

**PUBLIC CONSULTATION
FOR**

**PAPUA NEW GUINEA ROAD MAINTENANCE AND
REHABILITATION PROJECT II ADDITIONAL FINANCING**

ALOTAU - EAST CAPE ROAD AND BOGIA – AWAR ROAD

Final Report

Contents

| | |
|------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 1.0 Introduction..... | 1 |
| 1.1 Venues selected..... | 2 |
| 2.0 Consultation | 2 |
| 2.1 Bubuleta village | 3 |
| 2.2 East Cape market | 4 |
| 2.3 Lelehoa..... | 6 |
| 2.4 Casual Meeting with the Milne Bay Governor | 7 |
| 3.0 Bogia – Awar Road – Madang Province | 7 |
| 3.1 Awar village..... | 8 |
| 3.2 Kamasina village – Mambuan..... | 10 |
| 4.0 Conclusion | 11 |
| Annex 1 Attendance at Public Consultation | 12 |
| Annex 2: Photos of the Public Consultation | 13 |

1.0 Introduction

Public consultation for resource and development projects in Papua New Guinea is essential as it ensures that the community is informed on the types of project interventions and the benefits that a particular project brings.

This process also allows the community to express their views and sentiments on the project. Exchanges between the proponents or developers allows for specific concepts if not understood in written material to be explained to on site. Often, events or hazards are either perceived or have occurred and the consultation allows for the clarification of these events and to guide the community to seek remedial action on them.

In the Road Rehabilitation and Rehabilitation Project II Additional Financing (RMRP II AF), public consultation is essential as it satisfies the Government of Papua New Guinea and the World Bank Operative Policies (OP) and Bank Policies (BP). All World Bank projects require public consultation and this report presented the outcomes of the public consultation for the sub projects; Alotau – East Cape Road – Milne Bay province and Bogia – Awar Road – Madang Province. The consultations were conducted from the 2nd to the 5th October 2013¹.

Three places were selected for the public consultation in Milne Bay province while two places were in Madang province. The five venues are representative of sections of the community along the Alotau – East Cape road and Bogia – Awar road that will be influenced by the RMRP IIAF.

The structure of this report sets out the introduction, including the justification for these venues. Section 2 provides records of each of the consultation where issues raised were noted and where appropriate response was offered to the question. Where no appropriate response was forthcoming, concerns were noted to be addressed at the management level as agreeing with a suggestion or issue may not reflect the institution that the facilitator represents. Finally, a conclusion notes the main issues arising from these consultations. Annex 1 contains a listing of persons present at the public consultation and not all locations have attendance lists. Photographs of these consultations are attached in Annex 2.

¹ The public consultation was carried out by John Duguman and Diro Gabi from DOW – EMU together with cooperation from DOW Works Engineers and Milne Bay Provincial Administration Environment Officer and Provincial Works coordinator Officer in Madang.

1.1 Venues selected

The selection of villages and venue in Milne Bay was based on discussion with the Provincial Works Manager in Alotau and also with World Bank staff (Julie Babinard and Dr. Mari Clarke) who visited Milne Bay in September 2013. Venues for the Bogia – Awar road were selected from the author’s local knowledge and from the Provincial Works Coordinator. These are the following points that supported the selection of the venue sites.

- The three venues along the Alotau – East Cape road (Lelehoa, Bubuleta and East Cape) were places earlier visited by the World Bank staff and the communities were aware of the consultation process in relation to the RMRP II AF.
- These venues also represent communities along this stretch of the sub project and this would provide views covering the full length of the sub projects.
- Similar comments as previous stated can be echoed for the Bogia – Awar road. This sub project is just half the length of the Alotau to East Cape Road (29 km). Here only two venues were suggested here (Kamasina and Awar). These nevertheless represent the beginning and end of the road and any issues along this section of the road will have been known as those at the end the road travel to and from Madang.

2.0 Consultation

Public consultation at the five venues was conducted as public meetings where the community and civil servants were given an opportunity to air their views on the RMRP II AF. The keeping of attendance list was not practical at these venues, although the name of one or two community leaders present have been listed here. Pictures showing the meetings are in Annex 1.

Thursday 3rd October 2013;

The intention for consultation for this day was to begin at Lelehoa followed at Bubuleta and then finally at East Cape. Leaving Alotau, at 8 40 am after the female engineer could not come along for the consultation, the first stop was at Lelehoa Community School. The team members were

Amayang Wintowe – Provincial Civil Engineer (PCE) , Misah Lionel – Environment Officer - Milne Bay Provincial Administration, Joel - Officer in Charge of AusAID Transport Sector Support Programme (TSSP) in Alotau, Diro Gabi – Senior Environment Officer – DOW – Environmental Management Unit

(EMU) and John Duguman (Facilitator) and the driver Rhyan . It was noted that another awareness program (AIDS) was carried out at the community hall and all the students were there.

It seems that even after word was sent out earlier by DOW, the community did not get the message because of miscommunication between the former councilor and the current elected councilor. A female school teacher met us and the purpose for the consultation was mentioned to her. She said to pass on the message to the children during the awareness announcement so that they can inform their parents to come to the school ground around half past four in the afternoon. The team then left for Bubuleta.

2.1 Bubuleta village

Meeting with Bubuleta community including government officer at Bubuleta Agriculture station
Betel nut was purchased and shared amongst the men and women for them to feel at ease and also it is part of the cultural approach.

Consultation started at 9.50am. Present:

Bubuleta Ward Councillor – Abel Jacob, Roger Nanakia, Ward Development Committee (WDC) – Law and Order, and team.

Villagers total 30 persons including 10 women and 15 men ; both groups consists mainly of parents and elderly men and women and about 10 children, aged about 5 – 10 yrs. Consultation in English, Pidgin and local language. In the group gathering was the health worker at the Bubuleta clinic and the Officer in Charge of the Bubuleta Agriculture station.

Consultation started with the Ward councilor explaining the purpose of this gathering before the facilitator introduced the team and the purpose of the consultation. Meeting was conducted in Pidgin and translated into local dialect for the elders to understand.

Village population about 800 and about thirty of the women (30 ~ 50 yrs. old) were involved in a Kwato Church camp at Watenoi and therefore were leaving today for Watenoi. Hence only a handful of elderly women were present at the meeting. The Councilor had to sound the gong a number of times for the people to come and gather for the meeting.

Comments/ Issues and Concerns were then aired.

1. Speed limit was a main concern because vehicles often increase speed along the main road this will increase when roads are sealed Concern was noted.
2. Should there be a need for crops to be cleared then crop compensation should be done first. Concern was noted and facilitator stated that this will need to be established if this is the case.

3. Land acquisition is an issue and this must be looked at in relation to the project going ahead. Concern noted however it was emphasized that the road will be on the existing Right of Way and hence this may not be an issue.
4. Comment from the aid post sister who stated that if a contractor did not complete the road work as set out by the World Bank, what will the World Bank do to my land? This was explained by the facilitator that this is a misconception and loan agreements are between the Government of PNG and World Bank and there is no need to fear. Your land is not held as collateral as a normal bank loan.
5. OIC at Bubuleta Agriculture Station reiterated the need for safety and was happy with a sealed road but stated that there must be humps and crossing in school areas with appropriate signage. This was noted down.
6. Concern was raised by a villager (men) that often there is the issue of outsider contractors used and youths are not properly compensated through their groups. The Environmental Officer mentioned that it is better for youths or even women's groups to get registered with the Community Development Officer with the Local Level Government and it would be the Huhu LLG. In that way, they can be recognized. The facilitator added that if this arrangement is in order then this can be facilitated by the provincial works department and have contractor seek the established groups for small contracts.
7. Another comment was raised regarding previous contractors –Shorncliff who did not complete their work on the East Cape road. This was noted and it was stated by the facilitator and the provincial works engineer that because of that, the remaining funds were given to the other contractor who is currently working on sections of road leading to East Cape.

Overall remarks; Community gathering were happy of the project and supported this with the councilor responding on behalf on the community for the consultation and awareness on the start of the process for the RMRP II AF. This then concluded the consultation at Bubuleta at 12.40 pm. The team then left for East Cape.

2.2 East Cape market

Second Public Consultation: East Cape Market; Commenced at 2.00pm

Information was relayed to the East Cape Ward Councillor regarding this meeting but he was not available and was away on one of the outer islands. In lieu of that, a former school teacher was approached in the market place to gather the community there for the meeting.

Present; Yauna Sioni – Former school teacher, Team and East Cape market vendors and customers. Total of ~ 25 -30 including men, women and 15 children about 3 -5 years old. Consultation in Pidgin and local language.

Mr Sioni explained the purpose of the gathering before the facilitator elaborated further and asked for discussion on the road project.

- ❖ Observation; Not everyone came to the market and with the ward councilor out, only some representation were present. None of the women spoke although they were asked to participate. It would seem that they were more interested in getting their food items sold, which is what everyone would do first in their life.

Concerns/ Issues

1. There must be some strategies for youths or small contractors to be able to be trained to participate in the possible jobs along the road, e.g. the correct mixing of cement on line drains. These strategies must be provided by the project. Facilitator noted this concern and response was that the project has a limited scope of work in delivering this project and these skills must already be built up so that sub-contractors need to also register through the Community Development Officer in the LLG for them to participate.
2. Trucks travel back and forth from East Cape into Alotau and back till the early hours of the morning and might impact on the road works when the project starts. This concern was noted.
3. Humps and speed limits must be placed at established markets along the route. Although another man commented that too many humps slow down the traffic and should be limited to those that are essential such as markets and schools.
4. Concern was raised about getting contracts by young men who stated that the contracts must be done properly so that the main and sub-contractors are adequately compensated for their effort. Hence ensure that a good job leads to good money made. This was noted.
5. Spoon drains along the water front of the East Cape villages is a concern and must be replaced by culvert. This was noted although the PCE said that this would create additional problems such as digging down to have the culvert inserted in.
6. There is a need for a proper bus or PMV stop at the end of East Cape road because this is also the transit point for the Esa ála islanders as they travel into Alotau.

Overall remarks: All were supportive of the project to proceed while the concerns and issues can be addressed.

Besides these, it was noted that the women did not contribute to the discussion and the teachers at the school were also preparing for the International Teachers Day that was to be held tomorrow (Friday 4th October 2013).

Informal discussion with Mr. Sioni later noted that there were already existing women groups within churches and therefore they will need to contact the Community Development Officer at the Local Level Government so that they can participate meaningfully.

Consultation then closed at 3.00 pm and the team returned to Lelehoa.

2.3 Lelehoa

Thursday 4th October 2013; Third Public Consultation Returned from East Cape about 4.25pm

It seems that the message to the children did not get to their parents or they were preparing for tomorrow's International Teachers Day. Consultation was in Pidgin.

Present: 8 men, John Marlo – Ward Councilor and seven other villagers and team

Brief introduction on the project by the facilitator and then opened this to discussions from those present.

Concerns/ Issues

The Ward Councilor apologized for the people not turning up as they may be busy with other commitments. He also said that he only got the notice this afternoon hence there may have been some miscommunication. He works in Alotau and commutes to and from the village.

1.0 Concern on current road works undertaken by the local Member of Parliament and the Goilana rural electrification project running adjacent on the left side of the road. PNG Power has agreed to pay for the five metres on the left side of the road but the Member has told them that they will not pay for the other five metres on the other side as this was allowing the development of power lines into the villagers.

- This has prompted the councilor to organize with the villagers to seek redress of these issues. The Provincial Lands Officer has not been consulted on this and they feel that the land was not acquired in the past and this issue must be resolved before any of these projects can proceed.
- Some precedence has been set such as on the West Gurney road and this they feel must follow similar arrangements.

- Affected crops such as coconut trees or mango trees must be properly compensated as they are the people's livelihood
- 2.0 Concern on safety and while sealed roads will eliminate dust, appropriate speed signs need to be erected.
- 3.0 Pedestrian crossing next to the Lelehoa School is essential as it links the school to the beach and allow for vehicles to slow down when they are in the vicinity of the school.

Overall remark: Those that attended approved of the project and wanted the concerns addressed. They also know that this project comes after the current road project.

Public consultation ended at 5.20 pm and the team then headed for Alotau

2.4 Casual Meeting with the Milne Bay Governor

Friday 5th October 2013

While waiting at the Gurney airport to travel to Port Moresby and then to Madang, was introduced to the Government of Milne Bay (Hon Titus Philemon MP) by the Environment Officer.

He was grateful for the Work Bank assistance and said that “we were scratching the road surface and it’s good that the World Bank has come to our aid in sealing the Alotau – East Cape road. This road served a lot of people coming in from the islands and north coast and this was a genuine component of development in Milne Bay province.

3.0 Bogia – Awar Road – Madang Province

Saturday 5th October 2013, Awar village 12.30 pm.

Trip to Bogia was three and half hours so we left at 8.40 am and got into Bogia station at 12.00 noon. We met up with the Bogia District Administrator (DA) - John Nobl who accompanied us to the two villages. Awar and Kamasina – Mambuan villages. Team was then DA, James Dimara (Works Manager – Department of Madang and Jacob Obungai – Assistant Director – Office of Information – Department of Madang) and Diro Gabi – DOW – EMU.

In arranging to come to Madang, asked for a Civil Society representative to accompany us at the meetings but the response was not positive. Non-government organizations often are very sceptical about World

Bank projects and their initiate response was “All the World Bank wants is for us to agree to their safeguard and state our participation”.

3.1 Awar village

After betel nut and tobacco sticks were given out to the twenty men gathered there, the consultation started. Present: Robert Mainzin - Awar ward councilor and nineteen of the village men. A Nubia Ward member was present and he will relay the message of this consultation to his people when he returns to Nubia. Nubia is before Awar village. A single lady was present but seated away from the gathering even though the councilor asked the ladies to come and listen to the gathering.

Consultation was in Pidgin.

The DA gave an opening remark regarding the consultation and then the facilitator elaborated before allowing for issues/comments to be aired in the gathering. Most of these issues were stated by the councilors and supported by one or two men.

Concerns/Issues

1. Ward councilor said that all the villagers were unanimous in agreeing that the road be sealed as it would improve their travelling time to and from Madang. Sealing of the road to Bogia Hospital would help the sick to reach the hospital quickly.
2. Need for speed humps before and after village and also at schools to regulate speed of PMVs and those of betel nut traders who travel all the way from the Highlands down to Bogia and to Awar to get to Boroï for betel nut. They pass through Awar to get there.
3. In addition to point 2, there is a lot of PMVs on route 100 (Highlands Highway) who travel all the way to Bogia and in doing so deprive the local PMV operators in making money on this route into Madang town. Can this be stopped? There is already a PMV Association formed however the Madang Lands Transport Board has been defunct and therefore this irregularity has crept in. If the Land Transport Board is resurrected then the route 100 PMVs will be asked to pay a fee to use this route or be penalized.
4. If the sealing starts, can it go all the way to the Awar airport? This was noted although this may not be in the scope of works for the RMRP II AF.

5. Another issue which was not related to the RMRP II AF but it relates to sub-contractors who engaged the men from Awar to do clearing along road sides and then did not pay their wages. This has angered the men who want this to be resolved. It was stated further that the Madang Provincial Supply and Tenders Board must ensure that there are the right contractors who will be diligent in their dealing with sub-contractors and groups working along the roads. The DA took note of this and will respond to those concerned and to have that sorted out.
6. When asked by the facilitator if women and youth groups are organized, the councilor responded that these groups are organized and ready to participate. They were encouraged to be registered with the Local Level Government so they can be officially recognized.
7. Some of the road sections had a number of “S” bends and could this be straightened so this will cut down travelling time? This was noted for now and the civil engineers and designers will have the final say in the road route.
8. Minor issue regarding flowers planted on the road sides and the facilitator stated that you can always uproot and plant them away from the road. These are not serious considerations for compensation.
9. Concern about World War II bombs. Before the road side works began, a Bomb Expert unit must check out road section from Iku up to Awar. This is to ensure that bombs closer to the road sides and surface must be removed to allow safe working environment for the contractor and commuters.

Consultation ended at 1.30pm and team then left for Kamasina village – Mambuan.

Additional Information received on 15th October 2013

The giant Frieda Copper Mine in neighboring East Sepik province is considering piping the copper concentrate down to Hansa Bay (Awar) where it will ship it out from there. This will mean that this road Bogia to Awar Road will see a lot of traffic in terms of carting of equipment from Madang to Hansa Bay. It may also see the transformation of Bogia station into a formal town and bring development.

3.2 Kamasina village – Mambuan²

The councilor for Mambuan Felix Malagen left for Madang in the morning and he was not available. Nevertheless the DA together with the facilitator and Diro Gabi met with at least 10 men. The village gong was sounded twice but people did not attend to the consultation. Driving back from Awar to Kamasina was a big gathering about 100 metres from the meeting place and it seemed that this was more valued to the people there.

Consultation was in Pidgin and started at 3.00pm. Two of the villagers names were Wesley Onden and Apoa. After the DA explained about the reason for the meeting, the facilitator elaborated on the RMRP AF and then opened the discussions for comments, issues or queries.

Comments/Concerns/Issues

1. The Mambuan villagers were of the opinion that the road will be diverted away from the village uphill before it connected to the other Mambuan villages but the facilitator stated that this road will follow the current right of way.
2. There were concerns that sections of the road is very close to the houses on the left side and the road may need to be widened on the other side. If that is the case then there may be a possibility for some structures to be affected. This was noted and explained that the final design of the road will be decided by then if there are structures that will need to be relocated. The facilitator noted that there is the LARF that will address this issue³.
3. Hump and signage at the beginning and end of the village is important for safety in the village.
4. World Vision currently has a program in the Mambuan villages providing water pumps into the villages and pipes were layered alongside the road. The road design and upgrading work will need to be coordinated with them so as to the possible disruption of water supply to the villages.
5. Some of the water drains from the hills down across the road and there will need to be culverts to divert the run off into the sea. Otherwise, run off will erode road surface.

² Major Mambuan villages are Kamasina, Kosakosa, SamuSamu and Ambu

³ The date of 5th October 2013 was later transmitted to the District Administrator for him to inform the villagers that any new structures or items grown there after the consultation will not be entertained.

Consultation closed at 3.40pm and the small group of villagers was unanimous in getting the road sealed but to ensure that it was safe for the community.

4.0 Conclusion

The responses from the five locations in Milne Bay and Madang provinces overall supported the intervention of the Road Maintenance and Rehabilitation Project II Additional Financing (RMRP II AF).

While there are issues that arose in the public consultation, these were no contentious issue that needs to be resolved. The road alignment along the Bogia to Awar road will need to be surveyed when funding has been made available to determine if any structure is in the way. Otherwise, these issues are perceptions until then.

The representation of women in these meetings was not as fruitful as could be expected even though prior notice was sent out. There is also the perception among a lot of younger generations around Papua New Guinea who are not believers of any government meetings and often do not turn up. Their questions are so what? Nothing has happened all these times and unless there is something individually for me, I will come along.

Setting these aside, the sealing of these roads will remove dust altogether although fumes of vehicles will still exist. The sealing of roads will provide opportunities for other activities such as the giant undeveloped Frieda Copper Mine who will use the Bogia to Awar road for its supplies in building a wharf to export copper concentrate from the Hansa Bay.

From the consultations, the issues or concerns can be grouped into the following themes;

- I. Clearing of ROW and associated spoil; crop compensation; structures within road corridors
- II. Contractors Work Ethics and labour employment
- III. Payment of Claims for the crops removed.
- IV. Transport safety, speed humps and signage
- V. Request for additional sealing to the airport
- VI. Road alignment and possible Land Acquisition
- VII. Possible World II bombs and
- VIII. DOW Supervision.

These themes need to be addressed some by way of adhering to by the Department of Works and its responsibilities. Others were to be addressed by the contractors and to be overseen by their Public Relations Officers.

The process of dealing with Land Acquisition and Resettlement is with the Land Acquisition and Resettlement Framework (LARF) and with all stakeholders working together will result in an amicably and successful project.

Annex 1 Attendance at Public Consultation

For the five location, no full listing available as community may feel that their names are being taken without their consent, but title of councilor and ward committee members as appropriate are stated here together with contacts for government officers for further information and perusal.

| Name/Organization/Position |
|-----------------------------------------------------------|
| Bubuleta village |
| Abel Jacob – Ward Councilor |
| Roger Nankia – Ward Development Committee (Law and Order) |
| Benjamin Maisei – OIC – Bubuleta Agriculture Station |
| East Cape market |
| Yauna Sioni – retired teacher |
| Lelehoa Community School |
| John Marco – Ward Councilor |
| Awar village |
| Robert Mainzin – Ward Councilor |
| Kamasina (Mambuan) village |
| Wesley Onden – retired public servant |
| Apoa – old villager |

Annex 2: Photos of the Public Consultation



Pictures of the gathering at Bubuleta village under a mango tree with the clinic sister sitting with the women in the bottom of the picture.



Gathering at the East Cape market with the market sellers mostly women and men gathering around the market.



Gathering at Awar village in the top picture and at Kamasina village in the lower picture. Note the proximity of the road about twenty five metres from the gathering place.