

ICR Review  
Operations Evaluation Department

## 1. Project Data :

OEDID:  
OEDID : L3010  
Project ID : P006842  
Project Name : Second Subsector Project for Primary Education  
Country : Colombia  
Sector : Education Adjustment  
L/C Number : L3010-CO`  
Partners involved : None  
Prepared by : Rebecca Macina, OEDST  
Reviewed by : Linda Ankrah Dove  
Group Manager : Gregory Ingram  
Date Posted : 04/21/1999

2. Project Objectives, Financing, Costs and Components :  
In line with government decentralization, the project would :

Strengthen resource management and mobilization in the education sector .  
Raise the quality of education while expanding access to all school -aged children.

## Objectives :

- a. Restrict the appointment of new teachers and strengthen incentives to relocate surplus teachers to rural areas.
- b. Raise the share of non-personnel inputs in recurrent expenditures .
- c. Introduce automatic promotion in an attempt to reduce repetition, dropout, and average cost per graduate .
- d. Increase investments in primary education and direct the largest share to schools in disadvantaged rural areas.
- e. Encourage local contributions to finance civil works .

## Components::

## Policy

- a. Improve the efficiency of use of existing teachers .  
--Transfer teachers from urban areas with excess to rural .  
--Initiate and finance special incentives (housing loans, family health insurance )
- b. Reduce expenditure per primary school graduate .  
--Adopt an automatic promotion policy .
- c. Encourage and increase local contributions to the financing of primary education under the investment program.

## Management

- d. Develop management capacity.

- Fully introduce the key elements of the new Ministry of Education information system .
- Develop budgeting and financial management capacity .
- Finance selected sector studies and the preparation of future education projects .

#### Primary Education

##### e. Improve educational quality.

--Introduce (or complete introduction) of the Escuela Nueva in rural schools enrolling about 800,000 children.

--Provide student learning guides, teacher's manuals, and school libraries specifically designed to support

Escuela Nueva curriculum for 4,000 schools.

--Provide financing for replacement student and teaching materials for 25,000 schools.

□ Provide in-service training to orient existing teachers toward Escuela Nueva . (20,000 rural teachers).

--Provide textbooks, classroom materials and related teacher training for public schools in marginal urban

areas.

--Finance 3.3 million textbooks, train 6,500 teachers, and provide materials for 30,000 classrooms.

--Introduce systematic educational testing .

##### F. Improve Access.

--Raise the participation rate of rural, school aged children from 70% to 90%.

--Raise completion rate from 20% to 60%.

--Provide basic furniture for about 13,000 unfurnished schools and rehabilitate dilapidated classrooms

##### G. Test delivery systems for providing education beyond grade 5 for rural youth.

Costs. Appraisal estimate: \$169.0 million

Actual: \$220.9 million

### 3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives :

The ICR stated that the project achieved significant progress in increasing access and enhancing the quality of

primary education but it was hindered by the poor quality of supporting data in substantiating this claim.

Public

school enrollment grew from 2.7 million in 1989 to 3.5 million by 1994, a 30% increase over a targeted 20%.

Furniture and books were provided to students and teachers . Students whose schools received furniture and other

quality inputs gained higher test scores . The design and application of a student achievement instrument was a

significant result. Urban scores proved higher in math and science and rural scores were higher in values education .

About 60% of textbooks and 56% of furniture went to rural areas. Teacher relocation was carried out, though with

difficulty, and it is unknown if targets (5,000 to rural areas, 3,000 to urban areas) were met. Teachers were trained

but the number trained is uncertain . The ICR states in various places that 105,300 teachers were trained; that some

type of training reached 50%; and that 6,500 urban teachers were trained by 1990 and 10,500 rural teachers by

1991. Automatic promotion was introduced but not fully adopted . Primary education's share of investment

expenditures rose from 1.7 to 2.8%. Increased mobilization of funds for education was achieved at both

national and local levels. The share of non-personnel expenditures in recurrent expenditures rose to 9%. The ICR does not clarify how far this was a result of the project or other factors but indicates uncertainty about whether financial support from the central level which is essential to sustain quality improvements will be forthcoming now that local authorities are responsible for school operations . The project achieved these results in a difficult context including constitutional and government changes and increasing violence .

4. Significant Achievements :

Pogress was achieved in establishing local capacities for managing schools although the framework for decentralization was not yet fully developed .

5. Significant Shortcomings :

The General Accounting Office of Colombia in 1991 revealed deficiencies in loan administration, particularly in planning, contracting, and communication with project executing entities . High turnover of Ministry of Education management and technical staff hindered project implementation . Overall project management was complex and weak in the early years, though it improved later . The ICR states that Bank supervision focused more on financial, administrative, and management aspects than on educational improvement but could provide only limited help in redressing problems of adequate technical and administrative inherent in the project .

The establishment of an integrated information system was covenanted but the project failed to establish the links between local and central systems and could not adequately monitor project activities and results . Some of the initial indicators became inappropriate as the system changed but neither the Bank nor the borrower thought to revise them. Drop-out and repetition rates remained unsatisfactory despite the automatic promotion policy and indicators for completion rates are not available . Thus, the extent cost-effectiveness and efficiency are unknown .

Disputes on the Escuela Nueva concept, a key innovation that the project anticipated would be applied nationally, prevented the spread of its curricular and pedagogical innovations . Teacher training was not consolidated into a cohesive program and no new teacher training policy emerged . The effect of teacher training on teacher practices and effectiveness was not evaluated . The number of teachers who received incentives to relocate from urban to rural areas and who actually relocated are not given in the ICR, though some municipalities did take initiative to hire their own teachers.

|   |   |  |
|---|---|--|
| <p>□6. Ratings :</p> <p>Outcome : Satisfactory</p> <p>Institutional Dev .: Partial</p> <p>Sustainability : Likely</p> | <p>ICR</p> <p>OED Review</p> <p>Marginally Unsatisfactory</p> <p>Modest Uncertain</p> | <p>Reason for Disagreement /Comments</p> <p>Some improvements in enrollments, quality and resource mobilization were achieved but objectives in resource management were not.</p> <p>The ICR raises the concern that the</p> |
|---|---|--|

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <p>Bank Performance : Satisfactory<br/>in</p> | <p>necessary investments per student may not be sustainable. The likelihood of sound planning and management of the system is uncertain because of the inadequate information available to decision makers. It is unclear how far the Escuela Nueva innovation may not be adopted as the paramount organizing principle for school management and teacher training,.</p> <p>Unsatisfactory      At entry, the project was too complex</p>  |
| <p>Borrower Perf .: Satisfactory</p>          | <p>design and unready for implementation . The Bank underestimated the contextual challenges, over-estimated management capacities, and exaggerated the degree of consensus on the Escuela Nueva and the ease with which incentives would encourage teacher redeployment in the absence of social analysis . Supervision, though demonstrating perseverance and flexibility, was unable to redress design defects. Needed revisions to indicators were left undone, resulting in problems for the ICR in measuring results.</p> <p>Unsatisfactory      Because of the country-wide situation, the borrower failed to provide the enabling environment for successful implementation and efficient use of funds until later in the project.</p> |
| <p>Quality of ICR :</p>                       | <p>Unsatisfactory</p>  |

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability :  
ICR

Innovative and effective educational concepts and programs may be difficult to implement broadly unless adequate attention is paid to the political dimensions of change that impinge on educational policy making, such as urban -rural school differences and poor versus middle -class students.

Monitoring performance in coordination with representatives of participating national and sub -national entities is crucial for effective project implementation . In a decentralized context, a basic monitoring and auditing system is essential to provision of timely assistance to local authorities .

OED

When the education sector is challenged by a changing governance framework, civic upheaval and weak institutional capacities, projects need to be modest in objectives for achieving sector -wide reforms and the adoption of innovations . Extra care is needed in implementing ambitious sector programs to ensure that investment funds will be used efficiently and effectively and that responsibilities for monitoring expenditures and results are clear .

8. Audit Recommended?      Yes    No

Why? Follow-up on cost-efficiency and development outcomes, to be evaluated in a cluster audit .  
Potential lessons for sector results -based management to be explored .

9. Comments on Quality of ICR :

The ICR attempts to cover the experience of a complex operation fully and to convince the reader that overall

outcomes were satisfactory but, hampered by lack of hard evidence, it contains some contradictory information

which it fails to reconcile and some ambiguities which it fails to clarify .