Kyrgyz Health Results Based Financing (P120435)

EUROPE AND CENTRAL ASIA | Kyrgyz Republic | Health, Nutrition & Population Global Practice |
Recipient Executed Activities | Investment Project Financing | FY 2013 | Seq No: 13 | ARCHIVED on 29-May-2019 | ISR37110 |

Implementing Agencies: Mandatory Health Insurance Fund, Ministry of Health, KYRGYZ REPUBLIC

Key Dates

Key Project Dates

- Bank Approval Date: 18-Apr-2013
- Effectiveness Date: 29-Jul-2014
- Planned Mid Term Review Date: 26-Sep-2016
- Actual Mid-Term Review Date: 26-Sep-2016
- Original Closing Date: 30-Jun-2017
- Revised Closing Date: 31-May-2019

Project Development Objectives

Project Development Objective (from Project Appraisal Document)

The Project Development Objective is to (1) pilot performance-based payments and/or enhanced supervision for quality of maternal and neonatal care in randomly selected rayon hospitals; and (2) strengthen the Government’s and providers' capacity in performance-based contracting and monitoring and evaluating for results.

Has the Project Development Objective been changed since Board Approval of the Project Objective?

No

Components

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Component 1: Pilot Performance-Based Payments and Enhanced Supervision for Quality of Care:(Cost $9.59 M)</th>
<th>Component 2: Strengthen the Government's and Providers' Capacity in Performance-Based Payment Reform and Monitoring and Evaluation for Results:(Cost $1.41 M)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Overall Ratings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Previous Rating</th>
<th>Current Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Progress towards achievement of PDO</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Implementation Progress (IP)</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Risk Rating</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Implementation Status and Key Decisions

The Project, in the amount of USD$ 11 million, funded by the Health Results Innovation Trust Fund's grant, was declared effective on July 29, 2014. The extended closing date is May 31, 2019. The project is on track and will achieve its Project Development Objectives (PDO) by the closing date. Over the period of 5 years, the project has contributed to substantial achievements in rayon hospitals performance, changing providers' behavior, and introducing a team work. It succeeded in achieving its development objectives of piloting performance-based payments and/or enhanced supervision for quality of care and strengthening the Government and providers' capacity in performance based contracting and monitoring and evaluation. The project's results are confirmed by achievements of the set targets for the PDO and intermediate results.
indicators. Results of the Impact Evaluation confirmed improvements along three dimensions of quality of care (structural quality, process quality and outcomes) and showed significant and positive effects of intervention on the newborn’s Apgar score and mother’s blood loss, as well as blood supply, drug availability and quality, and provider’s motivation. The “positive incentives” scheme based on a results-based financing quality score has been institutionalized across all hospital and PHC level facilities (except national facilities) using public funds since July 2018 with the Mandatory Health Insurance Fund taking a leadership in conducting regular verifications with support of the project.

Risks

Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risk Category</th>
<th>Rating at Approval</th>
<th>Previous Rating</th>
<th>Current Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Political and Governance</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● High</td>
<td>● High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macroeconomic</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● Substantial</td>
<td>● Substantial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector Strategies and Policies</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● Substantial</td>
<td>● Substantial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Design of Project or Program</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
<td>● Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● High</td>
<td>● High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiduciary</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● Substantial</td>
<td>● Substantial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment and Social</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● Low</td>
<td>● Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stakeholders</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● Substantial</td>
<td>● Substantial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● Low</td>
<td>● Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>● High</td>
<td>● High</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results

PDO Indicators by Objectives / Outcomes

pilot performance-based payments and/or enhanced supervision for quality of maternal/neonatal care

►Proportion of eligible rayon hospitals that received the authorized performance-based payments within two weeks after the MHIF’s receipt of RBF payment to their bank account (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Comments: Achieved.

►Proportion of quarterly peer verification records for Groups 1 and 2 rayon hospitals submitted to MHIF within 30 working days after the end of each quarter (Percentage, Custom)
Intermediate Results Indicators by Components

Component 1: Pilot Performance-Based Payments and Enhanced Supervision for Quality of Care

| Performance Contracts signed with the Group 1 rayon hospitals (20) and updated annually based on any modifications introduced to the Balanced Scorecard (Number, Custom) |
|---|---|---|---|
| Baseline | Actual (Previous) | Actual (Current) | End Target |
| | | | |

Comments: Achieved. The 7th round of counter-verifications was completed on Sept 16-21, 2018 in 8 hospitals.

Comments: Target is met as two rounds of Impact Evaluation surveys (quantitative and qualitative studies) were completed.

Comments: Overachieved.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>30-Nov-2014</td>
<td>Overachieved. Contracts with participating providers are signed on annual basis. Performance contracts with all 22 hospitals (Group 1) were signed in December 2018 for the year 2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.00</td>
<td>25-Oct-2018</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.00</td>
<td>20-May-2019</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.00</td>
<td>31-May-2019</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proportion of Group 1 rayon hospitals (20) that received quarterly performance-based payments in accordance to their level of performance as per agreed Performance Contracts (Percentage, Custom)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baseline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Average % score Balance Score Card (BSC) indicator 1.7 Red Blood Cell Availability (Group 1 hospitals) (Percentage, Custom)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baseline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Average % score for Category 6 Maternity Department (Group 1 hospitals) (Percentage, Custom)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baseline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Average % score for Category 7 Pediatric/Neonatal Department (Group 1 hospitals) (Percentage, Custom)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baseline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IN00703574 ▶</th>
<th>Proportion of Group 1 rayon hospitals (20) that received quarterly performance-based payments in accordance to their level of performance as per agreed Performance Contracts (Percentage, Custom)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baseline</td>
<td>Actual (Previous)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>Achieved. All 22 hospitals (Group I) received performance based payments in accordance with their BSC scores</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IN00703576 ▶</td>
<td>Average % score Balance Score Card (BSC) indicator 1.7 Red Blood Cell Availability (Group 1 hospitals) (Percentage, Custom)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baseline</td>
<td>Actual (Previous)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>19.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>Mostly achieved. There has been a significant increase from the baseline of 19% in August 2014 to 73% in 2018. There is no room for further improvement because small size hospitals refer high risk pregnancies to higher level hospitals and thus don’t need have blood cell at the hospital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IN00703578 ▶</td>
<td>Average % score for Category 6 Maternity Department (Group 1 hospitals) (Percentage, Custom)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baseline</td>
<td>Actual (Previous)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>5.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>Mostly achieved as there has been a significant increase from the baseline 5% till 79.9% as of today. The target of 85% was set too ambitious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IN00703579 ▶</td>
<td>Average % score for Category 7 Pediatric/Neonatal Department (Group 1 hospitals) (Percentage, Custom)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baseline</td>
<td>Actual (Previous)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>21.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>Overachieved</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Component 2: Strengthen the Government's and Providers' Capacity in Performance-Based Payment Reform and Monitoring and Evaluation for Results

► National RBF Steering Committee meets at least twice a year (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>2.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>Achieved</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

► Extended RBF team meets at least every 4 months (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>Achieved</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

► MOH/MHIF produce quarterly monitoring reports within 3 weeks after the end of each quarter (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comments</td>
<td>Achieved</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data on Financial Performance

Disbursements (by loan)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan/Credit/TF</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Currency</th>
<th>Original</th>
<th>Revised</th>
<th>Cancelled</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
<th>Undisbursed</th>
<th>% Disbursed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P120435</td>
<td>TF-13310</td>
<td>Effective</td>
<td>USD</td>
<td>11.00</td>
<td>11.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>10.64</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>97%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key Dates (by loan)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan/Credit/TF</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Approval Date</th>
<th>Signing Date</th>
<th>Effectiveness Date</th>
<th>Orig. Closing Date</th>
<th>Rev. Closing Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Cumulative Disbursements
Restructuring History

Level 2 Approved on 21-Jun-2017, Level 2 Approved on 17-Dec-2018

Related Project(s)

There are no related projects.