



## INDONESIA<sup>1</sup>

### Overview

The National Education System includes: basic education, secondary education and higher education. In addition there are distinctions between formal and non-formal education, as well as education run by public and private providers.

The vocational training sector includes programs conducted under the Directorate Courses and Trainings - Ministry of Education and Culture (MoEC) or those conducted under the Directorate General of Directorate General Training and Productivity - Ministry of Manpower (MoM). Various other technical ministries and industries also undertake training to meet their specific needs either through their own training agencies or through private providers.

### Indonesia National Qualifications Framework

Indonesia confirmed a national qualifications framework under presidential decree in 2012. The Indonesian Qualification Framework (IQF) provides nine qualification levels with each level based in four main dimensions (a) job skills, (b) science or knowledge comprehension, (c) capacity to select and apply methods and knowledge and (d) management skills. The framework has a strong focus on equivalency and recognizing all pathways to obtaining qualifications and promotes recognition of prior learning.

An agency responsible for governing and monitoring the implementation of IQF has not been established. The IQF has not been linked to any qualifications framework.

The following overview of quality assurance relates specifically to the skills training sector under the purview of the Ministry of Manpower and its related agencies.

### Quality assurance mechanisms – Ministry of Manpower

#### Accreditation (Approval) of qualifications – Ministry of Manpower

The Ministry of Manpower is a government department and one of its key areas of focus is improving manpower skills competency and productivity.

#### *Approval*

The Ministry of Manpower is the ministry responsible for the management and coordination of competency standards development. However, the Ministry devolves responsibility for the actual

---

<sup>1</sup> This overview is based on the Indonesia Report on Standards and Qualifications (2015) prepared by a team of Indonesian experts with support from the World Bank. The Report and its overview expand on the original submission by Indonesia for the East Asia Summit Vocational Education and Training Quality Assurance Framework Project managed by Australia Commonwealth Government in 2012.

development of the standards and qualifications to the relevant technical Ministries (18 ministries), while maintaining oversight of the process.

Competency standards have been developed since 1996 based on the model of occupational skills standards (ILO-MOSS). Since 2006 the development of national standards have been based on the regional model for competency standards (ILO-RMCS). However they have only recently been advanced enough to be packaged into national qualifications.

The Ministry of Manpower has a list of national competencies and qualifications accessible on their website (and in hard copy). Both the Ministry of Manpower and the relevant technical Ministry maintain the competencies. In each technical ministry there is a competency standards committee who has one function, to monitor compliance with the standards of competence in accordance with industry needs.

It is expected that competency standards, clusters of competencies and qualifications that are derived from them will be reviewed at least every five years, although this has not always been the case. The development of a revised template has delayed some reviews.

### *Relationship to standards*

The competency standards are:

- Based on ILO-RMCS which includes competency standards template (however only core and electives are utilized and not functional competencies [as per ILO model])
- Proposed by technical ministry and developed by stakeholders
- Processed through national convention among stakeholders
- Endorsed by ministerial decree of Minister of Manpower and endorsed by relevant Minister<sup>2</sup>.
- Regulated and implemented by technical Minister.

The competency standards have been developed based on the needs of national industry/users. The development process for competency standards involves national representative stakeholders, so it is not for specific industry needs. Competency standard setting can be done by sector approach, work area, or job title/occupation. Up to the end of 2014 there were about 406 competency standards in 9 sectors.

The competency standards are based on the notion of competence, and include individual units of competency. Competence is defined as the knowledge, skills and attitude to be applied in the workplace. The competency standards describe specific tasks. Ideally the competency standards are to address all industry areas, although this has not been achieved as of yet.

In principle, the preparation of national competency standards must have equality with international standards therefore developing of national competency standards can be done with the adoption or adaptation approach to the international standards.

Employability skills are embedded in individual competencies. *Competency standards* is the collective term.

---

<sup>2</sup> The Minister of Manpower signs off on the qualification, and the relevant Minister signs off on the competencies.



The competency standards development process includes:

- Establishment of a standards committee (made up of ministry representatives)
- Establishment of two working groups (drafting team made up of industry representatives) and verification team (made up of government and industry representatives)

The standards committee is responsible for:

- Developing a National Competency Standards master plan
- Appointment of the development team and verification team
- Proposal assessment for National Competency Standards development
- Execution of conventions
- Monitoring and review of National Competency Standards.

The process includes:

- National Competency Standards needs identification (e.g. functional analysis, DACUM)
- National Competency Standards development
- Verification of first draft related to competencies, content
- Pre-convention – which is a workshop with all stakeholders/participants from relevant industry (but the numbers are limited). It is focussed on the substance of national competency standards including mapping of competency and units of competency.
- External verification by Ministry of Manpower related to structure and integrity of qualification and confirming that the process has been followed.
- Convention – which is more broad based consultation but the number of participants is more than the pre-convention. The principle of convention is final validation of the national competency standards with a focus on substance.
- Endorsed by the Ministries.

The relevant regulations explain how functional analysis is to occur. The regulations and guidelines explain the number and make up of conventions. The Ministry of Manpower has developed a range of guidelines: developing of standard competency, mapping of competency, writing of standard competency, mechanism of convention and pre convention, adoption and adaptation of competency standard, review of competency standard, and a Standard Operational Procedure.

There is a standard template based on the requirements specified in the ILO Regional Model for Competency Standards guidelines. The template includes: code, title, unit description, elements, performance criteria, range of variables, and evidence guide.

The Ministry of Manpower has set-up the framework of competency based training design and implementation (and for curriculum), and facilitating the implementation (MoM Regulation Number 8/2014). Based on the framework, the individual providers develop curriculum. How far the individual providers are able to do competency based training will be accredited by Training Provider Accreditation Authority, established by Ministry of Manpower as an independent body.

## Quality assurance mechanisms –



## Lembaga Akreditasi Lembaga Pelatihan Kerja (LA-LPK)

The LA-LPK is the registering body for the vocational institutions (Training Provider Accreditation Authority). The LA-LPK is made up of 11 members representing various training institutions, government, professionals, experts, and key associations of industry and institutions.

### Registration (Approval) of training providers -LA-LPK

The main functions of LA-LPK are deciding national policy and establishing standards for training provider accreditation; establishing LA-LPK representative (Accreditation Committee) in each province in Indonesia; conducting training provider accreditation and surveillance across Indonesia by empowering the accreditation committee; conducting assessor accreditation training and licensing them as a partner of LA-LPK; promoting awareness of accreditation both for private training providers and government-owned training institutions; building cooperation with national and international institutions for standardization and harmonizing accreditation across south east ASEAN and internationally.

There are 34 provinces and there are accreditation committees (KAs) in 30 provinces, but the final decisions are all made by the Accreditation Committee (LA). The Accreditation Committee is made up of 7 members. The role of the Accreditation Committee is defined by the Ministry of Manpower – and the duration of the membership is 3 years.

Vocational institutions include:

- LPKs (Lembaga Pelatihan Kerja) – which is a generic term for private training institutions
- BLKs (Balai Latihan Kerja) – which are government owned vocational institutions (national or provincial)
- BLKLN (Balai Latihan Kerja Luar Negeri) – which are generally privately run institutions for those intending for overseas workers.

The registration requirements and processes are regulated through legislation and a series of ministerial regulations. The roles and responsibilities of the LA-LPK are outlined in the regulations. LA-LPK is responsible for the monitoring of training providers.

Training providers can apply to an LA or the Accreditation Committee. An assessment team is allocated. The assessment team review evidence submitted and also arrange site visits. Note that there are only 100-200 assessors (auditors) and there is a need for about 500 assessors to be able to effectively address all vocational training institutions.

It is not mandatory to be accredited (approved) to be a LPK but it is mandatory to be accredited (approved) to be a BLKLN. Both BLK and LPKs must be registered at labor affairs of the local government office in regency or city by submitting a legal status of institution. The labor affairs of local government office will release a letter of approval, valid for 2 years.

Training providers register at the local government office (labor affair bureau); training is implemented according to the management standards of the training provider; and training providers propose to be accredited by the relevant accreditation body as a training provider (LA-LPK).

During the approval process the assessment team reviews 8 quality standards for training providers:

1. Competency – relates to the competencies and qualifications that they wish to deliver, program design

2. Curriculum training – focusses on how the competencies/qualifications will be delivered and assessed, the syllabus
3. Materials for training
4. Assessment, including the assessment instruments
5. Instructor and assessor as well as support staff – assessors need to be approved by BNSP - the institution is also recognised for assessment purposes by BNSP. Students generally go to a LSP for assessment and certification. The training institutions do their own assessments, and the certificate is internal.
6. Infrastructure for training – theory rooms, practical rooms, library, instructor rooms, equipment, materials, toilets, prayer room, sports facilities, safety and security, ownership or lease for at least 3 years.
7. Marketing of institution and training – planning and evaluation, implementation, vision and mission, long/middle/short term objectives, letter of approval from local government (to use premises as a training institution), standard operating procedures, organisational structure, records management and reporting.
8. Financial budget – planning, yearly budget, financial reports.

All training providers who want to be accredited (approved) by LA-LPK have to propose by sending a letter of requirement. They have to enclose documents such as a copy of certification of establishing training provider (LPK), fulfill an accreditation form that consists of 100 questions and enclose supporting documentation related to the forms, along with self-assessment documents.

The providers are monitored throughout the 3-year accreditation period. The aim is to have a site visit once a year. Low performing providers can be sanctioned but not removed from the approval list. They are monitored for improvement. Sanctions include refusal of permission to issue certificates. Information of poor performing providers is not made public. Providers submit information regarding number of students, gender and age.

There is a list of providers on the LA-LPK website but it does not provide specific information as to the qualifications that they are approved to deliver.

Total number of LPKs (Training provider) across Indonesia that registered at the Labor Affairs of a local government office are about 7500 LPK, plus 250 BLK owned by government and 450 BLK-LN. Up to now the number of LPK that have been accredited is approximately 1100 LPKs and 320 BLK-LN.

---

### 3.4 Educator requirements –LA-LPK

Instructors are the responsibility of the training providers. There is no register of instructors. The Instructor required standards include:

- Competence relevant to the technical task and teaching pedagogy
- Assessing competency from LSP (BNSP requirements)
- 12 years minimum service in a high school

There is a task force unit under MOM to monitor and develop instructor competencies including content and methodology of teaching/ facilitating. Actually most instructor training providers do not have a certificate of methodology even though they are competent in relevant subject content.



### 3.5 Transnational/cross border education– LA-LPK

It is possible to deliver off-shore training programs, but there are none as of yet. Incoming providers can be assessed against the standards, but it is not mandatory for a LPK to be registered. Up to now there is no mutual recognition inter-nation arrangements related to recognition of qualifications within ASEAN countries, even though there is a lot of cooperation between national training providers with institutions of other countries. LA-LPK does not recognize other country standards unless there is an agreement between the user and the overseas qualification certificate.

## Quality assurance mechanisms - Badan Nasional Sertifikasi Profesi (BNSP)

BNSP is an independent body responsible to the President who has the authority as a certification authority in charge of implementing the certification of personnel and professional competence for labor.

### 3.2 Registration (Approval) of assessment providers - BNSP

BNSP is the registering/licensing body of assessment providers (LSP= Professional Certification Body). The functions are to:

- Give license to LSP by process of accreditation to ensure and maintain performance of the certification bodies.
- Ensure implementation of the Qualification Framework certification scheme is in place for assessment and certification.
- Approve the development of the certification scheme, especially for clusters and competency units.
- Survey LSP to ensure performance of LSP services in certification assessment.
- Control and monitor certification implementation.

The licensing/registration of a LSP is legislated by Law 13/2003, Government Decree 23/2004, and Government Decree 31/2006. The criteria that applies to the licensing/registering body (BNSP) includes:

- Government Decree 23/2004, which includes governance and structure of the organization (BNSP), management, personnel and the functions.
- Benchmarking to international accreditation body requirements for competency assessment i.e.: ILO-RMCS and ISO 19011.

The process for registration includes application and review by a team of licensing assessors.

BNSP is the awarding body and approves assessment provider/certification bodies (LSP). The conditions and criteria include BNSP Guidelines 201 & 202 which are traceable to ISO 17024/2003. There are quality standards or requirements apart from BNSP Guidelines, i.e.:

- Specific quality standards to be benchmarked in assessment, including product or services quality standards.
- Specific workplace quality standards or simulated workplace assessment venue/centre.

In short, LSPs are to demonstrate:



- A system of office and quality management
- Impartiality
- Certification scheme<sup>3</sup>
- A venue for assessment (TUKs [competency assessment centre]), which are to be workplaces or simulated workplaces
- Access to assessors registered by BNSP
- Assessment tools and assessment processes
- Record keeping capacity

Support documents that assist assessment providers (LSPs) to adhere to quality standards, including: BNSP Guidelines to manage LSP organization, assessment and surveillance.

The assessment provider (LSP) is to ensure that they maintain their quality of services, and are to regularly conduct an internal audit. BNSP follows up at audit by reviewing the internal audit non-conformity report and CAR (corrective action request) including implementation of the corrective action.

BNSP manages and monitors registration of providers or awarding bodies by assessment (audit), surveillance and oversight. BNSP undertakes an annual audit. There are two types of audit: regular and unannounced.

LSP also reports all assessment activity (i.e. completions at cluster or qualification level) to BNSP every 6 months.

Assessment provider outcomes are reported to BNSP every 6 months; some are reported in real time and the public has direct access to the BNSP website. BNSP does not report audit or surveillance outcomes on their website.

There is a public register of assessment providers (LSPs) for specific qualification/professional status. However, the assessment venues are not listed.

### **Assessment**

The assessors (licensed by LSP and registered with BNSP) undertake the competency assessments. Assessments are third party assessments, although an MOU has been signed with senior secondary vocational schools (SMKs) for first party assessments (an internal assessment undertaken by another assessor who was not the trainer). There are over 20,000 assessors registered with BNSP.

BNSP has a range of strategies in place to ensure the consistency of assessor judgements:

- BNSP encourages LSP first party certification to certify their students during their education. Assessments apply various methods i.e: formative, summative and holistic.
- To ensure and maintain quality and impartiality of the LSP first party assessments, BNSP conducts assessment, direct observation, and surveillance.
- To ensure consistency BNSP approves the certification schemes, assessment tools and the assessors.

---

<sup>3</sup> Certification schemes include code of practice, benchmarking and technical requirements, industry requirements, and qualification information.



- To ensure standardization of national assessments, BNSP coordinates with industry and Competent Authorities to develop and approve National Qualification Certification Schemes.
- Every LSP first party shall conduct internal audits, while BNSP carries out external verification and audits.

There are not yet consensus or statistical moderation strategies in place either internally or externally.

BNSP provide LSPs with unique numbered parchments (certificates) for issuance by the LSP. Data of completions are sent to BNSP on a six monthly cycle, however completion of competencies is kept at the LSP level. At the moment, BNSP is developing real time reporting by e-report and some LSP have already implemented the e-report.

### 3.4 Assessors requirements - BNSP

There are minimum requirements for assessors, which are outlined in the BNSP legislation and guidelines. Assessors are to have assessment competencies (plan and organize assessment, develop assessment tools, assess competencies – e.g. competency clusters) and are to come from industry and hold the relevant competencies (although an industry expert can be used in the assessment process).

BNSP is the body that monitors and manages recognition/approval of assessors. BNSP undertakes surveillance of the assessors to maintain their competencies. There is a proficiency test (standardized, paper-based) undertaken each year and every 3 years assessors go through a recognition of current competency process to be re-recognized. There are 22,431 registered assessors. BNSP maintains the register and LSPs use this list for assessment purposes.

### 3.5 Transnational/cross border education - BNSP

BNSP does not prohibit LSPs from delivering their services in other nations. Some qualifications are recognizes in some countries including ASEAN countries and some country business partners. BNSP’s quality standards/requirements apply to transnational delivery. Qualifications are benchmarked through ASEAN MRAs (if they are in place)

## Quality indicators/data – MoMP, LA-LPK, BNSP

The Ministry of Manpower (competency standards development team) collects very little data. The LA-LPK collects a range of data however BNSP (being focused on assessment) indicates that some fields are irrelevant, e.g. recognition of prior learning, program design.

## Additional information – MoMP, LA-LPK, BNSP

Information for this summary was provided by the following representatives.

Name	Role	Organization
Dr M. Moedjiman	Chairman of National Training Council (independent body)	Ministry of Manpower





Mr Muchtar Azis	Responsibility for national competency standard	Ministry of Manpower
Mr Aris Hermanto		Ministry of Manpower
Mr Darmawansyah		Ministry of Manpower
Mr Agus Susilo		Ministry of Manpower
MrZakir	Quality control of accreditation and standard development	Member of LA-LPK
Mr Didik Sumbodo	Chairman	LA-LPK
Mr Surono	Chairman of Commission for Planning and Institutional Harmonization.	BNSP
Ibu Mega Santoso		