



1. Project Data:		Date Posted : 05/14/2001	
PROJ ID: P002134		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name: Primary Education	Project Costs (US\$M)	158.4	103.3
Country: Nigeria	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	120	94.2
Sector(s): Board: ED - Primary education (64%), Central government administration (36%)	Cofinancing (US\$M)	4	4
L/C Number: C2191			
	Board Approval (FY)		92
Partners involved : Japan	Closing Date	06/30/1997	06/12/2000
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group:
Helen Abadzi	Laurie Effron	Alain A. Barbu	OEDST
2. Project Objectives and Components			
a. Objectives			
The project was intended to assist the government's program for : (a) upgrading the quality of primary education; (b) improving resource allocation; (c) increasing enrollments; (d) strengthening institutions; and (e) facilitating future planning. Though objectives were not revised, the scope and coverage of some nation -wide activities were scaled back due to capacity constraints and a deteriorating political environment . Community-based activities were also introduced to fill the gap of the faltering public institutions .			
b. Components			
The project financed (a) procurement and distribution of books and supplementary materials to all schools, and staff training in their care and use; (b) measures to ensure that the share of the federation account budgeted for the National Primary Education Fund (NPEF) was maintained at 65 percent of staff salaries, introduce cost sharing and cost recovery and reallocate budgets in favor of non -salaried items; (c) training of educational practitioners to improve curriculum delivery and of equipment to intensify the primary education enlightenment campaign; (d) vehicles and equipment and the training of administrative, finance and planning personnel, and reinforce procurement capacity; and (e) a management information system, training of statistics and planning staff, research and monitoring and evaluation.			
c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates			
The project had disbursed only 10% of its funds by the closing date in 1997 and received a three-year extension to 2000; by the end, 65% of the proceeds were disbursed, and US\$30 million were cancelled.			
3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:			
The objectives were not achieved . Data, which were deemed unreliable, point to a 2% annual increase in school populations, but the percentage of school -aged children entering school decreased . This was probably due to higher costs of primary education and the exploding prevalence of AIDS . The project provided millions of textbooks to students, but did not train teachers in their use, and quality of education has not significantly improved . A revolving fund to make the books available was abolished after parents protested against high costs and after very high leakage. Capacity building took place to some extent among community -run schools, but the management information system has not produced reliable educational and financial data .			
4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:			
Despite many problems, textbooks for grades 1-6 were distributed in all (36,000) schools and remain in use, a major project achievement. Also, many communities gained experience in monitoring schools and procuring materials for them. Educational achievement tests were standardized, and research on their use was completed and disseminated. Awareness campaigns to encourage parents to send children to school were held, but their influence on the population or the extent to which they reached their targets were not monitored .			
5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):			
The Bank overestimated the borrower's ability to carry out the project in light of the deteriorating economic and social circumstances. It was impossible to carry out the large-scale cascading model envisaged for teacher training on textbook use and student assessment . High staff turnover undermined the efforts to build skills in statistics,			

research, and evaluation at the national level. The military government of the country was highly centralized, and some regional initiatives could not be carried out. The severe shortage of counterpart funds further undermined project implementation efforts. Often teachers remained unpaid, and classroom activities were disrupted due to abandonment of the profession. Overall, extensive governance problems in the country greatly undermined implementation and made it very difficult to evaluate the achievements of the project.

6. Ratings:	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome:	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	
Institutional Dev.:	Modest	Modest	
Sustainability:	Likely	Unlikely	The most important product were the textbooks, and they have a limited life span.
Bank Performance:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Borrower Perf.:	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	
Quality of ICR:		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

-When there is lack of support from government economic deterioration in the country, implementation of basic services projects may only result in minimal gains. Access to and quality of education may not improve during implementation.

-In an environment of strong centralization, poor governance, and loss of trust in Government, the most successful interventions may be those with substantial involvement from communities. Similarly, the use of alternative institutions - parastatals - for service delivery, may be the most effective way to achieve results in an environment as previously described.

- Though textbook revolving funds are used in many parts of the world, they are not sustainable in an environment where textbook costs are high and mismanagement is severe.

8. Assessment Recommended? Yes No

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The ICR is frank and describes the problems of the project in considerable detail.