

**Enhancing Shared Prosperity through Equitable Services (ESPES)
Second Additional Financing (P176354)**

Addendum to Environmental and Social System Assessment (ESSA)

**April 2021
Addis Ababa**

Abbreviations and Acronyms

ACSO	Agency for Civil Society Organizations
AGP	Agricultural Growth Program
BoFEDs	Bureau of Finance and Economic Development
BOLSA	Bureau of Labor and Social Affairs
BOWCY	Bureau of Women, Children and Youth
CRGE	Climate Resilient Green Economy
DAs	Development Agents
EFCCC	Environment, Forest, Climate Change Commission
EFDA	Ethiopia Food and Drug Administration
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
EIO	Ethiopian Institute of Ombudsman
EPA	Environmental Protection Authority
ERA	Ethiopian Roads Authority
ESIA	Environmental and Social Impact Assessment
ESM	Environmental and Social Management
ESMF	Environmental and Social Management Framework
ESMS	Environmental and Social Management System
ESPES	Enhanced Sharing Prosperity through Equitable Services
ESSA	Environmental and Social Management Assessment
FSPC	Federal Social Protection Council
FTA–A	Financial Transparency and Accountability
GBV	Gender Based Violence
GEQIPE	General Education Quality Improvement Program for Equity

GRM	Grievance Redress Mechanism
HEP	Health Extension Program
HEWs	Health Extension Workers
HSTP	Health Sector Transformation Plan
JRIS	Joint Review and Implementation Support
MOA	Ministry of Agriculture
MOE	Ministry of Education
MoEFCC	Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change
MOF	Ministry of Finance
MOH	Ministry of Health
MOLSA	Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs
MOP	Ministry of Peace
MoWCY	Ministry of Women, Children and Youth
NPDC	Planning and Development Commission
PAP	Program Action Plan
PSNP	Productive Safety Net Program
PWD	People living with Disability
RPF	Resettlement Policy Framework
SA	Social Assessment
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SESA	Strategic Environment and Social Assessment
SNNP	Southern, Nation, Nationalities and People
WDC	Water Development Commission
WOCY	Women, Children and Youth

Contents

<i>Abbreviations and Acronyms</i>	2
<i>Executive Summary</i>	6
1. Program Description and Background	8
2. Summary of potential environmental and social impacts and risks applicable to the proposed Second Additional Financing	9
2.1. Potential Environmental Impacts and Risks	9
3. Assessment of Borrower’s Environmental and Social Management Systems, Policy and Legal Framework	12
3.1. Updates: Policy and Legal Framework for Environmental and Social Management	12
3.1.1. Proclamation NO. 1097/2018: Powers and Duties of the Executive Organs of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia	12
3.1.2. Ten-Years Development Plan	13
3.1.3. Ten-Years Agricultural Plan	14
3.1.4. A Roadmap for Optimizing the Ethiopian Health Extension Program	15
3.1.5. Health Sector Transformation Plan (HSTP-II)	15
3.1.6. Proclamation No.1161/2019 Expropriation of Land for Public Purposes, Payments of Compensation and Resettlement of Displaced People and Regulation No. 472/2020.	16
3.1.7. Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)	17
3.2. Updates: Capacity for Environment and Social Management	17
3.3. Coordination related to Environment and Social Management	18
3.4. Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) Capacity Review and Its Current Status	18
3.5. Progress against Program Action Plan (PAP)	18
4. Findings from Rapid Assessment of Environmental and Social Management (Federal, Regional and Woreda Sectoral Offices)	22
4.1. Structural Setups, Policy and Legal Framework for Environmental and Social Management (ESM) at Federal level and sampled Regions (Gambella, Oromia, Somali and SNNP)	22
4.2. Updates to Regional Level Capacity for Environment and Social Management	27
4.2.1. Oversight bodies	27
4.2.2. Basic Sectors	29
4.3. Gender and Gender Based Violence	30
4.4. Social Conflicts	31
4.5. Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM)	32

4.6. Public Participation/Consultation	33
5. Conclusion, Recommendations and Program Action Plans (PAP)	34
5.1. Conclusion	34
5.2. Recommendations	34
5.3. DLIs and DLRs	35
5.4. Program Action Plan (PAP).....	35
6. Consultation.....	36
7. Summary of key findings from the four regions against OP/BP 9.00 Core Principles.....	37
References.....	41
Annex 1: Lists of Participants for Addendum to ESSA for ESPES (Federal, Regional and Woreda Levels)	42

Executive Summary

The Second AF to ESPES project aims to improve equitable access to basic services and strengthen accountability systems at the decentralized level. The parent project is anchored around four sets of key results: (a) ensuring equitable access to basic services; (b) enhancing citizens' engagement, environmental and social risk management capacity; (c) deepening fiduciary aspects of basic service delivery; and (d) ensuring quality data access and results. These result areas will continue in the proposed second additional financing of the project. Evaluation of the Government's decentralized service delivery through the general-purpose grant evidences that it is pro-poor and has contributed to improved human capital outcomes across Ethiopia. The second AF of ESPES will entirely be PforR and will not contribute to the IPF component of the first Additional Financing. In addition to the basic sectors (education, health, agriculture, water and rural roads) included in the parent project and first AF, the second AF also supports the effort of establishing digital monitoring, evaluation and reporting system of National Planning and Development Commission (NPDC) and strengthening civil society organizations through the Agency for Civil Society Organizations (ACSO).

The parent project and the first AF had a dedicated program of support for environmental and social safeguards to strengthen risk assessment and management from the ground up. ***“Improved environmental and social management capacity at woreda level”*** was included as a Development Linked Indicator (DLI) with relevant Development Linked Results. While maintaining the same DLI, moving from outputs to outcome, the first AF included a DLR: *“250 Woredas have environmental and social impact assessment (ESIA) system with institutional setup, human resources and vet projects/programs for environmental and social impacts”* by 2021. This DLR was achieved which contributes to improvements in managing environmental and social risks at local level regardless of type of project and/or funding source. This goes a long way to ensuring the sustainability of project/program activities and benefits.

The first AF Investment Project Financing (IPF) component provided capacity building support to strengthen the environmental and social management system at local level. This was informed by the Addendum to environmental and social system assessment (ESSA) conducted for the AF, which emphasized the need for building capacity at local level. Thousands of local government staff were trained on ESMS related topics such as ESIA, environmental and social audit, public participation, etc.

The reform process in Ethiopia is overhauling the country's policy and legal frameworks including proclamations, regulations, strategies, guidelines, etc. As a result, the review and revision of Policies, Proclamations, Regulations, Roadmaps, Development Plans, Strategies, and Guidelines as part of the new reform has given more scope and room for implementation of environmental and social management in sectoral as well as oversight bodies

After the preparation of the first Incremental ESSA in 2017, some of the major updates with regard to environmental and social management policies and legal frameworks include: Proclamation No. 1097/2018 regarding Labor Safety and Health Protection, Vulnerable and Disadvantaged Groups, Gender and Gender Based Violence; Sustainable Development Goals

(SDGs); the Ten-Years Development Plan; Ten-Years Agricultural Plan and Land Acquisition. These are described in detail in the forthcoming sections.

In Ethiopia, environmental and social management and assessment institutions and legal frameworks are largely in place. However, inadequate human resources in environmental and social safeguards in the regular programs of some of the organizations; such as the MOE and the MOA were observed. In addition, frequent turnover of technical staff is still a challenge. Coupled with this, the inadequate coordination and integration between basic service sectors and oversight bodies continues to limit progress and has remained to be a challenge for effective implementation of environmental and social management systems.

In general, in relation to the practical implementation of environmental and social management systems, the following were observed:

- Vertical coordination between the federal and regional oversight bodies has improved, they now meet annually to prepare joint plans and bi-annually to review implementation.
- All basic sectors which have development projects have assigned safeguards experts for their respective projects
- In some federal ministries, directorate responsible for safeguard issues were established, for example, in the MOA, a directorate of Environment and Climate Change Coordination

In spite of the above positive developments in environmental and social management systems (ESMS), there are still areas that require further improvements:

- The enforcement and application of the policies and proclamations should be strengthened by developing or preparing appropriate enforcement laws, regulations and directives
- EFCCC, MOLSA, MOWCY should strengthen collaboration on environmental and social management and assessment.
- Develop a Capacity Building Plan for improved environmental and social management in the basic sectors in a participatory manner involving all stakeholders. The Plan should be informed by the ESIA capacity assessment and the ESMS OM.
- Strengthening vertical and horizontal linkages between environmental and social oversight institutions and basic sectors; and
- Establishing and strengthening information, communication and data management system.

1. Program Description and Background

The second AF to ESPES project aims to improve equitable access to basic services and strengthen accountability systems at the decentralized level. The parent project is anchored around four sets of key results: (a) ensuring equitable access to basic services; (b) enhancing citizens' engagement, environmental and social risk management capacity; (c) deepening fiduciary aspects of basic service delivery; and (d) ensuring quality data access and results. These result areas will continue in the proposed second additional financing of the project. ESPES supports Ethiopia's woreda block grant system which transfers resources from the federal to regional level and then from the regions to over one thousand woredas all over the country. The woredas hold responsibility for delivering basic services in health, education, agriculture, water and rural roads. The ESPES contribution, as well as that from other IDA programs and from other donors, to the block grant system is roughly 10 percent of this investment with domestic resources making up the bulk of these intergovernmental fiscal transfers.

The ESSA addendum is prepared for the second AF to ESPES. The 2nd AF covers the PforR part and does not contribute to the IPF component. The 2nd AF covers education, health, agriculture, water and rural roads sectors that are included in the parent project and first AF. It will also support digital monitoring, evaluation and reporting system of National Planning and Development Commission (NPDC) and strengthening civil society organizations through the Agency for Civil Society Organizations (ACSO).

As part of the system strengthening, ESPES has been supporting basic service sectors in improving their M&E systems. ESPES' predecessor, PBS, has played a key role in the establishment of the Ethiopian Data Quality Assurance Framework which helps sectoral Management Information Systems (MIS) produce quality, timely and reliable data. The monitoring of the implementation of the Environmental and Social Management System (ESMS) includes (a) quarterly review meeting of the federal EFCCC and its regional counterparts on the operation of the program ESMS, and, (b) quarterly meeting of the basic sectors Safeguards Technical Working Group chaired by EFCCC. These quarterly meetings were disrupted for more than one year because of the COVID-19 pandemic.

Scaling up this support, the 2nd AF will encourage the Government's effort building a national level digital Monitoring and Reporting System (MRS). Based on the findings of a 2018 assessment by the PDC on the shortcomings of M&E across federal and regional institutions,¹ the Council of Ministers issued a guideline for M&E that affirmed the need for establishing a comprehensive digital MRS. The overall goal of implementing the MRS is to build a dynamic and comprehensive monitoring and reporting system to improve national monitoring and reporting. The MRS will also improve the monitoring and reporting on environmental and social management, including the implementation of the program ESMS.

¹ PDC, "An assessment on the national level M&E organization, leadership and human resources," 2018.

Evaluation of the Government's decentralized service delivery through the general-purpose grant evidences that it is pro-poor and has contributed to improved human capital outcomes across Ethiopia. Additional financing to the general-purpose grant will protect access for the poor and vulnerable to basic services critical not only as part of the COVID-19 response but also for long-term human capital formation. The second AF of ESPES will entirely be PforR and will not contribute to the IPF component of the first Additional Financing of the project.

This Addendum to *ESSA* reviews progress since the first Incremental *ESSA*, and (a) identifies any changes or updates to the systems in place for environmental and social management against the Core Principles of OP/BP 9.00; (b) assesses the capacity to operate the systems and systems performance; and (c) suggests actions for any necessary improvements to bring the operation of the system to the standard required to meet the Core Principles to be included in the Program Action Plan.

2. Summary of potential environmental and social impacts and risks applicable to the proposed Second Additional Financing

2.1. Potential Environmental Impacts and Risks

ESPES support to the basic sectors through the block grant finances salaries and operation costs of frontline workers, and do not fund on-the-ground civil works with potential environmental impacts. The environmental effects of the activities of the sectors supported by ESPES at the woreda level are not significant, since most of the works are relatively small and confined to limited geographical areas. However, where there are environmental risks, (a) mitigation works can effectively reverse the potential negative environmental and social effects; and (b) consultation and public participation, using local knowledge, could help avoid or educe potential negative effects. The local ESMS capacity building efforts through the IPF component of the project over the years would help to mitigate these concerns. Moreover, the presence of oversight institutions at woreda level and the availability of EIA proclamation, guidelines and regulations help to address environmental concerns related to the basic sectors activities at local level. In the following sections, some of the potential environmental effects that may encounter as a result of some activities by the basic sectors supported by ESPES are highlighted.

Environmental Implications of Construction Activities

Some activities, such as sourcing of construction materials (gravel, quarry, sand etc.) from borrow pits and gravel pits, can potentially result in the complete removal of vegetation and could negatively affect the fauna and flora of the area. These may result in the accumulation of standing water which will be a breeding place for mosquitos. Furthermore, some activities of the sectors supported by the ESPES program at woreda level could lead to the loss of important ecological resources for local people, vegetation that provides watershed protection, and the depletion of biodiversity of national or international importance. Thus, recognizing these negative impacts and developing appropriate mitigation measures is critical. In line with this, for example, the Rural Roads Authority has a regulation that obliges construction firms to close pits and quarries after use.

Implications for Physical Cultural Resources

The physical cultural resources aspect of the EIA is frequently not given due attention, despite the fact that Ethiopia is particularly rich in tangible cultural heritage. To ensure that impacts are not overlooked, it is important to screen all woreda-level projects for possible impacts on physical cultural resources, and to be alert to the possibility of chance finds.

Potential for Soil Erosion

Soil erosion, especially alongside roads, can result in gullies inside productive farmlands or forests as well as the silting of nearby water bodies. However, initiatives that are underway to rehabilitate gully formations have a positive impact in mitigating the negative consequences. In addition, this should be supported by appropriate engineering designs, including mitigation measures for potential negative

Potential for Depletion and Pollution of Surface and Groundwater Resources

Water required for construction purposes could potentially place greater demand on both surface and groundwater resources. The risk that the construction activities in the sectors supported by the ESPES will over-extract groundwater remains very low. If discharges from structures like health institutions are released into nearby water systems, they could have an adverse impact on water quality, resulting in pollution with solid waste debris, wastewater, and silt. Committees that are formed around health facilities could be made aware and strengthened to look after these issues.

2.2 Potential Social Impacts and Risks

ESPES funded activities are not expected to cause significant negative social impacts rather benefits by strengthening capacity of the basic sectors through salary and operational cost coverage. ESPES 2nd AF finances only salaries and operation costs of frontline workers. The program will not finance infrastructure that require land acquisition thus land acquisition will not be a for the PforR. On the other hand, the contextual security risk with the current social conflict in areas such as West Oromia, Guji, Tigray and Benishangul Gumuz may affect the smooth implementation of the program and pose potential risk on workers' health and safety.

If in case any negative social impacts or risks happen among the basic sectors beyond the program finance as well, the updated public consultation guideline prepared during ESPES Additional Finance and Environment and Social Management System Operational Manual that was part of the prior program phases will be used. The second ESPES Additional Finance will also support in strengthening the health sector GBV prevention and Response system by having a DLR on the sector GBV strategy training for the health workers.

In the following sections, some of the potential social effects and social system strengthening areas that may be encountered as a result of certain activities by the basic sectors that could go beyond this second additional finance PforR are described .

Land acquisition

ESPES 2nd AF doesn't finance infrastructure which requires land acquisition. In cases where basic sectors involve in such activities beyond the PforR, the new proclamation (1161/2019); the regulation (472/2020), and the public consultation guideline (2020) prepared by EFCCC can be utilized to minimize and reduce the complaints and other negative impacts or risks. In some of the sectors, the site selection guidelines used are not revised. For example, during consultation with key informants from the MOH, it was revealed that the existing site selection guideline is relatively old. As a result, it may not be up to date to respond to the current needs of the community. On the other hand, identifying areas for small infrastructural construction, the involvement of the community is highly recognized. Furthermore, the public consultation guideline mentioned above

will also help in harmonizing the community participation process in the basic sectors and various agencies, which will reduce problems related to land acquisition.

Social conflict

Conflict and civil unrest disrupt project implementation. This creates problem of movement from place to place and restricts access to the problem affected areas. For example, due to security problems, for instance, in West Oromia, Guji, Tigray and Benishangul Gumuz and in other parts of the country, projects as well as regular government activities related to basic services were disrupted for a while. In addition, the internal displacement of people as a result of conflicts in different parts of the country has forced the government to divert budget that could have been used for improving the delivery of basic services. Such conflicts may reappear in the coming years. Thus, it would be good to work on preventive measures and develop contingency plans.

Worker health and safety

The type and scale of activities implemented by ESPES-supported basic sectors might not bring significant negative impacts or risks to workers. Nonetheless, these sectors could undertake some activities at the woreda level that may pose health and safety concerns to workers. Therefore, it is important for the sectors to implement relevant labor laws and OHS requirements. In some regions, the management and regulatory branches of the health sector are put in the same organizational structure. Thus, activities that are supposed to be carried out by the regulatory branch may not be effective in supervising public health and health facilities. Therefore, it is necessary to separate the two branches organizationally.

Cultural inappropriateness

While most of the activities implemented by ESPES-supported are culturally appropriate, there are some activities, which require contextualizing to the different needs, priorities, and circumstances of various groups and cultures. For example, pastoralists and agro-pastoralists are characterized by frequent movements in need of pasture and water for their livestock. Therefore, services provided by the basic sectors such as education and health should be designed in culturally appropriate manner. As a result of the mobility of the community in the pastoral society, public consultation is a challenge. Thus, understanding and strengthening the existing traditional ways of communications and consultations is necessary.

Gender and gender-based violence

Though the scale may vary, gender inequality has been common in all parts of the country. This is mainly observed in accessing productive resources and basic services. This could also happen in ESPES-supported basic sectors. However, most basic sectors have recognized the problem and have initiated mitigating measures. For example, the MOE has considered girls grade 8 completion rate as one criterion to select the bottom 20% woredas that was used to be included in the ESPES project. Moreover, regional governments have passed a directive which gave a 50% share to women in committees formed to increase public participation.

In relation to GBV, the DHS data reported that in all regions, there were considerable number of GBV cases. There is also a possibility that ESPES supported sectors may face similar challenges. As a result, the issue cannot be overlooked. Some of the positive developments in developing mitigation measures include the establishment of one stop center that provide service to victims in

order to help them get psychological, physical and cash support in one place from multi-sectoral government partners. This support provided by the multi-sectoral government partners (health service providers, Women and Children Affairs, Police and legal service providers) should be strengthened. In addition, it may be required to update the gender action plan and make sure it has a protocol on how to carry out referrals of GBV to response services. Furthermore, it may be useful to establish GBV sensitive channels for reporting and making certain the availability of an effective GRM involving multiple channels at federal, regional and woreda levels. To strengthen the system of GBV prevention and response, the ESPES second AF will have a DLR to strengthen the health system by training the health workers on the Health Sector Strategy.

Vulnerable Groups

In project implementation, there is always a tendency to consider clients as homogenous. This assumption has put vulnerable groups in a disadvantaged position, and they are overlooked. This situation may also happen in the ESPES supported basic sectors. However, there are positive developments that help curve the problem. In line with this, Proclamation No. 1097/2018, which specifies the powers and duties of the federal ministries mentions about strengthening the social protection system to improve and ensure the social and economic wellbeing of citizens and, in particular to: a) enable persons with disabilities benefit from equal opportunities and full participation; b) enable the elderly to get care and support and enhance their participation; prevent social and economic problems and provide the necessary services to segments of the society under difficult circumstances particularly the elderly and people with disabilities. With regard to the implementation of ESPES, it is important to take into consideration equitable access to services delivered and ability of the service sectors to meet needs of most vulnerable and underserved groups.

3. Assessment of Borrower’s Environmental and Social Management Systems, Policy and Legal Framework

3.1.Updates: Policy and Legal Framework for Environmental and Social Management

The reform process in Ethiopia is overhauling the country’s policy and legal frameworks including proclamations, regulations, strategies, guidelines, etc. In line with this, the institutions that are responsible for the environment and social management are doing their level best to review and update proclamations and guidelines used for safeguards purposes. However, these frameworks may require (1) harmonization and coordination among existing laws and regulations, and (2) effective implementation and enforcement.

As mentioned above, after the preparation of first incremental ESSA in 2017, some of the major updates with regard to environmental and social management policies and legal frameworks include: Proclamation No. 1097/2018 regarding Labor Safety and Health Protection, Vulnerable and Disadvantaged Groups, Gender and Gender Based Violence; Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs); the Ten-Years Development Plan; Ten-Years Agricultural Plan and Land Acquisition. These are described in detail in the forthcoming sections.

3.1.1. Proclamation NO. 1097/2018: Powers and Duties of the Executive Organs of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia

Labor Safety and Health Protection: Labor safety and protection activities are handled by different institutions. However, the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MOLSA) is mandated

to design mechanisms that ensure the safety and health of workers. In line with this, Proclamation No. 1097/2018, which specifies the powers and duties of the federal ministries has given MOLSA, in article 29(3) to “establish a system to prevent occupational accidents and occupational diseases; issue occupational health and safety standards and supervise their implementation;” under sub-article 4, it also gives power to “set up a system to ensure industrial peace and ensure its proper implementation”. Therefore, MOLSA is better placed to coordinate tasks related to labor safety and health in collaboration with other similar organizations.

Vulnerable and Disadvantaged Groups: Proclamation No. 1097/2018, which specifies the powers and duties of the federal ministries under article 29, sub-article 11 has given MOLSA the duty to:

work in collaboration with the concerned bodies to strengthen the social protection system to improve and ensure the social and economic wellbeing of citizens and, in particular to: a) enable persons with disabilities benefit from equal opportunities and full participation; b) enable the elderly to get care and support and enhance their participation; prevent social and economic problems and provide the necessary services to segments of the society under difficult circumstances particularly the elderly and people with disabilities.

The Proclamation No. 1097/2018 Article 13 (1t), which specifies the powers and duties of the federal ministries has given to Ministry of Peace “in collaboration with concerned organs coordinate activities that enable pastoralists and semi-pastoralists to become beneficiaries of social and economic developments.” Besides to this, each ministry is given the power and duties to ensure the aforementioned segments of the society who are vulnerable to social and economic problems benefit from equal opportunities and full participation.

Gender Based Violence: In relation to **Gender Based Violence**, proclamation No. 1097/2018, article 28 (f & g) bestow powers and duties to the Ministry of Women, Children and Youth to: “design strategies to effectively prevent and take measures against gender-based violence against women; implement same in collaboration with relevant organs; facilitate the setting up centers for provision of holistic health, psychological, legal and rehabilitation services for women who were victims of violence; and follow up the implementation of same.”

3.1.2. Ten-Years Development Plan

Ethiopia is engaged in carrying out multi-sectoral reforms that include agriculture, manufacturing, mining, tourism and the ICT sectors as sources of growth in the Ten- Years Development Plan (2021-2030). The growth approach focuses on diversifying source of economic growth and job creations by undertaking necessary and substantive policy reforms across the different sectors. Some of the issues related to environmental and social management (ESM) focus areas in the plan are described as follows.

Population and Human Resource Development: In the areas of population and human resource development, the Ten- Years Development Plan aims to develop an all-rounded human resource capacity. It intends to achieve this through the provision of equitable access to health and education

services as well as ensuring quality and relevance, which will form the primary area of focus for the coming ten years.

Social Justice, Social Security and Public Services: In the areas of Social Justice and Social Security, the ten years plan focuses on empowering various sections of the society to enable them benefit from economic development and get their fair share from the development endeavors. This is planned to be attained through skills development, capacity building and equitable participation. The plan specifically pay attention to inclusiveness and developing the overall capacity of women, children, the youth, the elderly, the handicapped and all vulnerable citizens and facilitate their all-rounded participation in the country's economic, social, and cultural affairs. The plan also looked at the areas of the justice and public services. The main focus is to ensure access to justice and good governance, providing impartial and effective legal services, enforcing the rule of law, protecting and respecting the constitution, and enforcing the criminal law.

Environment and Climate Change: In the Ten Years Development Plan, activities in the environment and climate change focus on ensuring sustainable development by developing, enriching, maintaining and protecting the country's environment, forests, wildlife and other biodiversity resources. It also focuses on sustainable utilization and maintenance of healthy ecosystem interactions. The plan has laid out to achieve by increasing the greenhouse gas emissions reduction capacity from the present 92.7 million metric tons of carbon dioxide equivalent (CO₂E) to 162.3 million metric tons of carbon dioxide equivalent. It also intends to increase the coverage of protection against illicit activities in wildlife habitats from 62% to 92%, increase national forest coverage from 15.5% to 30%, increase the wild life habitats from the present area of 8.6% to 14%, increase the number of enriched wildlife and biodiversity species from 311,470 to 743,447, and the number of species maintained from 179,285 to 764,361.

Gender: The Ten-Year Development Plan vision and goals are, by and large, interlinked with the 17 goals and the associated 169 targets that are identified in the SDG 2030. Of the 17 goals, goal number 5, which states achieving gender equality and empowerment for all women and girls is adopted by the Ten-Year Development Plan.

3.1.3. Ten-Years Agricultural Plan

The Ten- Years Agricultural Plan mentions that natural resource will be developed taking into consideration the different agro-ecologies and watersheds. In doing so, appropriate technologies and required inputs will be introduced and used. During implementation, active community participation will be ensured, specifically women and youth. The specific focus of natural resource management will consider soil, water, forest, and common grazing land in pastoral areas. In addition, the Ten- Years Agricultural Plan regarding sustainable rural land administration and use intends to reduce land related conflicts from currently existing 20% to 15%. In addition, the plan intends to increase landowners' access to credit from the current 13, 000 to 1 million². It also intends to develop land use policy in the coming years.

² MOA (2020), Ten-Years Agricultural Plan (Amharic Version), MOA, Addis Ababa.

In line with the implementation of the CRGE Strategy, the Ten- Years Agricultural Plan intends to increase reduction in greenhouse gas emission from currently existing 36.84 million metric tons to 125.8 metric tons.

This second AF doesn't directly finance the Ten- Years Agricultural Plan. However, the support to the block grants finances the salaries and operation costs of agricultural development agents who will be involved in the implementation of the Plan at local level. Furthermore, the envisaged activities in the Ten-Year Agricultural Plan will support the implementation of better environmental and social management practices.

3.1.4. A Roadmap for Optimizing the Ethiopian Health Extension Program

The government of Ethiopia has launched a new roadmap for optimizing the Ethiopian health extension program from 2020-2035. Among other things, the new roadmap aims to improve the earlier health extension program, which focused mostly on addressing married women in their homes. Since that was found to be inadequate, the new roadmap has set a goal to leave no one and reach the different categories target populations in the different settings.

The roadmap has outlined six strategic objectives. From among these, four of the strategic objectives that deal on: ensuring equitable access to essential health services, improving the quality of health services provided through HEP (introduce professional and gender mix among HP staff), strengthening community engagement and empowerment as well as strengthening political leadership, multi-sectoral engagement and partnerships deliberate on issues of ESM. Therefore, if these are implemented, they will have a positive effect on the improvement of ESM.

The HEP Optimization Roadmap aims to accelerate the realization of universal health care, including prevention, promotion, treatment, rehabilitation and palliative care. It is a core element of the Government's decentralized delivery of health services. In line with this, the DLI 5a.8 gives provision for the implementation of A Health Extension Optimization Implementation Manual, with specific considerations for the pastoralist regions. This ensures that the roll-out is implemented equitably, with special considerations for the challenges of service delivery in the lowland regions.

The first COVID-19 case in the country was reported in March 2020. Since that time, cases are growing daily, and the positivity rate is also increasing alarmingly. The World Bank-supported Ethiopia COVID-19 Emergency Response Project intends to fill critical gaps in addressing COVID-19 emergency response activities which aims to strengthen the prevention activities, rapid detection, preparedness and response to COVID-19 outbreak. The project provides support on renovation, establishing, and equipping isolation, treatment, quarantine and Point of Entry centres in the country. The second AF contributes to the COVID-19 response through its financing of frontline health extension workers who are critical in the provision primary health care.

3.1.5. Health Sector Transformation Plan (HSTP-II)

The MOH has prepared a five years Health Sector Transformation Plan (HSTP-II) (2020– 2025). In this plan, among the 14 strategic directions that are identified, the following seven are directly and indirectly linked to the issue of ESM:

- Enhance provision of equitable and quality comprehensive health service;
- Improve health emergency and disaster risk management;
- Ensure community engagement and ownership;
- Improve regulatory systems;
- Improve human resource development and management;
- Improve health infrastructure; and
- Ensure integration of health in all policies and strategies;

In addition, the HSTP-II has identified five transformation agenda. Out of which two are related to the issue of ESM. These are:

- **Transformation in equity and quality of health service delivery:** it refers to ensuring delivery of quality health services and creating high performing primary health care units, engaging the community in service delivery and consistently improving the outcome of clinical care.
- **Transformation in Health Workforce:** it aims at ensuring the availability of adequate number and mix of quality health workforce that are Motivated, Competent and Compassionate (MCC) to provide quality health service.

As DLI 5a.8 stated the implementation of a Health Extension Optimization Implementation Manual, which is one of the Health Sector Transformation Plan (HSTP). Therefore, DLI plays a key role in achievement of the HSTP objectives. In addition, the DLI mentioned in this addendum to ESSA proposed Training-of-Trainers for 300 health professionals in 10 regions and 2 city administration on new Gender Based Violence (GBV) Strategy under the Ministry of Health.

3.1.6. Proclamation No.1161/2019 Expropriation of Land for Public Purposes, Payments of Compensation and Resettlement of Displaced People and Regulation No. 472/2020.

The FDRE House of Peoples Representatives Council has recently enacted Proclamation No.1161/2019 that deals with “Expropriation of Land for Public Purposes, Payments of Compensation and Resettlement of Displaced People”, and replaced the previously active Proclamation on the matter i.e. Expropriation of Land and Compensation Proclamation No. 455/2005. The new Proclamation gives priority rights to develop Land for the Landholders when the capacity of the Landholders to develop the land as per the approved land use plan; urban structural plan; or development master plan is presented. It states, “Landholders whose holdings are within the area prescribed to be redeveloped shall have priority rights to develop their lands according to the plan either individually or in a group” (Article 7, sub-article 1-2).

Under Article 16 (sub-article 2), the Proclamation mandates the responsible bodies to establish a resettlement package for the affected persons as follows: “Regional states, Addis Ababa, and Dire Dawa, shall develop resettlement packages that may enable displaced people to sustainably resettle”. The Proclamation states, “The City or Woreda Administration has the power to order evacuation and takeover the land decided to be expropriated for public purpose” Generally, the new Land expropriation, compensation payment and resettlement Proclamation, compared with the

Proclamation No. 455/2005, has improved a number of issues related to compensation and resettlement, among others, the major improvements are:

- Number of years for permanent loss of farmland has increased from ten (10) years into fifteen (15) years;
- The number of consecutive years of productivity of crops and price considered for compensation estimate is reduced from five (5) to three (3) years of which the best productivity and price of the three (3) years is to be considered;
- Time limit for the landholder to whom compensation is not paid after estimation, can use the land for former purpose is added in the new proclamation (Article 3, sub-article a, b and C);
- Number of days of notice for illegal holders is set to be thirty (30) days (Article 8);
- Displaced People shall be compensated for the breakup of their social ties and moral damage they suffer as a result of the expropriation (Article 4e); and
- Provision on resettlement packages that enable displaced people to sustainably resettle (Article 16, sub-article 2).

Furthermore, FDRE Council of Ministers Regulation No. 472/2020 on Expropriation and Valuation and Compensation and Resettlement was issued. The regulation provides the basis for compensation of affected properties and to assist the displaced or affected persons to restore their livelihood.

3.1.7. Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)

The Post-2015 SDGs, the Common African Position on Post-2015 Development Agenda, Agenda 2063 of Africa, and the Addis Ababa Action Agenda have been embraced by the Government of Ethiopia. The principles and tenants of these international and regional agendas are currently being integrated and mainstreamed (‘domesticating’) into national plans, policies and strategies.

3.2. Updates: Capacity for Environment and Social Management

The environmental and social management institutions and legal frameworks are largely in place. However, inadequate human resources in some of the organizations such as MOE and the regular program of the MOA are observed. In addition, frequent turnover of technical staff is still a challenge. Coordination and integration between basic service sectors and oversight bodies continues to be inadequate. As a result, it has remained to be a challenge for effective implementation of environmental and social management and assessment.

Experiences elsewhere in the world show that effective implementation and enforcement of environmental laws, regulations and standards is based on: 1) sound decision-making processes on environmental protection and natural resources management and conservation, 2) regular, effective and strong coordination among the institutions endowed with an environmental and social mandates, 3) reliable and open data and information management system as well as effective compliance monitoring and enforcement capacity. In line with this, strengthening the capacity of units that are responsible for environmental and social management in the basic service sectors has a great role in tackling the issues linked to the weak implementation and enforcement of all

environmental and social-related laws, policies, proclamations, regulations, strategies, guidelines and standards.

3.3. Coordination related to Environment and Social Management

Coordination and cooperation between and across various organizations (basic service sectors and oversight bodies) is a prerequisite for effectiveness of social and environmental management and assessment. Some steps which can be initiated to enhance coordination could include:

- Building common understanding between all stakeholders (clients, implementing agencies and oversight bodies) about the available laws, policies, regulations, strategies, guidelines, and standards
- Developing accountability mechanism within and across involved stakeholders
- Implementing joint activities to monitor and enforce active compliance through local institutions, particularly woreda level;
- Collecting and sharing relevant information and analysis on implementation, compliance and enforcement of environmental and social laws, regulations and standards; and
- Developing and implementing joint capacity enhancement programs, including training.

3.4. Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) Capacity Review and Its Current Status

The condition with regard to ESIA capacity has not changed much from what was reported in the first Incremental ESSA, 2017 review for the basic service sectors at local levels of all regions. The review findings mentioned that there were high staff turnover and lack of qualified experts in market and the environmental or agency staff at regional and woreda offices do not have adequate knowledge in the implementation of ESIA. This inadequate in-house capacity to conduct ESIA is still prevailing in most basic sector organizations. As a result, most of the ESIA are commissioned to external consultants.

The ESIA capacity in the oversight bodies at regional levels is better than what is existing in basic sectors. For example, Somali region has established a unit to review and approve ESIA reports and carry out environmental audit on projects. The agency has revised and transformed its organizational structure to bureau level. They have also devolved power and responsibility to woreda level.

Therefore, in order to strengthen the implementation of ESIA, building the capacity within the basic sectors and improving the coordination with the oversight bodies should be given attention.

3.5. Progress against Program Action Plan (PAP)

There is some progress with regard to the Program Action Plan related to environmental and social management. Details are discussed as follows.

- a. Coordination between basic service sectors and oversight bodies on environmental and social management**
 - **Status of creating annual forums dedicated to reviewing the implementation of agreed actions at federal level with participation from regions**

In relation to creation of annual forums two things have happened. One: The Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs organized annual meetings inviting regional level labor and social affairs experts. In this meeting, they develop joint plans and review program implementation. Two: The Environment, Forest, Climate Change Commission also organizes similar review meetings with regional environmental experts. Nevertheless, the planned annual forum to bring together basic sectors and oversight bodies was not created. The only forum that exists is the Joint Review and Implementation Support (JRIS).

- Bi-annual technical meetings to review progress at regional level

The Bi-annual meetings planned to be carried out has not been conducted yet. Therefore, it may be good re-initiate it and convince the relevant stakeholders to conduct the activity.

b. Status of assignment of environmental and social management focal person in the BoFEDs

Channel One Coordinators in BoFEDs were assigned to serve as ESM focal persons. Ministry of Finance has also recently written a letter to regional finance bureaus suggesting that they hire staff that will follow up social accountability issues. This is believed that it could be useful for the implementation of social accountability program. In addition, a one-man social accountability unit was created in the MOF. There is also a plan to hire two more experts for the unit. Besides, a consultant was hired by the World Bank to support and provide knowledge transfer.

c. Status of customization of the ESMS Operational Manual in regions (Amhara, Oromia, SNNP, Tigray and Harari) and the two city administrations (Addis Ababa and Dire Dawa)

The customization of the ESMS operational manual was attempted. However, the result was not satisfactory as most sector offices have not started using it. In order to understand the reason, a study was commissioned to be carried out by an independent consultant. Follow up to this, a revised and customized ESMS operational manual that considers the context of the five basic sectors in the regions will be prepared.

There is some progress in relation to the Program Action Plan (PAP) of environmental and social management. However, there are still tasks that need further attention.

Table 1: Progress in the Program Action Plan (PAP) Implementation

Action	When	Responsible Party	Status
1. Strengthen coordination between basic service sectors and oversight bodies	AF Year 1, 2 and 3	BoFED/Regional environmental protection agencies	The planned annual forum to bring together basic sectors and oversight bodies

<p>on environmental and social management:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Bi-annual technical meetings to review progress at regional level <input type="checkbox"/> Annual forums dedicated to reviewing the implementation of agreed actions at federal level with participation from regions 			<p>was not created. Nevertheless, MOLSA and EFCCC organized annual meetings inviting regional experts. They also conducted joint planning and review.</p>
<p>Assign environmental and social management focal person in the BoFEDs</p>	<p>Original ESPES Year 1</p>	<p>BoFED/Woreda council</p>	<p>Channel One Coordinators in BoFEDs were assigned to serve as ESM focal persons.</p> <p>Ministry of Finance has also recently written a letter to regional finance bureaus suggesting that they hire or assign staff that will follow up social accountability issues.</p>
<p>3. Customize the ESMS Operational Manual in five regions (Amhara, Oromia, SNNP, Tigray and Harari) and the two city administrations (Addis Ababa and Dire Dawa)</p>	<p>AF Year 1 and 2</p>	<p>BoFED/Regional environmental protection agencies</p>	<p>Customization of the Operational Manual was completed by EFCCC. However, utilization was not satisfactory. A study by independent consultants will be conducted and the result will be used to revise and further</p>

			customize the manual.
--	--	--	-----------------------

Bi-Annual Reviews of Safeguards and Risk Management Progress: Bi-Annual Joint Review and Implementation Support (JRIS) missions are an opportunity to review the progress on safeguards and risk management, including reflections on common environmental and social risks in the basic sectors, key challenges and opportunities to address challenges. The following sections highlight some of the recent JRIS mission findings related to safeguards.

November 2020: the mission noted the Environment, Forestry and Climate Change Commission’s (EFCCC’s) commitment and efforts to take increased responsibility for the implementation of the program’s environmental and social management system capacity building component. Despite the COVID-19 challenges, the EFCCC has continued facilitating the ESMS implementation and providing technical backstopping to regions. Mission participants commended the government for this effort and encourage further strengthening of the system as it is critical for the sustainability of basic service delivery. Furthermore, the mission encouraged the government to fast-track the completion of the preparation of the guidelines for environmental and social audit, and sector specific ESIA’s (Agriculture, Water, Transport and Mining). Going forward, it is also important to: (a) further strengthen the implementation of the ESMS, (b) timely complete the update of the customization of the ESMS operational manual in the three regions (Oromia, Amhara and SNNP), and (c) strengthen public participation, particularly women and vulnerable groups, in ESIA.

November 2019: the mission welcomed the development of a comprehensive public consultation guideline on Environmental and Social Impact Assessment that is expected to enhance the involvement of the community and stakeholders in ESIA thereby minimizing the adverse impacts and maximizing the benefits of development projects. Participants suggested enhanced dissemination of the consultation guideline to regions and sectors and increased media disclosure for improved outreach.

Safeguards Technical Working Group: was established with the objective of providing coordinated technical support to the Government of Ethiopia, Development Partners supporting basic service delivery, and other relevant stakeholders to operationalize safeguards and risk management and promote socially and environmentally sustainable decentralized basic service delivery.

The major tasks of STWG include: (a) provide advice and support on the coordination of safeguards and risk management activities among the Government and DPs; (b) provide advice on building capacity on environmental and social management at local level, particularly in the basic sectors; (c) provide advice and support in monitoring the progress of the implementation of agreed actions for safeguards and risk management; (d) support the institutionalization and mainstreaming of environmental and social issues in the basic sectors; (e) share lessons and best practices; and (f) share information and coordinate with other TWGs in the basic sectors, as appropriate. It was agreed to meet quarterly, but the meetings were discontinued in 2020 due to the COVID-19 pandemic.

4. Findings from Rapid Assessment of Environmental and Social Management (Federal, Regional and Woreda Sectoral Offices)

4.1. Structural Setups, Policy and Legal Framework for Environmental and Social Management (ESM) at Federal level and sampled Regions (Gambella, Oromia, Somali and SNNP)

a. Federal Level

Environment, Forest and Climate Change Commission (EFCCC)

EFCCC was established by proclamation No. 916/2015 and re-established by proclamation No. 1097/2018. All rights, duties and responsibility of environment components of its predecessors EPA, MoEF and MoEFCC have been transferred to this new Commission. The Proclamation gives the mandate of regulating the environmental and social issues in Ethiopia to EFCCC. The EFCCC is responsible for ensuring the realization of the environmental rights, goals, objectives, and basic principles enshrined in the Constitution. Previously, ESIA review was delegated to six ministries: Mines and petroleum; Agriculture; Water, Irrigation and Energy; Urban Development and Construction; Transport; and Trade and Industry. Now, the delegation is revoked, and responsibility has gone back to EFCCC.

Currently, the EFCCC is in the process of amending the 299/2002 proclamation on environmental impact assessment (EIA). The draft document was submitted to the Council of Ministers and feedback was received. The feedback was incorporated and resubmitted to the same. The Council is expected to review and submit the draft document to the parliament. The revised draft proclamation is made to include Strategic Environment and Social Assessment (SESA) as a requirement in developing investment proposals. It also specifies when and by whom the SESA should be prepared. In addition, the revised draft proclamation has included environmental audit as one part with details of when and how it should be carried out. Moreover, equal emphasis is given to social assessment, and amended proclamation will have the title “Environment and Social Impact Assessment”. However, earlier than this, the social components of the assessment were overlooked and given limited attention. Besides, usually it is obvious that after proclamation, regulations are prepared. However, the previous EIA Proclamation was not complemented with regulation. But now, the EFCCC has planned to prepare a regulation after the proclamation is enacted.

Furthermore, the EFCCC has prepared Integrated Risk Management Guideline in 2020 in order to complement ESIA. The guideline is prepared as a national general guideline and specific for mines and irrigation. The guideline recommends ESIA to consider additionally the assessment of impact that may happen as a result of climate change, ecosystem restoration, and disaster. In addition, the

EFCCC has prepared public consultation guideline in 2020. This was prepared to guide how public consultation should be undertaken during project planning and implementation.

In relation to coordination and cooperation, the EFCCC has started coordination work with Investment Commission as well as with Ministry of Trade and Industry. The coordination is related to addition of ESIA as a prerequisite for approval of new projects.

Ministry of Agriculture

The regular program of the Ministry of Agriculture does not have a safeguards unit. However, starting from 2019, the environment and climate change coordination directorate was established. The directorate has climate change as well as environment and social safeguards wing. It has a mandate of capacity building of regions on ESM issues as well as monitoring and support. In 2020, to guide the implementation of ESM, the directorate has prepared social and environmental code of practice to be used for commercial agriculture. Even though the current focus of the directorate is on commercial farms, in the future, it intends to support small scale farms.

All projects in the Ministry of Agriculture have experts working on safeguards. However, coordination between the regular programs and the projects safeguards units is nonexistent. But, when revising the current watershed development manual, the project safeguard experts made contributions in preparing the ESMF section of the manual. This manual is also being used by the regular watershed development program.

Ministry of Health

The ministry has about six directorates namely, Health Extension and Primary Health Service, Hygiene and Environmental Health, Health System Special Support, Women, Youth and Children Affairs, Health and Health-Related Inspection, and Primary Health Infrastructure Development that are directly or indirectly involved in ESM related issues.

In relation to vulnerable and disadvantaged groups, more specifically, the Health System Special Support Directorate and the Women, Children and Youth (WOCY) Affairs Directorate support regions that require special attention. The regions that receive the support include Afar, Somali, Gambella, Benishangul Gumuz and parts of pastoral areas of Oromia and SNNP. In addition, low performing zones in Amhara and Tigray regions are given support. With respect to integration and coordination, a multi-sectoral woreda transformation pilot program led by the Ministry of Health was implemented in Gimbichu woreda of Oromia region in 2019 to demonstrate the integration of multi-sectoral activities.

Although coordination between the WOCY affairs directorate in the MOH and the MOWCY were expected, they rarely have working relationship. If there were coordination, they could have synergistically benefited their clients as well as reduced overlap and redundancy.

Ministry of Education

In the MOE, there is no focal person or unit for safeguards practices in the regular program. Nevertheless, recently, one expert is hired to handle safeguard issues for ESPES as a focal person.

Although an agreement was reached to establish a directorate looking after ESM issues in federal sectoral offices, this was not materialized in the MOE. This was due to challenges faced in convincing the office responsible for federal civil service to approve a structure for safeguards specialists. In relation to ESM capacity building, a training was organized in collaboration with the MOH and others focusing on the educational sector ESM.

Water Development Commission

Under this Commission, there is a safeguards unit organized as Environment, Social and Climate Change Directorate. This was created with establishment of the Water Development Commission in 2018. Under the directorate, there are five environmentalists, four sociologists, one climate change expert and two economists. Among other things, the directorate has prepared a GRM guideline for UWSSP II (February 2020), ESMF of OWNP-CWA II (December 2018), RPF of OWNP-CWA II (November 2018), and SA of OWNP-CWA II (January 2019) to help the implementation of ESM commitments.

Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MoLSA)

MoLSA is responsible for the coordination and implementation of the Social Protection Policy. Given the multidimensional nature of the policy implementation, a Federal Social Protection Council (FSPC) was established consisting of members drawn from the relevant federal offices and other stakeholders. To implement the policy across the federal structure, institutional arrangements and accountability mechanisms were established at regional, zonal, and woreda levels. It also plays an overarching role in the design, amendment, implementation of and monitoring of occupational health and safety policies, directives and guidelines, and makes sure that sector ministries and other executive organs perform their responsibilities related to health and safety issues in their respective mandate areas. MoLSA is also responsible for organizing and coordinating support for vulnerable groups. It has the necessary structure at regional, zonal and woreda levels but not at kebele levels.

The activities of MoLSA are informed by the national social protection policy, which was prepared in 2015. In addition, in 2018, a new proclamation (1097/2018) that states the roles and responsibilities of all federal ministries and offices in relation to the implementation of the national social protection policy, was enacted. In this proclamation under Article 10.4, the role and responsibility of each ministry was stated about disadvantaged and vulnerable groups. Informants from MoLSA argue that there could be duplication of policies, regulations, or guidelines as they are being prepared by different organization without considering what is already existing. This shows the need for coordinated and harmonized way of preparing policies, proclamations and guidelines. Recently, the Attorney General office has given attention to the issue of duplication. Therefore, it has become mandatory for every proclamation and regulation to pass through the Attorney General office.

Ministry of Women, Children and Youth (MOWCY)

The ministry has three branches, namely women, children and youth. In all of these, the ministry is responsible for follow-up of the implementation of national and international laws; conducting research and formulating policies and guidelines; collaborating with organizations working on women, child and youth affairs; and providing capacity building support to ensure the equal participation and benefit of women, children and youth in the protection of their rights and security. In the ten regional states and the two city administrations, the ministry has structures organized as bureau.

In order to address the wide ranging problems of women, children and youth, the ministry has carried out several activities that included mainstreaming, reducing Harmful Traditional Practices (Female Genital Mutilation and Early Marriage), children Care and Support, establishing children parliament reducing youth unemployment rate and increasing Youth Representation in the legislative and judiciary. Even though the tasks of the ministry require working in coordination with other basic sectors and oversight bodies, the coordination level is yet to be developed.

Planning and Development Commission (PDC)

The Planning and Development Commission is member of the Council of Ministers with the rank of a Minister. It is responsible for preparing development plans and monitoring and evaluation of their implementation. The PDC has regional counterparts which are not directly reporting to it but have functional relationships.

With regard to coordination, at national level, PDC as federal public body gives directions to line ministries and receives reports from each sector ministry regarding the preparation and implementation of development plans. It supports regions in capacity building and has provided training on planning monitoring and evaluation, regional accounts development and population.

In relation to ESMS, the PDC has established a gender directorate which looks after gender issues within the Commission as well as in all areas of its mandate. In addition, the PDC has established an environment team that works on environment and climate change issues.

The second AF has created a room to encourage the Government's effort in building a national level digital Monitoring and Reporting System (MRS). It is expected that the data that will be collected and reported to the MRS will have information related to Age at First Marriage, Regional Disparities in Fertility Levels, and Gender Based Violence, including climate-related shocks. PDC intends to establish the MRS based on the M&E needs assessment it will be carrying out for the federal entities that are expected to work with the Digital MRS.

Agency for Civil Society Organizations (ACSO)

The agency has seven core directorates, namely: registration, monitoring and evaluation; civil society property administration; volunteering, promotion fund administration; strategic partnership and cooperation; study, research and dissemination; planning, budget and change and women, children and youth.

ACSO has mandate to register and work with civil societies operating in Addis Ababa, Dire Dawa and in more than two regions. The operations of the agency in the regions are handled by the regional bureau of finance. In terms of coordination, there is a joint council, which meets quarterly. The members of the joint council are regional representatives and key federal ministries.

With regards to ESM, the plan, budget and change directorate and the ethics monitoring unit perform tasks to ensure client satisfaction on the service that the agency is providing. In addition, these two units follow up that vulnerable and disadvantaged groups are getting appropriate service and priority.

In relation to capacity building, the leadership has received safeguards related training organized by a multi-donor civil society support program. As a result of this training, the agency has a plan to prepare a safeguards guideline.

b. Regional Level

Institutional arrangement and Coordination

i. Institutional arrangement

In the four sampled regions, the institutional arrangement for ESM is different. In SNNPR, Oromia, and Gambella regions, it is organized in the form of Environment, Forest and Climate Change Authorities. Earlier Somali region was organized as Environmental Protection, Mines, Forest and Energy Development Agency (EPMFEDA) and now changed to Environment, Forest and Climate Change Authorities similar to others. The Environment Authorities of SNNP and Oromia Regions have offices at woreda level, while in Gambella Region there is no such an office at woreda level. However, the Gambella regional environment authority has delegated the Natural Resource Conservation section in the woreda office of Agriculture to carry environmental and social management and assessment related activities on its behalf. Almost all of the regional environment authorities have zonal environment offices.

The structure of BOLSA in the regions differs from region to region. As a result, in Dire Dawa Gambella and Sidama, it is organized as agency; in Harari and Benishangul Gumuz, it is organized as office; while in the other regions (Amhara, Afar, Oromia, Somali, SNNP and Tigray), it is organized as bureau. Communication between the federal and regional offices is weak.

ii. Coordination

Basic Sectors and BoFED: In all the sampled regions, BoFED plays a significant role in coordinating basic sector service providers in the planning and implementation of projects. The five basic sectors have recognized and committed for coordination, harmonization and leveraging of resources toward gender equality. One of the expressions in this regard is the establishment of a Gender Directorate at the ministries and respectively gender units in Regional Bureaus. However, awareness on the importance of environmental and social management, including gender and vulnerable groups varies between the regions. In Somali, it is relatively strong whereas in Gambella, though there are gender and vulnerable group specialists assigned in sector offices,

awareness on ESM in sectors other than health and agriculture is limited. In all the regions, coordination and networking between basic service sectors on ESM is limited. In Gambella, with regard to coordination with other sectors, BOLSA has some joint activities with nutrition cluster offices (labor and social affairs, health, women and children, and agriculture). These include reviewing the activities carried out by the responsible sectors related to breast feeding and nutritional food for pregnant women.

In Oromia region, there is limited coordination between Bureau of Education and Bureau of Environment, Forest and Climate Change Authority in the implementation of ESM. However, the coordination with BOLSA is almost nonexistent.

With regard to Women, Children and Youth Bureau, there is overall improvement in integration and coordination. However, inadequate understanding by leadership in sector offices compounded with irregular monitoring and follow up has limited its effectiveness.

4.2. Updates to Regional Level Capacity for Environment and Social Management

4.2.1. Oversight bodies

a. EFCCC structures at regional level

Capacity development activities are essential to foster the implementation of planned ESM activities using appropriate skill and knowledge. Capacity building trainings on environmental and social safeguard issues at federal sectoral offices and oversight bodies are being provided. These trainings are being cascaded to regions. For example, EFCCC has provided training on EIA and Audit for Amhara, Oromia, SNNP and Sidama regions. The training will also be delivered to Benishangul Gumuz, Gambella, Afar, and Somali regions. As a result of the capacity building, regions have shown improvements in environmental and social impact assessments based on the ESMS Operational Manual. However, there are capacity differences between regions. The four regions (Amhara, Oromia, SNNP and Tigray) have developed a well-established structure or system for the environment and social management. These were mainly due to:

- As a result of the size of these regions, there are a greater number of projects (big, medium and small) that has helped professionals to get better exposure and acquaint themselves with issues of environment and social aspects.
- Similarly, due to the above reasons, they had better chance to get a greater number of capacity building trainings from various development partners, including the WB

However, other regions such as Benishangul Gumuz, Gambella, Afar, and Somali are still in need of further strengthening. In the case of Tigray, EFCCC has established a committee comprised of 3 people to assess the current situation in the region regarding the environmental and social management and the required actions. Based on the feedbacks from the committee, the Commission in collaboration with the government will prepare an action plan that includes training.

In 2017, Somali region has issued a directive that categorizes projects into: 1) Projects requiring full ESIA, 2) Projects requiring preliminary/partial assessment and 3) projects that do not require an assessment. In 2017, the Agency developed a guideline for the preparation and review of ESIA reports. This is expected to strengthen vetting processes. Somali region Bureau of Finance and Economic Development (BoFED) introduced, a practice made effective as of 2016, an approval certificate from Environmental Protection, Forest, Mining and Energy Development Agency, as a requirement before the release of a project fund. In SNNP, the environment authority has not yet developed its own contextualized operational documents. As a result, documents prepared at federal level are in use.

At regional level, bureaus have environmental focal persons designated/employed to support and supervise implementation of projects, for example, PSNP, AGP, One Wash, etc. However, the regular programs do not have dedicated persons for ESM. At woreda level, most of the offices generally lack dedicated environmental and social management focal persons. Nevertheless, in woreda agricultural offices implementation of ESMF for projects is generally handled by the natural resource experts. In the woreda health office, personnel are assigned to perform health and health related facilities regulatory purposes.

b. Bureau of Labor and Social Affairs (BOLSA):

In all regions, there is a very limited experience of working with the basic sectors. Monitoring and supervision on workers' safety issues is irregular and inadequate largely due to shortage of human resources and logistics. The federal civil service and labor law proclamations are employed at regional level to ensure basic safety of workers. However, the system in place is only responsive to demand for reconciliation between conflicting parties.

The social protection guideline developed by MOLSA is the document that is being used at regional level for supporting disadvantaged and vulnerable groups. This guideline is currently under revision. In most of the sampled regions, ESM issues are handled as an integral part of each directorate of MOLSA. As a result, specific experts are not assigned for ESM.

In Somali region, BOLSA utilizes mass media in creating awareness to the public and private sectors on the rights and responsibilities of workers and employers. Training was also organized by BOLSA in 2019 to laborers and contractors on issues of workers safety. However, due to budget limitation the training was provided to limited number of participants.

With regard to coordination, in most regions, BOLSA and MOLSA have good cooperation. MOLSA organizes annual planning and review meetings. It also provides technical support to the regional counterparts. In Somali region, BOLSA coordinates the issue of social safeguard work with different sectors such as rural road authority, agriculture, health, microfinance, urban administration, education, police, and justice office. However, the regional BOLSA and the basic sectors are not satisfied with the current level of coordination as the problem at hand requires them to do more and bring about an observable change. They mentioned finance and capacity as the problem that restricted them from doing what is expected from all stakeholders.

c. Bureau of Woman, Child and Youth Affairs

In all regions, the bureau is organized around three core processes: gender development, empowerment, and child protection. At woreda level, though similar structures exist, most positions are vacant. However, there is no unit dedicated specifically for ESM. As the responsibilities of the three core processes is related to ESM, the tasks handled by staff members are in line with activities required for ESM.

When it comes to coordination, in most regions, coordination and cooperation between BOWCY and the other oversight bodies (BOLSA and EPA) is weak. However, they have coordination and cooperation with the federal MOWCY. With regard to the implementation manual, the environmental protection guideline, which was developed by MOA and contextualized by MOWCY in 2018 is in use in the Somali region BOWCY. They mainly used the guideline to improve youth participation in natural resource activities. The Bureau has also received capacity building training on ESM related issues organized by REED+ in 2018.

4.2.2. Basic Sectors

Capacity is key component for an effective implementation of projects. However, with regard to ESM, the basic sectors at regional levels operate with limited capacity. This is mainly due to shortage of skilled human resource, high staff turnover, and shortage of logistics required for mobility purposes. In line with this, lack of clear career development opportunities and incentives were mentioned as a key factor for the staff turnover. The following sections summarize the environmental and social management arrangements and practices in the basic sectors at regional level:

a. Health

The regional health bureau in all regions have sub-units related to hygiene and sanitation, health and health related facilities regulatory functions. However, in Somali region, it was upgraded to Hygiene and Sanitation Directorate and have seven experts since 2018/19. In most regions, capacity building trainings related to community led hygiene and sanitation, latrine strategies, infection prevention guideline were provided by different development partners. In 2018, in SNNP, the regional health bureau provided training to staff members engaged in regulatory purposes courses related to health and health related facilities regulatory packages. Similarly, in 2021, EFDA (Ethiopian Food and Drug Administration) provided training on iodized salt testing.

b. Education

There is no environmental and social unit and experts were not assigned for ESM purposes at regional level. However, for projects such as GEQIPE, a committee is established composed of representatives from all departments and led by an expert. In the formal system, education supervisors carry out activities related to ESM, including attending issues of gender and vulnerable groups. The situation is more or less similar in all sampled regions.

As part of the GEQIPE, training on the implementation of ESM guidelines was organized by the MOE in 2019. This training was cascaded to zones and woredas in 2018, 2019 & 2020. However, due to budget limitation, the trainings were delivered to limited experts and schools.

c. Water

In regions where projects such as One WASH operate, Safeguards specialists are assigned for environment and social management. However, for regular programs, there is no assigned experts for ESM. For federally financed small scale irrigation, experts from federal and regions of different specializations are used for ESIA as the work requires the cooperation and participation of various expertise.

d. Agriculture

The regular programs in the agricultural bureaus do not have safeguards unit. However, projects such as PSNP AGP, SLMP, etc. have one ESMF expert operating at Bureau level. Even in these projects, there are no social development expert/focal persons in the bureau in all regions. In addition, there is limited cooperation and coordination between the regular program and projects in relation to ESM.

In 2018, capacity building trainings were given by EFCCC on Environmental Impact Assessment, Environmental, Social Management Framework and Environmental and Social Management Plan in most regions.

e. Rural Roads Authority

In all regions, ESIA is prepared for all road development projects constructed by the federal Ethiopian Roads Authority (ERA), based on the Ethiopian Government Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) guideline. However, the regional Rural Road Authorities do not have independent unit responsible for ESIA. In Oromia region, the ESM is handled as additional task by different sections mainly by Roads' right unit. With regard to capacity building, limited trainings were provided by regional Road Authority. However, AGP and SLM organized a training on safeguards in road construction in 2017.

With regard to mainstreaming gender, gender focal persons are assigned in all sectors. This can be taken as a positive development. There is a possibility that this staff may handle gender and vulnerability related issues in collaboration with the oversight bodies such as BOLSA and BOWCY.

4.3. Gender and Gender Based Violence

Though the scale may vary, gender inequality has been common in all parts of the country. This is mainly observed in accessing productive resources and basic services. However, initiatives are implemented that enhance the participation and benefits of women in various development projects. In line with the ESPES project, the MOE has considered girls grade 8 completion rate as one criterion to select the bottom 20% woredas that was used to be included in the ESPES project. As a result, activities that helped to increase girls' grade 8 completion rate were identified and implemented. However, Girls' completion rate of grade 8 performance is still low in pastoralist areas because of home to school distance and low community awareness about girls' education. Regional governments passed a directive which gave a 50 % share to women in committees, including parent and teacher committee should be up to 50%.

In rural road construction, priority was given to women affected by the project during compensation and resettlement program. In Somali region, though women are hesitant, they are highly encouraged to be member of steering committees working on women issues.

Gender based violence (GBV) mostly affects women and girls due to the fact that in many cultures of Ethiopia, they are marginalized and have little or no power to make important decisions about their lives. Therefore, there will obviously be a gap in the overall capacity of ESPES implementers with regard to understanding and integrating GBV/SEA issues in the program implementation.

The study team discussed about GBV with the five basic service sectors (agriculture, education, health, water and rural roads) and oversight agencies. It appears that GBV is not a main challenge that has happened as a result of ESPES activities. Contrary to this, the DHS data³ reported that in all regions, there were considerable number of GBV cases'. For example, in SNNP the prevalence of GBV was 29% and in Oromia 38%. Therefore, during the implementation of ESPES, taking due consideration on the issue of GBV should not be overlooked.

Although there is a National GBV Working Group, currently its main focus is on humanitarian/rehabilitation issues. However, since ESPES is not directly involved in humanitarian activities, it may not be supported by the working group. Therefore, it may be necessary to strengthen the activities of the multi-sectoral government partners (health service providers, Women and Children Affairs, Police and legal service providers). In addition, it may be required to update the gender action plan and make sure it has a protocol on how to carry out referrals of GBV to response services.

Besides, it may be helpful to recognize and refer grievances related to GBV to respective service providers based on the demands of survivors and without forgetting confidentiality. In this respect, GBV related grievances could be better handled by the Woreda Women and Children Affairs Office or female GBV focal points who have the knowledge and skill to provide basic referrals. Furthermore, it may be useful to establish GBV sensitive channels for reporting and making certain the availability of an effective GRM involving multiple channels at federal, regional and woreda levels.

In relation to capacity building, in rural road construction, orientation and training was provided to contactors and workers on how to prevent GBV related activities. Similarly, the gender department of Oromia Bureau of Education has organized and provided trainings and awareness raising programs on GBV for teachers and students, mainly through girls' clubs. In Somali region, concerning GBV, one stop center having representatives from BOWCY, justice office, police, sheria, woreda administration, kebele, health office, social worker was established to enable victims get the required holistic support. In addition, the Somali region BOLSA organized training and orientation forums aimed at protecting GBV in the workplace. Similarly, in Arbamich, SNNP, one stop center was established and provided service through which victims get support such as psychological, physical and cash in one place from different organizations.

4.4. Social Conflicts

³ Demographic and Health Survey (DHS), 2016, Central Statistical Agency, Addis Ababa

Conflict and civil unrest disrupt project implementation. This creates problem of movement from place to place and restricts access to the problem affected areas. During the last three years, Ethiopia has experienced various internal conflicts in different parts of the country, including parts of Oromia, Somali, Sidama, Amhara, SNNP, Benishangul Gumuz and Tigray. Due to security problems, for instance, in West Oromia, Guji, and in other parts of the country, projects as well as regular government activities related to basic services were disrupted for a while. This has also significantly affected ESPES program to deliver services as it has affected movement of experts to perform their duties. In addition, the internal displacement of people as a result of conflicts in different parts of the country has forced the government to divert budget that could have been used for improving the delivery of basic services.

Regarding conflicts and conflict resolution mechanisms, The Proclamation No. 1097/2018 Article 13 (1g), which specifies the powers and duties of the federal ministries has given a mandate to Ministry of Peace to, “identify factors serving as causes of conflicts among communities; submit a study proposing recommendations to keep communities away from conflicts and instability, and implement same upon approval”. As a result, in most parts of the country where conflicts erupted, the formal and informal institutions with the support of the MOP and in collaboration with the regional and federal security forces helped in resolving the conflicts. This helped to resume most activities, including of projects.

4.5. Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM)

The ESPES has supported the establishment and running of the national GRM. All regional governments have established their respective GRM structures down to woreda level with focal points located in the Kebeles. At kebele level, GRM committee members are drawn from kebele administration, teachers, DAs, HEWs, and the community. At woreda level, it is composed of representatives from the local administration, education, health, women and child affairs, and the community. The reporting structure starts from the woreda by the assigned GRM officers reporting to the woreda administrator, who in turn submits regular consolidated reports to the GRM office at the regional level. The head of the regional GRM office is accountable to the regional presidents and also provides regionally consolidated reports to the EIO.

In Somali region, the Grievance and Compliance Redress Commission was organized as a Commission in 2013. However, recently, the regional government revisited the structure and maintained a similar structure with other regions. With regard to working documents, except Gambella and Afar, all regions have laws that enforces the implementation of GRM.

By and large, the grievances reported so far are related to land issues. For example, in rural roads construction, conflicts arise between road projects and local communities. This is mainly due to amount of compensation and delay in compensation payments. As a result, delay in project completion is frequently observed. Such kind of cases are handled through continuous consultation, awareness creation, negotiation with community and revising the compensation. However, the government encounters budget constraint when trying to compensate affected individuals. Therefore, addressing grievances related to land has an influence on the implementation of ESM.

GRM can also have relevance in handling complaints that arise due to the implementation of ESPES. One example, which was mentioned by participants from the MOE is related to complaint that arose in relation to capacity building provided to special support receiving woredas from MOE (selected as the bottom 20%). The woredas neighboring the special support receiving woredas specially complained for not being included in the capacity building activities. However, in order to minimize the complaints the ministry included non-special support woredas while conducting capacity building trainings to reduce the complaint. Furthermore, an attempt to start a pilot school feeding program was dropped due to fear of backlash from related to equity issue. This kind of conflict could have been handled by the GRM committee operating in the woredas.

With regard to changes that has happened after 2017 in relation to institutional issues and capacity building, the following were observed:

- Job Evaluation and Grading (JEG) assessment was carried out for all regions. Based on this, positions were identified and filled.
- Logistics including desk top computers, laptops were distributed to all regions.
- Exposure visit were organized for better performing regions and they were sent to visit best practices abroad.
- Capacity building was given to regional and woreda GRM office staff on prevention and investigation of conflict.

Two studies on grievance hearing and redress mechanism were also conducted in 2015 and 2016. Based on the study result, a draft procedural manual was prepared. Public consultation on the draft procedural manual was conducted at different forums in the different regions except Amhara and Addis Ababa. The public consultations for Amhara region and Addis Ababa will commence soon.

In order to enable GRM to be more effective in the ESPES program, recommendations or suggestions made by GRM committee's should be implemented by the leadership of the organizations. Furthermore, there is a need for GRM to enter into mediation and arbitration levels of conflict resolution. Therefore, staff and the leadership should be given capacity building to enable them perform these tasks

4.6. Public Participation/Consultation

Community participation is required at all stages of the project cycle including planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation. All parts of the community groups should be involved and their opinions should be taken in to consideration without overlooking inclusiveness and at the appropriate time.

Basic service providers: Health, Education, Agriculture, Rural Roads and Water conduct community consultation at project level using general as well as sectoral guidelines. At woreda and kebele level demands arise from community or the government initiates projects. Experts consult the community to understand and identify the priority needs, interests and concerns. Moreover, they also conduct technical assessment in relation to the appropriateness of the proposed site. However, several community consultations were not conducted due to urgency to start implementation and logistical challenges. For example, key informant from Oromia Rural

Roads Authority mentioned that most consultation processes were inclusive but sometimes due to time constraints, key stakeholders were skipped.

In Somali region, score cards are used to measure communities' satisfaction with services provided through health extension system. The cards show three satisfaction levels excellent, medium and low. This has increased communities participation in evaluating public services.

In Somali region, EIA and One WASH guidelines are used by regional bureaus to conduct public participation for bigger projects which are within the jurisdiction of the bureau. For roads, they use a guideline developed by ERA. Learning from the Financial Transparency and Accountability (FTA-SA) practices, and supported by agricultural/environment desk, the contacted woredas have strengthened their community engagement processes. Community Mobilization Guideline is being revised by the Regional Agricultural and Natural Resources Development Bureau.

In Gambella, as there is a perception that land is not a scarce resource in the region, community consultation on land acquisition is taken lightly. Most of the times it refers to identifying preferred site by the community.

EFCCC, in 2020, prepared a Public Consultation Guideline aimed at harmonizing the public consultations process currently being practiced by different sectors. However, the implementation is yet to be started.

5. Conclusion, Recommendations and Program Action Plans (PAP)

5.1. Conclusion

The review and revision of Policies, Proclamations, Regulations, Roadmaps, Development Plans, Strategies, and Guidelines as part of the new reform has given more scope and room for implementation of environmental and social management in sectoral as well as oversight bodies.

In relation to the practical implementation of environmental and social management issues, the following were observed:

- Vertical coordination between the federal and regional oversight bodies has improved. They now meet annually to prepare joint plans and bi-annually to review implementation.
- All basic sectors who have projects have assigned safeguards experts for project execution
- In some federal ministries, directorate responsible for safeguard issues were established, for example, in the MOA, a directorate of Environment and Climate Change Coordination

5.2. Recommendations

Despite the above positive developments in ESM implementations, there are still areas that require further attention:

- The enforcement and application of the policies and proclamations should be strengthened by developing or preparing appropriate enforcement laws, regulations and directives
- EFCCC, MOLSA, MOWCY should collaborate on environmental and social related issues.

- Develop a Capacity Building Plan for improved environmental and social management in the basic sectors in a participatory manner involving all stakeholders. The Plan should be informed by the ESIA capacity assessment and the ESMS OM.
- Strengthening vertical and horizontal linkages between environmental and social oversight institutions and basic sectors; and
- Establishing and strengthening information, communication and data management system.

5.3. DLIs and DLRs

DLIs

The DLI, *improved environmental and social management capacity at woreda level*, remains relevant because improvement in ESMC at local level is still a key indicator for enhanced environmental and social safeguards.

DLRs

1. 100 woredas have ESIA system in place (system in place means that there is an institutional setup with human resources (safeguards personnel) and vets projects for their environmental and social impacts)
2. Minimum of 300 health professionals receive Training-of-Trainers conducted in 10 regions and 2 city administration on new Gender Based Violence (GBV) Strategy under the Ministry of Health

5.4. Program Action Plan (PAP)

The following actions are agreed:

Table 2: Program Action Plan

Action	Timeframe	Responsibility
<p>Strengthen coordination between basic service sectors and oversight bodies on environmental and social management:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Annual forums organized by EFCCC to review progress of implementation of agreed actions at federal level with participation from regions(Basic Sector offices send report on E & S performance biannually and annually to EFCCC based on agreed template, the annual forum proceeding will be documented and shared to the participants by the EFCCC) 	2 nd AF Years	EFCC/Regional environmental protection agencies

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bi-annual meeting and progress of agreed action by environment and social oversight bodies organized by EFCCC; 		
Strengthen the Social Accountability Unit in COPCD with fulltime Environment and Social Safeguards Specialists to oversee E & S implementation	2 nd AF Year 1	COPCD/MOF

6. Consultation

The Addendum to ESSA consultation workshop aimed at reviewing federal, regional and woreda findings and enriching the draft report was held virtually via Zoom meeting on April 1, 2021. The draft report was prepared based on assessments in the four regions using telephone interviews and email exchanges, desk review of relevant documents and related studies and consultation with relevant federal and regional sector bureaus. The key findings and conclusions of the report were presented during the virtual workshop with a view to solicit comments and inputs from the participants. Twelve participants drawn from the Ministry of Finance, EFCCC, and the basic sectors ministries attended the virtual meeting.

The following were some of the questions and comments reflected during the meeting:

- How much is the system is functioning from the federal down the woreda levels?
- Do we have communications between the different levels from federal to woreda?
- How is the awareness of decision makers regarding environmental and social system?
- How can the inadequacy of human resource be tackled and how can this be supported with planning and budget?
- Do we have coordination between oversight bodies?

In response to the above questions and comments, the following explanations were made:

- Most of the questions related to human resources, coordination, and budget are still challenges. The ESPES is supporting in building capacities through training and provision of equipment under the IPF component. EFCCC and MOF have to explore on how to strengthen the ESM at all levels by addressing the human resources and budget issues.
- There is an improvement in coordination with establishment of Safeguards Technical Working Group for the basic sectors and oversight bodies chaired by EFCCC. It was discontinued due to the COVID-19 pandemic, but it be reactivated going forward. The annual forums have to be reactivated and provide a platform for ESM coordination.

At last, the participants commended the findings, conclusions and recommendations of the Addendum to ESSA. After deliberations and agreement on the suggested changes to the proposed actions in the PAP, the virtual workshop endorsed the Addendum to ESSA.

7. Summary of key findings from the four regions against OP/BP 9.00 Core Principles

Table 3. Summary of key findings from the assessment in the federal offices and regions (Afar, Benshangul-Gumuz, Somali and Gambella regional states) and areas for strengthening the E&S system in relation to OP/BP 9.00 Core Principles

Core principle 1: General principles of Environmental and Social Management

Current System

- The country is under a major reform process. As a result, most basic sector as well as oversight offices have revised their proclamations, regulations, and guidelines to address the issue of ESM in better ways.
- The general awareness about on environmental and social management has improved. This is specially observed in sectoral offices which have projects. However, there is limited coordination and cooperation between project safeguard units and the regular programs.
- Safeguards units are organized differently in different regions. It is either organized as bureau, authority or agency. This affects the amount of budget allotted and organizational structure allowed by the civil service for the offices. Mostly, the preferred institutional arrangement to be organized is bureau as it entails regional cabinet membership which has better chance to influence the regional leadership.

Area for Strengthening system

- The next step in utilizing the revised ESM documents, which include proclamations, regulations, and guidelines will be creating awareness and adapting them to suit the regional contexts.
- Create mechanism to utilize safeguards staff assigned in projects to support ESM activities in regular programs of sectoral offices.
- Strengthen regional and woreda level sectoral safeguards units, filling vacant positions and building their capacity. In addition, reduce the effect of knowledge loss due to turnover by introducing a self-learning CD.
- Build a system to increase cross sectoral collaboration and support. This could be supported by mechanism of accountability, which has reward and penalty.
- Convince regions to elevate regional safeguards offices that are below bureau level so that they have better voice and capacity to implement ESM.

Core principle 2: Natural Habitats and Physical and Cultural Resources

Current system

- In relation to Natural Habitats and Physical Cultural Resources, there has been a positive development. In line with this, EFCCC has prepared Integrated Risk Management Guideline in 2020 in order to complement the existing ESIA guideline. The guideline recommends ESIA to consider additionally the assessment of impact that may happen as a result of climate change ecosystem restoration and disaster. As this will widen

Area for Strengthening system

- There is frequent turnover at all levels including leadership and experts. Therefore, to fill the knowledge gap and bring them at speed continuous awareness creation on the issue of managing the natural resources as well as physical cultural resources is still required.

the scope of the ESIA, it will help the ESM to consider the issue of this core principle.

- In addition, the ten years agricultural plan mentions that natural resources will be developed taking into consideration the different agro-ecologies and watersheds.
- Regions differ on the kind of attention given and knowledge they have about natural resources, including relevance of ESIA for natural resources management. Regions with pastoral community and vast stretch of lands give less attention to natural resource management compared to the other ones. In addition, accessibility is a challenge to develop the natural resource due to the size of the pastoralist regions coupled with inadequate road network.
- In order to carry out the identification/inventory of natural habitat and cultural resources including pastoralist cultures, it would be good to build skill and knowledge.
- As most of the natural resources sites are scattered and inaccessible, developing information database and early warning system to protect them would be useful.

Core principle 3: Public and Worker Safety

Current system

- The health and health related regulatory function has different structures in different regions. In some regions, it is a separate authority and in others, it is structured under the health bureau. The institutional arrangement, which is under the regional health bureau, has made it to be less stringent when it comes to supervision of public health and health related facilities.

Area for Strengthening system

- Explain and convince leadership to understand the need to separate implementation and regulatory offices.
- Awareness creation should refocus on the public and leadership and include all sectors;
- Skill and knowledge development to proactively guide practices;

Core principle 4: Land Acquisition

Current system

- Though there is no direct project intervention through the support of ESPES, there could be land acquisition related to Program interventions that derives from involvement of the sectors supported by ESPES basic sectors that might require land for infrastructural development, including facilities. In such instances, the woreda administration is expected to provide land for the infrastructural development and replacement. If replacement land is not

Area for Strengthening system

- Urgent attention is required to prepare and implement directives and guidelines at regions and City councils levels to smoothly implement the newly enacted proclamation and regulation on land expropriation, compensation and resettlement.
- Strengthen GRM to extend its scope and coverage into issues of land expropriation, compensation and resettlement.

available, it can be treated under the Country's proclamation No.1161/2019 article 1(1) and Regulation No. 472/2020 that states landholding expropriation for public purposes is compensated and a payment is supposed to be made either in cash or in kind.

- Communities which provide land for Roads and other constructions contractors are compensated by contractors. This could be by constructing schools and water facilities to the affected community

-

Core principle 5: Vulnerable Groups

Current system

Even though stakeholders during ESSA consultations could not inform the presence of Gender Based Violence (GBV), the DHS (2016) study in the four regions consulted for this assessment revealed the existence of GBV and requires awareness creation during Program implementation.

- Awareness to engage vulnerable groups (including women, children, elderly &PWD) has improved; examples include: Female members are included in committees at kebele levels
- FTA- SA practice has opened opportunities for dialogue/discussion with marginalized groups, disabled and elderly at woreda levels;
- Organizing elders and PWDs and supporting them through income generating activities.
- Implementation of GBV prevention guidelines and strategies of Ministry of Health as well as strengthening the health sector GBV response mechanism remain critical

Area for Strengthening system

- Recognize and refer grievances related to GBV to respective service providers based on the demands of survivors and without forgetting confidentiality.
- Ensure GBV related grievances are handled by the Woreda Women Children and Youth Affairs Office or female GBV focal points who have the knowledge and skill to provide basic referrals.
- Establish GBV sensitive channels for reporting and making certain the availability of an effective GRM involving multiple channels at federal, regional and woreda levels.
- Strengthen FTA- SA practice to cover more districts and kebeles;
- Strengthen awareness on the benefit of women's involvement in development
- Support women's empowerment through skill and knowledge development
- Implement the GBV prevention guidelines and strategies
- Health sector GBV risk prevention mechanism needs to be improved.

Core Principle 6: Social Conflict

Current system

Area for Strengthening system

- Ethiopia experienced various internal conflicts in different parts of the country. This include; parts of Oromia, Somali, Sidama, Amhara, SNNP, Benishangul Gumuz and Tigray. Due to security problems, for instance, in West Oromia, Guji, and in other parts of the country, projects as well as regular government activities related to basic services including ESPES were interrupted.
- Internal displacement of people as a result of conflicts in different parts of the country has forced the government to divert budget that could have been used for basic services.
- In most parts of the country where conflicts erupted, the formal and informal institutions with the support of the MOP and in collaboration with the regional and federal security forces helped in resolving the conflicts. This helped to immediately resume most activities, including projects.
- Strengthen the useful experiences in resolving the recently observed social conflicts through blending the formal and informal institutions.
- Document good practices that were used to resolve conflicts with collaboration of the local communities and the government operating at different levels.
- Organize awareness and consult with the community to help them understand the relationship of conflicts and project delays.

References

- Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Ministry of Finance & Economic Development (MOFED), Studying the Grievance Hearing and Redress at Federal, Regional and Local Levels in Ethiopia, study conducted by IPE GLOBAL PRIVATE LIMITED
- Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Ministry of Health (2020), Health Sector Transformation Plan II 2020/21-2024/25, Ministry of Health, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
- Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Ministry of Women, Children and Youth, Ten Years Indicative Development Plan (2013-2022)
- Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Planning and Development Commission, 10 Years Development Plan, A pathway to Prosperity (2021-2030)
- Federal Negarit Gazette of Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (2020), Expropriation and Valuation, Compensation and Resettlement Council of Ministers Regulation No. 472/2020, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
- Federal Negarit Gazette of Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (2018), A Proclamation To Provide For The Definition Of The Powers And Duties Of The Executive Organs Of The Federal Democratic Republic Of Ethiopia, Proclamation No.1097/2018, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
- Ministry of Health (2020), Realizing Universal Health Coverage through Primary Healthcare: A Roadmap for Optimizing the Ethiopian Health Extension Program (2020 – 2035), Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
- MOA (2020), 10 Years Agricultural Indicative Development Plan, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

Annex 1: Lists of Participants for Addendum to ESSA for ESPES (Federal, Regional and Woreda Levels)

No	Name	Administrative Level	Institution	Position	Phone No.	Email Address
1	Melaku Kifle	Federal	MOF	Senior Program Management Specialist & Consultant Channel One Programs Coordinating Directorate	0911124249	melakukifle2004@yahoo.com
2	Demile Yismaw	Federal	MOF	Sr. Social Protection Specialist Channel One Programs Coordinating Directorate	0911397784	demileyismaw@yahoo.com
3	Abayneh	Federal	MOA	Focal person, planning directorate	0911533204	abakalu@gmail.com
4	Addis Negash	Federal	MOA	Environment and Social Safeguards Team Leader	0911023263	negash.addis@gmail.com
5	Abinet Mengistu	Federal	MOA	Public Work Coordination Unit Coordinator	0911701783	Abmengistu2003@gmail.com
6	Mulatu Abebe	Federal	MOA	Small-scale Irrigation Development Directorate,	0943040387	Mulatuabebe1@gmail.com

7	Shiferaw Negash	Federal	EFCCC	Senior Irrigation and Drainage Engineer General Director, Environmental and Social Impact Assessment Directorate	0911936802	shifeabbagada@gmail.com
8	Tolessa Yadessa	Federa	EFCCC	Director, Environmental and Social Impact Assessment Directorate	0913754227	Tyterfa2011@gmail.com
9	Getahun Desalgn	Federal	MOE	Focal person, planning	0911566975	Getahundesalegn737@gmail.com
10	Tesfahun Belay	Federal	MOE	Focal person	0911835102	tesfaeyosias@gmail.com
11	Mesfine Kebede	Federal	MOH	Partnership and Cooperation Directorate, Assistant director	0913464510	mesfine.kebede@moh.gov.et
12	Enawgaw Alemayhu	Federal	MOH	Youth Case Team Leader, WCY directorate	0910602033	Enawgawalemayhu2013@gmail.com
13	Nigussie Lemma	Federal	MOH	Health System Strengthen directorate	0936239730	Nigussie.lemma@mo.gov.et
14	Andargie Abie	Federal	MOH	Senior Health financing advisor,	0967131921	Andarge.abie@moh.gov.et
15	Jamal Mohammed	Federal	MOH	Health and Health related inspection regulation directorate	0913367442	Jamalmohammed14@gmail.com

16	Samuel Kebede	Federal	MOH	Director of Infrastructure expert		
17	Tesfahun Belay	Federal	MOE	Focal person	0911835102	tesfaeyosias@gmail.com
18	Feleke Jembere	Federal	MOLSA	Director, Social welfare development promotion directorate	0911897179	
19	Elsabet Geto	Federal	Ethiopian Institution of Ombudsman		0993657618	elsabetgeto6@gmail.com
20	Deneke Shanko	Federal	Ethiopian Institution of Ombudsman		0911682201	
21	Agash Asmamaw	Federal	WDC		0911418736	
22	Shewanesh Demeku	Federal	WDC		0911875771	
23	Zebidar Alem	Federal	WDC	Environment, Social and Climate Change	0947372172	
24	Elsabet Geto	Federal	Ethiopian Institution of Ombudsman		0993657618	elsabetgeto6@gmail.com
25	Solomon Tesfasilassie	Federal	PDO	M&E Director	0911904620	solomontesfasilassie@gmail.com
26	Fassikaw	Federal	ACSO	Deputy director	0944307311	fassikaw@gmail.com
27	Mahamud Yesuf	Region	Somali Region	Channel One Program Coordinator	0913832288	mahamudmaelin@gmail.com
28	Tesfaye Gemechu	Region	Oromia Region	Channel One Program Coordinator	0911866629	Tesfayegemechu830@gmail.com
29	Obong Oboya	Region	Gambella Region	Channel One Program Coordinator	0917907908	obongoboya@yahoo.com

30	Tarekegne Nuramo	Region	SNNP	Channel One Program Coordinator	0911711527	tareknnuramo@yahoo.com
31	Sadik	Region	Somali Region	Bureau of Agriculture	0911977798	
32	Abebe Gizachew	Region	Oromia Region	Road Rights expert	0912745703	
33	Ahmed Mohamed Usman	Region	Somali Region	Regional office of Education, Social and Environment Safe guard Officer	0915745442	Camarhadi@gmail.com
34	Mohamed Aynale Hassen	Region	Somali Region	Bureau of Health, Planning, Policy Monitoring and Evaluation Director	0910484566	ayanle5710@gmail.com
35	Wardi Abdulacif	Region	Somali region, BOWCY	Panning, Monitoring and Evaluation Director		
36	Nimo Yusuf	Region	Somali region, BOLSA	Social Development Director		
37	Ahmed Adem	Region	Somali region, Environment	Environment Assessment Expert		
38	Tesfaye Tesfahun	Region	SNNP, Bureau of Education	ESM Expert	911923372	
39	Bogale	Region	SNNP, Agriculture			
40	Shimels	Region	SNNP, Bureau of Health	Health and Health related Product Quality team leader	911052342	
41	Belayneh Banja	Region	SNNNP, BOLSA		949613977	
42	Wudneh	Region	SNNP, Environment			

43	Dereje Mekonen	Region	Oromia region, Education	General Education Quality Improvement Program for equity GEQIP-E Director		
44	Elias Kedir	Region	Oromia	Agriculture and Natural resource bureau		
45	Motuma hirko	Region	Oromia	Agriculture and Natural resource bureau	0911871131	motumahirko@gmail.com
46	Olieck Omodo	Woreda	Gambela Finance Office, GOG woreda	Planning and Program team leader	0917483040	
47	Damot Woiide	Woreda	SNNP Finance Office, Dugoma Soloso	Office leader		
48	Mohammad	Woreda	Somali region	Gursum woreda	0913421410	