi. The government often outsourced the service of technical training to professional institutes, and the frequency of the training for farmers is quite high, as much as four time per year.

Guangxi Government is making great effort to reduce the use of pesticides. An ambitious target that zero incremental use of pesticide in 2020 has been set up by Guangxi. It is reported that such target has been achieved in 2016, with 1062.58 t reduction on 2015, which is attributable to the wide promotion and adoption of ecological method in the whole region.

Assessment

The pest control system in China and Guangxi is well established and implemented following the principle of IPM approach. It focuses on the procedure for permit for production and sale of pesticides, forecast and control of pests, and training of users, which ensure the consistency with the international good practice. The good performance is guaranteed with the established accountability under the government budget support and adequate training.

4.3 Environmental Management Agencies and Capacity Assessment

Based on the screening of environmental and social effects of the program activities and the analysis of applicable management system, the main government stakeholders involved in the environmental safeguards management at the program level are: EPB, agricultural department, livestock and aquaculture bureau, and forestry department at the provincial, municipal, county, and township level.

4.3.1 Environmental Management

Department of Environmental Protection of Guangxi Autonomous Region (Guangxi REPB)

Guangxi PRPB is the highest environmental protection authority in the province reporting to the Regional government. The main responsibilities of the EPB include: (i) establishing regional environmental protection institutional system; (ii) preventing and controlling environmental pollution; (iii) coordinating and supervising key environmental issues; (iv) enforcing provincial emission reduction targets; (v) directing, coordinating and supervising ecological protection work; (vi) managing and supervising nuclear and radiation safety; and (vii) monitoring and publishing environmental information.

Below is a list of divisions and subordinate institutes within the Guangxi PEPB's organizational system and their associated responsibilities for environmental management of the Program activities.

- Division of Environmental Impact Assessment: Managing the EIA for plan, policy and project; supervising and managing license and qualification of EIA institutes; and controlling the EIA approval for areas with non-compliance of total emission control threshold, serious ecological damage or pending ecological restoration efforts; controlling the index exceeding the Max. pollution load.
- Natural Ecological Protection Division (Rural Environmental Protection Division): drafting and supervising the implementation of natural ecological protection plan; providing comments on the proposals for new or adjusted natural reserves and ecological function protection zones; guiding the pollution control of soil, livestock and waterfowls in rural area.
- Policy and Regulation Division: organizing and implementing the supervision over the law enforcement.
- Regional Environmental Enforcement Supervision and Examination General Squad: Conducting on-site inspection on pollution emission entities/individuals in the province; organizing the investigation of major environmental pollution incidents; implementing Environmental Emergency Response Plan; conducting supervision on administration of environmental protection; receiving public complaints; and guiding the municipal and county/district EPB on environmental law enforcement.

Besides the public complaints receiving office inside the Provincial Environmental Enforcement Supervision and Examination General Squad, Guangxi PEPB has also established a public grievance system for environmental issues and violations reporting through its website (www.gxepb.gov.cn), which provides access to on-line reporting and on-line consultation. A nationwide environmental protection grievance hotline (12369) is universally available to access the local environmental grievance system.

Municipal and County EPBs

Municipal EPBs are responsible for managing and supervising the implementation of environmental protection measures on the ground. There are 14 municipalities in Guangxi and each has its own Municipal EPB structured similarly to the regional EPB. The main divisions of Municipal EPB include:

- Division of Environmental Impact Assessment and Environmental Monitoring
- Division of Air Pollution Prevention and Treatment
- Division of Water Pollution Prevention and Treatment
- Environmental Supervision and Examination Squad

The county EPBs are responsible for enforcement of pollution control and compliance supervision at district/county level. Given the decentralization of government function reform, district and county EPBs are responsible for EIA Form approvals and filing of EIA Registration Form for the projects within their jurisdictions. Each of the 53 poverty counties has its own county EPB. The main responsibility of the county EPB is: (a) implementing the environmental

laws, regulations, rules and policies; (b) coordinating and supervising key environmental issues in the county; (c) enforcing emission reduction targets set by municipal and county governments; (d) directing, coordinating and supervising ecological protection work; (e) taking the responsibility for prevention and control of environmental pollution at source; (f) supervising the pollution control in the county; (g) managing and supervising nuclear and radiation safety; (h) monitoring and publishing environmental information; (i) pushing forward establishing the environmental technical management system; and (j) organizing, guiding and coordinating the environmental outreach program.

Below is a list of divisions and subordinate institutes within the county EPB's organizational system.

- Division of Environmental Impact Assessment.
- Pollution Prevention Division.
- Max. Load Control Division.
- Rural Ecological Plan Division.
- Environmental Supervision and Examination Sub-squad.

The number of staff in the county EPBs varies largely in different counties in Guangxi. The number of staff is determined by the features of the county, e.g. area, number of key pollution sources, budget, etc. At the level below township, there is currently no branch of EPB. But a deputy head of township is designated to take charge in the environmental protection, who is actively responsible for 1) implementing environmental laws and regulations; 2) promulgating environmental policies and knowledge; 3) collecting information of polluting sources; 4) preparing and implementing the environmental protection plan for township; 5) supervising the implementation of the pollution control in township, and 6) accepting and handling public complaints.

Under this program, most of the activities are subject to the EIA Registration Form with a few subject to the EIA Form, which fall within the county/district EPB's authority threshold. With regards to the EIA Registration Form, only recording in the county EPB is required. But this record becomes the legal basis for law enforcement. The activities requiring EIA Form are typical agricultural food processing activity of small size. For such kind of activities, review of the clearance documents issued by the county EPB indicates that the county EPB is adequately capable of reviewing and clearing the EIA Form.

Assessment

Based on institutional review and consultation, it is concluded that Guangxi EPBs at the regional, municipal and county levels have a well-established organization structure with comprehensive divisions and subordinate institutes, and is authorized with adequate mandate to manage the overall environmental protection work in the region. The EIA for new construction projects is well-regulated by a well-established legal and regulatory framework and procedures and managed by qualified staff in relevant divisions and institutes in the bureau. Given the context of the environmental management system reform, the capacity of the county EPBs can adequately handle the supervision of the environmental performance of the activities to be supported by the program.

4.3.2 Livestock and Aquaculture Bureau

Guangxi Regional Livestock and Aquaculture Bureau¹⁴ has been integrated into the Department of Agriculture of Guangxi Autonomous Region. Currently, the departments relevant to livestock have become the divisions of the Department of Agriculture of Guangxi Autonomous Region, and the departments relevant to aquaculture have been merged into the Department of Ocean and Fisheries of Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region. Thus, as the divisions in Department of Agriculture of Guangxi Autonomous Region, they are the highest livestock and veterinarian authority in the region reporting to the Department of Agriculture of Guangxi Autonomous Region. The regional livestock and aquaculture bureau takes the main responsibility for: (a) implementing the laws, regulations, policies, development strategy and planning for livestock sector; (b) providing guidance on the development of large scale, standardized, ecological and industrialized livestock in Guangxi. Being responsible for statistical analysis, monitoring and alarming

¹⁴ During the preparation of the ESSA, the Provincial Livestock Bureau is being merged into the Department of Agriculture of Guangxi Autonomous Region.

and information disclosure in livestock sector; (c) animal epidemic prevention; (d) management and supervision of the livestock, animal medicine, forage, pasture seed, and implementing the relevant permitting system; (e) supervising and managing the animal product safety; (f) supervising and managing the slaughtering of animals; (g) the safety of milk in the process of production and acquisition; (h) supervising and managing the veterinarian qualification, and animal health, and animal medicine test, and managing the official veterinarian and certified veterinarian; (i) emergency response to significant accident of animal epidemic diseases or of animal product quality safety; and (j) providing guidance on technical services, monitoring and testing, supervising the law enforcement.

Below is a list of divisions and subordinate institutes within the regional livestock bureau's organizational system and their associated responsibilities for livestock waste management of the Program activities.

- Livestock and Forage Division: guide the work on environmental protection in livestock production process; provide the guidance and service regarding the integrated use of livestock wastes in the scaled livestock farms; supervise quality of forage; approve the permit for enterprises producing additives and forage pre-mixed with additives.
- Under the regional livestock bureau there are some subordinate professional institutes and stations, those directly associated with the livestock waste management are the general livestock station and the livestock research institute. They are studying the technical parameters and specifications for ecological livestock farms

Besides the public complaints receiving office inside the Animal Health Supervision Station which also sets up and maintains a website for public complaints, the livestock bureau has established the village level epidemic prevention system where a villager is engaged and trained by the county livestock bureau to supervise epidemic diseases and collect public complaints to report to the county animal health supervision station. In each township quarantine station, a hotline number is provided for public complaints. All of the public complaints are well received and treated with the progress of the public complaints treatment shown in the website of the provincial Livestock Bureau. Base on the information and discussion, it is concluded that the GRM is established and well maintained in the livestock system.

Municipal Livestock Bureau

Municipal livestock bureau right now is independent of the agricultural bureau at the municipal level. It is responsible for implementing the system for livestock immunization, epidemic prevention, animal and animal products quarantine, management of veterinarian, and forage quality control on the ground. There are 14 municipalities in Guangxi and each has its own Municipal livestock bureau structured similarly to the provincial bureau. However, the municipal livestock bureau places more resources on the law enforcement thus more branch or institutes than the provincial level. A typical institutional arrangement of municipal livestock bureau is as flows:

- Livestock division
- Livestock technique promotion station

Each of the 28 poverty counties has livestock bureau. The county livestock bureau is in similar structure with the municipal livestock bureau. In the county level, there is an animal epidemic prevention station designated for routinely supervising the performance of quarantine, epidemic prevention and livestock waste management. Through field visit and discussion it is learned that the county level bureau do not have adequate capacity in terms of budget, equipment and qualified staff.

Assessment

Based on institutional review and consultation, it is concluded that livestock bureau has a well-established organization structure with comprehensive divisions and subordinate institutes, and is authorized with adequate mandate to manage the overall livestock work in the region.

The livestock bureau at regional and municipal levels have adequate technical capability to promote the ecological livestock techniques centered on ecological planning, layout, design, feeding and waste management, and construction quality. However technical staff at county level bureaus need to be enhanced with technical capability and budget to ensure the good performance of the livestock waste management systems.

4.3.3 Department of Agriculture of Guangxi Autonomous Region

Department of Agriculture of Guangxi Autonomous Region (DAGAR hereinafter) is the top government authority in the Guangxi Region in charge of agricultural development. Among its wide variety of duties, the main duties regarding

the pest management and agricultural non-point-source pollution control are: (a)organizing and coordinating the construction of the agricultural production materials market system. Conducting the permit and supervision on seed and pesticides; (b) supervising and managing the fertilizers; (c)being responsible for prevention and control of significant pest in the whole province; (d) guiding the construction of vegetation epidemic prevention and quarantine system; (e) organizing and supervising the vegetation epidemic prevention and quarantine, and releasing the information on the vegetation epidemic situation and organizing to eradicate the severe vegetation epidemic disease; (f) drafting and implementing the plan and policies regarding agricultural science and technology, education and technical promotion; guiding the agricultural non-point-source pollution control; (g) guiding the development of ecological agriculture and circular agriculture.

Below is a list of divisions and subordinate institutes within the DAGAR's organizational system and their associated responsibilities for pest management in agricultural planting of the Program activities.

- Cropping and Oil Plants Management Division: responsible for works relevant to farmland quality management and water conservation; responsible for registration, supervision and management of fertilizers and pesticides; carry out the emergency pest management programs.
- Agricultural Technical Promotion Central Station: responsible for introduction, experiment, demonstration and promotion of new crop species and new agronomic technology; responsible for monitoring of farmland soil quality and use of fertilizers.
- Plant Protection and Quarantine Station: quarantine vegetation; monitoring and forecast of pests; promotion of new pesticides and equipment and safe use of pesticide; emergency control of significant pests.

The key aspects of the pest management in the agricultural sector are under the adequate supervision and management by the comprehensively established institutions in the DAGAR. The subordinate institutions at the regional level are often designated to provide technical support to the key projects sponsored by the provincial government, and as a usual practice, their routine jobs are largely focused on field experiments, technical trainings, and technical studies.

Municipal Agricultural and Rural Work Committee (or agricultural and livestock bureau) is responsible for regulating and guiding the agricultural development within the municipality. The typical set up of the municipal agricultural bureau is similar to that of the regional agricultural bureau. Regarding the pesticide management, currently the permit for pesticide sale is to be issued by the Municipal Agricultural Rural Work Committee.

The county agricultural bureau takes the responsibility to implement the laws, regulations, rules and policies on pest management and non-point pollution control on ground.

It is learned that in each township there are several large pesticide wholesalers. The focus of the pesticide law enforcement is to examine these wholesalers, so through consultation it is concluded that the pesticide management is adequately managed under the current institutional setting.

Assessment

Based on institutional review and consultation, it is concluded that agricultural departments at regional, municipal and county levels have a well-established organization structure with comprehensive divisions and subordinate institutes, and is authorized with adequate mandate to manage the overall pest management issues in the region. The institutions have adequate capacity to implement their assignments provided by the laws and regulations.

4.3.4 Guangxi Regional Department of Forestry (GRDF)

Guangxi Regional Department of Forestry (HPDF) is the highest authority for forests management reporting to the regional government. Its main responsibilities are: (a)supervising and managing the forestry and the ecological construction; (b)organizing, coordinating, guiding and supervising the afforestation; (c) protecting, developing, supervising and managing the forestry resource; (d) organizing, coordinating, guiding and supervising the protection of wetland; (e) organizing, coordinating, guiding and supervising the desertification control; (f) organizing and guiding the protection and scientific development of terrestrial plants and animal resources; (g) supervising and managing the natural reserves; (h) pushing forward the forestry reform; and (i) fire prevention.

The institution directly relevant with the pest management in economic forests is the forest pest management and quarantine station:

(a)disseminate and implement the Forestry Law, Plant Quarantine Regulation, Forest Pest Management Regulation, Plant Quarantine Rule of Guangxi Region; (b)responsible for forecast of forestry pests in the whole province; (c)responsible for prevention and control of forestry pests; (d)organize, guide and coordinate the management of significant or emergency forestry pests; (e)guide and supervise the quarantine of seedlings, seeds and materials at the origin and transportation.

In the municipal and county level, the forest pest management and quarantine stations have been established for managing the pest and conducting compulsory quarantine in forestry within the boundary of the municipality and county respectively.

Like the agricultural sector, the forest pest management and quarantine station provides the free trainings for the farmers and release the information on forestry pests. The experts from universities or technical institutes are often invited by the station or the farmers to give targeted training.

Assessment

In summary, the institutional setting and the capacity is deemed to be adequate to handle the pest management issues associated with the activities of planting of tree crops under the PforR.

SECTION V: SOCIAL MANAGEMENT SYSTEM

5.1 Legal Framework Applicable to the Program

In general, the Chinese legal framework includes three aspects: (i) The laws and regulations issued by the NPC and the State Council; (ii) The regulations, standards and technical specifications issued by the Ministries; (iii) The laws and regulations promulgated by the local People's Congress and local governments. Generally, it is assessed that a social related legal framework has been established in China, Guangxi Autonomous Region and local government, related to the Program identified potential social issues, such as land acquisition, land donation, and land use right transfer, ethnic minority development, participation, consultation and grievance redress measures.

5.1.1 Land acquisition / land donation

In order to standardize the system of land acquisition and land use right transfer¹⁵, China has promulgated *the Land Administration law of the People's Republic of China* (the law came into force on January 1, 1987) and *the PRC rural land contract law* (the law came into force on March 1, 2003). *Measures of Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region for Implementing "Land Administration Law of the People's Republic of China"* has regulated land use rights and ownership, land use planning, protection of cultivated land, expropriation and compensation of construction land, land supervision and other matters.

(1) Land Acquisition

National land acquisition policies

The nature of land ownership. Article 2 and 8 of *the Land Administration law of the People's Republic of China* expressly stipulates that the socialist public ownership of land implemented by the People's Republic of China, that is, the collective ownership and working. The land in urban areas belongs to the state. Land in rural and urban suburbs belongs to farmers collectively, except where the law stipulates that it belongs to the state; homestead and plots, cropland belong to the farmers collectively owned.

Land acquisition. Article 42 of *the Law on real rights of the People's Republic of China* stipulates that, for the sake of public interest, the land and units, individual houses and other immovable property could be levied collectively in accordance with the powers and procedures prescribed by law. Where collective-owned land is levied, the cost of land compensation, resettlement subsidy, attachments and seedlings on the ground shall be fully paid in accordance with law. The peasant's social security expense should be paid to guarantee the land-taken farmer's life, the lawful rights and interests. Where houses and other real properties of institutions and individuals are acquired, compensation for demolition and resettlement shall be paid according to law in order to safeguard legitimate rights and benefits of the expropriated; where individual residential house is expropriated, residential conditions of the expropriated shall be guaranteed.

Land property rights. *Opinions on improving the method of allocation of rural land ownership, contracting rights and management rights* (2016) issued by the general office of the CPC central committee and the general office of the state council divided the rural land contractual management right into three rights, they are ownership, contracting right and management right. This is another major system innovation to promote agricultural modernization and rural reform after the household contract responsibility system. The land collective owner has the right to possess, use, benefit and dispose of the collective land according to law. Farmers are the right subjects of collective ownership of land, and they have the power of contracting, adjusting, supervising and withdrawing. Rural collective land is contracted by the peasants who are members of this collective economic organization, regardless of how management right transferred, the contracting right of collective land belongs to the peasant family. No organization or individual

¹⁵ It is translated as Rural Land Contractual Management Right. Since 2014, a new round of reform of rural land system has put forward the idea of "three rights separation". The three rights are ownership, contracting right and management right. The rural land contractual management right can be transferred, leased, exchanged or otherwise in accordance with law. In the process of land transfer, land use right is transferred to other farmers or economic organizations, the farmers retain the right to contract land. When we refer land transfer in this report, we mean land use right transfer.

can replace the land contract status of the peasant family, nor can they illegally deprive and limit the land contract rights of the farmers. In the process of perfecting the "three rights separation" method, it is important to fully maintain the rights such as the use, circulation, mortgage and withdrawal of the contracted land.

Women's Rights. Women enjoy equal rights as men in terms of contracting rural land. The legitimate rights and benefits of women shall be protected during land contracting. No organizations or individuals may deprive their rights to land contracting and management, which they are entitled to, or infringe upon such rights. The employer (contract-issuing party) may not take back or readjust the contracted land during the term of contracting. (Articles 6, 26 and 27 of *Rural Land Contracting Law of the People's Republic of China*).

Consultation and Disclosure of land acquisition information. During land acquisition, it is necessary to safeguard the ownership of farmer collectives land and farmer's rights and benefits of land contracting. Before an application for proposed land acquisition is submitted for approval, farmers whose land is to be taken shall be informed of the uses, location and compensation rate of the land to be taken and resettlement channels. Results of status quo survey of the proposed land to be taken must be confirmed by rural collective economic organizations and farmers whose land is to be taken. If necessary, land resources authorities shall organize hearings. *Relevant* documents that are confirmed by land-taken farmers shall be used as necessary documents for approving the land acquisition application. It is necessary to accelerate the establishment and improvement of coordination and mediation mechanisms for disputes related to land acquisition and resettlement so as to safeguard legitimate rights and benefits of land-taken farmers and land users. With the exception of special circumstances, issues related to the approved land acquisition shall be disclosed. After the land use application is approved, the pre-deposited funds shall be accounted for and refunded or topped up (Article 14 of *State Council Decision on Deepen Reform and Strictly Enforcing Land Administration*).

Land Inspector. The State Council establishes the national General Inspector of Land. The Ministry of Land and Resources sends 9 national Land Inspectorate to the local government to perform supervision and inspection duties on behalf of the National Land Inspectorate. In accordance with the law, when the provincial people's government reports to the State Council for approval of farmland transfer and land acquisition, the National Land Inspectorate in the area should be copied to at the same time. The National Land Inspectorate in the area should report to the National Land Inspectorate timely once found illegal operations. Matters of farmland transfer and land acquisition approved by the provincial and municipal governments shall be copied to the National Land Inspectorate in the area timely.

Land acquisition policies in Guangxi region

Land acquisition procedures. *Guidance on further strengthening and standardizing the management of land acquisition in Guangxi region* (2014) stipulated perfecting the procedure of land acquisition. The preliminary work of the land acquisition institution shall be reported to the municipal and county people's governments for approval, then start the work of informing, confirming investigation results, hearing and prepaying land acquisition compensation fees according to provisions. During the process of land acquisition, two announcements and one registration¹⁶ shall be implemented. According to relevant regulations, the land-expropriated units and peasants shall be paid the relevant expenses in full and demolition work shall be carried out in accordance with laws and regulations.

Land compensation. *Guiding opinions on further strengthening and standardizing land acquisition management work in Guangxi Region (2014)* stipulated that: i) Establish the periodic adjustment mechanism of land acquisition compensation standard. The unified standard for annual output of land acquisition in the whole region and the land price in the integrated area shall be subject to regular adjustment and shall be renewed every 3 years. Compensation rates for young crops and attachments on the ground shall be timely updated and adjusted by the local people's

¹⁶ The first announcement is "land acquisition announcement", the municipal and county people's governments where the requisitioned land is located should make two announcements and one registration of requisitioned land in the village within 10 working days from the date of receiving the approval document of land acquisition by the provincial or the State Council. The Land and Resources Department shall be responsible for the concrete implementation. The second announcement is "announcement of land acquisition compensation and resettlement plan", the Land Administrative Department shall, in accordance with the land acquisition plan approved by the provincial or State Council, formulate the compensation and resettlement scheme for land acquisition within 45 days from the date of the first announcement. "One registration" refers to registration of land acquisition compensation. The land-expropriated rural collective economic organizations, rural villagers or other rights holders shall, within the period specified in the requisition of land announcements, hold the certificate of land ownership (land contract) to the designated place for registration of land acquisition compensation.

government and promulgated according to law. ii) Standardize the use and management of compensation fees for land acquisition. Land compensation fees, resettlement subsidies and compensation for ground attachments (young crops) should be paid in full and in time according to law so as to ensure that the living standards of landless farmers will not be reduced and long-term livelihoods will be protected. The income and expenditure of compensation for land acquisition shall be made public in the form of village affairs public columns, villager congress or village assembly and shall be subject to the democratic supervision of all members of rural collective economic organizations. iii) Broaden the way of resettlement of landless farmers. Land-expropriated peasants should be resettled in various ways such as agricultural production resettlement, keeping land allocation, re-employment placement, stock dividend placement, off-site resettlement so as to effectively solve the problems of living, production and employment of land-expropriated peasants.

Public participation and consultation. *Notice of Regional Land and Resources Office of Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region on Issuing the Guiding Opinions on Further Strengthening and Standardizing the Management of Land Acquisition* (2014, No. 81) stipulated: Organizing the hearing of the collective economic organizations and peasant households affected by land acquisition according to the application. During the implementation of land acquisition, the government should carry on policy propaganda, interpretation, communication, and consultation, and seriously investigate and deal with cases in land acquisition that infringe on the interests of land-expropriated farmers.

Social security of land-expropriated farmers. *Notice on Issuing Guiding Opinions of Guangxi Autonomous Region for Land-expropriated Farmers to Participate in the Basic Endowment Insurance System by Human Resources and Social Security Department, Land and Resources Department and Finance Department* (2016, No.46) stipulated that: The people's government at the place where the land is requisitioned should raise the subsidies for the endowment insurance of land-expropriated farmers through various channels. The subsidies for endowment insurance of land-expropriated farmers should be separately listed in the cost of land acquisition and shall not be included in the unified annual output value compensation standard.

Assessment: The current legal framework on land acquisition at both national-level and Guangxi region has been well established to ensure that affected people are assisted in improving or at least restoring their livelihoods and welfare levels. The legal framework have developed detailed regulations on land acquisition policy targets, approval procedures, compensation rates and updating mechanism, resettlement livelihood restoration measures, consultation and information disclosure, supervision arrangement, among others. Since China has no land market in rural areas, the methodology for land compensation is designed as unified annual output value standard or district piece comprehensive land price for a county. In addition, the national-level and Guangxi polices require local governments to take specific measures to restore or maintain the land acquisition affected farmer's welfare levels.

(2) Land Donation

The Villagers' Autonomy Law of the People's Republic of China (July 23, 2013). In accordance with the Constitution, this law is formulated to ensure the rural villagers' autonomy and villagers' managing their own decisions in accordance with the law, developing rural grassroots democracy and promoting the construction of socialist material and spiritual civilization in the countryside. The village assembly is the highest decision-making body of the administrative villages. It is composed of villagers, who are 18 years and above (people with their household registration books in the administrative villages or without the household registration books but having fixed residences in the villages, as well as living there consecutively for more than a year, can be called a villager of the village).

The village committee is responsible for setting up the village finance, village annual financial budget, and final accounts; handling the village public affairs and public welfare undertakings; mediating civil disputes; assisting the public security departments to maintain social order; and reporting to the people's government to reflect the opinions, requirements, and suggestions of the villagers. The village committee assists the work of the people's governments of townships, ethnic minority townships, and towns. The village committee should support and organize the villagers, in accordance with the law, to develop various forms of cooperative economy and other economies, serve village production and coordination, and promote construction of rural production and development of the socialist market economy. In accordance with the law, the village committee should manage the village-owned collective land and

other properties and educate the villagers to rationally use natural resources and protect and improve the ecological environment (Articles 12 and 13).

Village-level public service land and utility land. Village-level public service and public facilities construction should be carried out in rural construction land. Village construction land refers to the village collective economic organizations and rural individuals to invest or raise funds to carry out various non-agricultural land constructions. The village construction land mainly includes the village public welfare service land, the public facility land as well as the rural residential land. The rural collective construction land is divided into three categories: homestead, public facilities and management land.

Access to village-level public service land and utility land. Village-level public service and utility property are owned by the village collectively; the land will be in village unused lands or reserved lands or a few of individual lands which will generally provide by the village free of charge or land donation. The land donation is determined and processed by the villagers' Congress through the consultation with villager's representatives. Decisions on village-level land use change for construction activities are made through democratic meetings with villagers.

Assessment: The village public utility or public facilities ownership belong to the collectives; the land donation is determined by the villagers' Congress through the consultation with villager's representatives. However, procedure for consultation and information disclosure in the process of obtaining village-level public service land and utility land is not stipulated in policy basis.

5.1.2 Land use right transfer

There is an increasing land transfer markets in China for agricultural activities as rural population continues to migrate to urban areas. National government has established a policy system or framework which has standardized the principles, subjects, procedures, transactions, contract management and management agencies on transfer of land use rights. The policies stipulated that the transfer of the rural land contractual management right should abide by the principle of equal consultation, legal, voluntarily, and paid on the basis of insisting on the household contract management system and stabilizing the rural land contract relations. It has been estimated that about 30% of the agriculture land in China has been transferred under the legal framework.

Land use right management. The *rural land contract law of the People's Republic of China* (2003) stipulates that the natural attribute of land ownership shall not be changed, and the agricultural use of the land shall not be changed (the agricultural use of the land shall not be converted into permanent use).

Facilities for agricultural land. The *classification of land use status* (released on August 10, 2007) stipulates that the status of land use classification adopts the classification system of Level 1 and Level 2, which can be divided into 12 Level 1s and 56 Level 2s, including arable land, garden area, woodland, facility agricultural land, etc. Facilities agricultural land refers to agricultural facilities used directly for the operation of livestock and poultry houses, factory crop cultivation or aquaculture production facilities and their corresponding ancillary land, as well as the drying field outside the rural homestead, but excludes the permanent building land such as the affiliated management and living room. Irrigation and water conservancy facilities are mainly used for farmland irrigation and people's living sources of ponds, reservoirs, ditches and river channels. Facility farmland does not change the nature of the land and can be obtained through negotiated lease.

Transfer of land use right. Article 32, 34, 36 and 37 of the *rural Land Contract law of the People's Republic of China* stipulates that the use right obtained by family contraction can be transferred by subcontract, rent, interchange, transfer or other ways in accordance with the law. The subject of the land use right transfer is the contractor. The contractor shall have the right to decide independently whether or not to transfer and ways to transfer the land use right according to law. The subcontract fee, rent and transfer fee of the transfer of the land use right shall be determined by the parties concerned in consultation. The proceeds of transfer shall be vested in the contractor, and no organization or individual could withhold it without authorization. The use rights of the land shall be contracted, leased, exchanged, transferred or otherwise exchanged, and the parties should sign a written contract.

The principle of land transfer. *Provisions on the administration of the transfer of rural land use rights* (article 2) stipulated that the transfer of rural land use right should abide by the principle of equal consultation, legal, voluntarily,

and paid on the basis of insisting on the peasant household contract management system and stabilizing the rural land contract relationship.

Transaction of rural land use right. The Ministry of Agriculture issued *the Market Operation Code on Rural Land use Rights Transfer (trial)* in 2016, put forward a series of rules on the operation of land transfer market, especially the situation of the collective outward transfer and industrial and commercial capital to the countryside. Where the inflow exceeds the local standard, it is necessary to provide proof of agricultural management capacity, project feasibility report and the right to authorize the institution to allow transfer transactions, emphasizing the standardization of land transfer.

Voluntary land transfer. In 2014, the general office of the CPC Central Committee issued *the opinions on guiding the orderly transfer of rural land use right and developing agricultural moderate scale operation*. The opinion stipulated that the land contractual management right belongs to the peasant family, willingness of land transfer, price and choice of the form should be decided by the contracted peasant household, and the transfer proceeds should be owned by the contracted peasant. The transfer period shall be determined by negotiation between the two parties in the scope stipulated by law. Without the written entrustment of the peasant household, the rural grassroots organizations have no right to decide the contraction in any way or even manage foreign investment with farmers' contracted land of the whole village. Prevent grass-roots cadres from seeking personal gain. It is forbidden to push the land transfer through the task, index or taking transfer area and proportion into performance appraisal.

Transfer mode. *Measures for the management of the transfer of rural land use right* stipulated that the use right of rural land obtained by the contractor can be transferred by subcontracting, renting, exchanging, transferring or other ways that conform to the relevant laws and state policies. The contracting party shall transfer part or all of the rural land use right by means of subcontracting, renting and buying shares, in this way, the contractual relationship between the contractor and the employer shall remain, and the rights and obligations of both parties are unchanged. The land can be voluntarily invested by the contractor to develop agricultural cooperative production, but the shares should be returned to the original contracted farmers when the joint stock is dissolved. The Land use right acquired by means of transfer and interchange can be transferred by subcontracting, renting, exchanging, transferring or other ways by provisions of law and State policies after the registration and certification.

Contract for land use right transfer. *Measures for land use right transfer* (the law came into force on March 1st, 2005. Department of Agriculture Order No. 47th) has stipulated the transfer parties, methods, contracts and management. The contracting party shall sign a written transfer contract with the assignee to transfer the use right of rural land on the basis of consensus. The contract of land use right transfer has four copies, each of the two sides of the transfer holds one, the employer and rural land contractual management department of People's government in township puts one on record. The contractor may not enter into a written contract for the land to be cultivated by another person for no more than one year. The transfer contract of rural land use right includes: a) Name and domicile of both parties; b) place, area and quality of the land in transfer; c) term of transfer and date of starting and ending; d) transfer mode; e) use of the land; f) rights and obligations of both parties; g) transfer price and payment method; h) disposal of attachments and related facilities on the ground after the expiration of the transfer contract; i) liability for breach of contract.

Management of transfer of land use right. *Measures for the management of the transfer of rural land use right* stipulated that the competent department of Agricultural Administration (or rural management) of the local people's government at or above the county level shall strengthen the guidance for the work of rural Land Contractual Management Department of the township People's government. The Rural Land Contractual Management Department of the township People's government directs and manages the transfer of rural land use right according to law.

Dispute settlement in transfer of rural land use right. Disputes over the transfer of rural land use right should be negotiated and resolved by the parties concerned. If the parties fail to negotiate, they may request the villagers' committee and People's government in township to mediate. If the parties are unwilling to negotiate or mediate, they may apply to the rural land contract arbitration institution for arbitration, or they may sue directly to the people's Court.

Dispute mediation in rural land contract management. *Provisions of the Arbitration Law on the settlement of disputes over rural land in the PRC* (2010) proposed that, in case of disputes over rural land contract operation, the parties may

reconcile themselves, or they may request the villagers' committee, People's government of township and so on. If the parties fail to reconcile or mediate, they may apply to the rural Land Contract Arbitration Commission for arbitration, or due directly to the people's Court. The arbitration of the rural land contracted operation shall not be charged, the financing of arbitration work should be ensured in the budget. Agencies receive complaints from complainants free of charge, and the resulting reasonable costs shall be guaranteed by the local budget. These appeals procedures have been in effect throughout the construction of the project to ensure that affected persons are able to deal with related issues.

Land use right transfer policy of Guangxi region. *Opinions on Guiding and Regulating the Orderly Transfer of Rural Land Management Right in Guangxi region (2015)* stipulated that: whether the land is transferred, how the price is determined and what transfer form to be chosen shall be decided by the contracting farmers themselves, and the proceeds from the transfer shall be owned by the contracting farmers. Without the written entrustment of farmers, rural grass-roots organizations have no right to transfer the contracted land of farmers in any way, nor can they contract the whole group of peasant households in the name of foreign investment with the name of the majority. It is forbidden to promote the land transfer by assigning tasks, issuing targets or including the area and proportion of transfer into the performance appraisal.

Assessment: China and Guangxi region have established a policy system which has standardized the principles, subjects, procedures, transactions, contract management and management agencies on land transfer. The policy stipulated that the transfer of rural land use right should abide by the principle of equal consultation, legal, voluntarily, and paid on the basis of insisting on the peasant household contract management system and stabilizing the rural land contract relationship.

5.1.3 Ethnic Minority Development

In order to guarantee the legitimate rights and interests of ethnic minority residents, the PRC, Guangxi region and prefecture-level cities have formulated a series of policies on ethnic minorities, in terms of development measures, cultural respect, consultation and participation, information disclosure, the support of vulnerable groups and other areas of detailed guidance, to promote the unity and common prosperity of all ethnic groups.

National Ethnic Minority development policies

Respect for the views of minorities. Article 51 and 52 of *the Law on national autonomy of the People's Republic of China* have stipulated that the organs of self-government of autonomous areas must consult fully with their representatives and respect their views when dealing with the special problems of local people. The organs of self-government in autonomous areas ensure that citizens of all nationalities in locality enjoy the civil rights enshrined in the constitution and educate them to fulfill their obligations as citizens.

The economic and social development planning of the ethnic villages. *The opinion on accelerating development in areas inhabited by minorities and ethnic groups* stipulated that the superior party committee and the government shall give support to the economic and social development planning of ethnic areas, villages and groups, and regularly check and supervise. All levels of the comprehensive economic management departments should pay attention to speeding up the economic and social development of minority and ethnic areas in the preparation of medium and long-term planning and annual plans. Ethnic areas, villages and groups should be taken care of in terms of project arrangement and capital investment.

Minority litigation. Article 9 of *the Administrative Procedure Law of the People's Republic of China* (amended in 2014) stipulated that citizens of all nationalities have the right to carry out administrative litigation in their own language and words. In areas inhabited by ethnic minorities or in multi-ethnic communities, the people's Court shall apply the language, text and legal documents of local nationalities. The People's Court shall provide translation to the participants who are not familiar with the common language and text of the local people.

Guangxi Ethnic Minority Development Policy

Regional National Autonomy. Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region implements the system of National Regional Autonomy, that is, under the unified leadership of the state, local governments living in areas inhabited by ethnic minorities implement regional autonomy, set up autonomous organs to exercise autonomy and autonomously administer the internal affairs of their own people and the region. The autonomy of self-government includes: national

legislative power, flexible execution, financial and economic autonomy, culture, language and writing autonomy, the right to organize public power, minority cadres have priority of appointment.

Guangxi 13th five-year plan of ethnic minority development. *Opinions of the People's Government of Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region on Implementing the National 13th Five-year Plan for Promoting the Development of Minorities in Ethnic Areas (2017)* (hereinafter referred to as Opinion) is a programmatic document promoting the economic and social development of ethnic minorities and the communities inhabited by ethnic minorities during the 13th Five-Year Plan period. Opinions put forward that by 2020, Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region with less populous ethnic groups and areas inhabited by ethnic minorities shall simultaneously build a well-off society in an all-round way with the whole country. Opinions stipulated that: 1) Develop industries with national characteristics and support traditional handicrafts enterprises of ethnic minorities, support the construction of traditional handicrafts heritage base for ethnic minorities. 2) Promote the inheritance of intangible cultural heritage, the construction of language resource bases, the construction of traditional sports bases and the compilation of ancient books, develop press and publication, radio, film and television programs as well as non-profit cultural undertakings of ethnic minorities. Strengthen the inheritance and development of the excellent traditional culture of ethnic minorities, especially the less populous ethnic groups. 3) To protect and develop minority-style villages and towns. Focus on cultivating and building demonstration zones for villages and towns with features of ethnic minorities in northwest region, protect and rehabilitate distinctive residential areas. Improve the living environment and give play to the advantages of villages and towns with minority characteristics.

Minority poverty reduction in Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region. *Opinions* requires take overall consideration of poverty alleviation and development in areas inhabited by ethnic minorities and consider them as key areas for poverty alleviation, consider the minority masses as one of the key support objects. Focusing on supporting the development of 164 administrative villages in the areas of Jing, Maonan and Mulao communities (with a population of not less than 20%), as well as the relatively concentrated population of natural villages. Promote Jing populated area to strive to prosper and lift Maonan and Mulao communities off of poverty on schedule.

Minority Development Fund of Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region. *Notice on Printing and Distributing the Administrative Measures on Development Funds for Ethnic Minorities*¹⁷ in Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region (2012, No. 102) stipulated following principles of using development funds for ethnic minorities: 1) It is in line with the development planning of ethnic minority and minority areas in the autonomous region, which is conducive to accelerating economic and social development. 2) Focus on solving the special difficulties in the economic and social development of ethnic minorities and ethnic regions; 3) Comply with relevant national laws, regulations and financial rules and regulations; 4) It is earmarked for special purposes and shall not be crowded, intercepted or misappropriated for other purposes. The use of development funds for ethnic minorities includes: improving the basic conditions for production and living; supporting the development of social undertakings such as education, culture and public health of ethnic minorities and ethnic minorities inhabited areas; supporting the poor people of ethnic minorities in developing planting and breeding industries, promoting new technologies and new breeds, practical technical training in rural areas for ethnic minorities and ethnic minorities, and promotion of advanced and applicable technologies.

Assessment: The state and Guangxi region have formulated a series of policies on ethnic minority development, including respecting for minority views, safeguarding the political equality of ethnic minorities, respecting the customs of ethnic minorities, supporting the development of ethnic minorities, and planning the economic and social development of ethnic communities.

5.1.4 Participation, consultation and Information Disclosure

The *No.1 Document of the Central Government* promulgated in 2018 emphasized that maintaining the dominant position of peasants. Fully respect the wishes of rural people and give full play to the rural residences' ownership.

Requirements for public participation in 13th Five-year Plan of poverty alleviation in Guangxi region. The 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty alleviation in Guangxi region puts forward the establishment of the participation mechanism of

¹⁷ The funds for the development of ethnic minorities in Guangxi region are special funds for accelerating the economic and social development in minorities and ethnic areas. The funds are established by the finance of the autonomous region and are included in the budgets of the Ethnic and Religious Departments for supporting and helping the ethnic minorities in the district to solve the special difficulties on economic and social development.

the poor group, to guarantee the ownership of the poor groups stimulates their enthusiasm, initiative and creativity. *The 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty alleviation in Guangxi region* issued by the Office of Guangxi Provincial People's government (Guangxi Administration Office [2016] No. 193) stipulated innovating the working mechanism of social poverty alleviation and mobilize various units, enterprises, social organizations and individuals to participate in poverty alleviation. Organize cadres and workers to help poor households and contact poor students, and ensure that assistance resources and measures are implemented to every household. Establish a "one household, one card" mode for helping the poor in a unified way in the whole region, raise the enthusiasm and initiative of the poor to lift themselves from poverty.

The Industrial Poverty Alleviation Planning in Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region During the 13th Five-Year Plan Period issued by Industry Development Task Force of Regional Leadership Group for Poverty Alleviation and Development (2017. No. 1) stipulated that: giving full play to the role of the poor people in their own initiative, work hard and strive to change the face of poverty. Promote the construction of the village affairs supervisory committee in poor villages, implement the "four meetings and two openness" (四议两公开)¹⁸, village union and other systems, and improve the village self-government mechanism under the leadership of the Party Organizations. Implement the masses' right to know, to participate and to supervise, and mobilize the masses to actively participate in the process of poverty alleviation planning, project selection and implementation, fund use management and other processes so as to make poverty alleviation work in line with public opinion. Improve the openness of village affairs, explore autonomous organizations such as the establishing councils in villager groups or villages, strengthen supervision by the masses and fully mobilize the enthusiasm of the masses in getting out of poverty.

The 13th Five-year Plan for Economic and Social Development of Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region (2016) required establishing a comprehensive grassroots service platform to coordinate the interests of all parties in society. Improve the institutionalized channels for public participation and governance, seek public opinions and suggestions through residents meetings, deliberations and other ways on important decisions and projects related to public interests. Improve the joint working system of people's mediation, administrative mediation and judicial mediation, establish a comprehensive mechanism for defending the rights according to law and mediating contradictions and disputes. Improve the mechanism of mass appeal and establish petition system. Improve the system of open village affairs, open government affairs and democratic appraisal system, strengthen public supervision and evaluation.

Requirements for public participation in the implementation of poverty alleviation at county level.

- *The 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty alleviation in Teng County* required the organic combination of government leading and mass subject. Give full play to the leading role of the government, implement the local leader responsibility system, increase financial input and policy support, mobilize the participation of social forces extensively. Play the main role of the poor people, guarantee the equal participation and equal development rights of the poor people, and inspire the masses endogenous power.
- *The 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty alleviation in Tianlin County* required extensive mobilization of social forces to participate in poverty alleviation work. Ensure participation of the whole people to promote poor counties, poor people and the region simultaneously into the well-off society.
- *The 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty alleviation in Du'an County* required innovative integration mechanism and multi-linkage of poverty alleviation. The Plan pointed out that in the process of poverty alleviation and development, attention should be paid to the participation of the poor, poverty alleviation projects should go to village. Strengthen the ownership of the poor and improve the initiative and enthusiasm of them to participate.

Requirements for women's public participation.

- *Notice of the General Office of the People's Government on Printing and Distributing the 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty Alleviation in Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region* (2016. No. 193) stipulated to improve the level of practical skills of poor households. In particular, practical skills training and mentoring services for poor women should be strengthened to enhance the capacity of poor women to participate in industrial development.

¹⁸ "Four meetings and two openness" is a set of basic working procedures for democratic decision-making of village affairs under the leadership of village Party organizations. "Four discussions" refers to the proposal of the Village Party Branch, the consultation of "two committees" of the village, the deliberations of Party members and the resolutions of villagers' representatives or villagers' assembly. "Two openness" means the resolution is open and the result of the publicization is open.

- *Measures of the Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region for Implementing the Law of the People's Republic of China on the Protection of Women's Rights and Interests (Revised in 2010)* stipulated that: People's governments at all levels should take necessary measures to gradually improve various systems for safeguarding the rights and interests of women and eliminate all forms of discrimination against women. State organs, social organizations, enterprises, institutions and other organizations should, in accordance with their respective functions, guarantee that women enjoy equal rights with men in politics, economy, culture, society and family. People's governments at all levels and relevant departments shall, according to the needs of urban and rural women, organize women to receive vocational education, practical technical training and labor skill training, so as to provide assistance to women in productive operations and employment.
- *Notice of the People's Government of Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region on Issuing Women and Children's Development Plan (2011, No.69)* defined the main goals and strategic measures for women in six fields of economy, education, health, law, environment and women's participation in decision-making and management. The Notice emphasized greater support for poor women, formulating poverty alleviation measures in favor of poor women and guaranteeing the supply of resources to poor women. Help and support poor rural women to implement poverty alleviation projects, projects such as micro-secured loans should be targeted at poor urban and rural women. Increase support for women's development in rural areas, impoverished areas and ethnic areas. Improve the system, increase investment, optimize the layout of the project to narrow the gap between urban and rural areas in the per capita income level, quality of life, culture and education, health care services, social security and other aspects. Protect women's right to participate in economic and social development according to law, respect women's ownership and guide and support women in their own progress and development.

Information disclosure. *Notice of the General Office of the People's Government on Printing and Distributing the 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty Alleviation in Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region (2016. No. 193)* stipulated establishment of a unified region-wide poverty alleviation information mode, that is "one family, one card". Build social poverty alleviation information Service data platform, release the supply and demand information and show the results of helping. Notice on the implementation plan for the construction of large data platform for poverty alleviation (2016. No.9) required that sub-platform of poverty alleviation big data service be completed in 2019. Which will provide related departments and the general public with services such as poverty alleviation information inquiry, complaint reporting, information interaction and policy navigation, so as to increase public participation and transparency in poverty alleviation.

Assessment: The No. 1 National policy issued to increase the ownership of rural/poor people, the 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty alleviation in Guangxi region and counties, as well as the special poverty alleviation programs, have clearly put forward the establishment and improvement of the participation mechanisms of poor groups and women, aiming at fully mobilizing the enthusiasm of the masses in getting out of poverty and getting rich, guaranteeing the equal rights of the poor to participate in and equality in development and stimulating the masses' intrinsic vitality.

5.1.5 Grievance Redress Measures

The poverty alleviation programs in Guangxi region and three counties have put forward the establishment of social supervision mechanism, the examination of the accountability mechanism and the benefit expression mechanism of the poor group.

National Petition/complaint mechanism

Petition/complain mechanism. Guangxi provincial government has established a perfect petition system to ensure that citizens unimpeded the expression of interest channels. *The petition Ordinance*(came into force on May 1, 2005) stipulated that citizens, legal persons or other organizations could use letters, emails, faxes, telephones, visits and other forms to make recommendations or complaints to the people's Governments at all levels, their views shall be dealt with by the relevant administrative organs according to law (article 2).The working departments of the People's Governments at all levels shall expedite the petition channels and provide convenient conditions for the petitioners. No organization or individual shall retaliate against the complainant (article 3).

Petition Department. Article 6 of *the petition Ordinance* stimulated that the people's Governments at or above the county level should set up petition agencies. The people's Governments of counties, townships and towns shall

determine the institutions and personnel responsible for petition work in accordance with the principle of facilitating the petition. The duties of petition work of the people's Government at or above the county level are: i)Accepting, transferring and forwarding letters and visits submitted by petitioners; ii) Undertaking the matters of petition to be handled by the superior and the people's Government; iii)Coordinating and dealing with important petition matters; iv)Supervision the handling of complaint matters; v)To study and analyze the situation of petition, carry out investigation and research, and put forward suggestions on perfecting policies and improving work to the people's Government in time; iv)Guiding the petition work of other working departments of the People's Government at this level and the subordinate people's government.

Propose of petition matters. The complainant shall make suggestions on the performance of the following organizations and personnel or submit a petition to the relevant administrative organs if they are not satisfied with the conduct of the following organizations and persons: i)Administrative organs and their staff; ii)The organization and its staff authorized by law and regulation with the functions of managing public affairs; iii)Enterprises, institutions and staff providing public services; iv)Persons appointed and dispatched by the State administrative organs in social organizations or other enterprises or institutions; v)Villagers committees, residents committees and their members.

Acceptance of the petition matters. The people's Governments at or above the county level receive and register complaints and make a distinction between them, then dealt with the following manners within 15 days. i)The petitioners who are not satisfied with the review request a further review to administrative organs of the previous level within 30 days from the date of receipt of the written reply. ii) The administrative organ submits a review opinion within 30 days from the date of receipt of the request for review. iii) Petition matters are settled within 60 days from the date of acceptance. If the situation is complicated, the processing period can be extended with the approval of the head of administrative organ. However, the extension shall not exceed above 30 days and the complainant would be informed of the reason for the extension. iv) Where the laws and administrative regulations stipulate otherwise, they shall be prescribed.

Handling and supervising the matters of petition. The administrative organ handles the petition matters, listens to the complainant to present the fact and the reason, requests the complainant, the organization and the personnel to explain the situation if necessary. Investigate other organizations and personnel if further verification of the situation is required. Hold public hearings on major, complex and difficult complaint matters. The scope of hearing, moderator, participants, procedures, etc. are prescribed by the people's Governments of provinces, autonomous regions and municipalities.

Guangxi Poverty Reduction Petition/ Complaint Mechanism

Petition for poverty alleviation. *Notice of the Poverty Alleviation Office on Printing and Distributing the Interim Measures for Handling Petitions on Poverty Alleviation in Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region (2017. No.46)* stipulated that: the masses use letters, emails, faxes, telephones, visits and other forms to reflect situation, make recommendations or complaints to the Poverty Alleviation Departments and the People's Government petition agencies, the Poverty Alleviation Departments deal with cases according to law. Petitions for poverty alleviation should be managed and graded by their respective subordinates, follow the principle of resolving problems in accordance with law combining with education, and separation of lawsuits and petition. The poverty alleviation departments at all levels should set up a leading group and employ 1 to 2 petition staff, providing work space and necessary office conditions. The poverty alleviation departments at all levels shall establish and perfect the petition system according to the relevant regulations, disclose to the society the mailing address, postal code, e-mail, reception time, reception place and telephone number of the unit. At the place of reception or on the website, the laws, rules and regulations and handling procedures related to petitioning work should be announced. Reception environment and conditions should be improved to facilitate the masses to reflect the problem.

Acceptance of petition for poverty alleviation. The poverty alleviation departments at all levels shall accept the following petition matters: i) Consultation on issues related to poverty alleviation operations; issues related to the interests of the masses which should be resolved by the poverty alleviation department. ii) Suggestions and advice on poverty alleviation work. iii) Criticism and suggestions on the post and service performance of poverty alleviation cadres, prosecution of illegal and disciplinary violations of poverty alleviation cadres. iv) Requests for review submitted to poverty alleviation department within the prescribed time limit when it comes to dissatisfaction with the

treatment of the subordinate departments. v) Petition work assigned by superior poverty alleviation department or relevant units and approved by leadership.

Handling procedures of petition for poverty alleviation. Letters, calls, lead mail, online petitions should be handled in accordance with the following provisions: i) The staff of the petition office register and number the petitions mentioned above. ii) Questions of consultation should be answered immediately in accordance with the policy. The matters needing investigation and verification should be transferred to the relevant business center or subordinate poverty alleviation department. iii) Petition work assigned by the leader and relevant units should be referred to the relevant business center for processing in accordance with the instructions. After completion, the contractor department should submit the report to the leader and the action unit, and send a record to the petition room at this level. If petitioners are dissatisfied with the handling opinions of county (city, region) poverty alleviation departments, they may, within 30 days from the date of receipt of the written reply, file an application for review to the administrative organ at higher level.

Assessment: The petition system in Guangxi region is one of the effective ways to express the interests of all citizens. Combined with the requirements of the 13th Five-Year plan of Poverty Alleviation, Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region has stipulated the acceptance of petitions for poverty alleviation work and established a special grievance mechanism for the poor.

5.2 Implementation of Social Management Systems

5.2.1 Implementation of Land acquisition/land donation

(1) Land Acquisition and Resettlement

Review and approval of construction land. State-owned land and peasant collective land in Guangxi region are determined by law to the unit or individual use. Units and individuals who need to use land apply for the use of state-owned land according to law. The construction of occupation land, involving agricultural land conversion to construction sites, handles agricultural land conversion approval procedures. The land administrative departments of the people's Governments at or above county level are responsible for the application, examination and approval of construction sites. The State Council approves when the acquisition area is above 35 hectares of farmland or 70 hectares of other lands.

Public consultation and participation of land acquisition. The public consultation and participation are carried out in preparation and implementation stages of land acquisition in Guangxi region, specifically embodied in: i) Confirmation of land acquisition investigation results. The staff of municipal and county-level land acquisition organizations organize collectively-owned rural economic organizations, peasant households and owners of the attachments on the ground to conduct joint consultations and verification of the proposed land acquisition activities, and obtain the seals or signature confirmation of the land-requisitioned party. ii) Organize the land acquisition hearing work according to the application. The collectively-owned rural economic organizations and peasant households can apply for a hearing on the compensation standards for land acquisition and resettlement approaches. The municipal and county land acquisition agencies organize hearings in accordance with the procedures in *the Land and Resources Hearing Regulations* and relevant requirements to produce a “transcript of the hearing” and accurately reflect the meaning of the land-requisitioned party. When related to social security issues, the human resources and social security departments also participate. ii) After the land acquisition is approved, two announcements and one registration will be carried out. During the announcement period, the opinions of the APs will be accepted and consulted, and the land acquisition compensation and resettlement plan will be modified in accordance with relevant laws, regulations and approved land requisition plans if necessary.

Procedures for approval of land for construction purposes in Guangxi region: application to land administrations for their pre-approval → preparation and issuance of pre-approval report by land administrations → development of “one letter (of explanation) and four plans”¹⁹ by land administrations within 30 calendar days since its receipt of the

¹⁹Letter of explanation on the land, agricultural land conversion plan, cultivated land top-up plan, land acquisition plan and land supply plan.

application → land approved by local people's government → within 10 calendar days after receiving the approval document, city and county people's governments shall disclose the following information at townships/towns and villages where the proposed land is to be acquired: agencies responsible for land acquisition, approval document number, uses, scope and area of land to be acquired, land acquisition compensation rates, methods for resettling agricultural population and validity period for processing land acquisition compensation → payment of land acquisition compensation and compensation for attachments to land and standing crops on land, work out channels for resettling agricultural population → issue to construction units Document of Decision on Allocation of State-owned Land and Document of Approval for Land Use for Construction Purposes²⁰ and register the land in compliance with relevant regulations.

Compensation standards. Guangxi region has formulated and promulgated the unified annual output value standard or district piece comprehensive land price of each city county, land acquisition compensation achieves the same price. In addition, Guangxi region has established the dynamic adjustment mechanism of land acquisition compensation standard according to the level of economic development and the increase of local per capita income. The compensation standard of land acquisition has been adjusted every 2-3 years, the level of land acquisition compensation has been gradually improved. The county level is responsible to ensure that compensation for land acquisition is legal, full and timely paid.

Income restoration strategies for land-taken farmers in Guangxi region:

- Agricultural production-based resettlement. Where land of farmer collectives outside urban planning area is taken, the following types of land shall be used and allocated to land-taken farmers in the first place to ensure that they have necessary cultivated land to continue their agricultural production: unallocated land of farmer collectives, contracted land returned by farmer contractors on a voluntary basis, and increased land as a result of contracted land transfer and land development and consolidation;
- Employment-based resettlement. Favorable conditions shall be created for providing labor skill training and corresponding jobs to land-taken farmers. Under the same conditions, land use entities shall give priority to employing land-taken farmers. Where land acquisition takes place within the urban planning area, local governments shall incorporate landless farmers due to land acquisition into urban employment systems and establish social security systems for them;
- Shareholding-based resettlement. For projects with stable income streams and subject to consultations between rural collective economic organizations and land use entities, farmers can buy, on a voluntary basis, their stocks with land acquisition compensation or buy stocks in proportion to their rights to the land to be used for construction purposes approved according to law. Rural collective economic organizations and farmers shall benefit from preferred stocks through signing contracts with land use entities;
- Relocation-based resettlement. If the local area cannot provide basic production conditions to landless farmers due to land acquisition, the local government can organize their relocation to other areas, subject to extensive consultations with rural collective economic organizations and farmers.
- Vocational training. The government at all levels uses technical schools to strengthen the vocational training of land-taken farmers in working age and improve their employment and entrepreneurial ability. Funds for employment training subsidies and free employment services for land-expropriated peasants are set aside from special funds for employment and re-employment. For each of the land-expropriated peasants, senior-employment-hardship personnel (women over 40 and men over 50) can apply for "re-employment permit", they can get vocational training subsidies, job placement subsidies, social insurance subsidies, vocational skills identification subsidies and public service job subsidies, and enjoy employment support policies such as tax deductions and small-sum guaranteed loans as well. For those land-expropriated peasants who have the will to work independently or start their own business and meet the conditions stipulated in the employment support policy, they can receive free entrepreneurial guidance services from public employment service agencies, and may apply for 2 years of small loans.

²⁰Where use rights to state-owned land are provided on a fee basis, the land administration of city or county people's government shall sign a fee-based land use contract with the land user and issue to the construction unit Document of Approval for Land Use for Construction Purposes; where use rights to state-owned land are provided through land allocation, the land administration of city or county people's government shall issue to the construction unit Document of Decision on Allocation of State-owned Land and Document of Approval for Land Use for Construction Purposes.

- Social security program for land-taken farmers. i)The land-taken farmers who are over 60 years old can receive old-age security every month once the old-age security is fully paid. ii)the land-taken farmers who are within 16 to 60 years old shall pay the old-age security fee according to the provisions. When they are over 60 years old, they may receive old-age security every month with approval of the Labor Security Department. iii)Land -taken farmers who are under 16 years old receive payment of resettlement subsidies at one-time. After reaching the age of employment, they will participate in the corresponding social security according to the employment status. iv) Land-taken farmers who participate in the old-age security have willingness to join in the new rural social endowment insurance shall be actively organized to participation and insured. v)The people's government at the place where the land is requisitioned raise the subsidies for the endowment insurance of land-expropriated farmers through various channels. The subsidies for endowment insurance of land-expropriated farmers are separately listed in the cost of land acquisition and not included in the unified annual output value compensation standard for land acquisition.

Land acquisition management. When the city and county organizations apply for approval in Guangxi region, the compensation for land acquisition is calculated according to the scale of land requisition and compensation standard. The unit that applies for the land pays the deposit beforehand. When it comes to the urban construction land and the land for the individual site selection and construction project, the local government deposits the compensation for the land acquisition. When the land is approved according to law, the pre-deposited compensation would be accounted for in time based on the approval.

Information disclosure of land acquisition. Guangxi region has set up a land acquisition information open platform which officially runs on July 1, 2017. The land information approved before July 1, 2017 has been gradually replenished and incorporated into the provincial land acquisition information disclosure platform. The platform was constructed by the provincial Ministry of Land and Resources, filled out separately by the provincial, municipal and county departments of land and resources. The platform releases construction land approval documents, land acquisition announcements, compensation and resettlement plans and other relevant information in region. The land-taken farmers and the public can access the website of the provincial, city and county land and resources department, and obtain the relevant land acquisition information. In addition, land acquisition information open channels are established through setting up "Land acquisition Information" column on web site of government portal or land resources authority, and the use of newspapers, radio, television, micro blog and other carriers.

Land Inspector. Guangxi Bureau of State Land Inspector is responsible for the independent supervision and inspection of land behavior in Guangxi region, verifying the legality and authenticity of land use and management, supervising and inspecting land management and approving matters and fulfilling the legal duties of land administration. National Land Inspector of the region makes corrective comments within 30 working days if a violation is found. The Department of Land and Resources of Guangxi region opened land and resources illegal hotline (12336) and Tencent Micro-blog (<http://t.qq.com/gxgt2013>).

Survey findings. As administration and implementation agencies of land acquisition, Guangxi Provincial Department of Land Resources, city and county land administration authorities and township land administration stations have rich experience in land administration. Through interviews with staff of Guangxi Provincial Department of Land Resources, social experts found that land acquisition agencies have carried out land acquisition in strict accordance with national and local policies. The county level is responsible to ensure that compensation for land acquisition is legal, full and timely paid. In addition, local governments took specific measures to restore or maintain the land acquisition affected farmers' welfare levels. Field survey observed that some of the measures include: i) village collective land readjustment; ii) jobs training and provision of economic opportunities; iii) enrolment into social security/protection program benefits.

(2) Land donation

Three pilot county survey showed that upgrading village roads, water supply utility and cultural centers in poor villages does not involve the occupation of new construction land. However, some new infrastructure which ownership belongs to village collectives will require village construction land to be constructed. The construction land generally occupies the collective unused land or reserved land or a few of individual farmland and forestland, which will not affect villagers' income or the family property. In practice, the selection of sites for construction of these facilities and the way are determined by the Village Congress, with the method of "one thing, one discussion". The survey found

that villagers were quite in favor of building public welfare facilities or infrastructure and welcome to donate village's construction land or wasteland.

The survey found that, according to the actual situation and practical experience, each village has different methods of implementation on land donation. There are generally several ways: i) The construction land mostly chooses the village collective unused land with a small scale of about 0.3-3 Mu, these lands are provided by the village free of charge. ii) A small amount of farmland or wasteland is obtained by negotiating with the villagers, and the farmers will get the exchange of farmland elsewhere. iii) To consult with the villagers, occupy a small amount of farmland, forestland or wasteland, the village provides land compensation to farmers. For example, farmers in Tianlin County who donate their land receive compensation commensurate with the market price. In general, the compensation price is the same as the cost of land acquisition. Alternatively, the annual compensation to the affected households is about 500 yuan to 1000 yuan in form of land leases.

The survey found that there is not a unified way on land donation in the infrastructure projects of poor villages, some county poverty alleviation offices required the village to provide the land without compensation, others paid compensations or provided lands elsewhere. However, there is rarely land donation contracts, payment certificates or record backups.

Survey findings. Villagers are quite in favor of building public services and infrastructure in the village, however, there is not a unified way on land donation in the infrastructure projects of poor villages. It is recommended to further standardize the community consultation and compensation procedures, to ensure equitable and transparent outcomes. In cases where land is voluntarily donated, or compensation is given to affected families, clear records of the type of compensation shall be documented and archived to improve transparency and standardization.

5.2.2 Implementation of land use right transfer

The transfer of land use right in Guangxi region follows the principle of equal consultation, legal, voluntary and paid to stabilize the rural land contract relationship.

Land Transfer Service Center. By the end of May 2016, 826 townships/ towns have carried out land right transfer work, covering 26.03 million mu of contracted land and 7.008 million peasant households, accounting for over 70% of the second-round contracted cultivated area. At present, some cities in Guangxi region such as Yulin, Nanning, Hechi, Liuzhou, Laibin and Wuzhou have established the Land Transfer Service Center in Guangxi region. The main functions of Land Transfer Service Center are: i) Publicity and consultation. To publicize the laws, regulations and policies of rural land contracting and transfer, and provide relevant policy and legal advice. ii) Information Services. Collect, Audit and reserve the information of rural land transfer, and establish information base, timely report and release the data. iii) Flow audit. Review the qualification of both sides of the flow and check the corresponding flow items. iv) Price guidance. According to the transfer party's application, the organization carries on the appraisal to the land transfer income, provides the price instruction to both sides. v) Contract identification. To instruct the two parties to sign the land transfer contract and to give the verification. vi) Contract supervision. To supervise the implementation of the transfer contract and the use of the transferred land. vii) Dispute mediation. Help to mediate the conflict of land transfer. Coordinate and protect the interests of both sides. viii) File management. To be engaged in the collation, filing and management of land transfer data.

Land transfer information Platform. At present, the National land transfer Information Network has been established (<http://www.tuliu.com/>), it collects and updates information of the country's provinces, municipalities and autonomous regions of rural land, homestead, industrial and commercial land, and has land price inquiry, land information, land forum and other interactive columns. There are several similar national websites such as <http://www.jutubao.com/> and <http://land.lianjiang.gov.cn/>. Guangxi Beibu Wan Equity Exchange has signed a strategic cooperation agreement with Shenzhou Land to jointly set up Guangxi Rural Property Exchange Center, which is an platform of "Internet +" rural property rights transaction and comprehensive service. The platform is to promote agricultural inclusive finance, farmer's credit reference platform and big data platform for agriculture, rural areas and farmers.

The process of rural land transfer in Guangxi region includes two forms, one is individual transfer, and the other is the entrusted transfer.

- The procedure of the individual farmers' land use right transfer in Guangxi region. a) The transfer of the two parties determine the way of transfer, the name, location and area of the land, the price and period of transfer, the income payment methods and so on. b) The two sides sign a written contract with signature and seal on the basis of consensus. c) After the transfer contract is signed, the farmers give two copies of the contract to the employer and township government rural management department for archival reference. d) When the employer receives a copy of the transfer contract submitted by the peasant household, he will register the land transfer and report to the Rural Management Department of the township government regularly.
- The procedure of farmers in Guangxi region entrusting the contracting party to transfer the contracted land. a) The household submits the application for the entrusted transfer signed by the household. b) The employer discusses the decision whether to accept the commission, the results of the discussion are informed to the farmers within 15 days. c) The employer who accepts the entrustment signs contract with the peasant household, the transfer of farmers, plots and other basic conditions are published in appropriate form within 15 days. d) Those who are interested in undertaking the transfer of land submit application in the validity of the announcement by the employer. e) The employer who accepts the entrustment negotiates with applicant to determine the price of the transfer. The employer and applicant draft the transfer contract on the basis of consensus, the draft contract shall enter into force after it has been signed by the client or agent. f) The land transfer contract has four copies, the outflow party, the inflow party, the employer and the Rural Management Department of township government each retains one, the consultation record and entrusted contract are preserved by the employer.

Implementation status of county land transfer.

- While carrying out the work of confirming and registering the rural land contractual management right, Tianlin County guided the rural land contractual management rights to transfer according to law, voluntarily, compensated and rationally in such fields as forestry breeding, fruit cultivation and high- sugar cane. As of February 2017, the total area of rural land transfer in Tianlin County has reached 65,000 mu, accounting for 25% of the total farmland area. The annual income of land transfer has reached 15 million yuan in total. The peasants have gradually realized the increase of their incomes.
- Du'an Yao Autonomous County carried out the work of confirming and registering the rural land contractual management right in 2016. Through land transfer and the development of moderate-scale operation, the entire county transferred 76,900 mu of arable land in 2016, accounting for 17% of the total cultivated land. The scale of operation area was 46,000 mu, accounting for 59.82% of the total transferred land.
- In 2017, Teng County pushed forward land transfer, explored and developed various business entities and launched impoverished households to participate in large-scale operation with the form of land shares. As of October 2017, the county has transferred 95,000 mu of rural land, accounting for 15% of the total cultivated land. More than 600 agricultural cooperatives, 24 leading enterprises, 67 family farms and 2,000 large-scale farming households have been developed.

Survey findings. The land transfer is implemented according to the policy of the state and Guangxi region. At the end of 2016, the land transfer area in Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region accumulated 860 million mu, accounting for about 25% of the total contractual area. At present, the main part of the land transfer in Guangxi region is mainly leading specialized households and peasant, and supplemented by leading enterprises and farmers ' professional cooperatives. In recent years, the rapid development of farmers ' professional cooperatives has promoted the process of land transfer. Land transfer in Guangxi region mainly obey the method of physical valuation and cash settlement, the price is equal to the average net income of local planting crops for two seasons in one year. The land rental price is about 400-1000 yuan currently, which is higher than net income from most cropping activities available to farmers.

5.2.2 Implementation of ethnic minority development

As an autonomous region with a minority population of more than 37.94%, the activities under the Pfor program cover 28 poor counties, 0.42 million poor households and 1.74 million poor people, of which, there are 1.17 million poor ethnic minority people (accounting for 67.64% of the poor population) and 10 poor minority autonomous counties.

The 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty Alleviation in Guangxi region has already targeted the minority, thus the procedures and rules of accurate recognition, accurate exit and poverty alleviation provided in plan is equally applied to poor minorities. The “five precise” principle of poverty alleviation in ethnic minorities of Guangxi region follows *the National 13th Five-Year Plan of Poverty Alleviation*, and is the same as other provinces. It is: i) Carry out field research to ensure accurate identification of the real poor and build a stand-card; ii) ensure the poverty alleviation project is accurate, implement scientific industry driven of "one village, one product" according to the reality of each village; iii) ensure the accurate use of funds, strict management of minority development funds and special poverty funds use; iv) ensure the coordination of accurate contact, each officer or two officers at the deputy level contacts a minority poverty village to help two committees (Chinese Communist Party Branch committee and Villager Autonomy Committee) carry out poverty alleviation; v) ensure that poverty eradication is accurate, strict implementation of work requirements, make sure that every piece of poverty information is detailed.

Guangxi region implemented *the 13th Five-Year Plan for Promoting the Development of minority areas and Ethnic Minorities and Planning of the Action of Prospering Frontier (2016-2020)* issued by State Council, which stressed that the level of basic public service in ethnic communities shall be improved and the outstanding problems and special difficulties faced by economic and social development shall be solved. The key tasks of the minority Work Department of Guangxi region during the 13th Five-year are: (i) promoting the construction of infrastructure in ethnic communities, as well as optimization and upgrading of industrial structure; (ii) promoting coordinated development of urban and rural areas; (iii) accelerating the development of education; (iv) promoting the prosperity and development of minority cultural sports undertakings; (v) strengthen the ability of scientific and technological innovation; (vi) promoting the development of medical and health undertakings in ethnic areas; (vii) improving the employment and social security system in ethnic areas; (viii) promoting the overall poverty alleviation in ethnic areas.

The Ethnic and Religious Committee of Guangxi Autonomous Region implemented the requirements of *Poverty Alleviation Responsibility Book*, which reflected in: 1) Scientifically formulated a distribution plan. Taking poverty as an important factor in allocating development funds for ethnic minorities, ensuring that more than 50% of the funds were invested in 54 impoverished counties throughout the region. In 2017, a total of 365.6 million yuan of Central funds for ethnic minority development were invested in 54 impoverished counties, accounting for 75% of the annual funds. 2) Increased capital investment in the construction of village-grade roads in ethnic areas, assisted the Poverty Alleviation Office to promote the construction of roads in rural villages with the conditions of more than 20 families.

Implementation of Minority Projects in Counties. The counties integrate minority development funds and county finance to jointly promote minority development. In the specific use of the process, combined with the actual situation, the proportion of each county's capital investment is not the same.

- Du'an Yao Autonomous County. According to the public security household registration in 2015, there are 709.6 thousand people in Du'an County, among them, the Zhuang nationality accounts for about 74% of the total population and the Yao accounts for about 22%. 112.45 thousand people of them are poor (2016 data). The Zhuang nationality accounts for 51.12% of the poverty population and other ethnics account for 41.94%. In 2017, Du'an County received a total of 8.84 million yuan of funds for the development of ethnic minorities, 32 projects in remote mountainous areas of ethnic minorities were implemented. Among them, there were 6 newly-built village roads of 6.52 kilometers and 24 hardened village roads of 20 kilometers. 2 new rural water tanks were built, a total of 750 cubic meters. There are 10 members of the Ethnic and Religious Affairs Bureau in Du'an Yao Autonomous County, all of them signed Pledge of Commitment to Reduce Poverty with poor households and filled in the household survey in accordance with the Table of Basic Conditions of Poor Households. Each household posted the Poverty Alleviation Contact Card in Du'an County to implement poverty alleviation policies.
- Tianlin County. There are 267 thousand people in Tianlin County, among them, 195 thousand are ethnic population, involving Zhuang nationality, Yao nationality, Miao nationality etc. 46743 people are impoverished, Han nationality, Zhuang nationality and other nationalities account for 38.01, 43.67 and 15.97 respectively (2016 data). In 2017, the second batch of special funds for poverty alleviation of the central government in Tianlin County (direction of expenditure for ethnic minorities development) was implemented as follows: 1) The roads in Sanyao Village, Lucheng Yao Township were hardened with a total investment of 1.83 million yuan; roads in Liuzhang Village, Badu Yao Township were hardened with a total investment of 600,000 yuan. The projects adopted the way of public bidding, which were led by the County Bureau of Ethnic Affairs and implemented

jointly by the township (town) People's Government. The project funds were managed and used in the light of financial special poverty alleviation funds, which were open and transparent, and announced in accordance with relevant provisions.

Implementation of minority cultural projects. In addition to the work carried out by the Ethnic and Religious Committee, the Culture Bureau attached great importance to the development of minority cultures and the protection of Intangible cultural heritage. For instance, Tianlin County invests 5 million yuan annually in fiscal funds to promote and protect the Zhuang culture. It is mainly used for performances by Zhuang Opera troupes, troupe training and organizing arts festivals. From February to March each year, Cultural Bureau of Tianlin County carries training on amateur Zhuang troupes in rural areas, targeting at the rural Zhuang villagers. In addition, with the efforts of the Cultural Bureau, Tianlin County successfully declared 1 national-level and 7 district-level intangible cultural heritages.

Implementation of Minority Projects in villages. Poverty reduction activities implemented in poor ethnic villages are identified through free, prior, and informed consultations approaches: i) After discussion and consultation by villagers and villager's committee, the ethnic villages report to the Ethnic and Religious Committee and get approval for project implementation; ii) The Poverty Alleviation Headquarters under Poverty Alleviation Office selects projects from project list, then reports to the county government for confirmation. After three rounds of publicity, the projects will be subject to final confirmation. The three rounds of publicity are respectively on the government websites, village bulletin boards and project cards after completion. The cadre of Ethnic and Religions Committee have been arranged to serve as the first secretary in ethnic villages, many grassroots cadres in these villages are themselves ethnic minorities. Grassroots cadres are responsible for contacting the masses, interpreting policies and publicizing policies. Should the poor have difficulties and problems, they usually contact the village cadres firstly. The village cadres report to the township and county governments, which take their concerns then up to the higher-level of governments for resolution, if needed. The investigation showed that some ethnic minorities in remote mountainous areas, especially those aged 40 or over, are not familiar with Mandarin Chinese, and had difficulties on understanding polices and taking training courses, therefore, the channels through which they learned the information are mainly verbal on local native languages through village cadres and villagers.

Survey Findings. Implementation of the 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty Alleviation in Guangxi region concerned about the poor groups of ethnic minorities. All sectors and departments have been integrated funds for the development of ethnic minorities. More than 50% of the minority development funds were invested into 54 impoverished counties to help the minorities get out of poverty. The County Ethnic and Religious Committee, along with Cultural Department, has invested a considerable portion of minority development funds and financial allocation on the development of minority cultures and the protection of intangible cultural heritage. The use of minority development funds includes supporting ethnic enterprises, minority rural practical technique training (including handicrafts) etc. The poverty reduction activities implemented in poor ethnic villages are identified through consultations approaches. The cadre of Ethnic and Religions Committee have been arranged to serve as the first secretary to help minority villages off poverty, in particular serve for those aged 40 or over, and uneducated EM people.

5.2.3 Implementation of public consultation

Public participation and information disclosure. The 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty Alleviation in Guangxi region and three counties proposed clearly that the participation mechanism of poor groups gives full play to the main role of the poor masses, including the following: (i) guide the poor people to change their ideas and concepts; (ii) strengthen their skills training; (iii) enhance their self-development ability; (iv) strengthen supervision and evaluation by the masses; (iv) ensure the sustainability of poverty alleviation projects.

Publicity and awareness education. The Government of Guangxi Autonomous Region at all levels encourages and launches all sectors to take part in poverty alleviation by convening mobilization, policy advocacy and "Poverty Alleviation Day". In the "Poverty Alleviation Day", a letter to the participants of poverty alleviation in Guangxi Region was published, to publicize the deeds and experience of the enterprises, social organizations and citizens' individual participation in poverty alleviation. The Central mainstream media reported 1326 times of poverty alleviation efforts in Guangxi region and regional media coverage of 1921 times. In 2017, governments at all levels in Guangxi region conducted visits to the poor, publicized policies and mobilized production. During the Spring Festival, the region

conducted activities of visiting returnees, investigated returning entrepreneurship and employment intentions, promoted projects to train poor village leaders and village cadre candidates to help lift the poor out of poverty.

During investigation, staff from the poverty alleviation office showed that the awareness education is not effective, some poor households still have the idea of "waiting, relying on, and wanting." Their self-willingness is not strong. They expect the party committees and governments to help solve all the difficulties. Due to the preferential treatment of poverty alleviation, there are still unwillingness to get out of poverty. It is necessary to encourage the poor people to actively participate in getting out of poverty, changing their concepts and cultivating the awareness that "I want to get out of poverty and I want to develop".

Information disclosure. According to the regulations of government information disclosure, the websites of Guangxi provincial and county governments have set up information public columns to establish and perfect the information releasing system. The poverty alleviation office of cities and counties in Guangxi region have carried out information publicity and propaganda on poverty alleviation policies, management methods and experience on the website. In addition, poor counties and towns/townships also pay attention to the propaganda and education of poverty alleviation, every poor village has radios, banners and a bulletin board for poverty alleviation teams. Each poor household has set up a file with a clear card, signed bidirectional commitment and has a brochure on poverty alleviation policies.

Participation and openness of precise identification. Poor precision identification in Guangxi region implements the procedure of "two households, two reviews, two audits, two publicities, one announcement" ("两入户、两评议、两审核、两公示、一公告"). In the link of "two reviews and one announcement", the villagers' group holds a convocation to review the evaluation of the household survey and to publicize the results of the appraisal. After publicity, the village committee carries on another round of deliberation. In the stage of auditing and confirming the poor households, all cities and counties determine the number of poor households and poor people according to the scores and the grading order of farmers. After examination and verification of each township (town), the list of the poor households in the administrative villages is confirmed. The two committees organize village cadres and villagers' groups to review the list of poor people again, then publicize the list for 5 days in village. During the publicity, villagers may, if there is any objection, make a complaint or call the village committee, the township (town) will organization personnel to investigate and review. After the public notice of poor households is dissent, it will be confirmed by the leading group of the county (city and district) and announced for 7 days on the government websites and villages.

Participation and openness of accurate exit. There are five procedures for poor household to exit poverty precisely: home verification → village-level review → township audit publicity → county-level examination and approval notice → record for municipalities and autonomous regions. Township People's Government publicize a list of first instance submitted by administrative villages for 3 days. During the publicity period, villagers may disagree with the township people's government if there is any objection, and the township people's government organizes personnel to investigate and review. County-level poverty alleviation and development leadership team reviews the exit list reported by township/ town, and issues the annual poverty alleviation approval file. The exit list is announced in administrative villages in the end.

In the implementation of poverty alleviation program, a variety of forms of information disclosure and participation of poor groups have been carried out in poor counties in Guangxi region, policy brochures were issued to poor villages and households. "Package Insurance" is adopted in the work of poverty alleviation, each poverty alleviation cadre help 5 poor households to recognize poverty, analyze causes of poverty, promote poverty alleviation policies pointedly and help poor households develop poverty alleviation programs. In addition, there is a female cadre in each work team of the villages to help women get out of poverty. In each poor village, the villagers' group announces the complaint telephone numbers of the autonomous region, city, county and township (town), and accepts the masses' complaints. (Complaint telephone number of poverty alleviation and development leading group in region level: 0771-5782887; complaint telephone number in Guilin City: 0773-2848875; complaint telephone number in Du'an Yao Autonomous County: 0778-5212268).

Women in poverty alleviation. The autonomous Women's Federation and the Poverty Alleviation Office jointly planned to reduce poverty by taking part in rural tourism development, cultivated the "Golden Hydrangea" farmhouse demonstration site, gave priority to poverty alleviation loans and related financial support to the demonstration of the

poor. Since its establishment in 2016, a total of 131 demonstration sites for "Golden Hydrangea" have been set up, and subsidies of 100,000 yuan per model point have been allocated to subsidies from the special funds for poverty alleviation. This has effectively helped the peripheral poor women to get out of poverty.

Experience of participatory poverty alleviation in Guangxi World Bank loan Project. The World Bank has a wealth of experience in poverty alleviation projects. From 2006 to 2011, Guangxi participated in the World Bank's Poverty Rural Community Development Project (PRCDP). Based on the participatory learning system and the successful experience of participatory planning in Pilot Village, this project completed participatory poverty analysis and participatory poverty alleviation planning in the project villages. In the participatory poverty alleviation planning, the project took the community as the center, respected the customs and wishes of the community, emphasized the participation of the remote areas, women and the destitute households. The project used the community's own democratic decision-making, voting and selection, adopted a bottom-up approach to development planning. In the infrastructure sub-projects, during the implementation and construction process of project application-- land acquisition coordination-- the project decision-making contracting-- project implementation-- project acceptance-- follow-up management, the community was involved, and also required 30% of women participation. The Agricultural sub-project included: planning-- peasant household application-- field workstation site verification-- county office verification-- signed loan agreement-- batch loan-- project implementation for poor households-- county and township monitoring-- repayment, loans disbursement was mainly targeted at poor households, especially the vulnerable groups. During the meeting, the Poverty Alleviation Office of Guangxi region and County government expressed that, the World Bank's PRCDP served as a good model for raising the capacity of self-organization, self-management and self-supervision of poor communities in sustainable development and enhancing the subjectivity of the poor.

Survey Findings. The 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty alleviation in Guangxi region and the three counties had proposed clearly the participation mechanism of poor groups, required to give full play to the self-management capabilities of poor villages and enhance the ownership of poor people. During the investigation, staff from the poverty alleviation office raised that the awareness education is not effective, the Poverty Alleviation Office of all counties proposed to lead the poor people to change their mindset and improve their ability to self-development. The idea of "asking me to lift myself out of poverty" into "I want to get out of poverty" is a problem faced by the poverty alleviation work. It is suggested to conduct further community engagement and awareness education program by learning the work experience of model provinces and cities, and improve the way of publicity, to enhance the self-organization, self-management and self-supervision of poor communities for sustainable development ability.

5.2.4 Implementation of grievance redress measures

Guangxi has implemented public comments on petition matters. The competent administrative organs and petition agencies at all levels of the region handled petitions for difficult matters in the form of open council. Third-party councilors were invited to attend statements, arguments, testimony, comments and other procedures, to identify the facts, clarify responsibilities and resolve petitions matters.

On November 3, 2017, Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region opened up a green channel for petitions in the field of poverty alleviation. The whole region and the three counties attached great importance to petitions arising from poverty alleviation and gave priority to supervision and follow-up. The Discipline Inspection Bureau of the Poverty Alleviation Office published the relevant information on poverty alleviation petition, the scope of receiving prosecution, accusation and complaint in the disciplinary Inspection Unit is: i) Reporting and prosecuting the Poverty Alleviation Office for violating laws and regulations and using its power for personal gain. ii) Appeals against party members' dissatisfaction with the other disciplinary actions taken by Party discipline disposal or discipline inspection organs. iii) other issues involving the party discipline and party style, the political style of political issues. Supervision and reporting channels are: i) Office Tel: 0771 -2835920.iii) E-mail: gxfpjc@163.com. iii) Guangxi Poverty Alleviation Information Network "I want to report" platform. iv) Mailing address: Discipline Inspection Team of Poverty Alleviation Office in Autonomous Region, No.1 of Minle Road, Nanning, Guangxi Region. Zip code: 530012.

In 2017, Guangxi region completed the project construction of public information management and service platform for petition (Phase II). The petition big data platform has been initially completed. On the basis of the website petition, the new We-chat petition and mobile phone APP petition have further facilitated the masses to address petition appeals. The Petition Bureau of Guangxi region formulated and issued *Guiding Opinions on Standardization Work of Guangxi*

Online Petition, and held on-site online petition work meetings in Civil Affairs Department and Yulin City. Localities and departments in region have set up more than 3,000 online petition windows and established an online volunteer team of over 5,000 people. The district-wide video interview system covering 14 cities and 111 counties has been completed and connected with the State Petition Bureau, the system has the functions of video conference and video interview, which provides more effective means for petition work.

Petition work in Tianlin County. Since 2016, Commission for Discipline Inspection in Tianlin County has broadened the channels of petitioning and launched the "Convenient Petition Card." At present, a total of more than 20,000 copies of the card have been printed and distributed to 165 households in the county by the poverty alleviation work team and the village discipline inspection committee. The card printed on the report site, the report phone, mailing address, e-mail, reporting procedures and other information to facilitate the public consultation, problems can be directly reflected. In 2016, the Tianlin Petition Bureau handled 25 complaints from the masses about petitions in the field of poverty alleviation and completed 25 cases.

Center for Comprehensive Management of Petition and Stability in township/ town. Each Comprehensive Management Office in township/ town has one or two cadres who are responsible for the petition maintenance. Once accepting letters or visits, the front desk staff on duty is the chief responsible person, he or she has the duty to ask the situation and complete registers the record whether or not the problems and demands raised by the masses belong to their own areas of responsibility. Answer the problems if they are able to solve on own. If the problem needs to be referred to other departments for settlement, timely transfer and supervise.

One village, one legal adviser. The Legal Adviser participates in the petition work, mainly provides the legal consultation, answers the legal question, raises the legal opinion and assists the petition person to solve the problem through the legal way. The county Judicial Bureau adopts working mechanism of "one village, one legal adviser", the township/ town Judiciary contacts village Legal Advisers to resolve disputes and participate in the villagers mediation on the spot. The Legal counsel, town government leaders, the Comprehensive administration office and the Judicial Department cooperate to solve the villagers' complaints, the process is: the town government leader presides over, the local village committee submits the dispute, the populace complements, the judicial center induces the contradictory focal point, the Center for Comprehensive Management proposes the mediation plan, the populace appraises, finally the village legal adviser (County Law Aid Center's lawyer) carries on the detailed legal explanation to this case.

Survey findings. Guangxi has implemented public comments on petition matters and has set up a system of letters or calls for poverty reduction program at all levels. In addition, the Legal Adviser participates in the petition work, mainly provides the legal consultation, answers the legal question, raises the legal opinion and assists the petition person to solve the problem through the legal way. In the investigation of the poor village, poor households expressed that when they have problems with poverty alleviation, they usually go to village cadres or stations in the village team instead of going directly to the township for petition.

5.3 Performance of Social Safeguards Management Agencies and Capacity²¹

5.3.1 Poverty Reduction Institutional Arrangement

In order to promote the work of poverty alleviation in Guangxi region and achieve poverty alleviation program objectives, Guangxi established a leading group for poverty alleviation and set up Guangxi provincial poverty alleviation and development office as a provincial government department. Cities and counties in Guangxi have also set up a leading group for poverty alleviation, and established the poverty alleviation and development office. The members/headquarters of the leadership group at all levels include the Women's Federation and Bureau of Ethnic and Religious Affairs. The Women's Federation and Bureau of Ethnic and Religious Affairs have developed and implemented poverty alleviation programs for women or minorities combining with 13th Five-year Plan of Guangxi

²¹ According to the deliberation of the 13th session of the National People's Congress in March 2018, the State Council will implement reforms to form the Department of Natural Resources, and will no longer retain the Ministry of Land and Resources; set up the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural, will no longer retain the Ministry of Agriculture; set up the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, The Ministry of Culture will no longer be retained; the Ministry of Supervision will be incorporated into the newly formed National Monitoring Committee. At present, the provincial level and below have not yet been reformed, however, may be reformed accordingly later on.

region, cities and counties, being also present into villages and households as members of poverty alleviation work team.

The working mechanism of poverty alleviation program in Guangxi region in 13th Five-Year. Guangxi provincial government has overall responsibility; county governments are responsible for the implementation of the specific implementation. It is Guangxi provincial government's responsibility to connect poverty alleviation work up and down, to coordinate between areas, supervision and inspection. Leaders of county governments are the first responsible person for poverty alleviation. The mechanism of cadres in the village aid work have been established, clearing responsibilities, strengthening management services and assessment. The first Secretary of the poor village and the appointed task force in the village have the roles to stimulate endogenous motivation of grassroots organizations and poor people, to supervise and manage poverty alleviation funds, to guide grassroots to carry out poverty alleviation.

The management mechanism of 13th Five-Year poverty alleviation program in Guangxi region. A series of implementation management measures have been set up such as *Implementing measures comprehensive and integrated use of financial agriculture funds in Guangxi region, the method of accurate recognition and management of poverty alleviation objects in Guangxi region, Measures for evaluating the effectiveness of poverty alleviation in Guangxi region, Measures for the implementation of poverty exit in Guangxi region and Measures for the management of poverty alleviation funds in Guangxi region.* Poverty big data management mechanism, rewards and punishments of poverty alleviation work, supervision and inspection measures and third party evaluation mechanism has been established in the meanwhile.

Poverty alleviation training on grass-roots party members and cadres. Through party-wide poverty alleviation conferences, special training sessions, the party members and cadres at all levels in the region, including First Secretary, cadres and "two committees" in villages got trained. In 2017, a special budget was devoted to train cadres in the "two committees" of impoverished villages, focusing on such issues as exiting poverty, financial poverty alleviation, industrial poverty alleviation, education poverty alleviation, electricity supplier poverty alleviation and village-level collective economic development. A total of five training courses were held, 733 people got trained.

Institutional capacity Assessment. The poverty alleviation institutions in Guangxi region are established and equipped with qualified staff and adequate working expenses. Poverty alleviation department of the province and the three counties have high sense of responsibility, are implemented in accordance with the Guangxi region and the county planning and the management system in 13th Five-Year, and the institutions work well. In addition, the members/headquarters of the leadership group at all levels include the Women's Federation and Bureau of Ethnic and Religious Affairs. The Women's Federation and Bureau of Ethnic and Religious Affairs have developed and implemented poverty alleviation programs for women or minorities combining with 13th Five-year Plan of Guangxi region, cities and counties, and also into villages and households as members of poverty alleviation work team.

5.3.2 Land Acquisition Management and Land Transfer Agencies and Capacity

Land acquisition and land transfer are respectively in charge by the department of Land and Resources and the department of Agriculture. Their institutional capacities are assessed as follows:

(1) Department of Land and Resources

Department of Land and Resources of Guangxi region, cities and counties are in charge of land acquisition and management. 17 offices have been established, the main responsibilities are: protecting and making rational use of the province's land resources; optimizing the land and resources of the whole province; regulating the management of land and resources ownership in the province; bearing the responsibility for the protection of cultivated land in the province; ensuring that the amount of cultivated land and the amount of basic farmland are not reduced; provision of land use data in the province timely and accurately; bearing the province's savings and intensive use of land resources responsibility; standardizing the order of land and resources in the whole province; supervising the registration of real estate, such as land registration, housing registration, forest land registration, grassland registration; promoting the province's land and resources. There are over 800 staff members in Department of Land and Resources in Guangxi Region, also, there are fixed office locations and equipment. Department of Land and Resources of Guangxi region made regular training of land management personnel in counties, cities and towns to improve land management and implementation of the business level of personnel. The annual training expenses were borne by Finance.

Department of Land and Resources is established in each county in responsible for land acquisition within the county. The main functions are: organizing the implementation of national land laws and regulations, organizing weaving and implementation of national land use planning, participating in land approval, implementing land administration according to law, developing cultivated land and protect basic farmland. For example, there are 10 functional units (rooms) in Tianlin Bureau of Land and Resources, including Planning and Finance Unit, Planning Tillering Unit, Cadastral Management Unit, Surveying and Mapping Management Unit, Mineral Development and Management Unit, Geological Environment Unit, petition Office, Laws and Regulations and Enforcement Monitoring unit, Land Use Unit and so on.

Institutional capacity Assessment. Land resources Management departments have been set up in cities and counties in Guangxi region, the towns/townships have also set up Land Management Stations to manage and implement land acquisition in the region of Guangxi region. The organization is reasonable and runs efficiently, the personnel is complete and the equipment is advanced. Through the discussion with staff of land use approval and Farmland Protection Unit in County Department of Land and Resources, we found that personnel who are responsible for land acquisition and management have strong business ability with bachelor degree. Work of land acquisition and demolition has been implemented in strict accordance with policies and procedures. Staff is trained 1 to 2 times a year on land policy implementation and land management in the provinces and municipalities.

(2) Department of Agriculture

According to article 5 of *the management measures for the transfer of rural land use right*, the departments of agricultural administration (or rural operation and management) of the people's government at or above the county level are responsible for the management of rural land use rights transfer and contract management in the administrative region in accordance with the functions prescribed by the people's government at the same level. Land lease and transfer are managed by provincial and county level department of agriculture. Land use rights transfer follows the principle of equal consultation, legal, voluntary and paid, the parties sign a lease or transfer contract.

The Agriculture Department of Guangxi region is equipped with 14 offices, including personnel office, policy and regulations office, rural reform guidance office, rural economic system and management office, market and economic information office, agricultural products quality and safety supervision office, planning and finance office, science and technology education office, Foreign Economic Cooperation Office, Grain and Oil Crops Office, Economic Crops Office, Party Committee and Retired Staff Office, one conditional commission for Discipline Inspection of the autonomous region. The provincial Department of Agriculture conducts annual business training and the cost of training is financially burdensome.

The county Agriculture Department is responsible for the management of rural land use rights transfer and contract management in the region. The township government establishes the land transfer service center which is located at the rural agricultural and economic station (or integrated service center). The land transfer service center manages land transfer issues such as transfer contract, transfer price, etc. The village accountant was appointed the land transfer information officer in villages.

In order to solve rural land use rights disputes in a fair and timely manner, safeguard the legitimate rights and interests of the parties, and promote rural economic development and social stability, Arbitration law on the arbitration of land use rights in rural areas of the People's Republic of China(2009) stipulated that the parties shall settle the dispute by themselves in general when it occurs to land use rights disputes, the villagers committee, township (town) people's government can also be asked to mediate. If a party fails to settle or mediate or refuses to settle or mediate, he may application for arbitration to the rural land contract arbitration commission or brings a suit directly to a people's court.

Institutional capacity Assessment. The investigation found that the agricultural department in Guangxi region has been well established, qualified staff and adequate work resources were provided to regulate and manage land transfers. The land transfer service platform has been set up including the county level land transfer service centers and land transfer networks. The rural land arbitration commission has been established to resolve disputes over land transfer in rural areas in a timely manner and safeguard the legitimate rights and interests of all contractual parties.

5.3.3 Ethnic minority Management Agencies and Capacity

The Ethnic and Religious Affairs Committee of Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region belongs to the people's government of Guangxi Region. Its main responsibilities are: implementing the guidelines and policies of the Party Central Committee and the State Council on ethnic and religious affairs; coordinating and promoting the work of members of the ethnic working committees and other relevant departments of the autonomous region in performing their duties related to ethnic affairs; putting forward suggestions on how to coordinate ethnic and religious relations; studying and analyzing the economic development and social undertakings of ethnic minorities and ethnic minorities inhabited areas, and putting forward policy recommendations. The Ethnic and Religious Affairs Commission of Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region has 11 sub-committees and 6 direct reporting units. There are 431 staff members in Ethnic and Religious Affairs Commission of Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region, all of whom have bachelor degree or above. There are fixed workplaces and advanced working equipment. The provincial ethnic affairs committee conducts business training for the personnel of ethnic religious institutions at all levels annually, and the training expenses are borne by the financial burden.

The Bureau of Ethnic and Religious Affairs in counties is responsible for coordinating the ethnic relations of the whole county and promote equality, unity and mutual assistance among all ethnic groups; protecting the lawful rights and interests of ethnic minorities according to law; dealing with matters relating to ethnic relations; establishing and improving a comprehensive evaluation and monitoring system for the development of ethnic minority undertakings, promoting the implementation of the national service system and the information construction of ethnic affairs management; organizing the recognition activities of national unity and progress. It also works with relevant departments to develop special policies and measures for the development of ethnic and ethnic enclaves in the whole county, and carry out alleviate poverty work of ethnic minorities, promote the development of social undertakings such as education, technology, culture, health and sports.. The Bureau of Ethnic and Religious Affairs in cities and counties is involved in allocation of special loans and special funds for ethnic minorities.

Besides the Ethnic and Religious Affairs Committee, the Cultural Bureau, the Transport Bureau, the Health and Planning Commission at all levels are all important organs for the development of ethnic minorities. The cultural department of the Autonomous Region has 60 staff members and 9 internal institutions, mainly responsible for the formulation of cultural and arts industry development planning, organization and implementation of intangible cultural heritage protection, inheritance and popularization of outstanding minority culture. The Transport Bureau is responsible for undertaking planning and coordination involving the integrated transportation system in the region and supervising the market of highway and waterway construction in the whole region, it has 14 internal institutions. The Health and Planning Commission is mainly responsible for guiding the region's primary health and family planning, maternity and child health services; responsible for health and family planning publicity, health education and so on.

Institutional capacity Assessment. There are 1.17million impoverished minorities in 28 targeted counties, accounting for 67.64% of the total poor population. Ethnic and religious management institutions have been established in provincial, municipal and county level in Guangxi region, with special staff, work place and good equipment. The staff has a college degree or above and receives policy training every year, they have ability to carry out poverty alleviation work in poor villages and groups according to the requirements of the policies of poverty alleviation and ethnic minorities in Guangxi region. The survey found that the ethnic and religious committees at all levels were responsible for the implementation and management of minority funds, and they are under the list of poverty reduction leading group at all levels to cooperate with poverty alleviation departments for 13th five-year plan implementation.

5.3.4 Women's Federation Management Agencies and Capacity

In order to protect women's rights and promote gender equality, the Women's Union of Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region established women's organizations from the top down. The main responsibilities of the Women's Federation are: to train women in vocational and technical skills and to train women cadres at multiple levels; to represent women in the democratic management and democratic supervision of state and social affairs; to serve women and children; to serve grassroots units; to undertake the office of the Women and Children Working Committee of the Autonomous Region Work etc. 14 prefecture-level cities, 109 counties (cities, urban areas), 1126 townships (towns) and 14,816 village committees, streets and communities in the whole region have set up women's federations. Women's committees have been established by organs and public institutions above the county level, and there are nearly 2,300 full-time cadres above the townships in Guangxi regions. In addition, the Women's Federation also contacts more than

5000 members from various groups, including the trade union women workers 'committee, the women workers' committees of colleges and universities, all kinds of women's associations, women leaders, sorority associations of women, and women judges associations. The Women's Federation carries out business training every year, and the training costs are borne by the government.

Women's federations at all levels of Guangxi region have mobilized and organized women to participate in economic and social development and poverty alleviation programs. For instance, Women's Federation in Tianlin County has implemented a "Six-for-One" campaign of an inspirational preaching, a skill training, an off-poverty stalemate, a volunteer service, a small hands-on hand, and a signature commitment. They also organized the "grassroots activities to send warmth" to visit condolences and focus on helping disadvantaged groups such as single poor mothers. Training workshops on "planting and nurturing skills into women's homes" were organized, to carry out pig breeding knowledge training classes for poor women and enhance poor women's ability to shake off poverty. Since 2017, Guangxi has carried out the training activities of "young women farmers". The Agriculture Department gives 500,000 yuan of special funds each year to cultivate new-type professional farmers for carrying out cultivation work. At the same time, as an undertaking province of "new vocational female farmer training courses in rocky desertification area of Yunnan, Guangxi and Guizhou", more than 80 poor minority women in Guangxi have benefited from training courses.

Women's Federations in villages. In 2017, Women's Federation in Guangxi region conducted the general election of the grass-roots organizations in villages (communities) and the reconstruction work of the Women's Federation. The village women's federations executive committee generally comprise 9 to 11 members. The main responsibilities of the Women's Federation in administrative villages/ communities are: improve the overall quality of women in administrative villages / communities, organize various training, exchange and seminars; care for the life and health of women and children; carry out various activities and various forms of service; promote and participate in the formulation and implementation of policies concerning women's development; regularly hold community women's congress and so on. The village women's federation helps rural women to get out of poverty by setting up "Golden Hydrangea" farmhouse demonstration sites, fostering a new type of female farmers, providing small loans to support entrepreneurship and domestic service.

Institutional capacity Assessment. The survey found that women's federations in Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region have established top-down women's organizations, providing qualified personnel and adequate working resources to safeguard women's rights and promote equality between men and women. In addition, women's federations in autonomous regions, municipalities and counties have organized a series of activities to enhance the ability of poor women to lift themselves out of poverty and self-development.

5.3.5 Public Participation and complaints Management Agencies and Capacity

(1) Information disclosure

Under the relevant provisions of *the government information disclosure ordinance (decree No. 492)* of the People's Republic of China, the office of the people's government of Guangxi region established government information leading group, the office located in the administrative service center management office. Combining the reality of the province, *Notice of the General Office of the People's Government of Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region on the Key Priorities in Opening the Government Information (2013, No. 126)* was issued to arrange and deploy government information in key areas. The Notice required the disclosure of information related to people's livelihood.

According to the regulations of *the government information disclosure ordinance*, information public columns have been set up on the websites of Guangxi region and county governments to establish and improve the information distribution system and clarify the procedures and responsibilities of the review. In 2016, the relevant staff of municipal and county-level governments was trained in information disclosure regulations and methods, which improved the working ability of government information disclosure.

The provincial and county poverty alleviation office in Guangxi region has conducted information publicity on government websites and promoted poverty alleviation policies, management practices and experience. Impoverished counties have also established an open participatory mechanism for accurate recognition and exit of poor villages and rural households.

Institutional capacity Assessment. Guangxi provincial and municipal governments at all levels have set up the Government Information public office in Guangxi Provincial People's government office, and have opened up government information of 10 key areas on government websites at all levels.

(2) Grievance Redress Mechanism

The petition Bureau of Guangxi region and petition departments in cities and counties along with petition agencies of the relevant functional departments of poverty alleviation industries are responsible for the mass petition work. Main duties of the petition Bureau in Guangxi provincial, municipal and county level. i) To formulate relevant policies, laws and regulations of petition work and to organize and implement them. ii) To receive letters from the people, receive visitors and provide the public with relevant laws, regulations and policy advisory services on behalf of provincial, municipal and county committees and governments. iii) To undertake the petition matters assigned by the superior leading authority and the leaders; assign petition matters to the relevant units and supervise the handling and implementation of important petition matters; conclude cases. iv) To coordinate and deal with the important petition events across the region and department; supervise on important cases and put forward treatment opinions and suggestions to the responsible persons. v) Analyze and study the work situation, solicit the suggestions of the masses, provide the government with petition information in time and put forward opinions and suggestions on important issues. vi) To guide the petition work in all provinces, exchange work experience and propose improvement measures; to organize the training of petition cadres and guide the construction of office automation in petition departments. vii) To be responsible for publicity and information dissemination of petition work.

The regional Petition Bureau has 6 functions (rooms) and 62 public officers. The main departments of the municipal Petition Bureau are: Office, Processing Branch, Supervision section, Access section, contact section, Network Petition Branch, Sentiment public opinion Branch, Risk Assessment Division and Review office. In addition, Guangxi Poverty Alleviation Office also set up a petition agency which is responsible for reception of petitioners, and accept the case of poverty alleviation petition.

In March 2017, *the Guidance Opinions on Establishing a Third-Party Expert Library for Participating in Petition* was promulgated at the level of the autonomous region. The expert library of third-party participating petition in the autonomous region, which is composed of 80 professionals including Party representatives, NPC deputies, professional lawyers and reporters has been built. Lawyers' participation in petition work has further deepen, 123 lawyers from 39 law firms went to Petition Bureau to accept petition visits and on duty. The autonomous region has established the Legal adviser system at this level, the petition Bureau and Wanyi Law Firm signed the resident Legal Adviser agreement. Guangxi Region has implemented Professional Lawyer's Opinion system of legal argumentation on decision of major petition work, introduction of important documents of petition and handling of major petition matters.

County Petition Bureau. Petition Bureau in Tianlin County has set up secretarial unit, visiting unit, letter-unit, supervision unit and hotline telephone unit. There are 12 staff members. One or two members from Petition Bureau are responsible for petition and stability work of special departments. Each township/ town is equipped with 1 to 2 cadres in charge of petition and stability work in Comprehensive Management Office. Village-level organization has one village cadres responsible for petition and stability work. The counties take various forms to publicize the Regulations on petition and relevant normative documents, and popularize the knowledge of petition regulations. Annual business training has been carried out on cadres from units, townships, towns and villages.

Institutional capacity Assessment. The petition Bureau of Guangxi region, cities and counties have been set up, the relevant functional departments of the poverty alleviation industries have established petition agencies and work well, they played a great role in resolving social conflicts. In addition, poverty reduction various activities have particular channels to deal with disputes.

SECTION VI: ASSESSMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL SYSTEM AGAINST PforR POLICY AND DIRECTIVE

The legal framework for environment management in China is comprehensive and is evolving toward international standards. The legal framework of laws, regulations, guidelines, policies, and standards, as well as the implementation mechanism provide full coverage over the environment and health and safety aspects. In general, the framework is consistent with the Bank PforR Policy and Bank PforR Directive in terms of principle and key elements. The legal framework provides a reasonable basis for addressing environmental issues likely to arise in the proposed Program.

An assessment of environmental management systems relevant to the activities supported under the Program for each PforR Bank Policy and respective Bank PforR Directive is presented below.

PforR Policy (a): Promote environmental and social sustainability in the Program design; avoid, minimize, or mitigate adverse impacts, and promote informed decision-making relating to the Program's environmental and social impacts.

The legal framework of environmental management aims to promote environmental and social sustainability as ultimate objectives through comprehensive laws, regulations, guidelines, and institutional arrangements. These are supported by political commitment at the highest level for developing an ecological civilization. It prioritizes prevention and defines a comprehensive assessment system to promote informed decision making. Overall, the legal framework of environmental management in China is fully consistent with the Bank PforR Policy.

PforR Key Directive: Operate within an adequate legal and regulatory framework to guide environmental and social impact assessments at the Program level.

China has developed an adequate legal framework for environmental and social impact assessment for infrastructure construction projects. This framework includes comprehensive laws, regulations, technical guidelines, standards, institutional arrangements, and practice procedures that apply nationwide. Over the decades, it has gradually evolved into a comprehensive system that is consistent with the internationally accepted good practices.

PforR Directive: Incorporate recognized elements of environmental and social assessment good practice, including: (i) early screening of potential impacts; (ii) consideration of strategic, technical, and site alternatives (including the "no action" alternative); (iii) explicit assessment of potential induced, cumulative, and transboundary impacts; (iv) identification of measures to mitigate adverse environmental or social impacts that cannot otherwise be avoided or minimized; and (v) clear articulation of institutional responsibilities and resources to support implementation of plans.

The Chinese EIA system has well-defined screening principles, technical manuals and guidelines to guide the environmental screening and classification of EIA categories early in the project preparation stage. The new Environmental Protection Law (2015) requires that plan EA be conducted for the land use plan and sectoral development plan and its conclusions and recommendations will be used as the basis for development project EA. This requirement has enhanced the early screening in EA.

The Plan EA Technical Guideline (2014) requires the comprehensive analysis of plan options and recommendations for optimizing the plan, which include the consideration of layout, routes, siting, and technical aspects. Thus, generally the analysis of alternatives for a specific development project is unnecessary provided that it is consistent to the plan. The EIA guidelines require assessment of potential, induced, cumulative, and trans-boundary impacts.

The EIA system emphasizes preventive measures, such as avoiding environmentally and socially sensitive sites as much as possible from the outset. Based on assessment of potential impacts, measures are developed to minimize, mitigate and/or compensate the impacts encountered. These measures are required to be built into construction contracts and will be monitored and supervised by environmental authority during the operation of the project.

The EIA system requires institutional arrangements with clear responsibilities and resources in the environmental management plan to support implementation.

The EIA system requires timely disclosure of project and EA information. Project proponents must announce both the preparation and disclosure of EA documents to the environmental authority prior to approval. Public consultation is mandatory by EIA law for projects that require EIA Reports and responses to public comments must be included in the EIA report. Upon receipt of EA documents, local EPBs will conduct public consultation by disclosing the full EA documents and soliciting public feedbacks through their websites before approving the report. Environmental grievance/complaint systems are well established in Guangxi's provincial and local EPBs and include universally available internet registries and phone hotlines.

Generally, the EIA system applied to the activities supported under the Program is well aligned with the key planning elements of the Bank PforR Policy in terms of screening, alternative analysis, assessment of cumulative impacts, development of mitigation measures, requirements of institutional arrangements for implementation, and public consultation and grievance redress.

PforR Policy (b): Avoid, minimize, or mitigate adverse impacts on natural habitats and physical cultural resources resulting from the Program.

PforR Directive: Include appropriate measures for the early identification and screening of potentially important biodiversity and cultural resource areas; support and promote the protection, conservation, maintenance, and rehabilitation of natural habitats; avoid the significant conversion or degradation of critical natural habitats; or, if avoiding the significant conversion of natural habitats is not technically feasible, include measures to mitigate or offset the adverse impacts of the Program activities.

The EIA guidelines provide detailed guidance on the identification and screening of sensitive environmental and cultural resources, including surveys of baseline environmental data. Key sensitive areas such as rivers, reservoirs, nature reserves, wetland parks, forest parks, and scenic areas are identified for detailed survey and special assessment. Cultural resources are screening through consultation/approval of the relevant authority and field investigation. Therefore, the Chinese EIA system has well established processes for early identification and screening of potentially important biodiversity and cultural resource areas that are consistent with this key element.

The Chinese environmental protection system emphasizes the protection, maintenance and rehabilitation of natural habitats through a comprehensive set of laws, regulations, guidelines and standards. Avoiding such sensitive areas is the top priority of the EIA. Special assessment is mandatory and necessary mitigation or offset measures are to be included in the environmental management plan when avoiding these areas is not possible. The environmental protection system in China is well aligned with this key planning element.

During the initial screening stage of the program, the activities involving natural habitats and natural forests have been excluded. Important biodiversity and cultural resource areas will not be involved.

PforR Directive: Take into account potential adverse effects on physical cultural property and provide adequate measures to avoid, minimize, or mitigate such effects.

The Cultural Property Protection Law provides adequate legal framework and procedures for protecting cultural property during the EA process. If any physical cultural resource is impacted, impacts must be assessed and consultation and approval must be secured from the cultural property authority. Additionally, protection measures be included in the environmental management plan. Chance-find procedures are also explicitly established in the legal system for cultural property protection. These are fully in line with the requirement of this key planning element.

The activities to be supported under the Program will only take place in existing farmlands or disused land in rural area. There will not any activities involving significant excavations, demolition, movement of earth, flooding, or other environmental changes; and any activities located in, or in the vicinity of, a physical cultural resources site recognized by the borrower.

PforR Policy (c): Protect public and worker safety against the potential risks associated with: (i) construction and/or operations of facilities or other operational practices under the Program; (ii) exposure to toxic chemicals, hazardous wastes, and other dangerous materials under the Program; and (iii) reconstruction or rehabilitation of infrastructure located in areas prone to natural hazards.

PforR Directive: Promote adequate community, individual, and worker safety through the safe design, construction, operation, and maintenance of physical infrastructure; or, in carrying out activities that may be dependent on such infrastructure, incorporate safety measures, inspections, or remedial works as appropriate.

China has established a comprehensive management and supervision system for work safety as discussed in previous sections. This system ensures the screening of safety issues and occupational hazards, assessment of work safety, and assessment of occupational diseases hazards during project preparation, design and construction, and supervision during operation. The ultimate responsibility of occupation health and safety rests with enterprises that are closely supervised by work safety and health authorities. The system is consistent with the Bank PforR Directive.

PforR Directive: Promote the use of recognized good practice in the production, management, storage, transport, and disposal of hazardous materials generated under the Program; promote the use of integrated pest management practices to manage or reduce pests or diseases vectors; and provide training for workers involved in the production, procurement, storage, transport, use, and disposal of hazardous chemicals in accordance with the relevant international guidelines and conventions.

The Work Safety Law and Regulations for Safety Management of Dangerous Chemicals, as well as their implementation systems, provide a comprehensive framework for managing hazardous materials. It requires special permit systems for production, storage and sale of dangerous chemicals in accordance with established management practices. It also enforces the certification of workers involved in handling dangerous chemicals. A comprehensive management system addressing the production, management, storage, transport of dangerous chemical, and disposal of hazardous materials is in place that is consistent with this planning element requirement.

The activities to be supported under the Program will involve the use of pesticides in agricultural planting, forestry and livestock development. The current system is aligned with the integrated pest management including trainings on health protection and various agronomic techniques e.g. physical, ecological and chemical methods and the combination. The trainings are free and frequently provided by the local government.

PforR Directive: Include adequate measures to avoid, minimize, or mitigate community, individual, and worker risks when the Program activities are located in areas prone to natural hazards such as floods, hurricanes, earthquakes, or other severe weather or climate event.

The EIA and work safety systems incorporate environmental and work-related risk assessment measures into the project design and implementation. As discussed in previous sections, China has also established other risk assessment systems for projects that are prone to flood and natural hazards to avoid, minimize or mitigate community, individual, and worker risks. The activities to be supported by the program are located outside the areas prone to natural disasters.

China has well established systems to address risks related to natural hazards. These systems are consistent with the Bank PforR Directive.

6.2 Assessment of social management systems against core principles

In general, the legal framework and implementation performance on land acquisition activities, land use right transfer and ethnic minority development in national and Guangxi are adequate. The legal framework of laws, regulations, policies and standards and implementation mechanism provided are consistent with the Bank PforR Policy and respective Bank PforR Directive.

PforR Policy (d): manage land acquisition and loss of access to natural resources in a way that avoids or minimizes displacement, and assist the affected people in improving, or at the minimum restoring, their livelihoods and living standards; and

PforR directive(i): avoid or minimize land acquisition and related adverse impacts; identify and address economic and social impacts caused by land acquisition or loss of access to natural resources, including those affecting

people lacking full legal rights to resources they use or occupy; provide compensation sufficient to purchase replacement assets of equivalent value and to meet any necessary transitional expenses, paid before taking land or restricting access; provide supplemental livelihood improvement or restoration measures if taking of land causes loss of income-generating opportunity (e.g., loss of crop production or employment); and restore or replace public infrastructure and community services that may be adversely affected by the Program;

Land acquisition. The current legal framework on land acquisition in both national and Guangxi has been well established to ensure affected people are assisted in improving or at least restoring their livelihood and living standards. Relevant regulations on consultation and information disclosure related to land acquisition has been developed. China has no land market in rural areas, therefore, the methodology for land compensation is designed as unified annual output value standard or district piece comprehensive land price for a county. In addition, the national and Guangxi policies require local governments to take specific measures to restore or maintain the land acquisition affected farmers' welfare levels.

Land donation. The village public utility or public facilities ownership belong to village collectives; the land obtained is determined by the villagers' Congress through the consultation with villager's representatives. Villagers are quite in favor of building public services and infrastructure in the village. However, procedure for consultation and information disclosure in the process of obtaining village-level public service land and utility land is not stipulated in policy basis, and in practice, there is not a unified way on voluntary land donation in the infrastructure projects of poor villages, some villages provided the land without compensation, others paid compensations or provided lands elsewhere. And there are rarely land donation contracts, payment certificates or record backups as well.

Land use right transfer. China and Guangxi have established a policy system or framework which has standardized the principles, subjects, procedures, transactions, contract management and management agencies on transfer of land use right. The policies stipulated that the transfer of the rural land contractual management right should abide by the principle of equal consultation, legal, voluntarily, and paid on the basis of insisting on the household contract management system and stabilizing the rural land contract relations.

The Agriculture Departments at all levels in Guangxi have been established, and equipped with qualified staff and sufficient work experience or operational resources to standardize and manage the land transfer behavior. Guangxi has set up a land transfer service platform such as county level Land Transfer Service centers and land Transfer networks. The Rural Land Contract Arbitration Commission has been set up to settle the disputes of rural land contract in time and safeguard the lawful rights and interests of the parties.

PforR Policy (e); give due consideration to the cultural appropriateness of, and equitable access to, Program benefits, giving special attention to the rights and interests of the Indigenous Peoples and to the needs or concerns of vulnerable groups; and

PforR Directive(j): undertake free, prior, and informed consultations if the Indigenous Peoples are potentially affected (positively or negatively), to determine whether there is broad community support for the Program activities; ensure that the Indigenous Peoples can participate in devising opportunities to benefit from exploitation of customary resources or indigenous knowledge, the latter (indigenous knowledge) to include the consent of the Indigenous Peoples;

(k) and give attention to groups vulnerable to hardship or disadvantage, including as relevant the poor, the disabled, women and children, the elderly, or marginalized ethnic groups; and, if necessary, take special measures to promote equitable access to the Program benefits.

The activities under the PforR program have 28 poor counties, 0.42 million poor households and 1.74 million poor people, of which, there are 1.17 million poor ethnic minority people (accounting for 67.74% of the poor population) and 10 poor minority autonomous counties. The state and Guangxi region have formulated a series of policies on ethnic minority development, including respecting for minority views, safeguarding the political equality of ethnic minorities, respecting the customs of ethnic minorities, supporting the development of ethnic minorities, and planning the economic and social development of ethnic communities.

Implementation of the 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty alleviation in Guangxi region is concerned about the poor groups of ethnic minorities. Ethnic and religious affair management institutions have been established in regional, municipal and county level in Guangxi region. The staff has a college degree or above and receives policy training every year, they worked closely with Poverty Reduction Office in poor ethnic minority villages and groups.

All sectors and departments have integrated funds for the development of ethnic minorities. More than 50% of the minority development funds were invested into 28 impoverished counties to help the minorities get out of poverty. The poverty reduction activities implemented in poor ethnic villages are identified and determined through free, prior, and informed consultations approaches. The cadres of the Ethnic and Religious Bureaus have been arranged to serve as the first secretary to help minority villages off poverty, in particular serve for those aged 40 or over and uneducated EM people.

PforR Directive (L) give attention to groups vulnerable to hardship or disadvantage, including as relevant the poor, the disabled, women and children, the elderly, or marginalized ethnic groups; and, if necessary, take special measures to promote equitable access to the Program benefits; and

The members/headquarters of the leadership group at all levels include the Women's Federation and Bureau of Ethnic and Religious Affairs. The Women's Federation and Bureau of Ethnic and Religious Affairs have developed and implemented poverty alleviation programs for women or minorities combining with 13th Five-year Plan of Guangxi region, cities and counties, they also enter into villages and households as members of poverty alleviation work team. The Program covers 1.74 million poor people of 0.42 million households from 28 poor counties, among which, 40.48% are poor women. Women's federations in Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region have established vertical women's organizations, providing qualified personnel and adequate working resources to safeguard women's rights and promote equality between men and women. In addition, women's federations in autonomous regions, municipalities and counties have organized a series of activities to enhance the ability of poor women to lift themselves out of poverty.

The No. 1 National policy issued to increase the rural people ownership of community development. The 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty alleviation in Guangxi region and counties, as well as the special poverty alleviation programs, have clearly put forward the establishment and improvement of the participation mechanism of poor groups and women, aiming at fully mobilizing the enthusiasm of the masses in getting out of poverty and getting rich, guaranteeing the equal rights of the poor to participate in and equality in development and stimulating the masses' intrinsic vitality. However, during the investigation, the Poverty Alleviation Office of all counties proposed to lead the poor people to change their ideology and improve their ability to self-development. The idea of "asking me to lift myself out of poverty" into "I want to get out of poverty" is a problem faced by the poverty alleviation work.

Guangxi has implemented public comments on petition matters as national and Guangxi policies. In particular, Guangxi region has set up a system of letters or calls for poverty reduction program at all levels. In addition, the Legal Adviser participates in the petition work, mainly provides the legal consultation, answers the legal question, raises the legal opinion and assists the petition person to solve the problem through the legal way. In the investigation of the poor village, Poor households expressed that they know and welcome petition mechanism, when they have problems with poverty alleviation, they usually go to village cadres or stations in the village team instead of going directly to the township for petition.

Consider conflict risks, including distributional equity and cultural sensitivities. (NA)

Table 5 Assessment of Environmental and Social Systems based on the Bank Policy for PforRs

a. Promote environmental and social sustainability in the Program design; avoid, minimize, or mitigate adverse impacts, and promote informed decision-making relating to the Program's environmental and social impacts.		
Key Elements	National and Provincial Systems	Key Findings
Operate within an adequate legal and regulatory framework to guide environmental and social impact assessments at the Program level.	China has developed an adequate legal framework for environmental and social impact assessment, backed by a set of comprehensive laws, regulations, technical guidelines and standards, which apply nationwide. Over the decades, it has gradually evolved into a comprehensive system that is consistent with the PforR. The Guangxi regional and municipal EPBs have well established institutional arrangements with qualified staff and technical expertise for managing the environmental impact assessment of construction projects.	Consistent.
Incorporate recognized elements of environmental and social assessment good practice, including: (i) early screening of potential impacts; (ii) consideration of strategic, technical, and site alternatives(including the “no action” alternative); (iii)explicit assessment of potential induced, cumulative, and transboundary impacts; (iv)identification of measures to mitigate adverse environmental or social impacts that cannot be otherwise avoided or minimized;(v) clear articulation of institutional responsibilities and resources to support implementation of plans; and (vi)responsiveness and accountability through stakeholder consultation, timely dissemination of the Program information, and responsive grievance redress measures.	The Chinese EIA system has well-defined guidelines covering screening, alternative analysis, impact assessment, mitigation measures, management plan, and consultation.	Consistent.
b. Avoid, minimize, or mitigate adverse impacts on natural habitats and physical cultural resources resulting from the Program.		
Key Elements	National and Provincial Systems	Key Findings
Include appropriate measures for the early identification and screening of potentially important biodiversity and cultural resource areas.	The EIA guidelines provide detailed guidance on identification and screening of sensitive environmental and cultural resources, including survey of baseline environmental conditions in geology, surface water, wild life, forest, wetland, fishery, rare and endangered species, and nature reserves. Key sensitive areas such as rivers, reservoirs, nature reserves, wetland parks, forest parks, and scenic areas are identified for detailed survey and special assessment. Cultural resources are screened through consultation/approval of relevant authorities and field investigation.	Consistent. Important biodiversity and cultural resource areas will not be involved in this program.

b. Avoid, minimize, or mitigate adverse impacts on natural habitats and physical cultural resources resulting from the Program.		
Key Elements	National and Provincial Systems	Key Findings
Support and promote the protection, conservation, maintenance, and rehabilitation of natural habitats; avoid significant conversion or degradation of critical natural habitats; and, if avoiding the significant conversion of natural habitats is not technically feasible, measures to mitigate or offset the adverse impacts of the Program activities are required.	The Chinese environmental protection system emphasizes the protection, maintenance and rehabilitation of natural habitats. Avoiding such sensitive areas is the top priority of the EIA. Special assessment is mandatory and necessary mitigation or offset measures are to be developed in the environmental management plan if avoidance is not feasible.	Consistent. The activities supported under the Program do not take place on sensitive environmental sites/areas.
Take into account potential adverse effects on physical cultural property and provide adequate measures to avoid, minimize, or mitigate such effects.	The Cultural Property Protection Law provides adequate legal framework and procedures for protecting cultural property during the EA process. If any physical cultural resource is impacted, impacts must be assessed, and consultation and approval must be secured with the cultural property authority, and protection measures be included in the environmental management plan.	Consistent. The activities supported under the Program do not take place in areas with existing physical cultural resources.
c. Protect public and worker safety against the potential risks associated with: (i) construction and/or operations of facilities or other operational practices under the Program; (ii) exposure to toxic chemicals, hazardous wastes, and other dangerous materials under the Program; and (iii) reconstruction or rehabilitation of infrastructure located in areas prone to natural hazards.		
Key Elements	National and Provincial Systems	Key Findings
Promote adequate community, individual, and worker safety through the safe design, construction, operation, and maintenance of physical infrastructure; or, in carrying out activities that may be dependent on such infrastructure, incorporate safety measures, inspections, or remedial works as appropriate.	China has established a comprehensive management and supervision system for work safety. This system ensures the screening of safety issues and occupation hazards, assessment of work safety and occupational diseases hazard during project preparation, design and construction completion acceptance of work safety and health facilities, and supervision during operation.	Consistent. The activities to be supported by the program are labor intensive without involving large machinery or construction of large scale physical works. The safety risk is minimal.
Promote the use of recognized good practice in the production, management, storage, transport, and disposal of hazardous materials generated under the Program; promote the use of integrated pest management practices to manage or reduce pests or diseases vectors; and provide training for workers involved in the production, procurement, storage, transport, use, and disposal of hazardous chemicals in accordance with the relevant international guidelines and conventions.	The legal system in China provides a comprehensive framework in managing hazardous materials, which requires special permit systems for production, storage and sale of dangerous chemicals. It requires the adoption of good and compliance management practices. It also enforces mandatory certification of workers involved in handling dangerous chemicals.	Consistent. The activities supported under the Program will involve use of pesticides in agricultural planting and planting of tree crops. But this issue can be adequately handled by the established system in China.
Include adequate measures to avoid, minimize, or	The EIA and work safety systems cover the environmental and work	Consistent.

b. Avoid, minimize, or mitigate adverse impacts on natural habitats and physical cultural resources resulting from the Program.		
Key Elements	National and Provincial Systems	Key Findings
mitigate community, individual, and worker risks when the Program activities are located in areas prone to natural hazards such as floods, hurricanes, earthquakes, or other severe weather or climate events	related risk assessment, and require necessary measures to be incorporated into the project design and implementation. In addition, China has established other risk assessment systems for projects that are in areas prone to flood and natural hazards (e.g. geo-hazard, earthquake) as part of project approval procedures.	

d. manages land acquisition and loss of access to natural resources in a way that avoids or minimizes displacement, and assist the affected people in improving, or at the minimum restoring, their livelihoods and living standards;		
Key Elements	National and Provincial Systems	Key Findings
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - avoid or minimize land acquisition and related adverse impacts; - identify and address economic and social impacts caused by land acquisition or loss of access to natural resources, - including those affecting people lacking full legal rights to resources they use or occupy. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The policy legal framework on land acquisition in China and Guangxi has well established to ensure affected people are assisted in improving or at least restoring their livelihood and living standards. - The effort of avoid or minimize land acquisition is achieved through both technical design of the any project including project feasibility study and preliminary design, and relevant land department review process, including pre-land examination and land use approval process. - Under the existing land acquisition procedures, the potential social and economic impacts caused by land acquisition is addressed by engaging affected villages in the process of land impact survey, confirming surveyed outcome, conducting public hearing, establishing unified compensation rates by provincial government, and providing employment opportunities and social security coverage for land loss farmers. - For those affected people who may lack full legal rights to assets or resources they use or occupy, although the existing laws or regulations do not provide clear entitlements, in the actual implementation, depending on actual condition, certain level of compensation are often provided following negotiation with affected parties. 	<p>The activities supported under the PforR will not cause large-scale land acquisition that might result in emergence of landless farmers. There might be some potential small piece of land use for village roads improvement through land donation rather than land acquisition process.</p> <p>Consistent.</p> <p>Consistent.</p> <p>No house demolition and illegal buildings will be affected under the program</p>
provide compensation sufficient to purchase replacement assets of equivalent value and to meet any	The policies require local governments at or above county level to take practicable measures to make sure that the land acquisition affected farmers' living standards well off because of land acquisition; and to be sure that the	<p>Consistent.</p> <p>Land compensation is adequate for APs livelihood restoration.</p>

necessary transitional expenses, paid before taking land or restricting access.	<p>full and timely payments of the land compensation, resettlement subsidy, and compensation for ground attachments and green crops are allocated before taking of land/assets in compliance with the law requirements.</p> <p>The methodology for land compensation is designed as unified annual output value standard or district piece comprehensive land price for a county. In addition, the national and Guangxi policies require local governments to take specific measures to restore or maintain the land acquisition affected farmers' welfare levels.</p> <p>China and Guangxi have established a policy system or framework which has standardized the principles, subjects, procedures, transactions, contract management and management agencies on transfer of land use right. The policies stipulated that the transfer of the rural land contractual management right should abide by the principle of equal consultation, legal, voluntarily, and paid on the basis of insisting on the household contract management system and stabilizing the rural land contract relations.</p> <p>If a new infrastructure is to be built in a poor village and the ownership belongs to village collectives, the construction land is voluntary donated by the village collective or individuals.</p>	<p>Land use right transfer in poor villages are on the basis of the principle of equal consultation, legal, voluntarily, and paid on the basis of insisting on the household contract management system and stabilizing the rural land contract relations.</p> <p>There is not a unified way on voluntary land donation in the infrastructure projects of poor villages, some villages provide the land without compensation, others received compensations or land elsewhere. And there are rarely land donation contracts, payment certificates or record backups as well.</p>
provide supplemental livelihood improvement or restoration measures if taking of land causes loss of income-generating opportunity (e.g., loss of crop production or employment)	<p>Land policies system requests to use of multiple resettlement channels, including 1) agriculture-based resettlement; 2) employment-based resettlement; 3) shareholding-based resettlement; and 4) relocation-based resettlement. In addition, Policies have specified provision of endowment insurance and employment training to land-taken farmers.</p> <p>Guangxi 's existing endowment insurance policies targeting at land-taken farmers no longer applicable due to low insurance benefits. New policies are under development.</p> <p>Land Contract Law specifies: women enjoy equal rights as men to contracting rural land; no special regulations governing provision of assistance to vulnerable groups affected by land acquisition.</p>	<p>Consistent.</p> <p>Used multiple compensation and livelihood approaches during implementation.</p>
restore or replace public infrastructure and community	Public infrastructure and community services impacts should be surveyed and restoration approaches should be considered to ensure the public	Consistent.

services that may be adversely affected by the Program;	infrastructure and community services restoration.	
e. give due consideration to the cultural appropriateness of, and equitable access to, Program benefits, giving special attention to the rights and interests of the Indigenous Peoples and to the needs or concerns of vulnerable groups;		
Key Elements	National and Provincial Systems	Key Findings
undertake free, prior, and informed consultations if the Indigenous Peoples are potentially affected (positively or negatively), to determine whether there is broad community support for the Program activities	The state and Guangxi have formulated a series of policies on ethnic minority development, including respecting for minority views, safeguarding the political equality of ethnic minorities, respecting the customs of ethnic minorities, supporting the development of ethnic minorities, and planning the economic and social development of ethnic communities. The current legal framework supports the lawful rights and interests of the minority nationalities and upholds and develops a relationship of equality, unity and mutual assistance among all of China's nationalities, The activities to be supported under the Program which may involve ethnic minorities are voluntary. The poverty reduction activities implemented in poor ethnic villages are identified and determined through free, prior and informed consultation approaches. In addition, the cadres of the Ethnic and Religious Bureaus have been arranged to serve as the first secretary to help minority villages off poverty on site.	Consistent. A series of measures have been taken to conduct public consultation and participation activities.
ensure that the Indigenous Peoples can participate in devising opportunities to benefit from exploitation of customary resources or indigenous knowledge, the latter (indigenous knowledge) to include the consent of the Indigenous Peoples	Ethnic minority development and project management are responsibilities of Guangxi Department of Ethnic and Religious Affairs and bureaus of ethnic and religious affairs of all counties in the province. During daily work, an organizational structure has taken shape, which comprises ethnic and religious affairs, finance, environmental protection and other relevant authorities, whose roles and responsibilities are clearly defined and who collaborate with each other, hold joint meetings every year, supervise and inspect implementation of relevant activities and address relevant issues.	Consistent.
give attention to groups vulnerable to hardship or disadvantage, including as relevant the poor, the disabled, women and children, the elderly, or marginalized ethnic	The members/headquarters of the leadership group at all levels include the Women's Federation and Bureau of Ethnic and Religious Affairs. The Women's Federation and Bureau of Ethnic and Religious Affairs have developed and implemented poverty alleviation programs for women or minorities combining with 13th Five-year Plan of Guangxi region, cities and	Consistent.

<p>groups; and, if necessary, take special measures to promote equitable access to the</p> <p>Program benefits</p>	<p>counties, they also enter into villages and households as members of poverty alleviation work team.</p> <p>The 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty alleviation in Guangxi region and the three counties had proposed clearly the participation mechanism of poor groups, required to give full play to the self-management capabilities of poor villages and enhance the ownership of poor people.</p> <p>Women's federations in Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region have established top-down women's organizations, providing qualified personnel and adequate working resources to safeguard women's rights and promote equality between men and women. In addition, women's federations in autonomous regions, municipalities and counties have organized a series of activities to enhance the ability of poor women to lift themselves out of poverty.</p> <p>Guangxi region has set up a system of letters or calls for poverty reduction program at all levels. In the investigation of the poor village, Poor households expressed that when they have problems with poverty alleviation, they usually go to village cadres or stations in the village team instead of going directly to the township for petition. In addition, some villagers do not know the working mechanism of "one village, one legal adviser"</p>	
--	---	--

SECTION VII: STAKEHOLDERS CONSULTATION

7.1 First Round Consultation

Between Nov 3-11, 2017, and Jan 21-26, 2018, meetings were held with representative from a number of Guangxi region, and three counties government institutions to discuss policies and procedures on land acquisition and structure demolition, land use right transfer, ethnic minority development, and social sustainability among others. Participating institutions are presented in Table 7-1.

Table 7-1 Summary of Consultation and Participation Activities

Stakeholder	Main Contents
Guangxi and County Government Department, PMO, Department of Environmental Protection, Finance Department, Pricing Department, Department of Land and Resources, Department of Human Resources and Public Security, Department of Statistics, Poverty Alleviation Office, Department of Civil Affairs, Department of Ethnic and Religious Affairs, Women's Federation, Department of Agriculture (Office of Agriculture), Health and Family Planning Committee, Water Conservation Bureau, Forestry Bureau, Bureau of Agriculture and Pasture, Bureau of education, Department of Transportation, Bureau of Housing and Urban, National Development and Reform Commission	<p>Collection and consolidation of social consultant materials (list of materials has been provided)</p> <p>Main Topics: land acquisition and structure demolition, land donation, land use right transfer, and ethnic minority development, participation and consultation mechanism, and grievance redress mechanism.</p> <p>Sub-topics:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) China's and Guangxi's policy systems; b) Implementation procedures; c) Implementation agency and capacity; d) Practices during implementation; e) Analysis of cases with implementation already completed.
Farmer cooperatives organization (including base for agricultural products cultivation, base for livestock breeding and forest poverty alleviation base)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Basic situation of industry poverty alleviation; - Land transfer contracts and subsidy schemes; - Poverty alleviation model and poor households' benefits; - Vocational Farmer Training; - Poverty alleviation funds disbursement and financing method; - Participation of women and other disadvantaged groups
Residents/farmers(6-8 people, including women, elder ethnic and the poor) in poor villages	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - positive and negative impacts of implementing the action plan; - Industrial poverty alleviation methods and participation - Subjective willingness, subsidy and policy of land transfer, land acquisition or donation; - Personal willingness and ability to pay - Informed status and active participation in various pro-poor policies, subsidies - Channels and methods of redress - infrastructure of poor village
- Residents/farmers (6-8 people, including women, elder and the poor) in villages out of poverty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Practices of the village poverty alleviation: personnel determination, poverty reduction, exit process, third-party assessment method, etc. - Lesson learn from poverty reduction - Tips and suggestions for poverty reduction
- Residents/farmers (6-8 people, including	- The living and cultural customs of minorities and their ethnic

Stakeholder	Main Contents
women, elder and the poor) in ethnic villages	<p>relations with the Han nationality;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Identification and helping of poor households in minority nationalities - The participation of industrial poverty alleviation and employment and the fair benefit mechanism - Public infrastructure expropriation, lease subsidy, voluntary land donation and individual willingness - Loan situation - Maintenance of infrastructure management and allocation of funds

7.2 Second Round Consultation

From April 14 to 15, 2018, public consultation meetings were conducted in 2 venues in Guangxi. The purposes of the multi-stakeholder consultation workshops were to: (a) introduce on the Environmental and Social Systems Assessment approach under the proposed Program for Results operation; (b) introduce the findings and recommendations of the assessment; and (c) seek comments and feedback on the key findings and recommendations of the ESSA.

Prior to the public consultation meetings, the Chinese version of ESSA was distributed to potential participants and disclosed on website of the Counties and Guangxi Regional Department of Agriculture on 29 March 2018.

Two consultation workshops were held in at Nanning city and Du'an county respectively. Participants included poor facility representatives, poor village representatives, women representatives, NGOs, government agencies relevant to the Program such as Land Resources Bureau, Environmental Protection Bureau, Agricultural Bureau, Poverty Reduction Office, Livestock Bureau, Petition Bureau, Forestry bureau, Ethnic and Religious Affairs Bureau, Women's Federation at provincial level and from 7 counties out of the 28 program counties. Extensive discussions were seen during all the consultation meetings.

In all meetings, participants voiced strong support to the proposed PforR. The participants agreed that overall the ESSA report are of good quality; the review and analysis of domestic laws and regulations are comprehensive and well-organized; the key environmental and social issues identified are consistent with the reality in general; the assessment of institutional arrangement and capacity and performance is objective; most of the recommendations made by the ESSA are pragmatic and achievable. More details are presented in Annex 3.

This version of ESSA was updated to reflect the public consultation inputs and disclosed locally and on the external website of the World Bank.

SECTION VIII: RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on assessment of the environmental and social management system applicable to the proposed PforR, environmental and social systems assessment concludes that China and Guangxi have established comprehensive sets of environmental and social management system to address the environment, as well as issues related to land acquisition and ethnic minority concerns related to the proposed activities under the PforR. Such systems are principally well-aligned with the core principles and key planning elements as defined in the Bank Policy for PforR. As the Program supports mainly small-scale infrastructure, small-scale agricultural activities, such as livestock, crop and tree crop planting activities, and labor-intensive agro-products processing, with exclusion of potentially high risk activities, the overall risk from environmental and social management perspective is rated as moderate. The environmental and social systems assessment makes the following recommendations:

Recommendation 1: Enhance the technical capacity of staff in county livestock bureau and enhance technical training and support to farmers

Enhanced trainings on design and operation of ecological livestock farms for farmers should be listed as a priority agenda in the county livestock bureau which should possess adequate technical details and results evaluation procedure. Thus, the capacity of the staff in county livestock bureau should be further strengthened. In view that the regional stock bureau is experienced and making studies on the specifications and standards for ecological livestock farms, the regional livestock bureau is suggested to play an active role to disseminate the concept and prototype design of the ecological livestock farm, as well as the trainings for the county livestock bureau.

Recommendation 2: To develop a community participation and consultation manual to initiative to lift people out of poverty and increase poor people ownership, in particular, encourage poor people participating in the design, implementation and management of community services facilities and infrastructure.

The “No.1 central document” emphasizes to increase the ownership of rural/poor people. The 13th Five-year Plan of Poverty alleviation in Guangxi region proposes the participation mechanism of poor groups, in order to give full play to the self-management capabilities of poor villages and enhance the support from poor people. It is recommended that the regional PRO develop a community participation and consultation manual including i) poor people awareness education program to increase poor people support and participation, and ii) poor people participating in the design, implementation and management of community services facilities and infrastructure. (PAP action)

Recommendation 3: Standardize the community consultation and contact signature procedures of voluntary land donation.

There is not a unified way on voluntary land donation in the infrastructure projects among villages. While some villagers provide land without compensation, others have received compensations or substitute land elsewhere. However, there are rarely land donation contracts, payment certificates or. It is recommended to further standardize the community consultation procedures, contact signature and record backups.

Other Consideration(s)

Considering the geographical coverage and the nature of the PforR activities OP 7.60 Disputed Territories are not applicable to the PforR.

Annex 1: Initial screening of poverty reduction activities

CHINA Guangxi Poverty Reduction Program-for-Results

Environmental and Social Initial Screening of the Guangxi 13th Five Year Plan for Poverty Reduction²²

Project Activities	Associated or Likely Social and Environmental Effects	Environmental and Social Context	Program Strategy and Sustainability	Institutional Complexity and Capacity	Reputational and Political Risk Context	Overall Assessment
<p>(i) Rural education programs for poverty reduction, including vocational training (教育扶贫工程)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● upgrade school facilities (dormitories; classrooms; playgrounds); ● teachers training; ● vocation skill training (16-60 year-old labors) ● poor student support 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Positive impacts from poor family capacity building ✓ Very small scale works with minimal environmental impacts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The activities are mainly within the existing school. ✓ small size land taken for new school construction in villages or township ✓ poor girl or female labors, ethnic minority groups participation and consultation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ the land acquisition or land lease/voluntary donation policies and compensation in the province and counties level. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Land Resources Bureau and villages involved in land acquisition or land lease/voluntary donation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ If the APs have not got any compensation and their livelihood are worse off 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The ESSA will include assessment of the responsible agencies on how to conduct the land taken; ✓ Women and ethnic minority participation will be assessed ✓ The proposed program activity is suitable for PforR.
<p>(ii) Cultural poverty reduction (community libraries, cultural yards, etc.文化扶贫工程)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● cultural yard ● community center ● culture squares ● village library/reading room 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Positive impacts from village culture promotion. ✓ Very small scale works with minimal environmental impacts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The activities are mainly within the existing buildings. ✓ small size land taken for new center or yard construction in villages ✓ ethnic minority villages participation and consultation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ the land acquisition or land lease/voluntary donation policies and compensation in the province and counties level. ✓ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Land Resources Bureau and villages involved in land acquisition or land lease/voluntary donation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ N/A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The ESSA will include assessment of the responsible agencies on how to conduct the land taken; ✓ Women and ethnic minority participation will be assessed ✓ The proposed program activity is suitable for PforR.

²² The PforR boundary cover a small subset of activities identified in the Guangxi 13th YP for Poverty Reduction

Project Activities	Associated or Likely Social and Environmental Effects	Environmental and Social Context	Program Strategy and Sustainability	Institutional Complexity and Capacity	Reputational and Political Risk Context	Overall Assessment
(iii) Poverty reduction through science and technology (科技扶贫工程) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Training and extension service ● S&T demo base ● local expert; ● cultivation/training ● innovation incubator; ● popular science dissemination 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Potential positive impacts by science and technology inputs ✓ Minimal environmental impacts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Program activities are in the existing land. ✓ science and technology service meet the needs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Timely and approaches of dissemination 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The capacity of implementing agencies (e.g. science and technology bureau, Women Federation, poverty reduction office) will be assessed once information is available. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ N/A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The implementing agencies will be identified, and their capacity assessed in the ESSA. ✓ The proposed program activity is suitable for PforR
(iv) Rural health services (健康扶贫工程) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● upgrade hospital/clinic facilities ● doctor training; ● disease prevention ● public health ● medicare insurance 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Potential positive impacts by poor family health services. ✓ Upgrading of hospital/clinic may involve physical works and procurement of radioactive equipment and expansion of medical service, which could lead to the increase of amount and complexity of medical waste , and radioactive impact on public and occupational health. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Program activities in the existing land. ✓ small size land taken for new clinic construction in villages or township 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ the land acquisition or land lease/voluntary donation policies and compensation in the province and counties level. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The capacity of implementing agencies (e.g. Health Women Federation, poverty reduction office) will be assessed ✓ The EPB and health bureau will be assessed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ N/A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The implementing agencies will be identified, and their capacity assessed in the ESSA. ✓ The proposed program activity is suitable for PforR

Project Activities	Associated or Likely Social and Environmental Effects	Environmental and Social Context	Program Strategy and Sustainability	Institutional Complexity and Capacity	Reputational and Political Risk Context	Overall Assessment
(v) Rural transport infrastructure (交通扶贫工程) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Village road, road connecting town and county ● bus stations ● rehabilitation of bridges 	✓ Potential positive impacts through rural roads condition improvement ✓ The works are limited to the rehabilitation of rural roads under Grade II and small bridges. Potential environmental impacts may involve the safety, ecology, environmental issues which are moderate.	✓ Program activities in the existing rural roads. ✓ land taken for roads extension, bridges rehabilitation or bus station construction in villages or township ✓	✓ the land acquisition or land lease/voluntary donation policies and compensation in the province and counties level. ✓	✓ The capacity of implementing agencies (e.g. Land Resources Bureau) will be assessed once information available. ✓ The capacity of EPB will be assessed	✓ If the APs have not got any compensation and their livelihood are worse off	✓ The system and compensation policies for land taken will be assessed in the ESSA. ✓ The proposed program activity is suitable for PforR ✓ Significant land acquisition and resettlement impacts is excluded (farmlands or house demolish)
(vi) Rural electrification and communication technology infrastructure (电力通讯扶贫工程) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● transmission lines; ● internet coverage, ● ICTs, radio/TV 	✓ Potential positive impacts from rural electric access ✓ The voltage is under 110 kV and the impacts are limited to the electromagnetic effect and ecology. The impacts are moderate.	✓ small size land taken infrastructure construction in villages or township ✓ human health and safety	✓ the land acquisition or land lease/voluntary donation policies and compensation in the province and counties level.	✓ The capacity of implementing agencies (e.g. Land Resources Bureau, Price Bureau, Civil bureau) will be assessed once information available. ✓ The capacity of EPB will be assessed	✓ N/A	✓ The system and compensation policies for land taken will be assessed in the ESSA. ✓ The proposed program activity is suitable for PforR
(vii) Danger Housing improvement (危房改造工程)	✓ Potential positive impacts from Housing improvement ✓ Minimal environmental impacts	✓ Poor targeting mechanism ✓	✓ To be assessed in the technical assessment.	✓ The capacity of implementing agencies will be assessed once information available	✓	✓ The proposed program activity is suitable for PforR.

Project Activities	Associated or Likely Social and Environmental Effects	Environmental and Social Context	Program Strategy and Sustainability	Institutional Complexity and Capacity	Reputational and Political Risk Context	Overall Assessment
(viii)Ecological protection and restoration (生态保护扶贫工程) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • afforestation(farmlands convert to forest) , protection of natural forests, construction of wind breaker; • living environment improvement; • protection of water and soil • jobs for natural forest protection • national nature forest protection 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Potential positive impacts by rural environmental improvement ✓ Income generation from jobs creation ✓ In terms of environmental effect, this activity may introduce alien species, and change of management and protection of natural forests, increase the use of pesticide ✓ This activity will change the management and protection of natural forests, affect the welfare and level of reliance of local communities and their interaction with natural forests, and increase of use of pesticide 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Voluntary land lease, ✓ Labors health and safety ✓ Afforestation is recognized as a way by planting economic forests to contributing economic benefits of poor families 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Assess the land-leases or land use rights transfer (LURT) contracts to ensure land transfer is voluntary, transparent, fair, and beneficial to farmers ✓ Villagers participation, in particular women participation ✓ Labors health and safety policies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The capacity of implementing agencies (e.g. Forest Bureau, Land Resources Bureau) will be assessed once information available. ✓ Capacity of agricultural department, EPB and forestry department will be assessed. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ If there are any forced land-leases for afforestation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The proposed program activity is suitable for PforR if plantation not involving natural forests..
(ix)Water conservation and supply infrastructure (水土保持和供水扶贫工程) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • disaster relief and preparation; • irrigation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Potential positive impacts by disaster relief and water conservation ✓ disaster relief and preparation may cause significant environmental impact in terms of safety and environmental issues; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ land taken infrastructure construction in villages or township ✓ loss of access to natural resources for water conservation ✓ disaster relief activity include the works of 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ land taken and compensation policies ✓ alternative livelihood restoration policies ✓ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The capacity of implementing agencies will be assessed once information available ✓ Capacity of water resource department, EPB and agricultural 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ If the APs have not got any compensation and their livelihood are worse off 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Only the drinking water safety in rural areas and water conservation (water and soil erosion control) activity is suitable for PforR. ✓ Significant land acquisition and resettlement impact is excluded

Project Activities	Associated or Likely Social and Environmental Effects	Environmental and Social Context	Program Strategy and Sustainability	Institutional Complexity and Capacity	Reputational and Political Risk Context	Overall Assessment
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> water resource distribution and management drinking water safety in rural areas water conservation (water and soil erosion control) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ irrigation may involve dams and change of water resource availability; ✓ water resource distribution and management may involve dams, or projects involving allocation or conveyance of water, including inter-basin water transfers or activities resulting in significant changes to water quality or availability, including construction expansion of water resource facilities ✓ drinking water safety in rural areas is of limited scale and the environmental impacts are moderate ✓ water conservation (water and soil erosion control) will bring major positive environmental effect 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> dams or rehabilitation of subsided area or protection from flooding; ✓ drinking water safety in rural areas is to provide accessibility of clean water introduced from mountain springs to the scattered households in mountainous region. 		department will be assessed		(farmlands or house demolish)
(x)Poverty reduction through industrialization (产业扶贫) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> agri-production 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Potential positive impacts by industrialization development ✓ Income generation for poor ✓ Agri-production and agri-processing will 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Voluntary land lease for rural industrialization transparent, fair, and beneficial to poor ✓ participation and consultation, in 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Voluntary land lease policies ✓ Fair benefit sharing mechanism (To be assessed in the technical assessment) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ See above ✓ The institutional setting is very complex, involving EPB, livestock bureau, water resource 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Unfair benefit sharing mechanism ✓ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The proposed program activity is suitable for PforR except the resource development. the rural tourism activity is suitable provided not

Project Activities	Associated or Likely Social and Environmental Effects	Environmental and Social Context	Program Strategy and Sustainability	Institutional Complexity and Capacity	Reputational and Political Risk Context	Overall Assessment
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● livestock ● high-quality crops ● facility agriculture ● rural tourism development ● agri-processing ● e-commerce ● resources development ● intergraded development 	<p>cause moderate environmental effects which include the solid waste and wastewater, occupational health and safety issue;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Livestock activity will cause animal waste, and odor effect; ✓ Crop production activities will involve the issue of pest management and water use, and the non-point source pollution; ✓ Rural tourism development will involve the tourism development of natural reserve pr scenic area of high value ✓ E-commerce has minimal environmental effects ✓ Resource development will cause significant environmental effects 	<p>particular for women, ethnic minority groups</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ labors health and safety ✓ resource development is centered on the exploitation of local natural resources, e.g. coal mine, natural gas, to contribute economic benefits for the poor families 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Labors health and safety policies 	department, agricultural department		involving natural reserve or scenic area or cultural relics of high value
<p>(xi) financial services to the enterprises and the rural poor (金融扶贫)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● loans for agribusiness 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Potential positive impacts for income generation ✓ Minimal environmental effect 	✓	✓	✓	✓ N/A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The proposed program activity is suitable for PforR. ✓

Project Activities	Associated or Likely Social and Environmental Effects	Environmental and Social Context	Program Strategy and Sustainability	Institutional Complexity and Capacity	Reputational and Political Risk Context	Overall Assessment
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● micro-finance ● agri insurance 						
(xii) Jobs transfer poverty reduction (就业转移) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● improve labor capacity ● labor export ● jobs creation within province ● encourage start up 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Potential positive impacts for income generation ✓ Minimal environmental impact 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Labors health and safety ✓ Labors influx 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Labors influx policies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The capacity of implementing agencies will be assessed 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ N/A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The proposed program activity is suitable for PforR.
(xiii) Disaster relief and temporary help to the poor	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Potential positive impacts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ N/A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ N/A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ N/A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ N/A 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ The proposed program activity is suitable for PforR

Annex 2: List of Applicable Environmental and Social Law, Regulations and Guidelines

1. Main Environmental Laws and Regulations

Environmental Protection Law (NPC, 1989, last amended in 2014)
中华人民共和国环境保护法

Environmental Impact Assessment Law (NPC, 2002, last amended in 2016)
中华人民共和国环境影响评价法

Marine Environmental Protection Law (NPC, 1999, last amended in 2014)
中华人民共和国海洋环境保护法

Wildlife Protection Law (NPC, 2004)
中华人民共和国野生动物保护法

Water and Soil Conservation Law (NPC, 1991, last amended in 2010)
中华人民共和国水土保持法

Water Pollution Prevention and Control Law (NPC, 2008)
中华人民共和国水污染防治法

Noise Pollution Prevention and Control Law (NPC, 1996)
中华人民共和国环境噪声污染防治法

Air Pollution Prevention and Control Law (NPC, 1988, last amended in 2015)
中华人民共和国大气污染防治法

Solid Waste Pollution Prevention and Control Law (NPC, 1995, last amended in 2013)
中华人民共和国固体废物污染环境防治法

Cultural Property Protection Law (NPC, 1982, last amended in 2015)
中华人民共和国文物保护法

Forestry Law (NPC, 1984, last amended in 1998)
中华人民共和国森林法

Grassland Law (NPC, 1985, last amended in 2013)
中华人民共和国草原法

Flood Control Law (NPC, 1997, last amended in 2016)
中华人民共和国防洪法

Agricultural Law (NPC, 1993, last amended in 2012)
农业法

Regulations on Nature Reserves (SC, 1994, last amended in 2016)
自然保护区条例

Regulations on Wild Terrestrial Animal Protection (SC, 1992)
陆生野生动物保护实施条例

Regulations on Wild Aquatic Life Protection (SC, 1993, last amended in 2013)
水生野生动物保护实施条例

Regulations on Wild Plant Protection (SC, 1997)
野生植物保护条例

Regulations on Scenic Areas (SC, 2006)
风景名胜区条例

Regulations on Plan EIA (SC, 2009)
规划环境影响评价条例

Pesticide Management regulations (SC, 2001, last amended in 2017)
农药管理条例

Forests Pest Management Regulation (SC, 1989)
森林病虫害防治条例

Regulation of Pollution Control for Scaled Livestock Farms (SC, 2013)
畜禽规模养殖污染防治条例

2. Main Environmental Management Rules and Codes

Regulations on Environmental Management of Construction Projects (SC, 1998, last amended in 2017)
建设项目环境保护管理条例
Categorized Directory for Environmental Management of Construction Projects (MEP, 2017)
建设项目环境保护分类管理名录
Environmental Protection Design for Construction Projects (MEP, 1987)
建设项目环境保护设计规定
Environment and Hygiene Standards for Construction Site (Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development, 2013)
建筑施工现场环境与卫生标准
Management Rules for Safety of Construction Projects (SC, 2003)
建设工程安全生产管理条例
Interim Measures for Environmental Supervision (MEP, 2013)
环境监理工作暂行办法
Protection Rules for Urban Old and Famous Trees (Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development, 2000)
城市古树名木保护管理办法
Environmental Protection Management Rules for Transport Project (Ministry of Communication, 2003)
交通建设项目环境保护管理办法
Implementation Rules of Water Pollution Prevention and Control Law (SC, 2000)
水污染防治法实施细则
Circular on strengthening EIA Management for Construction Projects Funded by International Financial Institutions (1993)
关于加强国际金融组织贷款建设项目环境影响评价管理工作的通知
Interim Measures for Public Consultation in EIA (MOEP, 2006)
环境影响评价公众参与暂行办法
Regulations of Forest Parks (Forestry Administration, 2011)
森林公园管理办法
Regulations on Wetland Parks (Forestry Administration, 2011)
国家湿地公园管理办法（试行）
Stipulation on Limited Use of Pesticide Ministry of Agriculture, 2003)
农药限制使用规定农业部令 第 17 号

3. Main Technical Guidelines for EIA Preparation

Technical Guidelines for Environmental Impact Assessment: General Programme
环境影响评价技术导则—总纲 (HJ/T 2.1-2016)
Technical Guidelines for EIA: Surface Water Environment
环境影响评价技术导则—地面水环境 (HJ/T 2.3-93)
Technical Guidelines for Environmental Impact Assessment Groundwater Environment
环境影响评价技术导则地下水环境 (HJ 610-2016)
Technical Guidelines for Noise Impact Assessment
环境影响评价技术导则—声环境 (HJ2.4-2009)
Technical Guidelines for EIA: Atmospheric Environment
环境影响评价技术导则—大气环境 (HJ 2.2-2008)
Technical Guidelines for EIA: Ecological Environment of Nature Resource Development
环境影响评价技术导则—生态影响(HJ/T 19-2011)
Technical Guidelines for Water and Soil Conservation for Construction Projects
开发建设项目水土保持方案技术规范
Technical Guidelines for Environmental Risk Assessment on Projects
建设项目环境风险评价技术导则(HJ/T 169—2004)
Code for Environmental Impact Assessment of Water Conservancy and Hydro Projects

环境影响评价技术导则—水利水电工程(HJ/T 88-2003)
Technical Guidelines for Environment Impact Assessment of Urban Rail Transit
 环境影响评价技术导则—城市轨道交通 (HJ 453—2008)
Guideline for Technical Review of Environment Impact Assessment on Construction Projects
 建设项目环境影响技术评估导则(HJ 616-2011)
Technical Guidelines for Plan Environmental Impact Assessment General principles
 规划环境影响评价技术导则总纲(2014-09-01)
Technical Guidelines for Plan EIA
 规划环境影响评价技术导则(HJ/T 130-2003)
Technical Policy for Pollution Control in Livestock and Poultry Sector
 畜禽养殖业污染防治技术政策 2010
Technical Requirement for Non-Hazardous Treatment of Animal Waste
 畜禽粪便无害化处理技术规范 NY/T 1168-2006
Technical Standard of Preventing Pollution for Livestock and Poultry Breeding
 畜禽养殖业污染防治技术规范 HJ/T81-2001
Design Specifications for Wastewater Storage Facility of Animal Farm
 畜禽养殖废水污水储存设施设计要求 GB/T 26624-2011
General Guideline for Pesticide Safe Use
 农药安全使用规范总则 NY/T 1276-2007

4. Main Land Acquisition and transfer Laws and Regulations

Land Administration Law of the People's Republic of China (revised, issued and in effect since August 28, 2004);
 中华人民共和国土地管理法
Rural Land Contracting Law of the People's Republic of China (in effect since March 1, 2003);
 中华人民共和国农村土地承包法
Regulations Governing the Implementation of the Law of the People's Republic of China (State Council Decree No. 256, issued on December 27, 1998);
 中华人民共和国法律实施条例
State Council Decision on Deepening Reform to Enforce Strict Land Administration (Document No. 28 issued in 2004 by the State Council);
 国务院关于深化改革实施严格土地管理的决定
Guidelines on Improving Systems Governing Land Acquisition Compensation and Resettlement (Document No. 238 issued in 2004 by the Ministry of Land Resources);
 关于改进土地征用补偿和重新安置制度的指导方针
Circular of the State Council General Office about Transmitting the Guidelines of the Ministry of Labor and Social Security on Providing Employment Training and Social Security to Land-taken Farmers (Document No. 29 issued in 2006 by the State Council General Office);
 国务院办公厅转发劳动保障部关于做好被征地农民就业培训和社会保障工作指导意见的通知
Circular of the Ministry of Labor and Social Security and Ministry of Land Resources about Effectively Addressing Relevant Issues Concerning Social Security for Land-taken Farmers (Document No. 14 issued in 2007 by the Ministry of Labor and Social Security);
 劳动和社会保障部和国土资源部关于有效解决土地占用农民社会保障有关问题的通知
Property Law of the People's Republic of China (in effect since October 1, 2007)
 中华人民共和国物权法
Interim Regulations of the People's Republic of China Governing Tax on Occupying Cultivated Land (in effect since January 1, 2008);
 中华人民共和国关于占用耕地的税收暂行条例
Regulations of the People's Republic of China Governing the Disclosure of Government Information (in effect since May 1, 2008);
 中华人民共和国政府信息公开管理条例

Urgent Circular of the State Council General Office about Carrying out Stricter Administration of Land Acquisition and Structure Demolition Activities to Truly Protect Legitimate Rights and Benefits of the Affected People (Document No. 15 issued in 2010 by the State Council General Office);

国务院关于实施更严格的征地拆迁管理工作, 切实保护受影响人民合法权益的通知

Circular of the Ministry of Land Resources about Further Ensuring Effective Administration of Land Acquisition (issued on June 26, 2010);

国土资源部关于进一步确保土地征用有效管理的通知

Urgent Circular of the General Office of the Ministry of Land Resources about Strengthening Administration to Prevent Illegal Land Acquisition (Document No. 28 issued in 2013 by the General Office);

国土资源部办公厅关于加强行政防止非法征地的紧急通知

Circular of the General Office of the Ministry of Land Resources about Further Ensuring Effective Disclosure of Information on Land Acquisition at the City/County Level (Document No. 29 issued in 2014 by the General Office);

国土资源部办公厅关于进一步确保在市/县一级有效地公布土地购置信息的通知

Methods for Making Announcements about Land Acquisition (Decree No. 10 issued in 2001 by the Ministry of Land Resources;

征用土地公告办法

Categorization of Status Quo Land Use (GB/T21010-2007)

土地利用现状分类

Management measures for the transfer of rural land use right

农村土地承包经营权流转管理办法

the Market Operation Code on Rural Land use Rights Transfer (trial)

农村土地经营权流转交易市场运行规范 (试行)

the opinions on guiding the orderly transfer of rural land use right and developing agricultural moderate scale operation

关于引导农村土地经营权有序流转发展农业适度规模经营的意见 (2014)

5. Main ethnic minority Laws and Regulations

Law of the People's Republic of China on regional ethnic autonomy

《中华人民共和国民族区域自治法》(1984 年 10 月 1 日施行)

Regulations on administrative work of nationality townships of PRC

《中华人民共和国民族乡行政工作条例》(1993 年 9 月 15 日)

the Administrative Procedure Law of the People's Republic of China

中华人民共和国行政诉讼法

The 12th five-year plan of ethnic minority undertakings

《少数民族事业“十二五”规划》

The 13th five-year plan on promoting the development of ethnic minority areas and ethnic minorities

《“十三五”促进民族地区和人口较少民族发展规划》(国发〔2016〕79 号)

Views on helping to accelerate the development of ethnic and ethnic communities

《关于帮助少数民族和民族聚居地区加快发展的意见》

Summary of the utilization of funds for minority development

《少数民族发展资金管理使用情况总结》

6. Main Public consultation and grievance redress Laws and Regulations

the government information disclosure ordinance

政府信息公开条例

Circular of the State Council on issuing the key points of 2016 government affairs public work

国务院办公厅关于印发 2016 年政务公开工作要点的通知 (国办发〔2016〕19 号)

the petition Ordinance

信访条例

Views of the State Council on further mobilizing social forces to participate in the development of poverty alleviation
国务院办公厅关于进一步动员社会各方面力量参与扶贫开发的意见（国办发〔2014〕58号）

Comments of the State Council on further perfecting the support system for needy persons
国务院关于进一步健全特困人员救助供养制度的意见（国发〔2016〕14号）

Poverty alleviation and development Program for Rural Handicapped (2011-2020)
农村残疾人扶贫开发纲要（2011-2020年）

Views on the implementation of poverty alleviation projects in education
关于实施教育扶贫工程的意见（国办发〔2013〕86号）

Opinions on the implementation of the ingenious daughter-in-law's employment project and the action of promoting the poverty alleviation of the heroine

关于实施巧媳妇创业就业工程，推动巾帼脱贫攻坚行动的意见

Administrative measures for the construction of rural drinking water Safety project
农村饮水安全工程建设管理办法

7. Main poverty alleviation Laws and Regulations

Circular of the State Council on adjusting the leading group of poverty alleviation development
国务院办公厅关于调整国务院扶贫开发领导小组组成人员的通知（国办发〔2013〕63号）

Opinions on the effective linking of the rural minimum living security system and the poverty alleviation development policy to enlarge the pilot work

关于做好农村最低生活保障制度和扶贫开发政策有效衔接扩大试点工作的意见（国办发〔2010〕31号）

13th Five-Year Plan of Poverty alleviation in China

“十三五”脱贫攻坚规划（国发〔2016〕64号）

The decision of the State Council to win the fight against poverty

中共中央国务院关于打赢脱贫攻坚战的决定

Views of the State Council on supporting the implementation of integrated use of financial agriculture funds in impoverished counties

国务院办公厅关于支持贫困县开展统筹整合使用财政涉农资金试点的意见（国办发〔2016〕22号）

Annex 3: Summary of Consultation Workshop

Introduction

Formal consultation meetings of the ESSA were conducted in Nanning City and Du'an County respectively on April 14 and 15 in Guangxi.

The purposes of the multi-stakeholder consultation workshops were to: (a) introduce on the Environmental and Social Systems Assessment approach under the proposed Program for Results operation; (b) introduce the findings and recommendation of the assessment; and (c) seek comments and feedback on the key findings and recommendations of the ESSA.

Meeting agenda included: i) Bank team makes presentation on the PforR, including the Program proposed for financing; the scope, the thematic areas of coverage; ii) a presentation on P4R ESSA approach, key principles and requirements; iii) a presentation on social aspects of the ESSA; iv) a presentation on environmental aspects of the ESSA; v) Discussion & feedback.

Prior to the public consultation meetings, the Chinese version of the ESSA was distributed to potential participants and disclosed at the website of the Guangxi Regional Department of Agriculture on March 29, 2018.

Participants included poor facility representatives, poor village representatives, women representatives, NGOs, government agencies relevant to the Program such as finance bureau, DRC, Land Resources Bureau, Environmental Protection Bureau, Agricultural Bureau, Poverty Reduction Office, Livestock Bureau, Petition Bureau, Forestry bureau, Ethnic and Religious Affairs Bureau, Women's Federation at provincial level and from 7 counties out of the 28 program counties. Extensive discussions were seen during all the consultation meetings. Some participants provided additional details or updated information for the ESSA. The Bank team provided feedback to the participants as necessary.

Summary of key comments of the consultation workshops

In the workshops, participants voiced strong support to the Program. The participants agreed that overall the ESSA report are of good quality; the review and analysis of domestic laws and regulations are comprehensive and well-organized; the key environmental and social issues identified are consistent with the reality in general; the assessment of institutional arrangement and capacity and performance is objective; most of the recommendations made by the ESSA are pragmatic and achievable.

Participants suggested that the following aspects of the ESSA could be updated or revised. The ESSA team responded to their suggestions in the extensive discussion and some suggestions are agreed to be adopted:

Table 1 Summary of consultation meetings comments/questions and responses

No.	Comments /questions	Response from ESSA team	ESSA Revision
1	EPB official from Tend County advised that the pollution in soil caused by application of pesticide and fertilizers should be highlighted and further assessed	Unlike plain regions centered on cropping, the unfavorable landform in the 28 poverty counties handicaps severely the development of cropping. In the agricultural industrialization activities to be supported by the Program, the focus is to develop the fruits and cash trees with little on crops. The fruits and cash trees in Guangxi will not contribute large portion of non-point pollution load. The agricultural non-point pollution in	This issue will be clarified in the ESSA.

		Guangxi may be from livestock development. The ESSA already focuses on the livestock waste management;	
2	EPB official from Tiandeng County advised that the assessment on EIA system should be strengthened at the aspect of assessment of the consistency with the planning, the ecological carrying capacity, and Plan EA.	all of the activities are of small size and abstract of county planning which is not applicable to the Plan EA and these activities are fully consistent with the policy for poverty reduction, as confirmed by the DRC.	
3	EPB official from Xincheng County advised that the half of the public complaints they handled in 2017 were associated with livestock farms. The main reasons are the improper implementation of environmental measures and incomplete formalities. The official hoped the three-simultaneous system should be strengthened. The ESSA team responded that the assessment finds the inadequacy in the implementation of the system for livestock waste management, and make corresponding recommendation.	the law enforcement on ground is being strengthened as an integral part of the nation-wide environmental management reform. This issue will be handled during the implementation of the Program by the joint effort of the WB and Guangxi.	
4	Livestock Bureau official from Tianlin County advised that the element of minimization of the livestock waste should be assessed.	In the ESSA the effort made by Guangxi in the technical renovation for minimizing the generation has been assessed and applauded the effort made in the water conservation, ecological additive, and scientific formulated forage.	
5	Guangxi Regional Department of Agriculture official advised that the regional livestock bureau has been merged with the regional agricultural department.	Agreed to update the ESSA accordingly.	update the ESSA accordingly
6	The livestock bureau official from Longsheng County advised that the livestock farm and lots management method in Guangxi has been updated in 2017, and the epidemic prevention certificate is on longer a mandatory.	Asked the Guangxi Regional Department of Agriculture to help obtain the relevant information for updating the ESSA.	update the ESSA the feedback from Guangxi livestock bureau is that the first issue in being discussed, the second issue actually is not changed, the epidemic prevention certificate is still mandatory.
7	Guangxi Regional Department of Land Resources and county level Land Bureau advised that the terminology of land donation may not be applied to China since in China rural land ownership belongs to collective rather than farmer individuals. The land use for village infrastructure upgrading or construction is through the way of collective land use right adjustment.	Agreed to add a footnote to clarify the meaning of land donation in the ESSA. The meaning of land donation refers to rural collective land use right adjustment in China.	add a footnote to explain the terminology of land donation in the ESSA
8	Women's Federation from Mashan county advised that the village women executive committee has around 9-11 persons (Section 5.3.4)	Thanks. revised	update Section 5.3.4
9	Guangxi Regional Department of Agriculture official advised that the provincial level environment and social management agencies may be reformed in terms of the currently national institutional reform.	Thanks . will add a footnote to explain that according to the deliberation of the 13th session of the National People's Congress in March 2018, the State Council will implement reforms to form the Department of Natural Resources, and will no longer retain the Ministry of Land and Resources; set up the Ministry of Agriculture and	Add a footnote in section 5.3

		Rural, will no longer retain the Ministry of Agriculture; set up the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, The Ministry of Culture will no longer be retained; the Ministry of Supervision will be incorporated into the newly formed National Monitoring Committee. At present, the provincial level and below have not yet been reformed, may be reformed accordingly later on.	
10	With regard to the ESSA recommendation of "Recommendation 1: Enhance the technical capacity of staff in county livestock bureau and enhance technical training and support to farmers", the officials from the livestock bureau agreed to it and made strong commitment to implement this recommendation.	Thanks	
11	"Recommendation 2: To develop a community participation and consultation manual to initiative to lift people out of poverty and increase poor people ownership, in particular, encourage poor people participating in the design, implementation and management of community services facilities and infrastructure." The officials from the Guangxi Poverty Reduction agreed to it and made strong commitment to implement this recommendation under the supporting of the Bank	It was agreed that the Guangxi poverty reduction office will take responsibility for the manual preparation.	
12	"Recommendation 3: Standardize the community consultation and compensation procedure of voluntary land donation" the officials from Guangxi Land Resources and Management agreed to standardize the consultation procedure, contract signature and records backups .	Agreed to revise "standardize the consultation and compensation procures" to "standardize the consultation and contract signature procedures"	Revised in ESSA

Next steps

The comments of the consultation meetings were incorporated into the ESSA as appropriate. The revised ESSA will be disclosed on the external website of the World Bank, and on the website of the Guangxi Regional Department of Agriculture.

Participant counties:

Du'an, Mashan, Longsheng, Teng, Tianlin, Xincheng, Tiandeng

Bank ESSA Consultation Team

Yongli Wang , Environmental Engineer

Shaojun Chen, Senior Social Development Consultant