



# EQUITY AND INCLUSION IN EDUCATION IN WORLD BANK PROJECTS:

*Persons with Disabilities, Indigenous Peoples, and Sexual and Gender Minorities*

May 2019



This report was prepared by World Bank staff. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed here do not necessarily reflect the views of The World Bank, its Board of Executive Directors, or the governments they represent. The sole responsibility of this publication lies with the authors. The European Union is not responsible for any use that may be made of the information contained herein.

The World Bank does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this work. The boundaries, color, denominations, and other information shown on any map in this work do not imply any judgement on the part of the World Bank concerning the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

**Rights and Permissions:**

The World Bank encourages dissemination of its knowledge, this work may be reproduced, in whole or in part, for noncommercial purposes as long as full attribution to the work is given.

The material in this work is subject to copyright.

**PHOTO CREDITS FROM LEFT TO RIGHT:**

Dominic Chavez/World Bank, Corinna Kern, wavebreakmedia / Shutterstock, Movilh Chile, Curt Carnemark / World Bank, Simone D. McCourtie / World Bank, Mohamad Al-Arief / World Bank, Jenny Matthews/Leonard Cheshire Disability, GPE/Sarah Beeching, Dominic Chavez/World Bank, Trevor Samson / World Bank, Corinna Kern

© 2019 International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / International Development Association or The World Bank  
1818 H Street NW  
Washington DC 20433



## EQUITY AND INCLUSION IN EDUCATION IN WORLD BANK PROJECTS:

*Persons with Disabilities, Indigenous Peoples, and Sexual and Gender Minorities*

**May 2019**

# CONTENTS

<b>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</b> .....	4
<b>INTRODUCTION</b> .....	6
<b>FOCUS OF BRIEF</b> .....	7
<b>INTENDED AUDIENCE</b> .....	7
<b>STRUCTURE</b> .....	7
<b>CHAPTER 1:</b>	
<b>INCLUSION AND EQUITY IN EDUCATION</b> .....	9
1.1 CONTEXT .....	9
1.2 PRINCIPLES OF INCLUSIVE EDUCATION TO ACHIEVE INCLUSION AND EQUITY .....	10
1.3 SYSTEMIC REFORM TO ACHIEVE INCLUSIVE EDUCATION .....	16
<b>CHAPTER 2.</b>	
<b>APPROACHES TO ENSURE INCLUSION AND EQUITY IN EDUCATION FOR LEARNERS WITH DISABILITIES, INDIGENOUS LEARNERS, AND LEARNERS BELONGING TO SEXUAL OR GENDER MINORITIES</b> .....	18
2.1 INCLUSIVE EDUCATION FOR MARGINALIZED LEARNERS .....	19
2.2 INCLUSIVE EDUCATION FOR PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES .....	20
2.3 INCLUSIVE EDUCATION FOR INDIGENOUS PEOPLES .....	24
2.4 INCLUSIVE EDUCATION FOR SEXUAL AND GENDER MINORITIES .....	30
2.5 MONITORING AND EVALUATING INCLUSIVE EDUCATION .....	36
<b>CONCLUSION:</b>	
<b>ADDRESSING WORLD'S EDUCATIONAL ATTAINMENT GAPS IS PRECONDITION TO REDUCE EXTREME POVERTY</b> .....	39
<b>APPENDIX 1. KEY RESOURCES</b> .....	40
<b>APPENDIX 2. GLOSSARY</b> .....	44
<b>APPENDIX 3. SYSTEM-WIDE CHECKLIST QUESTIONS</b> .....	47

## TABLES

- Table 1:** Causes, Consequences, and Prevention of Educational Exclusion and Inequity
- Table 2:** What Are the Key Barriers to Participation and Learning for Learners with Disabilities?
- Table 3:** What Are the Key Barriers to Participation and Learning for Indigenous Peoples?
- Table 4:** What Are the Barriers to Participation and Learning for Sexual and Gender Minority Learners?
- Table 5:** Addressing Exclusion and Inequity through Inclusive Education Approaches: Illustrative Measures
- Table 6:** General Indicators for Evaluating Inclusive Education for Disadvantaged Learners with Disabilities
- Table 7:** Indicators for Evaluating Inclusive Education for Learners with Disabilities
- Table 8:** Indicators for Evaluating Inclusive Education for SGM Learners
- Table 9:** Indicators for Evaluating Inclusive Education for Indigenous Learners

## FIGURES

- Figure 1:** From Separate Schools to Inclusive Education Systems
- Figure 2:** Elements of Inclusive Education
- Figure 3:** Components of System-Wide Inclusion in Education
- Figure 4:** Scoping Questions for Assessing Exclusion in Education

## BOXES

- Box 1.** Respect, Protect, and Fulfill Framework for Inclusive Education
- Box 2.** World Bank Group Education Strategy 2020
- Box 3.** What Does Supporting Students with Disabilities in Education Mean?
- Box 4.** Disability Inclusion Education in Guyana: Education Sector Improvement Project
- Box 5.** Indigenous Education in Colombia: Preparation of Educational Materials with Sociocultural Relevance
- Box 6.** Indigenous Education Practices
- Box 7.** Inclusive Education in Nicaragua: Using the Knowledge Traditions of the Mayangna People to Build an Inclusive Curriculum
- Box 8.** Cultural Inclusion in Education in Paraguay: Addressing Linguistic and Cultural Inclusion
- Box 9.** Gender and Diversity Inclusion in Curricula in Namibia
- Box 10.** Resources to Train Teachers to Support LGBTI Youth in Scotland
- Box 11.** Combatting Homophobic and Transphobic Bullying in Schools in Albania



# ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The paper on Education for Inclusion and Equity in World Bank Projects: Persons with Disabilities, Indigenous Peoples, and Sexual and Gender Minorities was prepared as a knowledge product by a team led by Charlotte McClain-Nhlapo (Global Disability Advisor) in collaboration with Clifton Cortez (Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity (SOGI) Global Advisor) and Luis Felipe Duchicela (Former Global Advisor on Indigenous Peoples) and the Inclusive Education Thematic Group of the Education Global Practice. The note was prepared and drafted by Janet Lord (Consultant) in consultation with a World Bank team comprising (in alphabetical order) Hanna Alasuutari (Inclusive Education Thematic Lead, Education Specialist, Education Global Practice), John (Ioannis) Arzinos (SOGI Consultant), Mary Donovan (Social Inclusion Consultant), Deepti Raja (Disability and Development ET Consultant), Ruchi Singh (Disability and Inclusive Education Consultant), and Michelle Morandotti (Knowledge Management ET Consultant). Colum Garrity (Senior Knowledge and Learning Officer, World Bank) gave valuable advice and support in preparing the brief for publication.

The team acknowledges and thanks peer reviewers Dianna M. Pizarro (Senior Social Development Specialist) and Jason Allen Weaver (Senior Education Specialist). The team is grateful for thoughtful and detailed comments on an earlier draft by Gina Cosentino (Senior Social Development Specialist), Christopher Thomas (Inclusive Education Thematic Lead, Adviser, Education Global Practice), and Jeffrey Waite (Adviser, Education Global Practice).

The team would like to express its gratitude to the Disability-Inclusive Development Knowledge Silo Breaker (KSB), Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity (KSB), and Indigenous Peoples and Ethnic Minorities, and the Education Global Practice. The team is grateful for the support of Maitreyi Das (Practice Manager, Social, Urban, Rural and Resilience Global Practice) and Omar Arias (Practice Manager, Education Global Practice) to advance knowledge in breaking barriers against the inclusion of children with disabilities; children who are or are perceived as sexual or gender minorities; and children who belong to indigenous groups or ethnic minority groups.

Graphic Design and Page Layout by Carlos Plaza Design Studio.

# ACRONYMS & ABBREVIATIONS

<b>CRPD</b>	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
<b>ESF</b>	Environmental and Social Framework
<b>IBE</b>	Intercultural Bilingual Education
<b>ICE</b>	Intercultural Education
<b>IE</b>	Inclusive Education
<b>ICCPR</b>	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
<b>INEE</b>	Inter-Agency Network for Education in Emergencies
<b>LGBTI</b>	Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Intersex
<b>SDG</b>	Sustainable Development Goals
<b>SGM</b>	Sexual and Gender Minorities
<b>SOGIESC</b>	Sexual Orientation, Gender Identity, Gender Expression, and Sex Characteristics
<b>UN</b>	United Nations
<b>UNDP</b>	United Nations Development Program
<b>UNESCO</b>	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
<b>WHO</b>	World Health Organization



The findings, interpretations, and conclusions herein are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/World Bank and its affiliated organizations, its Executive Directors, or the governments that they represent.



Inclusion and equity in and through education is the cornerstone of a transformative education agenda, and we therefore commit to addressing all forms of exclusion and marginalization, disparities and inequalities in access, participation and learning outcomes.

— UNESCO, *Education 2030: Incheon Declaration and Framework for Action* (2015)



## EQUITY AND INCLUSION IN EDUCATION IN WORLD BANK PROJECTS:

*Persons with Disabilities, Indigenous Peoples, and Sexual and Gender Minorities*

## INTRODUCTION

At the heart of the World Bank Group Education Strategy 2020: Learning for All is the recognition that a holistic, multidimensional approach is essential to achieve education for all.<sup>i</sup> Student-centered learning is a precondition for achieving inclusion and equity for all students, especially those who are disadvantaged in society. Moreover, teachers and school leaders have an affirmative duty to create the conditions within which students can be included, learn, and thrive. Education is a crucial determinant of an individual's income, health (as well as the health of his or her children), and participation in society. Exclusion and inequality in education contribute to inequalities in economic, social, cultural, and other dimensions of well-being.<sup>ii</sup>

Through its work on social inclusion, the World Bank Group (WBG) aims to improve the terms under which individuals and groups take part in society.<sup>iii</sup> Exclusion of individuals and groups takes place through practices and processes that derive from norms and values. Inclusion can be achieved by improving the abilities and opportunities of people disadvantaged based on their identity (individual or collective) or intrinsic personal characteristics to take part in society,<sup>iv</sup> including in education. The World Bank's Environmental and Social Framework (ESF) notes that inclusion encompasses policies to promote equality and nondiscrimination together with actions to remove barriers for those excluded from development.<sup>v</sup> An essential component of realizing both the aims of the ESF, together with the inclusion and equity education mandate of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), entails specific and practical measures to ensure that learners are effectively included and appropriately supported in safe and accessible learning environments.

## FOCUS OF PAPER

This paper focuses on three groups who experience deeply entrenched disadvantages, inequity, exclusion, and discrimination in education: persons with disabilities, Indigenous Peoples, and sexual and gender minorities. Inclusion and equity in education at all levels recognize the responsibility of the school system and individual teachers and school leaders to create a learning environment that facilitates all students. Inclusion and equity also require an enabling law and policy environment that support inclusion and nondiscrimination in education and in all spheres of life. Making education inclusive and equitable requires recognizing (a) that many different groups experience exclusion and (b) that some individuals' exclusion is compounded by their belonging to more than one disadvantaged group.

## INTENDED AUDIENCE

The intended audience for this resource includes Task Team Leaders (TTLs) across sectors as well as TTLs engaged in thematic issue areas. The resource is designed to provide baseline guidance for TTLs engaged in developing project concepts; and, when deeper guidance is required, to point to additional resources.

## STRUCTURE

Chapter 1 outlines the context for inclusive education in relation to persons with disabilities, Indigenous Peoples and sexual and gender minorities,<sup>vi</sup> and sets out core principles for equality and inclusion in education that should guide any education project or program design. Chapter 2 sets out practical approaches for addressing equity and inclusion in education, with specific attention to persons with disabilities, Indigenous Peoples, and sexual and gender minorities. Appendix 1 lists resources on inclusive education, particularly for persons with disabilities, Indigenous Peoples, and sexual and gender minorities. Appendix 2 provides sample indicators to guide education project assessment and design specific to all three groups. Appendix 3 provides a checklist to ensure inclusion of persons with disabilities, Indigenous Peoples, and sexual and gender minorities throughout the education system.



The World Bank Group commits to removing barriers to access quality education so that the right to education may be upheld for all children and youth.

— *World Bank Group Education Strategy 2020 (2011)*

# CHAPTER 1:

---

## INCLUSION AND EQUITY IN EDUCATION

### 1.1 CONTEXT

Transforming Our World: The 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development by the United Nations addresses exclusion and prioritizes the needs of the most vulnerable and disadvantaged persons.<sup>vii</sup> The United Nations' Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) recognize the critical role of education for social, economic, and environmental justice and the indivisibility of human rights. Accountability measures are reflected in specific education targets. The SDGs require access and equity to be addressed for all ages, and for all people, within and outside formal education settings. The goals specify giving particular attention to those marginalized by gender, race, language, religion, ethnicity, indigeneity, disability, sexual orientation, health status, geographic location, refugee or migrant status, socioeconomic status, age, emergency and conflict, among others. Calling specific attention to the needs of marginalized and excluded learners, SDG 4 specifies that inclusive education requires building and upgrading education facilities that are child-, disability-, and gender-sensitive and providing safe, nonviolent, inclusive, and effective learning environments for all. Inequality across all sectors, including education is tackled by SDG 10 ("Reduce inequality within and among countries"), and requires the social, economic, and political inclusion of all.

UNESCO data indicate that some 263 million children and youth aged 6 to 17 years, most of them girls, are not in school today.<sup>viii</sup> Projections indicate that 25 million of these children never will have access to a classroom. Significant gender disparities exist, with girls representing two-thirds of the total number of children out of school. Compared with the richest children, the poorest children are 4 times more likely to be out of school and 5 times more likely not to complete primary education. Multiple risk factors of deprivation are intersecting and multidimensional: "Gender, poverty, language and culture often combine to radically heighten the risk of being left far behind."<sup>ix</sup>

The World Bank's Environmental and Social Framework (ESS1) states that social risks and impacts include "...any prejudice or discrimination [against] individuals or groups in providing access to project benefits, particularly in the case of those who may be disadvantaged or vulnerable."<sup>x</sup> Indigenous Peoples, persons with disabilities, and those disadvantaged due to their real or perceived sexual orientation or gender identity fall within the parameters of individuals or groups who may be "disadvantaged or vulnerable," as explicitly recognized in the Bank Directive on Addressing Risks and Impacts on Disadvantaged or Vulnerable Individuals or [Groups](#).<sup>xi</sup> These groups very often experience disadvantage in more than one dimension.

## 1.2 PRINCIPLES OF INCLUSIVE EDUCATION TO ACHIEVE INCLUSION AND EQUITY

UNESCO's 1994 Salamanca Statement on Principles, Policies and Practice in Special Needs Education first set out the case for inclusive education.<sup>xii</sup> The Salamanca Statement asserted that education for all encompasses the inclusion of all types of learners in a single learning environment. Furthermore, the statement proclaimed that the schools that create an inclusive orientation are most effective in “combating discriminatory attitudes, creating welcoming environments, building an inclusive society and achieving education for all.”<sup>xiii</sup> Inclusive education is now recognized as an integral and necessary approach to quality education for all.<sup>xiv</sup>

Inclusion and equity in education is based on the idea that all children can learn together, regardless of difference or [disability](#).<sup>xv</sup> This concept also implies a learner-centered and inclusive response that accommodates the differing perspectives, needs, and experiences of all students. The concept includes individual learners' needs as well as the collective needs of particular groups of learners, such as indigenous learners, in a particular setting.

Inclusive education begins with the premise that all learners have unique characteristics, interests, abilities, and particular learning needs. Furthermore, learners with diverse educational needs must have equal access to and receive individual accommodation in the general education system.

By definition, inclusion transitions away from separated, segregated learning environments—a common, but now discredited, approach to educating persons with disabilities. This common practice also was enforced on other disadvantaged learners including Indigenous Peoples and ethnic minorities by segregating them in separate, inferior schools.

However, it must be acknowledged that (1) separate schooling systems persist; and (2) the merits of a complete transition away from separate schools is not uniformly embraced. These tensions will remain and point to the complexity of advancing inclusion while acknowledging strongly held positions regarding the merits of, for instance, maintaining optional separate systems of schooling for some groups of learners, for example, separate schools for deaf primary students.

Effective transitions from segregated special education to inclusive education require careful planning and structural changes to ensure that the students most often still segregated—learners with disabilities and Indigenous learners—are not placed within the regular or mainstream school system without access to specific accommodations and supports to ensure equitable access to learning. An essential element of this transition entails the recognition that disadvantaged groups will have different views of what inclusion looks like, underscoring the obvious need for extensive consultation during the transition to or development of inclusive schools. Adopting inclusive practices among disadvantaged learners in one community may look different to disadvantaged learners in another community. Moreover, navigating the diverse views of what should constitute inclusion and reaching a consensus is an integral part of any transition to inclusion and is an ongoing process.

Inclusive education is the ultimate goal. However, it is not possible to create overnight an enabling environment that is accessible, safe, and supportive for all learners. Thus, transition from a segregated system to an inclusive one requires planning and progressive implementation. Moreover, transitioning from a segregated to an educational environment that is ill-prepared or ill-equipped to facilitate inclusion may worsen educational outcomes and seriously harm already disadvantaged students. Figure 1 illustrates the transition from separate education to a system that fully accommodates differences in needs of learners.

**Figure 1.** From Separate Schools to Inclusive Education Systems



In sum, inclusive education reflects principles of nondiscrimination and participation; and calls for all schools to be fully accessible, available, acceptable, and adaptable to all learners. In It is fully consistent with the school systems that move away from serving the needs of an (non-existent) average learner and rather recognize that learners have different needs and strengths that should be accommodated. Likewise, it underpins school systems that are safe and gender- and age-responsive.

The principles that follow reflect the key objectives of inclusive education. They are overlapping and interrelated in their application yet reflect distinct principles in the international law and policy on inclusive education (figure 2).

**Figure 2.** Elements of Inclusive Education



**1. PARTICIPATION** ensures meaningful opportunities to engage actively in learning and to be consulted in decision-making in education law, policy, and practice. Consultations with the full diversity of students and communities opens opportunities to all students to participate in the formulation, implementation, and evaluation of education plans, programs, and services that may affect them. These consultations also give students opportunity to establish and control their own education systems and institutions, if they so choose.

**2. ACCESSIBILITY** in education means that educational institutions and programs are accessible to everyone system-wide, with no discrimination based on gender, disability, real or perceived sexual orientation or gender identity, indigeneity, or other characteristic. A core element of nondiscrimination is to provide reasonable accommodation where needed and where not causing a disproportionate or undue burden (box 1).

Access includes accessibility of the entire education system, including buildings, information and communication, curriculum, education materials, teaching methods, assessment, and language and support services. Accessibility also includes economic access.<sup>xvi</sup>

- Accessibility in education can be promoted by adapting the education to the learner, rather than the learner to the system. Schools need to transform to secure inclusion for all learners.
- Physical accessibility as applied to education means that schools are within safe distance to reach, accessible both in getting to the school and in moving around within the school building and all facilities. Physical reach may mean access through attendance at some reasonably convenient geographic location (for example, a neighborhood school).
- Provided it is not used to segregate, physical reach also could mean access through modern technology (for example, access to a “distance learning” program offered by a university).
- The principle of accessibility supports, for example, modifying sanitation facilities to enable safe access to a student with a physical disability, providing safe spaces for students who belong to sexual or gender minorities, and providing mobile learning for Indigenous learners in remote areas.
- Accessibility also requires adapting pedagogy and materials and flexibility, for instance, adapting teaching methods to meet the needs of a learner who is blind or ensuring teaching in their native languages for Indigenous learners. Accessibility also can mean adapting school curricula to ensure that sexual and gender minorities see themselves portrayed positively and made visible.

### **Box 1. Respect, Protect and Fulfill Framework for Inclusive Education**

**Respect:** Ensuring noninterference with the exercise and enjoyment of the right to education, for instance through the adoption of nondiscrimination legislation explicitly prohibiting discrimination based on, among others, disability, gender, sexual orientation, gender identity, or indigeneity.

**Protect:** Protecting against adverse consequences to disadvantaged learners, such as allowing an unsafe environment for those who are or are perceived to be sexual or gender minority learners subjected to violence, bullying, or harassment.

**Fulfill:** Taking positive actions to ensure that every individual can enjoy nondiscrimination in education. Such actions include ensuring that teachers are trained in inclusive education and have the knowledge and skills to ensure equity and the inclusion of all learners. Examples could be to use disability accommodations in teaching methods, to implement SOGI awareness and protection, and/or to take into account indigenous cultures and languages.



**3. AVAILABILITY** in securing the right to education implies that functioning educational institutions and programs be available in sufficient numbers to reach all learners and accommodate their needs. For Indigenous children living in faraway communities and for children with disabilities, schools may be difficult to reach due to distance or lack of accessible transport. Furthermore, students with disabilities may need to travel to a distant urban area to find a school that can accommodate their needs.

**4. ACCEPTABILITY OF LEARNING ENVIRONMENTS** relates to the structure and content of education. For Indigenous learners, acceptability means access to culturally relevant curricula and content, partly or completely in the learner's own language.

Other aspects of acceptability include choice of the language of instruction or the technology by which language is used. For deaf learners, this could mean teaching and learning in the local sign language and making sure that teachers have acquired cultural competence about the local deaf community. For blind learners, acceptability could mean providing instructional materials in Braille or plain-language, easy-to-read formats. Acceptability also entails recognizing that, for some learners, inclusion will necessitate, for instance, specific course work outside a mainstream class (such as sign language, Indigenous language, assistive technology training, or Braille instruction), a modality that ostensibly falls outside of the (narrowly construed) inclusive education frame.

Respect for and accommodation of diversity and differences in education acknowledges that learners have needs based on a wide variety of factors such as age, gender, ethnicity, language, disability, sexual orientation, or gender identity; and that these needs must be accommodated to achieve quality education. Respect requires the accommodation of diversity and differences through specific positive measures to facilitate inclusive education. These measures may take the form of accessible learning materials for children with print disability such as visual impairment or learning disabilities; sign language interpretation for deaf students; providing safe spaces for sexual and gender minorities, as well as for students with psychosocial disabilities; providing bilingual education for Indigenous learners; and providing, for example, flexible curriculum and assessment mechanisms for students with diverse learning needs.

**5. ADAPTABILITY** as applied to inclusive education means the flexibility to meet the needs of all students. For students with disabilities, education must be responsive to their diverse needs. Two aspects of adaptability are essential to meet the needs of students with disabilities: (1) providing reasonable accommodation to meet individual student needs; providing support within the general education system to facilitate learning. For Indigenous learners, adaptability means taking diversity into account in social and cultural contexts and guarding against assimilation practices that ignore or erase Indigenous culture. Adaptability also means responding to the changing nature of education toward inclusion, meaning recruiting teachers from Indigenous communities, teachers with disabilities, and lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, and intersex (LGBTI) teachers.

**6. SAFE AND SUPPORTIVE LEARNING ENVIRONMENTS** need measures to ensure that school environments are safe and that supports are available. These include specific measures for students affected by any kind of violence, including disability-based violence, violence based on sexual orientation or gender identity/expression, and violence based on cultural and linguistic differences.

**7. GENDER- AND AGE-RESPONSIVENESS** in education takes account of all genders and gender identities in accordance with gender equality and identifies and addresses gender-related discrimination and harmful stereotypes. In education, gender responsiveness evaluates existing structures, institutions, and gender relations vis a vis gender equality. It also ensures respect in the classroom and beyond for children to self-identify, if they choose, in the ways that they wish. Gender responsiveness could mean respecting the gender self-identity of a transgender student and respecting the sexual orientation of a lesbian student. Gender responsiveness also could mean respecting the cultural and linguistic identity of an Indigenous student or a deaf student. Age-responsiveness entails respect for the evolving capacities of children and supports educational content and approaches consonant with the age and education level of the learner. Gender- and age-responsiveness also ensures respect for the right of all children to preserve their identities.

### 1.3 SYSTEMIC REFORM TO ACHIEVE INCLUSIVE EDUCATION

Inequity in access to, and participation in, education for disadvantaged groups cannot be addressed with single, discrete interventions. To ensure inclusion and equity in education, a system-wide and “whole of institutional approach” —legal framework, governance policies and institutions, infrastructure, accountability mechanisms, information and communication, financing and procurement rules, and school management and administration—is required. This approach is recognized in the World Bank Group Education Strategy 2020 and in the literature on inclusive education (box 2).<sup>xvii</sup>

#### **Box 2. The World Bank Group Education Strategy for 2020**

The Education Strategy for 2020 emphasizes that the challenge of inequality requires systemic reform, as opposed to single interventions or multiple targeted interventions that address one disadvantaged group or another. A systemic approach to addressing inequalities in education for disadvantaged groups could include:

- Safe and healthy environment
- Scholarships for disadvantaged groups
- Recruitment and training of teachers who belong to disadvantaged groups
- Inclusive curricula that reflect the voices and positive images of disadvantaged populations
- Flexible learning methods
- Cooperation with other sectors including justice, health, agriculture, and infrastructure
- Ensuring that the education provided is relevant to the labor market
- Systemic assessment and benchmarking with specific targets for quality and inclusion.

Beyond economic measures, a multisectoral approach to implement inclusive education requires measures to ensure a physically accessible, safe, and healthy environment for all students; raising quality of education through measures to improve access for disadvantaged learners; building a supportive legal, policy, and practice environment; and making education relevant to the labor market. When paired with benchmarking that carries specific targets for inclusion and equity, system-wide approaches help to identify disparities in education, understand the drivers of exclusion, plan interventions, and equitably allocate resources.<sup>xviii</sup>

**Figure 3.** Components of System-Wide Inclusion in Education





A school that includes all children is good for all children. Intercultural, inclusive education—that is, learning that promotes respect for and understanding of other cultures and caters [to] all children, irrespective of their individual characteristics—is a key element in eliminating discrimination and increasing respect among children and between teaching staff and pupils. In other words, diversity can become a pedagogical resource that contributes to a better and safer educational experience for all children, and this experience has potential to spread beyond the school into society as a whole.

— Office of the Special Representative of the Secretary General on Violence against Children, *“Tackling Violence in Schools: A Global Perspective. Bridging the Gap between Standards and Practice”* (New York: United Nations, 2012), 39.



# CHAPTER 2:

## APPROACHES TO ENSURE INCLUSION AND EQUITY IN EDUCATION FOR LEARNERS WITH DISABILITIES, INDIGENOUS LEARNERS, AND LEARNERS BELONGING TO SEXUAL OR GENDER MINORITIES

Inclusive and equitable education means the identification and dismantling of exclusionary practices system-wide. Disparate access to education needs to be identified and understood to be addressed. According to the 2006 World Development Report, equity is concerned with “systematic differences in opportunities for individuals and groups who differ only in skin color, caste, gender, or place of residence” and that these produce “inequalities in key dimensions of opportunity, such as health, education, and the freedom and capacity of people to participate in and shape society.”<sup>xix</sup> A framework that assesses the causes, consequences and prevention of educational exclusion appears in table 1.

**Table 1.** Causes, Consequences, and Prevention of Educational Exclusion and Inequity

### CAUSES OF EXCLUSION AND INEQUITY

- Use social impact assessment to understand the specific drivers of exclusion for disadvantaged learners, including persons with disabilities, Indigenous Peoples, and sexual and gender minorities.
- Study what works in fostering access to, and full participation in, education for disadvantaged groups.
- Build understanding of specific barriers in the attitudinal, legal, policy, communication/linguistic, and physical/built, environment that prevent access and inclusion of excluded groups.

### CONSEQUENCES OF EXCLUSION AND INEQUITY

- Research the health, economic, and social consequences for marginalized groups of exclusion from education, including the specific risk factors for persons with disabilities, Indigenous Peoples, and sexual and gender minorities.
- Gather data on the economic costs of exclusion in terms of decreased educational and employment potential, disaggregated based on, for example, disability, gender, sexual orientation, gender identity, and/or indigeneity.

### PREVENTION OF EXCLUSION AND INEQUITY

- Identify the essential components of inclusive education interventions to scale up, the duration of implementation measures, mechanisms for effective delivery, and the cost of scaling up.
- Measure the sustainability of inclusive responses and the wider benefits of these changes on the lives of marginalized learners.
- Identify and capture lessons that can be learned from prevention and response initiatives.

## 2.1 INCLUSIVE EDUCATION FOR MARGINALIZED LEARNERS

When assessing exclusion in education, it is important to determine who may be considered “most excluded.” At the same time, it should be acknowledged that not all who are excluded will fit into a specific category. Furthermore, the most excluded persons likely will experience multiple barriers based on more than one grounds for exclusion. The following five scoping questions are designed to guide education sector assessments and to identify the most excluded and at-risk learners (figure 4):

1. What are the barriers to participation and learning for disadvantaged learners?
2. What groups of learners experience these barriers?
3. How can these barriers be eliminated or minimized?
4. What resources are available to address exclusion and support participation?
5. Are there other options for mobilizing resources?<sup>xx</sup>

**Figure 4.** Scoping Questions for Assessing Exclusion in Education



Barriers to accessing and participating fully in education generally are broken into two broad categories: (1) systemic barriers, which encompass law, policy, and institutional barriers; and (2) school-centered barriers, which encompass attitudinal, pedagogical, physical, communication, cultural, economic, and other barriers.<sup>xxi</sup> The following subsections provide context and illustrations for understanding the barriers to education that learners with disabilities, Indigenous learners, and learners who are sexual or gender minorities experience.

## 2.2 INCLUSIVE EDUCATION FOR PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES

Persons with disabilities, who number approximately 1 billion people worldwide, are disproportionately left out of school, particularly in developing countries.<sup>xxii</sup> Children with disabilities attend and complete primary and secondary education at lower rates than children without disabilities.<sup>xxiii</sup> The 2007 Report by the Special Rapporteur on the Right to Education emphasized that “...persons with disabilities, [different]... genders and of all ages and in most parts of the world, suffer from a pervasive and disproportionate denial of [the] right [to education].”<sup>xxiv</sup>

As defined and elaborated in the nearly universally ratified Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD), inclusive education, first, is a specific substantive right. Second, it connects to the realization of all other substantive rights in the treaty: civil, political, economic, social, and cultural. Third, inclusive education applies across all levels: primary, secondary, and higher education.

Nondiscrimination in education for learners with disabilities requires that reasonable accommodations to support inclusion be provided and tailored to the individual needs of the child. The CRPD’s requirements include ensuring that the educational system (1) is open and accessible to children and other learners with disabilities; (2) addresses systemic barriers (such as legal, policy, and institutional); and (3) requires school systems to accommodate the diversity and difference of disability by providing individualized student accommodations, accessibility measures, and individualized education plans. Table 2 summarizes the key barriers to participation in education for learners with disabilities.

Taken with the SDGs, CRPD requires the collection of disability data and statistics in education. SDG target 4.a.1 concerns the availability of adapted infrastructure and materials for students with disabilities.<sup>xxv</sup> Meeting this target requires collecting data disaggregated based on disability. Where such data are not being collected, measures should be implemented to collect such data, at a minimum in the context of an education project.

**Table 2. What Are the Key Barriers to Participation and Learning for Learners with Disabilities?**

#### **ATTITUDINAL BARRIERS IN EDUCATION**

- Stigma, or negative or pejorative beliefs, feelings, and attitudes associated with disability based on teacher/student/community perceptions, misunderstandings, and lack of awareness; sometimes rooted in false beliefs about the cause of disability (as curse, punishment) or false beliefs (about contagion).

#### **LACK OF PHYSICAL ACCESSIBILITY TO EDUCATION FACILITIES**

- For students with physical disabilities: Inaccessible transport to school and around school grounds/university campus; unpaved and rough walkways and roads in and around school; barriers such as stairs and door thresholds on entry, egress, and inside school facilities; lack of safety railings in toilets or hallways; auditorium-style lecture halls; fixed and nonadjustable furniture.
- For students who are blind or have low vision: No transport around campus; no orientation training for navigating school/campus at time of entry; poor road surfaces; hazardous door thresholds and pathways; elevators unstaffed or lacking Braille or audio directions.

#### **INACCESSIBLE SCHOOL CURRICULA MATERIALS, AND INFLEXIBLE LEARNING ASSESSMENTS**

- Limited curriculum content on disability as a human rights issue and as a cross-cutting, multidisciplinary focus, as opposed to a narrowly defined health/medical issue.
- For students who are blind or have low vision: Segregated schooling with limited access to national curriculum/poor access to education; no access or untimely access to Braille and electronic lecture notes and course materials; exclusion from certain faculties/departments in higher education; no access to audiotaping for lectures; no large-print handouts provided; poor quality scanned materials; no equipment to enlarge computer screen characters; no access to screen readers; unqualified readers and examination writers; no computer training and assistive technology training provided; inaccessible websites; inaccessible PowerPoints and PDFs.
- For students with intellectual and learning disabilities: Unmet support needs such as and learning assessment methods, plain language materials, and other supports; teachers ill-equipped to accommodate these learners.
- For deaf students and learners who are hard-of-hearing: Unmet linguistic needs, including teaching sign language; shortage of teachers with proficiency in sign language and supports to ensure equal access to curriculum.

#### **DISCRIMINATORY AND/OR UNDER-DEVELOPED LAWS AND POLICIES**

- Lack of explicit protection against discrimination in education based on disability in laws and education plans; laws/policies/practices that limit/restrict educational options for students with disabilities, including in higher education, where policies often prevent qualified students with disabilities from accessing their chosen programs; absence of policies on disability inclusion, such as policy directives that require disability support services, guidelines on adopting reasonable accommodations, and providing individualized education plans.

International human rights law prohibits discrimination in education,<sup>xxvi</sup> a right that applies specifically to persons with disabilities in the UN CRPD.<sup>xxvii</sup> The convention protects against discrimination based on disability in education. This discrimination is prohibited and requires the specific provision of reasonable accommodations to students with disabilities that require individualized supports. In addition, the convention covers all aspects of education: (1) enrollment; (2) participation; (3) curriculum development, accreditation, and delivery; (4) access to and participation in the whole curriculum (such as academic courses, physical education and recreation, health education, social events, school trips); (5) student support services; and (6) safety of environment (such as eliminating harassment, bullying, and victimization). Hence, education projects should be designed taking a “whole-of-institution” approach to identify and mitigate barriers to education for persons with disabilities. Examples of supports for learners with disabilities appear in box 3.

### Box 3. What Does Supporting Students with Disabilities in Education Mean?

- **Adopting** a “whole of institution” approach for all students with disabilities, with an inclusive education sector analysis and planning for inclusion.
- **Opportunities for blind and partially sighted students** to learn Braille, alternative script, augmentative and alternative modes, means and formats of communication, and orientation and mobility skills. Investment in access to appropriate technology and alternative communications systems to facilitate learning be supported. Peer support and mentoring schemes should be introduced and encouraged.
- **Opportunities for deaf and hard-of-hearing students** to learn sign language, and measures to recognize and promote the linguistic identity of the deaf community. Persons with disabilities are entitled, on an equal basis with others, to be recognized and supported for their specific cultural and linguistic identities, including with sign language and deaf culture. Hard-of-hearing students also must have access to quality speech therapy services, induction loop technology, and captioning.
- **Supporting students who are blind, deaf, or deafblind** with education delivered in the most appropriate languages, modes, and means of communication for each individual; and in environments that maximize personal, academic, and social development both within and outside formal school settings. Providing these means will require support, including with resources, assisted technology, and provision of orientation and mobility skills.
- **Providing learners with communication impairments** with the opportunity to express themselves and learn using alternative or augmentative communication. Provision may include, but is not limited to, sign language; and low- or high-technology communication aids such as tablets with speech output, voice output communication aids (VOCAS), or communication books. Providing these tools requires investing in developing expertise, technology, and services to promote access to appropriate technologies and alternative communications systems to facilitate learning.
- **Support learners** with social communication difficulties by adapting classroom organization, including working in pairs, peer tutoring, and seating close to the teacher; and by creating a structured and predictable environment.
- **Providing learners** with intellectual impairments with concrete, observable/visual and easy-to-read teaching and learning materials within a safe, quiet, and structured learning environment. The materials must target capacities that will best prepare students for independent living and vocational contexts. States Parties should invest in inclusive, interactive classrooms that use alternative instructional strategies and assessment methods.

In addition to identifying specific risks for exclusion and inequity that could lead to discriminative education based on disability, projects will have opportunities to take proactive steps to advance and improve the inclusion of persons with disabilities in education. Box 4 details an ongoing mainstream education sector project in which opportunities were seized to ensure that children with disabilities were reached and their needs addressed.

**Box 4. Disability Inclusive Education: Guyana Education Sector Improvement Project (P159519)**

The 2017 Guyana Education Sector Improvement Project included as a key project objective the improvement of student learning at the pre-primary, primary, and lower secondary levels of the education system. To meet this objective, the project planned a phased revision of the curriculum, defined not only in terms of the content that students are expected to learn in each subject and grade level, but also by the pedagogical approach taken to teach that content. The following seven actions identified in the social assessment were incorporated to ensure a disability-inclusive design.

- 1. Participation and Decision-Making:** Ensuring that the curricula reform systematically includes key constituents, such as the National Commission on Disability, as resources in planning consultations and reform content.
- 2. Attitudinal and Sensitization Changes:** Training teachers to foster positive teacher attitudes toward students with disabilities; sensitizing teachers to the implications of unconscious bias; and equipping them with relevant skills to tailor various modes of delivery (oral, written) for children who have specific needs and to avoid negative stereotyping by focusing on representation, illustrations, language, and transformational roles.
- 3. Accessibility:** Ensuring that teaching and learning materials are inclusive (including considerations for disability, gender, culturally appropriate) in content and formats (large print, Braille, audio).
- 4. Labor:** Ensuring gender diversity in teacher workforce and including positive measures to ensure that teachers with disabilities are hired. Improving coordination between special education teachers and general education teachers through modifying institutional coordination arrangements (such as co-teaching and having teaching assistants work with special needs teachers).
- 5. Monitoring:** An intermediate results indicator was developed to measure number of teachers who have participated in the sensitization on the consequences of even unconscious biases against students of different genders, racial and ethnic groups, and students with disabilities
- 6. Consultations:** Scheduling consultations with persons with disabilities and Disabled People's Organizations (DPOs) during project preparation and implementation.
- 7. Knowledge and Evidence-Based Policy-Making:** The project implementation (ongoing as of this publication date) would include selection of pilot schools to showcase some of the interventions and analyze the impacts on students, including schools with students with disabilities.

Source: World Bank. GUYANA EDUCATION SECTOR IMPROVEMENT PROJECT (GESIP) Washington D.C (2017)



## 2.3 INCLUSIVE EDUCATION FOR INDIGENOUS PEOPLES

Indigenous Peoples represent 5 percent of the world's population. The estimated 5,000 different indigenous cultures encompass approximately 370 million individuals worldwide.<sup>xxviii</sup> An estimated 4,000 to 5,000 of the more than 6,700 languages still spoken in the world are spoken by Indigenous Peoples. Nevertheless, of these languages, 40 percent (2,680) are in danger of extinction, threatening the cultures and knowledge systems to which they belong.<sup>xxix</sup> Efforts to force assimilation—including through education—into the dominant culture has put entire communities of indigenous cultures at risk.

Indigenous Peoples live in widely varying environments, many in rural and remote areas, and face substantial barriers in retaining their specific cultural identities, languages, customs and traditions, social organization, economy, practices, and spiritual beliefs. Indigenous learners tend to have less access to education, contend with poorer quality education, and not enjoy the same benefits from education relative to non-Indigenous learners.<sup>xxx</sup> Indigenous communities have experienced substantial threats to their existences and way of life. They have been—and often continue to be—deprived of schooling in their mother tongues and exposed to curricula and teaching methods that downplay, demean, or ignore their communities' histories or traditional knowledge. In sum, the formal school curricula are often far removed from their cultural practices. The overall quality of schools in the areas in which Indigenous children live—often more remote, poorer areas—also usually is lower than the quality of schools in more populated regions.

Educational marginalization of Indigenous Peoples occurs within a context of disproportionately high poverty and hunger; decreased security; and loss of identity, language, territories, and livelihoods. These disadvantages result in high dropout rates among Indigenous children, especially girls, and a progressive decrease in the number of Indigenous students who continue on in secondary and higher education.<sup>xxxi</sup> In turn, Indigenous young people enter adulthood lacking adequate or relevant skills to compete in the job market or to engage effectively in the economic and social development challenges facing their own communities.

A 2009 study conducted by the United Nations Expert Mechanism on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (EMRIP) identified a series of concerns and barriers against realizing the right to Indigenous education.

<sup>xxxii</sup> The study found that Indigenous Peoples experienced a lack of control over the educational initiatives aimed at their children, and the parents reported not being consulted when programs were designed and implemented. As a result, the programs did not meet the children's needs; the programs were not delivered by Indigenous educators nor in the children's indigenous languages; and no account was taken of the children's cultural histories, traditional knowledge or cultures.<sup>xxxiii</sup>

### **Box 5. Indigenous Education in Colombia: Preparation of Educational Materials with Sociocultural Relevance**

In Colombia, the Ministry of Education provided technical, pedagogical support, and financing for the participatory design and implementation of education projects and models of learning for 97 of its 102 Indigenous Peoples. Key elements included:

**Participation of Indigenous Communities:** The representatives of local Indigenous communities entered into 194 inter-administrative agreements and contracts with the government to design and implement projects and educational models. Educational materials were designed to integrate cultural components and traditions specific to each community.

**Working to Increase Enrollment:** 75,520 students have benefited, corresponding to 21 percent of indigenous enrollment.

**Assessing Needs of the Community:** Approaches to pedagogy are based on the assessment of the community; are inclusive of social, cultural, and linguistic foundations; and are integrally connected to the overall life plan of the Indigenous community, whether oral or written.

Source: World Bank, Guía de Buenas Prácticas. Los derechos de los pueblos indígenas y la educación en América Latina (Washington, DC: World Bank, 2017).

The United Nations EMRIP study defines quality education for Indigenous Peoples as “education that is well resourced, culturally sensitive, respectful of heritage and that takes into account history, cultural security and integrity, encompasses human rights, community and individual development.”<sup>xxxiv</sup> Research makes clear that the design of education programs for Indigenous Peoples, especially women and girls, must recognize and consider their particular needs and the barriers they face in accessing quality education.<sup>xxxv</sup> Furthermore, indigenous students should not be forced into mainstream education systems that fail to take meaningful account of their culture or that use a single model of education for all students regardless of who they are. To not take into account the needs and cultures of indigenous students will undermine their learning and violate their human rights, in particular their rights to culture and self-determination. Table 3 summarizes the key barriers facing Indigenous Peoples in securing their right to education.

**Table 3. What Are the Key Barriers to Participation and Learning for Indigenous Learners?**

**ATTITUDINAL BARRIERS IN EDUCATION**

- Attitudinal barriers including stigma and lack of understanding and respect among non-indigenous students/teachers about Indigenous cultures, knowledge and traditional ways of knowing, traditions, and histories.

**LACK OF PHYSICAL ACCESSIBILITY TO EDUCATION FACILITIES**

- Limited access to education (due to, for instance, remote areas, unsafe/inaccessible distance from school) and in an environment that is culturally inappropriate (that is, away from families/community year-round, in a building versus having other models of schooling that would accommodate community livelihoods).

**LACK OF AVAILABLE AND QUALITY SCHOOL FACILITIES**

- School facilities remote from Indigenous communities.
- Where schools exist, conditions are often inferior.

**INACCESSIBLE AND UNACCEPTABLE SCHOOL CURRICULA AND MATERIALS**

- Pedagogical barriers, including curricula and pedagogical materials not tailored to the unique needs of Indigenous learners, communities, and peoples; limited curriculum content on Indigenous Peoples and their rights as a cross-cutting, multidisciplinary focus, inclusive of content on histories, languages, oral traditions, philosophies, writing systems, and literatures of Indigenous communities.
- Lack of understanding about how to incorporate cultural norms and practices into learning (such as alternative models of education; and aligning education with cultural practices such as seasonal animal harvesting, spiritual practices, and incorporating family/elders).
- Failure to provide learning supports, curricula, and education materials that reflect Indigenous culture and traditional teaching methods.

**UNMET LINGUISTIC NEEDS AND LACK OF RESPECT FOR LINGUISTIC IDENTITY**

- Inaccessibility or non-existence of school-provided education in mother tongue.
- Lack or shortage of teachers of, insufficient teacher training on, and limited use of Indigenous language, knowledge, and culture and practices.
- Limited number of speakers of the Indigenous language(s) in Indigenous communities, meaning that students learn their Indigenous language as a second language.
- Lack of recognition of, and/or respect for Indigenous languages (including in law) in comparison to official language(s).

**DISCRIMINATORY AND/OR UNDER-DEVELOPED LAWS AND POLICIES**

- Discriminatory and/or under-developed laws and policies. These include lack of explicit protection against discrimination in education based on Indigenous status in laws and education plans; and lack of laws/policies that recognize the right of Indigenous Peoples to establish and control their educational systems and institutions and to provide education in their own languages, consistent with their cultural methods of teaching and learning.

For many decades the predominant educational model for Indigenous populations was forced assimilation, leading to non-recognition of Indigenous culture and traditions and undermining the right of Indigenous Peoples to self-determination and preservation of their unique culture. The efforts of Indigenous communities have resulted in a paradigm shift towards developing education policies and practices based on respect for cultural diversity and the promotion of bilingual and intercultural education. Achieving inclusion and equity for Indigenous learners means tailoring education to their needs—not assimilation into a mainstream, dominant culture— including their geographical, infrastructural, livelihood, cultural, historical and linguistic contexts. Box 6, below, contains several examples of Indigenous learning practices that are respectful of traditional knowledge and practices and thus more in keeping with self-determination and the preservation of Indigenous culture.

### Box 6. Indigenous Education Practices

**Language Nests:** Originally developed as an approach to preserve Indigenous languages in New Zealand, a language nest operates like a creche or nursery in which older Indigenous community members provide child care while speaking their language. This sustained proximity to their elders exposes children to their language during the crucial period in which they are young enough to acquire native fluency. Language nests have succeeded in New Zealand and Hawaii in slowing down language loss and are being used in Australia.

**Elders in Residence Programs:** Used in school district No.85 in Canada, these programs bring in elders and knowledge-keepers to classrooms and school to support learning, for example, by strengthening cultural perspectives and sharing wisdom to promote students' awareness of cultural traditions and language.

**Cultural and Language Education Programs:** In Finland, the Inari-based Sámi Education Institute runs programming on Sámi cultural and language education. The institute provides vocational training across a range of subjects that helps preserve Sámi traditions while preparing Sámi youth for employment in the workforce, be it in reindeer herding, tourism, or information technology.

Source: <http://www.rcinet.ca/eye-on-the-arctic/2018/06/20/finland-indigenous-sami-reindeer-herding-culture/>; <https://www.ictinc.ca/blog/two-examples-of-indigenous-education-programs>.

Progressive education law and policy that embrace inclusion for Indigenous learners recognize the inclusion of indigenous perspectives and languages into the regular education system, culturally appropriate curricula, mother-tongue-based bilingual and multilingual education, intercultural education; as well as guarantee the participation of Indigenous peoples in designing their own education programs.<sup>xxxvi</sup>

The promotion of indigenous methods of education and the inclusion of traditional knowledge are core components of making education inclusive for Indigenous learners. Mother-language instruction is recommended for Indigenous Peoples. Where the Indigenous language is not the mother language, that is, where the identity or heritage language is not being transmitted from generation to generation, language revitalization programs should be integrated in the education system. Inclusive infrastructure, curricula, and pedagogical materials should be tailored to the unique needs of Indigenous Peoples. Tailoring could include modified schedules, distance learning initiatives, mobile schools, and culturally and linguistically appropriate pedagogical materials.

Box 7 illustrates the approach taken by a UNESCO project in Nicaragua to build an inclusive curriculum for an Indigenous Peoples community drawing on the knowledge traditions of that community.

### **Box 7. Inclusive Education in Nicaragua: Using the Knowledge Traditions of the Mayangna People to Build an Inclusive Curriculum**

UNESCO's inclusive education demonstration project with the Mayangna people of Nicaragua uses the Intercultural Bilingual Education (IBE). The Autonomous Regions of Nicaragua, home to many of the country's Indigenous Peoples, has developed an education curriculum within an IBE framework that enables Indigenous groups to adapt a certain proportion of the curriculum to their own cultural context and lived reality. Indigenous Peoples have worked in their own communities to develop lesson plans and pedagogical materials that are rooted in the knowledge traditions of the Mayangna people.

The project worked with Mayangna experts, community members, and the Nicaragua Ministry of Education to develop classroom materials in the Mayangna language that teach Mayangna knowledge of the environment in Mayangna schools. By focusing on the strengths and capabilities of Mayangna experts and professionals to reinforce their greatest assets—their communities, knowledge, culture, and livelihood skills—this project provides classroom activities. Equally important, the project builds social and cultural capital in Mayangna communities. Social and cultural capital, in turn, can help these communities respond more effectively to other challenges. Early results have been positive: students are reporting enthusiasm for lessons and rapid comprehension of learning points. The teachers are acquiring new, active learning techniques; and community leaders and parents report feeling pride, increased community cohesion, and a feeling of empowerment.

Source: UNESCO, Indigenous Knowledge and Knowledge Transmission, Mayangna Language, Culture and Knowledge, <https://en.unesco.org/links-transmission/mayangna>.

Box 8 depicts the approach that Paraguay took to implement bilingual teaching and learning to accommodate its multiethnic, multicultural society.

### **Box 8. Addressing Linguistic and Cultural Inclusion in Education in Paraguay**

Paraguay is a multiethnic, multicultural society. Its 1967 Constitution recognized Paraguay as a bilingual country. Bilingual teaching and learning have been national policy since 1994. Language plays a very important role both for understanding the national culture and for transmitting universally accepted cultural values. Bilingual education is a pedagogical approach in which the mother language is deemed necessary throughout the learning process.

The second language is introduced with respect to the mother language to achieve communicative competence in both.

One innovative literacy model that has been successfully implemented uses both official languages at the same time. From this perspective, education in two languages and in two cultures is the foundation that ensures functional and meaningful learning. Simultaneously learning both avoids a long, complicated process of trying to prioritize one language over the other.

Source: UNESCO, "A Guide to Ensure Equity and Inclusion in Education" (2017), 23.

One innovative literacy model that has been successfully implemented uses both official languages at the same time. From this perspective, education in two languages and in two cultures is the foundation that ensures functional and meaningful learning. Simultaneously learning both avoids a long, complicated process of trying to prioritize one language over the other.

— Benítez Ojeda and Martinez Stark, (2014), 22. Orig. in Spanish.



## 2.4 INCLUSIVE EDUCATION FOR SEXUAL AND GENDER MINORITIES

Estimates of the size of the LGBTI community across the world are difficult to obtain, even in countries whose sexual and gender minorities do not face discrimination under the law or where there are explicit protections against discrimination based on sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, and/or sex characteristics (SOGIESC). Surveys in some places have consistently shown higher school drop-out rates, higher suicide rates, and higher homelessness rates among young people who are sexual and gender minorities versus among young people who are not.<sup>xxxvii</sup> In light of these data, the World Bank believes that sexual and gender minorities likely are over-represented among the poorest 40 percent in most Bank client countries.<sup>xxxviii</sup>

Terminology and identities related to sexual orientation and gender identity vary across languages and cultures. Nevertheless, stigma, discrimination, violence, and exclusion based on real or perceived SOGIESC are all too common. These types of discrimination are particularly evident in educational settings.<sup>xxxix</sup> In many developed countries, as well as in some developing countries, the English-language terms “lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, and intersex (LGBTI) people” are in common use. However, in many developing countries, other local, language- and cultural-specific terms are used more commonly. Recognizing this reality, the World Bank often uses the catch-all term, “sexual and gender minorities,” when referring to those who face SOGIESC-based exclusion.

In school settings, some learners self-identify as sexual or gender minorities, while many others who may do so privately will not identify publicly for fear of the consequences. Whether a person self-identifies or not, in school settings, any person who is known, believed, or perceived to be a sexual or gender minority, whether correctly or not, often faces the same stigma, discrimination, violence, and exclusion as do those who choose to self-identify as such.

Learners who are, or are perceived to be, sexual or gender minorities face numerous barriers at school. Data clearly show that these students experience negative comments due to their actual or perceived sexual orientation and gender identity and expression; see little to no representation of themselves in the curricula; and run into teachers and school leaders who lack confidence and training in how and when to address SOGIESC issues.<sup>xl</sup>

Violence is a major barrier to education and learning for persons regarded as nonconforming to established sexual and gender norms in a given society.<sup>xli</sup> This was a major finding of UNESCO’s comprehensive global review of violence based on sexual orientation and gender identity/ expression in schools and other educational settings.<sup>xlii</sup> The United Nations’ 2006 World Report on Violence against Children found that violence particularly affects students who are perceived not to conform to prevailing sexual and gender norms.<sup>xliii</sup>

Sexual and gender-based violence includes violence based on sexual orientation and gender identity/ expression, also known as homophobic, biphobic, and transphobic violence. It includes physical, sexual, and psychological violence and bullying and harassment. Sexual and gender-based violence occurs on the way to and from school; in the classroom; on the playground; in sports facilities, toilets, and changing rooms; and online.

Discrimination or lack of representation within the school system tends to result in nondisclosure by sexual and gender minority learners. These learners work hard to hide their sexual orientation or gender identity and expression or spend energy to align outwardly with the prevailing norms. Research demonstrates the resulting impact on the mental and physical health of these students, along with other consequences, such as lower participation in school or lower achievement levels relative to other students.

As a result, ensuring the right to education for sexual and gender minority learners focuses on safeguarding the right of children and youth to an education in a safe learning environment free from violence, bullying, social exclusion, or other forms of discriminatory and degrading treatment related to SOGIESC. Table 4 summarizes barriers to participation and learning for sexual and gender minority students.

**Table 4.** What Are the Barriers to Participation and Learning for Sexual and Gender Minority Learners?

**STIGMA**

- Stigma and discrimination based on actual or perceived sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, or sex characteristics (SOGIESC).

**UNTRAINED TEACHERS**

- Lack of training in creating an enabling environment for sexual and gender minorities in schools.
- Lack of teacher understanding or preparedness to accommodate difference based on SOGIESC, and preparedness to provide support.

**NONINCLUSIVE CURRICULA**

- Curricula either excludes mention of sexual and gender minorities or includes highly stereotyped and negative content about differences based on SOGIESC.
- Schools’/teachers’ lack of engagement with civil society organizations (CSOs) equipped to provide inclusive educational materials and suggestions for improving inclusive curricula.

**UNSAFE SCHOOL ENVIRONMENT**

- Absence of monitoring and data collection on SOGIESC-based violent incidents and/or against sexual and gender minority students.
- Schools’/teachers’ failure to act in response to violence rooted in discrimination based on SOGIESC.

**DISCRIMINATORY AND/OR UNDER-DEVELOPED LAWS AND POLICIES**

- Lack of law and policy framework to protect sexual and gender minority students from violence and discrimination and/or from overt legal and policy discrimination against such learners.

For sexual and gender minorities, a “whole of school” approach will require addressing prevention and responses to homophobic, biphobic, transphobic, and intersexphobic bullying and harassment. Some learners may experience intersecting and multidimensional forms of exclusion, for example, a transgender learner who also is an Indigenous person or person with a disability. These learners may require combining strategies to create a safe, enabling environment in which learning can happen.

The “whole of school” approach entails implementing (1) national laws, policies, and/or action plans; (2) inclusive curricula and learning materials, including support to classes focused on respecting differences related to SOGIESC; (3) training for educational staff; (4) support for students and families; (5) partnerships with civil society organizations (CSOs); (6) international policy commitments to support sexual and gender minority learners; and (7) monitoring discrimination, including violence and bullying, and evaluating the executed measures. The examples in boxes 9, 10, and 11 illustrate SOGIESC-inclusive approaches.

### **Box 9. Gender and Diversity Inclusion in Curricula in Namibia**

In Namibia, the Grade 8 Life Skills curriculum explicitly addresses the topic, “gender roles,” in relation to different types of families. For example, students are expected to “... in their own words define and discuss different sexual patterns, such as heterosexual, homosexual, bisexual, asexual and celibacy, in their own words define sexism in writing and [lastly] appreciate [their] own sexuality.”

In the Grade 12 Life Skills curriculum, the Self-Awareness unit requires students to understand what homosexuality is, its impact on individuals, and issues of conduct.

Source: UNESCO, 2015. “Gender, Diversity and Violence in Schools in Five Countries in Southern Africa: Botswana, Lesotho, Namibia, South Africa, Swaziland”. UNESCO: Paris.

### **Box 10. Resources to Train Teachers to Support LGBTI Youth in Scotland**

The Scottish Government and LGBT Youth Scotland has developed a Toolkit for Teachers: Dealing with Homophobia and Homophobic Bullying, which contains information, guidance, and specific lesson plans for teachers to include LGBT topics across all subjects. More recently, LGBT Youth Scotland, developed Guidance for Supporting Transgender Young People to help primary and secondary education staff in Scotland support transgender and nonbinary learners. The guidance is based on the experiences of transgender young people and good practice approaches suggested by teachers, youth workers, and others. The organization is also one of the partners of Scotland’s anti-bullying service, Respectme., Jointly, they are working on a new resource for Scottish schools that focuses on homophobic, biphobic, and transphobic bullying. This resource is supported by the Scottish Government through its Learning Directorate.

Source: Scottish Government and LGBT Youth Scotland, Toolkit for Teachers: Dealing with Homophobia and Homophobic Bullying (Learning and Teaching Scotland, Glasgow, 2009); Scottish Government, LGBT Youth Scotland, and Scottish Trans Alliance, Guidance for Supporting Transgender Young People (2017).

### **Box 11. Combatting Homophobic and Transphobic Bullying in Albanian Schools**

In 2015–16, Albania specifically coordinated a national action plan (2016-2020) to foster the engagement of the schools, families, the community, state institutions, and civil society organizations (CSOs) to prevent and deal with cases of violence in schools, the protection of children’s rights, and the peaceful resolution of conflicts. Following the advice of the PINK Embassy, an NGO, to the Ministry of Education, the plan, “Stop Violence in Schools,” specifically mentions homophobic and transphobic bullying. The document specifies many different areas of work to be done, including preventing violence, raising awareness, and teaching school staff.

Among other measures, the plan states that the government and CSOs, collaborate to conduct a national study on eliminating violence in schools, organize extracurricular activities \_\_\_\_\_, and support learners’ and parents’ communities in campaigns to tackle bullying in schools. This project is being carried out by PINK Embassy and LGBT Pro. The project’s main goal is to increase the awareness of the educational institutions and communities of students and parents about the importance of safe environments free of violence and bullying; and to assess the level of homophobia, transphobia, and discrimination in school environments in Tirana, Durrës, Elbasan, and Shkodra.

Source: IGYLO, “Inclusive Education Report” (Preview) (International LGBTQI Youth Organization, Brussels, 2018), pp.21-23.

**Table 5. Inclusive Approaches to Address Exclusion and Inequity in Education**

Domains	Persons with Disabilities	Sexual and Gender Minorities (SGM)	Indigenous Peoples
<b>Educating Teachers</b>	Train teachers in disability awareness and inclusion practices (pre-service and in-service)	Train teachers in SOGIESC awareness, attitudinal barriers, and child protection risks	Train teachers in local indigenous communities, their experiences and knowledge, and strategies of inclusion in education
<b>Designing Inclusive Infrastructure/Facilities</b>	Identify and remove barriers to physical access, for instance, through identifying whether WASH facilities are accessible to students with disabilities	Provide safe spaces and modify WASH facilities to ensure access (such as gender-neutral washrooms), privacy, and safety	Address access barriers such as remote locations, unsafe distances from school (such as mobile schools, distance learning)
<b>Accessing an Inclusive Curriculum and Accommodations in Learning Assessments</b>	Identify opportunities to include the voices and images of persons with disabilities in curriculum and learning materials; provide access to curriculum in accessible formats and accommodations in learning assessments	Include examples of SGM in curricula; avoid stereotyping based on sexual orientation and gender identity and expression in curricula	Establish links between indigenous knowledge and skills and national standard curricula; curricula that is place- and culture-based; including material such as seasonal-environmental curricula and the use of local flora and fauna
<b>Utilizing Communication, Language and Linguistic Identity, Terminology</b>	Provide sign language in schools; accommodate students who are hard of hearing; use flexible teaching methods for learners with communication barriers; use respectful, rights-based language regarding disability	Promote student (and teacher) awareness of terminology preferred by the SGM community; establish policies to bar bullying via name-calling/offensive stereotyping; promote awareness of SOGIESC	Support and promote the survival and use of indigenous languages in education; recognize indigenous languages as an essential element of indigenous cultures and identities
<b>Addressing Protection</b>	Provide accessible communication means where needed, for example, for persons who are deaf or hard of hearing, including emergency preparedness; establish procedures to report violence and abuse	Develop protocols on confidentiality and nondiscrimination for SGM students (and teachers); establish procedures to report violence and abuse	Support the right of Indigenous communities to voice their own educational priorities; address instances of violence and abuse in schools; implement measures to report

Domains	Persons with Disabilities	Sexual and Gender Minorities (SGM)	Indigenous Peoples
<b>Reaching Out to Identify Excluded Children</b>	Hire women and men with disabilities as outreach workers to reach unschooled children with disabilities	Partner with local SGM groups, where they exist, to support inclusive actions to increase participation of SMG youth in schools	Engage with leaders in Indigenous communities to address school enrollment and learner needs and to generate two-way learning to harness Indigenous knowledge
<b>Providing Student Support Services</b>	Provide individualized reasonable accommodations and other positive measures of support; disability support services; link to disabled persons' organizations (DPOs) for assistance	Provide counselling services; ally teachers and staff; SGM clubs; mentor through community organizations	Provide individualized planning; links to indigenous community for supports
<b>Addressing Resistance to Inclusion</b>	Highlight success stories in which persons with disabilities have been included in education, schedule guest appearances by educated individuals with disabilities	Highlight success stories in which SGM individuals and groups have been included in education; where possible, invite SGM individuals for guest appearances	Highlight contributions of Indigenous communities to learning; invite Indigenous Peoples leaders into the schools
<b>Eliminating Harassment, Bullying, and Victimization</b>	Consider school-wide policies to combat violence and abuse	Consider school-wide policies to combat violence and abuse	Consider school-wide policies to combat violence and abuse

## 2.5 MONITORING AND EVALUATING INCLUSIVE EDUCATION

Project outcomes to measure the impact of inclusion and equity for the most disadvantaged learners must be built into education project monitoring and evaluation processes. Concept design, action plans and the targets and indicators used to measure success and completion must be inclusive of disadvantaged learners. Inclusive Monitoring and Evaluation serves to promote knowledge and understanding of marginalization in education, enhance the evidence base for inclusive approaches, and support the incremental realization of inclusive education for all learners. Tables 6, 7, 8, and 9 provide sample outcome indicators to advance inclusive education generally, and specifically for learners with disabilities, Indigenous learners, and learners who are sexual or gender minorities.

**Table 6. General Indicators for Evaluating Inclusive Education for Disadvantaged Learners**

- Number of teachers trained in implementing inclusive education practices (specify per marginalized group).
- Percentage of trained teachers self-reporting increased knowledge of measures to make schools safe for learners with disabilities, SGM learners, and Indigenous learners.
- Number of legal/policy instruments proposed, drafted, or adopted to promote equity and inclusion in education.
- Degree to which national education policy documents strongly emphasize inclusion and equity for all.
- Percentage of financial resources allocated to support inclusive learning for learners with disabilities, SGM learners, and Indigenous learners.
- Public spending on education in Indigenous communities and territories as a percentage of national spending, compared to spending on non-Indigenous communities or as a percentage of GDP or total public expenditure.
- To what extent are available resources used flexibly, and targeted to support participation and learning?



**Table 7. Indicators for Evaluating Inclusive Education for Learners with Disabilities**

- Access of students with disabilities to reasonable accommodations, where needed, at school to access facilities, academic programs, and extracurricular activities.
- Percentage of schools (primary and lower and upper secondary) with adapted infrastructure and materials for students with disabilities.
- Percentage of schools (primary and lower and upper secondary) with adapted WASH facilities for students with disabilities.
- Percentage of public schools meeting relevant (for example, ISO 21542:2011) standards on accessibility and usability of the built environment.
- Number of legal/policy instruments proposed, drafted, or adopted to promote inclusive education; nondiscrimination based on disability and reasonable accommodations in education at the national or subnational level resulting from education sector activities.
- Percentage of direct beneficiaries with disabilities who rate their access to education as having improved during the period covered by the education project.
- Percentage of direct beneficiaries with disabilities who rate their access to education as having improved during the period covered by the education project.
- Number of women and men with disabilities serving as teachers in schools since start of project.

**Table 8: Indicators for Evaluating Inclusive Education for SGM Learners**

- Percentage of schools with safe spaces program since start of education project.
- Percentage of schools with adapted WASH facilities offering gender-neutral facilities and/or private facilities for transgender and intersex students.
- Percentage of direct beneficiaries identifying as SGM who report enhanced safety and security in school during the period covered by the project.
- Number of legislation or policy instruments that protect SGM students from discrimination and harassment in education at the national or subnational level resulting from education sector activities.
- Number of school policies on how to prevent and address school-related violence including violence based on SOGIESC since start of project.
- Percentage of direct beneficiaries who identify as SGM who rate their access to education as having improved during the period covered by the education project.
- Number/proportion of learning materials/curricula including sexual orientation and gender identity and expression and sex characteristics that reflect positive rather than negative messages.
- Number of women and men who identify as SGM serving as teachers in schools or as mentors (whether in school or outside, for example from an LGBTI organization) since start of project.
- Number of international commitments undertaken in support of SGM rights in higher education (such as Member of the Governmental LGBTI or other SGM Focal Points Network, signing the UNESCO Call for Action by Ministers on Inclusive and Equitable Education for All Learners in an Environment Free from Discrimination and Violence).

**Table 9. Indicators for Evaluating Inclusive Education for Indigenous Learners**

- Percentage of schools with in-service training delivered by indigenous teachers to combat prejudice and eliminate discrimination and to promote tolerance, understanding, and support for Indigenous learners.
- Percentage of Indigenous Peoples who report increased opportunities for identifying their own educational priorities, participating in curriculum and pedagogical material development, and engaging in planning and implementation of teacher training and education delivery responsive to the needs of Indigenous Peoples.
- Number of education programs managed by the autonomous institutions of Indigenous Peoples.
- Number/proportion of learning materials/curricula reflecting the histories, cultures, languages, oral traditions, philosophies, writing systems, and literatures of Indigenous Peoples.
- Percentage of Indigenous children/youth (a) in grades 2 and 3, (b) at the end of primary, and (c) at the end of lower secondary school who have attained a minimum level-one reading competence in their own Indigenous language.
- Percentage of direct beneficiaries from Indigenous Peoples communities who report an increase in access to education during the period covered by the project.
- Percentage of direct beneficiaries from Indigenous communities who report that infrastructure, curricula, and pedagogical materials are tailored to their unique needs as Indigenous learners.
- Availability of flexible and accessible career and accreditation pathways for Indigenous teachers.
- Number of school policies on educational priorities specified by Indigenous communities since start of project.
- Percentage of direct beneficiaries from Indigenous communities who rate their access to education as having improved during the period covered by the education project.
- Number/proportion of learning materials/curricula including Indigenous histories, knowledge, cultures that reflect positive, nonstereotyped messages.
- Number of women and men, including elders, from Indigenous communities who serve as teachers in schools or as mentors from the community since start of project.
- Evidence of integration of Indigenous language into cultural activities focused on transmitting cultural knowledge.
- Number of school policies on educational priorities specified by Indigenous communities since start of project.
- Percentage of direct beneficiaries from Indigenous Peoples communities who rate their access to education as having improved during the period covered by the education project.
- Number/proportion of learning materials/curricula including Indigenous histories, knowledge, and cultures that reflect positive, nonstereotyped messages.
- Number of women and men, including elders, from Indigenous communities serving as teachers in schools or as mentors from the community since start of project.
- Evidence of integration of Indigenous language into cultural activities focused on transmitting cultural knowledge.
- Number of school policies on educational priorities specified by Indigenous communities since start of project.

# CONCLUSION

---

## ADDRESSING WORLD'S EDUCATIONAL ATTAINMENT GAPS IS PRECONDITION TO REDUCE EXTREME POVERTY

Ensuring equity and inclusion in education for particularly marginalized groups of learners—students with disabilities; Indigenous students; students who are, or are perceived to be, sexual or gender minorities, among others—requires specific attention to meet the discrete needs of these learners. In many instances, interventions that benefit one group of learners will enhance equity and inclusion for others. Interventions will vary according to country and community culture and context, but the emerging evidence points to some interventions that can enhance equity and inclusion in education for the most marginalized of learners with disabilities, Indigenous Peoples learners, and learners who are sexual and gender minorities.

Addressing the educational attainment gaps that are (a) keeping some 58 million children of primary school age and 63 million children of lower secondary school age out of school and (b) meeting the needs of some 250 million children of primary school age who do not reach a minimum level of learning is a major challenge. Meeting this challenge is a precondition to reducing extreme poverty and shared prosperity worldwide.





## APPENDIX 1. KEY RESOURCES

### GENERAL SOURCES ON INCLUSIVE EDUCATION

World Bank. 2006 Education for All–Fast-Track Initiative (EFA FTI). (English). Washington, DC: World Bank.

<http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/451931468136188771/Education-For-All-Fast-Track-Initiative-EFA-FTI>

United Nations Girls' Education Initiative (UNGEI). 2010. "Equity and Inclusion in Education: A Guide to Support Education Sector Plan Preparation, Revision, and Appraisal". UNGEI: New York.

<https://www.globalpartnership.org/content/equity-and-inclusion-education-guide-support-education-sector-plan-preparation-revision-and>

Inter-Agency Network for Education in Emergencies. Undated. "INEE Pocket Guide to Inclusive Education" (available in Arabic, Bahasa Indonesian, English, French, and Spanish). New York: INEE.

<https://www.ineesite.org/en/materials/inee-pocket-guide-to-inclusive-education-in-emergencies>

OECD (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development) and Partners, and S. Field, M. Kuczera, and B. Pont. 2007. No More Failures: Ten Steps to Equity in Education. Paris: OECD.

<http://www.oecd.org/education/school/nomorefailurestentstepstoequityineducation.htm>

\_\_\_\_\_. 2012 Equity and Quality in Education: Supporting Disadvantaged Students and Schools. OECD: Paris.

<http://www.oecd.org/education/school/equityandqualityineducation-supportingdisadvantagedstudentsandschools.htm>

\_\_\_\_\_, 2014. Equity, Excellence and Inclusiveness in Education: Policy Lessons from Around the World. OECD: Paris.

[https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/education/equity-excellence-and-inclusiveness-in-education\\_9789264214033-en](https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/education/equity-excellence-and-inclusiveness-in-education_9789264214033-en)

UNESCO (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization). 2016. "Reaching Out to All Learners: A Resource Pack for Supporting Inclusive Education." UNESCO International Bureau of Education, Geneva.

<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000243279>

\_\_\_\_\_. 2009. "Policy Guidelines on Inclusion in Education." UNESCO, Paris. <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000177849>

\_\_\_\_\_. 2008. "Equity and Inclusion in Education: Tools to Support Education Sector Planning and Evaluation." UNESCO, Paris.

<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000248254>

World Bank Group. 2011. Learning for All. Investing in People's Knowledge and Skills to Promote Development. World Bank Group, Washington DC.

<http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/685531468337836407/Learning-for-all-investing-in-peoples-knowledge-and-skills-to-promote-development-World-Bank-Group-education-strategy-2020-executive-summary>



## SOURCES ON INCLUSIVE EDUCATION FOR SPECIFIC POPULATIONS

### *Persons with Disabilities*

- United Nations. 2006. Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, G.A. Res 61/106, U.N. DOC A/RES/61/106. United Nations: Geneva.  
<https://www.un.org/development/desa/disabilities/convention-on-the-rights-of-persons-with-disabilities.html>
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2016. Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, General Comment on the Right to Inclusive Education. United Nations: Geneva.  
<https://www.ohchr.org/en/hrbodies/crpd/pages/gc.aspx>
- Inter-Agency Network for Education in Emergencies (undated). "INEE Minimum Standards Toolkit Thematic Guide: Disability and Inclusive Education".  
[https://toolkit.ineesite.org/inee\\_minimum\\_standards/implementation\\_tools/%3Ch3%3Ekey\\_thematic\\_issues%3Ch3%3E/inclusive\\_education](https://toolkit.ineesite.org/inee_minimum_standards/implementation_tools/%3Ch3%3Ekey_thematic_issues%3Ch3%3E/inclusive_education)
- \_\_\_\_\_. (undated). "INEE Pocket Guide to Supporting Learners with Disabilities (available in Bahasa Indonesian, English, and French)".  
[https://toolkit.ineesite.org/pocket\\_guide\\_to\\_supporting\\_learners\\_with\\_disabilities](https://toolkit.ineesite.org/pocket_guide_to_supporting_learners_with_disabilities)
- International Labor Organization. 2007. The employment situation of persons with disabilities. Towards better statistical information. ILO, Geneva.  
<https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/disability-and-work/publications/lang--en/index.htm>
- Lord, J. et al. 2017. Needs Assessment of Persons with Disabilities in Egyptian Public Universities and Regional Technical Colleges, Final Report. United States Agency for International Development: Egypt.  
[https://www.edulinks.org/sites/default/files/media/file/Needs\\_assessment\\_of\\_persons\\_with\\_disabilities\\_in\\_egyptian\\_higher\\_institutes.pdf](https://www.edulinks.org/sites/default/files/media/file/Needs_assessment_of_persons_with_disabilities_in_egyptian_higher_institutes.pdf)
- Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights. 2009. Thematic Study on enhancing awareness and understanding of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (A/HRC/10/48). OHCHR: Geneva.  
<http://www.un.org/disabilities/documents/reports/ohchr/A.HRC.10.48AEV.pdf>
- Plan International (2017) "Planning for inclusion: How education budgets and plans target the most marginalized". Plan International: United Kingdom.  
<https://plan-international.org/publications/planning-inclusion>
- Sightsavers. 2012. "Sightsavers' Inclusive Education Work in Bangladesh: Summary of a Scoping Study 2010". Sightsavers: West Sussex, United Kingdom.  
[https://www.eenet.org.uk/resources/docs/Sightsavers\\_Bangladesh\\_booklet.pdf](https://www.eenet.org.uk/resources/docs/Sightsavers_Bangladesh_booklet.pdf)
- United Nations. 2007. Special Rapporteur on the Right to Education, Report on the Right to Education of Persons with Disabilities. A/HRC/4/29 (12 Feb. 2007). United Nations.  
<https://www.right-to-education.org/resource/report-special-rapporteur-right-education-right-education-persons-disabilities>
- UNESCO (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization). 1994. Salamanca Statement on Principles, Policies and Practice in Special Needs Education, World Conference on Special Needs Education: Access and Quality, 7-10 June 1994. UNESCO: Salamanca, Spain.  
[http://www.unesco.org/education/pdf/SALAMA\\_E.PDF](http://www.unesco.org/education/pdf/SALAMA_E.PDF)
- \_\_\_\_\_. (2009) Specialized booklet 3: Teaching Children with Disabilities in Inclusive Settings. UNESCO: Bangkok.  
<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000182975>
- UNICEF (United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund). 2012. The Right of Children with Disability to Education: A Rights-Based Approach to Inclusive Education. Geneva: UNICEF Regional Office for Central and Eastern Europe and the Commonwealth of Independent States (CEECIS).  
[https://www.unicef.org/disabilities/files/UNICEF\\_Right\\_to\\_Education\\_Children\\_Disabilities\\_En\\_Web.pdf](https://www.unicef.org/disabilities/files/UNICEF_Right_to_Education_Children_Disabilities_En_Web.pdf)
- United Nations Development Group. Undated. Including the rights of persons with disabilities in United Nations programming at country level: A Guidance Note for United Nations Country Teams and Implementing Partners. United Nations.  
[http://www.un.org/disabilities/documents/iasg/undg\\_guidance\\_note\\_final.pdf](http://www.un.org/disabilities/documents/iasg/undg_guidance_note_final.pdf)
- World Health Organization. 2011. World Report on Disability. WHO: Geneva.  
[https://www.who.int/disabilities/world\\_report/2011/en/](https://www.who.int/disabilities/world_report/2011/en/)

## Sexual and Gender Minorities

Australian Research Centre in Sex, Health and Society. Undated. "How to support sexual diversity in schools: A checklist". La Trobe University, Melbourne.

<https://www.sex-ed.com.au/how-to-support-sexual-diversity-in-schools-a-checklist/>

Council of Europe. 2016. "Equal opportunities for all children: Non-discrimination of lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex (LGBTI) children and young people". Council of Europe Publishing, Strasbourg.

<https://edoc.coe.int/en/children-s-rights/7051-equal-opportunities-for-all-children-non-discrimination-of-lesbian-gay-bisexual-transgender-and-intersex-lgbti-children-and-young-people.html>

Formby, E. 2013. The Impact of Homophobic and Transphobic Bullying on Education and Employment: A European survey. IGLYO: Brussels.

<https://www4.shu.ac.uk/research/ceir/sites/ceir/files/IGLYOBullyingReportJan2014.pdf>

Fundamental Rights Agency. 2016. Professionally Speaking: Challenges to achieving equality for LGBT people. European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights: Vienna.

<https://fra.europa.eu/en/publication/2016/professional-views-lgbt-equality>

Fundamental Rights Agency. 2014. European Union Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender Survey: Main results. Fundamental Rights Agency: Vienna.

[https://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra-eu-lgbt-survey-main-results\\_tk3113640enc\\_1.pdf](https://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra-eu-lgbt-survey-main-results_tk3113640enc_1.pdf)

IGLYO (The International LGBTQI Youth and Student Organization). 2007. "Guidelines for inclusive education. Sexual orientation, gender identity and gender expression". IGLYO: Brussels, Belgium.

<https://hivhealthclearinghouse.unesco.org/library/documents/guidelines-inclusive-education-sexual-orientation-gender-identity-and-gender>

\_\_\_\_\_. 2018. "Inclusive Education Report: Preview". IGLYO: Brussels, Belgium.

<https://www.education-index.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/LGBTQI-Inclusive-Education-Report-Preview.pdf>

Office of the High Commissioner of Human Rights (OHCHR). Undated. "Free and Equal: United Nations for LGBT Equality, 'Fact Sheet: Intersex'". OHCHR: Geneva.

<https://www.unfe.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/UNFE-Intersex.pdf>

UNDP (United Nations Development Program), Williams Institute. 2014. "Surveying Nepal's Sexual and Gender Minorities: An Inclusive Approach - Executive Summary". UNDP: Bangkok.

<https://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/Nepal-Survey-Oct-2014.pdf>

UNESCO (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization). 2007. Advocacy Kit for Promoting Multilingual Education: Including the excluded. UNESCO-Bangkok, Bangkok.

<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000152198>

\_\_\_\_\_. 2010. Education for All Global Monitoring Report: Reaching the Marginalized. UNESCO: Paris.

<https://en.unesco.org/gem-report/report/2010/reaching-marginalized>

\_\_\_\_\_. 2012. Education Sector Responses to Homophobic Bullying. UNESCO, Paris.

<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000216493>

\_\_\_\_\_. 2015. "From Insult to Inclusion: Asia-Pacific report on school bullying, violence and discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation and gender identity". UNESCO: Paris and Bangkok.

<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000235414>

\_\_\_\_\_. 2016. Out in the Open: Education sector responses to violence based on sexual orientation and gender identity/expression. UNESCO, Paris.

<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000244756>

\_\_\_\_\_. 2017. School Violence and Bullying: Global Status Report. UNESCO, Paris.

<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000246970>

WHO (World Health Organization). 2011. Standards for Sexuality Education in Europe: Guidance for Implementation. WHO Regional Office for Europe and BZgA.

<https://www.bzga-whocc.de/en/publications/standards-in-sexuality-education/>

## Indigenous Peoples

UNESCO (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization). Benson, C. (2005) Girls, Educational Equity and Mother-Tongue-based Teaching. UNSECO: Bangkok.

[http://www.ungei.org/resources/1612\\_779.html](http://www.ungei.org/resources/1612_779.html)

\_\_\_\_\_. 2007. Advocacy kit for promoting multilingual education: Including the excluded. Bangkok: UNESCO-Bangkok.

<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000152198>

Champagne, D. (2009), Contemporary Education in State of the World's Indigenous Peoples, Ch. IV. UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs, ST/ESA/328. United Nations: New York.

<https://www.un.org/development/desa/indigenouspeoples/publications/state-of-the-worlds-indigenous-peoples.html>

Coolangatta Statement. 1999. "The Coolangatta Statement on Indigenous Peoples' Rights in Education (1999). Ratified during the World Indigenous Peoples Conference on Education held in Hilo, Hawaii, in 1999".

<http://www.tebtebba.org/index.php/all-resources/category/21-indigenous-peoples-declaration-statements-and-interventions?download=273:the-coolangatta-statement>

EENET (Enabling Education Network). 2008. "Enabling Education, Issue 12, Special edition on language and inclusive education". EENET, Manchester.

<https://www.eenet.org.uk/enabling-education-review/enabling-education-12/>

EMRIP (Expert Mechanism on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples). 2009. Study on lessons learned and challenges to achieve the implementation of the right of Indigenous peoples to education: Report of the Expert Mechanism on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples. Human Rights Council, UNGA, A/HRC/EMRIP/2009/2, Geneva.

<https://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/IPeoples/EMRIP/Pages/RighttoEducation.aspx>

ILO (International Labour Organization) (ILO). Indigenous, Tribal and Semi-Tribal Populations Convention, No. 107, adopted 27 June 1957.

[https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100\\_ILO\\_CODE:C107](https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100_ILO_CODE:C107)

\_\_\_\_\_. 1989. Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention, No. 169, adopted 27 June 1989.

[https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100\\_ILO\\_CODE:C169](https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=NORMLEXPUB:12100:0::NO::P12100_ILO_CODE:C169)

King, L. and S. Schielmann. 2004. The Challenge of Indigenous Education: Practice and perspectives. UNESCO: Paris.

<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000134773>

UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (UN CESCR). 1999. General Comment No. 13: The Right to Education (Art. 13 of the Covenant). E/C.12/1999/10. United Nations: Geneva.

[https://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/Education/Training/Compilation/Pages/d\)GeneralCommentNo13Therighttoeducation\(article13\)\(1999\).aspx](https://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/Education/Training/Compilation/Pages/d)GeneralCommentNo13Therighttoeducation(article13)(1999).aspx)

Stavenhagen, Rodolfo, Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights and fundamental freedoms of Indigenous people, 16 September 2005, a/60/358, pp. 13-14

[http://ap.ohchr.org/documents/alldocs.aspx?doc\\_id=11540](http://ap.ohchr.org/documents/alldocs.aspx?doc_id=11540)

Psacharopoulos, G. and H.A. Patrinos. 2002. "Returns to Investment in Education: A Further Update". World Bank Policy Research Working Series 2882. World Bank: Washington D.C.

[http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTDEBTDEPT/Resources/468980-1170954447788/3430000-1273248341332/20100426\\_16.pdf](http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTDEBTDEPT/Resources/468980-1170954447788/3430000-1273248341332/20100426_16.pdf)

United Nations. 1997. "The Rights of Indigenous Peoples. Human Rights Fact Sheet No.9".

<https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/FactSheet9rev1en.pdf>

United Nations Development Group. 2008. "UNDG Guidelines on Indigenous Peoples' Issues". United Nations.

<https://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/IPeoples/Pages/UNDGGuidelines.aspx>

UN Expert Mechanism on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples. 2008. Education for All Global Monitoring Report: Education for All by 2015-Will we make it? UNESCO: Paris.

<https://en.unesco.org/gem-report/report/2008/education-all-2015-will-we-make-it>

World Bank (2017) Guía de Buenas Prácticas. Los derechos de los pueblos indígenas y la educación en América Latina. World Bank: Washington DC.

<https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/bitstream/handle/10986/30201/129298-7-8-2018-17-30-51-AfrodescendientesenLatinoamerica.pdf?sequence=5&isAllowed=y>

## APPENDIX 2. GLOSSARY<sup>1</sup>

**Accessibility** refers to the measures taken to ensure persons with disabilities access, on an equal basis with others, to the physical environment; to transportation; to information and communications, including information and communications technologies and systems; and to other facilities and services open or provided to the public, in both urban and rural areas.

**Barriers** The aspects of society that intentionally or unintentionally exclude people with disabilities from full participation and inclusion in society. Barriers can be physical, informational, legal, institutional, environmental, attitudinal, and others.

**Disadvantaged or vulnerable** refers to individuals or groups who, by virtue of, for example, their age, gender, ethnicity, religion, physical, mental or other disability, social, civic or health status, sexual orientation, gender identity, economic disadvantages or Indigenous status, and/or dependence on unique natural resources, may be more likely to be adversely affected by a project's impacts and/or more limited than others in their ability to take advantage of a project's benefits. Such an individual/group also is more likely to be excluded from/unable to participate fully in the mainstream consultation process so may require specific measures and/or assistance to do so. Such assistance will take into account age, including the elderly and minors; and their circumstances, such as being separated from their families, communities, or other individuals upon whom they depend.

**Diversity** refers to individuals' differences, which may relate to their race, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, language, culture, religion, mental and physical ability, class, and immigration status.

**Equity** ensures concern for fairness such that the education of all learners is seen as having equal importance.

**Gender** refers to the social attributes and opportunities associated with being male and female and the interrelationships: between women and men and girls and boys, and between women, and between men.

**Gender equality** conveys the understanding that women and men have equal conditions for realizing their full human rights and for contributing to, and benefiting from, economic, social, cultural, and political development.

**Gender expression** refers to a person's deeply felt internal and individual experience of gender, which may or may not correspond to the sex assigned to the person at birth. Gender expression includes the personal sense of the body (which may involve, if freely chosen, modification of bodily appearance or function by medical, surgical, or other means) and other expressions of gender, including dress, speech, and mannerisms.

**Gender nonconformity** refers to individuals who do not conform to either of the binary gender definitions of male or female, as well as to individuals whose gender expression may differ from standard gender norms.

**Homophobic, biphobic, transphobic, and interphobic** refers to fear of, discomfort with, and/or intolerance or hatred of homosexuality and sexually diverse people.

**Inclusion** in development, in general terms, means empowering all people to participate in, and benefit from, the development process. Inclusion in education targets overcoming the barriers that limit the presence, participation, and achievement of learners. Inclusion utilizes policies to promote equality and nondiscrimination that increase the access of all people, including the poor and disadvantaged, to services and benefits encompassing education, health, social protection, infrastructure, and other assets. Inclusion also employs actions to remove barriers against those who often are excluded from education projects.

**Inclusive education** is a process of strengthening the capacity of the education system to ensure equity and inclusion in the forms of educational access, participation, and achievement for all learners.

**Indigenous Peoples** refers to members of a distinct social and cultural group who possess the following characteristics to varying degrees: (a) self-identification as members of a distinct Indigenous social and cultural group and recognition of this identity by others; and (b) collective attachment to geographically distinct habitats, ancestral territories, or areas of seasonal use or occupation, as well as to the natural resources in these areas; (c) customary cultural, economic, social, or political institutions that are distinct or separate from those of the mainstream society or culture; and (d) a distinct language or dialect, often different from the official language or languages of the country or region in which they reside.

**Individual education plans** are written plans/programs prepared by education professionals in collaboration with multisectoral colleagues with input from the parents that specify a student's academic goals and the methods to achieve these goals.

**Integration** is an approach that places learners deemed to have “special educational needs” in mainstream education settings with some adaptations and resources, but on the condition that they can fit into preexisting structures, attitudes, and an unaltered environment.

**Intersex** is an umbrella term that refers to people whose physical sex characteristics have one or more of a range of variations that fall outside traditional conceptions of male or female bodies. Some intersex characteristics are identified at birth. Other individuals may not discover that they have intersex traits until puberty or later in life. LGBTI/LGBTI+ are the English-language acronyms used to denote lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons. (See endnote 6.)

**Mainstreaming/Mainstream education** is the practice of educating students with specific learning needs in regular classes during specific time-periods based on their skills.

**Persons with disabilities** include those who have long-term physical, mental, intellectual or sensory impairments that, in interaction with various barriers, may hinder their full and effective participation in society on an equal basis with others.

**Reasonable accommodation** means that, where needed in a particular case, the necessary and appropriate modification and adjustments that do not impose a disproportionate or undue burden to ensure to persons with disabilities the enjoyment or exercise on an equal basis with others of all human rights and fundamental freedoms.

**Sexual and gender minorities** is a term that refers to all identities based on sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, and sex characteristics (SOGIESC). This term often is used by the World Bank in lieu of the English-language term, “LGBTI,” in recognition that SOGIESC terminology around the world varies by culture and language.

**Sexual orientation** is a person's capacity for profound emotional and sexual attraction to, and intimate and sexual relations with, individuals of a different gender, the same gender, or more than one gender. For example, gay men experience sexual attraction to, and the capacity for an intimate relationship primarily with, other men. Lesbian women experience sexual attraction to, and the capacity for an intimate relationship primarily with, other women. Bisexual individuals are attracted to both men and women.

**Special education** is classes or instruction designed for students categorized as having special educational needs.

**Special educational needs** is a term used in some countries to refer to children with impairments who are seen as requiring additional support.

**Transgender** refers to a person whose gender identity differs from her/his sex at birth. Transgender people may be male-to-female (female identity and appearance) or female-to-male (male identity and appearance). Transgender people may be heterosexual, homosexual, or bisexual.

**Traditional knowledge** refers to the traditional knowledge, innovations, and practices of Indigenous and local communities.

**Universal design** is the design of products, environments, programs, and services to be usable by all people, to the greatest extent possible, without the need for adaptation or specialized design. Universal design does not exclude assistive devices for particular groups of persons with disabilities when these devices are needed.

<sup>1</sup>This Glossary explains key terms and concepts central to understand equity and inclusion in education for persons with disabilities, Indigenous Peoples, and LGBTI persons. These terms are gleaned particularly from the following sources:  
United Nations. 2006. Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, G.A. Res 61/106, U.N. Doc A/RES/61/106. United Nations: Geneva. <https://www.un.org/development/desa/disabilities/convention-on-the-rights-of-persons-with-disabilities.html>  
United Nations. 1989. Convention on the Rights of the Child. G.A. Res 44/25. United Nations: Geneva. <https://www.ohchr.org/en/professionalinterest/pages/crc.aspx>  
World Bank. 2018. “Environment and Social Framework”. Washington D.C: World Bank. <http://www.worldbank.org/en/projects-operations/environmental-and-social-framework/brief/environmental-and-social-framework-resources>  
United Nations. 2007. Declaration on Rights on Indigenous Peoples. G.A. Res 61/295. United Nations. <https://www.un.org/development/desa/indigenouspeoples/declaration-on-the-rights-of-indigenous-peoples.html>  
UNESCO. 2016. Out in the Open: Education sector responses to violence based on sexual orientation and gender identity/expression. UNESCO, Paris. <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000244756>

## APPENDIX 3. SYSTEM-WIDE CHECKLIST QUESTIONS

### *Law/Policy Framework*

- Comprehensive analysis, including of legislation, to modify or abolish existing laws, regulations, customs, and practices that constitute discrimination in education against disadvantaged groups, including:
  - Persons with disabilities
  - Sexual and gender minorities
  - Indigenous Peoples
- Are there any provisions that exclude persons from the general education system based on:
  - Disability (physical, sensory, psychosocial, intellectual)?
  - SOGIESC?
  - Indigenous status, language?
- Does legislation guarantee for all on an equal basis:
  - Access to early stage education?
  - Free and compulsory primary education?
  - Access to secondary education? Higher education?
- Do any provisions require/favor segregation of persons with disabilities, Indigenous learners, learners who are sexual or gender minorities, or other disadvantaged groups from the mainstream education system?
- Are legislative, administrative, and other measures required to ensure inclusive education for disadvantaged learners?
  - Including legislation that specifically protects persons with disabilities, Indigenous Peoples, and sexual and gender minorities from discrimination in education?
    - Does legislation incorporate the denial of reasonable accommodation in education as an element of nondiscrimination?
    - Does legislation/policy recognize the right of Indigenous learners to education?
- Does education policy reflect the principles of inclusive education (for example, nondiscrimination, accessibility, availability, adaptability, acceptability, safety, participation, and respect for difference)?

### *Budgetary Resources for Inclusion*

- How is inclusive education factored into resource allocation?
- Is earmarked funding provided to ensure the delivery of quality education for Indigenous Peoples? For persons with disabilities?
- Are resources distributed in ways that benefit disadvantaged learners?

### *Partnerships for Inclusion*

- Are there civil society partners available for consultation to understand the needs of learners with disabilities, learners who are sexual or gender minorities, and Indigenous learners, or other disadvantaged groups? Are these civil society partners consulted?

### **Monitoring for Inclusion**

- Are systems in place to monitor the presence, participation, and achievement of all learners within the education system?
  - Are data collected at all levels of education and disaggregated as appropriate, to enable full understanding of the education gap and the barriers to education faced by disadvantaged learners in exercising their right to education, at all levels of education?
  - Including disaggregated data based on indigeneity, gender, disability, SOGIESC, and other disadvantage?

### **National Plans, Strategies for Inclusive Education**

- Does the national education plan/strategy reflect the aims and principles of inclusive education?
  - Does the plan/strategy identify inclusive education as a goal and indicator of progress?
  - Does the plan/strategy include teacher training in inclusive education?
  - Does the plan/strategy recognize and align with relevant international standards on, and commitments to, inclusive education?
- Measures to ensure participation?
  - Do such measures ensure full consultation and participation in decision-making with Indigenous communities?
  - Do such measures make the best interests of the child (as defined in human rights law) a primary consideration?
  - Do disadvantaged children have the right to express their views freely on all matters affecting them and are their views given due weight in accordance with their age and maturity?
- Measures to ensure the accessibility of the education system for all children:
  - Do these measures include the physical environment in the education system?
  - School transportation systems?
  - Information and communications, including information and communications technologies (ICTs) and systems utilized by the education system?
  - To other facilities and services utilized by the education system?
  - Do such measures apply to urban and rural settings?



## SCHOOL-LEVEL MEASURES FOR INCLUSION

### *Participation and Decision-Making*

- Are representatives of disadvantaged groups fully and effectively involved at all levels and stages of decision-making, planning, design, and implementation of education program?
  - Are Indigenous elders, community leaders, and parents involved?
  - Are individuals who are sexual and gender minorities involved, especially parents of students who are sexual and gender minorities, community allies, representatives from the sexual and gender minority community?
  - Are persons with disabilities involved, especially parents of children with disabilities, disabled leaders in the community, representative disabled people's organizations?
- Are disadvantaged groups offered meaningful positions on school boards and policy-making committees (as well as in institutions of the state education system)?
  - Indigenous representation? Sexual and gender minority representation? Representation among persons with disabilities?
- Do teaching appointments (and recruitment) reflect diversity and disadvantaged groups?
- Are representatives from disadvantaged communities involved as consultants, teachers, volunteers?
  - In particular, in mother-tongue instruction in early childhood and primary education (such as Indigenous language instruction, sign language)?
- Are education plans used as tools for cooperation and collaboration to advance inclusion?
  - Is support provided for the design and implementation of Indigenous Peoples' own educational plans, programs, curricula, and materials; and the establishment of their own educational institutions to enhance responsibility and ownership of Indigenous Peoples over educational practices and contents?
  - Is there a process in place for individualized education plans, especially for all students with disabilities that require disability accommodations and support at school?

### *Inclusive Pedagogy and methodology*

- Are the views, values, priorities, and aspirations of Indigenous Peoples carefully considered and accounted for as the basis for project planning?
- Are pedagogical principles and teaching methods identified in consultation with Indigenous Peoples at the start of a project?
- Are Indigenous community members, parents, and elders consulted and involved regarding what their students should, and want to, learn—and when and how?
- Are formal and nonformal, as well as traditional and modern, teaching methods considered and used, drawing from traditional teaching methods at home and in the community?
- Are cooperative, interactive, and reflexive learning-teaching processes promoted, based on all aspects of knowledge and the experiences of all disadvantaged learners?
- Are creative approaches used to incorporate knowledge and methods of different cultures and communities?
  - Using multiple methods of teaching, including visual, tactile, and practical materials for nonverbal communication
  - In cases in which the children speak different languages, arranging the children according to their mother tongues
  - Taking excursions to learn the cultural significance of places and their specific flora and fauna as well as associated stories, ceremonies, beliefs, and usages
  - Participating in ceremonies with family members, to learn rituals, associated songs, dances, astronomical observations
  - Producing artefacts, using local materials and techniques to revitalize and maintain traditional practices.

### ***Inclusive Curriculum***

- Is the curricula inclusive and reflecting the diversity of the population, including disadvantaged groups in society?
  - Has revision of all curricula and materials throughout the education system occurred to remove negative and discriminatory stereotypes rooted in cultural prejudice about Indigenous persons? Sexual and gender minorities? Persons with disabilities?
- Are the curricula and learning materials inclusive and intercultural?
  - Do they reflect include accurate information about Indigenous Peoples, their cultures, histories, and lived experience?
  - Do they convey accurate and positive representation of students who are sexual and gender minorities and students with disabilities?
  - Are programs on health issues, including safer sex education programs, inclusive, including for students who are sexual or gender minorities, and students with disabilities especially? Provided in mother tongue for Indigenous students?
- Are extra curricula programs accessible to all students, including students with disabilities, students who are sexual and gender minorities, and Indigenous students?

### ***Languages of Instruction, Culture, and Knowledge***

- Are there teaching and learning of and through the mother tongue for Indigenous learners in early schooling and literacy instruction, with additional language learning in a culturally appropriate and gradual way, according to learners' capacities and needs?
- Are there teaching and learning Indigenous knowledge and curricula through Indigenous language and the use of locally researched and produced material in Indigenous languages?
  - Does the approach to inclusion demonstrate respect for, and recognition of ownership of, Indigenous communities as holders of Indigenous knowledge, and for their specific ways of generating and transmitting knowledge?
  - Are the identification and incorporation of relevant local cultural knowledge done with the participation and informed consent of Indigenous communities and elders; inclusion of stories, diaries, and textbooks; as well as nonverbal education materials produced by Indigenous teachers
- Has the school involved native speakers of Indigenous languages as teachers/assistants/visitors?
- Has capacity-building for teachers occurred so that they are able to teach in the mother tongue or ethnic language of the students; are prepared for and understand the importance of involving the community in formal education; and understand and work to the strengths of their learners?
- Does the education of persons, particularly children who are blind, deaf, or deafblind, meet individual requirements to ensure delivery in the most appropriate languages and modes and means of communication?
  - Does the education system facilitate the learning of sign language?
  - Does the education system promote the linguistic identity of the deaf community?

### **Individualized Supports to Facilitate Full Inclusion and Active Learning**

- Do schools have strategies that encourage the presence, participation, and achievement of all learners from their local community?
- Do schools provide support for learners who are at risk of underachievement, marginalization, and exclusion?
- Do persons with disabilities have their individual requirements for reasonable accommodation met to facilitate their effective education within the general education system:
  - Do these persons have individualized education plans?
  - Does the education system facilitate the learning and use of Braille; alternative script; and augmentative and alternative modes, means, and formats of communication?
  - Is sign language provided?
- Do persons with disabilities have access to life and social development skills to facilitate their full and equal participation in education and as members of the community?
  - Does the education system facilitate the learning and use of orientation and mobility skills, such as use of white canes, wheelchairs?
  - Does the education system facilitate peer support and mentoring?
- Are professionals and staff who work at all levels of education trained in:
  - Disability awareness?
  - Use of appropriate augmentative and alternative modes, means, and formats of communication?
  - Educational techniques and materials to support persons with disabilities?
- Are persons with disabilities included as teachers and school leaders in school systems?
- Is the general tertiary education, vocational training, adult education, and lifelong learning system accessible to persons with disabilities without discrimination on equal basis with others?
- Are individualized requirements met?

### **Physical Infrastructure**

- Are the pathways to and inside school facilities accessible? Is the interior space accessible, including levels above ground floor?
- Are hazards removed that may pose dangers for blind students and students with mobility disabilities?
- Are physical learning spaces meeting the needs of all students?
- Do Indigenous learners (and others) have opportunities to learn in the natural environment?
- Are classrooms arranged in an inclusive manner (accessible to students with physical disabilities? structured in unconventional ways, such as circle arrangements?)
- Do the facilities take into account the specific needs of transgender and intersex students?
- Does the education facility have gender-neutral toilets and changing facilities?
- Does the education institution provide access to sports and private changing areas facilities for transgender and intersex students?

### **Teacher and Staff Training and Capacity Building**

- Are teachers and support staff trained to respond to learner diversity during their initial teacher/staff education and training?
- Do teachers and support staff have opportunities to take part in continuing professional development regarding inclusive and equitable practices?
- Are there in-service teacher training programs in place on inclusion regarding:
  - Children with disabilities?
  - Sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, and sex characteristics?
  - The local Indigenous community and its culture, history, knowledge?
- Are there teachers, including teachers with disabilities, who are qualified in sign language and/or Braille?
- Are there teachers qualified in local Indigenous languages?
- Is in-service teacher training provided on law/policy/practice to protect diverse students and staff from discrimination and harassment and to ensure that the policy is enforced?
  - Is the teacher training inclusive of all groups subject to disadvantage including persons with disabilities, Indigenous persons and sexual and gender minorities?

### **Welfare and Support Services**

- Are welfare and support services, information, and resources offered for disadvantaged students?
  - For students who are sexual and gender minorities:
- Are students who are sexual or gender minorities provided with supports to address violence and bullying?
- Does the education institution have membership in any inclusive education networks that support students who are sexual or gender minorities, specifically or as part of wider inclusion initiatives?
- Has the school set up peer mentoring with individuals who are sexual and gender minorities from the community?
- Have efforts been made to address and educate the perpetrators of violence and bullying?
  - For students with disabilities?
- Do students with disabilities know where to go for support services, including reasonable accommodations? Are support services adequate?
- Does the education institution have membership in any inclusive education networks that support students with disabilities specifically, or as part of wider inclusion initiatives?
- Has the school set up peer mentoring with persons with disabilities from the community?
  - For Indigenous students?
- Is the education institution a member in any inclusive education networks that support Indigenous students specifically or as part of wider inclusion initiatives?
- Has the institution set up peer mentoring with Indigenous People from the community?
- Are remedies available to victims of violence in the school system?

### ***Assessment, Monitoring, and Evaluation***

- Does assessment test students' performance at the end of a program/term and include multiple strategies such as observation, informal interviews, self-evaluation, and continual assessment of performance throughout the program?
  - Are students accommodated during assessments?
  - Do students with disabilities receive accommodations during assessments, such as accessible testing venues, access to technology, readers, scribes?
- Are there assessment and monitoring of teaching methods and practices?
- Teachers' performance?
- Accessibility and inclusiveness of curriculum and materials?
- Program overall?

## REFERENCES

- <sup>i</sup> World Bank, *Learning for All: Investing in People's Knowledge and Skills to Promote Development*. World Bank Group Education Strategy 2020 (World Bank, Washington, DC, 2011).
- <sup>ii</sup> World Bank, *Equity and Development. World Development Report 2006* (Washington, DC and Oxford, England, UK: World Bank and Oxford University Press, 2005), 34.
- <sup>iii</sup> World Bank, *Inclusion Matters: The Foundation for Shared Prosperity* (Washington, DC: World Bank, 2013), 3.
- <sup>iv</sup> World Bank, *Inclusion Matters: The Foundation for Shared Prosperity* (Washington, DC: World Bank, 2013), 3.
- <sup>v</sup> World Bank, *The World Bank Environmental and Social Framework: A Vision for Sustainable Development* (World Bank, Washington, DC, 2017), 1.
- <sup>vi</sup> The World Bank uses "SOGI" (sexual orientation and gender identity) as a short-hand term when referring to matters related to sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, and sex characteristics (SOGIESC). On the other hand, when referring to people, the World Bank may use the acronym, "LGBTI" (lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, and intersex), or LGBTI+ to represent the full spectrum of persons of diverse sexual orientation and gender identity/gender expression/sex characteristics. Finally, sometimes "sexual and gender minorities" is used when referring to country or local contexts in which it is not common for sexual and gender minorities to use LGBTI+ or in which the use of local, culturally specific terms prevails.
- <sup>vii</sup> United Nations. A/RES/70/1. The Sustainable Development Agenda. (United Nations, New York, October 2015) <https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/21252030%20Agenda%20for%20Sustainable%20Development%20web.pdf>.
- <sup>viii</sup> UNESCO, *Global Education Monitoring Report* (Paris: UNESCO, 2016).
- <sup>ix</sup> UNESCO, *Education for All Global Monitoring Report: Reaching the Marginalized. Summary* (Paris: UNESCO, 2010).
- <sup>x</sup> World Bank Group, *Environmental and Social Framework, Environmental and Social Standard 1. Assessment and Management of Environmental and Social Risks and Impacts* (World Bank, Washington DC, 2017), 19.
- <sup>xi</sup> World Bank, Bank Directive, "Addressing Risks and Impacts on Disadvantaged or Vulnerable Individuals or Groups" (World Bank, Washington DC, 2016).
- <sup>xii</sup> UNESCO, "Salamanca Statement on Principles, Policies and Practice in Special Needs Education," World Conference on Special Needs Education: Access and Quality, June 7–10, 1994 (UNESCO, Paris).
- <sup>xiii</sup> UNESCO, 1994, para. 2.
- <sup>xiv</sup> United Nations, *Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities*, G.A. Res 61/106, U.N. Doc A/RES/61/106 (UN, New York, Dec. 13, 2006); Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, *General Comment on the Right to Inclusive Education* (UN, New York, 2016); UNESCO Policy Guidelines on Inclusion in Education (UNESCO, Paris, 2009); UNESCO, *Equity and Inclusion in Education: Tools to Support Education Sector Planning and Evaluation* (UNESCO, Paris, 2008).
- <sup>xv</sup> UNESCO. 1994. Para. 3.
- <sup>xvi</sup> International conventions mandate that primary education be available "free to all," including hard-to-reach students. In the case of secondary and higher education, States Parties are required to achieve economic accessibility based on progressive realization, hard-to-reach students must not face additional barriers and ensuring access on an equal basis with all other students.
- <sup>xvii</sup> World Bank, *Learning for All: Investing in People's Knowledge and Skills to Promote Development*. World Bank Group Education Strategy 2020. (World Bank, Washington, DC., 2011).
- <sup>xviii</sup> World Bank Group Education Strategy 2020, 2011, 43.

- <sup>xix</sup> World Bank, *World Development Report 2006: Equity and Development* (Washington, DC and London: World Bank and Oxford University Press, 2005), 28.
- <sup>xx</sup> INEE (Inter-Agency Network for Education in Emergencies), Task Team on Inclusive Education and Disability, “Education in Emergencies: Including Everyone” (INEE, New York, 2009), 13.
- <sup>xxi</sup> Ibid, 212.
- <sup>xxii</sup> WHO (World Health Organization) and World Bank, *World Report on Disability* (Geneva and Washington, DC: WHO and World Bank, 2011).
- <sup>xxiii</sup> World Bank, “Including Persons with Disabilities in Water Sector Operations: A Guidance Note” (World Bank, Washington, DC., 2017).
- <sup>xxiv</sup> United Nations Special Rapporteur on the Right to Education, “Report on the Right to Education of Persons with Disabilities.” A/HRC/4/29 (UN, February 2, 2007). United Nations. 2007. <https://www.right-to-education.org/resource/report-special-rapporteur-right-education-right-education-persons-disabilities>
- <sup>xxv</sup> UNSTAT (United Nations Statistics Division), SDG Indicators. Metadata Repository (UN, New York, 2018). <https://unstats.un.org/sdgs/metadata?Text=andGoal=4andTarget=4.a>.
- <sup>xxvi</sup> UN (United Nations), International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, G.A. Res. 2200A (XXI), U.N. GAOR, Supp. No. 16, U.N. Doc. A/6316, art. 13 (UN, New York, 1966).
- <sup>xxvii</sup> United Nations, CRPD (Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities) (UN, New York, 2006), Art. 24.
- <sup>xxviii</sup> Luis Felipe Duchicela, Svend Jensby, Jorge Uquillas, Jelena Lukic, and Karen Sirker, “Indigenous Peoples Development in World Bank-Financed Projects: Our People, Our Resources Striving for a Peaceful and Plentiful Planet Case Studies Report,” Social Development Department, Social Sustainability and Safeguards Social, Urban, Rural and Resilience Global Practice and Operations Risk Management Department, Operations Policy and Country Services (Social Development Department, World Bank, Washington DC, April 2015), <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/230651468190153314/Indigenous-peoples-development-in-World-Bank-financed-projects-our-people-our-resources-striving-for-a-peaceful-and-plentiful-planet-case-studies-report> World Bank policy uses “Indigenous Peoples” in a generic sense to refer to distinct, vulnerable, social, and cultural groups who, to varying degrees, possess the following characteristics: (1) self-identification; (2) collective attachment to territories and natural.
- <sup>xxix</sup> UNESCO (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization) and Partners, Year of Indigenous Languages (YIL) (2019). <https://en.iyl2019.org/>.
- <sup>xxx</sup> UN (United Nations), Expert Mechanism on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (EMRIP), “Study on Lessons Learned and Challenges to Achieve the Implementation of the Right of Indigenous Peoples,” HRC/12/33 31. (UN, New York, August 2009).
- <sup>xxxi</sup> Rodolfo Stavenhagen, United Nations Special Rapporteur on the Situation of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms of Indigenous People, a/60/358 (UN, New York, September 16, 2005), 13–14.
- <sup>xxxii</sup> UN EMRIP 2009.
- <sup>xxxiii</sup> UN EMRIP 2009.
- <sup>xxxiv</sup> General Law on Education and General Law on Linguistic Rights of Indigenous Peoples (Mexico); Policy on Complementary Education for Indigenous Peoples (Colombia); Republic of South Africa, Constitution of the Rep. of South Africa, sect. 6 (2).
- <sup>xxxv</sup> Linda King and Sabine Schielmann, *The Challenge of Indigenous Education: Practice and Perspectives* (Paris: UNESCO, 2004), <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000134773>



- <sup>xxxvi</sup> Examples provided by the UN's Expert Mechanism on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (EMRIP) include: General Law on Education and General Law on Linguistic Rights of Indigenous Peoples (Mexico); Policy on Complementary Education for Indigenous Peoples (Colombia); Rep. of South Africa, Constitution of South Africa, sect. 6 (2); First Nations Jurisdiction over Education Act 2006 and First Nations Education Act 2007 (Canada); Education Act of Norway; and National Education Act (Argentina).
- <sup>xxxvii</sup> UNESCO, *Education Sector Responses to Homophobic Bullying* (Paris: UNESCO, 2012); Eleanor Formby, *The Impact of Homophobic and Transphobic Bullying on Education and Employment: A European Survey* (International Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer and Intersex Youth and Student Organisation, or IGLYO), Brussels, 2013), <https://www4.shu.ac.uk/research/ceir/sites/ceir/files/IGLYOBullyingReportJan2014.pdf>
- <sup>xxxviii</sup> World Bank Group, Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity, <https://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/sexual-orientation-and-gender-identity>
- <sup>xxxiv</sup> UNESCO. *Out in the Open: Education Sector Responses to Violence Based on Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity/Expression* (Paris: UNESCO, 2016).
- <sup>xi</sup> Council of Europe, *Equal Opportunities for All Children: Nondiscrimination of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Intersex (LGBTI) Children and Young People* (Strasbourg: Council of Europe Publishing, 2016); Eleanor Formby, *The Impact of Homophobic and Transphobic Bullying on Education and Employment: A European Survey* (International Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer and Intersex Youth and Student Organization, or IGLYO), Brussels, 2013), <https://www4.shu.ac.uk/research/ceir/sites/ceir/files/IGLYOBullyingReportJan2014.pdf> Fundamental Rights Agency, *Professionally Speaking: Challenges to Achieving Equality for LGBT People* (Vienna: European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, 2016).
- <sup>xli</sup> UNESCO. *Out in the Open: Education Sector Responses to Violence Based on Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity/Expression* (Paris: UNESCO, 2016).
- <sup>xlii</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>xliii</sup> UN (United Nations), *World Report on Violence against Children*, Paulo Sérgio Pinheiro, Independent Expert for the United Nations Secretary-General's Study on Violence against Children (UN, New York, 2006).

