



<b>1. Project Data:</b>		<b>Date Posted :</b> 08/03/2000	
PROJ ID: P010417		<b>Appraisal</b>	<b>Actual</b>
<b>Project Name:</b> Balochistan Primary Education Program Project	<b>Project Costs (US\$M)</b>	120.00	86.75
<b>Country:</b> Pakistan	<b>Loan/Credit (US\$M)</b>	106.00	78.80
<b>Sector(s):</b> Primary Education	<b>Cofinancing (US\$M)</b>		
<b>L/C Number:</b> C2482			
	<b>Board Approval (FY)</b>		93
<b>Partners involved :</b> None directly, several in parallel interventions.	<b>Closing Date</b>	12/31/1999	12/31/1999
<b>Prepared by :</b>	<b>Reviewed by :</b>	<b>Group Manager :</b>	<b>Group:</b>

**2. Project Objectives and Components**

**a. Objectives**  
Under the Government's long-term Balochistan Primary Education Program (BPEP), the project was to implement special measures to improve girls' education, including :

1. **improving access, equity and efficiency;**
2. **improving the quality of the learning environment;**
3. **improving the organizational framework, planning and management .**

**b. Components**

1. **Access, equity and efficiency** would be increased by:
  - establishing new girls' schools which boys are allowed to attend;
  - providing classrooms and facilities to mixed shelterless schools;
  - introducing a scholarship program for girls in urban slum areas to attend privately -run schools; and
  - introducing a new policy to permit double-shifts where needs arose .
2. **Quality** would be improved by:
  - establishing appropriate pre-service and in-service teacher training system geared to multi-grade school conditions;
  - developing core student-activity books and other instructional materials suitable for multi -grade teaching and learning;
  - institutionalizing an instructional support system using learning coordinators .
3. **The organizational framework, planning and management** would be improved by:
  - establishing a Directorate of Primary Education (DPE) separate from the secondary school administration at provincial and district levels;
  - establishing a monitoring and evaluation unit within the DPE;
  - continuing development of the management information system (MIS).

**Beneficiary participation** would be used to achieve all of the objectives by setting up parent committees and involving them in school establishment and supervision .

**The project's scope was amended in September 1997**, in part to align it with the ongoing programmatic Social Action Plan projects covering management and budgetary planning and management countrywide . Objectives were not amended but component scope was broadened to include middle schools; inclusion of mentoring and peer-training for primary school teachers; provision of funds for piloting innovations such as new training approaches and early childhood education; requirement of the Borrower to expand the supply of female primary school teachers; and development of a student learning assessment system; inclusion performance indications; five new conditionalities; revision of the program agreement on procurement, withdrawals, reallocation of credit proceeds and more frequent audit reporting.

**c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates**  
The credit financed construction, furniture and equipment, educational materials, specialist services, fellowships and

training, and incremental recurrent costs for additional staff and operations and maintenance during the project's implementation.

In February 1996, the BPEP Development Credit Agreement and project legal agreement were amended with new conditionalities and conditions to address generic problems of weak administrative capacity and deficient provincial governance; excessively centralized management and unclear accountability; delays in budgeting and release of funds; frequent manager transfers, hiring of unqualified teachers, and staff absenteeism; refusal by the Government of Balochistan (GOB) to place qualified counterparts for the TA or retain contract staff; and difficulties with procurement and logistics. NGO involvement was included.

In December 1999, a decision was made to cancel the remaining credit, (\$8.5 m.). 100% depreciation of Rupee against US dollar partially explains non-utilized proceeds from credit, according to ICR (p.11).

### **3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:**

BPEP was successful in achieving targets for: access and equity; development of learning inputs (teacher training and instructional materials); development of the MIS; and establishment of partnerships with NGOs to mobilize communities in establishing and overseeing the effectiveness of primary schools.

**School Construction, rehabilitation and teacher selection and deployment**. Over 4,000 schools and nearly 1,500 classrooms were constructed, though the ratio of 70/30 of girls' to boys' schools was reversed with a ratio of 40/60 at completion. Furniture was procured though chairs and desks were unsuitable in design for teaching-learning activities. The numbers of female teachers in rural areas increased, including in 1,500 community schools, though merit-based criteria for recruitment allowed unqualified and untrained teachers to be hired instead of the available qualified teachers. In community schools, teacher absenteeism was far less frequent than elsewhere where the problem remains rampant.

**Improving the Learning Environment**. Altogether, 8,600 untrained teachers including 1,500 community school teachers were trained and certified through BPEP effectively clearing a backlog of untrained teachers. Accelerated in-service training was implemented for 2,500 teachers and pre-service training was implemented through the government college and, for community schools, a mobile female teacher training unit. In-service training for trained teachers was implemented in multi-grade teaching, hygiene and sanitation and learning coordinator skills. The DPE's teacher training and support cell successfully developed and delivered innovative needs-based training for 3,300 girls in remote rural areas. The college based training, however, continued in a traditional mode. The mentoring program benefited 10,000 teachers in monthly workshops, and UNICEF-funded health and early childhood workshops were conducted through the program. The Primary Education Improvement Program, a complementary initiative funded by the Netherlands, provided inputs to improve teaching and community involvement in school management.

**Improving the organization framework, planning and management**. About 22% of positions were filled by female managers compared with 2% at project launch. All officers were trained. New joint management arrangement for classes K to 8 that were expected to emanate from the separation of the DPE from secondary and higher education management was not completed. The MIS was established by USAID prior to the project and was one of the brightest achievements of BPEP. It is in use province-wide for annual school censuses, planning (school sites and construction, textbooks and teachers). However, analysis of data is a huge task still required but with potential use for targeting and impact evaluation. When an Assessment Monitoring and Performance Evaluation Cell was established in 1996, it began to monitor and textbook availability and school management committees and developed student progress reports for parents. But the methods it used for assessment of student learning do not so far yield reliable and valid information and have not proved useful for policy and planning.

**The community schools** demonstrate considerable success and potential if problems in the partnership between the government, NGOs and communities could be resolved, especially the full inclusion of communities in decision-making. At credit closing, 1,300 schools enrolled 60,000 students and they have lower rates of absenteeism, dropout and repetition and encourage greater demand for girls' education overall. Village Education Committees did not consider that they could support the schools without government help. In 1996, the GOB decreed that all new schools should follow the community model but without the involvement of NGOs. About 10,000 school management committees were established, over 2,000 were trained and validated by NGOs and 4,700 opened bank accounts and received operating funds. The more successful committees were those established with adequate preparation and participation and not under abrupt central directives. Their potential benefits are at risk unless the community support experience can be built on and adequate operational funds are made available.

### **4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:**

**Fellowships for girls'** to attend low-tuition private schools helped increase access for 6,654 girl students in 40 urban schools by covering fees for tuition, books and educational materials. Implementation was undertaken by an NGO and later the Balochistan Education Foundation. It continues to enjoy parental support even when subsidies have

ended and the enrollment of girls continues to increase . The rural scheme provided the means for about 1,000 girls to attend school for 30 schools in remote and sparsely populated rural areas . By the completion, 21 schools converted to community schools, one became private and 8 failed, probably due to unrealistic assessment of the community's capacity to support the schools .

**5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):**

Satisfactory institutional capacity was developed in the DPE to manage the program but this has dissipated since 1996 due to deterioration of the political environment, frequent staff turnover and transfer of the teacher training support and the materials development functions out of the dedicated units to inexperienced agencies, and to exclude NGOs. Due to the changes, the risk is considerable that teaching and learning practices and the use of materials will revert to pre-project behavior.

<b>6. Ratings:</b>	<b>ICR</b>	<b>OED Review</b>	<b>Reason for Disagreement /Comments</b>
<b>Outcome:</b>	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
<b>Institutional Dev .:</b>	Negligible	Modest	During implementation, institutional development was achieved from a low base and with moderate success --in primary education organization, planning and management; in teacher training; and in community/NGO support for schools. The <i>impact</i> was less than substantial because of post-project government actions in transferring functions and denial of funding.
<b>Sustainability:</b>	Unlikely	Unlikely	ICR judges that recurrent and investment budgets and structural arrangements inadequate and overall sustainability unlikely, therefore. ICR observes that, in the schools established under BPEP, community schools and urban fellowships for girls are likely to be sustained in the short-term because of demand.
<b>Bank Performance:</b>	Satisfactory	Unsatisfactory	The ICR points out that task teams made great efforts with too few resources under difficult country conditions but also comments on important deficiencies of Bank performance overall. The project as presented to the Board was not ready for implementation and is judged over-complex and unrealistic about project management skills, financial and procurement arrangements, implementation capacity, use of TA and borrower commitment. Frequent staff changes in supervision led to lack of attention to financial, management, educational and sustainability issues, and this led to disruptions of which the Borrower complains.
<b>Borrower Perf .:</b>	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Despite the satisfactory performance of some technical agencies and the successful completion of most components, the Government demonstrated lack of commitment to maintaining funding and staffing for project institutions; allowed the project to suffer from political interference; and failed to comply with financial and other covenants. Furthermore, the management of TA was grossly inadequate. These deficiencies damaged the project's ability

		to make a lasting developmental impact, despite its relevance and innovative focus.
<b>Quality of ICR :</b>	Exemplary	

**NOTE:** ICR rating values flagged with '\*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

### 7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

Among the many lessons for the Pakistan context, several are of broad applicability and are not frequently mentioned in ICRs (OED's emphasis in italics).

#### Lessons for Education

- Complementing targeting priorities with appropriate targeting *mechanisms* have been shown to improve equity.
- Toward ensuring sustainability beyond completion, project processes and outcomes and, *in particular, the implementation of agreed exit* strategies should receive more attention from supervision missions from mid-term.
- Taking to scale successful interventions need to consider the time required *to build additional* capacity to ensure appropriate follow up and quality in the delivery of interventions . Too much too soon leads to serious operational drawbacks.
- Demand-driven interventions involving community participation in managing school -related issues have proved effective worldwide in reducing teacher absenteeism and in increasing access to schools *---in this case, for girls, as well as boys.*
- Needs-based teacher training activities involving periodic *peer interaction and on-site follow up* have proven effective to change teaching practices in the classroom .
- Ensure the involvement of *qualified NGOs in the design and* implementation of project-related interventions for which they have shown expertise .
- **Among lessons learned for the Bank 's management** , the most important are that management should ensure that supervision missions avoid frequent changes in tactics, priorities and unwarranted design changes, and that they are *backed appropriate budgets, sufficient time for field visits and adequate skills to address relevant issue.*
- **Among lessons learned by the Borrower** , the most important are: planning should be undertaken at the start to *ensure adequate financial resources* for new structures and activities beyond the completion of the project; *permanent staff should act as counterparts to technical experts to ensure that capacity -building remains within the DPE*; the fees for experts should not be changed during implementation, local experts should used except in dire necessity, only qualified persons should be engaged, and TA costs should be controlled at 5% of total costs rather than the 10% in this project.

### 8. Assessment Recommended? Yes No

**Why?** In a country social sector review as a cluster with other basic education projects and the SAPs in Pakistan when all are near completion in 2--3 years. Successful innovations in girls' education and teacher training should be evaluated for their durability and replicability .

### 9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The ICR is exemplary because the evidence is presented clearly and fully, the evaluation of findings is balanced and convincing, and the conclusions drawn are well-grounded. In particular, the discussion of educational issues shows an exceptional level of appreciation for the technical aspects ---a quality that is often missing from ICRs in education . The 18 lessons learned are clearly divided between the preparation -appraisal stage and the implementation stage, and demonstrate appreciation for factors important for relevance, efficacy and efficiency and fiduciary issues, as well as sustainability OED's evaluation led to some variance in ratings of Bank and Borrower performance and somewhat different focus for institutional development