



1. Project Data:		Date Posted : 06/17/2002	
PROJ ID: P000948		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name: Educ/voc.trng	Project Costs (US\$M)	12.4	8.6
Country: Ghana	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	9.6	7.9
Sector(s): Board: SP - Vocational training (77%), Central government administration (23%)	Cofinancing (US\$M)	00	00
L/C Number: C2695; CP898			
	Board Approval (FY)		95
Partners involved :	Closing Date	06/30/2001	06/30/2001
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group:
Lenor Armstrong	Ridley Nelson	Alain A. Barbu	OEDST

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives

The project was prepared to support the Government of Ghana in developing the informal sector through training, and providing an enabling environment for employment creation and income generation in the micro and small enterprise sector. Objectives were:(i) redirect the focus of both public and private vocational training institutions towards the provision of short, focused, practical, competency-based, demand-driven training for people already in employment; (ii) improve informal sector product quality and productivity in five selected occupational areas; (iii) and ensure that an institutional capacity is created that will ensure that Government has access to regular labor force employment, and earnings data that will enable it to make rational decisions as to the types of training that should be supported. However, objectives were restated in terms of the number, wording, and focus in the Staff Appraisal Report annex 5-1, which also provides performance indicators. The re-stated objectives were:(a) improve the capacity of private and public training institutions to run short competency-based training programs; (b) improve the level of technical/ entrepreneurial skills of master craftsmen and apprentices in the informal sector; (c) help create new businesses and small informal sector enterprises; (d) improve the level of technical/ entrepreneurial skills of master craftsmen and apprentices in the informal sector. The inconsistencies in defining the objectives and lack of clarity may have had a negative impact on performance.

b. Components

The components were: (a) apprentice training; (b) training of master craftsmen; (c) financing the training; (d) support to apprentices and masters; (e) training program development; (f) training of instructors; (g) institutional strengthening of the National Council for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (NACVET); (h) tracer studies; and (i) the establishment of a dynamic labor market data system.

c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates

The project was estimated to cost US\$12.4m, to be financed by an IDA Credit of US\$ 9.6m (77.4 % of the total); Government's contribution, US\$0.9m (7.3%) and beneficiary trainees US\$1.9m (15.3%). At the closing date (June 30, 2001) US\$ 7.9m (82%) of the Credit had been disbursed, and a total of \$US0.69 (25%) of the estimated Government and trainees 'contribution was expended. Counterpart funding was inadequate, and there were delays in its provision throughout implementation

3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:

Project objectives were not stated precisely, consistently or concisely. Project performance indicators were not put into operation and no detailed information was collected, thus making assessment more difficult. With respect to improved capacity of the vocational and training institutions, from the standpoint of the re-stated objective, the institutions have demonstrated improvement in their capacity to deliver short, focused, practical, competency based , demand-driven training, albeit with shortages of instructional staff, limited consumables and without the necessary rehabilitation in 15 of the institutions. However, the desired shift in focus, has not yet taken place, nor is there evidence that the project design included the necessary activities to redirect the focus of the institutions towards the type of training program developed and implemented. Numbers in excess of revised targets were trained. No independent evaluation of the training was undertaken; however, beneficiaries, and supervisory masters reported satisfaction with the training. Regarding product quality and productivity, based on exhibitions mounted, master craftsmen appear better equipped to manufacture a wider variety of products, and both trainees and master craftsmen acquired a wider range of competencies. The impact of training should be monitored closely during the operational phase, since as yet, there is no available evidence that the skill improvements have made an impact on product quality in the informal sector, a key element of the stated objective. The project did not succeed in strengthening NACVET for sustainability. Although base line data on the informal sector are now available; the capacity, in terms of staff and equipment for conducting tracer studies was developed, and 3 studies successfully conducted; staff has not been retained. With respect to the creation of new businesses and small informal sector enterprises, the inadequacies in project design (e.g., lack of access to start up credit, land and post training support) precluded success.

4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:

Despite the significant shortcomings in project design, the unacceptable quality of the project at entry, and implementation delays, delivery of training was significant, in relation to the revised targets: 14,565 (97%) apprentices, and 5,434 (121%) masters received technical training, and 7,666 (170%) masters benefited from entrepreneurship training. The capacity for conducting tracer studies has been enhanced and now includes control groups from the informal sector, and products of formal vocational training programs. Data on the informal sector are now included in the Ministry of Manpower Development's Employment Market Reports.

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):

There were severe weaknesses in the planning, preparation and design of this project which contributed significantly to negative implementation impacts and outcomes. The lack of an appropriate policy framework and systems, unresolved conflicts between the major implementation institutions (Ministry of Education and Ministry of Employment and Social Welfare), and inadequacies in the key agency the National Council for Technical and Vocational Education and Training contributed to implementation and management problems. The tool kit sub-component, estimated at 51% of the project financing at appraisal, was poorly conceived and managed, resulting in loss of kits. At the close of the project, the majority remained unsold, and revenue lost. Only tools for dressmaking and tailoring were purchased in large quantities. Counterpart funding arrangements were unsatisfactory. It was estimated that government and beneficiary trainee contributions would be 22.6% of project costs, but these only amounted to 8%.

6. Ratings :	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome :	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	
Institutional Dev .:	Negligible	Negligible	There was some improvements in capacity for undertaking tracer studies, monitoring the informal sector as well as delivery of competency based training .
Sustainability :	Unlikely	Unlikely	
Bank Performance :	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	
Borrower Perf .:	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	
Quality of ICR :		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

- Ambiguous, inconsistent and unrealistic objectives coupled with poor project design often leads to implementation difficulties and inadequate outcomes.
- To prepare a project adequately, the institutional capacity and the ability of various institutions to work among themselves must be assessed. Project design should make adequate provision for institutional capacity support, especially in the initial phase
- Performance indicators should have clear operational definitions and specify data requirements
- The establishment of asset management systems at start-up is a fundamental requirement for projects which include large quantities of motor vehicles and equipment. Otherwise, theft and losses may occur.
- Project supervision must move beyond focus on implementation issues; it must focus on the measures necessary for positive outcomes, attainment of development goals, and sustainability.

8. Assessment Recommended? Yes No

Why? The vocational training and informal sector has been unaudited for many years . There is therefore need for more detailed analysis to avoid the problems encountered .

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The ICR is comprehensive and provides adequate justification for the conclusions reached. However, it might have been enhanced by more complete annexes such as the assessment of performance.