

1. CAS Data	
Country: Republic of Moldova	
CAS Year: FY 2005	CAS Period: FY2005 - FY2008
CASCR Review Period: FY2005 - FY2008	Date of this review: January 22, 2009

### 2. Executive Summary

- i. The Bank's Moldova program was evaluated in a Country Assistance Evaluation (FY2005), which was one of several inputs into the preparation of the FY2005 CAS. That CAS was launched at a time of considerable uncertainty. The government was highly skeptical of economic reform and Bank experience under the 1999 CAS/2002 CASPR programs was disappointing.
- ii. The FY2005 CAS was developed to support the Republic of Moldova's development program. The program it outlined focused on the growth and poverty reduction objectives of the Moldovan program via a three-pillar program (Promote Conditions for Sustaining Growth and Employment Creation, Improving Access to Social Capital and Services, and Community Infrastructure, and Improving Public Sector Governance and Combating Corruption). It envisaged base case lending levels (\$20-\$25 million annually) similar to those actually delivered since the 1999 CAS, complemented by an active program of AAA linked primarily to the policy dialogue, with the possibility of a high case including policy-based lending should the policy dialogue result in progress on a specified reform agenda.
- iii. The CAS was, in substance, highly relevant to Moldova's development problems. It was also realistic in its appraisal of implementation risks based on the Bank's previous operational experience in Moldova.
- iv. A particularly noteworthy feature contributing to CAS relevance and realism was the incorporation of a results framework, notwithstanding the fact that this was not required by Bank operational policies.
- v. CAS implementation was roughly as planned during FY05-06, and progress made on policy issues met triggers for moving to the high case Program over the balance of the CAS period. All available data indicate that the quality of Bank services was satisfactory.
- vi. Over the full CAS period, Moldova achieved or made progress toward a number of the development objectives supported by the Bank's strategy, and progress was made on targeted outcomes of Bank assistance, with many achieved or substantially so. Nonetheless, progress was less than anticipated in some important areas under each pillar of the strategy. IEG rates the overall outcome of Bank assistance to Moldova during the FY 2005-08 period as *Moderately Satisfactory*.
- vii. Bank performance in developing and executing the CAS was strong in all dimensions. Bank performance during this period is rated by IEG as *Satisfactory*.
- viii. The CASCR is clear, concise, complete in its coverage and candid. It does an excellent job in discussing the implementation of the CAS program, achievement of country and CAS level objectives, and draws sensible lessons from the implementation experience. To the six lessons drawn in the CASCR, with which IEG concurs, IEG would add a seventh the importance (well illustrated by the Bank's experience in Moldova) of grounding country strategies in a realistic appraisal of the political environment for CAS implementation. Such an appraisal is likely to inform beneficially strategic selectivity with regard to which areas to target for support (a CASCR lesson) as well strategies for managing CAS implementation risks to maximize the prospects for successful CAS outcomes.

CASCR Reviewed by:	Peer Reviewed by:	CASCR Review Coordinator
Robert J. Anderson	Konstantin Atanesyan	Jaime Jaramillo-Vallejo
Consultant, IEGCR	Senior Evaluation Officer, IEGCR	Lead Economist, IEGCR



### 3. CASCR Summary

### Overview of CAS Relevance:

- 1. <u>Context of the CAS</u>. The 2005 CAS was launched at a time of considerable uncertainty about the government's capacity in the complex internal political and external relationships environments in which it operates and commitment to implement the program outlined in its PRSP. The government was highly skeptical of economic reform and had, indeed, come to power in 2001 on a platform that promised and delivered rollback of many earlier reforms. The strong recovery in the region in the aftermath of the Russian crisis reinforced widely-held views that earlier reforms had exacerbated poverty and that reversing them reduces poverty. The government's 2001 election platform was inconsistent in a number of respects with the PRSP it produced to qualify for Bank/Fund poverty funding. Bank experience under the 1999 CAS/2002 CASPR programs, which envisaged policy-based lending in the base case program, was disappointing. Only about half of planned base case lending was delivered (lending averaged about \$25 million annually over the period FY00-04 and the sole policy-based operation of this period, the three-tranche SAC III was cancelled after disbursement of only one tranche).
- 2. <u>Summary of the CAS</u>. The FY2005 CAS was developed to support the Republic of Moldova's development program, as outlined in its 2004 Economic Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy. The program it outlined, which placed growth and poverty reduction in a somewhat broader national development context, was intended to promote sustainable socially-oriented development, the reintegration of the country, and European integration. The Bank's supporting program (the details of which i.e., the specific development objectives supported, the targeted CAS outcomes, and the supporting Bank instruments are laid out in Annex 9 to this Review) focused on the growth and poverty reduction objectives of the Moldovan program via a three-pillar program of support, similar to the structure of the 1999 CAS. The first pillar sought to promote conditions for sustaining growth and employment creation through reducing the cost of doing business and promote the expansion of the private sector and job creation, with special emphasis on small and medium enterprises (SMEs).
- 3. The second pillar sought to improve access to social services, capital and community infrastructure, while minimizing environmental risks. Key attention was given to targeting of social assistance to improve access to quality health, education and social protection, to addressing the deterioration of critical infrastructure, such as housing, and to dealing with ground water pollution.
- 4. The third pillar aimed at improving public sector governance and combating corruption by improving transparency and accountability in public financial management, expenditure programming, and evaluation practices.
- 5. For each objective, the CAS identified specific outcomes targeted to be achieved by Bank assistance and intermediate progress indicators. The results matrix in the CAS also included indicators that were completely unrelated to the objectives of the Bank's strategy or to the instruments of Bank intervention. The relevant outcomes are detailed in Annex 9 and indicated in the discussion below on the Overview of Achievement by Objective.
- 6. To implement this program, the CAS envisaged a base case lending program of \$90 million of investment lending over 4 years, and a substantial program of AAA. It also specified a high case of \$137 million, with potential policy-based lending and additional lending.
- 7. Relevance of the CAS. The CAS was, in substance, highly relevant. It was well-linked to the parts of the government's program appropriate for Bank involvement. It was based on knowledge accumulated through previous operational experience (i.e., a number of operations e.g., in water and sanitation, rural development, land market development built on previous operations) and an extensive analytical foundation and thorough diagnosis of the constraints to growth and poverty reduction that fed an active policy dialogue and progress in some key policy areas, culminating in the resumption of policy-based lending. The specific individual development objectives and CAS outcomes chosen were for the most part realistically attainable in principle, although some were poorly formulated (e.g., in education, no instruments were in place during the CAS period to monitor outcome indicators; in health, some specific targeted Bank assistance outcomes for



instance – maternal and child mortality – are virtually indistinguishable from country development objectives). Many were an extension of Bank assistance outcomes that had been pursued since the 1999 CAS, and perhaps earlier.

- Two features of the 2005 CAS further contributed to its relevance and realism. First, the base case was designed to be deliverable with a high degree of certainty by delinking it insofar as possible from policy and institutional development plans or possibilities that might or might not materialize. This contrasted sharply with the 1999 CAS. The base case lending levels proposed in the 2005 CAS were reasonable in light of previous experience. The flexibility to respond should possibilities materialize was provided through a carefully and clearly specified set of high case triggers. Second, although not required by operational policies at the time, the CAS was grounded in an explicit framework linking Bank product outputs, with CAS outcomes and the higher level country objectives supported by the Bank program. This framework provided both a rationale for specific Bank program design and for appraising most results, despite the inclusion of unrelated outcome indicators. As noted above, the framework was better (tighter, more logical, linkages between Bank products, broader targeted outcomes and development objectives) in some areas (e.g., cost of business reduction) than others (e.g., education), but all in all good for a CAS of its vintage. The CAS was however unrealistic in two dimensions – its breadth, and its reliance on legacy projects to deliver outcomes that were not envisaged in their designs. The number of targeted outcomes was very large and the scope of the agenda covered was very broad in relation to the number of instruments and size of the program the Bank planned. This was probably a carryover from previous CAS periods, when the Bank's planned program was considerably larger. The FY96-98 base case program (when Moldova was eligible for IBRD) was US\$290 million, of which \$208 million was actually committed.
- 9. The CASPR of 2006 took stock of developments, and sought to speed up slow progress areas, incorporate interventions to address unforeseen developments, and to incorporate the outcome of the dialogue with the government and the analytical work. It also highlighted the need to align more closely Moldova's institutions and structures to European norms and structures, while stressing the focus on donor coordination and harmonization.
- 10. Overall, the CAS merits high marks for substantive relevance grounded (albeit with some wishful thinking concerning the impacts of some legacy projects) in a results framework, for realism with regard to risk and overall program size and, with some delay, for selectivity to align objectives in number and scope with available program resources and government implementation capacity.

### Overview of CAS Implementation:

- 11. The FY05 and FY06 lending and AAA programs outlined in the 2005 CAS were largely delivered. Lending during the first two years of the CAS period totaled \$54.3 million against a planned base case program of \$40.0 million, with the difference accounted for primarily by a supplemental loan for the Cadastre project and an additional project to address the Avian Flu risk. AAA deliveries were also broadly in line with the CAS plan, and it appears that the Bank was able to engage in some areas not originally envisaged notwithstanding the relatively low share of administrative resources devoted to these Bank product lines noted in the CASCR.
- 12. By the time of the FY2007 CASPR, Moldova had met or substantially met high case triggers and thus moved to higher lending volumes, based in part on policy-based lending. The Bank was not, however, able to deliver the planned level of high case lending volume (\$47 million over two years in addition to planned base case resources of about \$50 million, thus roughly doubling the annual amount of assistance over the last two years of the CAS period), envisaged in the FY2005 CAS due to the fact that the PBA system for allocating IDA resources indicated a somewhat lower level for Moldova. Actual commitments during FY 2007-08 amounted to \$73 million, and supported two PRSCs in conjunction with investment lending volume roughly as envisaged in the 2005 CAS.
- 13. As noted above, it was also recognized at the time of the CASPR that there were some areas in which the Bank had no instruments for objectives and some where government support did not materialize as expected (e.g. youth).



- 14. Quality at entry of lending and analytical work and quality of supervision were satisfactory by Bank standards. Three projects were evaluated by QAG for quality at entry (Energy 2, Competitiveness Enhancement, and Environmental Infrastructure); all were rated as satisfactory. Two projects were evaluated by QAG (Health Investment Fund, and First Cadastre) for supervision quality; the former was rated Moderately Satisfactory, and the latter Satisfactory. Quality of portfolio in implementation was generally satisfactory and better than Bank or regional averages. Moldova has had no projects at risk since FY 2005. Quality at exit was also satisfactory. Outcomes of 100 percent of the 7 projects evaluated were rated by IEG as moderately satisfactory (1 project) or satisfactory against an ECA average of 85.1 percent of projects evaluated and a Bank-wide average of 79.7 percent of projects evaluated. Moldova's ratings on risk to development outcome, institutional development impact, sustainability, and overall Bank performance also exceeded ECA and Bankwide averages. Quality of AAA during the CAS period has not been separately assessed (i.e., no tasks reviewed by QAG). Several quality attributes, however, are present in this work. The program appears to be closely-linked to policy dialogue priorities and to have provided an effective basis for productive dialogue. Individual products (e.g., PER, Health Note, Education Note) are clear in their diagnoses and recommendations, and many are also couched in terms of relevant international experience (e.g., the PER bases its findings with regard to size of the public sector on international comparisons). Several products (e.g., CEM (2005) and Agriculture Policy Notes (2006)) were translated into Romanian (data on translations are not presented in the CASCR so it is not possible to ascertain what percentage of products was translated). Some (again no statistics are presented in the CASCR) are available on the Moldova Country Office website.
- No fiduciary or safeguard issues of note arose during the CAS period.

### Overview of Achievement by Objective:

16. Detailed data concerning achievement of strategic objectives and targeted CAS outcomes are contained in Annex 9.

### Pillar I: Promoting Conditions for Sustaining Growth and Employment Creation

- 17. At broad level, Moldova largely achieved its growth objectives, with an average growth of 5.2 percent in 2004-2007 and a considerable increase in the domestic and foreign investment ratios, albeit with a higher than expected inflation rate. Data on poverty reduction are not presented. At a more micro level, this pillar of the CAS sought to reduce the cost of doing business, improve corporate governance, deepen financial intermediation and improve the maintenance of basic infrastructure. It also aimed at developing the rural economy, where most of the poor are, and remove the internal barriers limiting Moldova's export capacity. Results of Bank assistance at this micro level were for the most part good, but mixed.
- 18. Achievements with regard to the CAS outcomes targeted to improvement of the investment climate area were mixed, and there is no data reported on the new enterprises created. In addition, Moldova's overall ranking among countries in the Cost of Doing Business declined from 90<sup>th</sup> in 2007 to 92<sup>nd</sup> in 2008. However, costs of compliance with business regulations were reduced in line with targeted CAS outcomes and significant improvements were made in customs administration, also in line with outcome targets. Bank support contributed significantly to these outcomes. In the area of business regulation, lending support provided through Private Sector Development II, Competitiveness Enhancement, PRSC I and AAA products such as the CEM, PSD/FSD TA and Cost of Doing Business helped Moldova identify and assess regulation costs and regulation alternatives and take steps to reduce these. It is important to keep in mind, in these regards, the findings of IEG's evaluation of IFC's Cost of Doing Business indicators, which concluded that the overall Doing Business rankings (which are constructed by averaging ten component indicators, and which in turn are often averages of several sub-indicators) are not very reliable. Bank support for strengthening the financial sector through FSAP follow-up appears to have achieved much though not all of its intended outcome. FSD/PSD TA seems to have been a major contributing factor to progress in this area.
- 19. In the area of trade, the Bank's Trade Diagnostic Study and Trade and Transportation Facilitation in South Eastern Europe appear to have been largely responsible for the improvements observed. Outcomes of Bank supported measures to arrest deterioration in productive infrastructure are at an earlier stage. Efforts to strengthen road financing via adoption of road user charges were only beginning at the end of the CAS



period. These developments were supported by the Transport Sector Strategy and Roads Rehabilitation Project. Pilots with regard to improvement of energy availability and efficiency, supported through Energy 2 yielded targeted results in pilot areas but have yet to be validated and scaled up to effect sector-wide general improvements in service in line with targeted CAS outcomes.

- 20. Moldova's agricultural growth lagged substantially behind the rest of the economy, raising concerns about a widening gap between the higher incomes in urban areas and the lower ones in rural areas. The sector growth averaged annually in real terms only 0.65 percent in 2004-07, contrasting markedly with an expected rate of at least 5 percent a year. Indeed, the CASCR mentions that rural poverty increased since 2003, but offers no data. While income and output growth outcomes during this period were affected by unfavorable exogenous trade and weather shocks, poor progress with regard to reforms intended to reduce disincentives to rural growth and development as noted by the CASCR undermined sector potential.
- 21. The CAS had also stated that, if requested by the Government, the Bank would provide technical assistance on public debt. In this regard, Bank AAA, primarily in working through debt scenarios under alternative arrears clearance and debt management scenarios, contributed to a Paris Club agreement and improved debt management.
- 22. At the time of the Progress Report, the strategy added as a target helping Moldova better address its energy policy, with the particular objectives of reducing energy vulnerability and bringing the sector in line with European practices. This target was also achieved as higher tariffs and increased payments discipline, supported by the PRSC program, contributed to reducing the energy intensity of the economy.
- 23. In addition, several steps were taken with Bank support (via the Social Protection Management Project, PRSC I and II, and the Pension Policy Dialogue) to strengthen the finances of the pension system (increasing retirement age, elimination of in kind contributions and pensions, design of a system of individual retirement accounts, elimination of pension arrears and elimination of budget transfers to cover pension payments) and reduce the threat to future macroeconomic stability associated with pension fund operation and policies.
- 24. IEG rates the overall outcome of Bank assistance under this pillar as *Moderately Satisfactory*. While, there was good progress in reducing the cost of doing business, arresting the deterioration of infrastructure and addressing energy policy, progress in broadening financial remediation and in supporting rural development fell short of expectations. The lagging growth of the agricultural sector points to shortcomings of the Bank's support to agriculture. That outcome is a source of concern, given the high concentration of the poor in the rural sector.

### Pillar II: Improving Access to Social Capital and Services, and Community Infrastructure

- 25. The data available in this area are sparser than those for the first pillar, so the picture with regard to degree of achievement of strategic objectives and targeted outcomes is less clear cut than for Pillar I. With regard to the strategic objectives under this pillar, strongest areas of performance were registered with regard to health, water and sanitation, and environment. Objectives with regard to maternal and child health, TB/HIV/AIDs control, water and sanitation services, drinking water, management of persistent organic pollutants (POPs), land preservation, and use of bio-waste appear to have been at least partially achieved. Those for poverty reduction and education appear, for the most part, to have not been achieved.
- 26. Outcomes of Bank support in this area were similarly mixed. In the rural poverty area, the specific outcome envisaged in the CAS improved targeting was not achieved. Progress was made under the Social Protection Management Project and PRSC I and II, however, on a number of preparatory steps (e.g., development of assistance roles) that will provide the technical and systems underpinnings for improving targeting if and when the government undertakes to do so. In the education area, data necessary to assess whether intended outcomes have been achieved are, for the most part, not available. It is probable, however, that few of the intended outcomes in this area have been achieved. Bank assistance has addressed input supply (General Education), education policy (Education Note), and efficiency and effectiveness of public spending in education (PER). Toward the end of the CAS period, the Quality Education in Rural Areas Project began to provide support that is more directly linked to some of the targeted outcomes in this area. In the health area the picture is more positive, with most targeted outcomes achieved at least in part. Maternal



and child mortality has declined, progress has been made in stabilizing HIV/AIDs incidence and reducing TB and HIV/AIDs mortality, and access to primary health care has been improved through extending health insurance and through increasing primary health inputs. Bank support has been provided through the Health Investment Fund Project, the AIDs Control Project, the Health Services and Social Assistance Project and through AAA in a policy note on health and public expenditure work on the efficiency of public expenditure on health. The primary contributions of this assistance appear to have been in the area of increasing the quality and efficiency of primary health care, and improving the efficiency of public spending on health.

- 27. In water supply and sanitation and environment, targeted outcomes (e.g, expanded service access, improved financial performance) were mostly achieved, at least in part. Targeted outcomes in these areas were closely linked to targeted outcomes of Bank projects in these areas (e.g. Water Supply and Sanitation (2003) in the case of water supply, and Renewable Energy from Agricultural Waste Biomass (2005) in the case of energy from biomass outcomes).
- 28. Overall, IEG rates the outcome of Bank assistance under Pillar II of the strategy as *Moderately Satisfactory*.

### Pillar III: Improving Public Sector Governance and Combating Corruption

- 29. Support under this pillar of the program sought to help Moldova improve its capacity to develop and implement government policy, reduce perceived corruption, increase public participation in the development and implementation of government policy, and improve access of the poor to legal services. The latter two objectives were dropped at the CASPR stage for lack of instruments and traction with the government. The first two objectives were achieved. The government's policy capacity was strengthened, albeit modestly. Public perceptions of public sector corruption improved, as reflected in improvement in Moldova's ratings in the BEEPs survey. However, concerns remain as regards to progress on property rights and rules based government and transparency, as well as on accountability in the public sector.
- 30. Specific anticipated Bank outcomes supporting the capacity objective institution of a civil service system (100 percent of civil servant hires below deputy minister based on merit) and reorganization of civil service training with adequate objectives were not achieved. Some progress toward these was made toward the end of the CAS period, but the government's commitment to proceed in this area is in doubt. Bank support the PRSC program and Civil Service/Governance TA appear to have been important factors in achieving any progress at all in this dimension of the Bank's program.
- 31. Anticipated Bank outcomes supporting the reduced perceived corruption objective were partially achieved. Progress was made in reducing single source procurement, although the reduction fell well short of one specific numerical outcome target. The budgeting outcome targeted by Bank assistance (annual budgets drawn up on the basis of MTEF) was achieved. Bank support (Public Procurement Infrastructure, Public Financial Management TA (2004), the PRSC series, and the PER (2007)) appear to have been a major contributor to these outcomes. Overall, the outcome of the Bank assistance in this area is rated *Moderately Satisfactory*.

### **Achievement of CAS Objectives**

Objectives		CASCR Rating*	IEG Rating	Explanation / Comments
Pillar I:		NR	MS	Although there was progress in many areas, the key role of agriculture in growth and poverty reduction coupled with its poor performance warrant an overall rating of MS.
(a)	Reduce cost of doing business	3	S	Country objective (reduce cost of doing business) achieved, although overall ranking among countries declined from 90 <sup>th</sup> in 2007 to 92 <sup>nd</sup> in 2008. Targeted CAS outcomes (customs clearance time at Chisinau reduced to 25 minutes target versus actual reduction from 500 [2002] to 124 minutes [2007]; licensing costs reduced to <=20% pc income target [~\$200 in 2007] versus actual of \$286, substantially achieved; inspections <=8 per year per firm target [versus 18 actual in 2004, actual 8.7 in 2007) were substantially achieved.
(b)	Arrest Deteriora- tion of	3**	MS	CAS outcomes (system of road user fees in place, not achieved; increased availability - e.g., heat availability increased from 30 to 120 days per year - and reduced specific heat consumption – significant savings achieved - in pilot

6



infras ture	truc-		communities and public buildings achieved) were mixed, with substantial achievement in energy, but progress in roads finance being made only at the end of the CAS period.
(c) Reduc Energ Vulne lity	у ,,**	S	Evidence on this outcome (added at the CASPR) is thin but supports the conclusion that progress was made in reducing the energy intensity of GDP (gas consumption lower by 15 percent in 2007 despite economic growth). Bank support for tariff adjustment (70% increase Feb 2007-Feb 2007) and improving payments discipline in the economy (overall gas collection rates > 90%) and support for improving energy efficiency contributed to this outcome.
(d) Broad Finan Interm diation	cial ne-	MS	M3 increased from 31.1% of GDP in 2004 to 58.4% in 2007, although increasing inflation points to a supply driven increase in the financial deepening ratio. CAS objectives (follow up on recommendations of FSAP were partially achieved (progress made in identifying ownership of banks, improving regulatory framework, strengthening payments system infrastructure, and legal framework for accounting). CASCR notes that an unfinished agenda remains.
(e) Suppo develo ment o the ru econo	op- of 3 ral	MU	Progress made on targeted CAS outcomes pertaining to availability of rural credit (agricultural portfolio increased by more than the targeted 50%), land tenure (increase in registration of privately held lands to 85% versus target of 20%), and advisory services (350,000 farmers served versus a target of 200,000). Weather risks/hazards were not however addressed, nor were important market policy issues affecting incentives and growth potential in the sector, which would undermined sector performance even had external shocks not occurred. Poverty rates reportedly increased in rural areas.
Pillar II		MS	
(i) Improve Education Indicators in I with MDGs	ine 2	MU	Country objectives mostly not achieved. Indicators of access deteriorating (NER 86% in 2006 versus 88.5% in 2004; drop out rate increased from 21.8 in 2004 to 23.6 in 2006). Bank portfolio projects not well linked to intended supporting CAS outcomes. No data are reported (or available according to the CASCR) on targeted CAS outcomes on rural access to compulsory education, rural urban performance gaps. However, progress in improving linkage and monitoring framework made with Quality Education in Rural Areas Project (07)
(ii) Improve Health Indicators 4 S in line with MDGs		s	Progress was made on most key indicators of country objective achievement (maternal and child mortality – e.g., infant mortality reduced from 14.4 in 2003 to 11.8 in 2006; infection disease (TB/HIV/AIDS) mortality). Most targeted CAS outcomes are identical or nearly so to country level objectives. One distinct CAS outcome target – increase in coverage of essential health interventions – appears to have been achieved. Bank support was an important contributing factor in extending access to primary care, including an improvement of Moldova's system for addressing HIV/AIDS, and extending health insurance.
iii) Improving Water and Sanitation	4	MS	Progress was made toward long term (2015) country access objectives (approximately 80% of urban residents connected to water supply and 63% to sewerage services, up from 70% and 55% respectively; 52% of rural communities have piped water and 40% have sewerage infrastructure, up from 50% and 35% respectively; progress made in reducing incidence of water borne diseases by improving quality of drinking water). Progress was also made toward targeted CAS outcomes (collection ratio in pilot project areas ranged from 95% to 98% as against a sector target of 80%; cash operating revenues exceeded cash operating expenses in pilots, compared with net operational losses in 2003; water quality monitoring initiated as part of effort to reduce incidence of water-borne diseases). Bank supported projects contributed to progress toward meeting targeted CAS outcomes in pilot project areas. No evidence presented on non-pilot areas.
(iv) Environment and Energy 4 MS		MS	Country objectives achieved in area of Persistent Organic Pollutants (POPs). Status of forestation, soil conservation and renewable energy from biomass activities mixed, with achievement of forestation targets and pilots of biomass from agricultural waste, and partial or unclear achievement of projected areas and soil degradation goals. Targeted CAS outcomes for POPs were achieved (100% of POPs managed or destroyed against a target of 35% for pesticides and no specified target for PCBs), while progress was made related for forestation and biomass, but achievement against specific stated targets is indeterminate. Bank supported projects contributed to progress toward targeted CAS outcomes in project areas.



Pillar III	3	мѕ	
(i) Increased transparency and accountability in management of public monies	4	MS	The country level objective of reducing the perception of corruption in Moldova was achieved (TI Corruption Index improved from 2.4 in 2003 to 3.2 in 2006, and BEEPS survey indicates improved perceived improvements in governance and decline in corruptions. Achievement of outcomes targeted by CAS mixed but substantial overall (sole source procurements were reduced to 8.9% of contracts, meeting a target of 20%; open tendering increased from 19% of procurements by value in 2003, to 70.4% in 2007, falling short of a target value of 85%). Targeted outcomes with respect to improvements in government budget formulation and management were achieved. CPIA indicator for Quality of Budget and Financial Management increased from 3 to 4.

<sup>\*</sup>The CASCR rates outcomes in terms of a 4 point scale used in a scorecard developed to monitor progress in achieving results. The 4 ratings are 1=deterioration; 2=steady state; 3=some improvement; and 4=significant improvement.

### Comments on Bank Performance:

32. The strategy outlined in the 2005 CAS was aligned with and highly relevant to the Government's preliminary poverty reduction strategy. Ahead of its time, it built the CAS around an explicit results framework. The CAS was also grounded in a realistic assessment of the risks the Bank faced, and pragmatic non-confrontational approach to dealing with a government that faced numerous constraints on its ability to engage with the Bank, and whose constituency was deeply skeptical of Bank engagement. It adopted an approach and sensible base lending case to isolate and manage these risks. The AAA program complemented lending by focusing on policy issues and technical support that could pave the way for increased Bank engagement. The Bank adjusted flexibly as some doors opened and others closed. In the large, it delivered the program as envisaged and, as noted above, all indicators of the quality of Bank work over this period were satisfactory. It also appears to have been effective, as evidenced by co-financing of Bank products and cooperative engagement with other donors in raising financing for Moldova's development program, in Donor Coordination. However, while noting the importance of donor harmonization, the CASCR provides no information on the status of efforts on this front in Moldova.

### 4. Overall IEG Assessment

Outcome:	Moderately Satisfactory
Bank Performance:	Satisfactory

- 33. The overall outcome of Bank assistance is rated as Moderately Satisfactory, as a simple average of the ratings of outcomes for the three pillars of Bank assistance. This compares with an overall average rating on the Moldova Country Team's scorecard system of 3.2 on a 4 point scale, and thus appears to be broadly consistent with the Country Team's self evaluation.
- 34. Bank performance was strong in all dimensions. The CAS was well-designed if perhaps slightly over-ambitious, drawing on the Bank's previous experience and a realistic assessment of the political economy of reform in Moldova, well-executed, and well self-evaluated (see Section 5 below). Bank performance merits a rating of Satisfactory.

<sup>\*\*</sup>CASCR outcome categories are slightly different than those presented here. The CASCR utilized two infrastructure outcomes: (i) Arrest deterioration of road infrastructure, which it rates at 2; and (ii) Improve energy efficiency and reduce energy vulnerability, with it rates at 4. The ratings above were synthesized assigning Arresting Deterioration in Infrastructure a rating of 3 – the average of 4 in energy and 2 on roads, and assigning Reducing Energy vulnerability a rating of 4.



### 5. Assessment of CAS Completion Report

- 35. The CASCR is candid, and clear, concise, complete in its coverage. It does an excellent job in discussing the implementation of the CAS program, and draws sensible lessons from the implementation experience. The effort at the CAS stage, notwithstanding the fact that the 2005 CAS was not envisaged as a results-based CAS, to establish a results framework for monitoring and evaluation of the Bank's program followed up with development of a scorecard system for tracking progress on objectives are notable features of the CAS and the country program implementation over this period. The existence of this framework contributed to the clarity of the CASCR.
- 36. The CASCR generally does a good job in reporting Country Outcomes, and in tracking those through the use of performance indicators; it is somewhat less strong in its follow up and reporting with regard to CAS outcomes (several of which are not reported, mainly due to lack of data, and hence, in providing the information needed to assess the Bank's contributions to country level development objectives. The discussion on the substantive contribution of specific Bank products is also thin in some places (e.g., education, health), with little evidence to attribute outcomes.

### 6. Findings and Lessons

- 37. The CASCR draws six lessons from recent experience: (i) Targeted support (relatively narrow, well-defined objectives) plays an important role in building country systems, enhancing ministry capacity, and enabling the development and implementation of longer term policies and strategies; (ii) Capable and committed government ministries are a critical factor in achieving development objectives; (iii) Cross-sectoral approaches improve the effectiveness of interventions; (iv) Resources from the Bank can be directed strategically to leverage those of other donors for optimal development impact; (v) The linkages between economic growth and poverty reduction are not yet sufficiently understood for Moldova; and (vi) Effective, efficient, and transparent public sector management is becoming increasingly important for achieving development objectives.
- 38. IEG concurs with these lessons. To these IEG would add a seventh the importance (well illustrated by the Bank's experience in Moldova) of grounding country strategies in a realistic appraisal of the political environment for CAS implementation. Such an appraisal is likely to inform beneficially strategic selectivity with regard to which areas to target for support (CASCR lesson (i)) as well strategies for managing CAS implementation risks to maximize the prospects for successful CAS outcomes.



### **ANNEXES**

Annex Table 1: IDA Lending, FY05-08

Annex Table 2: Non-Lending Services, FY05-08

Annex Table 3a: IEG Project Ratings for Moldova FY05-08

Annex Table 3b: IEG Ratings: Moldova and Comparators FY05-08

Annex Table 4: Portfolio Status Indicators, FY05-08

Annex Table 5: Net Disbursements in USD, FY05-08

**Annex Table 6: Millennium Development Goals** 

Annex Table 7: Net ODA Commitments, 2000-2006

Annex Table 8: Economic and Social Indicators

Annex Table 9: Summary of Achievements of the CAS Objectives

			·



Annex Table 1: Moldova IDA Lending, FY05 - FY08

Project	Planned FY	Approval FY	Status	Planned Lending (US\$ million)	Actual Lending (US\$ million)	Comments
Planned in CAS FY05-FY06						
Public Financial Management TA	2005	2005	***************************************	10	8.5	
Rural Investment Services II	2006	2006		15	15	
Rural Education	2006	2006		10	10	Project title was Quality Education in Rural Areas of Moldova
Competitiveness	2006	2006		5	9.8	Project title was Competitiveness Enhancement
Total CAS FY05-FY06	2000	2000		40	43.3	Elliancement
Additional Projects FY05-FY06			······································	TV	70.0	
Cadastre Supplement		2005			3	
Avian Flu - Moldova		2006			8	
Total FY05-06		2000		40	54.3	
Planned in CAS FY07-08		·····				
Social Assistance Project	2007		Dropped	10		
Primary Health Care Project	2007	2007	Diopped	10	17	Project Title was Health Services and Social Assistance. It was planned in CASPR
Hazard Mitigation in Rural Areas	2007		Dropped	10	·>	
Local Government and Community	0000		Danasad	10		
Infrastructure	2008		Dropped	10		Project Title was National Water Supply and
Water and Sanitation Project	2008	2008	»»»	10	14	Sanitation
Total CAS FY07-FY08	11111111111111111111111111111111111111			50	31	
Planned in CASPR FY07-08**						
Poverty Reduction Support Credit	2007	2007		10	10	
Social Assistance/ Primary Health Care	2007	2007		15	17	
	2007	2027		40	10	Project Title was Road Sector Program Support
Roads Rehabilitation Project	2007	2007	D	16	16	project
Hazard Mitigation in Rural Areas	2008		Dropped	10	4.4	
Total CASPR FY07-FY08 Additional Projects Not Planned in CASPR FY07-FY08				51	43	
PRSC2		2008			10	
National Water Supply and Sanitation		2008			14	
RISP2 Additional Final		2008			6	
Total FY07-FY08				51	73	

<sup>\*</sup> There was also a high-case totaling US\$ 137 million under which IDA will consider development policy lending (DPL)

<sup>\*\*</sup> The planned lending figures for CASPR are taken from CASCR as the CASPR didn't have the planned figures



Annex Table 2: Moldova Non-Lending Services, FY05 - FY08

Annex Table 2: Moldova Non-Lendi Title	Planned FY	Actual FY	Status	Comments
Underway				
Growth Study (CEM)	2005	2005	Actual	
Education Note	2005	2006	Slipped	
Agriculture Note	2005	2006	Slipped	
Reconciliation Through Education	2006	2006	Actual	It's a JSDF Grant and classified as Recipient Executed Activities
PSD/FSD TA Dialogue	Ongoing	2007	Actual	
CFAA Follow Up	Ongoing			
CPAR Follow Up	Ongoing			
Como-Macro Monitoring	Ongoing			
Local Gov/Community Development	2005	2010	Slipped	Also Planned under CASPR The ESW is titled Local Gov and Communal Services
Public Procurement (IDF)	2006			Couldn't be located
Planned in CAS				
CAS Update	2006	2007		CAS Progress Report Also Planned under CASPR as a 2007 delivery.
Poverty Assessment Update	2006	2007	Slipped	Poverty Update.
PRSP Update	2006	2006	2006	JSAN/PRSP Update
Disaster Management Note	2006	2007	Slipped	
Social Assistance Note	2006		Droppe d	Also planned under CASPR. Though the ESW has been dropped, a report does exist in SAP
FSAP Follow Up (TA)	2006	2006	Actual	
				The country team pointed out that there was no stand-alone CFAA update; the follow-up activities fed into the design of the Public Financial Management Project. There is also an IDF for capacity building in Public Sector
CFAA Update	2006			Accounting.
CPAR Update	2007	2010		Country Procurement Assessment Report
PRSP Update	2007			Couldn't be located
Housing Rehabilitation Note	2007			Couldn't be located
FSD/PSD	2007	2007	Actual	PSD/FSD TA Dialogue
PER	2007	2007	Actual	
Llacith Note	0007	2006	Forwar	·
Health Note	2007	2006	ded	Logol Empoyarment TA for Beer
Legal Empowerment TA	2008	2008	Actual	Legal Empowerment TA for Poor
CAS	2008	2009	Slipped	Country Partnership Strategy The ESW is titled Poverty Update & Technical
Poverty Assessment Update	2008	2009	Slipped	Assistance
PRSP Update	2008	2008	Actual	PRSP Extension
Planned in CAS Progress Report	000-	0007	A	Dublic Commendations Dead-
Public Finance Review	2007	2007	Actual	Public Expenditure Review
Hazard Management Note Additional ESW/TA Not Planned in CAS/CASPR	2007	2007	Actual	Disaster Management Note
Bottom Up Governance Note		2005		



Title	Planned FY	Actual FY	Status	Comments
FSAP Moldova	<u> </u>	2005		
FSAP Update Moldova		2008		
Social Protection TA/Dialogue		2006		
Poverty Profile Update & PRSP Support TA		2006		
Civil Service Governance TA		2006		
ROSC Acct & Audit Follow-up TA - MD	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	2007		
Moldova: Reforming Courts IDF		2006		
IDF-Capacity Building in Moldova's Public Sector Accounting		2007		
Strategy For Transport Sector		2008		
FIRST: Strengthening AA & Financial Reporting		2008		
FIRST: Devt Of Money Market II		2008		
PSD TA/Dialogue		2008		
minoshimiladhaaaaaaaaaaaa <del>M</del> aa		2008		
CF ASSIST - National Training Workshop (CDM)		Actual		
Research and Publications		FY		
Regional cooperation of the CIS7 : past				
experience and options for the future (English)		2005		
Informal export barriers and poverty (English)		2005		
Moldova - Agricultural policy notes : public expenditures for agricultural development			( control of the cont	
(English) Moldova - Agricultural policy notes : agricultural		2006	••••	
land (English)		2006		
Moldova - Agricultural policy notes : agricultural				
markets (English)		2006		
Doing Business 2008 Moldova : comparing				
regulation in 178 economies (English)		2007		
Rural productivity in Moldova : Managing natural		2001		
vulnerability (English)		2007		
Changing the way our services are governed?		2007		
Bottom-up governance and service delivery in				
Moldova: Opportunities and challenges for		0007		
effective mechanisms of participation  Land reform and farm restructuring in transition	••••	2007		
countries : the experience of Bulgaria, Moldova,				
Azerbaijan, and Kazakhstan (English)				
Moldovo Monoging food safety and agricultural		2007		
Moldova - Managing food safety and agricultural health : an action plan (English)				
		2007		
Moldova : results and the World Bank (English)		2007		
The impact of energy price changes in Moldova (English)		2007		
Social assistance and poverty reduction in		2007	······································	
Moldova, 2001-2004 an impact evaluation				
(English)		2008		
Moldova - Joint World Bank and IMF debt sustainability analysis (English)				
sustamavinty analysis (English)		2008		

# **Error**

An error occurred while processing this page. See the system log for more details.



Annex Table 4: Portfolio Status Indicators of Moldova and Comparators: FY05-08

Country	Fiscal year	2005	2006	2007	2008
	# Proj	10	13	12	11
	Net Comm Amt	143.8	170.0	164.1	169.3
Moldova	# Proj At Risk	1	0	0	0
MOIDOVA	% At Risk	10.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
	Comm At Risk	35.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
	% Commit at Risk	24.3	0.0	0.0	0.0
	# Proj	16	18	17	17
Armenia	Net Comm Amt	251.3	266.5	278.6	283.6
	# Proj At Risk	0	0	0	1
	% At Risk	0.0	0.0	0.0	5.9
	Comm At Risk	0.0	0.0	0.0	10.2
	% Commit at Risk	0.0	0.0	0.0	3.6
	# Proj	17	18	18	14
Georgia	Net Comm Amt	328.8	290.4	308.5	253.3
	# Proj At Risk	0	2	1	2
	% At Risk	0.0	11.1	5.6	14.3
	Comm At Risk	0.0	55.7	15.7	18.7
	% Commit at Risk	0.0	19.2	5.1	7.4
<u>-</u>	# Proj	16	17	20	17
Kyrgyz Republic	Net Comm Amt	244.2	232.2	268.2	196.2
	# Proj At Risk	3	0	2	1
	% At Risk	18.8	0.0	10.0	5.9
	Comm At Risk	60.0	0.0	40.0	7.8
	% Commit at Risk	24.6	0.0	14.9	4.0
	# Proj	11	13	13	15
	Net Comm Amt	167.4	173.7	165.9	184.2
Lao PDR	# Proj At Risk	2	1	1	0
	% At Risk	18.2	7.7	7.7	0.0
	Comm At Risk	18.4	16.7	4.0	0.0
	% Commit at Risk	11.0	9.6	2.4	0.0
	# Proj	19	19	20	20
	Net Comm Amt	1,395.9	1,457.9	1,742.8	1,755.9
Romania	# Proj At Risk	1,000.0	1,707.0	3	3
Homania	% At Risk	0.0	5.3	15.0	15.0
	Comm At Risk	0.0	80.0	455.0	217.7
	% Commit at Risk	0.0	5.5	26.1	12.4
	# Proj	11	12	11	12
	Net Comm Amt	789.2	1,008.6	924.1	1,207.5
	# Proj At Risk	4	3	4	1,207.5
Ukraine	% At Risk	36.4	25.0	36.4	50.0
	Comm At Risk	297.1	260.1	430.5	725.6
	% Commit at Risk	37.7	25.8	46.6	60.1
	# Proj	276	294	286	283
	Net Comm Amt	15,675.5	16,295.5	16,472.9	17,900.3
	# Proj At Risk	15,675.5	10,295.5	10,472.9	17,900.3
ECA	% At Risk	8.7	9.5	9.1	12.0
	Comm At Risk	1,413.0	1,177.8	1,647.9	2,216.8
	% Commit at Risk	9.0	7.2	10.0	12.4
	# Proj	1,332	1,345	1,347	1,386
	Net Comm Amt				
		93,211.7	92,888.8	97,790.5	105,292.5
Bank Wide	# Proj At Risk	224	188	224	250
	% At Risk	16.8	14.0	16.6	18.0
•	Comm At Risk	12,552.7	10,849.8	15,175.6	18,179.3
	% Commit at Risk	13.5	11.7	15.5	17.3

Source: WB Business Warehouse tables 3a.4 as of September 14, 2008.



## Annex Table 5: Moldova Net Disbursements in USD, FY05-FY08

Fiscal Year	Disbursements	Repayments	Net Amount	Charges	Fees	Net Transfer
2005	20,128,640.22	13,121,253.79	7,007,386.43	6,921,925.26	379,881.95	-294,420.78
2006	24,711,704.04	13,443,490.50	11,268,213.54	8,458,084.86	258,557.48	2,551,571.20
2006	42,791,405.46	14,482,283.55	28,309,121.91	9,794,918.18	203,127.06	18,311,076.67
		47 000 740 00		0.040.404.70	4 075 770 05	4 550 444 47
2006	27,006,543.59	17,636,719.68	9,369,823.91	9,646,461.73	1,275,776.35	-1,552,414.17
Total	11// 638 203 31	58 683 747 52	55 954 545 79	34 821 300 03	2 117 342 84	19,015,812.92
Total	114,638,293.31	58,683,747.52	55,954,545.79	34,821,390.03	2,117,34	2.84

Source: WB Client Connections, Net Disbursements and Charges Report of September19, 2008.



**Annex Table 6: Millennium Development Goals** 

	1990	1995	2000	2007
Goal 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger				
Employment to population ratio, 15+, total (%)	58	56	56	56
Employment to population ratio, ages 15-24, total (%)	36	34	34	36
Income share held by lowest 20%	6.9	6.5	7.1	
Malnutrition prevalence, weight for age (% of children under 5)	**			3.2
Poverty headcount ratio at national poverty line (% of population)	**	11	62.4	.,
Prevalence of undernourishment (% of population)	**	5	••	••
Vulnerable employment, total (% of total employment)	,,		36	36
Goal 2: Achieve universal primary education				(),,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,
Literacy rate, youth female (% of females ages 15-24)	100		**	••
Literacy rate, youth male (% of males ages 15-24)	100		**	**
Persistence to last grade of primary, total (% of cohort)			90	97
Primary completion rate, total (% of relevant age group)	,,	94	98	98
Total enrollment, primary (% net)			92	86
Goal 3: Promote gender equality and empower women			***************************************	
Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament (%)		5	9	22
Ratio of female to male enrollments in tertiary education			132	138
Ratio of female to male primary enrollment	102		99	99
Ratio of female to male secondary enrollment	110		102	104
Ratio of young literate females to males (% ages 15-24)	100			
Share of women employed in the nonagricultural sector (% of total nonagricultural employed)			52.8	54.
Goal 4: Reduce child mortality	vymony	**	JE.U	J-7.
Immunization, measles (% of children ages 12-23 months)	92	99	87	9
	30	25	21	1
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births) Mortality rate, under-5 (per 1,000)	37		24	1
	3/	30	24	
Goal 5: Improve maternal health			16	3
Adolescent fertility rate (births per 1,000 women ages 15-19)		58	46	***************************************
Births attended by skilled health staff (% of total)	O	99		10
Contraceptive prevalence (% of women ages 15-49)	•	74	62	6
Maternal mortality ratio (modeled estimate, per 100,000 live births)				2
Pregnant women receiving prenatal care (%)	**	99		9
Unmet need for contraception (% of married women ages 15-49)				
Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria, and other diseases			•	
Children with fever receiving antimalarial drugs (% of children under age 5 with fever)			1)	
Condom use, population ages 15-24, female (% of females ages 15-24)	11	**		2
Condom use, population ages 15-24, male (% of males ages 15-24)				
Incidence of tuberculosis (per 100,000 people)	65	91	138	14
Prevalence of HIV, female (% ages 15-24)			**	0
Prevalence of HIV, total (% of population ages 15-49)		7,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	0.1	0
Tuberculosis cases detected under DOTS (%)		**	41	
Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability				
Annual freshwater withdrawals, total (% of internal resources)		44	231.0	
CO2 emissions (kg per PPP \$ of GDP)	1.9	2.0	1.2	
CO2 emissions (metric tons per capita)	4.7	2.6	1.6	
Forest area (% of land area)	10		10	
mproved sanitation facilities (% of population with access)	1.	78	78	
Improved water source (% of population with access)		93	92	,
Marine protected areas, (% of surface area)			,,	
Nationally protected areas (% of total land area)			1+	
Goal 8: Develop a global partnership for development				
Aid per capita (current US\$)	2	15	30	6
Debt service (PPG and IMF only, % of exports of G&S, excl. workers' remittances)		7.6	13.1	4
nternet users (per 100 people)	**	0.0	1.3	18
Mobile phone subscribers (per 100 people)		0.0	3.4	49
Telephone mainlines (per 100 people)	10.5	12.9	14.1	28
Other				
Fertility rate, total (births per woman)	2.3	1.9	1.6	1
GNI per capita, Atlas method (current US\$)	630	480	370	1,20
GNI, Atlas method (current US\$) (billions)	2.3	1.7	1.4	4
Gni, Auas method (current US\$) (billions) Gross capital formation (% of GDP)	24.9	24.9	23.9	29
	······································	24.9	23.9 67	······································
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	67 96	0/	0/	6
Literacy rate, adult total (% of people ages 15 and above)	······	·		
Population, total (millions)	4.4	4.4	4.1	3
Trade (% of GDP)	98.8	107.3	125.2	129

Source: World Development Indicators database



Annex Table 7: Moldova Net ODA commitments (USD Million, Current) 2000-2006

Donor	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006
Austria	0.18	0.15	0.8	2.09	2.59	6.65	1.96
Belgium	••	0.1	0.02	0.03	0.07	0.24	0.11
Canada	0.12	0.05	0.32	0.5	0.58	0.62	0.23
Czech Republic		0.93	1.36	1.62	1.09	0.68	1.32
Denmark			1.47	**	1.94	0.9	0.41
Finland	0.07	0.15	0.46	0.04	0.04	0.13	0.82
France	1.03	1.08	2.29	2.71	4.19	25.8	6. <b>63</b>
Germany	1,9	1.88	2.4	5.52	6.25	7.81	9.42
Greece	0.46	0.27	0.31	1.67	2.09	1.59	2.51
Hungary			**	0.02	0.16	0.05	
Ireland	0.03	0.02	0.09	0.07	0.02	0.15	0.06
Italy	0.65	0.25	0.4	1.14	0.08		0.11
Japan	2.63	8.15	5.91	4.3	3.33	3.71	6.11
Korea	0.05	0.01	0.04	0.06	0.09	0.08	.,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,
Luxembourg		0.01	0.35	0.29	0.39	0.07	0.2
Netherlands	13.47	15.15	3.47	4.91	5.6	8.3	7
Norway	0.65	0.98	1.09	2.27	1.31	2.76	2.74
Poland	0.28	0.19	0.23	0.25	0.27	0.56	1.25
Portugal				0.01	······································		
Slovak Republic	.,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,		0.02	0.01	0.4		0.02
Spain	0.03	0.01	0.01	0.03	0.01	0.06	0.01
Sweden	2.41	2.55	4.57	4.55	7.22	8.52	11.86
Switzerland	1.77	1.97	2.15	3.27	3.22	5.34	6.01
Turkey	0.48	0.78	0.26	0.2	1.91	5.4	8.34
United Kingdom	1.11	2.53	3.32	5.31	4.86	2.96	3.42
United States	35	43.51	56.91	41.7	32.76	30.09	23.89
Arab Countries	33	0.32	30.91		32.70	30.09	1.04
Other Bilateral Donors	9.04	3.72	2.91	2.54	2	1.46	1.68
EBRO	0.45	0.28	0.24	0.47	0.73	0.71	0.71
EC	5.3	4.64	11.27	8.48	10.04	40.44	26.22
GEF	0.06	0.03	0.48	0.41	0.99	1.74	3.03
Global Fund (GFATM)	0.00	0.03	0.46	1.09	1.89	3.98	2.15
IDA	30.00	1416	01.07	15.9	17.68	24.78	26.49
SAF+ESAF+PRGF(IMF)	30.08 12.19	14.16 14.98	21.87 11.96	15.8	17.00	24./0	63.86
IFAD	·····				1.75	1.36	3.48
UNDP	0.4 0.66	0.4 0.88	1.77 0.8	2.43 1. <b>02</b>	1.49	1.81	2.34
UNFPA	0.11	0.15	0.17	0.19	0.23	0.35	2.34
UNHCR	<del></del>	0.15	0.17	0.19	0.23	0.35	0.4
UNICEF	0.73				·····		***************************************
UNTA	0.73	0.74	0.63	0.67	0.68	1.11	0.76
All Donors, Total	0.5	0.4	0.44	1.29	0.78	0.65	0.94
DAC Countries, Total	122.57	122.36	141.68	117.94	119.5	191.36	228.19
·	61.51	78.81	86.34	80.41	76.55	105.7	83.5
Multilateral, Total	51.21	37.6	50.52	32.83	37.03	77.43	131.04
G7, Total	42.44	57.45	71.55	61.18	52.05	70.99	49.81
DAC EU Members, Total	21.34	24.15	19.96	28.37	35.35	63.18	44.52
Non-DAC Countries. Total	9.85	5.95	4.82	4.7	5.92	8.23	13.65

Source: OECD DAC Online database, Table 2a. Destination of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid - Data Extracted on September 19, 2008

# EG CASCR Review Independent Evaluation Group

Annex Table 8: Economic and Social Indicators

		Year						Avera	Average 2004-2007	_			
Series Name	2004	2005	2006	2007	Moldova	Armenia	Georgia	Kyrgyz	Lao PDR	Romania	Ukraine	ECA	PA S
Growth and Inflation			,					nepanni					
GDP growth (annual %)	7.4	7.5	4.8	3.0	5.7	12.8	9.3	4.2	7.0	9.9	7.3	7.1	6.8
GNI per capita, Atlas method (current US\$)	720	940	1080	1260	1000	1815	1542.5	485	487.5	4442.5	1827.5	4550.6	519.8
GNI per capita, PPP (current international \$)	2210	2450	2680	2930	2567.5	4712.5	3895	1757.5	1732.5	9637.5	5910	9670.3	1322.4
GDP per capita growth (annual %)	8.8	8.8	0.9	4.1	6.9	13.2	10.3	3.2	5.3	6.8	8.2	7.1	4.4
Inflation, consumer prices (annual %)	12.5	12.0	12.8	12.4	12.4	3.7	8.1	6.1	7.2	8.1	11.1		
Composition of GDP													
Agriculture, value added (% of GDP)	20.4	19.5	18.1	17.2	18.8	20.8	14.6	32.7	44.3	10.8	9.6	7.6	25.8
Industry, value added (% of GDP)	17.3	16.3	15.1	15.5	16.0	41.9	25.5	22.2	30.0	33.6	32.9	30.9	29.9
Services, etc., value added (% of GDP)	62.3	64.2	999	67.4	65.2	37.2	59.9	45.1	25.7	55.6	57.5	59.4	443
Gross domestic savings (% of GDP)	-4.9	-9.7	-12.8	-14.9	-10.6	16.3	6.9	-5.3	21.0	12.2	23.0	23.1	15.6
Gross national expenditure (% of GDP)	131.3	140.5	146.6	144.4	140.7	113.8	121.2	121.5	111.3	110.7	99.5		
Gross fixed capital formation (% of GDP)	21.2	24.6	27.5	23.9	24.3	29.5	27.3	15.8	32.3	22.7	22.6	21.0	23.2
General government final consumption expenditure (% of GDP)	15.3	15.7	18.2	17.9	16.8	10.3	17.1	18.2	8.3	11.6	17.4	15.8	10.2
External Accounts			and the second s										
Exports of goods and services (% of GDP)	50.7	51.1	45.2	42.7	47.5	23.9	32.4	40.0	29.3	32.3	50.0	34.8	34.7
Imports of goods and services (% of GDP)	82.0	91.7	91.8	87.1	88.1	38.2	53.6	61.5	35.2	42.9	49.5	34.0	40.7
Current account balance (% of GDP)	-1.8	-7.6	-11.4	-15.8	-9.1	-2.4	-12.9	-4.2		-9.5	2.0		
External debt, total (% of GNI)	66.3	61.3	64.3		64.0	40.5	31.9	90.5	102.0	42.8	44.6	41.1	
IBRD loans and IDA credits (PPG DOD, current million US\$)	385.8	370.6	393.4	:	383.2	793.2	713.8	585.2	618.9	2483.5	2319.6	31485.9	
Total debt service (% of exports of goods, services and income)	15.0	10.3	12.2		12.5	8.8	9.4	10.0		17.9	14.0	20.0	
Total debt service (% of GNI)	10.4	7.5	8.8		8.9	3.3	3.6	5.5	5.7	7.0	7.6	7.8	3.2
Official exchange rate (LCU per US\$, period average)	12.3	12.6	13.1	12.1	12.6	437.3	4.8	40.3	10250.9	2.9	5.1		
Social Indicators													
Health													
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)		68.3	68.5	:	68.4	71.5	70.7	67.9	63.6	71.7	68.1	689	55.7
Immunization, DPT (% of children ages 12-23 months)	98.0	98.0	97.0		27.7	89.3	83.0	96.3	50.3	97.0	2.76	94.6	73.5
Improved sanitation facilities (% of population with access)			79.0	:	79.0	91.0	93.0	93.0	48.0	72.0	93.0	88.8	36.9
Improved water source (% of population with access)	-		90.0	:	90.0	98.0	99.0	89.0	90.09	88.0	97.0	95.0	63.9
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	:	17.0	16.4	:	16.7	22.1	28.5	36.2	60.5	16.4	19.7	23.3	86.4
Population													
Population, total (millions)	3.9	3.9	3.8	3.8	3.9	3.0	4.5	5.2	5.7	21.6	46.9	444.7	1148.6
Population growth (annual %)	-1.3	-1.2	-1.1	÷	-1.2	-0.3	6.0	1.0	1.6	-0.2	9.0	0.0	2.3
Urban population (% of total)	43.0	42.6	42.3	42.0	42.5	£4.1	52.6	35.9	28.0	53.8	8.79	63.4	30.9
Education													
School enrollment, preprimary (% gross)	59.4	66.1	70.7	:	65.4	33.5	52.2	12.9	10.2	73.8	85.9	49.2	13.1
School enrollment, primary (% gross)	101.2	97.9	296.7		98.6	97.4	95.0	96.8	114.5	105.2	102.2	6.96	94.5
Cohod annul accorden (0) accord	900	+ 00	6 00		9	3 70	868	98.0	727	85.8	7 60	90 4	A 70



Annex Table 9: Summary of Achieve pents of the CAS Objectives

		Actual Results	Comments
	Biller 1. Bremeting	(as of December 2008)  Onditions for sustaining growth and emplo	yment creation
Objectives	Reduce cost of doing business	Good Progress	Cost of Doing Business rank of Moldova = 90th in
Onfectives	neduce cost of doing business	Good Flogless	2007 and 92nd in 2008.
	Arrest deterioration of transport infrastructure	Good Progress	
	Improve Energy Efficiency	Good Progress	
	Agriculture: Strengthen property rights and increase access to finance, knowledge and technology	Some Progress	
<u>Major</u> <u>Outcome</u> <u>Measures</u>	Reduce cost of doing business  A. Customs clearance time at Chisinau inland clearance terminal reduced by 25%		Good Progress
	Reduce customs clearance to 70 min by Dec 2005	Clearance time reduced from 500 minutes (2002) to 124 minutes (2007).	Good Progress
	B. Licensing cost reduced by 20%		Good Progress
	Cost of licensing and permits- \$550 by 2005	Licensing costs reduced - in 2007 it took on average 20 days and US\$286 to obtain one license vs. CAS high-case trigger of US\$550:	Good Progress
	C. Number of inspections reduced by 8 per year/firm		Good Progress
	Inspections no more than 12/yr by 2005	In 2007, the surveyed enterprises were inspected 8.7 times on average, compared to 18 inspections in 2004 and the CAS high-case benchmark of 12 inspections.	
	Arrest deterioration of transport infrastructure  A. Roads: system of road user charges in place	Activities in this area started only in 2008. There has not been much Progress in this area until recently.	No Progress  CASCR states that Road Systems Project will support achievement of this objective in the forthcoming CAS period.
	Reduce vehicle operating costs by implementing cost-recovery (user charges) financing for road maintenance	No Progress reported on vehicle operating costs	No Progress
	Introduce SME and community participation in road maintenance	No Progress reported	No Progress
		-	
	Improved energy efficiency and reduced energy vulnerability  Increase availability and reduced specific heat consumption in pilot communities and public buildings	Energy efficiency in pilot communities and public buildings improved: (i) Significant savings achieved through implementation of new energy efficient technologies; (ii) Availability of heating in selected buildings increased from 30 to 120 days/year; (iii) Number of buildings connected exceeds the output indicator: 39 social objects/institutions and 37 residential objects/buildings benefit from heating improvement measures; (iv) Energy strategy adopted in July 2007 aiming at legal, regulatory and technical harmonization of Moldova's energy sector with the EU internal energy market (PRSC-2).	Good Progress  CASPR restated expected outcomes of CAS as (i) Energy efficiency improved; (ii) Energy vulnerability reduced; and (iii) Legal and regulatory framework place for harmonization of Moldova's energy sector with EU. Outcomes (i) and (ii) were achieved and (iii) was in Progress
	Energy: Reduced Vulnerability (added in CASPR)	Energy intensity, as measured by total energy consumed/real GDP (lei) has decreased by 6% between 2004 and 2006. Tariffs are set at cost-recovery levels.	Good Progress  Domestic gas tariffs increased by 70% Feb 2006-Feb 2007 as a result of more than twofold gas pric increase. Gas demand lower in 2007 by est. 15% despite overall economic growth. Overall gas collection rates > 90%. No net accumulation of debt to Gazprom.



		Actual Results (as of December 2008)	Comments
	System Eliminate pension privileges	GoM has not successfully reduced pension privileges but the Ministry of Social Protection Family and Child has drafted a unification strategy for all categories of pensioners.	Some Progress  Although the CAS and CASPR mention do not specify indicators, these indicators have be inferred from the text of the CASPR
			While there has been Progress towards pension reform greater work remains to be done to establish pension benefits on actual contributions paid. GoM laws and policies have impeded Moldova's success in reforming the pension system.
	Reduce redistribution of pension contributions from industrial to agricultural sector from 85 to 60 percent of total	No information presented in the CASCR on whether there has been a redistribution of pension contributions	No Progress
	100% of pension fund members with individual accounts	Individual accounts were established for all known pension fund contributors, all post-2005 data has been recorded in individual accounts	Good Progress.  CASCR states that PRSC-3 will support continued establishment of individual accounts for all pension contributors.
	Agriculture: Strengthen property rights and increase access to finance, knowledge and technology		Credit and TA to assistance farmers exceeded CAS targets. A unified national system of real estate cadastre system for urban and rural was established - this was an objective of the previous CAS. 85% of rural property in private hands had been fully registered strengthening tenure and ownership rights- no clear specification of the targets on private ownership in the CAS or CASPR.
	A. Improve credit to rural areas. Increase lending to agricultural and food processing by 50%	Portfolio of banking sector in agriculture and rural sectors increased by 144% between 2002 and 2004	Good Progress
	Increase share of micro-credit by banks and others	Growth in lending to agricultural and rural sectors in the portfolios of financial intermediaries continues, estimated at 25% from 2006 to 2008.	Good Progress
	B. Initiate implementation of strategy to help farmers mitigate against weather- related risks and reduce growth instability		No Progress
	The Govt. adopts a hazard mitigation strategy and action plan in coordination with donors by end 2007	Hazard mitigation strategy not adopted	No Progress
	C. Provide outreach to 200,000 registered farmers	Demand-driven rural advisory services provided to 350,000 farmers per year (RISP 2)	Good Progress
	A network of over 30 technology and information service providers is established & fully operation	No evidence of network establishment. However, the sub-objective of reaching out to registered farmers is met	No Progress
	D Encourage formation of voluntary production cooperative in agriculture  Legal framework for market friendly land	No evidence of voluntary production cooperative in agriculture  No evidence of legal framework for land	Not rated Not rated
<u> </u>	consolidation in place Social Protection Management (1999)	consolidation	
Ongoing Pro CAS	PSD2 (1997) IEG-S Trade & Transport Facilitation (2003) IEG-S	IEG outcome rating: Satisfactory IEG outcome rating: Satisfactory	
Pre-CAS Lending	Energy 2 (2004) First Cadastre(1998)IEG-S Rural Inv and Srv (2002) IEG-S RISP Supplement (2004)	IEG outcome rating: Satisfactory IEG outcome rating: Satisfactory	
Lending	Public Financial Management TA (2006)	Approved in 2007	
	Competitiveness Enhancement (2003)  SR MS/S  PRSC 1 (2007)	Approved in 2003 Approved in 2007	ISR Rating IP: Moderately Satisfactory; DO: Satisfactory
	PRSC 1 (2007)	Approved in 2007 Approved in 2008	
	Road Sector Program Support (2007)	Approved in 2007	ISR Rating IP: Satisfactory; DO: Satisfactory



		Actual Results	Comments
		(as of December 2008)	
	Cadastre Suppl (2005)	Approved in 2005	
	RISP 2 (2006) ISR-S/S	Approved in 2006	ISR Rating IP: Satisfactory; DO: Satisfactory
	Health Services and Social Assistance	Approved in 2007	Rating as of 2008 DO: Satisfactory IP: Satisfactory
		2005	
		2005	
		2006	
		2007	
		2008	
	FSAP FLWP TA	2006	
	PSD/FSD TA/DIALOG	2007	
	ROSC ACCT & AUDIT FLWP TA - MD	2007	
	STRATEGY FOR TRANSPORT SECTOR	2008	
	FIRST #309: STRENGTHENING AA &		
	FIN REPORTING	2008	
	FIRST #318: DEVT OF MONEY MARKET		
	H	2008	
	PSD TA/DIALOGUE	2008	
1	Regional cooperation of the CIS7 : past	2005	
	experience and options for the future	1	
1	(English)		
	Moldova - Agricultural policy notes : public	2006	
	expenditures for agricultural development	1	
1	(English)		
	Moldova - Agricultural policy notes :	2006	
	agricultural land (English)		
	Moldova - Agricultural policy notes :	2006	
	agricultural markets (English)		
	Doing Business 2008 Moldova :	2007	
	comparing regulation in 178 economies	1	
	(English)		
	Rural productivity in Moldova : Managing	2007	
	natural vulnerability (English)  Land reform and farm restructuring in	2007	
	transition countries : the experience of	2007	
	Bulgaria, Moldova, Azerbaijan, and		
	Kazakhstan (English)		
	Moldova - Managing food safety and	2007	
	agricultural health : an action plan	2007	
	(English)		
	Moldova : results and the World Bank		
	(English)		
	The impact of energy price changes in	2007	***
	Moldova (English)		
	Moldova - Joint World Bank and IMF debt	2008	
	sustainability analysis (English)		
	Pillar 2: Improving acce		
<u>Objectives</u>	Better targeting of social assistance	No Progress	
]	Improvements in education to	No Progress	
]	improve access to education in line		
	with MDGs		
	Improvements in health	Some Progress	
	Improved access to water quality	Some Progress	
	and sanitation		
Major Outco			No Progress
<u>Measures</u>	<u>assistance</u>		
	1. Targeted essiel essietenes from	The baseline conducted in 2006	The CASCR notes timited Progress in addressing
	1. Targeted social assistance from 60-85%	concluded that 21% of the social	poverty among rural groups since 2002 and
	00 00 /0	assistance program is received by bottom	suggests a need to better understand growth and
		40% of the households. Better targeting is	poverty reduction
		expected in 2008	pototty loudolloit
		Oxposiod in E000	This review notes other accomplishments listed in
			the CASCR: social assistance targeting law passed
1			that consolidates social assistance programs into a
			single benefit targeting 10%; Design of a database
		1	of beneficiaries of social assistance programs- both



	Actual Results (as of December 2008)	Comments
		these were not target set out in the CAS.
		Given the poor results in the sector, the Progress is considered to be unsatisfactory
 B. Improvements in education to improve access to education in line with the MDGs		
1. NER in rural areas in primary to increase from 96% to 98%, in gymnasium from 92-95% and upper secondary from 28% to 35%	The CASCR notes that secondary enrollment increased 86% in 2004 to 88.5% in 2006. While there is an improvement, there is no reporting of target indicators.	No Progress  The CASCR states the Progress in educational access is inconclusive due to inadequate indicators to assess Bank performance and limited capacity of the Ministry of Youth in implementing programs.
Adopt a strategy to improve the quality of rural education	School network optimization strategy prepared. Unclear whether this targeted improving quality of rural schools and whether it was implemented	Limited Progress
Adopt a strategy to reduce drop out from compulsory schooling and continuation of poor rural students	School dropout rates increased from 21.8% in 2004 to 23.6% in 2006. But unclear what the drop out was in rural areas.	No Progress
Establishment of a framework for increasing accountability among education providers and greater community oversight	No evidence that a framework increasing accountability among education providers has been adopted , no evidence of greater community oversight	No Progress
Review plans for revision to general and vocational programs to increase relevance	No evidence that there has been revision of general and vocational programs	No Progress
Strategy to increase IT literacy 2. Gap in performance between rural and urban students in grade 6 survey of student performance to be reduced by 50%	No evidence of increased IT literacy  No data available to demonstrate reductions in gap between urban and rural students	No Progress Not rated
C. Improvements in Health		The CASCR notes that
Reduction of maternal and infant and U-5 mortality	Infant mortality reduced from 14.4 in 2003 to 11.8 in 2006; Under-five mortality reduced from 18 in 2003 to 14 in 2006. Maternal mortality reduced from 22 in 2003 to 16 in 2006. Mother to child transmission reduced from 13.3% in 2002 to 0% in 2006	Good Progress
Hospital restructuring plan implemented	No evidence that a hospital restructuring plan was implemented. The CASCR notes that good quality primary care is lacking with inefficiencies remaining in the hospital sector and number of vacant positions for family practitioners in rural health centers is high.	Not rated
Reduction of TB incidence and mortality	HIV/AIDS incidence increased at a decreasing rate. TB incidence Not Reported.	No Progress
Allocation to primary health care is maintained at no less than 35% of total public health		
Stabilization of HIV incidence and mortality from HIV	Mortality due to AIDS decreased from 100% in 2002 to 30% in 2005. Mortality due to TB has decreased from 15.9 (per 10k) in 2002 to 2007	Good Progress
Increase in percentage of population covered by essential health interventions including HIV prevention services	No evidence that the population covered by health services has increased	Not rated
Basic package of services for	Treatment of highly active anti-retroviral	Limited Progress



	Actual Results (as of December 2008)	Comments
vulnerable groups fully covered by public resources	has been made available to patients including Transnistria (area of high HIV incidence) and prison population. IDUs covered by harm reduction activities exceeded the registered IDIs. Prisons are covered with HIV/AIDS and STI prevention. The CASCR notes that while GoM contributes to health insurance of non-working population, there is still a considerable risk of poverty due to cost of illness among rural population and self employed	While the CASCR notes that HAART and treatment has been provided to patients in vulnerable areas, IDUs and prisons, there is not indication of the what percentage of vulnerable people are covered and whether HAART represents the basic package proposed in the CAS
Sustainable Government funding of priority national programs, including TB HIV	The CASCR note that GoM emphasized cost-efficient service delivery in primary care settings and spent more on primary care through IDA funds and donor assistance. No evidence however of that funding to key health concerns was sustainable	Limited Progress  While the Govt made efforts in the primary care area through its own funds, IDA and other donor funds, there is no evidence that the funding of key areas was sustainable and no explanation as to whether primary care was one of the primary areas that the Government had identified as a priority area for funding.
Norms and Standards for social care services	The MOH has demonstrated initiative and capacity by setting policy and developing an overall health strategy. Improvements in testing and information managed have resulted in increased incidence in detection of HIV but the overall Progress towards indicators is unclear	Some Progress
D. Improved access to water quality and sanitation		
Average of 16 hours per day in supply areas	Water supply per day increased to 18-24 hours in pilot areas, water consumption per capita increased almost twofold	Good Progress
2. Collection ratio to exceed 80%	Collection ratios in pilot areas ranged from 95% to 98%	Good Progress
Operational and maintenance costs covered by operating revenues		Good Progress
Cash operational and maintenance of water utilities covered by cash covered revenues	Cash operating revenues as a % of operating expenditure plus debt service ranged from 71% to 85% profit in 2007 compared with net operational losses in 2003	
Water tariffs adjusted for annual inflation	No specific evidence that tariffs were adjusted to inflation	Not rated
Regular water quality monitoring and reporting from MoH for benchmarking	100% of micobiological water quality samples in pilot areas. Previously 10% of the sample was contaminated. Unclear however whether there is systematic monitoring of water quality	Some Progress
5. Volumes of obsolete POPs repackaged and stored in a safe matter 35% of the stock pesticides and agreed % of obsolete PCBs	100% of the POPs have been managed/destroyed	Good Progress
Adopt new laws and regulations on POPs management, create analytical capacity, strengthen institutions and raise public awareness	A modern chemical management system has not yet been set up in Moldova due to project delays	No Progress
Strengthen PAs institutional capacity	See above	No Progress
 Create local ecological network	21,000 acres of land have been	Some Progress

		Actual Results (as of December 2008)	Comments
	in Prut River Basis with 200km of forest belts; increase afforested degraded lands with local community participation	afforested. The role of community participation has been unclear and there is no evidence of the creation of an ecological network	
	Adopt new laws and regulations on best agricultural practices, trained farmers and raised public awareness		
	Emissions Reductions Purchase Agreement within CDCF energy conservation project on about 300,000 tons of CO2	Soil conservation projects will lead to CO2 emissions of 4.3million tons over the next ten years. Unclear whether the emissions reduction purchase agreement within the CDCF energy project was contributing the target amount	Some Progress
Ongoing Pre-CAS	SIF (1999)	IEG Outcome rating: Satisfactory	
lending	Social Prot (1999)	IEG outcome rating: Moderately Satisfactory	
	SIF 2 (2004)		
	Youth Inclusion LIC (2004)	IEG outcome rating: Not rated	
	Gen Educ (1997) IEG-S	IEG Outcome rating: Satisfactory	
	HIF (2001) IEG-S	IEG Outcome rating: Satisfactory	
	AIDs Control (2003) ISR-S/S	ISR rating IP: Satisfactory, DO: Satisfactory	
	WS & San (2003) ISR-S/S	ISR rating IP: Satisfactory, DO: Satisfactory	
	Soil Conservation (2004) (carbon offset)		
	Ag Pollution Control (2004) (GEF)		
	Biodiversity Cons (2002) (GEF)		
New Lending	QUAL EDUC IN RUR AREAS OF MD	2006	Rating as of 2008 DO: Satisfactory IP: Satisfactory
	AVIAN FLU - MD	2006	Rating as of 2008 DO: Satisfactory IP: Moderately Satisfactory
	HEALTH SERVICES AND SOCIAL ASSISTANCE	2007	Rating as of 2008 DO: Satisfactory IP: Satisfactory
	PRSC	2007	Rating as of 2007 DO: Satisfactory IP: Satisfactory
	PRSC 2	2008	
AAA	NATIONAL WATER SUPPLY & SANITATION	2008	
	EDUC NOTE	2006	
	HEALTH NOTE	2006	
	POV UPDATE	2007	
	SOC PROT TA/DIALOGUE	2006	
	POV PROF UPDATE & PRSP SUPPORT TA	2006	
	LKD LEGAL EMPOWERMENT TA FOR POOR		
	CF ASSIST - CDM WORKSHOP	2008	
	Social assistance and poverty reduction in Moldova, 2001-2004		
	an impact evaluation (English)  Moldova : results and the World	2008	
-	Bank (English) Informal export barriers and poverty	2007	
	(English)	2005	
	Public Sector Governance And Con		
<u>Objectives</u>	Increase public sector capacity	Limited Progress	
	Lower corruption perception by increasing transparency of public money	Good Progress	



		Actual Results (as of December 2008)	Comments
Major Outcome	A Increase capacity of the public		
<u>Measures</u>	sector  1. Merit-based selection of civil servants (100% hires below PM based on merit)	Govt functional review completed, selected recommendations on reorganizing of govt bodies	Good Progress
	New civil service law with secondary legislation and quarterly reports on recruitment results	No evidence that a civil service law was passed	No Progress
	National Civil Service training system reorganized with adequate resources	No national civil service reform training has been put in place	No Progress
	Curriculum of Academy of Public Administration changed to reflect needs identified in quarterly report	No evidence that the curriculum academy was changed to reflect needs identified	No Progress
	Local Govt budgets reflect developmental and public service priorities and capture spending commitments		Some Progress
	Annual reports of Rayon Administration	No evidence on production of annual reports	No Progress
	Public Administration reform council and public administration/civil service mgmt. created	The Central policy Coordination Unit was established in the Government apparatus and leadership appointed in 2007 Development of new civil service job classification and grading framework underway to introduce transparent and uniform remuneration for civil servants	Good Progress
	Clear assignment of responsibilities and predictable revenue stream through rule-based transfer system and increased revenue generation at the local level	Development of new civil service job classification and grading framework underway to introduce transparent and uniform remuneration for civil servants	Some Progress
	Law on valuation comparable to international best practice	No evidence that a law on valuation was adopted	No Progress
	New property taxation concept introduced to stakeholders including local govts and civil society	No evidence that a new property taxation concept was introduced to stakeholders	No Progress
	B. Lower corruption perception by increasing transparency of public		The perception of corruption by TI declined at border crossings.
	Reduce single source procurement to 20% of the total number of contracts and to 15% of the total value contracts	Increased competition in public procurement through reduced single source procurement from 51% to 45% of the total value of contracts. Open tendering increased from 28-40% of awarded contracts	Good Progress
	Public reporting on procurement	No information on whether public reporting of procurement but the CASPR suggests that there was a public procurement law that was adopted to make improvements on the ground	Good Progress
	System in place to make information available to public on state budget cash allocations on a continuous basis		
	Annual budgets drawn up on the basis of MTEF reflecting govt priorities as indicated by the EGPRSP	MTEF institutionalized as strategic planning phase of the regular budget cycle through amendments to the Law on Budget System and Budget Process	Good Progress
	Continuous improvements in MTEF by extending coverage use of indicators and evaluation	MTEF now covers all national public resources including state budgets, local budgets and state social insurance budget, national health budget, donor funded investments. The coverage of	Good Progress



		Actual Results (as of December 2008)	Comments
		detailed sector expenditure plans increased from 3 sectors in 2005 to 6 in 2007	
Ongoing Pre-CAS lending	Pub Proc Infrastructure IDF (2004)	Last Rating DO: Satisfactory IP: Satisfactory	
New Lending	PUB FIN MGMT TA	2005	Rating as of 2008 DO: Satisfactory IP: Moderately Satisfactory
	PRSC	2007	Rating as of 2007 DO: Satisfactory IP: Satisfactory
	PRSC 2	2008	No ISR
AAA	BOTTOM UP GOVERNANCE NOTE	2005	
	PUBLIC EXPENDITURE REVIEW	2007	
	CIVIL SERV GOVERNANCE TA	2006	
	IDF-Capacity Building in Moldova's Public Sector Accounting	2007	
	LKD LEGAL EMPOWERMENT TA FOR POOR	2008	
	Changing the way our services are governed? Bottom-up governance and service delivery in Moldova: Opportunities and challenges for effective mechanisms of participation	2007	
	Moldova - Managing food safety and agricultural health : an action plan (English)	2007	
	Moldova : results and the World Bank (English)	2007	