Abbreviated Resettlement Action Plan

Feasibility, Detailed Design and Safeguards Impact Study for Proposed Pasakha Dry Port and Inland Clearance Facility

Submitted to

Department of Trade, Ministry of Economic Affairs, Royal Government of Bhutan

June 2016
Table of contents

1. Abbreviated Resettlement Action Plan 5

1.1. Executive Summary 5

1.1.1. Resettlement Budget 6

1.2. Background 6

1.2.1. Scope and Objective of abbreviated RAP 7

1.2.2. Approach and Methodology 8

1.2.3. Alternatives Considered and Measures to Minimize Impact 9

1.2.4. Status of linked project’s activities 11

1.3. Scope of Land Acquisition and Resettlement 12

1.3.1. Scope of Land acquisition and associated impacts 12

1.3.2. Potential Impact on LAP due to approach road design 12

1.4. Socio-economic profile of PAP’s 15

1.5. Public Consultation and Disclosure 16

1.5.1. Stakeholder consultation 16

1.5.2. Disclosure of A-RAP 26

1.6. Resettlement Principles and Legal Framework 26

1.6.1. Resettlement principles for the project 28

1.6.2. Valuation of affected structures 29

1.6.3. Income restoration measures 30

1.6.4. Gender Plan 32

1.6.5. Training needs assessment 33

1.6.6. Cut-off date for eligibility 34

1.7. Eligibility, Entitlement Assistance and Benefits 34

1.7.1. Eligibility and impact classification 34

1.7.2. Entitlement matrix 37

1.8. Resettlement Budget and Management 38

1.8.1. Calculation of overall cost of resettlement as per the Entitlement matrix 38

1.8.2. Institution Arrangements and Resettlement Management 41

1.8.3. Implementation schedule 44

1.9. Grievance Redress Mechanism 45

1.10. Monitoring and Evaluation 47

1.10.1. Internal monitoring 47
1.10.2. Reporting requirements
1.10.3. External monitoring

A.1. Public Consultation Attendance Sheet

Table of Tables

Table 1: Linked Project's activities status (SASEC - ADB) ................................................................. 11
Table 2 summary of project impacts in terms of affected assets and displaced persons .................................................. 12
Table 3: PAP Details ............................................................................................................................................ 36
Table 5: Entitlement Matrix ............................................................................................................................... 38
Table 6: Implementation Schedule .................................................................................................................... 44

Table of Figures

Figure 1: Proposed Project Site .......................................................................................................................... 7
Figure 2: Pre design option proposed for the project .......................................................................................... 10
Figure 3: Final design option with minimized impact on PAP’s ........................................................................ 10
Figure 4: Snapshot of LAP ............................................................................................................................... 13
Figure 5: Impact classification for eligibility .................................................................................................... 35
Figure 6: Guidance to setup a GRM as described by World Bank ..................................................................... 45
# List of Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SR No</th>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>ADB</td>
<td>Asian Development Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>ARAP</td>
<td>Abbreviated Resettlement Action Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>BDPC</td>
<td>Bhutan Development Finance Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>BIT</td>
<td>Business Income Tax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>BM</td>
<td>Bench Mark</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>CAGR</td>
<td>Cumulative Average Growth Rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>CCD</td>
<td>Convention to Combat Desertification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>CFZ</td>
<td>Container Freight Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>CIT</td>
<td>Corporate Income Tax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>FGD</td>
<td>Focused Group Discussions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>FTWZ</td>
<td>Free Trade warehousing Zone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>GIS</td>
<td>Geographic Information Systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>ICD</td>
<td>Inland Container Depot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>Inland Container Terminal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>PAF</td>
<td>Project Affected Families</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>PAP</td>
<td>Project Affected People</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>PDP</td>
<td>Pasakha Dry Port</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>PIA</td>
<td>Project Influence Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>PPP</td>
<td>Public Private Partnership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>PRA</td>
<td>Participatory Rapid Appraisal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>RFP</td>
<td>Request for Proposal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>RGOB</td>
<td>Royal Government of Bhutan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>SIA</td>
<td>Social Impact Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>TEU</td>
<td>Twenty Foot Equivalent Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>ToR</td>
<td>Term of Reference</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. **Abbreviated Resettlement Action Plan**

1.1. **Executive Summary**

Royal Government of Bhutan with assistance from World Bank has initiated the study for a proposal to develop a Dry Port at Pasakha in the neighborhood of Phuentsholing. A dry port is expected to dovetail logistical benefits with facilitation of customs procedures, it is also expected to decongest cargo traffic at the Jaigaon-Phuentsholing gate.

The proposed dry port site is located at Pasakha (largest industrial area in Bhutan), and is within 1 km from the Bhutan-India border. The dry port is envisaged to be developed in an area of 15 acres which is about 20 km from Phuentsholing gate.

The project site consists of 15 acres of land which is entirely barren without any encumbrance. The site is mostly covered with bushes and grass and is free from any structures or community assets. However, the project design also includes development of an approach road leading to the dry port site.

The construction of approach road of length of 271m will lead to land acquisition resulting in physical and economic displacement of people and loss of access to the land that provides for economic resources. The construction of the approach road will entail acquisition of private land of area of 27443 sq.ft equivalent to 0.63 acres. The private land acquisition lead to resettlement of 5 land parcels out of which 3 land parcels have structures. These structures are being used for residential and commercial purpose. Thus project activity triggers World Bank Operational Policy OP 4.12 on Involuntary Resettlement.

*There are no indigenous people in the project area of influence, hence World Bank OP 4.10 is not triggered.*

A census survey was undertaken at the project site to determine the Project affected persons (PAP’s). The census survey indicated that the total number of the affected PAP’s are 88. Since less than 200 people will be affected, hence, in accordance with the World Bank Policy OP 4.12 an abbreviated Resettlement Action Plan (A - RAP) is prepared for project activities and planned for implementation.

The likely positive impacts with the establishment of the Economic Zone include:

- Increase in direct and indirect employment opportunities for both the genders
- Increase in employment opportunities in neighbouring villages as well
- Possibility of provision of enhanced water supply and medical care facilities
- Improved communication and transportation facilities
- Overall development of the surroundings leading to a cumulative development of living standard and social status

The adverse impacts for the proposed project include:

- Increase in environmental pollution levels during the construction stage (Air, Noise, Dust and Water)
- Impact on the existing sanitation and waste disposal practices
- influx of migrants might increase the cost of living in the area and also might affect socio-economic condition of the area by impacting public services, demography of the area, housing
facilities, employment opportunities and aesthetic quality of the community during both
construction and operational phase of the project

- Acquisition of the private land resulting in the physical and economic displacement of the
local stakeholders

1.1.1. Resettlement Budget

As the number of PAP’s are lower than 200, an abbreviated Resettlement Action Plan has been
prepared taking into cognizance WB OP 4.12 Annex A - Involuntary Resettlement Instruments. The
entitlement matrix and the budget allocation has been considered based on discussions with the DoT,
Thromde and also taking into cognizance the World Bank Operational Policy 4.12. The displaced
persons will be entitled to the following compensation:

- For titled holders, the land proposed to be acquired will be compensated either by (a) land to
land compensation or by (b) cash compensation at negotiated value.
- Compensation for structures (residential/commercial) and other immovable assets at
replacement cost;
- Rehabilitation assistance in lieu of the loss of business/ wage/income/livelihood;
- Special assistance for vulnerable groups;

1.2. Background

Royal Government of Bhutan with assistance from World Bank had intiated the study for a proposal
for development of a Dry Port at Pasakha in the neighborhood of Phuentsholing. A dry port is
expected to dovetail logistical benefits with facilitation of customs procedures, it is also expected to
decongest cargo traffic at the Jaigaon-Pheuntsholing gate.

The proposed dry port site is located at Pasakha (largest industrial area in Bhutan), and is within 1 km
from the Bhutan-India border. The dry port is envisaged to be developed in an area of 15 acres which
is about 20 km from Phuentsholing gate. We have observed that the proposed dry port is in a strategic
location to cater to the needs of Pasakha industrial area and also the trade requirements of northern
and interior parts of Bhutan. The site is bounded on two sides by seasonal rivers - Bhalu Jhora Chhu
and Padsekh Chhu. A 120 m bridge connects the site to the road from Phuentsholing across the
Bhalu Jhora Chhu. A snapshot of the proposed dry port in the context of Pasakha area in
Phuentsholing is shown in Figure
The project site consists of 15 acres of land which is entirely barren without any encumbrance. The site is mostly covered with bushes and grass and is free from any structures or community assets. However, the project design also includes development of an approach road leading to the dry port site.

The construction of approach road of length of 271m will lead to land acquisition resulting in physical and economic displacement of people and loss of access to the land that provides for economic resources. The construction of the approach road will entail acquisition of private land of area of 27443 sq. feet equivalent to 0.63 acres. The private land acquisition lead to resettlement of 5 land parcels out of which 3 land parcels have structures. These structures are being used for residential and commercial purpose. Thus project activity triggers World Bank Operational Policy OP4.12 on Involuntary Resettlement.

There are no indigenous people in the project area of influence, hence World Bank OP 4.10 is not triggered.

A census survey was undertaken at the project site to determine the Project affected persons (PAP’s). The census survey indicated that the total number of the affected PAP’s are 88. Since less than 200 people will be affected, hence, in accordance with the World Bank Policy OP 4.12 an abbreviated Resettlement Action Plan (A - RAP) is prepared for project activities and planned for implementation.

1.2.1. Scope and Objective of abbreviated RAP

An abbreviated Resettlement Action Plan (A-RAP) is a document drafted by the sponsor responsible for resettlement (such as government agencies), specifying the procedures it will follow and the
actions it will take to resettle and compensate affected people and communities. The A-RAP are meant to address issues related to Involuntary Resettlement and/or the loss of assets and/or income as a result of the land acquisition approach and the demarcation of location of facilities. These A-RAPs describe the broad scope of the project, land acquisitions policy and procedures, assesses the extent and severity of impacts, compensation to project affected people as well as required institutional arrangements.

The A-RAP for Pasakha Dry Port Project is prepared in line with all the necessary requirements outlined in World Bank's OP 4.12, Annex A - Involuntary Resettlement Instruments. These guidelines emphasize that involuntary resettlement should be avoided or minimized where possible by exploring other alternative project designs. Where displacement is unavoidable, people losing assets or other resources shall be assisted in restoring or improving their former living standards. The policy document further describes the details of entitlements and type of assistance to be extended to the affected households and persons, which is the basis for the abbreviated Resettlement Action Plan.

This abbreviated plan covers the following minimum elements:
- A census survey of displaced persons (DP’s) and valuation of assets;
- Description of compensation and other resettlement assistance to be provided;
- Eligibility of DP’s as per the entitlements and resettlement budget;
- Consultations with displaced people about acceptable alternatives, their concerns and likely positive impacts;
- Institutional responsibility for implementation;
- Procedures for grievance redress

### 1.2.2. Approach and Methodology

The following approach was adopted to develop the Abbreviated Resettlement Plan:

- a) The affected households list was inventorized, surveyed and reviewed; based on the final detailed designs and road alignment.
- b) Phuentsholing Thromde was consulted for the cognizance on the alignment of the approach road and the inventorisation of the assets was based on the consented design of the approach road.
- c) Data was collected from primary and secondary sources which including field visits and interviews with the project affected people, groups and communities.
- d) A census survey covering all affected households was carried out using a structured questionnaire.
- e) Consultations were held with affected families/groups (including women headed households), and their specific issues/impacts were documented.
- f) Assessment and verification was done on assets lost by households, loss of community resources/infrastructure if any.
- g) The Abbreviated resettlement plan was developed based on the land act of Bhutan and World Bank OP 4.12. The ARAP constituted the entitlement matrix and a compensation plan for the affected households.
- h) The proposed grievance redress mechanism and specific roles and functions for grievance handling at different levels was reviewed and improved based on consultations with the affected people.
- i) Final disclosure about the abbreviated Resettlement Plan to the DP’s. The disclosure will be held in multiple languages including the National language (Bhutanese) and English
1.2.3. Alternatives Considered and Measures to Minimize Impact

The proposed technical design for the Pasakha dry port project has undergone considerable iterations particularly related to the positioning of the approach road for dry port. The basis of these design iterations was not only to ensure the technical viability of the project, but more importantly to reduce and minimize the overall impact on the Project Affected Person (PAP’s). This impact takes into account their land, structures as well as livelihood.

During the feasibility study, 3 design options have been explored and were considered for the approach road. Based on extensive consultation with the Thromde municipality and keeping cognizance of the envisaged Local Area Plan for Pasakha area, the final design option was selected. This measure has reduced the potential involuntary displacement which would have resulted from the previous approach road design options.

The final design option that has been agreed with due consultation with Department of Trade (DoT) and municipality Thromde, Phuentsholing, is presented below:
Figure 2: Pre design option proposed for the project

Figure 3: Final design option with minimized impact on PAP's
1.2.4. Status of linked project’s activities

ADB and the Government of Bhutan are working together to bring safer roads and more opportunities to the southern part of the country. The South Asia Sub regional Economic Cooperation Road Connectivity Project (SASEC) will build 68.3 km of the vital Southern East West Highway between the towns of Dewathang and Nganglam, which is one of the main crossing points between Bhutan and India. The project is also building a 1.2 km access road between Bhutan’s border with India and the Pasakha industrial estate, reducing travel time by 90 percent from nearly two hours to about 10 minutes along with the reconstruction of the bridge over the Bhalujhora River (120m) and construction of the multi-cellular culverts over Bhawanijhora landslide debris flow. Border crossing stations in Phuentsholing City the town of Alay will also be improved, and a 2.7 km access road to the national highway will be built.

The proposed reconstruction of the bridge over the Bhalujhora River (120m) constitutes the linked project and the assessment of the safeguards for the linked project is as described below.

Table 1: Linked Project's activities status (SASEC - ADB)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Name and Brief Description</th>
<th>Funding Agency</th>
<th>Implementing Agency</th>
<th>Linkage to Dry Port project</th>
<th>Current Status of project</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>South Asia Subregional Economic Cooperation Road Connectivity Project: Nganglam-Dewathang Highway and Pasakha Access Road Sub Project: The proposed works under this project will require widening and reconstruction of a 1.2km section of the existing access road to Pasakha coming from Phuentsholing; reconstruction of the bridge over the Bhalujhora River (120m) and construction of the multi-cellular culverts over Bhawanijhora landslide debris flow</td>
<td>ADB</td>
<td>SASEC</td>
<td>Reconstruction of the bridge over the Bhalujhora River (120m)</td>
<td>The project is under construction. The ELA, feasibility and resettlement plan is updated and is available on ADB’s website for public review. The Resettlement plan proposed for the linked project has been reviewed to ensure the compliance with the WB safeguards. The review of the RP is suggestive of the compliance with the WB safeguards.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1.3. **Scope of Land Acquisition and Resettlement**

### 1.3.1. Scope of Land acquisition and associated impacts

As a result of the proposed activities for Pasakha Dry Port construction, the impacts on human population or social impacts can broadly be categorized as acquisition of the private land and loss of structures which are currently being used for both residential and commercial purpose. The majority of approach road belongs to Thromde Municipality and is governmental land. However, there are three parcels of land that are registered under private titled holders. Out of these three private parcels, only one parcel of land has a built-up structure on it, the remaining two parcels are barren lands and free of any encumbrance.

Other than these land parcels, there is no tree or crop losses, or loss of common infrastructure across the 15 acres of proposed project development area and also the proposed approach road.

According to the project census survey a total of five (5) land parcels have been identified as being affected (refer Figure 3).

A summary of project impacts in terms of affected assets and displaced households identified during the course of the census is presented in Table 1 and also depicted in Figure 3. Temporary land acquisition is not envisaged for the project during the construction or operation phase of the project.

**Table 2 summary of project impacts in terms of affected assets and displaced persons**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Impact category</th>
<th>Total Area (sq. ft.)</th>
<th>No of such entities impacted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Land parcels impacted by the project</td>
<td>44777.48 sq. ft.</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structures impacted by the project</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Area for structures built by Titled holders (built up area): 2000 sq. ft.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Area for structures built by Non-Titled holders: 4800 sq. ft.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 1.3.2. Potential Impact on LAP due to approach road design

**Background to Pasakha LAP**

Pasakha Local Area Plan (LAP) is developed by Phuentsholing Thromde with a vision to create Phuentsholing as a Business and Tourism Hub. The LAP for Pasakha is based on analytical assessment of the existing situation (viz: land use patterns, climate & vegetation, existing structures, landholdings, amenities & facilities, Utilities and services) followed by analytical studies around the same parameters. The topography, surface hydrology and natural environment have also shaped the plan. The layout for Pasakha considers efficient pedestrian and vehicular access to public amenities located within an comfortable walking distance from a central Urban Hub like neighborhood nodes and openspaces. Emphasis has been given to the provision of pedestrian network owing to steepterrain,
where provisioning of vehicular road to individual plots is not possible. Rationalization of the existing plots has been proposed by means of land pooling.

A major focus of the Pasakha Local Area Plan is to reconfigure the existing developable land in such a manner that each landowner retains their original land parcel, but with proper access, amenities and services. By reconfiguring the layout of land, the plots shall be regular in size and shape allowing for efficient development. This is essential because the land has been subdivided and sold in a haphazard manner, with no provision for the inclusion of modern infrastructure, which will assure hygiene, health, communications, electricity, drainage and access.

A land pooling contribution of 30% has been applied to all the plots in order to provide for the area required for infrastructure and amenities within the LAP. Almost all the plots within the LAP is accessed by road. Plots in the flatter terrain is accessed by secondary road (12 meter to 10 meter) while in the steeper areas it is accessed by tertiary roads (6 meter).

**Overlap of LAP with the land compensation for titleholders**

During the design feasibility studies for the Dry Port, Phuentsholing Thromde was consulted extensively in order to align the design requirements of Dry Port approach road so as to completely align with and complement the existing LAP. As depicted in figure 5 below, the LAP already accounts for an approach road to the proposed Dry Port location.

**Figure 4: Snapshot of LAP**

The access road will not affect the neighborhood node under the LAP, neither will it bifurcate the neighborhood node. The local people will be allowed to use their traditional passageway as before the project scenario and as per the LAP. Pedestrian crossings will be provided in the approach road for the local stakeholders to access the bridge which connects the neighborhood node to Phuentsholing. There will be no impact on
local traffic (pedestrian and vehicular) for people using the existing mud road to get to work and children who walk to school, both from an accessibility and safety perspective.

For the land parcels acquired due to the construction of the approach road, the titleholders will be provided with the option of the land to land compensation. The land compensated will be demarcated by Thromde and the titleholders will be consulted for the willingness to relocate.

In case the land parcels identified by Thromde as part of the LAP are not acceptable to the affected titleholders, they will be provided cash compensation at negotiated value.

Further, if any of the titleholders affected due to the project have multiple land holdings across Bhutan, they will be entitled for cash compensation at negotiated value.
1.4. Socio-economic profile of PAP’s

A detailed social impact assessment (SIA) was undertaken to ensure that potential social impacts/concerns are recognized at an early stage of project preparation, so that these concerns can be effectively addressed during subsequent stages.

The broad methodology for undertaking the social impact assessment (SIA) is detailed involved.

- To gather necessary information on existing socio-economic and cultural conditions in the project area and develop a baseline;
- Determine magnitude and intensity of (a) potential social impacts, positive as well as negative and (b) identify sensitive socio-economic cultural issues and vulnerable social groups.
- Identify key stakeholders and establish an appropriate framework for their participation in the project selection, design and implementation;
- Ensure that project objectives and incentives for change are acceptable to the range of people intended to benefits

The demographic characteristics of Pasakha region was obtained by conducting an extensive socio-economic survey of more than 94 households. To better understand the socio-economic environment of the people within the project’s area of influence, a detailed survey was undertaken from 24th to 27th April 2016. The team surveyed a sample population of 378 respondents, residing in the project’s area of influence. Key demographic characteristics that were obtained as part of the socio-economic survey are described below:

a) The survey result indicate that sex ratio of population in the project area of influence works out to be 940 females per thousand males. This is less than the overall estimate for Phuentsholing region as per the LAP document.
b) Children below 14 years of age account for almost 22 percent of the surveyed population. Almost 52% of the surveyed households have children below 14 years of age.
c) It was observed that 62.7% of surveyed households follow Buddhism and 27.6% households follow Hinduism.
d) The survey indicated that 32% of the households are of large size having more than four members. The household size comprising upto 4 to 6 members and more than 6 members constitute 21.2% and 10.6% of the total households respectively. The average size of the household works out to be 4.
e) The survey indicated that most of the people (73%) were employed with neighbouring industrial units, since the project’s area of influence is abetted by the industrial estate.
f) Only 12.7 % of the surveyed people actually own a house. 25 % are staying on rented accommodation and the remaining have a company provided accommodation (mainly BCCL employees)
g) Almost 75% of the surveyed people have access to a municipal water supply nearby BCCL accommodation. The remaining 25% are completely dependent on natural water supply which they collect from nearby springs for domestic and drinking purpose.
h) As per the outcomes of our socio-economic survey; we have not come across any household or establishment that belongs to the disabled, handicapped or tribal/ethnic minorities’ category. As per the National poverty line data for Bhutan, the poverty level is being measured at $1.25 per day purchasing power parity, this translates into 2500 Nu per month. We have not come across any person within the project’s area of influence who are earning less than this amount. Neither any such mention was found within the demographic profile description of Phuentsholing regionas per the LAP.
1.5. **Public Consultation and Disclosure**

1.5.1. **Stakeholder consultation**

Effective resettlement planning requires regular consultation with a wide range of project stakeholders. As per the World Bank guidelines, early consultation helps to manage public expectations concerning the impact of a project and its expected benefits. Subsequent consultations provide opportunities for the sponsor and representatives of people affected by the project to negotiate compensation packages and eligibility requirements, resettlement assistance, and the timing of resettlement activities. Project consultation with people affected by resettlement is mandatory. Meaningful consultation refers to a process that begins early in the project preparation stage and is carried out on an ongoing basis through the project cycle and most importantly it is undertaken in an atmosphere free of intimidation or coercion. Another aspect to look into is the gender inclusiveness and response which implies that the flow of information should be tailored to the needs of disadvantaged and vulnerable groups.

To meet requirements, consultations with the communities began at the feasibility design stage early on in the project cycle. Stakeholder consultation within the project’s area of influence was mainly conducted by organising meetings and face to face interactions with several target groups including a women centric Focused Group Discussion (FGD). As part of the stakeholder mapping, a reconnaissance survey was carried out from 14th to 19th January 2016 along with a detailed census survey and public consultations during the period of 24th – 28th April. The final set of FGD’s with identified PAP’s was conducted between 5th and 10th of June 2016.

I. Consultation were carried out within the project’s area of influence to involve the following groups:

- Women centric FGDs
- Consultation with the owners of all commercial establishment close to the proposed approach road along with participation from residents along the same area
- Consultation with the residents on BCCL colony area

II. In addition to the above groups, discussion and consultation were conducted at individual level during the participation of socio-economic survey; wherein a total of 36 participants (15 females and 21 males) attended another focused group discussions. The key highlights / outcomes of these consultation are depicted in table below.

III. Additionally, multiple level of consultations were held with Thromde Phuentsholing to understand the following:

1. Their vision, aim and planning schedule for proposed LAP for Pasakha industrial area
2. Finalising the project design specially the design and location of the approach road, so as to aid the objective of Pasakha LAP.
3. Understand their role in facilitating the resettlement of Paskha dry port PAP’s
4. Developing a common understanding for various technicalities such as calculation of cost of compensation for loss of structures.

IV. Lastly, a detailed set of census survey, structure evaluation and FGD were conducted targeting the final list of PAP’s, in order to understand their objectives and concern and to apprise them with the proposed project activities. This set of consultation also initiated a discussion on the views and concerns of PAP’s around the planned resettlement measures and whether such measures would be acceptable to them or
not. Further detailed consultation around acceptability of resettlement measures would be undertaken at the time of RAP disclosure.
A brief summary of the discussions and feedback is included in the Table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Summary of focussed group discussion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Issue</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information dissemination about the proposed Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General understanding of impacts and concerns on the proposed project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding current and perceived environmental concerns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any existing Air/water/noise pollution experienced currently. Do you foresee any increase in this regards due to project’s activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding the impact of current traffic scenario</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opinion on existing traffic scenario</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding concerns around restriction of access due to project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Will the project result in restriction of access to any public amenity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding concerns due possible influx of migrants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any perceived challenges due to influx of migrant workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception about labour camps and residential facilities during construction and operational phases</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Understanding the perception around overall project benefits and expectations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Will the project benefit community and overall employment</th>
<th>In general, the participants welcomed the project’s activities since they are eager to gain better employment opportunities.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Any more expectation like better cultural facilities, better waste disposal, better drainage and sanitation</td>
<td>The participants expressed that they desire better health facilities, banks, and provision of a local market close to the residential area. However when they were told that the Thromde is looking at all these options including the development of low income housing in this area, they expressed their satisfaction.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- Details of multiple consultations held with Project Officials at Thromde Municipality

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name / designation of Stakeholder</th>
<th>Input to project’s activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Mayor – Mr. Utham Kumar Rai, Mr. Tshering Phuntsho (Chief Urban Planner, Thromde Municipality) Regional Director – Dept of Trade, Phuntsholing Mr. Dhimal, (Land records Incharge), Thromde Municipality</td>
<td>Master plan including the proposed approach road and the internal planning of the dry port area was discussed with the Urban Planner and Mayor of Phuentsholing municipality</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The urban planner opinioned that the alignment of the approach road proposed as part of the feasibility report will significantly impact the land acquisition. Hence the plan needs to be realigned in concurrence with the local area plan as developed by Thromde and also taking into cognizance of minimizing the impacts due to land acquisition. The approach road is recommended to be re-aligned along the periphery of the dry port area.

- Retaining the bore wells in the project site

The Urban Planner mentioned that the LAP accounts for the augmenting of the existing municipality water supply unit envisaging the future increased demand. The other two bore wells in the dry port area are being used by the Coco-Cola company and the same should be retained even after the development of dry port.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name / designation of Stakeholder</th>
<th>Input to project’s activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Tshering Phuntsho (Chief Urban Planner, Thromde Municipality) Mr Uygen, Assistant Urban Planner, Thromde Municipality Miss Cheshen, civil engineer, Thromde Municipality</td>
<td>Verification of the Land area and built up area for final list of PAPS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Developing an understanding of the timelines for proposed LAP development - As per Thromde officials, the proposed LAP development plan is in its final stages and is expected to take shape by December 2016. In such a scenario, there could be possible conflicts with the relocation of PAP’s which have been identified under Pasakha Dry port project.

Acknowledgement and verification of Cost of compensation calculation methodology and the final compensation cost figures

- Stakeholder consultation held with Consultant responsible for construction supervision and capacity building of Pasakha Access road project under SASEC Road Connectivity - ADB
### Name / designation of Stakeholder

| Mr. Niralal Rai (Deputy Team leader/Road Management Specialist) & Mr. Williamor Ramos (Bridge Supervision Engineer), Egis International |

### Input to project’s activities

- **Re-aligning the approach road alongside the periphery in line with the Local area development plan in Pasakha.**

  Discussion was carried out on the necessity for re-aligning the road along the periphery of the proposed dry port area as per Thromde’s requirement. However, the bridge consultant put forth 2 major points which restricted the possibilities of proposing an approach road immediately after the bridge along the periphery of the dry port area.

1. As per the general bridge design practice, it is required to have at minimum 100 m of stretch on either sides of the bridge to match the gradient of the bridge with the road gradient. As against the norms of 100 m, at present only 40 m of stretch is available to match the gradients of bridge and the existing main road leading to Pasakha industrial estate. Hence the provision of immediately branching away an approach road after the bridge is not recommended.

2. As per the traffic engineering and road design practices, it is not recommended to propose a 4 legged intersection immediately after a bridge which justifies the fact that the approach road to the dry port immediately after the bridge is not possible. Also in such a situation, the maneuverability of heavy vehicles bound to the dry port shall be very difficult which may lead to subsequent traffic accumulation on the bridge and downstream the bridge (towards the existing Pasakha industrial estate). Hence it is required that the approach road to the dry port needs to be formed at a distance of 100 m away from the end point of the proposed Bhalujhora bridge.

---

The analysis of the key positive impacts, apprehensions and perceived negative impacts and the suggestions/recommendations as documented during the public consultation process are detailed below:

### Positive impacts perceived by the stakeholders

- *Increase in direct and indirect employment opportunities for both the genders*
- *Increase in employment opportunities in neighbouring villages as well*
- *Possibility of provision of enhanced water supply and medical care facilities*
- *Improved communication and transportation facilities*
- *Overall development of the surroundings leading to a cumulative development of living standard and social status*
Negative impacts perceived by the stakeholders

- Increase in environmental pollution levels (Air, Noise, Dust and Water)
- Deterioration in current practice of sanitation and waste disposal
- Possibility of resource crunch specially drinking water and loss of bore well structures
- Possibility of restriction of Access if the project is not planned adequately
- Perception that the project benefits will be availed more by communities who have built their shops for several years near the project area?
- Concerns around the exact employment status for the locals vs Migrants

Suggestions and measures to enhance Benefits and Mitigate Negative Impacts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Observation</th>
<th>Suggestion / Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Employment opportunities for local</td>
<td>In order to address this rising level of expectation, it would be necessary for the executing agency to not only undertake an effective campaign about employment opportunities but also to undertake training for skills improvement related to appropriate job profiles than van be created for long term perspective within the port’s construction and operation phase.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Control of Environmental Pollution and enhancement in the quality and supply of water</td>
<td>Adequate environmental pollution mitigation measures needs to be developed to monitor and control Air, Noise, Dust, Water contamination and pollution. Also, adequate hazardous and non-hazardous waste disposal techniques will be deployed during the port’s construction and operation phase.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Enhancement of Waste disposal and Sanitation Facilities</td>
<td>During the planning of environmental mitigation measures, specific focus needs to be provided for enhanced waste disposal and sanitation facilities for both, the locals as well as workers during construction and operational phase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Planning for the provision of Better facilities like Health Centers, Markets, Finance institution (Bank or ATM), communication and transport facilities</td>
<td>This is already being considered by Thromde municipality as part of their LAP for Phuentsholing area. The improved roads and transport would not only help business and trade but also with access to education and health care facilities in addition to improving social relations and network. The current project’s area of influence is also a part of the LAP activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Adequate compensation for impacted persons</td>
<td>It is essential to compensate not only the Title holders for the loss of land and physical displacement, however the Non-Titleholders have to be adequately compensated for their loss of livelihood and economic displacement due to project’s activities. Also, the PAP’s have 1 women headed household, for whom appropriate vulnerability mitigation measures needs to be undertaken as part of resettlement and rehabilitation plan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Careful project planning to avoid restriction of access</td>
<td>As per the current plan there is no restriction or blockage of any access road being used by the community towards their residence or establishments to for access to schools, markets and other facilities. However, care needs to be exercised during future planning as well so that the access to any facility is not restricted.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sample images depicting multiple stakeholder consultation undertaken as part of the
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stakeholder consultations being undertaken near BCCL residential area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stakeholder consultation and women focussed FGD being undertaken at the approach road area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stakeholder consultation held with the officials at Thromde municipality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultation with owners of all commercial establishment close to the proposed approach road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio-economic survey conducted within the project’s area of influence</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Detailed FGD’s and census survey along with evaluation of cost of compensation for loss of structures was undertaken between 5th and 10th June 2016
1.5.2. Disclosure of A-RAP

In order to be consistent in maintaining transparency for project planning and for further active involvement of Displace Persons / PAP's and other stakeholders, the project information will be disseminated through disclosure of Resettlement Planning document. This would also involve a dedicated consultation with the PAP’s to gather their views and concerns around the planned resettlement measures and whether such measures would be acceptable to them or not. **Detailed consultation around acceptability of resettlement measures would be undertaken at the time of A-RAP disclosure.**

- A resettlement information leaflet containing information on compensation, entitlement and resettlement management adopted for the project will be made available in locally prevalent languages (Bhutanese and English) and distributed to the PAP’s. The PAP’s will be provided information regarding their specific entitlements.

- A copy of the ARP will be disclosed through the DoT’s website and also on the Thromde’s website. The DoT will be the executing agency (EA) for the Project. A Project Management Office (PMO), headed by a Project Coordinator (PC) will be established and be responsible for the overall execution of the Project. The PC will act as Public Information Centres at the district headquarters closer to the Project site, which will be in a possession of all documents relating to the project, including compensation packages and grievance redress procedures, and will provide any information regarding compensation and grievance redress.

1.6. Resettlement Principles and Legal Framework

The reference for legal framework and principles adopted for addressing resettlement issues relies on the existing legislation and policies specifically the Land Act of Bhutan amended in 2007 and Land Compensation Rates 2009 (PAVA), The Thromde Act of 2007 as well as BSR rates of 2005 with quick cost guide reference. Additionally, World Bank guidelines for involuntary resettlement have been adhered to. Prior to the preparation of the Resettlement Plan, a detailed analysis of the existing national policies was undertaken vis. a vis. the requirements for World Bank.

The RGoB, based on laid down classifications and regulations, in case If the family losing land becomes endangered, the Government will compensate that family the cost of the land in cash and as well as substitute land. In the case of landless people, the land can be allotted free of cost by the Government as a Kidu.

Both the Bhutanese and WB guidelines related to resettlement aim at achieving the following overall goals of (i) Involuntary resettlement shall be avoided to the extent possible or minimized where feasible, exploring all viable alternatives Project designs, and (ii) where displacement is unavoidable, people losing assets, livelihood or other resources shall be assisted in improving or at a minimum regaining their former status of living at no cost to themselves. A detailed comparison between the World Bank Operational Policy (OP 4.12) on Involuntary Resettlement and existing national legislation in Bhutan, as applicable to the project’s activities is described below:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RGoB Policy</th>
<th>World Bank Policy</th>
<th>Recommendation to bridge gaps</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Loss of land</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Families, households | • If land owner has other land holdings in Bhutan cash compensation at government established PAVA Rates; or in other cases replacement land within the same Dzongkhag.  
• If land acquired by government is substituted with undeveloped land, landowner compensated with half the value of land.  
• Families who become landless as a result of land acquisition allotted land as per provisions of the Land Act of 2007. | • Compensation at full replacement cost of equal productive potential within the same vicinity.  
• Resettlement allowance in cash equivalent to the difference between compensation as per the Urban Land Compensation Rate and full replacement value as per current values in the same vicinity, plus value of all land transaction fees and charges. |
| Non-title holder (squatters and encroachers, share croppers, tenants, land less) | • No compensation or assistance. | • Resettlement assistance to those most vulnerable to restore pre-displacement level livelihoods. Vulnerable groups may include but not be limited to: poor or landless, women headed households, disabled and elderly.  
• Non-title holders will not be entitled to any compensation for their affected unauthorized/illegal extensions over public land. No-title holders with economic losses are entitled to assistance for livelihood restoration.  

**Loss of Homes/Structures**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Families, households, structure owners</th>
<th>Compensation in accordance with BSR (Bhutan Schedule of Rates).</th>
<th>Compensation at full replacement cost. For houses and structures, the market cost of the materials and labor to build a replacement structure of a similar quality or better than the affected structure.</th>
<th>Cash compensation equivalent to the amount of compensation received. Arrive for the market rates for Phuentsholing based on the BSR rates and devising an appropriate cost index for adjustment to market rates. To ensure that compensation is at replacement cost, additional resettlement assistance in cash equivalent to cover depreciation over and above compensation amounts determined based on the BSR rates.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Loss of Income</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Affected Persons Families, households</strong></td>
<td>Allot land free of cost to landless families who suffer partial or total loss of livelihood.</td>
<td>Measure to assist affected people in improving their former living standards, income earning capacity, and production levels, or at least restoring them</td>
<td>Rehabilitation assistance for lost or diminished livelihoods. In the case of landless families who suffer partial or total loss of livelihood, provide income generating options and Rehabilitation assistance for lost or diminished livelihoods. In the case of landless families who suffer partial or total loss of livelihood, provide income generating options and support mechanisms</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 1.6.1. Resettlement principles for the project

Following the Bhutanese Land Act of 1979 (amended in 2007) on land acquisition and incorporating World Bank Operational Directive 4.12 on Involuntary Resettlement, the basic resettlement principles for the project will include the following elements:

1. As a matter of policy, land acquisition and other involuntary resettlement impacts would be minimized as much as possible;
2. Any land acquisition and/or resettlement will be carried out and compensation provided in order to improve or at least restore the pre-project income and living standards of the displaced persons;
3. All information related to resettlement preparation and implementation will be disclosed to all concerned, and people’s participation will be ensured in planning and implementation of the Project;
4. Payment of compensation for lost land, housing, assets and resettlement allowances in full prior to the contractor taking physical acquisition of the land and prior to the commencement of any construction activities;

5. All compensation and other assistances will be paid to all DPs prior to commencement of civil works on the site acquired;

6. All activities related to resettlement planning, implementation, and monitoring would ensure involvement of women. Efforts will also be made to ensure that vulnerable groups are included; and appropriate grievances redress mechanism to ensure speedy resolution of disputes.

7. The eligibility of different categories of project-affected people has been assessed and is specified in the Entitlement Matrix. However, anyone moving into the project area after the cut-off date as declared in the SIA report will not be entitled to assistance;

8. The focus of RP will be on Income restoration and rehabilitation

9. Appropriate grievances redress mechanism to ensure speedy resolution of disputes.

In accordance with the resettlement principles suggested for the Project, all affected households and persons will be entitled to a combination of compensation packages and resettlement assistance depending on the nature of ownership rights on lost assets and scope of the impacts including socio-economic vulnerability of the displaced persons and measures to support livelihood restoration if livelihood impacts are envisaged. The displaced persons will be entitled to the following compensation packages:

a) For titled holders, the land proposed to be acquired will be compensated either by (a) land to land compensation or by (b) cash compensation at negotiated value.

b) Compensation for structures (residential/commercial) and other immovable assets at replacement cost;

c) Rehabilitation assistance in lieu of the loss of business/ wage/income/livelihood;

d) Special assistance for vulnerable groups;

1.6.2. Valuation of affected structures

The following steps were adopted to arrive at the valuation of the structures/ properties of the Project Affected Persons, they have been guided by the sample calculations mentioned within the Quick Cost Guide for BSR 2005, as published by RGoB:

I. The cost index was arrived at the proposed project site using the following procedures:

(a) BSR 2005 rate for Phuentsholing area (Phuentsholing) was considered as baseline rate

(b) Transportation cost upto the project site was added to the BSR (Phuentsholing) rate to arrive at the rate values for project site.

(c) The weightages used are that from BSR 2015 for “Building works Brick infill walls and Timber trusses”.

(d) The Cost Index (CI) has been worked out as per the above steps (a), (b) and (c) and it is estimated as 137.59% over BSR 2005 Phuentsholing rate.

(Notes: The above approach of using the BSR rates of 2005 and escalating using the cost index of 137.59% was recommended by Phuentsholing Thromde as the recently published BAR 2015 doesn’t adequately consider the weightage criteria etc. Accordingly, the latest rates – BSR 2016 are under discussion and the bill might pass soon, but until then the common accepted practice is to use BSR 2005 rates as base rates and then extrapolate the data to arrive at present rate values).
II. The built up area (or Plinth Area - PA) and the land holding area in sq. feet was furnished by Phuentsholing Thromde and verified on site. The same has been converted to sq. m units for the valuation purpose.

III. The average ceiling height (CH) and the number of rooms(R) were collected after the field inspection and in consultation with the PAPs during site review.

IV. Average room size was computed using cube root of ‘PA x CH/R’

V. Based on the Average room size, Room size factor (RSF) have been arrived from BSR 2005 - Quick Cost Guide by interpolation.

VI. The room size factor was used to obtain the Final Adjusted Rate (FAR) of BSR 2005 for the structure(s) in question.

VII. Finally, the valuation was arrived by multiplying FAR by Plinth Area (PA) and the average Ceiling Height (CH).

VIII. Additional calculation related details are provided in the Appendix.

1.6.3. Income restoration measures

Involuntary resettlement is an inevitable outcome of development-induced displacement. It disrupts livelihood and sometimes source livelihood is completely lost. In many cases, impacts on existing properties, assets and resources may lead to impoverishment. One of the main objectives behind a resettlement policy is to minimize the resettlement and to restore livelihood conditions of the affected persons at pre-project level; if not enhanced. It is therefore important that the project includes income restoration mechanisms at planning stage itself.

Some measures are proposed below for restoring livelihoods of the persons impacted by project’s activities:

- Wherever possible, the project will try to match the skills of impacted persons to work during construction and facilitate the contractors awarded the development works to employ both skilled and unskilled labour among people living in the project area of influence. If the skills are missing but the individuals are in dire need of a means of income for the household, the project will facilitate with the contractor on-the-job training for needy and interested persons.

- Furthermore, during the implementation of the project, skills training and job opportunities could be offered locally, in order to secure livelihoods benefits of the project to low income families, as only landowners will benefit from the expected increase in land values following provision of services.

The IA will work on enhancing the skills of the workforce including the youth through technical and vocational training, in partnership with EPC contractor, as well as imparting more life skills for the graduates to be entrepreneurs in different sectors.

As the entire PAP’s are non-agriculturists, it is pertinent to focus on the non-land based IR strategies for the effected PAP’s. DoT and Thromde will assist PAPs in identifying appropriate alternative livelihood strategies by engaging with the stakeholders through the entire process of the project development. The specific income restoration strategies include:

- Petty Traders

Under this, potentially available options include grocery, vegetable, fruit, and pan shops, stationery, cloth, tea and snacks; ready made garments; etc. PAPs who are already in the trade and business sector are suitable for these activities. DoT will facilitate access to financial institutions to arrange for loans for PAPs.

- Skill-related Schemes
The options available under this scheme are tailoring, carpentry, masonry, gold smith, blacksmith, motor-winding, cycle/motor cycle/auto repair, driving (auto/Matador/eqc), T.V./tape recorders/watch repairing, pottery, leather works, etc. PAPs who are in such trades, can undergo training for skills upgradation to supplement their annual income. Training in skill related activities can be imparted by through the skills development schemes developed by the Ministry of Labour & Human Resources. Various Skills Training Program (STP) are being conducted by Human Resource Development Division (HRDD), Department of Human Resources (DHR), Ministry of Labour and Human Resources (MoLHR) in the 11th FYP period. The HRDD has designed programs for effective employment of youth in the economic sectors.

Few key programs that can be leveraged to impart skills to PAPs include:

1. **Youth Employment Skills (YES):**
   - The overall objective of the program is to promote gainful employment of Bhutanese youth and achieve full employment target set by the Royal Government of Bhutan. Training areas will be announced periodically as and when training partners and areas are identified.
   - The program will target jobseeker with middle and higher secondary qualification within the age group of 18 to 29 years.
   - Training will be short-term ranging from 1 to 6 months.
   - Post-training, candidates will be employed in the existing industry.

2. **Graduate Skills Program (GSP)**
   GSP is a program designed specifically for the university graduates jobseeker who are aspiring to set up their own businesses or seek employment in the private sector. Training areas will be announced periodically as and when training partners and training areas are identified.

   The program has two core elements:
   - Core Skills: which will provide specific skill set to the graduates (Eg: software/application development, web development, food processing, furniture making, noodle making, agriculture, fishery, etc)
   - Soft skills: which will provide soft skills such as communication, business management, marketing, accounting, resource management and procurement skills.

3. **Skills for Employment & Entrepreneur Development (SEED)**
   The Skills for Employment & Entrepreneur Development or SEED is an intervention to provide vocational skills to any aspiring entrepreneurs. SEDD has been developed with the objective to give young and aspiring individuals who are interested to set up their own businesses on acquiring specific skill set. The SEED will be designed to provide an individual with:
   - Core Skills: which will provide specific skill set
   - On-the-Job Skills: which will provide industry attachment and learning from relevant industry.
   - Entrepreneurship skills: which will provide soft skills such as communication, marketing, and resource management.

   The training will be imparted in collaboration with the Training providers located either in Bhutan or India and the local experts such as Entrepreneurship Promotion Division (EPD), DoE and Business Opportunity and Information Centre (BOIC).
The following program specific trainings are available under SEED:

- Mushroom cultivation and technology
- Organic Soap Making
- Packaging technology
- Fruit and Vegetable Processing
- Barista (Coffee maker)

Implementation of and access to the above mentioned options will be facilitated by DOT through Self Help Groups (SHG's). Extending financial credit support is a critical component of non-land based IR schemes and these camps will include participation of Thromde, local NGOs and PAPs. Their purpose is to promote local financial institutions to inform participants of credit options and how to avoid procedural delays. With DoT assistance, formalities related to processing of applications for credit assistance can be completed at these sessions, and the DoT will coordinate closely with the Lead Bankmanagers and other commercial banks operating in Phuentsholing.

1.6.4. Gender Plan

Like many other infrastructure projects, this project is also likely to have differential impact on women and other vulnerable groups. For example, changes caused by relocation would not have equal implications for members of both sexes and may result in greater inconvenience to women. Women may have to face additional challenge of running a household on limited income and resources, which may also lead to deteriorate social network of women and men alike hence making them more vulnerable to both social and environmental hazards. As indicated by social survey, most of the commercial shops in the project influence area are headed by women. Due to project activities during both construction and operation phase, these commercial shops would be impacted. It is therefore important to assess status of project affected women, their potential impacts, and accordingly, design an appropriate strategy.

Women Involvement in Development Process

The participation of women in the project has been envisaged from the project preparation to the resettlement and rehabilitation implementation. Monitoring of project inputs concerning benefit to women will invite their participation that will make the process more transparent to them. Women shall be encouraged to evaluate the project outputs from their point of view and their useful suggestions shall be noted for taking necessary actions for further modifications in the project creating better and congenial situation for increasing participation from women.

- In the project preparation stage, participation of women was made possible during survey and consultation.
- The executing agency will take pro-active initiatives so that women are properly consulted and also invited to participate in group-based activities to gain access to the resources.
- Women's participation shall also be ensured for monitoring and evaluation activities.
- The assistances to be provided to women as a vulnerable group should create alternative livelihood for them to ensure their sustainable socio-economic development.

Involvement of Women in Construction Activities
A limited number of high-skilled labour forces will be required for the construction activities. These skilled labour forces are mainly involved in machinery and equipment during construction work. Most of these workers are regular employee with the civil contractor and work with the contractor on a long-term basis. These labour force moves with the contractor. The requirement of un-skilled labour forces will be met from the nearby area and will compromise of both men and women.

Provisions for Women in Construction Camp

- **Temporary Housing** - Families of labourers/workers shall be provided suitable accommodation during the construction work at labour camp site. The size of the room shall be as per the standard. In case of non-availability of standards, a design for the same will be prepared by the contractor. The design will be duly approved by the construction supervision consultant. Rooms for such families will be constructed as per the approved design.

- **Health Centre** - Health problems of the workers shall be taken care of by providing basic healthcare facilities through health centres temporarily set up for the construction camp. The health center shall have at least a visiting doctor to tackle first-aid requirements or minor accidental cases, linkage with nearest higher order hospital to refer patients of major illnesses and critical cases. The health center should have MCW (Mother and Child Welfare) units for treating mothers and children in the camp. Apart from this, the health center shall provide with regular vaccinations required for children.

- **Day Crèche Facilities** - It is expected that among the women workers there will be mothers with infants and small children at the construction site. Provision of a day crèche may solve the problems of such women who can leave behind their children in such crèche and work for the day in the construction activities.

- **Scheduling of Construction Works** - Owing to the demand of a fast construction work it is expected that a 24 hours-long work schedule would be in operation. Women shall be exempted from night shifts.

- **Education Facilities** - The construction workers are mainly mobile groups of people. They are found to move from one place to another taking along their families with them. Thus there is a need for educating their children at the place of their work. Day crèche facilities will be extended with primary educational facilities.

- **Measures for Controlling STD and AIDS** – Influx of migrant workers usually dominate the labour force of construction camps which increases the risk of spreading sexually transmitted diseases. It will be ensured that the stakeholders are made aware of the STD’s through awareness campaigns.

### 1.6.5. Training needs assessment

One of the strategies for economic sustenance of the PAPs is to help them improve their production level or to impart new skills or up-grade skills through training. As the project affected people are dependent on livelihood through the operation of petty shops, have no skill endowment, training is an important component of income restoration. For PAPs who intend to diversify their economic activity, suitable income restoration schemes will be identified on individual basis and training need would be assessed. Besides training in scheme specific skills, general entrepreneurship development will also form part of the training program, mainly to improve the management capabilities of PAPs.

Executing Agency will ensure that PAPs receive training in desired trades. The RAP IA will facilitate training by suitable agency or a professional and competent outside agency. The monitoring of training schemes will be carried out along with the monitoring of other components of RAP by the external monitoring and evaluation agency.
1.6.6. **Cut-off date for eligibility**

The cut-off date for those who have legal titles of their land/asset is to notify the landowners of the Government intention to acquire land at least 120 days prior to the acquisition of land. (Reference: Section 156 and 157 of the Land Rules and Regulations of the Kingdom of Bhutan 2007). For non-titleholders those without land such as encroachers the cut-off date is the date of the Project census survey, which is 24th April, 2016.

1.7. **Eligibility, Entitlement Assistance and Benefits**

1.7.1. **Eligibility and impact classification**

In order to identify the exact no. of PAP’s whose land and structures are directly impacted by the project design, we have classified them as existing on Left hand side (LHS) and Right Hand side (RHS) of the proposed approach road, as depicted in figure below:
Figure 5: Impact classification for eligibility
The details of PAP’s as per above design option are captured in table below:

### Table 3: PAP Details

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Identification no.</th>
<th>Landholding type</th>
<th>Compensation eligibility</th>
<th>Landholding claim area (sq-ft)</th>
<th>Structure built area (sq-ft)</th>
<th>No. of families</th>
<th>No. of shops</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LHS 2</td>
<td>Registered</td>
<td>• Land to land compensation or land to cost compensation at negotiated value to title holder, • Relocation assistance to families, • Livelihood restoration and compensation for loss of livelihood from commercial structures, • Cash compensation at replacement value for loss of structures to their respective owners</td>
<td>5663</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LHS 3</td>
<td>Non-registered</td>
<td>• Relocation assistance to families, • Livelihood restoration and compensation for loss of livelihood from commercial structures, • Cash compensation for loss of structures at replacement value</td>
<td>7229</td>
<td>2500</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LHS 4</td>
<td>Non-registered</td>
<td>• Relocation assistance to families, • Livelihood restoration and compensation for loss of livelihood from commercial structures, • Cash compensation for loss of structures to their respective owners at replacement value</td>
<td>10105</td>
<td>2300</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LHS 5</td>
<td>Registered</td>
<td>• Land to land compensation or land to cost compensation at negotiated value to title holder</td>
<td>13608</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Identification no.</th>
<th>Landholding type</th>
<th>Impact identified</th>
<th>Landholding claim area (sq-ft)</th>
<th>Structure built area (sq-ft)</th>
<th>No. of families</th>
<th>No. of shops</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RHS 1</td>
<td>Registered</td>
<td>Land to land compensation or land to cost compensation at negotiated value to title holder</td>
<td>8712</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1.7.2. Entitlement matrix

The Entitlement Matrix has been formulated according to the resettlement principles for this Project and specifically reflects various types of losses resulting out of the particular subprojects and specific compensation and resettlement packages. Apart from the compensation for the value of the land, the non-titleholders are eligible for all other losses and rehabilitation, livelihood programs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Impact Category / Entitlement</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. <strong>Loss of Private Property</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Loss of land</td>
<td>Compensation for land acquired will be based either: a) Land to land compensation b) Cash compensation at the negotiated value</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| b) Loss of structures | • Cash compensation for loss of structures to their respective owners equivalent to the amount as per 137.59% over BSR 2005 Phuentsholing rate (Cost index calculation rationale as described previously).  
  • Rights to salvage material from structure improvements and other assets constructed by the PAP’s. |
| 2. **Impacts to tenants (those who have rented property from title holder commercial)** | |
| a) Loss of residential structure | • Notice period of 2 months for shifting  
  • Reimbursement of rental deposit or unexpired lease amounts.  
  • Lump sum shifting allowance of Nu. 3000/- (or actual cost on production of bills) to valid tenants that will have to shift to a new/re-assigned plot.  
  • Lump sum rental assistance of 2 months @Nu 4000/month. (As per survey median rent paid is Nu 4000/month).  
  • Rights to salvage material from structure improvements and other assets constructed by the PAP. |
| b) Loss of commercial structure leading to impact on livelihood | • Cash compensation/transition allowance equivalent to an amount of 3 months loss of average monthly earnings from the commercial shop  
  • A lump-sum shifting allowance of Nu. 3000/- is proposed to transport belongings and salvaged materials.  

**Rehabilitation assistance for lost or diminished livelihoods:**

- Preferential treatment in employment in project activities  
- Skill training and income generation support  
- Priority consideration in poverty reduction/social development programs |
| 3. **Impacts to Non-title holders** | |
| a) Loss of residential structure | • Cash compensation for loss of structures to their respective owners equivalent to the amount as per 137.59% over BSR 2005 Phuentsholing rate (Cost index calculation rationale as described previously).  
  • Rights to salvage material from structure improvements and other assets constructed by the PAP’s  
  • Notice period of 2 months for shifting |
### 4. Additional assistance to vulnerable groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>a)</th>
<th>Loss of residential structure / livelihood</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Resettlement assistance to those most vulnerable namely residents that are poor (that earn less than Nu. 5,000 a month) and single women headed households with low household productive capacity (no paid employees) to enable them to restore or improve pre-displacement level livelihoods. A lump sum of Nu. 10,000 special assistance is proposed for these categories.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 1.8. Resettlement Budget and Management

#### 1.8.1. Calculation of overall cost of resettlement as per the Entitlement matrix

The following table describes the envisaged Total cost of resettlement taking into account all the criterions that have been agreed as part of the Entitlement matrix.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Identification as per figure 4</th>
<th>Name of Head of household</th>
<th>Brief description</th>
<th>Eligibility criterion as per entitlement matrix</th>
<th>Resettlement Cost in Nu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LHS 2</td>
<td>Sangay Penjore</td>
<td>Sangay is the owner of the land as well as of the Structure. He</td>
<td>Compensation for loss of structure</td>
<td>4,139,190.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land parcel (LHS)</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Details</td>
<td>Compensation for loss of structure</td>
<td>Compensation for loss of income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LHS 2 Mithey</td>
<td></td>
<td>Has leased out the main structure to Mithey, and two other shops to Bhima Kumari and Rhinzi</td>
<td>Compensation for loss of land</td>
<td>42000 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Has rented shop and accommodation area from Sangay.</td>
<td>Compensation for loss of rental income</td>
<td>120000.00 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A lump-sum shifting allowance of Nu. 3000</td>
<td></td>
<td>3000 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lump sum rental assistance of 2 months @Nu 4000/month.</td>
<td></td>
<td>8000 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LHS 2 Bhima Kumari</td>
<td></td>
<td>Has rented out a shop from Sangay which is being used as commercial and residential purpose. She is the head of the household and is staying with her mother aged more than 60 years old. She is also entitled for assistance under Vulnerable Category</td>
<td>Compensation for loss of income</td>
<td>90000 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A lump-sum shifting allowance of Nu. 3000</td>
<td></td>
<td>3000 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lump sum rental assistance of 2 months @Nu 4000/month.</td>
<td></td>
<td>8000 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A lump sum of Nu. 10,000 special assistance</td>
<td></td>
<td>10000 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LHS 2 Rhinzi</td>
<td></td>
<td>Rhinzi has rented out space from Sangay which is being used as commercial and residential purpose.</td>
<td>Compensation for loss of income</td>
<td>90000 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A lump-sum shifting allowance of Nu. 3000</td>
<td></td>
<td>3000 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lump sum rental assistance of 2 months @Nu 4000/month.</td>
<td></td>
<td>8000 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LHS 3 Purkha Bahadur Rai</td>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Purkha is a non-titled holder on the land parcel identified as LHS 3. Currently, Mr. Purkha owns 5 shops. He has rented out one shop for saloon purpose to Mr. Ram Babu Thakur.</td>
<td>Compensation for loss of structure</td>
<td>4290771.53 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Compensation for loss of income</td>
<td></td>
<td>120000.00 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A lump-sum shifting allowance of Nu. 3000</td>
<td></td>
<td>3000 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lump sum rental</td>
<td></td>
<td>72000 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Owner</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Compensation for loss of income</td>
<td>Lump sum rental assistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LHS 3</td>
<td>Ram Babu Thakur</td>
<td>Ram Babu Thakur has rented a shop for running saloon from Purkha Bahadur</td>
<td>36,000.00 Nu</td>
<td>8,000 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LHS 4</td>
<td>Tsheten Norbu</td>
<td>Mr. Tsheten Norbu is a non-titled holder on the land parcel identified as LHS 4. He is the owner of the structure, he is currently residing with his family. He owns a shop and has also rented out two areas to Mr. Nema Dorji and Chezom respectively for running commercial establishment as well as has also rented out residential place to Chezom, Nema Dorji and Mr. D. B Bishwa</td>
<td>3,843,323.33 Nu</td>
<td>8,000 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LHS 4</td>
<td>Nema Dorji (has rented shop from Tsheten Norbu)</td>
<td>Nema Dorji has rented place for residence and also for running shop from Tsheten Norbu</td>
<td>45,000 Nu</td>
<td>8,000 Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LHS 4</td>
<td>Chezom (has rented shop from Tsheten Norbu)</td>
<td>Chezom has rented place for residence and also for running a shop from Tsheten Norbu</td>
<td>1,20,000.00 Nu</td>
<td>8,000 Nu</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A lump-sum shifting allowance of Nu. 3000 to each household is also provided.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LHS 4</th>
<th>D.B Bishwa</th>
<th>D.B Bishwa has rented residential place from Tsheten Norbu</th>
<th>A lump-sum shifting allowance of Nu. 3000 to each household</th>
<th>3,000 Nu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lump sum rental assistance of 2 months @Nu 4000/month to each household</td>
<td>8,000 Nu</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| LHS 5 | Owner details available with Phuentsholing Thromde | The owner is a titled holder of land parcel, however he has not constructed any structure over his land parcel and the land is free from any squatter or encroacher | Compensation for loss of land | Land to land compensation or cash compensation at the negotiated value |

| RHS 1 | Owner details available with Phuentsholing Thromde | The owner is a titled holder of land parcel, however he has not constructed any structure over his land parcel and the land is free from any squatter or encroacher | Compensation for loss of land | Land to land compensation or cash compensation at the negotiated value |

**Total ARAP Budget**

### 1.8.2. Institution Arrangements and Resettlement Management

The Institutional Arrangements will be managed at two levels viz-a-vis DoT at central level and Phuentsholing Thromde at the local area level. This arrangement is based on partnership model wherein concerned agencies at different levels supplement and complement each other efforts. The key elements of institutional arrangements are co-operation/support, collaboration and sharing of responsibilities with clearly defined roles, involvement of key stakeholders and vertical and horizontal linkages amongst different agencies.

The key institutions which will be coordinating with each other and with DoT and Phuentsholing Thromde under various capacities. These institutions include:

- Department of Trade
- Thromde Phuentsholing
- Project Management Office
- Land Record Officer
- Grievance Redressal Committees
- Supervision Consultant
• The DoT will be the executing agency (EA) for the Project. A Project Management Office (PMO), headed by a Project Coordinator (PC) will be established and be responsible for the overall execution of the Project. The DoT along with Thromde Phuentsholing will be responsible for implementing the resettlement & rehabilitation activities.

• The Thromde Phuentsholing administration (Chief urban planner, Deputy urban planner and Survey Officer) and land records officer will assist and monitor the resettlement activities.

• The concerned officials will work in close coordination on the day-to-day activities of the Resettlement Plan and implementation. The officials will execute and monitor the progress of the work and ensure coordination between relevant departments, the Grievance Redress Committee and the PAPs.

1.8.2.1. Roles and responsibilities at DoT level:

Institutional arrangement at DoT Level will include augmenting the capacity of DoT for ensuring the implementation of envisaged resettlement and rehabilitation. A team comprising Social Expert along with adequate Technical and Secretarial Staff will assist PMO. The designated Social Expert will be directly involved in the overseeing the implementation of RAP. The Social Expert will ensure that all resettlement and rehabilitation issues are complied with as per the framework. The roles and responsibilities of the Social Expert along with the Technical and secretarial staff would broadly include the following:

• Ensure adequate staffing at the District level and Thromde level to ensure timely implementation of RAP.
• Guide and supervise in matters related to resettlement and rehabilitation to PMO and Thromde officials.
• Compile data related to resettlement and rehabilitation activities received from field offices and update Project Director (EA / PMO) and suggest suitable measures to be taken.
• Interact with implementation agencies at Thromde level on a regular basis.
• Undertake field visits as and when required.
• Facilitate necessary help needed at site with regard to LA and R&R issues.
• Ensure budgetary provision for resettlement and rehabilitation of PAPs.
• Ensure timely release of budget for implementation of RAP.
• Monitor implementation of RAP carried out by the implementing agency.
• Perform other roles and responsibilities related to implementation of RAP as assigned by the PMO from time to time.
• Ensure free, prior and informed consultation with vulnerable groups along the project and also ensure that sufficient supporting documentation is maintained.
• Ensure external third party audit of RPF implementation by carefully nominating supervision consultants and overseeing their activities.

1.8.2.2. Roles and responsibilities at Thromde level:

A Project Implementation Unit - PIU (mainly comprising of officials of Thromde and also minor involvement of DoT representatives) will be constituted at sub-project level headed by the Social Expert from DoT / Thromde. The PIU will be responsible for the project execution including RAP implementation. There will be a designated or appointed Resettlement & Rehabilitation Officer (RRO)
at PIU who will be responsible only for the implementation of RAP at site. No other roles and responsibilities will be assigned to RRO other than resettlement and rehabilitation.

The roles and responsibilities of the Resettlement and Rehabilitation Officer are as under:

- Ensure RAP implementation with assistance from implementation agency as per the time line agreed upon.
- Interact with RAP implementation agency on a regular basis.
- Undertake field visits with implementation agency from time to time.
- Co-ordinate with district administration and other departments in matters related to implementation of R&R.
- Ensure distribution of Resettlement and Rehabilitation Policy and entitlement matrix for the project to PAPs.
- Ensure preparation and distribution of photo identity cards.
- Ensure and attend meetings organised by implementation agency on thematic areas related to resettlement and rehabilitation policy and entitlements and awareness generation.
- Ensure preparation of identity cards, and approval from the DoT and distribution of the same to PAPs.
- Ensure timely preparation of micro-plan from RAP implementation agency and approval from DoT.
- Ensure disbursement of resettlement and rehabilitation assistance in a transparent manner.
- Participate in meetings related to resettlement and rehabilitation issues.
- Attend and participate in Grievance Redress Committee meetings for redressal of grievances of PAPs and other committees involving R&R matters.
- Liaison with government and other agencies for inclusion of PAPs in employment and income generation program/scheme.
- Ensure that vulnerable families get equal opportunity to participate during implementation and become overall beneficiaries in the project.

1.8.2.3. RAP Implementation Agency

To implement RAP, it is desirable that DoT engages the services of one or multiple agencies like a NGO, having experience in resettlement and rehabilitation issues through standard procurement procedures. The manpower availability at DoT may necessitates the requirement to engage an NGO/consultancy firm for the implementation of RAP. The implementation agency will work in close co-ordination with RRO and report to PIU. Financial matters related to services of the RAP implementation agency will be dealt by Project Director. Broad roles and responsibilities of implementation agency would be as:

- The RAP implementation agency will be the main link between the Project Director and PAPs.
- Shall be responsible for verification of PAPs as prepared by the DPR consultants.
- Undertake public information campaign along with RRO at the commencement of the RAP.
- Develop rapport with PAPs.
- Distribute pamphlets of R&R Policy to PAPs and concerned Govt. Offices in the project area and the project area of influence.
- Include PAPs who could not be enumerated during census cum socio-economic survey and certification from R&R Officer.
- Distribute identity cards for PAPs.
- Preparation of micro-plan.
- Submission of micro-plan to RRO for approval from Head Office.
- Organize consultations at regular interval with PAPs with regard to resettlement and rehabilitation.
- Organize training program for skill upgradation of the PAPs,
- Assist PAPs in all matters related to compensation and R&R,
- Assist and facilitate aggrieved PAPs (for compensation and assistance) by bringing their cases to GRC,
- Facilitate in opening of personal accounts of the PAPs. It will aid them in getting the account payee cheque for compensation in their individual account by the Project Authority
- Generate awareness about the alternative economic livelihood and enable PAPs to make informed choice,
- Consultations with PAPs regarding the choice of resettlement (i.e. self or assisted), development of resettlement site, participation of women, etc.
- Identify training needs of PAPs for income generation and institutions for imparting training,
- Participate in various meetings,
- Submit monthly progress report, and
- Any other activities that may be required for the implementation of RAP

**1.8.3. Implementation schedule**

All land acquisition and resettlement process of the displaced persons must be completed before the start of the civil works. All land is to be provided free of encumbrances. Displaced persons from the affected households have to be given sufficient notice prior to start of civil works. The proposed R&R implementation schedule is described in figure below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Activity</th>
<th>Month 1</th>
<th>Month 2</th>
<th>Month 3</th>
<th>Month 4</th>
<th>Month 5</th>
<th>Month 6</th>
<th>Month 7</th>
<th>Month 8</th>
<th>Month 9</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Approval of ARAP based on Feasibility Studies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disclosure of ARAP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultation with PAP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establishment of GRC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detailed Design</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Updating of ARAP per detailed design</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submission and approval of Updated ARAP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disclosure of Updated ARAP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1.9. Grievance Redress Mechanism

As the World Bank’s governance and anticorruption (GAC) agenda moves forward, grievance redress mechanisms (GRMs) are likely to play an increasingly prominent role in Bank-supported projects. GRMs are increasingly recognized as a critical tool for promoting transparency and accountability in Bank-financed operations.

Well-designed and -implemented GRMs can help project management significantly enhance operational efficiency in a variety of ways, including generating public awareness about the project and its objectives; deterring fraud and corruption; mitigating risk; providing project staff with practical suggestions/feedback that allows them to be more accountable, transparent, and responsive to beneficiaries; assessing the effectiveness of internal organizational processes; and increasing stakeholder involvement in the project. For task teams more specifically, an effective GRM can help catch problems before they become more serious or widespread, thereby preserving the project’s funds and its reputation.

The design of effective GRMs should take into account the building blocks, the value chain, and the steps involved in designing a GRM, as explained by World Bank in figure below:

*Setting up the GRM for Pasakha Dry Port project*

A grievance redress mechanism will be established to receive and facilitate the resolution of concerns, complaints and grievances of affected people and relevant agencies on the social and environmental performance of the project in a time bound and transparent manner. The project specific GRM is not intended to bypass the government’s own redress process, rather it is intended to address project affected people’s concerns and complaints promptly, making it readily accessible to all segments of affected persons and is scaled to the risks and impacts of the project.

*Figure 6: Guidance to setup a GRM as described by World Bank*
The proposed project will be conducted with a participatory process with the local communities. Through this, and the provision of good compensation and support mechanisms, acceptance of the project activities will be enhanced and the complaints reduced. There may nevertheless be individuals or groups who feel that they are not given adequate support, or that their needs are not properly addressed. The Project will therefore establish a Grievance Redress process which will hear complaints and facilitate solutions, as per following steps.

a) If any affected person or party faces grievances related to environment, land acquisition resettlements, he/she can approach the contractor, construction supervision consultants or PIU site staff directly at the site level.

b) If grievances are not addressed at the site level, the affected person or party can lodge a written grievance to the grievance redress committee (GRC) comprising of Sector Heads of the DoT Administration as well as DoT Officials. The affected person or party may also skip step 1 and directly file written grievance to the GRC. All grievances which cannot be address at the site level should be forwarded to the grievance redress committee within 15 days from the receipt of complaint. The committee must respond within 15 days. Further, the GRC will treat grievances of both male and female affected persons equally and address them fairly.

c) If the issue remains unresolved, people would have the right to approach the higher authority as per traditional practices including the Royal Government of Bhutan or His Majesty the
King. The Complainants will be able to access the higher authorities and courts at any time should they be not satisfied with the proposed resettlement measures.

The Project signboard and information brochure will include contact information for GRC as well complete display of Grievance Mechanism. Further, the GRC will treat grievances of both male and female affected persons equally and address them fairly. There will also be transparency maintained in terms of recording the grievances and their resolution.

Monitoring and Evaluation

1.9.1. Internal monitoring

The PMO supported by Thromde officials will systematically monitor land acquisition and resettlement activities, based on:

a) Process monitoring (e.g., project inputs, expenditures, staff deployment etc.),
b) Output monitoring (e.g. results in terms of number of PAPs compensated), and
c) Impact evaluation (e.g. project impact on PAP's resettlement and livelihood restoration).

The Resettlement & Rehabilitation Officer (RRO) at PIU will be responsible for overall internal monitoring and evaluation of the project progress for resettlement implementation. The RRO will undertake quarter monitoring during the RP implementation period. Monitoring will also ensure recording of PAP's views on resettlement issues such as; DP's understanding of entitlement policies, options, and alternatives; site conditions; compensation valuation and disbursement; grievance redress procedures; and staff competencies. The monitoring reports will be sent to DoT every quarter.

1.9.2. Reporting requirements

The project R&R monitoring process lead by RRO will be based on key implementation procedures and implementation schedule presented in the previous section. The following points form the basis of effective monitoring strategy:

- The RAP implementation should be reflected in the regular progress report of the Project, as part of the quarterly reporting requirements.

- Regularly carry out site visits and consultations with affected communities to assess social impacts, adequacy of mitigation actions, participation of community members, especially the vulnerable household in project activities.

- Report quarterly progress highlighting any new issues and recommendations for addressing these issues.

1.9.3. External monitoring

The external monitoring will be undertaken by a nominated Supervision Consultant selected by DoT on a fair basis. The external Supervision Consultant will verify RAP implementation to determine whether resettlement goals have been achieved, livelihood and living standards have been restored, and provide recommendations for improvement.
An important function of the external monitoring expert is to advise the PIU on World Bank operational directives and safeguard compliance issues. The supervision consultant will document monitoring results, identify the necessary corrective actions, and reflect them in a corrective action plan. If significant non-compliance issues are identified, the PIU is required to prepare a corrective action plan to address such issues. The PIU in each quarter, will study the compliance with the action plan developed in the previous quarter.
### A.1. Public Consultation Attendance Sheet

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No.</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Designation, Address</th>
<th>Signature</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>L. Kangnye</td>
<td>EG</td>
<td>Throna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Nima Wangmo</td>
<td>EO</td>
<td>Throna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Shamen Lha</td>
<td>PE</td>
<td>Throna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Tsering Ngeli</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Govinda Sharma</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Tshering Tenzin</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Samgy Rinchen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>D. Tshering</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>D. Tsering</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>N. Lhamdrup</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Yeshi Donchok</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>D. Tshering</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>