



1. Project Data

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| Project ID P148127 | Project Name GPE Guinea | |
| Country Guinea | Practice Area(Lead) Education | |
| L/C/TF Number(s) TF-19337,TF-A0171 | Closing Date (Original) 01-Jul-2018 | Total Project Cost (USD) 38,650,509.53 |
| Bank Approval Date 10-Jul-2015 | Closing Date (Actual) 31-Aug-2019 | |
| | IBRD/IDA (USD) | Grants (USD) |
| Original Commitment | 38,800,000.00 | 38,800,000.00 |
| Revised Commitment | 38,800,000.00 | 38,650,509.53 |
| Actual | 38,650,509.53 | 38,650,509.53 |

| | | | |
|---|---------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|
| Prepared by Hjalte S. A. Sederlof | Reviewed by Judyth L. Twigg | ICR Review Coordinator Joy Behrens | Group IEGHC (Unit 2) |
|---|---------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives

The Project Development Objective (PDO) for the Pooled-Fund for Basic Education as set out in the Grant Agreement (p. 6) and the Project Appraisal Document (p. 8) was to (i) improve access and learning in basic education and literacy of under-served populations; (ii) strengthen MEN-A's capacity in evidence-based management; and (iii) support the implementation of the education sector's short-term Ebola strategic response plan.



“Underserved populations” were defined as populations in remote rural areas and overcrowded urban areas. MEN-A is the Ministry of Pre-University Education and Literacy.

b. Were the project objectives/key associated outcome targets revised during implementation?

No

c. Will a split evaluation be undertaken?

No

d. Components

The project had three components:

Component 1: Equity and access in education (estimated cost at appraisal US\$24.90 million; actual cost US\$24.55 million). The component aimed at improving coverage and equity in access to basic education and at improving the hygienic conditions in primary schools. It emphasized equity by focusing on improving access to basic education for marginalized populations (primarily female and rural children, and out-of-school children), and by implementing a literacy campaign with a special focus on women. To mitigate the ongoing and any future Ebola epidemic through the school system and to promote a healthier teaching and learning environment, this component was also to support the MEN-A in its efforts to rehabilitate/construct latrines and water points and to complete the distribution of hand washing kits.

Component 2: Quality of teaching and learning conditions (estimated cost at appraisal US\$21.70 million; actual cost US\$20.63 million). The component aimed at improving the quality of teaching and learning environments in the primary and lower secondary subsectors, with contingent effects on the improvement of learning outcomes throughout the basic education cycle. This was to contribute to improved retention, smoothing of the transition from primary to lower secondary education, and the improvement of completion rates.

Component 3: Strengthened management and governance in education (estimated cost at appraisal US\$5.20; actual cost US\$6.69 million). The component was to support interventions to enhance governance and management in the education sector by building monitoring and evaluation (M&E) capacity to enable evidence-based policy design, strategy and planning; piloting programs to improve human resource management; and undertaking analytic work to prepare the roll-out of future reforms. The component was also to support institutional capacity building for the effective management of the pooled fund, coordination of the government’s education plan, and strengthening of the MEN-A’s fiduciary and technical capacity.



The PDO remained unchanged throughout project implementation. A key indicator was added during a project restructuring on February 15, 2018 to measure improved enrollment capacity (access). At the same time, enrollment was retained as a key indicator for access. The addition was made to introduce an indicator over which the project had direct influence.

The above was the second restructuring. A first restructuring was undertaken on March 17, 2016 when the number of latrines and water points to be constructed was reduced and the savings reallocated to hand-washing kits and other hygienic items, due to implementation delays and the limited time that the trust fund resources allocated to this activity were available.

e. **Comments on Project Cost, Financing, Borrower Contribution, and Dates**

Project cost. At appraisal, the total cost of the project was estimated at US\$51.80 million. Actual project costs at completion were US\$51.87 million (the difference is made up of exchange rate changes).

Project financing. The following grant funding supported the project: US\$37.80 million from the Global Partnership for Education; US\$12 million equivalent from the French Development Agency; US\$1 million from the United Nations Children’s Fund; and US\$1 million from the Ebola Recovery and Reconstruction Trust Fund. No Recipient contribution was planned or made.

Dates. The project was approved on July 10, 2015 and became effective on October 19, 2015, with an original closing date of July 1, 2018. The February 2018 restructuring extended the closing date to August 31, 2019 to allow project completion. The project closed at that date.

3. Relevance of Objectives

Rationale

The project’s objectives responded to the education challenges Guinea was facing, it supported government policy as reflected in education planning at the time, and in a subsequent ten-year education policy introduced in 2019. It was also relevant to the Bank’s country strategy.

The project was introduced into a low-performing education system further weakened by an Ebola crisis that broke out in 2014 and that severely affected school attendance. Systemic weaknesses contributing to low performance – coverage, relevance efficiency, quality – were recognized in the government’s education



sector plan for 2015-2017, on which this project partly drew. The Ebola crisis required an immediate response to deal with the additional educational demands imposed by the crisis, notably addressing the loss in attendance of some two million children, and requirements for a healthy and clean school environment. Aligned with the needs of the government, the project objectives were in line with the Bank's goals to end extreme poverty and boost shared prosperity; and the Country Partnership Strategy for FY2014 to FY2017 which included human resource development as one of its main pillars. These goals remain relevant in the new Country Partnership Framework (CPF) for FY2018 to 2023.

Rating

High

4. Achievement of Objectives (Efficacy)

OBJECTIVE 1

Objective

Improve access to basic education among under-served populations

Rationale

This objective was to be achieved by classroom construction and raised community awareness, as reflected in increases in school enrollments and improved latrines and water points in new primary and lower secondary schools

Outputs

Classroom construction met set targets: 402 new primary classrooms and 180 new lower secondary classrooms were constructed and equipped, and each one staffed with a teacher. 69 percent of primary and 60 percent of lower secondary classrooms were constructed in rural, more underserved areas.

Conditions of water points and latrines improved with targets partly achieved: 565 stand-alone water points and 233 latrines were constructed, in the former case exceeding the original target of 466, and in the latter case falling short of the original target of 284 latrines.



To increase the demand for schooling, awareness campaigns estimated to have reached some 12,000 people were conducted in more underserved areas, with a focus on girls.

Outcomes

Enrollment capacity as a result of new classrooms at the primary level increased to 17,330, exceeding the target of 17,150. The gross enrollment rate at the primary level increased from a baseline of 83.7 percent in 2015 to 91 percent, slightly above the target of 90.6 percent.

Enrollment capacity as a result of new lower secondary schools met the target of 11,520. The ICR does not report on changes in enrollment rates at this level.

Summary: Outcomes indicate improvements in access to education and a more sanitary environment along the lines envisaged, as well as the effects of better access and awareness on enrollment rates at the primary level.

Rating

Substantial

OBJECTIVE 2

Objective

Improve literacy among under-served populations

Rationale

This objective was to be achieved by upgrading and reactivating non-formal education centers (NAFA centers) and through functional literacy campaigns.

Outputs

226 NAFA centers were renewed, exceeding the target of 121 centers, with renewal including renovation and equipping of centers, as well as training of teachers and deploying them once trained.



A literacy campaign, conducted by non-governmental organizations, included developing a procedural manual, and opening 1,992 literacy centers and 583 centers for post-literacy support.

Outcomes

As a result of the renewal effort, participation in the NAFA centers increased from a baseline of zero to 13,000 by end-project. Enrollment in the literacy campaign rose from a baseline of zero to 97,000 (70 percent women). Approximately 22 percent of the latter also participated in the post-literacy program.

Summary: While participation in literacy and post-literacy programs was considerable and might be an indication of the success of the programs, there nevertheless is no information on outcomes as expressed in the objective, i.e. actual achievement in terms of enhanced literacy among beneficiaries.

Rating
Modest

OBJECTIVE 3

Objective

Improve learning in basic education among under-served populations

Rationale

This objective was to be achieved by improving the quality of the teaching and the learning environment in primary and lower secondary education.

Outputs

The number of teaching and learning materials produced and distributed at pre-school, and at primary and lower secondary levels, reached 9 million in 2019, far exceeding the end target of 3.5 million.



The number of teachers at the primary and lower secondary levels trained (primarily in French, mathematics, and pedagogy) reached 17,430, exceeding the overall target of 10,100. The training successfully experimented with part-time teacher training colleges and part-time on-the-job training, which has been maintained as a favored teacher training model.

Decentralization grants were distributed to a total of 7,700 schools and local education authorities to promote active engagement in school development by schools and communities. An assessment looked at 7,000 schools within the communities that received grants, indicating that 61 percent performed well on specific criteria of access, quality and management.

School and teacher inspectors were reintroduced within the general education inspection as pedagogic supervisors. Over the project period, some 14,500 school-level inspections were undertaken, involving classroom observations and feedback to teachers.

Outcomes

Based on early grade reading assessments undertaken over the 2016-2019 period, outcomes varied over time from a baseline of 6.64 words per minute in 2014 to 42.7 words per minute in 2017 (far exceeding the end target of 22 words per minute), and then dropping to 16.1 words per minute for 2019. According to the ICR (p. 19), the decline in 2019 may have been largely due to an extended teacher strike.

Rating

Substantial

OBJECTIVE 4

Objective

Strengthen MEN-A's capacity in evidence-based management

Rationale

This objective was to be achieved by capacity building; provision of equipment for planning, data collection, and analysis; and development of the education management information system (MIS) and standardized student learning assessment data.



Outputs

Tools for statistical analysis of education MIS data were designed and disseminated to be used by central and decentralized levels of government; and associated capacity building was provided to planners, managers, and other relevant personnel.

New human resource (HR) management processes and computerized management tools were introduced, aimed at improving the efficiency of HR processes and computerized management.

Renewed school mapping was achieved, including the mapping of schools and the educational environment (water points, health centers, markets, etc.), building on existing data bases.

Databases of the main public education agencies were harmonized and linked, with all schools being coded and teachers being coded and linked to their respective schools. On the other hand, teacher databases for MEN-A, the Civil Service Ministry, and the Ministry of Finance have not yet been harmonized.

Outcomes

As a result of the above outputs, five analytical reports were produced, on the following subjects:

- the process for facilitating transition from primary to lower secondary education, technical/vocational programs, and the job market – actions that require teacher, materials and adjustments to curricula; recommendations have been included in the government's new 10-year sector plan for 2019-2028;
- a strategy to boost private schools, including a draft law on private schools and the re-establishment of a department responsible for private schools; the draft law is currently pending in the national assembly, as are decisions on the staffing of the new department;
- the development of the national education system, underpinning the design of the new education sector plan;
- preschool development, informing the design of a new Bank project; and
- a holistic policy on the teaching profession, including areas such as deployment and professional development. Here, the next steps are to develop an implementation plan, being supported by UNESCO.



Staff affectation (the share of staff deployed according to standard procedures) was increased from a baseline of 91 percent to 95 percent, equal to the target.

Summary: In most cases, the analytical reports have been followed up on, moving MEN-A towards the application of evidence-based policy making in education. The main exception is in the area of private school legislation.

Rating

Substantial

OBJECTIVE 5

Objective

Support the implementation of the education sector's short-term Ebola strategic response plan

Rationale

This objective was to be achieved by the construction of latrines and water points to improve sanitation (short- and long-term response), and by the distribution of handwashing kits (short-term response).

As indicated under Objective 1, 233 latrines and 565 water points were constructed. Handwashing consisted of soap, mild chlorine solutions, 4,700 50-litre water faucets, 3.2 million 220-litre water drums, and 66,400 litres of disinfectants for schools.

Summary: The intervention addressed a direct need that responded to the crisis situation at the school level, through sanitary interventions, as well as by supporting access through the project's learning and literacy programs.

Rating

Substantial

OVERALL EFFICACY

Rationale

Efficacy was rated **substantial** for the first objective based on improved access to schools and better sanitation in schools, and **modest** for the second objective in the absence of sufficient evidence of improved



literacy. For the three other objectives, efficacy was assessed to be **substantial** with only moderate shortcomings. Overall efficacy is therefore rated **substantial**.

Overall Efficacy Rating

Substantial

5. Efficiency

Economic analysis covering all components was performed at appraisal and for the ICR. Both analyses use the same assumptions, albeit in the case of the ICR the analysis was updated with the latest data. The assumptions are judged reasonable: a working life of 40 years, wages adjusted for different levels of education, the effects of unemployment, etc. At appraisal, the project was expected to yield an Internal Rate of Return (IERR) of 27 percent. The ICR calculated that the project yielded an overall IERR of 28 percent (21 percent for access and 29 percent for quality).

Other factors also suggested substantial implementation efficiency. The cost of activities was mostly kept under budget, and a substantial decrease in unit costs of construction/rehabilitation of latrines and water points in primary schools partly balanced out cost overruns in classroom construction and equipping, and in costs related to better quality in the teaching and learning environment. Efficiency was dampened by capacity constraints in the coordinating team due to limited procurement experience and (in some cases) contract re-bidding; by a change in leadership as a new minister and secretary general for MEN-A were appointed; and by teacher strikes in 2018 that impacted primary and lower secondary schools as well as NAFA centers.

Efficiency Rating

Substantial

a. If available, enter the Economic Rate of Return (ERR) and/or Financial Rate of Return (FRR) at appraisal and the re-estimated value at evaluation:

| | Rate Available? | Point value (%) | *Coverage/Scope (%) |
|--------------|-----------------|-----------------|--|
| Appraisal | | 0 | 0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable |
| ICR Estimate | | 0 | 0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable |

* Refers to percent of total project cost for which ERR/FRR was calculated.



6. Outcome

Relevance of objectives was rated **high**, as the objectives aligned with government priorities and World Bank strategy at project preparation and closing. Achievement of the literacy objective was rated **modest** due to lack of data on literacy outcomes, and **substantial** for the four other objectives based on achievement of recorded outputs and outcomes. Efficiency was rated **substantial**. These ratings are indicative of only minor overall shortcomings, and therefore Outcome is rated Satisfactory.

a. Outcome Rating

Satisfactory

7. Risk to Development Outcome

While the project was brought to satisfactory closure as indicated by the Outcome rating, risks to the development outcome still appear substantial. The government was fully behind the project and is committed to continuing education reform as indicated by its new ten-year plan. Likewise, institutional arrangements are in place to further support the results of the project, as indicated by the numerous analytical reports that in most instances are being used to move primary and lower secondary reform forward.

Risk is to be found in the political arena. Guinea has experienced long periods of instability and weak governance, although elections and democratic institutions (an elected president and an elected assembly) have brought a sense of stability. Still, the ICR (pp. 2 and 34) points to a fragile environment where weak governance undermines the legitimacy of the state, and rapid urbanization is creating social unrest.

8. Assessment of Bank Performance

a. Quality-at-Entry

The project was strategically relevant in addressing weaknesses in the education system and in responding to the educational impact of the Ebola crisis. It was aligned with the government's interim and long-term education plans, and with the international community's strategy for addressing the Ebola crisis. In general terms, it included the Bank's twin goals of poverty alleviation and boosting shared prosperity, and CPF objectives for human resource development. Project design drew on the experience under earlier, Education for All Fasttrack projects in Guinea (P111470, P050046, T097485). These projects began the process of expanding access to and quality of education with interventions that then were incorporated into the design of the current project. The results framework was straightforward, though in some instances it could have been more rigorous in defining outcomes from increased access to services. Financial arrangements – the pooling of donor funds under Bank supervision – turned out to work well, although the agreed-on project period of three years would turn out to be too short and



resulted in an extension of the closing date. The risk assessment – substantial – was balanced considering the potential political volatility that continued to influence implementation.

Quality-at-Entry Rating
Satisfactory

b. Quality of supervision

Semi-annual joint review missions focusing on the project were undertaken jointly with the donors, complemented by annual reviews of progress on the government's overall education plan. Collaboration with government counterparts, drawing on in-country Bank staff, was close and facilitated resolution of field-level implementation issues. Particular attention was paid to financial management, procurement, and safeguards, including efforts to develop MEN-A capacity in those areas.

Quality of Supervision Rating
Satisfactory

Overall Bank Performance Rating
Satisfactory

9. M&E Design, Implementation, & Utilization

a. M&E Design

The PDO was clearly defined, and the results framework captured relevant outputs: implementation results, and selectively, results that measured program performance (changes in capacity, uptake and institutional development). Monitoring drew on regular MEN-A capacity, as routine monitoring using the education MIS was able to provide the data necessary to support the project. There was not, however, an outcome indicator to measure achievement of the objective to improve literacy among under-served populations.

b. M&E Implementation

Outcome and output indicators were tracked regularly and included adjustments to targets during the restructurings. For instance, the output targets for latrines and waterpoints were adjusted downwards and savings shifted towards increasing the number of handwashing kits and other hygienic items that were more likely to reduce the spread of Ebola; and the focus on "additional enrollment" shifted to "enrollment capacity," an indicator that was more under the control of the project. A number of studies were undertaken on areas key to further reform, and information flows between agencies in the education system were strengthened.



c. M&E Utilization

Data was used to inform on project progress and map the teacher database, including to determine retirement and recruitment needs. Data was also used to monitor the results of efforts at learning improvement, and to inform communities and parents of results.

M&E Quality Rating

Substantial

10. Other Issues

a. Safeguards

The project was rated as Category B (partial assessment), and OP/BP 4.01 “Environment Assessment” was triggered due to the construction of classrooms, water points, and latrines. An Environmental Social Management Framework and a Resettlement Policy Framework were prepared. As the project was processed under paragraph 12 of OP 10.00, the deadline for disclosure of social and environmental safeguards instruments was deferred to six months after project effectiveness. Safeguards were monitored consistently during project implementation and were consistently rated moderately satisfactory and satisfactory in Implementation Status and Results Reports (ISRs) (ICR, p. 32). The project construction sites were screened by the project safeguards specialist prior to the launch of construction. In 2019, the project also developed and finalized a grievance redress mechanism, distributed to the public, and training was provided to communities/beneficiaries on the tool.

b. Fiduciary Compliance

Financial management (FM). **The** FM performance rating remained satisfactory and moderately satisfactory throughout the life of the project. During the project period, there was a strong financial management team in place, and the Project Coordination Unit submitted unaudited interim financial reports of an acceptable quality on a regular basis. The auditors’ opinions were unqualified (clean). At the time of the ICR, the final audit report was in the process of being submitted (ICR, p. 32). The government’s integrated financial management information system was used for the project, and it is the standard system used in West African Francophone countries.

Procurement. Procurement was consistently rated satisfactory in the project ISRs. During the project, World Bank procurement staff provided training to the implementing units to ensure compliance with procurement guidelines. Procurement plans were updated during Bank supervision missions to accommodate adjustments in construction delays. There were also prior and post reviews of contracts. There were non-performing contracts related to the construction of classrooms that were canceled and re-bid in accordance with Bank procurement guidelines.



c. Unintended impacts (Positive or Negative)

None noted in the ICR.

d. Other

None noted.

11. Ratings

| Ratings | ICR | IEG | Reason for Disagreements/Comment |
|------------------|--------------|--------------|----------------------------------|
| Outcome | Satisfactory | Satisfactory | |
| Bank Performance | Satisfactory | Satisfactory | |
| Quality of M&E | Substantial | Substantial | |
| Quality of ICR | --- | Substantial | |

12. Lessons

The ICR (pp. 34-36) included several insightful lessons, including:

Awareness raising and capacity building of local communities, including school management committee members, can be key features in promoting inclusive and responsive institutions for service delivery. The introduction of awareness campaigns as well as basic management training gave communities a stronger voice in monitoring and supporting school activities.

Good institutional capacity can be key to smooth implementation, results, and sustainability of interventions. Improved project capacity was key to sustainable project interventions. However, going forward will require additional support to build on the project's achievements, inter alia, decentralized management and strong systems for planning, monitoring and evaluation.

Pooled funds and a multi-sectoral approach provide a workable platform to tackle a crisis like Ebola. Under the project, members of the donor community combined their education sector resources in a pooled fund to support national efforts to get children back into school after the crisis. The pooled fund ensured donor cooperation and a more rapid achievement of project goals than



might otherwise have been the case, in particular in providing coordinated and timely support for hygiene improvements in schools in the short term (hand-washing) and the longer term (latrines and water points).

13. Assessment Recommended?

No

14. Comments on Quality of ICR

While the ICR was long at 36 pages, it provided a thorough discussion of the choices made under the project. A somewhat more structured, selective and less narrative discussion of efficacy – while informative in its current form – would have facilitated the analysis, especially with regard to the strengthening of MEN-A where the presentation left the reader unsure about the actual results. Still, the ICR provided the necessary evidence to allow the project to be thoroughly assessed.

a. Quality of ICR Rating Substantial