



<b>1. Project Data :</b>
<b>OEDID:</b> C2094
<b>Project ID:</b> P001515
<b>Project Name:</b> Education Sector Reinforcement Project
<b>Country:</b> Madagascar
<b>Sector:</b> Primary Education
<b>L/C Number:</b> C2094-MAG
<b>Partners involved :</b> GTZ, UNDP, OPEC
<b>Prepared by:</b> Rebecca Macina
<b>Reviewed by:</b> L. Dove
<b>Group Manager:</b> G. Ingram
<b>Date Posted:</b> 04/29/1999

<p><b>2. Project Objectives, Financing, Costs and Components :</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● To start to implement Madagascar's education development program designed to improve the quality and efficiency of the education system .</li> </ul> <p>Objectives:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Strengthen the administrative, planning and monitoring capabilities of the sector;</li> <li>Improve the quality of education at all levels, especially levels 1 and 2, and adopting cost-efficiency measures based on a tight control of expenses to free resources for use on quality improvement;</li> <li>Regulate student flows through the system to encourage the qualitative and quantitative development of basic education while improving quality at other levels;</li> <li>Introduce new higher education programs, including vocationally -oriented short cycles, flexible enough to be adopted rapidly to the country's needs;</li> <li>Reorganize the vocational training and technical education systems under a coordinating structure which will establish a close link between training and employment requirements .</li> </ol> <p>Components:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Develop sector administrative, management, and planning capacities .           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>--Conduct a study to make better use of sector personnel and improve sector management .</li> <li>--Train education planners and statisticians locally and abroad .</li> <li>--Install modern equipment for treatment of educational statistics .</li> <li>--Reorganize the Department of Planning and Educational Programming .</li> <li>--Carry out studies on (1) Preventive maintenance of school and administrative buildings, and (2) Book distribution and cost recovery .</li> </ul> </li> <li>Improve the quality of basic and general secondary education .           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>--Establish a new department for educational activities .</li> <li>--Strengthen the role of inspectors, education advisors, and headmasters in teacher support and educational administration.</li> <li>--Enhance teaching staff effectiveness through pre -service and in-service training .</li> <li>--Provide textbooks and teacher's guides .</li> <li>--Upgrade laboratories .</li> <li>--Introduce environmental, nutritional, and population education as subjects in school curricula .</li> </ul> </li> <li>Strengthen higher education .           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>--Assist in setting up two Higher Technological Institutes .</li> <li>--Strengthen the administrative and planning capabilities of the Ministry of Higher Education and the universities .</li> <li>--Prepare new curricula for universities .</li> <li>--Support the establishment of an Employment Information System to provide students with information and advice on employment and career possibilities .</li> </ul> </li> </ol> <p>In order to circumvent poor management by the administration, PRAGAP (Reinforcement and Improvement of</p>
--

Administrative and Pedagogical Management) was adopted at Mid-Term. Some of the features were:

- Devolution of school management to local levels .
- Construction of schools using mainly local materials .
- Parental involvement in making choices in education for their children .

Costs: Appraisal Estimate: \$55 million  
Actual: \$61.3 million

### 3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives :

The ICR states that in recent years, some progress has been achieved in redistribution of public expenditures from wages and social services (in higher education) to non-salary expenditures for quality inputs . Planning and management functions were strengthened through technical assistance, staff training, provision of materials and support for key operations. This resulted in the development of micro-planning capacity at provincial and district levels, competent staff (from the pool of existing administrative staff) trained and assigned to planning offices at district level, production of educational statistics, and studies on schooling, participation, and efficiency . A pedagogical unit for the development of teaching methods and materials based on classroom research and experimentation was established and a total of about 3.0 million textbooks were produced, printed and distributed to all primary and lower secondary schools. In addition, reference books, posters and other pedagogical materials were distributed. The project established two Higher Institutes of Technology (IST).

### 4. Significant Achievements :

After Mid-Term Review, to circumvent implementation problems, the borrower adopted the PRAGAP program for strengthening management and improving quality of primary education at the immediate level of the schools and school children. The main conclusions from impact studies were: (a) more than 95% of all communities with a public primary school have committed themselves to implementing the school-based improvement contracts; (b) implementation of contracts (prepared and negotiated locally) is satisfactory in more than 80% of the 2,600 schools having contracts; (c) about US\$2.0 million has been spent on construction materials for the schools, averaging about US \$800.00 per school; (d) in the 20 PRAGAP district offices, grade 1 enrollment increased by 28% between 1993-1994 and 1995-1996 (compared to 15% nationwide), and overall enrollment increased by 15% (compared to 7% nationwide).

### 5. Significant Shortcomings :

Targets for increased enrollment and internal efficiency at all levels were not achieved . From 1987-1988 to 1997-1998, new intakes had increased by only 2.6% per year at primary level compared to the target of 4.0% per year. New intakes decreased by 0.2 % per year at the secondary level compared to a targeted increase of 2.0% . At the tertiary level, intakes increased by 2.8% per year compared to a target of 1%, and by 5.0% per year at the technical school level compared to a target of 0.5%. Throughout the period 1988-1997, the percentage of repeaters remained in the 30-35% range at primary level compared to a targeted maximum of 10% by the end of 1994, and at about 20% at secondary level. Examination success rates remained unacceptably low : 42% for the primary school certificate in 1996-1997, and 22% for the baccalaureate in 1995-1996. A mechanism for textbook cost recovery was introduced under the project, but had to be discontinued because of parents' limited capacity to pay . No alternative solution to textbook cost was introduced . The Employment Information System was not implemented .

Recommendations of the study (completed in 1992) of the management of Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education were not implemented, particularly those regarding personnel management at the primary and secondary levels. A Structural Adjustment requirement to freeze public sector recruitment impeded the hiring of newly trained teachers. Between 1990 and 1997, the budget for primary education decreased in real and nominal terms, a decline that continued even when enrollments at primary level started to increase in 1995/96, and public expenditures for education over GDP decreased (from 2.3% in 1991 to 1.4% in 1997). A follow-up meeting with the Region explored the difficulties in achieving project objectives when confronted with political instability and an almost nonexistent infrastructure for education. While the region concedes that the project design was too demanding and risky, nevertheless, it emphasizes that without the Bank's presence, the education system may have collapsed .

6. Ratings:	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
<b>Outcome:</b>	Satisfactory	Marginally Satisfactory	The project's objectives were to improve the quality and the internal and external efficiencies of the education system; however, some objectives were only partially met or not met at all. Without the improvements made through PRAGAP, a satisfactory rating would not have been

			warranted.
<b>Institutional Dev .:</b>	Substantial	Modest	Institutional development was substantial at local level through PRAGAP but modest at central level.
<b>Sustainability :</b>	Likely	Uncertain	The ICR states that commitment to reforms declined and that fulfillment of project developmental objectives suffered from the inability of Government to increase, in real and nominal terms, expenditures for primary education . ICR does not suggest that the government will be able to reverse this situation, despite the recent approval of a follow-up project.
<b>Bank Performance :</b>	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
<b>Borrower Perf .:</b>	Satisfactory	Unsatisfactory	The Borrower failed to provide counterpart funds on time. Covenants were complied with partially or with delays. Government did not increase budgets for primary education while allowing increased expenditures for higher education .
<b>Quality of ICR :</b>		Satisfactory	

### 7. Lessons of Broad Applicability :

#### ICR

There is a need for a gradualist (planned and phased) approach to the devolution of responsibility and resources to the local level, accompanied by appropriate capacity building measures . Experience under PRAGAP shows that management capacity has to be developed first at regional level before it can be delegated to district level . In the 20 pilot districts where PRAGAP has been implemented since 1993, it is now clear that the day-to-day management of the community-based development process has to be delegated to the sub -district level , supported by appropriate technical specialists from the District Office .

#### OED

When the Bank decides to address education reforms at every level of the system, the policy framework and institutions necessary to implement the reforms and manage the project need to be in place .

Considering the scope and magnitude of activities with which the newly established Pedagogical Unit was charged, the project should have included a provision for follow-up or monitoring of the agency's activities and evaluation of pre-service and in-service teacher training .

Policies to increase the supply of teachers need to be coordinated with public sector management reforms designed to limit public expenditures on salaries .

### 8. Audit Recommended? Yes No

**Why?** Evaluate long-term outcomes with follow-up operations and impact of donor assistance .

### 9. Comments on Quality of ICR :

ICR provides most of the relevant information and a good list of indicators, however, it fails to provide the contextual background to explain why many objectives were not able to be met .