MENA MDTF
Second Annual Report
December, 2014
# Table of Contents

Foreword
Acknowledgements

## Section 1: Introduction and Strategic Focus

Section 2: Project Implementation and Results

Section 3: Financial Status

Section 4: Challenges and Opportunities Going Forward

## ANNEXES

### ANNEX I: Activity Summaries

- Service Delivery in Jordan's Health and Education Sectors
- Syrian Damage and Needs Assessment
- Parliamentary Strengthening in Morocco and Tunisia
- Technical Assistance to Yemen for Post National Dialogue Transition
- Service Delivery Support in Tunisia
- Capacity and Design for Inclusive Groundwater Management in Morocco
- Strengthening Accountability for Improved Education Services in Jordan
- Transforming the Road Sector in Tunisia

### ANNEX II: Results Stories

- Supporting Economic Governance Transition in Tunisia and Morocco
- Yemen Decentralization and Local Governance Initiative
- Gender Informed Design in Morocco and Yemen
- Increasing Knowledge – Learning of SSN and ALMPs in MENA
Foreword

Since the political events of early 2011, the Middle East and North Africa region has experienced tremendous change. The road taken by each country since the so-called “Arab Spring” has been quite different, as each nation shapes its own ideas of what “transformation” means. Tunisia’s democratic elections and ability to largely overcome many internal divisions has so far been a beacon of promise for the region. Morocco continues to pursue gradual change. Egypt has seen many powerful changes of direction. And in Iraq, Syria, and Libya, we witness armed conflict as different groups vie for power.

The hopes and dreams expressed on the streets throughout the Arab world in 2011 have not died, but the challenges to realize those hopes and dreams have become even more immense. On the economic front, uncertainty continues to touch the entire region, dampening growth and investment relative to the region’s real potential. The weak Euro area and resulting reduction in trade, remittances and tourism have exacerbated the economic challenges in the region. In parallel, it is imperative not to forget the tremendous potential of the region, with its young, well educated population, its closeness to major European and Asian markets and its natural resources and fertile lands. With visionary leadership, right policies, a culture of tolerance and sound economic reforms, this potential could be unlocked to deliver a brighter future for the next generation.

As we witness political, security, identity, and governance challenges, and bearing in mind the potential of the region, various stakeholders including the development community are trying to address the obstacles to enhancing shared prosperity. There is a need for macroeconomic stabilization and related economic reforms, and much higher levels of external financing – public and private. The Middle East and North Africa Multi-donor Trust Fund (MENA MDTF) financed currently by the governments of Denmark, Finland, Norway and the UK and administered by the World Bank, is an element of the required external support. A relatively small trust fund currently at a little less than US$16 million, the MENA MDTF nonetheless plays a catalytic role in helping deliver reform. It provides technical assistance grants for knowledge exchange, design and implementation support, data collection and analysis in areas where country stakeholders and the Bank have identified clear and urgent need for increasing capacity. For example, in Jordan and Morocco, the MDTF is providing assistance to improve governance and service delivery of critical sectors such as health and education. In Tunisia and Morocco, the MDTF is providing support to strengthen parliamentary capacity and more extensive and effective public consultation. In Egypt, the MDTF is supporting the government with guidance related to subsidy reform.

The MENA MDTF has been in operation for over two years. We have seen real contributions to reform, as shown in this Annual Report. We have undergone several donor reviews, the results of which have been positive and encouraging. Denmark and Norway have provided the MDTF with renewed contributions; other donors are considering the same.

I thank the donors for their support, and the clients and teams for their perseverance under such challenging circumstances. I look forward as we continue to do our best to rise to the challenges ahead.

Gerard Byam, Acting Regional Vice President, Middle East and North Africa, World Bank
Acknowledgements

This Annual Report was prepared by the Program Coordination Unit of the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) Multi-Donor Trust Fund (MDTF), under the guidance of Gerard Byam, Acting Regional Vice President of the Middle East and North Africa Department (MNA), World Bank. The Coordination Unit would like to thank the donors – Denmark, Finland, Norway, the UK – for their financial support and technical guidance provided throughout the year, and specifically during the annual Program Council Meetings. The Coordination Unit would also like to thank the MDTF-funded activity task team leaders (TTLs) for their input, in particular for providing updates on work completed and data for the results framework. We thank the MENA MDTF Technical Review Committee for its time and effort during activity selection and review.
Section 1: Introduction and Strategic Focus

The overall objective of the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) Multi-Donor Trust Fund (MDTF) is to provide catalytic donor support, through a World Bank-administered trust fund, to countries in the region that are currently undergoing historic transition and reform. The MENA MDTF is designed to be in full alignment with the World Bank Group's MENA strategy for the institution's response to the transitions underway in the region, and therefore the activities funded demonstrate clear linkages to relevant current and future Bank-funded operations and programs on the ground. In line with the four building blocks of the Bank's regional framework for engagement in response to the transitions underway in the region, developed through the Bank's dialogue with governments and other key local stakeholders and partners, the MDTF focuses on the following interlinked components:

1) **Strengthening the Governance Framework**, in particular increasing transparency and accountability measures for the creation of responsive states that can be held accountable for their actions, in particular, service delivery and effective, efficient use of public monies;

2) **Increasing Social and Economic Inclusion** of disadvantaged groups (e.g. youth, women, the poor, rural populations, minorities) through measures which provide opportunities for enhanced voice and citizen participation in decision-making (including at the local level) as well as economic measures which help ensure more
inclusive growth, for example, access to infrastructure services in underserved areas and targeted safety nets;

3) **Creating Jobs** for the unemployed and underemployed, including for youth and women, by: a) providing an enabling environment for a dynamic and competitive private sector that supports opportunity, innovation and entrepreneurship, and, b) supporting actions that help match the demands of the job market with a well-equipped, appropriately educated and nimble labor force.

4) **Accelerating Sustainable Growth** through short and long-term policy actions that promote climate-friendly growth in recognition of the stresses on the Region’s natural resources and given its conflicts and fragility.

Initial focus areas were deliberately left broad to allow for a variety of subtopics to be treated within these themes as guided by country demands. However, two immediate areas of focus were anticipated to be (and to some extent have been) employment and social inclusion, with an emphasis on youth.

The MDTF is designed as a World Bank-implemented programmatic trust fund that supports technical assistance for project preparation, analytical studies, capacity building and knowledge sharing. “Soft” activities such as capacity building and knowledge sharing are the glue that holds together reform programs and provide the critical underpinnings for broad participation and sound institutions, yet these are often not funded through “hard” financing and investments. The MDTF contributes funding for these very activities, ensuring that the Bank and the broader donor community are helping governments, service providers and citizens “do different things and do things differently”. In addition to working closely with country counterparts, the MENA MDTF requires that all proposed activities have been discussed with key partners working on the ground (e.g. bilateral donors, international financial institutions or IFIs, in particular the African Development Bank or AfDB, and the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development or EBRD) to help ensure appropriate leveraging and synergies of activities, and to avoid duplication of effort and donor resources.

A Program Council, chaired by the Bank’s Regional Vice President or the Director of Strategy and Operations and at which donors committing to a contribution of $1 million have a seat, is the governing body of the MDTF. The Program Council provides strategic guidance on the overall MENA MDTF policy framework; reviews implementation progress/impact of activities; reviews and approves changes in scope of MENA MDTF activities; and, reviews issues referred by the Program Coordination Unit (PCU). The PCU comprises the Program Manager of the MDTF, an analyst and a Resource Management Specialist, and receives cross-support from the Bank’s MNA Results Team – all working under the guidance of the MNA Director of Strategy and Operations. A World Bank Review Committee is chaired by the Director of Strategy and Operations.
and is supported by the Program Manager, and includes representatives from relevant country units, the MNA Chief Accounting Officer, and the regional trust funds, quality and results coordinators/managers. The review committee meets two to four times a year to select proposals generated by a Call for Proposals.

This is the second Annual Report of the MENA MDTF. This section has laid out the strategic framework of the MDTF. The second section presents project snapshots and results. Next, information on the financial status of the trust fund is provided. The report ends with some forward-looking thoughts and next steps. The Annex includes 2-page summaries of the eight activities approved since the release of the First Annual Report, as well as four Results Stories of activities that have recently closed.
Section 2: Project Implementation and Results

Types of Activities Funded

The MDTF finances a broad array of activities to support the four thematic drivers of the trust fund and the Bank’s regional strategy to enhance shared prosperity in the region, including for example:

- **Project preparation**, including project design, to adapt best practice to local and country circumstances for greatest effectiveness, including timely and transparent delivery of results.
- **Institutional strengthening and capacity building**, including expert advisory services, training, and human resource or organizational development. This could also include the actual contracting of partners (e.g. training agents, auditors, NGOs, local governments) during initial stages of implementation of new procedures/reforms, alongside which government agencies and public service providers can receive “on-the-job” training.
- **South-South (S-S) knowledge exchange**, in particular with countries that have undergone transition.
- **Landmark conferences and workshops** on the thematic components or sub-components.
- **Outreach activities** that provide a platform for dialogue between key stakeholders (e.g. CSOs, youth groups, media, religious groups, NGOs) and also that enable the capture and dissemination of good practices, using a variety of communication/media tools.
- **Twinning arrangements** (e.g. between institutions in MENA and in OECD countries).
- **Research and analysis** produced into user-friendly and implementation-oriented studies/policy notes. This could include data collection (e.g. surveys) to help fill knowledge gaps and to inform policy interventions and program/project design. Release of new data is expected to yield a wealth of information that when analyzed, can help guide policy.
- Design of **management information systems**.
- Design of **monitoring systems and impact evaluations** of government/donor-funded programs.

Activity Selection Process

All applications requesting MDTF funding are submitted as part of a Call for Proposal. A World Bank Technical Review Committee chaired by the MNA Director of Strategy and Operations and supported by the Program Manager of the MDTF meets at least twice a year but not more than quarterly to select proposals generated by a Call for Proposals. To date, there have been six calls for proposals for the MENA MDTF. The selection criteria for funding are described in each Call for Proposal, as well as in the MENA MDTF’s Operating Principles, which can be found on the World Bank’s
internal and external websites. As already mentioned in Section 1, activities funded by the MENA MDTF should:

- be consistent with the Bank’s MENA strategy/framework for engagement, and therefore be truly transformational, supporting new and reforming governments to undertake initiatives in the areas of governance, inclusion, jobs and sustainable growth. This includes demonstrating that each initiative aims to “do things differently;”
- demonstrate client ownership and demand, and therefore be undertaken with clear government and/or relevant stakeholder commitment of the activity;
- be consistent with the MDTF annual work program agreed with donors at the annual Program Council Meeting;
- demonstrate clear results; and,
- be additional, not duplicating other trust funded (TF) and donor-funded activities administered by the Bank or other organizations, and also promote effective coordination with the activities of official donors and other IFIs/development partners active in the country and sector.

**Activity snapshots and results to date**

The activities funded to date are listed in the tables below, along with a brief description of key objectives as well as areas of progress made to date. More detailed summaries are provided further below, and additional information can also be found on the MENA MDTF internet webpage on the World Bank’s MENA home page\(^1\).

To date, 22 technical assistance (TA) grants have been awarded; six of these activities have been closed and one other (Life in Transition Survey) has disbursed fully to the EBRD, activity implementer, but is not complete (see below). Detailed stock-taking of outputs and outcomes achieved is presented in this report for the activities that have been completed or that are ongoing. For recently approved activities, the emphasis is on activity objectives.

---

### Deliver on Agreed Results: Outputs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity Funded</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Key Areas of Planned Support</th>
<th>Progress on deliverables</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Supporting Economic Governance Transition in Morocco and Tunisia | TN, MA | Develop guidelines for performance-based budgeting, M&E systems; support for drafting access to information (ATI) law and on fiscal transfers/equalization | • Draft budget law prepared;  
• Detailed assessment on ATI completed;  
• Budgeting and performance plans guidelines completed and TA on new budgeting approach provided;  
• Policy notes and guiding documents drafted on programmatic budget structure, performance approach, fiscal rules public consultation, eParticipation, petitions, and on legislative initiatives by citizens;  
• Training to ministries provided and training of trainers on new ATI held |
| Knowledge & Learning for Social Safety Nets and Active Labor Market Programs | MENA | Establish a community of practice (CoP) for SSN & ALMP to increase awareness & share knowledge in/out of region and provide detailed training | • CoP established;  
• S-S and other exchanges held (Australia, Georgia, Colombia);  
• Training provided (smart cards, targeting, public-private partnerships or PPPs);  
• Policy notes and How-to Guide developed;  
• Operations Manuals for M&E (TU and MA) developed;  
• Virtual Workshops held |
| Yemen Decentralization and Local Governance Initiative | RY | Inform National Dialogue participants on policy and regulation related to decentralization; Increase awareness of key civil society organization (CSO) stakeholders | • National workshop, media/awareness events held;  
• Design of SPF-funded project completed;  
• Analytical note on Institutional & Fiscal Arrangements prepared;  
• Newsletters produced;  
• S-S exchange (India) held |
| Gender Learning and Operational Initiative - Yemen and Morocco | RY, MA | Support gender inclusion through awareness raising along-side Yemen’s National Dialogue and Morocco’s Human Development Initiative | • Faith-based leadership program completed;  
• Gender consultations held;  
• S-S exchanges (Indonesia) held;  
• Quick notes for awareness raising activities developed;  
• Training on women’s leadership skills held |
| Enhancing Microfinance amongst Women and Youth in MENA | MENA | Recipient-executed activity to improve financial literacy of women, youth through training; Help financial institutions serve women, youth | • Financial inclusion diagnostic completed;  
• Financial literacy program developed;  
• Training of trainers on financial literacy held;  
• Knowledge exchange workshop held.  
• Focus groups to capture dynamic picture of demand-side constraints to financial services for women and youth completed (TU, MA, EG) |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Country/Countries</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Financial Management (FM): Connecting Voices in MENA</strong></td>
<td>MENA</td>
<td>Promote public sector governance and private sector development with improved FM through training, establishing a CoP</td>
<td>• CoP established and website launched;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Training (audit, other) provided;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Supreme Audit Institution legislation papers (EG, RY) and surveys completed;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Boot camps, quarterly dialogue solutions labs, and exchange conference held;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Surveys and roundtable discussions with CSOs and media held</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Enhancing Governance through Public Procurement Reform</strong></td>
<td>RY</td>
<td>Recipient-executed activity to build capacity on procurement issues to central and decentralized agencies, as well as to service providers</td>
<td>• Workshops on procurement held,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Contract management and technical auditing held</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MNA Life in Transition Survey</strong></td>
<td>JO, EG, MA, TN</td>
<td>Fill critical data gaps for more evidenced-based policies, e.g. on reducing inequality of employment opportunities (EBRD-led)</td>
<td>• Pilot conducted and questionnaire completed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Service Delivery and Governance Reforms in Egypt</strong></td>
<td>EG</td>
<td>Support governance reforms which aim to improve public service delivery</td>
<td>• Policy notes produced on civil service reform, access to information, and undertaking, public consultations;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Rapid Results Initiatives (RRIs) in health care and administration services launched;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Dialogue and knowledge exchange events, and workshops and training held (tax and industrial RRI, skill building)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Promoting Social Entrepreneurship in MENA</strong></td>
<td>MA, JO</td>
<td>Raise awareness on and create opportunities for social entrepreneurs via coaching and knowledge platforms</td>
<td>• Blog and media campaign launched;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Concept note and operations manual developed;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Learning visits (Jordan, UK) held;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• First Social Enterprise Forum held;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Partnership with British Council to promote social entrepreneurship established</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Communication for Policy Reforms in Tunisia</strong></td>
<td>TN</td>
<td>Recipient-executed activity to increase awareness and understanding on reforms through communications tools; Engage citizens in debate; Make economic topics accessible via different platforms</td>
<td>• Project website launched;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• TV-shows aired;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• University town hall held</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Governance and Accountability in Moroccan Health Management Information Systems (HMIS)</strong></td>
<td>MA</td>
<td>Help improve equity and delivery of health services through improved MIS (policy, data, systems, consultations)</td>
<td>• Country 10-year Health Management Information Systems (HMIS) staging plan developed;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Case studies completed (best practices in health service delivery);</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• WB/WHO workshops held;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• High-level retreat on HMIS held</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MNA Sharing Know-How and How To in Subsidy Reform</strong></td>
<td>EG, MENA</td>
<td>Provide strategic advisory and promote knowledge-sharing (workshops, virtual conferences) on subsidies</td>
<td>• Consultation sessions with MoF held;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Workshops and virtual conferences held (unified database, unified registries and cash compensation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation</td>
<td>Service Delivery in Jordan’s Health and Education Sectors</td>
<td>Regional Syrian Damage and Needs Assessment</td>
<td>Parliamentary Strengthening in Morocco and Tunisia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Delivery in Jordan’s Health and Education Sectors</td>
<td>JO</td>
<td>MENA</td>
<td>MA, TU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assess the quality of health and education services and better understand how local governance in those sectors can be supported to help improve the quality of service delivery</td>
<td>Case studies highlighting local success stories on governance and the link to quality of service delivery</td>
<td>Establish a comprehensive damage and needs assessment that allows tracking the impact of the conflict throughout the sub-region and in Syria itself, and the aggregation of existing and new information in a usable platform for open analysis.</td>
<td>Capacity evaluation completed; Participation training survey completed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Description</td>
<td>Outcome</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Road Sector in Tunisia in Tunisia to improve efficiency and sustainability of the road sector by taking a transformational approach to its management, consider performance-based approaches (the first in MENA’s road sector) and encourage economic inclusion of lagging regions.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capacity and Design for Inclusive Groundwater Management in Morocco MA Recipient-executed activity to improve resilience of stakeholders to current and future water scarcity and bringing stakeholders into the dialogue on groundwater management through inclusive approaches not previously used in the sector.</td>
<td></td>
<td>2014</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthening Accountability for Improved Education Services in Jordan JO Improve the governance framework of the education system by ensuring that ongoing decentralization efforts are matched with a rigorous, well-designed, and well-implemented quality assurance system based on high professional standards.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Egypt (EG); Jordan (JO); Morocco (MA); Tunisia (TN); Yemen (RY); Regional (MENA)
b) Delivering Outcomes through Technical Assistance Activities

Monitoring and evaluation (M&E) is an integral part of the MENA MDTF administration. Any proposed activity must have a clear and realistic activity results framework outlining its planned outputs and also the outcomes to which the activity will contribute. The review of the individual results framework is part of the selection process undertaken by the Technical Review Committee of the MDTF. The M&E framework allows for tailoring to the specific activity, which is important given the broad range of reform activities supported and the demand-driven nature of the trust fund.

So far, the results are very encouraging: after two years since the first technical assistance grants have been awarded, the results have been and are being realized. Several targets set for 2015 have been exceeded, from the number of high quality analytical products produced and dialogue and knowledge sharing events, to the amount of people trained. Some of the activities have leveraged other resources which allowed for an even greater impact.

Further, even though the MDTF is funding technical assistance – which is more “upstream” and short-lived by nature than actual projects – we are nonetheless seeing real outcomes. For example:

- The Enhancing Microfinance for Women and Youth activity has supported the development of a financial literacy curriculum for trainings in Tunisia, Morocco and Egypt. Half of the beneficiaries have already reported increased access to financial services, and 15% have opened an account.

- Through the Services Delivery and Government Reform in Egypt activity, the MDTF funded a first round of peer review for draft Civil Service legislation, and the Government took the peer-review into account when developing an improved draft law.

- Through the Yemen Gender Learning and Operational Initiative participants put their newly-acquired skills to work and established five civic associations and one charitable foundation to support vulnerable women and children. In addition, through the application of lobbying and negotiation skills learned in the classroom, participants trained through the MDTF-funded activity were able to get the attention of prison officials and tribunal courts regarding women who had been imprisoned and whose cases had been neglected.

- Through Supporting Economic Governance Transition in Tunisia and Morocco, the MDTF supported the adoption of performance based budgeting in Morocco to increase Government’s transparency and accountability in the use of public resources. A new organic budget law and implementation regulations have been adopted by Government and eight pilot ministries are developing programmatic budgets and performance plans for Parliament with the Bank’s support. The activity also supported the design of the core Open Government policies such as
access to information, public consultation and petitions in order to strengthen voice and citizen participation in both countries.

- Through the activity Supporting Economic Governance Transition in Tunisia and Morocco, Tunisia met the eligibility criteria, including an access to information law, and joined the Open Government Partnership (OGP).
- Through Knowledge and Learning on Social Safety Nets and Active Labor Market Programs, the MDTF provided catalytic funding to help kick-start an international community of practice and helped leverage $383,000 from the World Bank’s regional partnership program that has allowed sustaining and continuing this important initiative.

These are just some examples – more information is provided below and in the Results Stories in the Annex. The MDTF has demonstrated its ability to be responsive and efficient, and has enabled recipient countries and stakeholders to build on foundations for the future.

The section below provides more detailed stock-taking of the activities funded by the MDTF, the progress made and some of the challenges they have encountered. More information is provided in the annex for four of the closed activities in the form of more comprehensive “results stories” also available on the MENA MDTF webpage.
c) Detailed Summaries of Activities

1. **Supporting Economic Governance Transition in Morocco and Tunisia**  
   For more information on this activity that closed on 15 May 2014, please see the detailed Results Story in Annex

2. **Knowledge & Learning for SSNs and ALMPs in MENA**  
   For more information on this activity that closed on 15 September 2014, please see the detailed Results Story in Annex

3. **Yemen Decentralization and Local Governance Initiative**  
   For more information on this activity that closed on 15 May 2014, please see the detailed Results Story in Annex

4. **Gender Learning and Operational Initiative – Yemen and Morocco**  
   For more information on this activity that closed on 30 June 2014, please see the detailed Results Story in Annex

5. **Enhancing Microfinance amongst Women and Youth in MENA**  
   **Objectives:** Financial literacy and gender empowerment via microfinance is an important priority towards inclusive development, yet financial inclusion in MENA remains particularly low for women and youth: only 1% of youth and 13% of women have an account at a formal financial institution. This MENA MDTF recipient-executed activity is focusing on improving the financial literacy of youth and women. With a core focus in Tunisia, select financial literacy activities are also being piloted elsewhere.

   **Progress to date, challenges and next steps:** This MDTF-funded activity recipient-executed has facilitated the implementation of a Financial Literacy Program through an NGO, the Center of Arab Woman for Training and Research (CAWTAR). Through the MDTF, CAWTAR is increasingly becoming a support institution promoting financial inclusion in Tunisia through financial literacy trainings. This activity has also supported the development of a financial literacy curriculum for trainings in Tunisia, Morocco and Egypt, where half of the beneficiaries have already reported increased access to financial services, and 15% have opened an account. To date, almost 1100 people have participated in financial literacy courses and trainings of trainers across these three countries, and almost 520 businesses have been provided with support. CAWTAR has developed a basic e-learning course targeting unemployed youth, and produced a video on financial education, which was released in November 2014. In just one day over 1,000 had watched the video. It is expected the project will meet all its targets with regard to financial literacy training. Moreover, the activity has already exceeded several of its targets. The activity has potential for significant scale up across the region, and CAWTAR (with some support of the Bank team) is starting to develop partnerships with Arab regional funds.
6. **Connecting Voices in MENA**

**Objectives:** The social, political and economic upheaval that took place in MENA in 2011 presented a unique window of opportunity to engage differently with countries in the region. Connecting Voices in MENA (CV MENA) launched a process that took MENA financial management professionals on a journey to build their capacity, stay connected, learn from one another, and more importantly, provide the tools and solutions to implement reforms.

**Progress to date, challenges and next steps:** CV MENA has facilitated the promotion of intra-regional cooperation, and stimulated interest in improving corporate financial reporting and government accounting. CV MENA has built capacity of supreme audit institutions through a major annual knowledge-sharing platform (‘The Exchange’); has helped to establish a community of practice (‘Ma’arefah’) as a forum for ongoing dialogue and as a platform for peer-to-peer and expert knowledge exchange; created ‘The Solutions Lab’ which is a quarterly dialogue series; and provided intensive training on International Financial Reporting Standards for SMEs - in Arabic for the first time ever - as well as on International Public Sector Accounting Standards in partnership with the International Federation of Accountants. Over 230 people (of which 19% women), have been trained, and 105 business representatives have been provided with support directly through MENA MDTF. Specific activities include: surveys of CSOs and media; roundtable discussions with CSOs, media representatives and university academics; solutions notes; and the launch of the Connecting Voices of MENA webpage, with the potential to reach large numbers of users. In addition, MDTF seed funding was able to leverage support from other sources, which financed several “boot camps” for training, surveys, and Exchange Conferences. The TA was closed on March 31, 2014, and has met its intended objectives.

7. **MENA Early Stage Innovation Technical Assistance**

**Objectives:** MENA MDTF funding was provided to TA to support the design of the Early Stage Innovation Facility (ESIF). ESIF aims to support entrepreneurs in the region, in particular women and youth. The activity also supported a dedicated women’s entrepreneurship program to provide tailored TA solutions for women entrepreneurs.

**Progress to date, challenges and next steps:** The activity has facilitated the design of a methodology for identifying gaps in access (financial literacy, market, business development support, etc.) and has generated a gap analysis and stakeholder mapping in Tunisia, Morocco, Jordan and Egypt. Stakeholder workshops have been held and a toolkit has been developed. Initial due diligence on the Goldman Sachs 10K women initiative has been undertaken. The activity faced several challenges. In particular, the ESIF fund, which was in its early stage of development, has not yet had any firm commitment from donors and investors. This has delayed the piloting and implementation of the proposed program designed under the MENA MDTF. ESIF is still moving forward and other alternatives to financing are being pursued. Furthermore, early mapping revealed a large degree of heterogeneity in the targeted countries, with entrepreneurs facing very different landscapes in financing and business support (e.g. with more saturation in Jordan than others). This has called for a more customized approach. Despite these challenges, the World Bank team adopted a more customized approach which resulted in a more flexible program. The World Bank is planning to address donors in early 2015 to fund the ESIF pilot. The MDTF activity closed on 12 May 2014.

8. **Enhancing Governance through Public Procurement Reform in Yemen**

**Objectives:** Through the Mutual Accountability Framework, the Government of Yemen has committed to improving the delivery of public services in a transparent and accountable manner to help unlock
the billions of dollars in aid pledged by the donor community. Efficient and transparent public procurement is critical to reinstituting government credibility. This recipient-executed MDTF activity aims to improve Yemen’s national procurement practices; achieve greater government accountability; increase private sector participation in bidding opportunities; and promote civil society’s role in ‘social auditing’ during the bidding processes, and at contract execution.

**Progress to date, challenges and next steps:** After initial delays related to the complicated and lengthy process of opening a bank account in Yemen to receive the funds as well as staff changes in the technical committee in the High Tender Board, the activity is now underway. TA support was provided to a capacity building program in procurement reform and contract management, with 259 staff trained. These included participants from the Ministry of Public Works and several Governorates. The number of participants was higher than the initial target of 60 through the efficient use of funds. An awareness raising campaign on improving business' and service providers' responsiveness to bidding opportunities was completed at the end of November 2014. Another awareness raising campaign for CSOs on the new procurement law was also completed at the same time. To date, 309 people (4% women) have been trained and 55 businesses have been provided with support.

9. **MNA Life in Transition Survey**

**Objectives:** In the context of the 2011 MENA events and their aftermath, concerns about inequality have been expressed in popular debate. But when measured, the region as a whole does not display high income and consumption inequality. This disconnect suggests that the disquietude expressed may stem rather from the lack of fair and equal access to opportunities. The Life in Transition Survey (LITS), a product of the EBRD in the former Soviet Union which is now being extended into the MENA region, aims to fill critical data gaps to inform policies, especially geared toward reducing inequality of employment opportunities in Egypt, Jordan, Morocco and Tunisia. This activity is carried out in coordination with the EBRD.

**Progress to date, challenges and next steps:** TA support was provided to facilitate a pre-pilot in urban and rural areas of Morocco, which was conducted in April 2013 together with the EBRD. A pre-test of the questionnaire was also conducted in Egypt in April 2013. This has allowed highlighting how illiteracy, in particular among women, affects the formulation of questions and survey implementation. The survey questionnaire and instructions were modified to reflect this. However, to date, the survey has not been conducted. Clear permissions to conduct the survey were only received in a couple of countries, while the team is still waiting for a final decision from the ministries in two others. The World Bank team and the EBRD are currently working on addressing the concerns that have been raised, including revising parts with higher political sensitivity and simplifying the questionnaire. It is expected that a decision will be taken in early 2015 on whether to proceed with the survey. As this is a regional survey, permission is needed from all of the countries in order to move forward.

10. **Service Delivery and Government Reform in Egypt**

**Objectives:** Political economy literature and evidence from around the world indicate that the space for meaningful institutional and policy change is largest during the first 12 to 18 months after a major
political shift. To take advantage of such windows of opportunity while they are still open, this activity sought to support reform-minded champions in the Egyptian government, in particular as they relate to service delivery.

**Progress to date, challenges and next steps:** One of the initial aims of this activity was to provide TA for the first stages of implementation of an Access to Information (ATI) law. However, the law was not adopted and the activity was amended to build civil society, private sector and media awareness and capacity to advocate for an ATI law in line with international practice. To date, several activities promoting an ATI law have been concluded, including an international conference on media role in and benefits from ATI; the creation of a Steering Committee (the Egyptian Initiative for the Right To Information) of High Level public figures to promote ATI with private sector and civil society; the production of several Policy Notes on ATI, and an awareness raising event on International Anticorruption Day on December 9th. In addition, several policy notes for the creation of public service charters for select administrative and health services have been drafted. Rapid Results Initiatives, a management technique that introduces highly choreographed 100-day projects to development programs, have been launched, both in health care and administration services. Finally, a first round of peer review for draft Civil Service legislation has been completed and submitted to the Ministry of Administrative Reform. *The Government took the peer-review into account, which resulted in a considerably improved draft law.* This last component was possible thanks to additional funding from the MDTF from a second submission, which was submitted after a request from the Ministry of Administrative Reform. Thanks to the MDTF, the WB was able to quickly put a team in place to respond to the request.

11. **Promoting Social Entrepreneurship in MENA**

**Objectives:** “Social entrepreneurship” is a new breed of entrepreneurship aimed at improving social service delivery to the poor in areas such as health, education, employment services and social protection. This activity aims to promote the social entrepreneurship agenda in the region, specifically in Morocco and Jordan. The activity will focus on: raising awareness about social entrepreneurship among relevant actors; identifying and coaching potential social entrepreneurs in Morocco and linking the best ideas to potential private investors; and introducing counterparts to international best practices for social entrepreneurship promotion.

**Progress to date, challenges and next steps:** The activity has facilitated learning visits to Jordan and the UK to learn about regional and international best practices for the promotion of social enterprise. *A partnership with the British Council has been established through a MoU to promote the social entrepreneurship agenda in Morocco and create a large scale impact, and to co-finance the upcoming Social Enterprise pilot in Morocco.* In March 2014, the First Social Enterprise Forum was held in Casablanca, co-hosted by the British Council and the World Bank. The activity has also used media such as blogs and media campaigns to promote awareness about social entrepreneurship, with 38 articles published in the press in French and Arabic. A concept note and an operations manual on social enterprise business plan competition have been completed. Through this MDTF funded activity, 402 people (41% women) have been trained. The activity is expected to meet its intended targets.
12. Communication for Policy Reforms in Tunisia

**Objectives:** Through a series of innovative and appropriate communication tools, this recipient-executed activity aims to foster greater awareness and understanding of key structural challenges facing the Tunisian economy and their importance to broader development goals. The activity aims to actively engage Tunisian citizens in dialogue and debate on key issues. The activity also aims to help make complex economic topics accessible to a broad audience through compelling, informative content disseminated across multiple platforms.

**Progress to date, challenges and next steps:** This MDTF-funded activity has been named *Meli Melek*, a Tunisian expression meaning “My money, your money”. The production is now fully underway, with a production team producing videos and online content. The project website was launched in September 2014, along with social media channels (Facebook, Twitter, YouTube, etc.) and a marketing campaign is planned for December 2014. The first show aired in November, and by the end of the month three shows had aired on Hannibal TV, a private channel, focusing on topics such as labor markets and competition. The show airs on Sunday afternoons, with two replays the following week, ensuring wide coverage. The recipient is also working on the production of radio town halls, but there have been some delays due to difficulties with finding a radio station to host these programs. The issue is expected to be resolved by the end of 2014. Finally, an Advisory Council of representatives from an array of stakeholders has held several meetings to discuss the content of the programs and provide guidance to the recipient. The activity is expected to meet its intended targets.

13. Governance and Accountability in Moroccan HMIS

**Objectives:** The World Bank is a partner to the Ministry of Health as it embarks on a set of ambitious reforms and is developing a “Performance for Results (P4R)” lending operation to address the cross-cutting issue of health management information system (“HMIS”). The objective of the proposed program is to foster good governance and accountability of the Moroccan health system through the development of a nationally integrated, transparent and accessible HMIS with the ultimate aim of improving quality of and access to health services in Morocco, particularly for women, the poor and rural populations.

**Progress to date, challenges and next steps:** The MENA MDTF activity has facilitated the development of a 10-year HMIS staging plan, which has also been budgeted. To define next steps in HMIS, a consensus-building consultation and a high-level retreat were held in November 2013 and September 2014. The activity has also facilitated, with co-financing from the World Bank Institute, a joint WB/WHO conference themed “Universal Health Coverage and Health Management Information Systems”. The activity has also supported visits and surveys of several primary facilities, which resulted in case studies focusing on governance related to quality of care. The case studies have been published in the MENA Governance flagship report: Trust, Voice, and Incentives: Learning from Local Successes in Service Delivery in MENA.

14. Sharing Know-How and How To in Subsidy Reform Implementation in MENA

**Objectives:** Countries in the MENA region have recognized the costliness and inefficiency of their subsidy systems, particularly for fuel, and are currently considering reform options. Through this MENA MDTF-funded activity, the Bank is supporting reform efforts by providing strategic advisory services and facilitating knowledge sharing. The key elements of this activity include creating a platform for several MENA
countries to learn from each other, as well as South-South exchange with countries outside the region that have seen through successful subsidy reforms.

**Progress to date, challenges and next steps:** This activity has facilitated TA support to conduct a regional workshop on knowledge-sharing and how-to in subsidy reform, which was the culmination of collaborative knowledge-sharing activities across six MENA countries (Djibouti, Egypt, Jordan, Morocco, Tunisia, and Yemen). The activity has also benefited from virtual convenings on how to mitigate the impacts of fuel price increases, with examples from the Dominican Republic, Jordan and the Philippines. *The activity has provided advisory support to the Government of Egypt (GoE) on fuel subsidy reform* through an expert mission to Cairo and a workshop entitled "A Unified Database in Service of Egyptian Families". Finally, *one-week bilateral meetings and learning sessions for the new Egyptian Minister of Social Solidarity were held in March 2014, including sessions on the use of social safety nets to mitigate effects of subsidy reform.* About 124 people have been trained directly through MDTF so far, of which 28% were women.

**15. Service Delivery in Jordan's Health and Education Sectors**

**Objectives:** Jordan is currently undertaking political reforms on public participation and the strengthening of the role of CSOs and governance measures, while at the same time being severely impacted by the Syrian refugee crisis. Syrian refugees now constitute a large share of the population, putting health and education service delivery under intense pressure. Through this MENA MDTF-funded activity, the World Bank aims to help improve service delivery by increasing knowledge on governance factors affecting quality of public service delivery in the health and education sectors in Jordan. The Bank will collaborate closely with the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Education and partner with national stakeholders.

**Progress to date, challenges and next steps:** The activity has experienced some delays related to receiving nominations from line ministries for a technical advisory committee, which is to be engaged in the design of instruments to measure service delivery performance. However, the World Bank team has been liaising with the Ministry of Planning and International Cooperation (MOPIC) and was expected to finalize drafts for a battery of instruments at the end of November 2014. These instruments include surveys and interviews with patients and professionals. The activity has facilitated case studies highlighting local success stories on governance and the link to quality of service delivery in health and education. The case studies are currently being disseminated online through WB MENA blogs and shared with the Government of Jordan; they have also been integrated as part of the WB MENA flagship report on Regional Governance and Social Service Delivery.

**16. SIRI – Syria Damage and Needs Assessment**

**Objectives:** With 2 million refugees and 4 to 5 million internally displaced people, the Syrian conflict has had a tremendous impact on its people and has put an enormous strain on neighboring countries. Information on the impact in Syria is extremely limited and not always reliable. Various organizations collect isolated data, but there are no countrywide pictures of impacts and needs. Therefore, there is a need to collect data by aggregating existing datasets and to conduct a comprehensive damage and needs assessment. Through this MENA MDTF funded activity, the World Bank will aim at the establishment of a comprehensive damage and needs assessment (DNA) and the aggregation of existing and new information in a usable platform for open analysis. It will allow the actors to prepare for the reconstruction and recovery efforts and to mitigate the current impact of the Syrian conflict on neighboring countries. The Bank will collaborate closely with UN agencies, regional research centers, and the EU.
Progress to date, challenges and next steps: Progress has been made on various options incorporating technological expertise of the private sector and partnerships with the international organizations to come up with a cost effective and replicable model for the damage assessment. A percentage-based assessment model has been conceived and a market vendor with GIS and social media analytics expertise is planned to be engaged to develop baselines as well as damage updates for six cities. Other development and humanitarian organizations including UN agencies (UNHABITAT, UN OCHA), JRC, EU Syria desk, REACH-ACTED, ACAPS etc., are also being contacted to develop mechanisms for effectively sharing information and updates on Syria.

17. Parliamentary Strengthening in Tunisia and Morocco

Objectives: The 2011 events of the MENA region reinforce the central role of parliaments in strengthening voice and participation and promoting inclusive and accountable governance. New open government reforms in Tunisia and Morocco will require an active involvement of Parliament in the review and approval process of new laws as well as in carrying out enhanced oversight functions. This Bank-executed activity aims to strengthen the capacity of parliamentary staff and targeted parliamentarians with regards to public engagement mechanisms in parliamentary work, as well as in budget analysis to improve oversight responsibilities.

Progress to date, challenges and next steps: This activity has experienced some delay in implementation over the summer and through Ramadan, but is now underway. A capacity review of the Moroccan Government has been completed. Several training modules on methods and tools for public consultations, petitions and budget analysis in MA are being developed. A cadre of local experts, who will receive training on the aforementioned areas, is currently being identified. Several workshops incorporating international experience are planned for January 2015 and the identification of international experts is ongoing.

18. TA to Yemen for Post National Dialogue Transition

Objectives: During the National Dialogue Conference (NDC) held in January 2014, significant progress was made on governance, structural, and social contract challenges and agreement was reached on a series of guiding principles aimed at guaranteeing rights and freedoms, reducing the centralization of power, eliminating corruption, and empowering women and youth, among others. A Constitutional Drafting Committee (CDC) has been tasked to begin drafting the Constitution, translating these broad outcomes into governing laws. At the request of the President of Yemen, the World Bank will lead an effort to bring a group of key multilateral donors together to support Yemen’s post-National Dialogue (ND) transition. Specifically, this Bank-executed activity aims to provide short-term operational assistance to support the development and implementation of a transition support plan, and strengthen the capacity of the CDC in the aforementioned process.

Progress to date, challenges and next steps: Given recent political events in Yemen – much of which developed after the award of this TA – initiation of this activity has met with delays and required reengagement with the new counterparts. The drafting of the constitution, which initially came to a halt in July 2014, has now resumed in Abu Dhabi. However, the World Bank’s main counterpart has resigned and has not been replaced; the Bank’s TA to the NDC and the constitution drafting process was directly coordinated through her office. The recent events have shifted the power of balance in the country. In this fluid political environment, the World Bank has shifted its attention to other post-ND TA of supporting Yemen achieve a system of decentralization and local governance. There is a broad consensus that governance at the local level would need to be strengthened to increase the legitimacy of the State. In this regard, the Government of Yemen has requested the Bank to prepare a project for decentralization and local service delivery. The post-ND support package seeks to provide
TA on issues related to federalism and decentralization. This includes a proposed south-South learning trip to India in early January 2015 for a deputy minister-level delegation from the three main counterpart ministries of the proposed project (MoLA, MoPIC and MoF). To date, an inter-ministerial ‘National Team for the Formulation of Development Transformation Priorities’ was established and tasked with coordinating with the World Bank and donors on developing the joint-transition framework. A TOR for a diagnostic survey of at least four local Councils has been developed and a survey firm selected.
### MENA MDTF Aggregate Results Framework

#### Results Chain

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Baseline 2012</th>
<th>Dec 2014</th>
<th>Target 2015</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Doing different things:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative number of person days of employment (Tier II)</td>
<td>4,903,853</td>
<td>36.1 million</td>
<td>50 million</td>
<td>World Bank reporting against MENA Regional Results Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total number of beneficiaries across Bank projects</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>World Bank reporting against MENA Regional Results Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Of which labour market programmes</td>
<td>12,830</td>
<td>223,000</td>
<td>233,000</td>
<td>World Bank reporting against MENA Regional Results Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Of which safety net programmes (Tier II)</td>
<td>3,597,157</td>
<td>7.8 million</td>
<td>8,000,000</td>
<td>World Bank reporting against MENA Regional Results Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of countries with WB supported programs on Open Government OR PFM reform (Tier II)</td>
<td>2 (2011)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>World Bank reporting against MENA Regional Results Framework (noting the combination of two different indicators: Open Gov + PE/PFM activities)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doing different things/doing things differently:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative number of pieces of technical and analytical work that informed strategy/policy and stimulated public debate on (but not limited to): gender inclusion, governance, energy and consumption subsidy reform, social protection, youth inclusion, job creation, labour markets (Tier II)</td>
<td>40 (2011)</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>51 (2014)</td>
<td>World Bank reporting against MENA Regional Results Framework (although does not exactly equal total of individual figures to avoid double counting)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of projects linked to MDTF with gender informed design</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>MDTF Progress Reports and Activity Descriptions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Outputs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strengthened project preparation, technical assistance, seed funding, policy analysis, dialogue and knowledge sharing through World Bank MENA Trust Fund</td>
<td>MDTF progress reports with random sample quality assured by DFID advisers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direct support provided to beneficiaries through World Bank MENA Trust Fund</td>
<td>MDTF progress reports with random sample quality assured by DFID advisers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative number of high quality analytical products produced with resources from MDTF (policy notes, survey work, evaluations, reports) that demonstrate the good use of analysis with clear recommendations, with potential policy implications, targeted at policymakers or for project preparation</td>
<td>MDTF progress reports with random sample quality assured by DFID advisers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative number of high quality technical assistance activities (project design, capacity building, guidelines) carried out through MDTF that provide clear and practical recommendations for practical and policy implementation, with positive client feedback</td>
<td>MDTF progress reports with random sample quality assured by DFID advisers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative number of high quality dialogues and knowledge and knowledge sharing events (S-S exchange, conferences, focus group/Community of Practice general meetings, etc.) leading to clear policy conclusions in focus areas, using resources from the MDTF</td>
<td>MDTF progress reports with random sample quality assured by DFID advisers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative number of people trained directly through MDTF (and % of which women) e.g. through targeted workshops, training-oriented S-S exchange, certification programs, innovative learning programs, etc</td>
<td>MDTF progress Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative number of businesses provided with support directly through MDTF</td>
<td>MDTF progress Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative number of results stories produced which demonstrate the catalytic effect of the MDTF (particularly on women and youth)</td>
<td>MDTF progress Reports</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Information on Outcomes is from July, 2014, and is from World Bank’s MENA Results Framework, and is not directly attributable to the MENA MDTF.
Section 3: Financial Status

Of the total amount pledged of USD 15.5 million, USD 15.0 million have been received, with USD 0.5 million pending from Norway.

A. Contribution

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Donor Name</th>
<th>Currency</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Paid</th>
<th>Unpaid</th>
<th>(US$ equivalent)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Danish Ministry of Foreign Affairs (DANIDA)</td>
<td>DKK</td>
<td>18,340,000</td>
<td>18,340,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>3,172,408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway - Ministry of Foreign Affairs</td>
<td>NOK</td>
<td>22,000,000</td>
<td>18,000,000</td>
<td>4,000,000</td>
<td>2,866,349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom (DFID)</td>
<td>GBP</td>
<td>5,000,000</td>
<td>5,000,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>7,852,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland - Ministry for Foreign Affairs</td>
<td>EUR</td>
<td>800,000</td>
<td>800,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>1,059,920</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Contribution</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>14,950,677</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

B. Financial Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(+) Contribution Paid-In</td>
<td>14,950,677</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(+) Other Receipts</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(+) Investment Income</td>
<td>60,799</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-) Admin Fee - 2%</td>
<td>299,014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-) Admin Fee - 5%</td>
<td>747,508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Funding Available</strong></td>
<td>13,964,954</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-) Disbursements</td>
<td>4,149,003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Undisbursed Fund balance</strong></td>
<td>9,815,952</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-) Grants Awarded Undisbursed</td>
<td>6,057,570</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Balance available for allocation</strong></td>
<td>3,758,381</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:**

Fees: 2% of all contributions, taken off the top, to defray the costs of the central units (LEG, etc). Managing unit costs will be recovered on the basis of actual costs incurred, amount not exceeding 5% to cover the costs of program management and trust fund administration.
List of Grants Awarded (as of December 9, 2014)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity Name</th>
<th>Execution Date</th>
<th>Grant Agreement Date</th>
<th>Closing Date</th>
<th>Grants Awarded</th>
<th>Disbursed</th>
<th>Committed</th>
<th>Available Balance</th>
<th>% Disbursed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Economic Governance Transition in TN and MA Bank</td>
<td>7/11/2013</td>
<td>5/14/2014</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>420,607</td>
<td>420,607</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge &amp; Learning for Social Safety Nets and Active Labor Market Programs in MENA Bank</td>
<td>8/31/2012</td>
<td>6/15/2013</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>441,029</td>
<td>441,029</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YM Enabling Decentralization and Local Governance Initiative Bank</td>
<td>9/1/2013</td>
<td>5/15/2014</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>461,820</td>
<td>461,820</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENA Early Stage Innovation Technical Assistance Bank</td>
<td>9/29/2012</td>
<td>5/12/2013</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>167,676</td>
<td>167,676</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Learning and Operational Initiative - YM and MENA Bank</td>
<td>9/27/2013</td>
<td>6/30/2014</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>336,500</td>
<td>336,500</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENA Connecting Voices of MENA Bank</td>
<td>12/11/2012</td>
<td>3/31/2013</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>278,908</td>
<td>278,908</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENA Life in Transition Survey Bank</td>
<td>12/10/2012</td>
<td>11/30/2013</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>211,773</td>
<td>211,773</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing How to Implement Subsidy Reform Bank</td>
<td>1/25/2013</td>
<td>2/28/2015</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>350,000</td>
<td>327,098</td>
<td>22,876</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YEM Enhancing Governance thru Public Procurement Reform SPN</td>
<td>Recipient: 1/2/2015</td>
<td>6/11/2015</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>302,400</td>
<td>161,626</td>
<td>140,774</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enhancing Microfinance amongst Women and Youth in MENA SPN</td>
<td>Recipient: 9/27/2012</td>
<td>6/30/2015</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>600,000</td>
<td>809,516</td>
<td>290,484</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enhancing Microfinance amongst Women and Youth in MENA SPN</td>
<td>Bank: 12/17/2013</td>
<td>6/30/2015</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>100,900</td>
<td>51,713</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>56,287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication for Policy Reforms in Tunisia SPN</td>
<td>Recipient: 1/22/2013</td>
<td>2/28/2014</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>600,000</td>
<td>250,000</td>
<td>350,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication for Policy Reforms in Tunisia SPN</td>
<td>Bank: 12/22/2013</td>
<td>2/26/2015</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>131,000</td>
<td>69,322</td>
<td>15,250</td>
<td>1,752</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promoting Social Entrepreneurship in MENA Bank</td>
<td>9/18/2013</td>
<td>2/27/2015</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>350,000</td>
<td>70,755</td>
<td>55,425</td>
<td>195,820</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Delivery and Governance Reforms in Egypt Bank</td>
<td>12/23/2013</td>
<td>3/30/2014</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>320,000</td>
<td>244,205</td>
<td>75,295</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>18,448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GISc in MA Health Management Information System Bank</td>
<td>10/14/2013</td>
<td>6/30/2015</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>565,000</td>
<td>96,553</td>
<td>48,309</td>
<td>220,159</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Delivery in Jordan's Health and Education Bank</td>
<td>1/29/2014</td>
<td>2/28/2015</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>448,000</td>
<td>182,484</td>
<td>70,808</td>
<td>194,708</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parliamentary Strengthening in TN and MA Bank</td>
<td>5/12/2014</td>
<td>6/30/2015</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>360,000</td>
<td>8,848</td>
<td>64,484</td>
<td>286,687</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transition Support in Yemen Bank</td>
<td>5/21/2014</td>
<td>7/31/2015</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>450,000</td>
<td>30,160</td>
<td>11,400</td>
<td>408,440</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNRWA Capacity and Needs Assessment Bank</td>
<td>7/8/2014</td>
<td>6/30/2015</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>500,000</td>
<td>34,082</td>
<td>30,887</td>
<td>435,021</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tla'at: Service Delivery Support Bank</td>
<td>10/10/2014</td>
<td>11/30/2015</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>490,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>58,270</td>
<td>435,730</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA Capacity and Design for Inclusive Groundwater Management SPN</td>
<td>Recipient: 10/10/2014</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>750,000</td>
<td>750,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA Capacity and Design for Inclusive Groundwater Bank</td>
<td>10/10/2014</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transferring the Road Sector Bank</td>
<td>10/9/2014</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>909,000</td>
<td>909,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JOR: Strengthening Accountability for Improved Education Services Recipient: 10/24/2014</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>570,000</td>
<td>570,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JOR: Strengthening Accountability for Improved Education Services Bank</td>
<td>10/24/2014</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>247,000</td>
<td>247,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To date, USD 10.2 million has been awarded to 22 grants, of which USD 4.1 million has been disbursed and an additional USD 1.2 million committed. The disbursement rate is an impressive 41%, even when including the six newest activities awarded in the last Call for proposals in October, 2014.

Of the 22 grants, six are officially “closed”, with funds proposed outputs achieved and contributing to broader outcomes, and with all funds disbursed (except in some cases where small amounts undisbursed were returned to the MDTF). In the case of the Life in Transition Survey where the World Bank is working with the EBRD which is the principal executing agency, all funds are disbursed and the activity is closed on the financial books, yet this activity is actually still on-going and has not delivered the main results (four nation-wide surveys). All funds are disbursed because, through new arrangements piloted in 2012, the funds were transferred to the EBRD from the World Bank, as the EBRD would take the lead on the survey work (see discussion in Section 2).
Six of the 22 grants awarded are recipient-executed, at 37% of the total grant value awarded.

**Allocation by Country**

The pie-chart above describes how MENA MDTF funds have been committed across the MENA region:

- The largest share of commitments has gone to multi-country or regional activities. Some of these activities are truly regional – e.g. CV MENA, the SSN COP. Yet other activities may have regional elements but also come components largely focused on one or two countries, for example, Sharing Know-How on Subsidy Reform has a clear emphasis on Egypt, the Promoting Social Entrepreneurship activity has a focus on Morocco, and the Gender Learning and Operational Initiative has a specific focus on Morocco and Yemen.
- Tunisia is the largest single recipient, at 21%.
- Egypt has received the least as a single recipient, at 3%.
- Although Morocco only has 11% as a single-country recipient of TA, when including all regional activities that support reforms in MA, the percentage would increase substantially (e.g. Supporting Economic Governance Reforms in Tunisia and Morocco).
Section 4: Challenges and Opportunities Going Forward

The MENA region is in the midst of an uncertain and tumultuous time. But as much as the challenges are great, so may be the opportunities. One of the challenges faced by the MENA MDTF is that this very uncertainty and turmoil often, understandably, leads to the requirement of markedly large amounts of time for consensus building, and relatedly, quite significant delays in decision-making. Some MENA MDTF activities have therefore had to undergo changes in their initially-planned course of action and objectives and re-orient themselves to deliver support as quickly and effectively as possible given the circumstances.

Another challenge, related both to local capacity issues as well as Bank procedural requirements, has been the difficulty of moving recipient-executed grants forward at a desirable speed. This has resulted in slow implementation and delivery of results. Yet after some initial delay, the three recipient-executed under implementation have started to deliver impressive results. Two of these activities (Enhancing Microfinance for Women and Youth, and Communications for Policy Reform in Tunisia) were presented to the donors at the MDTF Program Council Meeting held in Tunis in June, 2014. Donors encouraged the MDTF management to continue to persevere with new recipient-executed activities, and the Sixth Call that took place in October, 2014, resulted in the award of three new recipient-executed activities (one each in Tunisia, Jordan and Morocco). The Bank is constantly learning to improve our processes and remove bottlenecks – and are piloting new, simplified procedures to this effect.

Two years after the creation of the MENA MDTF, several activities have closed and in all cases but one, have shown results. Targets have been exceeded, other resources have been leveraged and tailored TA solutions have contributed to the success. The success can be contributed to several factors. The MENA MDTF funded activities have built on the momentum in the region and continue to provide support where necessary. At times, a customized approach has been taken, given the diversity across the countries of the region. The teams have also sought partnerships with existing programs for a greater impact.

The success of the activities has contributed to a great demand for the MENA MDTF. The MENA MDTF is seen as a vehicle for helping clients as well as the Bank itself “do things differently” and “do different things”. For most teams, the MENA MDTF has been the catalyst for much larger activities and programs which are of a longer-term nature. Therefore, the MDTF has been available to help support clients and task teams while the window of opportunity is open – as policies and laws are shaped, and as citizens are still demanding change. The demand is clearly greater than the MDTF is able to satisfy, especially of Bank-executed grant funding.
ANNEXES

Annex I: Activity Summaries
1. Service Delivery in Jordan’s Health and Education Sectors
2. Syrian Damage and Needs Assessment
3. Parliamentary Strengthening in Morocco and Tunisia
4. Technical Assistance to Yemen for Post National Dialogue Transition
5. Service Delivery Support in Tunisia
6. Capacity and Design for Inclusive Groundwater Management in Morocco
7. Strengthening Accountability for Improved Education Services in Jordan
8. Transforming the Road Sector in Tunisia

Annex II: Result Stories
1. Supporting Economic Governance Transition in Tunisia and Morocco
2. Yemen Decentralization and Local Governance Initiative
3. Gender Informed Design in Morocco and Yemen
4. Increasing Knowledge – Learning of SSN and ALMPs in MENA
Overview

In response to the popular demands fuelled by the Arab Spring, King Abdullah II of Jordan has initiated some political reforms focusing on enhancing public participation and citizen engagement in decision making, strengthening the role of civil society institutions and strengthening some governance measures.

Meanwhile, the Syrian refugee crisis has had an impact on Jordan’s service delivery performance, with an estimated 1 million Syrian refugees in the country at the end of 2013. Syrian refugees now constitute 16 percent of the total population, putting health and education service delivery under intense pressure.

Through this MENA MDTF-funded activity, the World Bank will aim at improving service delivery by increasing knowledge on governance factors affecting quality of public service delivery in the health and education sectors in Jordan. The Bank will collaborate closely with the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Education and partner with national stakeholders, such as state institutions, CSOs, and private firms.

Specifically, the activity will:

- Assess service delivery in the health and education sectors utilizing instruments such as the service delivery indicator survey, the local governance survey, case studies, and citizen satisfaction surveys, implementing these instruments in selected governorates along the ongoing Health Financing Review and the Education Public Expenditure Review; and,

- Consult stakeholders and communicate findings to build consensus on priority actions. Consultations will be inclusive and encourage participation from groups that represent women, marginalized youth, and refugees.

The activity has received $448,000 from the MENA MDTF.

Objective

Assess the quality of health and education services and better understand how local governance in those sectors can be supported to help improve the quality of service delivery.
**Deliverables**

Deliverables will include:

- Implementation of social service provision assessments through surveys and workshops to promote learning about measuring and promoting service delivery performance and its determinants in health and education sectors;

- Two case studies for health and education followed by reporting and dissemination of results, for example through workshops, where interventions will be discussed and good local practices will be presented.

**Beneficiaries and Expected Results**

The intended beneficiaries of this program include Jordanian policy-makers, civil society organizations, and all citizens who use education or health services but in particular marginalized groups.
Overview

With 2 million refugees and 4 to 5 million internally displaced people the Syrian conflict has had a tremendous impact on its people. The conflict has also put an enormous strain on neighbouring countries, with Jordan and Lebanon most affected. For example, an impact assessment conducted by the World Bank in 2013 showed that Lebanon is expecting to lose USD7.5 billion by the end of 2014 in economic activity pushing 170,000 Lebanese into poverty. In other neighbouring countries even less information exists on the spillovers. And most notably, information on the impact in Syria itself is extremely limited and not always reliable.

Various organizations collect data but this can often be isolated information relating to a specific issue, with dissemination often strongly limited. Countrywide pictures of impacts and needs do not exist. Therefore, there is a need to conduct a comprehensive damage and needs assessment by aggregating existing datasets and assessments and generating new damage and needs data and analysis with the objective of creating an information pool for policy makers.

Through this MENA MDTF-funded activity, the World Bank will aim at the establishment of a comprehensive damage and needs assessment (DNA) that allows tracking the impact of the conflict, including in Syria itself, and the aggregation of existing and new information in a usable platform for open analysis. This will provide valuable information to humanitarian agencies and development actors. It will allow the actors to prepare for the reconstruction and recovery efforts once the Syrian conflict ceases and to mitigate the current impact of the Syrian conflict on neighboring countries. The Bank will collaborate closely with UN agencies, regional research centers, and the EU.

Key intermediate outputs for such an assessment would include the following:

(a) develop a preliminary quantitative estimate of the physical damages to key public and private social, physical and productive infrastructure;

(b) identify, characterize and quantify impacts of the crisis on associated service delivery and economic activity;

(c) identify, characterize and quantify the scope of population movements both inside and outside of Syria; and,
(d) develop an initial sense of the corresponding crisis recovery needs in respect of (a) to (c) and propose a broad-based recovery strategy.

The activity has received $500,000 from the MENA MDTF.

**Deliverables**

Deliverables will include:

- A baseline data and information platform which will be critical for future engagement in the recovery and reconstruction. A critical component of that recovery and reconstruction effort will be a better understanding of the social cohesion, and how Syria’s human capital was impacted by the conflict.
- Damage assessment for critical sector including among other, health, education, housing, agriculture, transport, energy, water and sanitation, and irrigation.
- Needs assessment for the above critical sectors in regions returning to normalcy.
- Recommendations for each sector linking the recovery needs and the development objectives.

**Beneficiaries and Expected Results**

The intended beneficiaries of this program are the affected displaced persons and refugees, and host communities, and the wider regional and international community.
Overview

The events of the MENA region since the beginning of 2011 reinforce the central role of parliaments in strengthening voice and participation and promoting inclusive and accountable governance. Parliamentarians are an important link between the electorate and the executive government and play a key role in voicing the concerns of the people they represent. Engaging citizens in the decision-making process is therefore essential to good governance, and a cornerstone of parliamentary procedure. Some MENA countries have started to introduce reforms in regards to parliamentary oversight.

In Morocco, the 2011 Constitution introduced the following reforms: the prime minister is now appointed from the party that wins parliamentary elections; parliament has been given authority over the cabinet; parliament is also granted more oversight of civil rights and electoral issues. But there is more work to be done: a draft law on access to information has not yet been adopted by the Cabinet and its successful implementation will depend in large part on political will for genuine open and inclusive governance. A draft law on petitions and legislative motions are also being developed and may take the form of parliamentary procedure, thus necessitating capacity building of parliament to respond to these new rights.

In Tunisia, the role and powers of the parliament have been pivotal in the discussions on the shape of post-revolution Tunisia. The National Constituent Assembly (NCA) was established on October 23, 2011, to realize the ambitions of the Jasmine Revolution by putting in place a new constitution for greater transparency and inclusiveness and playing the role of an interim Parliament.

New open government reforms in Morocco and Tunisia will require an active involvement of Parliament in the review and approval process of these and other laws as well as in carrying out enhanced oversight functions. Hence, this Bank-executed activity aims to:

- strengthen the capacity of parliamentary staff and targeted parliamentarians with regards to public engagement mechanisms in parliamentary work; and

- enhance the capacity of parliamentary staff and targeted parliamentarians in budget analysis to improve oversight responsibilities.

This proposal has received $360,000 from the MENA MDTF.

Objective

Strengthen parliament in the areas of budget oversight and public engagement in Morocco and Tunisia.
Deliverables

The specific deliverables of this activity will include:

- Two capacity reviews (one for Morocco and one for Tunisia);
- Four training sessions to be conducted in both countries in the areas of public engagement and budget oversight;
- A knowledge-exchange series (videoconference and/or face to face) which will help connect regional parliamentary staff and targeted MPs with the international parliamentary community to learn from international experience in these domains; and
- One study tour for local experts from Morocco and Tunisia to benefit from hands-on site visit to an international parliament, learn from their experience and strengthen cross-country knowledge exchange networks.

Beneficiaries and Expected Results

The primary intended beneficiaries of this activity are parliamentary staff, including through direct support to the work of parliamentary committees. Other beneficiaries are civil society representatives who will participate in seminars and knowledge-exchange sessions to maximize multi-stakeholder dialogue and to help establish strong lines of communication and collaboration on these important reform areas. The expected outcomes include:

- Effective engagement through a better understanding of various methods and tools that can be utilized;
- Enhanced legislative oversight functions particularly on budget formulation and implementation; and
- Increased awareness among parliamentary staff on how other countries have undergone similar reforms as well as why public engagement and transparency is an important tool to improve parliamentary capacity.
Overview

After months of historic deliberations amongst the various factions in Yemen, the National Dialogue Conference concluded on January 25, 2014. The flagship process within Yemen’s ongoing transition made significant progress on a daunting range of governance, structural, and social contract challenges. Agreement was reached on a series of guiding principles aimed at guaranteeing rights and freedoms, reducing the centralization of power, eliminating corruption, empowering women and youth, amongst others. The task at hand is to now translate these broad outcomes into governing laws. For this purpose, the Government of National Reconciliation (GNR) has nominated a Constitutional Drafting Committee (CDC), comprising 17 members, to begin drafting the Constitution. However, due to the limited coordination between the National Dialogue process, the government and key ministries, and donors supporting the transition plan, the CDC will require extensive support to accomplish this task.

At the request of the President of Yemen, the Bank will lead an effort to bring a group of key multilateral donors together to support Yemen's post-National Dialogue transition in a synchronized and sustained manner. This activity will take a holistic view of Yemen’s urgent needs as critical components of the country’s state-building process to help key stakeholders reinforce legitimacy of government institutions. Specifically, this Bank-executed activity aims to:

- Provide short-term operational assistance to support the development and implementation of a transition support plan; and
- Strengthen the capacity of the CDC in the overall process of state restructuring, decentralization and local governance.

This activity has received US$450,000 from the MENA MDTF.

Deliverables

The specific deliverables of this activity will include:

- Establishing a joint CDC-GNR-WB team to develop and implement the transition support plan;
Coordinating and framing broader and more long term transition priorities and programs with the government and key donors via a joint donor mission;

Conducting a workshop/roundtable/public event to increase awareness on state restructuring, key laws on topics related to fiscal federalism, civil service restructuring, natural resource management, and local governance;

Organizing an event to prepare selected service delivery sectors and their related institutions for the transition;

Preparing and disseminating two high quality policy notes/presentations on selected topics related to fiscal federalism, civil service restructuring, natural resource management, and local governance to support state restructuring, decentralization and local governance;

Developing and disseminating at least two high quality policy notes/presentations on selected service delivery sectors;

Organizing at least two South-South exchanges for CDC and both transition and sector ministries; and

Carrying out a diagnostic survey of at least four Local Councils to understand their systems, resources, capacities and accountability links in order to feed into a transition plan for local governments.

**Beneficiaries and Expected Results**

This initiative is expected to benefit the country at large. More specifically however, direct beneficiaries include the office of the President, the members of the CDC, relevant government ministries and civil society stakeholders. The expected outcomes include:

- **Better coordination** of CDC, GNR and donors activities related to the transition;

- **Increased awareness** of CDC members on specific aspects of state restructuring, decentralization and local governance; and,

- **Enhanced ability** of two key transition ministries in managing the transition process.
Overview

After the 2011 revolution ending the 23-year rule of President Zine El Abidine Bel Ali, Tunisia embarked on a new path of democratic and political reform. The transition gained new momentum in 2014 with the resolution of political deadlock, national elections, and the adoption of a new Constitution which sets a new framework for the relationship between central and local Governments with clear commitments to decentralization.

In the aftermath of the revolution, the Tunisian Government has taken steps towards strengthening local governance and decentralization. In its current state, municipal service delivery is lagging behind and there is limited engagement of citizens with their municipalities. Improving municipal service delivery would have a tremendous impact on quality of life, urban environment, public health and key economic activities.

Timely action is needed to preserve the current momentum to create a new model of effective and responsive local governance. Providing action-oriented assistance to municipalities during the transition to a decentralized system is therefore imperative. Through this MENA MDTF-funded activity, the World Bank will aim at enhancing the accountability of Local Governments to citizens through enhancing their ability to deliver results, increasing transparency and facilitating voice, especially for disadvantaged individuals and municipalities. The activity will provide critical support to the World Bank-supported Tunisia Urban Development and Local Governance Program for Results (PforR), which focuses on local service delivery and governance. PforR is a new lending instrument introduced by the World Bank in 2012, which supports government programs and links the disbursement of funds directly to the delivery of defined results with a special focus on strengthening institutions.

Specifically, the activity will:

Leverage the implementation of the Urban Development and Local Governance program by providing technical assistance on critical activities. More specifically:

- A Local Government Performance Assessment System will enable stakeholders to assess the management and service delivery performance of Local Governments; and

Objective

Contribute to enhancing the accountability of Local Governments to citizens, with a particular focus on disadvantaged municipalities. Provide critical support to the Tunisia Urban Development and Local Governance program.
Participatory planning and budgeting toolkits will be designed to help Tunisian stakeholders increase the accountability of the state to its citizens at the local level in the delivery and operation of basic services. Practical guidelines for local governments to increase transparency, accountability and participation through increased citizen involvement, focusing on women and youth, in municipal decision-making will be developed.

An e-platform will be developed to serve as a transparency platform, providing information about financial transfers to local governments and local government performance, which will allow continuous monitoring by local governments, civil society organizations and citizens, and will provide tangible channels for voice and agency for women and youth.

The activity has received $490,000 from the MENA MDTF.

**Deliverables**

Deliverables will include:

- A manual for participatory planning and budgeting to include citizens and civil society in municipal investment planning
- The creation of a Local Governance E-Platform that will help to generate and publicly disseminate financial and performance information on Local Governments
- Development of a Governance Performance Assessment System
- Knowledge sharing, capacity building and learning exchanges in the region and beyond

**Beneficiaries and Expected Results**

The ultimate beneficiaries of this MDTF-funded activity are citizens living in communities taking part in the Tunisia Local Governance Program for Results, with a focus on women and youth. Target beneficiaries also include policymakers, thinkers and leaders supporting the decentralization and urban development process, as well as municipalities and government agencies. The experiences will be shared across the region and beyond through learning exchanges and other forms of capacity building.
Overview

The current expansion of agriculture land in Morocco and changes in water pumping technologies, coupled with a subsidy for the use of butane, are contributing to a substantial increase in groundwater depletion. With less capacity for drilling and pumping, small farmers are among those most affected by decreasing groundwater levels.

As the agriculture sector accounts for more than 85% of total water consumption in the country, Government is currently focusing its efforts on supporting the groundwater management agenda. The Ministers of Interior, Agriculture and Water have recently issued an Interministerial Circular requiring the conclusion of groundwater management agreements (contrats de nappes) on November 15, 2013 with the aim to develop mutually agreed reduction of withdrawal from threatened aquifers by main water users.

Timely action is needed to provide capacity support to groundwater contract management. An important part of the work is to have an adequate mapping of stakeholders and agree on objectives for key groups of stakeholder. Contract management should allow stakeholder involvement in decision-making and agreeing on objectives for use of groundwater. Inclusive groundwater management contract is a shift from the current top-down approach. Indeed, based on lessons learned from an initial pilot undertaken in Morocco, key elements for increasing the likelihood of successful groundwater contract management include: mapping and involving stakeholders; building trust; good communication; and transparency of the process.

Through this recipient-executed MENA MDTF-funded activity, the World Bank will support the Oum Er Rbia River Basin Agency (ABH-OER), a champion in developing bottom-up participatory approaches to water resource management, to address the challenges of groundwater management at river basin level. The expected result is the regulation of the management of two overexploited aquifers (nappes) in Oum er Rbia by agreements among stakeholder on the use of groundwater. The interventions are complementary to the ongoing water governance work in Morocco under the World Bank-supported Green Growth Development Policy Loan, as well as support by other partners such as the French Development Agency (AFD) and the German Technical Cooperation (GiZ).

Objective

Improving the resilience of Morocco to the reality of water scarcity through more inclusive groundwater management contracts.
This is a recipient-executed activity. It will:

- Involve the stakeholders in selecting key performance indicators for a climate risk assessment of the Oum Er Rbia Basin. These KPIs will provide information on the key vulnerabilities in the Basin on key sectors (e.g. irrigation and energy production). For this purpose, a climate risk assessment will be conducted followed by consultations with key stakeholders to select the indicators. Once the KPIs are agreed, then a more in-depth analysis will be conducted to identify trade-offs and help facilitating discussions among users.

- Design and establish inclusive groundwater management contracts for aquifers in the Oum er Rbia Basin. Stakeholders are being consulted in selecting two strategic aquifers and support in the consultation for the development of content for each contract. The World Bank team will support the ABH-OER in designing the consultative process and the draft of the agreement amongst users.

The activity has received $800,000 from the MENA MDTF.

**Deliverables**

Deliverables will include:

- An analytical report on the current climate risk assessment in the Oum Er Rbia Basin;

- Training, workshops and consultations on climate risk assessment and on improved management of water to reduce demand, including through groundwater contract management, with at least 15% female participation;

- The design and development of agreement (groundwater contract management) among stakeholders in the use of the groundwater resource;

- An analytical report on lessons learned on the participatory design of groundwater contract management and assessment of current and projected vulnerability (climate risk) of the Oum Er Rbia Basin. The report with focus on main sectors, likely energy, drinking water and irrigation.

**Beneficiaries and Expected Results**

Target beneficiaries include farmers (particularly smaller scale farmers), the Ministry of Water, ABH-OER, and the Regional Agricultural Development Office (Office régional de mise en valeur agricole).
Overview

Research and experience show that empowering education service providers to make decisions and at the same time holding them accountable is one of the most effective ways of driving performance. To this end, the Government of Jordan has implemented a number of decentralization initiatives, like the School and Directorate Development Program (SDDP), a model for participatory school self-assessment, planning, and improvement. Nevertheless, the current results are not encouraging. In 2014, only forty percent of Jordanian students who sat for the national secondary school exam passed, and other indicators from national and international assessments suggest that the quality of education in Jordanian public schools has not improved at the rate expected given the considerable policy reforms and financial investments undertaken in the sector.

Improving the quality of schools is thus essential. The current leadership has shown commitment to improving quality by decentralizing resources and decision-making. To this end, the Ministry of Education (MoE) envisions transforming its role from one of administrator to policymaker and regulator. This MENA MDTF-funded activity aims to establish an accountability mechanism, the Education Quality and Accountability Unit (EQAU), within the MoE that will enable the empowerment of directorate and school leaders to raise performance by responding more effectively to school and student needs. The EQAU will strengthen the governance of the education sector by ensuring that decentralization efforts are coupled with adequate quality monitoring mechanisms. Once national capacity has been built for EQAU, the costs will be subsumed under the Ministry’s budget.

The activity will receive supplementary funding from DFATD-Canada, which has committed $500,000 in budget support earmarked for capacity building for accountability purposes. The funds will be used to finance an expansion of the program at a national level to include all schools and field directorates. This recipient-executed MENA MDTF-funded activity will:

Objective

Support the Jordan Ministry of Education’s efforts to develop a mechanism that ensures accountability and quality assurance to help improve the delivery of education services.
Provide technical assistance by highly experienced international and local experts for the establishment of the EQAU.

Provide capacity building through training and knowledge exchanges for the staff of the EQAU. Results stories that capture the lessons learned will be developed by participants and shared with the wider group members;

Build awareness and promote the goals of the reform to stakeholders throughout the process, through both high level meetings and workshops for Ministry staff at all levels.

The activity has received $817,000 from the MENA MDTF.

**Deliverables**

Deliverables will include:

- Operational guidelines for the EQAU, including structure, staffing, and roles and responsibilities; the development of curricula for professional development programs; and the development of accountability guidelines;

- Knowledge exchange activities for key members of the Minister’s Working Group on Accountability and MoE staff, with at least 50% female participation, and the development of results stories for each knowledge exchange visit;

- Capacity building for the EQAU, including the training of 100 professionals (of which 50% female) to carry out the tasks of the EQAU;

- High-level meeting on goals and activities of the EQAU;

- At least 2 workshops for MoE staff.

**Beneficiaries and Expected Results**

The direct beneficiary of the project is the Ministry of Education, whose technical capacity to play a quality assurance role will be strengthened. The ultimate beneficiaries are students in Jordanian schools, who will benefit from improved school performance as a result of the accountability measures that will be put in place.
Overview

One of the most pressing priorities in post-revolutionary Tunisia is private sector-led economic growth, in particular for the vulnerable and the marginalized. Development in Tunisia is regionally differentiated, with the three largest cities – Tunis, Sfax and Sousse – accounting for 85% of national GDP and all located on the coast. Lagging regions are often underserved in terms of road infrastructure, with poor state of road conditions and slow traffic. Improving road corridors to growth centers is seen as a key step to increase private sector investment in these regions, which will have a positive impact on growth and job creation.

The road sector in Tunisia is currently managed with outdated methods and with limited resources. There is a pressing need to transform the way the road sector is managed, with better allocation of resources and increased efficiency in public expenditure. The World Bank is currently preparing a $200 million Road Transport Corridor Project to improve the connectivity of the lagging regions through better roads. In addition, a Public Expenditure Review (PER) is planned for 2015, which will serve as a diagnostic of financial and human resources constraints, and assessment of financing needs for the road sector. The World Bank is also initiating an effort to coordinate the involvement and financial support of international development institutions like EIB, AfDB, and IsDB, and donors to the road sector in Tunisia, with a conference likely to take place in 2015.

To build on the momentum, this project aims at improving the efficiency and sustainability of public expenditure in the road sector through capacity building that will result in a transformational approach to road asset management.

This MENA MDTF-funded activity will:

Objective

Improve the efficiency and sustainability of public expenditure in the road sector, contributing to better planned investment to support economic inclusion and poverty reduction and enhance shared prosperity
Facilitate the design and implementation of decision-making tools to better plan maintenance and public expenditure, including in lagging regions;

Review the role of public and private sector in the management of the sector, including the use of performance-based contracts for rehabilitation and maintenance of roads; and,

Provide capacity building on road asset management and performance based contracts.

The activity has received $909,000 from the MENA MDTF.

**Deliverables**

Deliverables will include:

- Selection, purchase and installation of a road asset management information system for the Tunisian road network;

- The preparation of yearly maintenance condition reports of national and regional roads (including in lagging regions) and supporting sustainable investment to link lagging regions to economic centers;

- A feasibility study and technical specification for a performance-based pilot project; and,

- Training programs to support on road asset management and performance based contracts.

**Beneficiaries and Expected Results**

The intended beneficiaries of this activity are the Ministry of Equipment, Regional Planning and Sustainable Development (DGPC/MEHAT) and the contracting industry. Residents throughout Tunisia and in particular those in lagging regions will benefit as the MEHAT will increase its capacity to respond to actual needs and better plan maintenance and investment. This is expected to result in better road infrastructure generating increasing economic value to the regions and attractiveness to private sector-led investment.
ANNEX II
1. MDTF Results Story: Supporting Economic Governance Transition in Tunisia and Morocco

Overview

Following the Arab Spring, the governments in both Tunisia and Morocco have embarked on transformational Governance reforms to foster a more open and inclusive development process. This ambitious reform agenda required deep and comprehensive legal and institutional changes in new policy areas such as fiscal transparency, access to information and citizen engagement. Both governments requested the financial and technical support from the World Bank, which developed two integrated Governance programs, comprising policy lending, technical assistance and capacity building. The Middle East and North Africa Multi-donor Trust Fund (MENA MDTF) has been an integral part of these programs and provided strategic technical assistance to the inception of these reforms. Despite a challenging context characterized by regional political instability, significant progress has been made across important reforms on fiscal transparency, access to information and public engagement in Tunisia and Morocco through the MDTF activity “Supporting Economic Governance Transition in Tunisia and Morocco”. This project has provided valuable technical assistance, knowledge transfer and capacity building on new and structural reforms to bring about the expected changes. The MDTF activity was also instrumental in leveraging further support from the Transition Fund for the implementation of these cross-cutting governance reforms.

Specifically, the MDTF activity supported the adoption of performance based budgeting in Morocco to increase Government’s transparency and accountability in the use of public resources. A new organic budget law and implementation regulations have been adopted by Government and eight pilot ministries are developing programmatic budgets and performance plans for Parliament with the Bank’s support. The activity also supported the design of the core Open Government policies such as access to information, public consultation and petitions in order to strengthen voice and citizen participation in both countries. Morocco is in the process of adopting laws on access to information, on public petitions, on legislative motions and on public consultations, which benefited from international benchmarking, policy advice and capacity building funded by the MDTF. Tunisia met the eligibility criteria, including an access to information law, and joined the Open Government Partnership (OGP). Furthermore, the activity helped strengthen the analytical underpinnings for Morocco’s decentralization reform through advisory work.
Challenges

When compared to world averages of a wide-set of governance indicators, the MENA region shows significant weaknesses, particularly on issues of accountability, public engagement and transparency. Global Integrity’s governance scorecard indicates both Morocco (2010) and Tunisia (2008) as “very weak” based on an assessment of indicators on the existence, effectiveness, and citizen access to key governance and anti-corruption mechanisms. The Worldwide Governance Indicators also rank Morocco and Tunisia in the lower 25-50th percentile (2012).

Despite these challenges, over the past decade, Morocco has made progress towards achieving its millennium development goals (MDGs) and has sustained a growth rate of 4.9 percent. Tunisia also continues to face a difficult economic outlook after the Revolution. Preliminary estimates for 2013 suggest that the recovery is losing momentum. GDP growth is expected at around 2.6 percent in 2013. While extreme poverty has been reduced in both countries, unemployment and vulnerability remain very high, hampering shared prosperity. Despite important public investments in social policies, equal access to socio-economic opportunities remains a major challenge, fuelling a sentiment of deprivation among large sections of the population. The Governments in both countries thus seek to enhance the effectiveness of their development policies and public investments. For both Morocco and Tunisia, there continues to be evidence of growing demand for reform to strengthen governance, amplify citizen voice, and raise government accountability.

Approach & Key Agendas

To better leverage the need and opportunity for strengthened governance, the World Bank, with support from the MENA Multi Donor Trust Fund, has focused on four key themes and areas to support governance reforms in Morocco and Tunisia. The interconnected nature of these reform areas provided the team with an important opportunity to engage and partner with a wide range of stakeholders and build linkages across different levels of government (central and local) as well as among government and civil society.

1. Performance based budgeting

Through advisory work, technical assistance, and training this track sought to increase the attention on and capacity for greater government accountability and performance in the management of public resources.

2. Open Government

Supporting the respective governments’ new commitments to open government through greater fiscal transparency, open budgets, and better access to public sector information was a key tenet of this program.
3. **Enhanced Citizen Participation**

In response to growing citizen demand for participation, this track focused on improving the ecosystem and mechanisms for citizens to engage with their governments. This included the development of a legal framework on public consultations, petitions, and legislative motions.

4. **Strengthened Local Governance**

While many national and central-level programs have been the first-movers to adopt and implement new policies and mechanisms for improved performance, disclosure, and citizen engagement, greater impact will require extending these reforms to a more local level, to bring basic public services closer to citizens.

**Results: Outcomes and Outputs**

The project’s outcomes have been substantially met and its outputs exceeded what was initially planned:

- The new organic budget law introducing performance budgeting has been adopted by Cabinet;
- Nine ministries are preparing programmatic budgets and performance plans (instead of 8 foreseen in the additional financing);
- The Head of Government of Morocco issued a circular on performance monitoring (but the MEF’s spell out organogram has not yet been changed);
- Tunisia joined OGP;
- Morocco prepared an access to information law and held a national conference on the subject (the law is currently being finalized although concerns were expressed on its ambition).
- Citizens have an increased access to fiscal information in both countries and Tunisia is finalizing its Open budget platform, which is expected to go live by the end of the year.
- Morocco is publishing its draft laws and regulations prior to Cabinet adoption and is drafting laws on public consultations, public petitions and on legislative motions by citizens, largely exceeding the initial scope and depth of citizen engagement policies.

There have also been set-backs. For example, Morocco’s decentralization reform has witnessed delays. Although the diagnostic study of its transfer and equalization system was completed, the subsequent policy revision did not start due to a delay in the revision of the organic law on local governments, which is a prerequisite given the substantial changes introduced by the new Constitution. While this outcome indicator is partially met, the Bank remains fully engaged on this medium term reform agenda, including through technical assistance financed by the Transition Fund.
In terms of specific outputs/deliverables funded by the MDTF, the activity exceeded its objectives, thanks notably to the strong interest and demand from both governments. The core outputs and results are specified in the following thematic sections.

**Improving Government Accountability & Performance in the use of public resources**

Most notably, the program of work in Morocco contributed to the revision of the organic budget law submitted to Parliament in February 2014 and the creation of draft budget programs and performance plans for four Ministries (Finance, Agriculture, Education, and Water & Forestry) in 2014. A knowledge exchange seminar on performance budgeting reform was held in June 2013 with participation from all Secretary-Generals to jump-start the reform. Through the MENA MDTF, technical assistance has also been extended to five more ministries for the preparation of the 2015 budget proposal (Transport & Civil Works, Health, Foreign Affairs, Vocational Training and Justice) which is expected to coincide with the adoption of the new organic budget law. The project’s approach included peer learning and knowledge transfer from practitioners by involving high level officials who have implemented the same reform in France. Following the success of this type of cooperation, it was complemented by a 4-year twinning project with the French Ministry of Finance, financed by the Deauville Partnership Transition Fund. As a result, Parliament and Citizens will have a better view of the allocation and effectiveness of public resources. Ministers and program managers will have to commit to and report on corresponding performance indicators.

Ministerial performance plans 2014.
Fostering Open Government by granting citizen access to public sector information: Legal Frameworks, Online Platforms, and Impact Research

The demand for public information is high as evidenced by the results of the Nano survey conducted in Morocco (detailed below) in which 71% of respondents request access to information and 26% are even willing to pay for it. Likewise, in Tunisia where transparency and public participation represented core demands from the population since the Arab Spring. Much progress has been made in both strengthening the legal framework around the right to access to information and the public’s ability to access and interact with information, particularly in the legal and fiscal realm. In both Morocco and Tunisia the MDTF provided policy advice and technical assistance for the design of these new policies. This included international benchmarking and several assessments of and inputs on draft laws on Access to Information. These laws went through extensive public consultations, both online and through a national conference in Morocco and are currently finalized for respective Cabinet and Parliament adoption by the end of the year.

In Morocco, the MDTF supported a national high-level consultation event on access to information, on June 13, 2013. It was hosted by the Head of Government and included the President of Parliament, the United Kingdom Ambassador to Morocco, and the World Bank. Participants also included a wide representation of government Ministries as well as over 500 participants from civil society and the private sector. This event enabled the increase of awareness and understanding about new constitutional rights and provided valuable recommendations for the drafting of the law.

In Tunisia, the MDTF-funded activity supported the preparation of an organic law on access to information in order to consolidate the post-revolutionary decree-law and complement it with an independent information commission/enforcement body. This is an important step to strengthen the homogeneous implementation of this new policy/right across the public sector. To date, the implementation is still heterogeneous, with some ministries more active than others. The Ministry of Finance for instance was proactive and set up a web portal enabling citizens to access information about this new right as well as to lodge online requests for information. As seen below, the Ministry also emphasized proactive disclosure of fiscal information through its website and soon through a dedicated open budget portal. Other ministries, such as Justice or Higher Education received and responded to a high number of requests for information (64% of the total requests registered).
In order to support the actual implementation of the new rights, the MDTF supported a number of awareness raising and capacity building events in both countries. This including two "training of trainers" sessions organized with the presidency of the Government in Tunisia (March 2013 and May 2014). This enabled the training of 107 trainers and newly appointed information officers, 33% of which were women, from central government, state-owned enterprises and regions. Many have organized subsequent trainings within their respective organization. In parallel, the Government and CSOs have launched information and awareness raising campaigns. As can be seen below, these collective efforts have led to a substantial increase in the number of request for information, from 80 in March 2013 to 544 mid-May 2014. Likewise, the number of responses increased proportionally with a low and steady backlog of responses.
In parallel to the work on legal frameworks establishing the right to access to information, the MDTF supported the development of an “Open Budget” Internet platform in Tunisia, in order to facilitate broad access to detailed fiscal data.

The Open Budget platform, including an interactive open budget database called BOOST, seeks to foster budget transparency and facilitate citizen participation. A beta version with budget and expenditure data from 2008 to 2012 has been developed under the project and...
presented to the Ministry of Finance. It has been well received and is currently being finalized with updated 2013 budget data, with additional support from the Gates Foundation. The open budget platform is expected to go live by the end of 2014. This work is in partnership with the Tunisian Ministry of Economy and Finance, which has set up a participatory committee to foster fiscal transparency and assists in honoring Tunisia’s commitment and membership in the OGP. Tunisia is now in the process of developing an OGP implementation plan and needs effective open budget tools to make an impact on the ground.

**Impact study on Access to Information**

In order to strengthen the advocacy for swift and broad access to information and increase the private sector’s ownership of this new policy, a study was launched to develop an evaluation methodology suited for middle income countries and to assess the potential economic impact of access to public sector information (PSI) in Morocco. By identifying and defining PSI goods in reference to recent literature and basic concepts of information economics, the study primarily sought to provide evidence for the benefits of information transparency, offer a reliable estimate of the potential value of PSI goods to the private sector (i.e. cost reduction, increase in sales and willingness to pay), and provide a quantitative baseline on the usefulness of various types of PSI for future research both in Morocco and across MENA countries, advancing the policy dialogue regarding the importance and impact of information openness in the region. The study is carried out in partnership with Morocco’s main business association (Confederation of General Enterprises (CGEM)) and professional survey firm. About 380 firms have been surveyed and 18 qualitative interviews were conducted between July 2013 and May 2014. Preliminary findings confirm the largely untapped economic potential of greater access to public sector information in Morocco, both in terms of cost reduction for firms, as well as in potential increase in sales.

**Citizen Engagement**

Activities supporting or catalyzing citizen engagement are a natural component of work on strengthening governance and are an important step to the end result of a well-governed (efficient and open) government. Proactively addressing and creating favorable conditions for citizen interaction with public information sets the stage for a more smooth and seamless transition to implementation and realization of new rights to information in Morocco. Much progress was made in this arena, most notably a draft law on petitions and legislative motions derived from Morocco’s new constitution and a roadmap and technical structure for an e-participation platform.

The MENA MDTF supported a number of critical activities both strengthening government capacity and understanding as well as the development of tools for citizen engagement in Morocco. The Moroccan National Dialogue committee (60+ members) was tasked with developing a draft legal framework on public engagement and conducting a year-long consultation process among civil society on the national and regional level. Within the frame of this consultative body, the MDTF provided technical assistance to the National
Dialogue. This took the form of policy advice through policy notes and guidance documents on public consultations, petitions and legislative motions as well as a series of three technical seminars sharing international good practices and facilitating knowledge exchange on legal frameworks and petitions systems were held with participation from the Minister in Charge of Relations with Parliament and Civil Society. A closing consultative conference was held in Rabat March 2014, facilitating sharing of technical expertise and international benchmarking on relevant policy proposals. The proposals have been subject to a year-long National Dialogue involving more than 10,000 civil society organizations across the country and abroad.

Additionally, the MDTF supported the development of a multi-stakeholder working group focused on the development of a centralized e-participation platform. The platform itself aims to be implemented across the entire government, to act as a ‘one-stop-shop’ for all public engagement initiatives, including e-Petitions. The working group is comprised of representatives from civil society, government, academia, and will eventually integrate members of Parliament. The group also produced a collective benchmarking of similar initiatives across the world as well as a roadmap for the development of Morocco’s platform to be submitted to policy makers for approval. A beta version has been developed for demonstrational purposes. Once the functionalities and institutional arrangements of this government platform have been validated, the Deauville Partnership’s Transition Fund will support the Ministry for ICT in the platform’s IT development for testing in two public bodies.
**Measuring Demand and Preferences for Citizen Engagement**

In collaboration with the World Bank’s Open Data team and with civil society, a research project was designed and implemented to assess public opinion on the new Moroccan rights on public engagement, including awareness and preferences for engagement. Initial key findings are shared through the infographics below and offer additional input into the refinement of existing and development of new citizen engagement tools. From March 21 through April 10, 2014 a nano-survey was “live” in both French and Arabic. In total 54,441 randomly sampled internet users across Morocco were exposed to the survey with 15,020 participating and providing at least partial responses. 3,942 participants provided complete responses to the 9 primary questions in the survey (all raw response data is available in open data format on the Bank's website through this link). It is important to note that while the methodology and technology used are extremely powerful, a key limitation of this methodology is that it only measures the sentiment of internet users.

** Strengthening Local Governance**

This was both a cross-cutting objective and a new area of engagement. Local governments, which are the font line providers of basic public services to the population and often the primary interlocutors, have been systematically included in the scope of the open government policies supported by the project and to the extent possible in related capacity building events. For instance, citizens can request information or submit a petition to their local government. Representatives from the regions were invited to the seminars, consultations and training sessions on petitions and access to information.

The MDTF activity also included a specific component to inform the reform of fiscal transfers and equalization in Morocco. The diagnostic study has been carried out and delivered to the Ministry of Interior, but the expected outcome – the reform of the transfer system – was not yet achieved. This reform is part of a broader reform on regionalization in Morocco, which requires the overhaul of the country’s territorial organization, legal framework and institutions. This highly political reform has encountered delays and the transfer system will be reviewed once there is more clarity on the number, size and competencies of local governments.
Infographics of the citizen engagement nano survey, April 2014
Beneficiary Feedback

The project’s support was very much appreciated by the beneficiaries as evidenced by the increased engagement and cooperation on these reforms in both countries and the positive feedback received. For example, Ms Benkhaldoun, Head of cabinet of the Minister in charge of relations with Parliament and Civil society voiced her appreciation for the project’s support to their new citizen engagement policies during the MDTF Program Council meeting held in Rabat in June, 2013. Likewise, in Tunisia the key counterparts reiterated their appreciation for the support. For example, the Director General for Administrative Reform at the Prime Minister’s office in Tunisia expressed his great appreciation for the advice and support to the country’s new Open Government policies. The Head of the Tunisian budget committee expressed her thanks for the support to concretize the Ministry's new fiscal transparency policy through an open budget platform.

Challenges Encountered

Regional political and economic instability are ongoing challenges to governance reforms and progress. Open governance is a new concept in the region, which faced numerous legal, institutional and cultural hurdles that need to be overcome through a comprehensive and inclusive change management strategy that fosters collective appropriation and problem solving and helps alleviate fears from public officials. The broad scope of these structural reforms requires substantial capacity building and implementation support. The MDTF-funded activity provided initial technical assistance and capacity building but this needs to be complemented by the Government's own resources to mainstream the implementation of these cross-cutting policies and train all concerned officials. The setup of strong monitoring and enforcement structures is also a key element of success and thus foreseen in the respective laws. Finally, like all efforts focused on improving e-government and online tools, the digital divide (access to broadband and the internet) adds an additional layer of complexity and a gap to be addressed to ensure balanced and more equal citizen engagement and participation.

Way Forward

Moving forward as governance reforms and policies are implemented, it is important to begin applying the principles of access to information, citizen engagement, and open government and transitioning towards their respective practice. Given the high visibility of these reforms in both countries, the World Bank Group continues to provide essential technical support to the Ministries and agencies now tasked with the implementation of these policies, with the support from the Transition Fund, building on the outcomes of the MENA MDTF activity. For example, the Ministry of Finance in Morocco appreciated the Bank’s support to the performance budgeting reform and thus requested a continued implementation support, which will be financed through the Transition Fund. Likewise, the implementation of the new petitions law and local government reforms will be supported by the Transition Fund project called “Governance Framework Implementation Support Project” directly building on the policy advice provided through the MDTF.
Overall, this cross-cutting and collaborative approach and progress thus far have contributed to reforms that help position these countries in a trajectory towards not only membership in the Open Government Partnership (OGP) but also the subsequent honoring of those commitments and mainstreaming this new form of governance across a public administration that is traditionally top down and rather secretive. Support of access to information reforms in Tunisia has played an important role in the country's membership in OGP earlier this year. Morocco has also expressed interest in joining and is well underway on fulfilling the necessary eligibility criteria. Progress towards open and more effective governments has been made but expediting the journey forward is a key to capturing the promise and momentum of governance reform and fulfilling the promises of the Arab Spring.
2. MENA MDTF Results Story on the Yemen Decentralization and Local Governance Initiative: World Bank Support to the National Dialogue in Yemen
Overview

As part of its transition, Yemen launched a National Dialogue in 2013 to provide a forum for negotiating a new governance framework under which issues of future economic and social policies were to be created and implemented. Issues of state structure, resource sharing and management, and local governance and service delivery were some of the key issues on which the National Dialogue sought consensus. To ensure this debate is sufficiently informed by technical details, the Government of Yemen requested Bank’s support to provide technical assistance to the process. In response, the Bank launched the MDTF-financed initiative ‘Yemen Decentralization and Local Governance Initiative’ to leverage the Bank’s expertise and global experience in areas of state structure and federalism, decentralization, local governance, service delivery, good governance etc. to inform and support the National Dialogue Conference.

To launch this initiative, the Bank organized in collaboration with the National Dialogue Secretariat on March 16, 2013—two days before the start of the National Dialogue—a major workshop titled “Yemen in Transition and Beyond: Decentralization, State Building and Development”. This event was inaugurated by H.E. the Prime Minister and over 150 National Dialogue delegates, youth and women representatives, political parties, media, CSOs and donor community members participated. Additionally, the ‘Yemen Decentralization and Local Governance Initiative’ continued to inform the policy debates throughout the National Dialogue process by providing demand-based and just-in-time policy advice and critical analytical support to Working Groups within the National Dialogue Conference. In parallel, this initiative launched an innovative communications campaign on decentralization and local governance employing print, electronic, and social media, to engage and create awareness among key government representatives, civil society groups, and broader sections of the society. Additionally, this initiative conducted a
parallel perception survey aimed at understanding the evolving attitudes of different stakeholders on issues of State restructuring, decentralization and local governance.

**Approach**

The key components of the Bank’s initiative included:

1. Demand-based policy and analytical support on issues of federalism, decentralization and good governance in the form of high caliber national and international experts to assist the National Dialogue Conference. The support was in the form of just-in-time policy advice and critical analytical activities to inform policy dialogue taking place within various working groups of the National Dialogue.

2. Advocacy and awareness building on issues of federalism and decentralization in the form of an innovative communications campaign to create awareness among key government and civil society stakeholder groups including those outside the National Dialogue Conference. This communications campaign innovatively employed print, electronic and social media tools including a website and a dedicated Facebook page to reach out to a broad segment of the society. Thus far the Facebook page has attracted over 10,000 followers.

3. Conducting a Perception survey among key constituents around the National Dialogue process to understand the evolving nature of their attitudes on issues relating to decentralization—including state structure, local governance and service delivery and resource sharing. Understanding how these perceptions change/converge among targeted stakeholder groups over the National Dialogue period provided valuable insights on how best to calibrate Bank’s TA on these issues.

**Outputs and Results (including Beneficiary Feedback)**

- A high profile event under the auspices of the Prime Minister two-days before the start of the National Dialogue process (March 2013) bringing together some of the most authoritative experts and practitioners from around the world (including South Africa, India, Bangladesh and US) to highlight some of the general issues relating to federalism, decentralization and resource sharing. This event was extremely well received by the participants setting the tone for Bank’s support during the rest of the National Dialogue. Throughout the process several working groups within the National Dialogue repeatedly requested similar expertise from the Bank to inform their discussions.

- Sustained TA support to three working groups (in particular, working groups on *State Structure, Governance* and *Sustainable Development*) throughout the National Dialogue process in the form of expert speakers, policy notes and presentations. The
TA support included a presentation at the above event on the *de facto* and *de jure* status of the current Local Authorities Law, a High priority analytical note (by Ehtisham Ahmad and Giorgio Brosio) on Institutional and Fiscal Arrangements to provide concrete guidance on the way forward, targeted presentations to the working groups by Ehtisham Ahmad and World Bank staff Junaid Ahmad (Sector Director, MNSSD) and Balakrishna Menon (Lead Social Development Specialist, MNSSU) and televised fielding of questions on issues of decentralization posed by the public by Junaid Ahmad and Balakrishna Menon.

- South-South exchange visit to India for 8 high-level Yemeni public personalities to gain insights on decentralization and federalism. The purpose of the study tour was to expose senior Yemeni delegates from a mix of central government institutions and local authorities to India’s experiences in federalization and decentralization. The exposure trip provided the delegates with a sense of the specific measures that worked in the context of India and possible implications for Yemen. The delegates were able to take part in a highly interactive exchange with both academicians and practitioners on these issues.

- Supporting visits by critical members of the National Dialogue (ND) secretariat to WB headquarters in Washington DC to engage different sector teams on their support to the post-ND phase. Outcomes of the ND consisted of 1800 provisions cutting across several sectors. Therefore, in envisaging WB’s sector-level support to the post-ND transition, it was important to build upon these outcomes relating to the specific sectors. It was in this context that Dr. Afrah Al-Zouba (First Deputy Secretary General) and Ms. Suad Almarani (Technical Support and International Cooperation Manager) of the ND Secretariat were hosted in Washington DC to meet and engage with sector level teams to understand how best to situate their continued support to the transition.

- Establish an innovative media campaign ‘*Sahemye (Contribute) initiative*’ with a dedicated Facebook page, website and a series of newsletters on issues of decentralization local governance. This initiative aimed to reach beyond the delegates of the National Dialogue Conference to engage a broader segment of the public. In this regard, this activity aimed to adopt an active communication and dissemination strategy, involving print, electronic, and social media, as well as other modalities of engagement such as workshops, roundtables, media events, to engage Yemeni society more broadly on issues of decentralization and federalism. The Sahem Facebook page has already attracted over 10,000 followers and the workshops, roundtables, and media events have seen active and enthusiastic participation by members of the public from a cross-section of Yemeni society.

- A perception survey among delegates of the National Dialogue and other thought-leaders to understand their perceptions with regard to federalism, decentralization and resource sharing. This survey aimed not only to understand the views/perceptions of a subset of National Dialogue delegates and other key
stakeholders, but also understand how these perceptions evolved over the period of the National Dialogue Conference. The survey found a vast majority (93%) of respondents indicating a preference for a decentralized system. Meanwhile 88% expressed their belief that, despite the Local Authorities Law of 2000, there was no genuine power devolution to localities. Instead, the consensus seemed to be that previous attempts at decentralization only resulted in increasing the power of tribal sheikhs and making them more corrupt. Interestingly, while most of the respondents clearly supported giving full fiscal (90%) and administrative (90%) autonomy to the local level, they were divided about providing political autonomy (40% for & 55% against) to localities.

Challenges Encountered

Partly because of longstanding territorial, social and political cleavages and partly disillusioned by their past experience with decentralization, many Yemenis seem to have mixed views on issues of federalism and decentralization. As the above perception survey demonstrated, most respondents (90%) overwhelmingly supported fiscal and administrative decentralization while the enthusiasm for political decentralization was much less (40%). With such mixed views, the Bank’s support on issues of state structure and decentralization carried an inherent risk of being viewed as supporting a particular position within the contentious debate. Therefore, this initiative had to make extra efforts to keep its support at a very technical level to avoid any reputational damage to the Bank. For instance, most of TA under this initiative focused on showcasing various international experiences and different institutional arrangements without being too prescriptive on specific outcomes.

At the successful conclusion of the National Dialogue in January 2014, Yemenis adopted a series of governance and policy reforms including a six-region federal state structure. To implement these decisions, the Government of Yemen has formally requested the World Bank’s to coordinate and lead a group of key multi-lateral donors to develop a comprehensive transition plan under an overarching framework. The Government’s decision to reach out to the Bank in this regard can be seen to some degree as a testimony of their appreciation for the Bank’s approach adopted under this initiative.

Next Steps

On January 25, 2014, Yemen’s National Dialogue Conference (NDC) concluded after more than ten months of deliberation. The NDC made significant progress on a daunting range of governance, structural, and social contract challenges. Through the NDC, Yemenis were able to agree upon a series of guiding principles aimed at guaranteeing rights and freedoms, reducing the centralization of power, eliminating corruption, empowering women and youth, among others. They also agreed on a six-region federal state structure. However, the ND outcomes remain quite general and broad and needs to be detailed further into governing laws. For this purpose, the Government of National Reconciliation (GNR) has nominated a Constitution Drafting Committee (CDC) with 17 members, which
will translate the ND recommendations into a draft Constitution. However, there has been limited coordination between the National Dialogue process, the government and key ministries, and donor support to the transition plans. At the same time, there is an urgent need for reaching out to citizens to alleviate current hard living conditions and boost their confidence in the transition process.

In this context, H.E., President Abdrabuh Mansour Hadi formally requested from the Bank to coordinate and lead a group of key multi-lateral donors in helping the Government of Yemen develop a comprehensive transition plan under an overarching and multi-sectoral framework to support Yemen's post-National Dialogue transition in a synchronized and sustained manner.

In this regard, the WB team will be receiving additional funding from the MENA MDTF to respond to the above request to undertake the following:

1) Help the Government coordinate and monitor a Transition Support Plan that is focused on the most urgent needs of transition.
2) Provide demand-based support for state restructuring to the CDC in select high priority areas.
3) Provide targeted and high priority institutional support for key transition and sector ministries.
3. **MDTF Results Story:** YEMEN Gender Learning and Operational Initiative – Advancing women’s voice and participation in Yemen’s next chapter

**Overview**

Yemen is a country with deeply-rooted traditions and religious beliefs. Supporting interventions to uplift women towards greater equality and decision-making have to be realized within the local socio-political and cultural realities. Key Yemeni leaders understand the importance of promoting gender equality and building a cadre of women leaders as the country transitions towards democracy. Mindful of these divergent interests, the Middle East and North Africa Multi-donor Trust Fund (MENA MDTF) financed several important consultative and hands-on activities to increase women's voice and their economic empowerment.

**Challenge**

Following the 2011 revolution, Yemen had a 13 percent contraction in growth, a vacuum in political leadership, and some further divisions of an already fragile social fabric. While economic growth is slowly rebounding as economic activity in the major sectors of the economy recover, the country still faces challenges: highest unemployment rate in MENA; highest poverty rate in the MENA region; a vulnerable government budget with a high fiscal deficit; and continued instability and violence.

Despite these challenges, Yemen is entering a distinct chapter in its history: for the first time, women have the potential to attain 30 percent representation in government in several spheres, including legislative, executive and judicial, and local councils. This is higher than the maximum achieved in any MENA country to date and a far cry from current levels of female representation in government. Yemeni women now may have the opportunity to step up to the plate and take on decision-making roles they have not been formally or traditionally required to handle. For Yemeni women to take on this new and important challenge, further support in the form of access to training, exposure to ideas, sustained education are some of the basic tools needed to begin to frame a socio-economic empowerment agenda within the rubric of Islam.

**Way forward**

The World Bank, with support from the MENA Multi Donor Trust Fund has partnered with several local NGOs on four key initiatives to increase women’s voice and economic and political participation.

1. **Faith Based Leadership Training for Women**

The *Faith Based Leadership Training for Women* was a pilot program in Sana’a that provided a ciao 10-module leadership training over a six-month period (March-September 2013) to 36 women change-makers, political advocates and civic champions. The training combined *classroom learning* (150 hours) on advocacy work, project management, business development, constitutional
concepts and law, with *action-oriented field activities* (60 hours). The hallmark of this initiative was its faith-based approach that balanced religious sensitivities and cultural norms to ensure wider awareness and acceptance on the importance of the role of women in development. Upon completion of the training, participants were awarded official diplomas certified by the Ministry of Technical Education and Vocational Training, and endorsed by the Human Rights and Social Affairs and Labor Ministries.

2. *South-South exchange on gender equality and constitutional reform*

In collaboration with the Institute for Effective States, the MDTF-supported technical assistance program organized a high-level South-South exchange on May 6, 2013 around the National Dialogue, constitution-making, state-building and gender in Yemen. The workshop brought together gender and constitutional experts, government and civil society representatives from Yemen, and policy-makers from Afghanistan, Libya, and South Africa. Participants addressed both challenges and opportunities in Yemen, and shared comparative experiences on constitutional reform and women’s rights.

3. *Consultations with marginalized communities in Yemen on women’s rights and access to services*

Building on a UNFPA’s 2012 nation-wide survey on women’s rights, the Bank extended the scope and sample representation of the survey to focus on marginalized communities to investigate rural citizens’ perception of women’s rights with a strong focus on future expectations and demands. The survey’s key finding was the community members’ deep awareness of the importance of women’s inclusion in political, economic and social realms as well as the support from male participants on women’s participation in national and local institutions. The results and insights informed the six months-long National Dialogue Conference. Policy recommendations based on survey results included: (i) introduce women’s quotas in key government bodies; (ii) explore non-formal education models to improve girls access to schooling in rural areas; and (iii) establish community-based grievance redress mechanisms for women.

4. *Piloting a gender approach of the Yemen Labor Intensive Public Works Project (PWP)*

The pilot approach supported through MDTF funding tested the feasibility of involving women more intensely in subprojects selection, preparation, implementation, operation and maintenance of the Bank’s Yemen Labor Intensive Public Works project. The project creates short-term employment and provides improved infrastructure access to a wide variety of basic services such as health, education, water supply, sewage, water harvesting, and roads. A gender pilot in which was implemented in over 30 communities led to informed gender mainstreaming throughout the PWP project cycle. Additionally, the pilot helped create awareness among the cadres of the project’s staff regarding the concept of gender inclusion, including women in community committees and in the provision of basic services that help engender inclusion (water, sanitation, health, etc.) and serve the community as a whole. Further, women directly benefited through on-the-job training, for example:

- By means of job opportunities to female social researchers in field work, thereby enhancing the skills of junior female social researchers.

“Leadership should not be monopolized by any one group. All the different social factions must come together with a larger goal to revive the next renaissance period in Yemen,” responded Ms. Ashraq Al Jarash, a Yemeni independent rights activist and course participant, about her hopes to contribute to the future of Yemeni state-building. “For me, the way forward is to start the organization I have dreamt of all my life.”
• Providing female engineers the opportunity to design studies, supervise construction projects, and work as contractors has helped to empower women in decision-making roles and to create equal opportunities of employment between both males and females.

• Special involvement of female beneficiaries in community consultations and baseline surveys during sub-project identification provides gender-differentiated analysis of the priorities and needs of service delivery.

Outputs and Results (including Beneficiary Feedback)

Faith Based Leadership Training for Women pilot

“...The program exceeded my expectations, however, the ones who benefited the most were the participants who had the least experience. I saw women on the first day begin the course without even knowing the meaning of a roundtable discussion. For those of us who have more experience with such learning modalities, we also benefited but it was different. For example, I walked away [after course completion] as a different person. I am a different person today than when I started the leadership program. ”

- Beneficiary feedback during focus group discussion, March 25, 2014.

The action-oriented field component of the training fostered important linkages of leadership trainees with their communities. The training NGO institution NODSYEMEN, organized several activities, including gathering with National Dialogue members and attending sessions, meeting with political parties on a variety of relevant issues and causes, and action plan development sessions. Course participants also carried out a wide variety of community activities, including advocating for women's rights in conflict circumstances, meeting with staff of girls’ education centers, volunteering with associations focused on street children, and organizing a symposium to sensitize women and youth on the importance of the National Dialogue Conference (NDC).

Participants put their newly-acquired skills to work and established five civic associations and one charitable foundation to support vulnerable women and children. In addition, through the application of lobbying and negotiation skills learned in the classroom, were able to get the attention of prison officials and tribunal courts regarding women who had been imprisoned and whose cases had been neglected.

The majority of participants were highly satisfied with the quality of the training. Seventy six percent of participants rated the achievement of module objectives as excellent/very good, while the remaining reported it as very good or acceptable. The submission of individual evaluations per module revealed that the majority if not all participants were satisfied with course delivery and the techniques used for teaching. Approximately half wished to see the time duration for each module extended. Over 90 percent felt that freedom of dialogue and expression was either excellent or very good. The three top modules selected by participants as most useful were: (i) Strategic Mapping, (ii) National Dialogue and Constitutional Understanding, and (iii) Mobilization, Advocacy, and Raising Support. When participants were asked what additional topics they wished to have covered, a

“In the module covering fundraising and advocacy, the trainer used role play as a tool to learn how women can gain support from different factions that might be able to help her in achieving her goals. The role-play method itself impacted my understanding of the concept of fundraising and it was powerful. I learned how it is possible to carry out such activities [fundraising and advocacy] in an effective way.

- Beneficiary feedback during focus group discussion, March 25, 2014.

reported a beneficiary during focus group discussion, March 25, 2014.
frequent response was the inclusion of a Trainer of Trainer component, demonstrating broad interest in program replication and scale-up. Further, while many commended the mix of professional and personal backgrounds found in course participants, there was a broad agreement that a future training program should a small number of participants (20 rather than 36) to enable more attention to be paid per individual.

Yemen Labor Intensive Public Works Project

The piloted gender approach to the Bank's own Public Works Project has led to a revised Operations Manual, which now includes provisions to systematically involve women's voice and participation at all stages of the sub-project cycle and will be applicable to all public works sub-projects, covering 100% of activities, specifically:

- Strengthening greater participation of women in community consultations and through increasing the number of female social researchers from various districts;
- Increasing the number of female delegates for Community Committees that are in charge of identifying the priorities and needs of the community;
- Employing more female engineers during subproject design, implementation and supervision; and
- Facilitating the hiring of women in the short-term employment scheme.

Challenges Encountered

The Faith-based Leadership Training for Women pilot faced three main challenges during implementation. The first and largest challenge was the recruitment of potential women leaders due to the timing of the pilot, cost implications, as well as participant requirement to obtain permission and time off from work and family responsibilities. For example, the pilot's launch in March 2013 coincided with the launch of the NDC, a six-month process designed to provide recommendations for the country's new constitution. Many of the prospective women change-makers were involved in the NDC and thus were time-constrained to participate in the leadership training. Associated costs such as those related to transportation and learning materials were raised as a challenge by some applicants and may have been deterrents for other prospective students. The second challenge was related to the duration of the training program, which was considered long and therefore prone to interruptions by the ever-evolving political and security situation, as well as national holidays. Lastly, due to the security situation in Yemen, visiting World Bank missions were limited and at times suspended, which posed supervision challenges especially around quality in design and implementation of the program. The Bank relied heavily on the implementing organization, NODSYEMEN, for quality assurance.

“One of the biggest challenges with the implementation of the 30% quota is how to address rumors or misperceptions of what it implies among the general public. I was sitting in a gathering with mothers against illiteracy, and a woman said the quota is haram, and I asked her why. She said that it allows a woman to get married over her husband, for example. I then clarified what the quota system meant but raising awareness is needed to sensitize the average citizen on this matter.”

- Beneficiary feedback during focus group discussion, March 25, 2014.

The consultations with marginalized communities faced two challenges during implementation: The first challenge was the travel constraints of female surveyors who were obliged to travel to the districts and back home on the same day. The women surveys required approval of spouses or parents to travel and some male family members insisted in accompanying women. The second challenge was that community members demanded 'fees' for the time they spent with
enumerators. This was overcome by proper communication with local authorities and community leaders before conducting the survey, including the involvement of local sheiks to explain the importance of participation.

The **piloted gender approach in the public works project** served to find realistic solutions to a variety of implementation challenges, including: (i) Little practical work experience of female engineers to be able to compete against male engineers, (ii) Lack of mobility of female engineers to be able to work in remote rural areas due to lack of safe transport and accommodation and social norms, and (iii) Social norms preventing women from working side-by-side of men in some communities. The nature of the pilot itself was designed to identify which phases of the PWP project cycle would be best suited for up-scaling of the gender mainstreaming approach. The lessons learned from this activity are directly applicable to other Community Driven Development Projects and Public Works Projects.

**The Way Forward**

"The Women Leadership Training Program focused, importantly, on the notion of co-existence. The participant mix was very diverse. We had women from different backgrounds, professions, ideologies, political parties, and experience. There were tensions in the beginning on specific issues but as the course progressed we learned to work together and build consensus. We became a family. We set up organizations that while small in scale, the important outcome was that we achieved it together despite our differences."

- Beneficiary feedback during focus group discussion, March 25, 2014.

In light of the landmark 30 percent quota of female representation in government, the Bank is looking into scaling-up training programs to reach women in governorates outside the capital Sana’a. A recently approved Bank Civil Society Support project (P146312) that focuses on training NGOs and providing grants for sub-projects can provide an important avenue for NODSYEMEN to access additional funds for scale up. Building on the pilot experience, NODSYEMEN is in a better position to improve recruitment tactics and selection process in order to create linkages with existing and/or planned skill-building programs to leverage capacity and expertise. Additionally, champions from the pilot could be identified and given the option to join as prospective trainers for future leadership trainings. This trainer-of-trainer approach would help promote sustainability and increase the program’s cost-effectiveness. In order to ensure employability and application of skills learnt, the scale-up program could explore partnerships with organizations that implement employability and school-to-work transition programs for women, such as the International Labor Organization.

The results and lessons learned of piloted gender approach in the public works project has helped introduce gender in the operations manual of the Yemen Additional Financing Labor Intensive Public Works project which is currently in the pipeline. Specifically, gender-focused activities will help increase the project impact for women by (i) giving women more voice through community consultations during sub-project preparation, (ii) by employing more female engineers during sub-project design, implementation and supervision, and (iii) by encouraging the short-term employment of female beneficiaries during subproject implementation. The team believes that this MDTF supported technical assistance activity has helped to implement the mainstreaming gender inclusiveness through a sustainable mechanisms embedded in the project structure, which can become a model for other programs and partnerships in Yemen and beyond.
PHOTOS

Leadership training for women as change-makers in Yemen

Including women in consultations in Yemen Public Works Project: Before and After.


4 MENA MDTF Results Story: The MENA Community of Practice on Employment and Social Safety Nets

OVERVIEW

The Middle East and North Africa (MENA) Community of Practice on Employment and Social Safety Nets ("the community") facilitates south-south knowledge exchanges in nine countries (Morocco, Tunisia, Jordan, Iraq, Palestine Territories, Egypt, Djibouti, Lebanon and Yemen), creating a space for practitioners from the region to share their operational experience, knowledge, and best practices on issues related to the design and implementation of employment and social safety nets (SSN) programs. The Middle East and North African Multi-donor Trust Fund (MENA MDTF) provided catalytic funding to help kick-start the community. Specifically, through a total technical assistance grant of $442,000, the MENA MDTF funded a series of workshops, study tours and how-to guides and manuals, and also helped leverage $383,000 from the World Bank's regional partnership program that has allowed sustaining and continuing this important initiative.

CHALLENGE

The MENA region has recently been affected by several overlapping systemic and unpredictable shocks that, coupled with a large and growing youth bulge, have led to high unemployment (especially among high-skilled youth), poor working conditions, and reduced available income among the most vulnerable. As such, post Arab Spring, many countries in the Middle East and North Africa region have begun to re-define, reform, and scale-up their social programs. In this context, policy makers in the region are eager to learn from each other and to change the rules of the game, while identifying best practices that can be adapted to their country's context.

APPROACH

The work on this community focuses on three main axes/key components:

- **Operationalization:** this axis seeks to establish and deliver a community of practitioners in the areas of employment programs and safety nets that will interact regularly to share operational knowledge in relation to the design and implementation of social programs. This entails identifying the government officials and other potential participants, the specific topics, the experts, and facilitating their regular communication and interaction.
• **Knowledge dissemination**: this axis seeks to effectively disseminate international best practices for the design and implementation of employment and SSN programs through regular videoconference (VC) meetings (once every two months), workshops and study tours.

• **Knowledge generation**: this axis seeks to document the knowledge that is shared within the community through the generation of a series of policy notes and “how-to-guides/manuals” for practitioners on how to improve specific aspects of SSN and employment programs.

To-date, more than 250 different government officials from over 33 different government agencies and institutions in the region have benefited from knowledge activities conducted by the community, including: a launching workshop, six virtual workshops, three study tours (one of employment and two on SSNs), and three regional training courses (one on employment and two on SSNs). Practitioners have been exposed several learning and knowledge sharing tools, such as to blogs, bi-weekly newsletters (the community’s feature of the month/week), and several knowledge/how-to bulletins.

Table 1: Total beneficiaries by country

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Jordan</th>
<th>Lebanon</th>
<th>Iraq</th>
<th>Morocco</th>
<th>Tunisia</th>
<th>Yemen</th>
<th>Djibouti</th>
<th>Egypt</th>
<th>Palestinian Territories</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Launching workshop</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study tours</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virtual workshops</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training courses</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total participants</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**MAIN RESULTS (and BENEFICIARY FEEDBACK)**

In March 2014 an online survey was conducted with the objective of assessing the results, impact and effectiveness of the community after one year of its establishment. The survey consisted in a combination of multiple-choice and open-ended questions on the overall usefulness of the community, the value of networking with practitioners, the topics of interest, as well as questions on the community’s management.²

**Overall usefulness of the community**

Survey results indicate that 83% of all respondents considered that the community has been useful for improving the design and implementation aspects of their country’s social programs. Furthermore, two-thirds of the practitioners consider the community of practice is either useful or very useful, the two highest possible marks of 4 and 5, respectively (figure 1). Practitioners were

² The survey (ongoing) has been so far completed by 23 practitioners (5 female, 18 male) from 8 countries (Tunisia, Morocco, Lebanon, Iraq, Yemen, Palestinian Territories, Egypt and Djibouti). The main results of the survey are summarized below
also asked to evaluate the usefulness of the community as a tool for learning about international practices and as a tool for improving the design and implementation of their programs. In this regard, 100% of the practitioners expressed that the community has been useful for learning more about international best practices in the area of social safety nets.

**Figure 1:** Please rate the overall usefulness of the Community of Practice on a scale from 1 (minimum) to 5 (maximum)

![Bar chart showing the overall usefulness of the Community of Practice.]

**Networking among practitioners**

When asked about the usefulness of interacting with countries from their own region, 50% of all respondents considered these interactions were either helpful or very helpful. Moreover, 53% of all respondents considered that the community has helped them build either strong or very strong linkages with practitioners from their own region (see figure 2).

**Figure 2:** Usefulness of interactions within the region

On a scale of 1 to 5 (1 being not useful and 5 very useful)

![Bar charts showing the usefulness of interacting with countries from the region and the community's help in creating linkages.]

The community helped you create stronger linkages with practitioners from the region.
Mechanisms used to foster interaction

Virtual workshops and e-mail are considered as the most effective mechanisms, followed by face-to-face meetings and the virtual platform (figure 3).

**Figure 3:** Usefulness of different mechanisms used to foster interaction (% of respondents who rated these mechanisms with either 5 or 4)

On a scale of 1 to 5 (1 being not useful and 5 very useful) please evaluate the mechanisms used to foster interaction

![Bar chart showing the usefulness of different mechanisms](image)

Endorsement from World Bank Staff Leading Country Dialogue

Finally, through a small survey in August 2013, the team interviewed World Bank technical staff leading policy dialogue (project leaders) in the field of social protection as well as directors (managers) from beneficiary countries. All project leaders (100% of those interviewed) and 80% of all country directors endorsed the initiative and favored the continuation of the activities it supports. Results of the survey are summarized as follows (Figure 4 and Table 2):

**Figure 4:** Do you believe the activities conducted by the Community in Fiscal Year 2013 were useful?

![Bar chart showing the usefulness of activities](image)

Note: Sample includes eligible project leaders from Tunisia, Lebanon, Jordan, Egypt, Morocco, Djibouti, Iraq, Yemen, KSA, and Palestinian Territories.
Table 2: Why do you think this community should be further supported (Program Leaders)

1. In Tunisia, this work has supported our policy dialogue under the employment Technical Assistance program (ALMPs reform) and also contributed to the design of a lending operation (based on international best practices).

2. The community gives us an option of using the community as a training institute for our government counterparts and as a source / benchmark of global best practices. It was very useful in advancing policy dialogue where the opinion of government counterpart evolved after the Safety Nets course, for example.

3. The community helped provide a venue and tools for practitioners in the region to exchange lessons learned and best practices in the design and delivery of social safety nets and active labor market programs. This has been confirmed and characterized by the active participation of the various country representatives and also the positive feedback received from participants following each activity. The vast majority of feedback providers highly appreciated the opportunity to network, share knowledge and learn from others, especially when facing issues, challenges or bottlenecks of common nature.

4. Though the community was initiated in less than a year ago, a very strong network of practitioners has been built in less than a year. This platform not only exposed our Yemeni counterparts to other country programs in the region but also outside the region. In Yemen, it brought Social Fund and Social Welfare Fund together to advance social protection agenda, and now two institutions are discussing social program targeting, M&E, graduation programs, etc. Using various formats such as study tours, audio-conferences, workshops, and e-platforms complement ongoing capacity building project (i.e. Social Welfare Fund Institutional Support Project) very well especially under the current country and security context.

5. We connected the participants of the MENA SSN core course with the wider community which proved to be very useful.

6. It is important to keep bringing counterparts together to learn from each other.

COMMUNICATIONS

The community’s events and learning outputs have been disseminated through social media, the community’s e-platform, as well as other websites (e.g. the World Bank MENA Facebook page, the Jobs Knowledge Platform, as well as blog forums). Below some links to existing publications produced by the Community:


• Quick Note: [http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTMENA/Resources/QN84.pdf](http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTMENA/Resources/QN84.pdf)

• Knowledge Bulletin, "Voices of Practitioners": this bulletin is intended to open a space for community practitioners from the region to share interesting design and implementation features about their programs. The first bulletin was written by Mr. Daoud Al-Deek, Deputy Assistant for Administrative Development and Planning of the Ministry of Social Affairs of the Palestinian Territories, describing the Palestinian Conditional Cash Transfer Program.

• E-platform: The MENA community created a virtual network using the World Bank's Collaboration for Development Platform. Through this platform ([https://collaboration.worldbank.org/groups/mena-community-of-practice/](https://collaboration.worldbank.org/groups/mena-community-of-practice/)), practitioners can stay in contact with each other, initiate discussions, ask questions, as well as share information and documents on regional best practices on employment and safety nets. To date, the platform counts with 87 members (36 female, 51 male). There have been 29 discussions, and 69 documents have been shared.

**CHALLENGES ENCOUNTERED**

Although the community has been established more than a year and half ago, and continues to grow and consolidate itself, there are some challenges that have been encountered. First, the community targets high-level government officials so this sometimes presents a challenge in terms of the level of engagement practitioners can have in the different activities organized in the context of the community. Second, while beneficiary feedback shows that the community constitutes an initiative that is highly valued by the region’s participants, efforts need to be sustained in order to increase client ownership of the community and guarantee its sustainability.

**WAY FORWARD**

In order to assure the community's sustainability and to establish stronger links and interactions between practitioners in the region, efforts need to be sustained. Based on the experience of the Latin America and Africa regions, a community of practice requires at least five years to be self-sustaining and for country members to take ownership of the facilitation, financing, and coordination of activities. The team considers that currently the MENA community is too young and World Bank facilitation and financing is still needed to capitalize on the task's momentum and, most importantly, to assure continuity and sustainability. In order to improve cost effectiveness, it is recommended that more emphasis is given by the community to the organization of virtual workshops the development of the e-platform (low-cost activities of larger outreach) and less emphasis to the study tours (which are costly and can only benefit a small number of practitioners). This said, at least one face-to-face interaction between practitioners per fiscal year is recommended to improve the relations between members and to expose some of them to first hand operational experiences in the design and implementation of social programs.
In order to sustain the efforts and progress of the community, the MENA region partnership program in the cooperation with the Center for Mediterranean Integration, the International Monetary Fund, and the French Agency for Development will provide additional financing to the community in fiscal year 2015 (about US$175 thousand) to undertake the following activities:

- Continue with the community’s management (E-platform, communications, organization of knowledge sharing events, and M&E of all events conducted by the community).
- Continue with the organization of bi-monthly virtual mini-workshops covering themes that have been selected by the practitioners (within the region).
- Foster interaction between the MENA communities with practitioners from other regions.
- Provide cross support to MENA course on Labor Policy (in partnership with IMF) (planned for the first Quarter of FY15).
- Organize a face-to-face activity (workshop or study tour) with high level practitioners and government officials (based on concrete regional needs/demands and in close coordination with TTLs and country teams).

The community will continue to develop partnerships within the World Bank Group and with other international organizations in order to sustain and pursue the continuity of this community in the medium term.