Ho Chi Minh City Green Transport Development (P126507)

**Key Dates**

**Key Project Dates**

- Bank Approval Date: 29-May-2015
- Effectiveness Date: 09-Oct-2015
- Planned Mid Term Review Date: 18-Nov-2019
- Actual Mid-Term Review Date: 
- Original Closing Date: 31-Dec-2020
- Revised Closing Date: 31-Dec-2020

**Project Development Objectives**

Project Development Objective (from Project Appraisal Document)

The project development objective is to improve the performance and efficiency of public transport along a high priority corridor in Ho Chi Minh City.

Has the Project Development Objective been changed since Board Approval of the Project Objective?

No

**Components**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bus Rapid Transit Corridor Development</td>
<td>$122.80 M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional Strengthening</td>
<td>$5.00 M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contingency</td>
<td>$9.65 M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Overall Ratings**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Previous Rating</th>
<th>Current Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Progress towards achievement of PDO</td>
<td>Moderately Unsatisfactory</td>
<td>Moderately Unsatisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Implementation Progress (IP)</td>
<td>Unsatisfactory</td>
<td>Moderately Unsatisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Risk Rating</td>
<td>Substantial</td>
<td>Substantial</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Implementation Status and Key Decisions**

The World Bank mission during October 2019 noted good progress made since the previous mission in June 2019. All of the agreed actions that were due by October have been completed and steady progress has been made towards meeting the remaining milestones that are due over the next few months. The mission noted the strong commitment and improved cooperation for project implementation, under the leadership of TCIP, the Project Owner, and through active participation in the project’s Special Working Group (SWG) members. Nevertheless, there has been delay in implementing the critical technical activities, especially the revision of the Feasibility Study and basic design and preparation of the Detailed Design and bidding documents, which has resulted in revising the target dates of completing the remaining actions. HCMC PC, TCIP and all relevant departments are requested to closely coordinate to meet the updated milestones, so that major procurement activities can start and significant disbursement can be made as soon as possible, starting in 2020.
Risks

Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risk Category</th>
<th>Rating at Approval</th>
<th>Previous Rating</th>
<th>Current Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Political and Governance</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macroeconomic</td>
<td> Moderate</td>
<td> Moderate</td>
<td> Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector Strategies and Policies</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Design of Project or Program</td>
<td> Moderate</td>
<td> Moderate</td>
<td> Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiduciary</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment and Social</td>
<td> Moderate</td>
<td> Moderate</td>
<td> Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stakeholders</td>
<td> Moderate</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
<td> Substantial</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results

PDO Indicators by Objectives / Outcomes

To improve the performance of public transport along a high priority corridor in Ho Chi Minh City

► Number of passengers per day using the BRT system (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Value</strong></td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>28,300.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Date</strong></td>
<td>01-Jan-2019</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>31-Dec-2020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

► People satisfied with the service provided by Public Transport (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Value</strong></td>
<td>33.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>50.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Date</strong></td>
<td>01-Jan-2019</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>31-Dec-2020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

► Women satisfied with the service provided by Public Transport (Sub-Indicator) (Percentage, Custom Breakdown)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>0.00</th>
<th>0.00</th>
<th>60.00</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Jan-2019</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Low income riders satisfied with the service provided by Public Transport (Sub-Indicator) (Percentage, Custom Breakdown)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>25.00</th>
<th>0.00</th>
<th>50.00</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Jan-2019</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To improve the efficiency of public transport along a high priority corridor in Ho Chi Minh City

Travel time by public transport along the project corridor, measured as in-vehicle time from An Lac to Ky Con (14.1 km) (Minutes, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>60.00</th>
<th>60.00</th>
<th>60.00</th>
<th>37.00</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Jan-2019</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>31-Dec-2020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Number of workers and students accessing Thu Thiem Development within 45 minutes (Number, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>1,122,000.00</th>
<th>1,122,000.00</th>
<th>1,290,000.00</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Jan-2019</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Number of residents accessing Thu Thiem Development within 45 minutes. (Sub-Indicator) (Number, Custom Supplement)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>1,050,000.00</th>
<th>1,050,000.00</th>
<th>1,208,000.00</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Jan-2019</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Difference in GHG emissions compared to BAU case (Tones/year, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>0.00</th>
<th>0.00</th>
<th>-23,000.00</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Jan-2019</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Intermediate Results Indicators by Components

Bus Rapid Transit Corridor Development

Percentage of physical work completed as part of the civil works for the BRT transitway (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

11/18/2019
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage of physical work completed as part of the civil works for BRT stations (Percentage, Custom)</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Mar-2016</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>30-Jun-2019</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage of physical work completed as part of the civil works for constructing the Terminal at Rach Chiec (Percentage, Custom)</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Mar-2016</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>30-Jun-2019</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage of physical work completed as part of the civil works for constructing the Thu Thiem technical facility (Percentage, Custom)</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Mar-2016</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>31-Dec-2020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of buses acquired for the BRT system (Number, Custom)</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>28.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Mar-2016</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>15-Feb-2019</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage of intersections with improved traffic and safety control (Percentage, Custom)</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Mar-2016</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>31-Dec-2020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage of sidewalk improvements completed along the BRT route (Percentage, Custom)</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Mar-2016</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>31-Dec-2020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage of improvements to station access within a 400-meter radius completed (Percentage, Custom)</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Percentage of planned greening and landscaping activities along the corridor completed (Percentage, Custom)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Mar-2016</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>31-Dec-2020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Institutional Strengthening

**Percentage of training courses delivered to the HCMC PC and its agencies (Percentage, Custom)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Sep-2015</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>31-Dec-2020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Number of studies completed under Component 2 of the project (Number, Custom)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Actual (Previous)</th>
<th>Actual (Current)</th>
<th>End Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>3.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>01-Sep-2015</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>18-Dec-2018</td>
<td>31-Dec-2020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Data on Financial Performance

#### Disbursements (by loan)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan/Credit/TF</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Currency</th>
<th>Original</th>
<th>Revised</th>
<th>Cancelled</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
<th>Undisbursed</th>
<th>% Disbursed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P126507</td>
<td>IDA-56540</td>
<td>Effective</td>
<td>USD</td>
<td>124.00</td>
<td>124.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.51</td>
<td>120.35</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Key Dates (by loan)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Loan/Credit/TF</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Approval Date</th>
<th>Signing Date</th>
<th>Effectiveness Date</th>
<th>Orig. Closing Date</th>
<th>Rev. Closing Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

#### Cumulative Disbursements
Restructuring History

There has been no restructuring to date.

Related Project(s)

P172691-Ho Chi Minh Green Transport Development Project, P172731-Ho Chi Minh Green Transport Development Project