IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION AND RESULTS REPORT
(IBRD-80200)

ON A
DEVELOPMENT POLICY LOAN
IN THE AMOUNT OF EURO 100 MILLION
(US$ 136.7 MILLION EQUIVALENT)
TO THE
KINGDOM OF MOROCCO
IN SUPPORT OF
THE URBAN TRANSPORT SECTOR

June 27, 2012

Sustainable Development Department
Middle East and North Africa Region
CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(Exchange Rate Effective as of December 31, 2011)
Currency Unit = Moroccan Dirham (MAD)
MAD 1.00 = US$0.1163
US$1.00 = MAD 8.598

MOROCCO GOVERNMENT FISCAL YEAR
January 1 – December 31

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AFD</td>
<td>Agence Française de Développement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AODU</td>
<td>Agence Organisatrice des Déplacements Urbains</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRT</td>
<td>Bus Rapid Transit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNDU</td>
<td>Commission Nationale des Déplacements Urbains</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPS</td>
<td>Country Partnership Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Civil Society Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DDUT</td>
<td>Division des Déplacements Urbains et du Transport</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DGCL</td>
<td>Direction Générale des Collectivités Locales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPE</td>
<td>Division de la Planification et de l’Equipement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPL</td>
<td>Development Policy Loan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHG</td>
<td>Greenhouse Gas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFC</td>
<td>International Finance Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDO</td>
<td>Policy Development Objective</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Vice President:  Inger Andersen
Country Director:  Simon Gray
Sector Manager:  Patricia Veevers-Carter
Task Team Leader:  Jean-Charles Crochet
ICR Team Leader:  Ziad Nakat
# KINGDOM OF MOROCCO

Urban Transport Sector DPL

## CONTENTS

- **Data Sheet**
  - A. Basic Information
  - B. Key Dates
  - C. Ratings Summary
  - D. Sector and Theme Codes
  - E. Bank Staff
  - F. Results Framework Analysis
  - G. Ratings of Program Performance in ISRs
  - H. Restructuring

1. Program Context, Development Objectives and Design ........................................ 1
2. Key Factors Affecting Implementation and Outcomes ............................................. 6
3. Assessment of Outcomes ......................................................................................... 10
4. Assessment of Risk to Development Outcome ....................................................... 22
5. Assessment of Bank and Borrower Performance ...................................................... 24
6. Lessons Learned ....................................................................................................... 26
7. Comments on Issues Raised by Borrower/Implementing Agencies/Partners .............. 27
Annex 1 Bank Lending and Implementation Support/Supervision Processes ............... 28
Annex 2. Beneficiary Survey Results ........................................................................... 29
Annex 3. Stakeholder Workshop Report and Results .................................................... 30
Annex 4. Summary of Borrower's ICR and/or Comments on Draft ICR ..................... 31
Annex 5. Comments of Cofinanciers and Other Partners/Stakeholders ....................... 48
Annex 6. List of Supporting Documents ..................................................................... 49
Map .......................................................................................................................... 50
A. Basic Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country:</th>
<th>Morocco</th>
<th>Program Name:</th>
<th>Urban Transport Sector DPL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Program ID:</td>
<td>P115659</td>
<td>L/C/TF Number(s):</td>
<td>IBRD-80200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICR Date:</td>
<td>06/05/2012</td>
<td>ICR Type:</td>
<td>Core ICR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lending Instrument:</td>
<td>DPL</td>
<td>Borrower:</td>
<td>GOVERNMENT OF MOROCCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Original Total Commitment:</td>
<td>USD 136.70M</td>
<td>Disbursed Amount:</td>
<td>USD 140.56M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revised Amount:</td>
<td>USD 136.70M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Implementing Agencies: Ministry of Interior

Cofinanciers and Other External Partners: No co-financers

B. Key Dates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Process</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Process</th>
<th>Original Date</th>
<th>Revised / Actual Date(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appraisal:</td>
<td>12/13/2010</td>
<td>Restructuring(s):</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approval:</td>
<td>03/15/2011</td>
<td>Mid-term Review:</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Closing:</td>
<td>12/31/2011</td>
<td>12/31/2011</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C. Ratings Summary

C.1 Performance Rating by ICR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcomes:</th>
<th>Moderately Satisfactory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Risk to Development Outcome:</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bank Performance:</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borrower Performance:</td>
<td>Moderately Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C.2 Detailed Ratings of Bank and Borrower Performance (by ICR)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bank</th>
<th>Ratings</th>
<th>Borrower</th>
<th>Ratings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Quality at Entry:</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
<td>Government:</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of Supervision:</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
<td>Implementing Agency/Agencies:</td>
<td>Moderately Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Bank Performance:</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
<td>Overall Borrower Performance:</td>
<td>Moderately Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C.3 Quality at Entry and Implementation Performance Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Implementation Performance</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>QAG Assessments (if any)</th>
<th>Rating:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Potential Problem Program at any time</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Quality at Entry (QEA):</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Problem Program at any time (Yes/No): No
Quality of Supervision (QSA): None

DO rating before Closing/Inactive status: Satisfactory

D. Sector and Theme Codes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector Code (as % of total Bank financing)</th>
<th>Original</th>
<th>Actual</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General transportation sector</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Theme Code (as % of total Bank financing)       |         |        |
| Environmental policies and institutions        | 10      | 10     |
| Other social development                       | 10      | 10     |
| Other urban development                        | 50      | 50     |
| Public expenditure, financial management and procurement | 30      | 30     |

E. Bank Staff

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positions</th>
<th>At ICR</th>
<th>At Approval</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vice President:</td>
<td>Inger Andersen</td>
<td>Shamshad Akhtar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country Director:</td>
<td>Simon Gray</td>
<td>Simon Gray</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sector Manager:</td>
<td>Patricia Veevers-Carter</td>
<td>Patricia Veevers-Carter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program Team Leader:</td>
<td>Ziad Nakat</td>
<td>Jean-Charles Crochet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICR Team Leader:</td>
<td>Ziad Nakat</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICR Primary Author:</td>
<td>Ziad Nakat</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

F. Results Framework Analysis

Program Development Objectives (from Project Appraisal Document)
The development objective of the DPL was to improve the efficiency of urban transport in Morocco’s large cities through: (i) better governance of the sector; (ii) increased performance and supply of urban transport services and infrastructure; and (iii) higher environmental and social sector sustainability.

Revised Program Development Objectives (if any, as approved by original approving authority)
The program objectives remained unchanged throughout the loan.
### Indicator 1: There is a clear plan shared by all stakeholders for the restructuring of the bus route network of the agglomeration and this plan is well coordinated with the development of all other modes of transport.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value (Quantitative or Qualitative)</th>
<th>Baseline Value</th>
<th>Original Target Values (from approval documents)</th>
<th>Formally Revised Target Values</th>
<th>Actual Value Achieved at Completion or Target Years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No plan</td>
<td>Substantial completion</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>Substantial completion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Indicator 2: The CNDU meets at least twice a year to coordinate, monitor and evaluate government actions in the urban transport sector.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value (Quantitative or Qualitative)</th>
<th>Baseline Value</th>
<th>Original Target Values (from approval documents)</th>
<th>Formally Revised Target Values</th>
<th>Actual Value Achieved at Completion or Target Years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>Two</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Indicator 3: Conventions have been signed by the Ministry of Interior and local governments to assist them, including with funding, for the preparation of municipal urban strategies and priority investment plans.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value (Quantitative or Qualitative)</th>
<th>Baseline Value</th>
<th>Original Target Values (from approval documents)</th>
<th>Formally Revised Target Values</th>
<th>Actual Value Achieved at Completion or Target Years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>Three Large Cities</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>Four Large Cities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Indicator 4: Number of trained experts and number of cities which benefited from the training program.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value (Quantitative or Qualitative)</th>
<th>Baseline Value</th>
<th>Original Target Values (from approval documents)</th>
<th>Formally Revised Target Values</th>
<th>Actual Value Achieved at Completion or Target Years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>32 experts and 9 cities</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>32 experts and 9 cities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Indicator 5: Number of passenger seat-km supplied by Stareo.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value (Quantitative or Qualitative)</th>
<th>Baseline Value</th>
<th>Original Target Values (from approval documents)</th>
<th>Formally Revised Target Values</th>
<th>Actual Value Achieved at Completion or Target Years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>2.0 billion</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>2.26 billion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Indicator 6: Number of passenger seat-km supplied by M’dina Bus.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value (Quantitative or Qualitative)</th>
<th>Baseline Value</th>
<th>Original Target Values (from approval documents)</th>
<th>Formally Revised Target Values</th>
<th>Actual Value Achieved at Completion or Target Years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.9 billion</td>
<td>2.6 billion</td>
<td>n.a.</td>
<td>2.4 billion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Indicator 7: The selection of future public transport operators in large cities is fully competitive and transparent.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value (Quantitative or Qualitative)</th>
<th>n.a.</th>
<th>all</th>
<th>n.a.</th>
<th>all</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Indicator 8:** Percentage of the number of projects accepted for State funding which comply with the adopted eligibility criteria.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value (Quantitative or Qualitative)</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>75%</th>
<th>n.a.</th>
<th>75%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Indicator 9:** number of visits for vehicle inspection, the report of which has been issued through the automated electronic process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value (Quantitative or Qualitative)</th>
<th>1,100,000</th>
<th>1,700,000</th>
<th>n.a.</th>
<th>1,606,013</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Indicator 10:** number of cities which have included an accessibility component in their rehabilitation or improvement urban transport infrastructure projects.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value (Quantitative or Qualitative)</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>n.a.</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

(b) Intermediate Outcome Indicator(s)
Not Applicable.

**G. Ratings of Program Performance in ISRs**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Date ISR Archived</th>
<th>DO</th>
<th>IP</th>
<th>Actual Disbursements (USD millions)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>06/27/2011</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>12/22/2011</td>
<td>Moderately Satisfactory</td>
<td>Moderately Satisfactory</td>
<td>140.20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**H. Restructuring (if any)**
Not Applicable
1. Program Context, Development Objectives and Design

1.1 Context at Appraisal

1.1.1 Macroeconomic background.

1. At the time of appraisal of the Urban Transport Development Policy Loan (DPL), Morocco featured robust macroeconomic performance. The Government had carried out sound macroeconomic policies and reforms that allowed the country’s growth pattern to shift toward a higher level averaging 5.1% between 2001 and 2009. As a result, the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) per capita almost doubled over the same period and reached US $2,890 in 2009. In addition, the consolidation of public finances had led to budget surpluses in 2007/2008 and allowed the country to withstand the global crisis of 2008/2009, with a budget deficit that remained manageable at 2.2% of GDP. Similarly, the prudent debt strategy that had been adopted by the Government led to a decline in Treasury debt from 62% of GDP in 2005 to 46.9% in 2009, thus providing leeway to withstand the external shocks during the global crisis. On the monetary front, authorities had pursued policies geared toward maintaining low and stable inflation (an average of 2.2% between 2005 and 2009) and enhanced financial sector supervision. Overall, these efforts had led to a stable macroeconomic stance, stronger public finances, and a sound financial sector, something that had been acknowledged by rating agencies: Morocco gained an investment grade rate from both Fitch and Standard & Poor in 2007 and 2010, leading to a reinforced confidence of domestic and foreign investors.

1.1.2 Sector background.

2. During the DPL preparation, there was a broad consensus that Morocco’s urban transport sector did not serve its population and economy as well as it should have. The supply of public transport services in the main cities was inadequate and only equivalent to a third of the supply in most middle-income countries in Latin America and East Asia. While many structural and interrelated weaknesses explained this situation, the urban transport sector mainly suffered from (i) institutional weaknesses, (ii) inefficiencies in the provision of urban transport services and infrastructure, and (iii) the lack of environmental and social sustainability.

(i) Institutional weaknesses

3. The urban transport sector suffered from the widespread absence of effective institutions for developing and implementing government actions. Although many actors were involved, including at the local level (municipalities, local governments, de-concentrated services of the central government etc.), responsibilities were fragmented and there were many gaps and overlaps. While municipalities were in charge of urban transport, they had limited human and institutional capability and financial resources. Provinces and Regions were in principle responsible for filling some of this vacuum, especially for infrastructure development, but they had neither the capability nor the resources to do so. At the central government level, there was also limited capability to monitor progress in the sector and design and implement financial and technical support programs for the local authorities.
4. The sector’s institutional shortcomings were compounded by the near absence of comprehensive multimodal planning and the lack of financing. Only a few large urban areas had well developed urban transport master plans and knowledge through which decision makers could elaborate strategies and take economically sensible decisions. Besides Casablanca, there was no consensus in most cities on the sector’s development strategy, while factual knowledge of sector issues and investment needs was limited. Furthermore, the lack of financing for the sector had been a problem for many years primarily due to the limited fiscal resources of local governments and the absence of a structured process for funding urban transport investments out of the national budget.

5. Finally, the shortage of human resources was underlying most weaknesses in the sector. The number of Moroccan experts in urban transport was extremely small given the size and sophistication of the country. Opportunities for education and continuous learning were few and there was no system for collecting and disseminating national or international knowledge in the sector, sharing experiences, and building a common approach to the sector.

(ii) Inefficiencies in the provision of urban transport services and infrastructure.

6. Public transport supply was low and poorly regulated. At the time of appraisal, public transport in Morocco consisted only of buses and taxis. The supply of buses was limited and the quality of services was not satisfactory when compared to other middle-income countries. Furthermore, contracts used to provide bus services were net cost contracts that shifted all commercial risks to private operators and limited their willingness to invest, particularly in the absence of a level playing field in the competition between buses and collective taxis. Due to these deficiencies in the bus system, about half of public transport was provided by taxis in most large Moroccan cities, often on high density routes where bus services could have been more efficient.

7. The layout of the urban road network and the management of traffic and parking were inadequate. The urban road networks were usually not well structured and there was no functional classification of the urban roads. There were no proper urban infrastructure asset management tools to prioritize maintenance interventions on the urban road network. Meanwhile traffic flows were not well organized and the operation of intersections, whether signalized or not, was often inefficient. Priority in general had been given to car traffic and thus the facilities for pedestrians and bicyclists were lacking. Finally, parking was not managed to optimize the use of public space nor to provide a pricing disincentive to the use of private cars.

(iii) Lack of environmental and social sustainability.

8. The rapid motorization, aging vehicle fleet, and growing transport demand were undermining the environmentally sustainable growth of the sector. Morocco’s motorization rate had been growing at the rate of 4 to 5% yearly, a rate that had already created significant congestion in major cities and led to energy inefficiencies and poor air quality. An aging and poorly maintained vehicle fleet averaging 15 years old further exacerbated the problem. It was clear that the existing model for urban transport development raised serious sustainability concerns and alternative modes of public transport needed to be encouraged.
9. The urban transport sector in Morocco also suffered from an insufficient attention to social issues, particularly accessibility, in the planning and implementation of policies. The design and construction of urban infrastructure - such as sidewalks, pedestrian crossings, or bus stops - as well as the provision of public transport services, lacked basic accessibility features. Existing urbanism and construction codes seldom included provisions on the accessibility of persons with disabilities, and in the event few provisions existed, they were rarely understood or implemented.

1.1.3. Rationale for Bank Assistance.

10. The World Bank had been significantly involved in Morocco’s urban transport sector and was therefore well positioned to accompany the government in its sector reform program. Since 2006, the Bank had contributed significantly to the vigorous debate that had taken place in Morocco on the root causes of the poor performance of the country’s urban transport sector. The Bank had successfully focused its assistance on capacity building, the provision of technical support and the transfer of best practices and lessons of experiences from other middle-income countries. The strong policy and analytical support had allowed the Bank to assist the government of Morocco in designing its urban transport strategy. As such, the government request for an urban transport DPL to support it in the implementation of the sector strategy was a logical extension of the policy dialogue and advisory role the Bank had been playing in the sector for a few years.

11. The strong Government interest in Bank continuous support in the urban transport sector was expressed in the FY10-13 Country Partnership Strategy (CPS). The CPS identified an urban transport DPL and highlighted its capacity to contribute to three main CPS strategic pillars: (1) encouraging growth, competitiveness and employment, (2) improving the access to, and the quality of, public services, and (3) addressing climate change challenges. In addition, the DPL contributed to important cross cutting reforms such as local governments’ development, governance, and public private partnerships.

12. Multiple circumstances favored the choice of a single tranche DPL as the lending instrument for this operation. First, some of the key weaknesses in the sector, as highlighted in Section 1.1.2 above, were of a structural nature and required building a consensus among various government entities on critical actions that did not have specific investment implications. This concerned especially tackling the gaps in the sector’s institutional structure and capacity, and removing existing weaknesses in urban transport coordination and planning. Second, the government was reluctant to borrow for a Sector Investment Loan as recent experience had showed that World Bank funded infrastructure projects in Morocco often took a long time to prepare and implement. The 2008 global crisis also reinforced the government’s preference for budget financing through series of sectoral DPLs. These reasons explained the choice of a DPL as an instrument during project preparation. The choice of a single tranche operation resulted from the fact that while the government had a vision for the medium to long term policy in the sector, there was confidence in only very short term actions. Therefore a single tranche DPL, focused on such actions, appeared as the most realistic option. The difficulties faced, and eventual failure, in preparing a second DPL in programmatic series...
of DPLs undertaken in the water and energy sectors in Morocco, has reinforced the choice for a single tranche DPL.

1.2 Original Program Development Objectives (PDO) and Key Indicators (as approved)

13. The development objective of the DPL program was to support the government in improving the efficiency of urban transport in Morocco’s large cities. To do so, the DPL focused on (i) improving the governance of the urban transport sector, (ii) increasing the performance and supply of urban transport services and infrastructure and (iii) achieving higher environmental and social sector sustainability.

14. The specific benefits expected from the implementation of the reform program supported by this DPL were:

15. Improved governance: (i) efficient planning and management of the urban transport sector in the Casablanca agglomeration, (ii) effective coordination of policies and programs among the main government departments involved in the urban transport sector, (iii) effective central government support provided to local authorities on urban transport issues, and (iv) increased urban transport expertise in the cities that had carried out or launched the preparation of municipal urban strategies and priority investment plans.

16. Higher efficiency of urban transport services and infrastructure: (v) improved quality and quantity of bus services in the agglomerations of Rabat-Salé-Témara and Casablanca, (vi) alignment of the procurement process for outsourcing public transport services with international best practice, (vii) improved allocation of government financial support to those urban transport investment projects with superior economic and social returns.

17. Improved environmental and social sustainability: (viii) effective vehicle inspection and monitoring systems in place and (ix) the accessibility of persons with limited mobility mainstreamed in urban transport projects and awareness increased.

1.3 Revised PDO (as approved by original approving authority) and Key Indicators, and Reasons/Justification

18. The program objectives and key indicators remained unchanged throughout the loan.

1.4 Original Policy Areas Supported by the Program (as approved)

19. The government of Morocco put together an urban transport sector development strategy that focused on three policy areas. The DPL supported the program through ten priority actions.

Policy Area 1: Improving the Governance of the Urban Transport Sector:

20. Urban transport issue. Morocco suffered from a very limited institutional capacity in the urban transport sector, whether in central or local governments, for policymaking or implementation, and in the fields of planning, public transport or traffic management.
21. **Governmental Sector Strategy.** To tackle governance issues, the Government’s strategy supported the establishment of urban transport planning and management agencies in each large Moroccan urban area to prepare and monitor the cities’ multimodal urban transport strategies, select investment priorities, and organize and manage traffic, public transport and parking. In addition, the strategy focused on setting up an appropriate institutional framework at the national level to initiate, coordinate, implement and monitor central and local Government action in urban transport. Lastly, an emphasis was put on the widespread and multi-level development of national expertise in the urban transport sector through the carrying out of training programs and the setting up of an action plan to disseminate international best practices and establish a continuous learning process for urban transport staff.

22. **DPL support through priority actions.** The DPL supported the governance agenda of the Moroccan urban transport strategy through (1) the strengthening of Casablanca’s urban transport planning and management agency, (2) the establishment of the National Commission for Urban Transport (Commission Nationale des Déplacements Urbains – CNDU), (3) the reinforcing of the Urban Transport Division (Division des Déplacements Urbains et du Transport – DDUT) at the Ministry of Interior and (4) the training of a core group of managers in the urban transport sector.

**Policy Area 2: Improving the efficiency and increasing the supply of urban transport services and infrastructure**

23. **Urban transport issue.** Moroccan cities suffered from the lack of an efficient bus network, the absence of a proper framework for private provision of public transport services and the weaknesses of urban transport infrastructure management.

24. **Governmental Sector Strategy.** To address these problems, the government strategy supported technical, organizational and regulatory measures as well as investments in public transport aimed at developing the capacity and efficiency of services. In particular, the focus was put on enhancing the performance of bus systems and helping municipalities restructure bus services and operators’ contracts when deemed necessary. The government strategy also focused on improving the regulatory and institutional framework of public partnerships through the clarification of concession contract stipulations and the selection procedures of private service providers. Furthermore, Moroccan authorities strived to improve the funding mechanisms for urban transport systems through the rationalization of the allocation of funding to municipalities and the definition of eligibility criteria of investments that can benefit from central government financing.

25. **DPL support through priority actions.** The DPL helped in the implementation of the government strategy through (5) implementation of a new bus organization in Rabat-Salé-Témara with a new single bus service operator, (6) the restructuring of the provision of bus services in the agglomeration of Casablanca, (7) the adoption of adequate rules and regulations for selecting and contracting public services concessionaires and (8) the adoption of eligibility criteria for the state funding of urban transport investment projects.
Policy Area 3: Improving the Environmental and Social Sustainability of Urban Transport

26. *Urban transport issue.* The environmental sustainability of the urban transport sector was undermined by the rapid motorization, the aging vehicle fleet and the growing transport demand in Morocco, while the planning and implementation of urban transport policies suffered from the insufficient attention to social issues such as accessibility.

27. *Governmental Sector Strategy.* In order to tackle these issues, Moroccan authorities supported the supply increase of “green” transportation, such as Bus Rapid Transit systems, light rail transit lines and/or suburban railways in Casablanca and Rabat-Salé. Furthermore, they targeted the improvement of air quality through the reform of vehicle inspection centers, the revision of vehicle emission thresholds, and the definition of emission norms for vehicle types. The government strategy also aims to improve social integration, particularly of vulnerable groups such as persons with disabilities, through the reinforcement of the sector’s institutional and regulatory framework to deal with accessibility issues, the reinforcement of technical capacity at local and municipal level, and increasing the awareness of all relevant parties.

28. *DPL support through priority actions.* The DPL supported the government’s program through (9) the restructuring of the vehicle inspection centers and (10) the adoption and dissemination of an action plan to improve the accessibility of people with limited mobility.

29. It should be noted that while the financing of the sector is an important issue, authorities were not yet ready to address it in a sustainable manner: at the time of the DPL preparation, authorities were concerned about the financing of the capital investments in the public transport system, and the central government had accepted to support some of these investments granted they are justified on solid economic and social ground. This explains prior action 8 of the DPL on eligibility criteria, which is aimed at rationalizing central government financing of urban transport investments. The discussion on the financing of operating and maintenance costs was not then matured since no mass transit system was yet in place during the DPL preparation.

1.5 Revised Policy Areas (if applicable)

30. There were no revised policy areas.

1.6 Other significant changes

31. There were no other significant changes

2. Key Factors Affecting Implementation and Outcomes

2.1 Program Performance *(supported by a table derived from a policy matrix)*

32. The urban transport DPL was a single tranche operation that disbursed on effectiveness. The strong government commitment to the reform program and measures supported by the DPL program, combined with the timely completion of the specific
measures negotiated as prior actions have resulted in the disbursement of the operation as foreseen.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tranche #</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Expected Release Date</th>
<th>Actual Release Date</th>
<th>Release</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single Tranche</td>
<td>Euro 100 M</td>
<td>11/30/2011</td>
<td>09/08/2011</td>
<td>(1) Regular</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

33. The Ministry of Interior was the designated implementing agency given that urban transport falls under its responsibilities, and given its direct involvement in the execution of 8 out of 10 of the program’s prior actions described in table 1 below, except for prior action 9 (executed by the ministry of Transport) and prior action 10 (executed by the ministry of Social Development). Several other ministries were substantially consulted during the program preparation and implementation (Housing, Energy and Environment, Finance, and General Affairs) in addition to local authorities in the major agglomerations.

34. The table below presents the prior action by operation. The causal link to outcomes is discussed in section 3.2.

Table 1: Prior actions by operation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DPL</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Policy Area 1: Governance of the urban transport sector</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior Action 1. The Casablanca urban transport management and planning agency (Autorité Organisatrice des Déplacements Urbains du Grand Casablanca – AODU) became fully operational.</td>
<td>Completed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior Action 3. The Urban Transport Division (Division des Déplacements Urbains et du Transport - DDUT) of the General Directorate of Local Governments of the Ministry of Interior became operational.</td>
<td>Completed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior Action 4. The Ministry of Interior carried out a training program for a core group of managers in the urban transport sector.</td>
<td>Completed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Policy Area 2: Efficiency and supply of urban transport services and infrastructure</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior Action 5. The contract between the concerned municipalities of the agglomeration of Rabat-Salé-Témara and the operator of bus services Stareo became effective in 2009.</td>
<td>Completed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior Action 6. Key measures were taken to restructure the provision of bus services in the agglomeration of Casablanca.</td>
<td>Completed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior Action 7. The Minister of Interior issued an order (Arrêté) on August 25, 2010, setting forth the selection process for public services concessionnaires in accordance with Law 54.05 dated February 16, 2006, and the main stipulations of the concession contracts.</td>
<td>Completed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior Action 8. The Ministry of Interior issued a Circular (Circulaire) dated</td>
<td>Completed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
November 4, 2010, defining the eligibility criteria for state funding of urban transport investment projects.

Policy Area 3: Environmental and social sustainability of urban transport

**Prior Action 9.** The Ministry of Equipment and Transport completed the restructuring of the vehicle inspection centers.  
Completed

**Prior Action 10.** The Ministry of Social Development, Family and Solidarity in consultation with relevant ministries, adopted an action plan to improve the accessibility of people with limited mobility and organized a national seminar to raise awareness and disseminate the action plan.  
Completed

2.2 Major Factors Affecting Implementation:

**Positive factors affecting implementation:**

35. **Soundness of the background analysis.** The Urban Transport DPL was designed and undertaken based on significant consultations and previous analytical work conducted by the World Bank that allowed for a thorough understanding of the challenges facing the sector in Morocco. Bank teams prepared a number of sectoral notes on urban transport in Morocco, including five thematic diagnostic reports on urban transport (2006), a study on urban transport financing systems (2007), a review of investment options for Casablanca (2008) and a strategy note on Morocco's Urban Transport (2008). In addition, several workshops and high-level seminars were conducted and technical visits for Moroccan experts and decision makers were organized to Tunisia (2007), France (2008), and Brazil (2008). Combined with the consultations that took place with Moroccan counterparts, the long-term engagement of the Bank in urban transport in Morocco and its good understanding of the sector positively impacted the implementation of the DPL.

36. **Adequacy of government’s commitment.** The DPL included ten prior actions that had to be executed by different government agencies. The long-standing relationship of the Bank with Moroccan authorities helped assuage the difficulties that arose as a result of having multiple implementing agencies. A good dialogue was maintained with these agencies and they proved to be generally quite responsive, thus positively impacting the preparation and implementation of the DPL.

37. **Pragmatic design of the operation.** The prior actions included in the DPL were selected following significant consultations and discussions with the Moroccan counterparts. The design of the DPL was thus pragmatic and ensured that all prior actions were realistically feasible in the time frame of the operation.

Negative Factors affecting implementation:

38. **Lack of effective inter-agency coordination.** The main factor that negatively impacted the DPL was the insufficient local coordination of implementing agencies. At the beginning of the DPL preparation, joint meetings were held with all agencies involved to define actions. This however did not continue due to difficulty of continuously holding large meetings with involvement of all parties concerned, and the implementing agency did not have the appropriate resources for continuous and extensive follow ups. Agencies had therefore to each implement its actions separately, and the only
effective coordination had to be ensured by the Bank team through numerous and separate visits, and continuous transfer of information between all involved.

39. **Limited resources on the Government side for program preparation.** Staffing of the unit in charge of leading and coordinating program preparation was insufficient especially given the broad range of potential actions in the program and the relative novelty of Government involvement in the urban transport sector. There was also very limited funding from either the Government or donors for technical assistance and policy studies. This constrained the scope of what could be achieved and affected the speed of program preparation while placing much responsibility on the Bank team.

40. **Weak local capacity and limited impact of the DPL instrument at the local level.** The implementations of some of the program reforms required the involvement of local authorities. While local authorities have been generally willing to collaborate, they lacked the necessary capacity to do so. In addition, and while an adequate instrument to enhance central government policies, the DPL could not have direct impact at local level. Fostering local authorities’ commitment to the reforms therefore required a continuous dialogue and technical support from the Bank team.

### 2.3 Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Design, Implementation and Utilization:

41. **Design.** The design of the DPL’s indicators was good. The indicators were chosen in consultation with the implementation agency, their number was small and they were simple, yet specific, relevant and measurable. Overall, the design of these indicators struck a good balance between quantitative and qualitative measurements.

42. **Implementation.** The implementation was based on supervision missions by the Bank that allowed for a close monitoring of the program’s execution. Each ministerial department was in charge of data collection as well as of the execution and the monitoring of the relevant sections of the DPL. Both data collection methods and data quality were appropriate.

43. **Utilization.** The Bank’s missions prepared detailed aides-mémoires highlighting progress on each action and allowing for the coordination of the DPL. In the absence of institutionalized and effective inter-ministerial collaboration, the agencies in charge of different sections of the DPL were made aware of the progress of the project through the aides-mémoires, which ensured an indirect cooperation and knowledge transfer between these agencies to meet the reform objectives. World Bank missions and involvement provided implementing agencies with data and independent international expert opinion that informed their decision-making and resource allocation.

### 2.4 Expected Next Phase/Follow-up Operation:

44. A second single-tranche DPL was referred to in the CPS and the government of Morocco has expressed its interest for it. A new government heads the country since January 2012 and its new priorities have yet to be discussed. It is apparent however that the urban transport sector will remain an important priority for Moroccan authorities as expressed by a recent government request for a second urban transport operation.
45. The second DPL will focus on continuing and deepening all of the three reform axes of the first urban transport DPL: (i) improving the sector’s governance; (ii) improving the efficiency and increasing the supply of urban transport services and infrastructure; and (iii) improving the sector’s environmental and social sustainability. In addition, the second DPL will introduce a new area of focus: (iv) improving the financial sustainability of the urban transport sector. Indeed, during the first DPL, Morocco was in the process of building new mass transit systems in the agglomerations of Rabat-Salé and Casablanca. Today, the tramway in Rabat is in place, while construction is well underway in Casablanca. As a result, the issues of financing operating and maintenance costs and ensuring a proper coordination between different public transport modes (bus, taxi and tramway) have become increasingly important and need to be included in the second DPL.

46. In terms of timing, the second DPL is expected to be prepared by July 2013. The future monitoring of this second DPL will be three-fold: (1) each ministerial department will continue executing and monitoring relevant components of the DPL, (2) the World Bank will continue providing some degree of monitoring and coordination through missions and aides-memoires and (3) the World Bank will further push for the activation of the CNDU in its important role of monitoring the urban transport sector in Morocco.

3. Assessment of Outcomes

3.1 Relevance of Objectives, Design and Implementation

47. The long and successful history of policy dialogue in the sector between the Bank and the Moroccan government helped make the objectives, design and implementation of this operation relevant to Morocco’s development priorities and well aligned with its sector reform strategy. As earlier discussed, the Bank had contributed in shaping the government sector strategy following significant analytical work and consultations. Relevant government entities have generally come to share the Bank assessment of the sector issues and priorities. The DPL objectives were therefore, to a large extent, those of the government strategy, and the definition of the three policy areas of the DPL copied the pillars of the government strategy. The design of the DPL as a single tranche operation also allowed the needed flexibility to support those reform actions that were most ripe within the government overall sector strategy. The implementation of the DPL required the execution of 10 prior actions by 3 ministries as well as substantial consultations with additional ministries, government agencies, and local authorities, therefore concretizing a broad government ownership and support to the reform agenda.

3.2 Achievement of Program Development Objectives

48. The key policy achievements that were achieved under Urban Transport DPL operations are discussed below. The outcomes by actions are listed in table 2.

Overall Outcomes of the Urban Transport DPL.

49. Overall, the DPL program has been relatively successful in meeting its development objectives.
**Policy Area 1: Governance of the urban transport sector**

50. The institutions that were supported through the DPL have been generally successful. The reinforced DDUT is now effectively supervising the technical aspects of the sector at the national level and providing support to local authorities. Similarly, the Casablanca AODU has been strengthened and it currently plays a key role in planning and coordinating urban transport in Casablanca. Training programs are also being provided and continued and they have succeeded in creating and reinforcing a core of experts on urban transport in Morocco. The main shortcoming stems from the fact that the CNDU has to yet effectively start its work. The commission will have to play a key role in the sector and its effectiveness was an important objective of the reform program.

**Policy Area 2: Efficiency and supply of urban transport infrastructure and services**

51. The reforms supporting the efficiency of urban transport services and infrastructure however, while advancing, remain overall less successful. The essence of these reforms consisted in increasing the efficiency of public transport in Morocco, notably buses, and improving the financing of urban transport projects. In Casablanca, M’dina bus saw its performances improve, but only after substantial government support to achieve these results. In Rabat, the reform succeeded in having a single bus operator in the city, something that contributed to improving the efficiency of the system, but the private sector concession eventually failed and the government had to step in to maintain bus services. Lastly, the eligibility criteria for state funding of urban transport projects have been defined, thus increasing the due diligence required from local authority to receive central government financing, but the adherence and effectiveness of these criteria are yet to be tested by new requests for state financing of urban transport investment projects.

**Policy Area 3: Environmental and social sustainability of urban transports**

52. Meanwhile, the program’s reforms targeting environmental and social sustainability have been successful in meeting the desired objectives. The overall vehicle inspection centers’ reform program is almost complete, and inspection methods modernized. The information on the quality and composition of the vehicle fleet is automatically transmitted to the Ministry of Transport. To complement the program reforms, authorities have taken significant measures to reduce vehicle emissions by adopting Euro 4 norms and tightening emission thresholds. Similar advances were noted regarding the improvement of the accessibility of persons with limited mobility as an inter-ministerial action plan was developed and adopted and several of its important actions already undertaken. There is also increased national awareness to this subject and several cities are embarking on the improvement of the accessibility of their urban infrastructure.

**Outcome Indicators:**

53. As indicated by the table below, 7 of the 10 outcome indicators were fully met and 2 were partially met. The indicators that were partially met achieved results very close to the assigned targets, and have achieved the desired development impacts that were expected from the corresponding reform action. Only one outcome was not achieved by the project end target date: the CNDU has only held its first meeting on May
No distinction was made in the program documents between PDO indicators and intermediate indicators.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2: Project outcome indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Policy Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. IMPROVING THE GOVERNANCE OF THE URBAN SECTOR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.1 Establishment of an appropriate institutional framework in each large Moroccan agglomeration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior Action 1: Establishment of the Casablanca Urban Transport Planning and Management Agency has become fully operational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.2 Establishment of an appropriate national institutional framework to initiate and coordinate Government actions in the urban transport sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior Action 2: Establishment of the National Commission on Urban Transport</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior Action 3: The Urban Transport Division of the General Directorate of Local Governments of the Ministry of Interior is operational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.3 Widespread and multi-level development of national expertise in the urban transport sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior Action 4: The Ministry of Interior carried out a training program for managers in the urban transport sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. IMPROVING THE EFFICIENCY AND INCREASING THE SUPPLY OF URBAN TRANSPORT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.1 Restructuring of bus services and operators contracts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior Action 5: The contract of the new operator of bus services in Rabat-Salé-Témara agglomeration became effective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior Action 6: The provision of bus service in the agglomeration of Casablanca has been restructured</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.2 Improvement of the regulatory and institutional framework for public private partnerships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prior Action 7: The Ministry of Interior launched the selection process for public services concessions in accordance with law 54.05 and the main stipulations of the concession contracts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
B.3 Funding of urban transport services and infrastructure

Prior Action 8: The eligibility criteria for state funding of urban transport investment project have been defined.

Government financial support is allocated to those urban transport investment projects with superior economic and social returns. 75% of all new projects comply with eligibility criteria. End target met.

C. IMPROVING THE ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL SUSTAINABILITY OF URBAN TRANSPORT

C.1 Improving air quality in large agglomerations

Prior Action 9: The vehicle inspections centers have been restructured.

Effective vehicle inspection and monitoring systems are in place. 1.7 million car inspection visits have had their report issued through the automated electronic process. End target partially met. 1,606,013 visits reported for 2011.

C.2 Improving accessibility for persons with limited mobility

Prior Action 10: An action plan to improve accessibility to urban transports of persons with limited mobility has been adopted and disseminated.

Accessibility for persons with limited mobility has been mainstreamed in urban transport projects and awareness has increased. Two cities with accessibility project component. End target met.

Outcomes by Policy Area

Policy Area 1: Improving the governance of the urban transport sector

Component A.1: Establishment of an appropriate institutional framework in each large Moroccan agglomeration


55. Description of Prior Action 1. The AODU was created in July 2008 but was not endowed with the necessary resources to undertake its tasks. In 2010 however, the agency became fully operational through the adoption of a priority work plan and an adequate budget by its board of directors, the recruitment of a core group of technical experts and the launching of comprehensive studies of bus network restructuring and traffic management.

56. Performance of the reform supported by Prior Action 1. The AODU became fully operational and benefitted from competent technical assistance. The agency plays today a key role in the planning and coordination of the urban transport sector in the agglomeration of Casablanca, by far the largest in the country. It provides vital support to public actions undertaken in the urban transport sector through its analytical and technical expertise, and the two studies it has launched (in October 2010 and January 2011) on the restructuring of the bus network and the management of traffic are showing progress in spite of initial delays in the reviewing and validation process. Nevertheless, the AODU’s capacity to plan and manage urban transport in Casablanca could still be improved by giving it the oversight of public transport operators and by endowing it with an observatory of urban transport in charge of following and monitoring overall sector performance and the execution of all projects in the sector. More importantly, the AODU still needs to achieve a greater financial and institutional independence to become a full-fledged planning, coordinating, and regulatory authority.
57. **Outcome indicator of the reform.** The bus route network restructuring plan has substantially progressed and is expected to be completed by the end of June 2012. The study is the subject of lots of consultations, which explains that the plan was not completely finalized by December 2011 despite substantial progress. The end target of this prior action’s indicator, *being the substantial completion of the restructuring plan*, however is met.

**Component A.2: Establishment of an appropriate national institutional framework to initiate and coordinate government actions in the urban transport sector**

58. Component A.2 included two prior actions each measured by a separate indicator. These are summarized below:

59. **Prior Action 2.** The Minister of Interior issued a Circular (Circulaire) dated October 14, 2010 establishing the National Commission for Urban Transport (CNDU).

60. **Description of Prior Action 2.** The CNDU is an institution with membership at department director’s level. It has several functions that are important for the sound development of the urban transport sector in Morocco. The role of the CNDU is to ensure that the strategies of the main ministries involved in the sector are consistent and complementary. It also provides a technical forum to rapidly review in a uniform and collegial manner investment projects proposed by local governments for national budget financing. Lastly, the commission is tasked with the monitoring of the development of the sector over time. The CNDU therefore ensures that the central government plays an effective role in supporting local authorities in their day-to-day activities in the sector.

61. **Performance of the reform supported by Prior Action 2.** The CNDU first meeting finally occurred in May 23, 2012, 5 month after the closing date of the project. This first meeting was nevertheless important as the working mechanism of the CNDU had to be discussed and established. The primary objective the CNDU has to focus on is the steering and follow up on the government urban transport strategy. The CNDU also needs to discuss important sector governance issues, such as the creation of the urban transport authority in Rabat and the study of investment projects proposed by local authorities. Despite delays in convening the CNDU, the fact that it has eventually met and started its operations is very important for the continuation of the reforms in the sector and for ensuring inter-ministerial coordination.

62. **Outcome indicator of the reform.** The end target of this prior action’s required the CNDU to meet at least twice before the closing date of the project. Despite holding a later meeting in May 2012, no meetings were held by the end of December 2011, and the end target is therefore not met.

63. **Prior Action 3.** The Urban Transport Division (*Division des Déplacements Urbains et du Transport* - DDUT) of the General Directorate of Local Governments of the Ministry of Interior became operational.

64. **Description of Prior Action 3.** The DDUT plays an important role in supervising the technical management of the sector at a national level and in supporting local authorities in planning, organizing and managing urban transports. Staff have been nominated to the division’s main management positions and a priority work plan has
been adopted which adequately covers all the subject matters in which the division should be involved.

65. **Performance of the reform supported by Prior Action 3.** The urban transport division of the general directorate of local governments of the Ministry of Interior has now become the technical focal point for central government action in the sector and the complement of the CNDU, which it is meant to support at a technical level. It has demonstrated its usefulness in the recent past by managing government programs in the sector, particularly the fund dedicated for the preparation of urban transport master plans, by reviewing large investment proposals in Casablanca and Rabat-Salé-Témara, by launching a coordinated action plan for improving traffic management, and by being the central point for collection and dissemination of information in the sector. The agreements signed between the DDUT and local governments constitute a first step toward structuring state support and defining priority actions for local authorities. They clearly underline the commitment of local governments to developing and implementing efficient urban transport strategies and they include aspects pertaining to the improvement of the governance of the sector at the local level.

66. **Outcome indicator of the reform.** The end target of this prior action’s indicator is met. Four conventions on urban transport issues have been signed between the Ministry of Interior and the cities of Agadir, Kenitra, Oujda and Settat.

**Component A.3: Widespread and multi-level development of national expertise in the urban transport sector**

67. **Prior Action 4.** The Ministry of Interior carried out a training program for a core group of managers in the urban transport sector.

68. **Description of Prior Action 4.** The training program took place from February to October 2010 and included about thirty people from 11 cities. It consisted of five sessions of three to four days each and was organized by one of Morocco’s leading engineering university (Ecole Hassania des Travaux Publics) under funding and management from the Ministry of Interior’s Training Directorate. The content of the training was elaborated together with practitioners in order to fulfill priority needs. It covered the following five themes: (i) urban transport planning and strategy formulation; (ii) organization and financing of public transport (including public-private partnerships); (iii) operational aspects of urban transport strategy implementation; (iv) organization and financing of parking; and (v) traffic management. The sessions were delivered by balanced teams of local and international experts. A key objective was to pass on to Moroccans experts the lessons of experience from successful cities in middle-income countries. The evaluations carried out after the sessions showed highly positive feedback from the participants.

69. **Performance of the reform supported by Prior Action 4.** People trained through the training program now share a basic competence in the sector and follow a common approach to sector issues and activities. This result of the program is important as it helps ensure the quality of the urban transport master plans to be produced in many large cities as well as the stability and consistency of actions taken in the sector. Feedbacks on the program are positive and it is being continued in 2012. In addition to continuing the program, and following interest from participants, in depth training on select urban transport management topics will be also organized by the Ministry of Interior. Finally, it
should be noted that the training has allowed for the exchange of experiences in various
Moroccan cities on urban transport activities, and that an informal network of urban
transport experts is being created to share the relative experiences and mutually assist
each other on urban transport issues.

70. **Outcome indicator of the reform.** The end target of this prior action’s indicator is met. 32 experts from 11 cities benefited from the urban transport training program, which will be continued in 2012. Together with a similar program carried out by the World Bank with French Aid in 2008, around 55 persons have been trained in total, forming a core group of manager who share basic competences in the sector, and common approach and a pool of information.

**Policy Area 2: Improving the efficiency and increasing the supply of urban transport services and infrastructure**

**Component B.1: Restructuring of bus services and operators contracts**

71. Component B.1 included two actions, each measured by a separate indicator. These are summarized below:

72. **Prior Action 5.** The contract between the concerned municipalities of the agglomeration of Rabat-Salé-Témara and the operator of bus services Stareo became effective.

73. **Description of Prior Action 5.** Services by the previous informal operators were discontinued and the new operator Stareo started to provide bus service immediately.

74. **Performance of the reform supported by Prior Action 5.** Prior to the arrival of Stareo, urban bus services were provided in the Rabat-Salé- Témara metropolitan area by about ten small to medium size bus operators, each with about twenty to fifty buses of diverse manufacturers and sizes. Although these operators were established companies, they functioned in a very weak legal and institutional environment: their service contracts with local authorities had not been renewed for several years, they did not have any service standards, and the route network which they served was often obsolete. Moreover, they had a monopoly situation on their routes and were not accountable to any authority. As a result, bus services were overall which prompted the authorities to launch a competitive bidding to select a single private operator. Stareo was selected and started services under difficult circumstances due the strong opposition of some of the previous operators. However it renewed the bus fleet, rationalized the route network, absorbed many of the staff and buses of the previous operators, and considerably increased service on some previously neglected routes like those linking Rabat to the fast developing western part of the agglomeration. Yet, mainly because it had far overestimated the potential growth in demand, and offered a very low tariff in the competitive bidding process through which it was selected, Stareo’s revenues could not meet its operating costs. In view of the local governments’ refusal to consider a renegotiation of its contract, including especially a tariff increase, Stareo abruptly filed for bankruptcy and was shortly thereafter taken over by the municipalities of Rabat, Salé, and Témara, with their financial support and a stronger management. The authorities are now drawing the lessons of this experience and searching for a long-term solution that will ensure the sustainable provision of bus
services under a renewed public-private partnership arrangement in the agglomeration of Rabat-Salé-Témara. The potential creation of a single agency in charge of organizing and managing both the bus and the tramway network in the agglomeration is also being discussed.

75. **Outcome indicator of the reform.** The end target of this prior action’s indicator is met. The number of seat-km provided in 2011 amounted to 2.26 billion, which is above the end target set at 2.0 billion. However while the quantitative objective of this prior action has been met, primarily due to the purchase of new buses by Stareo, the transition to a new organization has proven to be difficult and was not successfully achieved with a private concessionnaire as anticipated.

76. **Prior Action 6.** Key measures were taken to restructure the provision of bus services in the agglomeration of Casablanca.

77. **Description of Prior Action 6.** The restructuring plan of Casablanca’s bus services included (i) the signature of a convention between the municipality of Casablanca and the new operator of bus services, M’dina bus for a US $25 million grant for bus fleet renewal and staff reduction in M’dina Bus, (ii) the approval of a change in the capital structure of M’dina bus with a major role being taken by the National Investment Bank (Caisse de Dépôts et de Gestion – CDG), (iii) the approval of an investment convention between the state and M’dina bus for the purchase of a large number of new buses, and (iv) the issuance to the previous bus operators of a notice to terminate their contracts.

78. **Performance of the reform supported by Prior Action 6.** Changes induced by this reform ensured that all bus services in the Casablanca agglomeration would be placed under only one management and supervisory structure, and provided by a strengthened operator with appropriate financial capability. Despite the achievement of significant progress, two key actions from the restructuring plan of M’dina bus have yet to be undertaken. The first one is the phasing out of those concessionaires that have stayed partially active since the end of their contract in 2009. These concessionaires were expected to stay active until M’dina bus reached full capacity but the phasing out of these concessions has not taken place yet despite M’dina bus having largely met its capacity targets. It is important that authorities assess the need for maintaining additional concessionaires in Casablanca while keeping in mind the necessity to balance out both the interests of M’dina bus and the importance of having an adequate supply of public transportation. The second one is the restructuring of the bus network, which will be possible when the study currently undertaken by AODU is finished, which will also allow for an efficient coordination between the operations of M’dina bus and those of the tramway and address urgent issues such as tariff integration between the bus and the tramway systems. Additional institutional measures are required to allow for this, in particular, the AODU should be strengthened in order to be able to play a more active role as a regulatory authority for all public transportation in Casablanca.

79. **Outcome indicator of the reform.** The end target of this prior action’s indicator is partially met: Despite an increase in supply of M’dina bus service from 1.9 billion seat-km in 2009 to close to 2.4 billion seat-km in 2011, this remained below the end target value of 2.6 billion seat-km.
Component B.2: Improvement of the regulatory and institutional framework for public private partnerships

80. **Prior Action 7.** The Minister of Interior issued an order (Arrêté) on August 25, 2010, setting forth the selection process for public services concessionaires in accordance with Law 54.05 dated February 16, 2006, and the main stipulations of the concession contracts.

81. **Description of Prior Action 7.** The order specified the procedures for bidding, bid evaluation, contract award and the main clauses of concession contracts.

82. **Performance of the reform supported by Prior Action 7.** The order has been published in the Official Journal of Local Authorities (Journal des Collectivités Locales) and is therefore applicable. The preparation of this regulation necessitated a long coordination process between all ministerial departments involved. The quality of the final text reflected the strong experience and understanding of public private partnerships in Morocco. The impact, which will be evidenced mostly on the long term, will be fair, fully competitive, and transparent selection of private providers of public transport services. It should be noted that while this reform action focused on improving the transparency of the concessioning process in the sector and improving competition, additional reforms should be considered to address commercial risk attributions in public transport contracts to limit the risk of future situations such as the bankruptcy of Stareo.

83. **Outcome indicator of the reform.** The end target of this prior action’s indicator is met. The August 25, 2010 Arrêté is in place and enforceable. However, no concessions have been issued this year, and the compliance with this regulation could therefore not be tested yet.

Component B.3: Funding of urban transport services and infrastructure

84. **Prior Action 8.** The Ministry of Interior issued a Circular (Circulaire) dated November 4, 2010, defining the eligibility criteria for state funding of urban transport investment projects.

85. **Description of Prior Action 8.** The criteria reflect the key institutional points of the government’s reform program for the sector and ensure that government financial assistance is focused on the most effective projects.

86. **Performance of the reform supported by Prior Action 8.** The eligibility criteria provide a strong incentive to municipalities to develop their institutional capacity, to put in place multimodal sector strategies and priority investment programs, and to conceive their investments within the context of the strategies. This ensures that local authorities are well prepared to undertake urban transport investments and provide the government with the necessary information to properly assess and prioritize these investments.

87. **Outcome of the reform.** The end target of this prior action’s indicator is met. The eligibility criteria have been defined but no project came forward for central government financing this past year in order to test whether the eligibility criteria were properly implemented.
Policy Area 3: Improving the environmental and social sustainability of urban transport

Component C.1: Improving air quality in large agglomerations


89. Description of Prior Action 9. The restructuring comprised the establishment of an automated electronic process for preparing the vehicle technical inspection reports and the selection of a firm for technical and financial audit of the vehicle inspection centers.

90. Performance of the reform supported by Prior Action 9. The reforms implemented inspection procedures that substantially reduce the likelihood of fraud by (i) directly and automatically reporting the recorded measures from inspection equipment to secured and standardized electronic sheets, and (ii) directly and electronically communicating the results of the inspections from the various centers to the Ministry of Transport where the bar-coded electronic sheets are issued. As a result, the quality of vehicle inspections improved drastically and the Ministry of Equipment and Transport was able to properly monitor the roadworthiness of vehicles and their emissions of pollutants. The renovated system of vehicle inspection is functioning well, with all vehicle inspection centers working in network with three certified operators: Decra, SGS and Salama. In addition, the company in charge of auditing both the inspection centers and the certified operators has started operations. To complement the reform of the inspection centers, additional measures to improve air quality are also being taken: (i) Euro 4 norms have been adopted for all imported vehicles and should be adopted progressively for all vehicles produced or assembled in Morocco, (ii) all imported vehicles have to be less than five years old and, (iii) the definition of tighter emission thresholds by the Ministry of Transport and the Ministry of Environment is currently underway.

91. Outcome indicator of the reform. The end target of this prior action’s indicator is partially met. The number of car inspection visits that have had their report issued through the automated electronic process in 2010 (1,686,007 visits reported) is very close to the indicator’s end target(1.7 million). Furthermore, the slight drop in the car inspection visits in 2011 (1,606,013 visits reported) is also a result of the success of the prior action undertaken. Indeed, the drop can be explained by the fact that the number of cars having to undergo re-inspection has gone down: car owners, aware of the stringency of car inspections, tend to repair their vehicles before taking them for inspection. The desired outcome of this reform action was therefore achieved.

Component C.2: Improving the accessibility of persons with limited mobility

92. Prior Action 10. The Ministry of Social Development, Family and Solidarity in consultation with relevant ministries, adopted an action plan to improve the accessibility of people with limited mobility and organized a national seminar to raise awareness and disseminate the action plan.

93. Description of Prior Action 10. The action plan focused on reinforcing the regulatory, institutional, technical, and awareness framework regarding the accessibility of persons with limited mobility and required actions from the four ministries of Interior,
Transport, Housing, and Social Development. The ministry of Finance was also associated.

**Performance of the reform supported by Prior Action 10.**

94. The draft action plan was presented and discussed in April 2010 at a national conference on accessibility in Marrakesh. The conference was attended by senior government officials, civil society representatives, as well as the Bank project team. Following the action plan’ finalization and adoption, the government is currently quite active on implementing its actions: the government has approved the draft execution decree of the law 10-03 on accessibility, the Ministry of Housing is studying the accessibility requirements that need to be included in the new construction code, the Ministry of Interior is demanding additional attention to accessibility in urban transport master plans and the Ministry of Transport is developing detailed action plan for all agencies and departments it oversees.

95. The efforts that took place in the context of the preparation of the DPL have created a positive dynamic and raised the awareness on the issue of the accessibility of both at the national and at the local level. In additional to the ministries’ actions on accessibility, cities like Marrakech, Rabat, and Oujda have started addressing accessibility in the design and construction of their urban infrastructure.

96. **Outcome indicator of the reform.** The end target of this prior action’s indicator is met. The city of Marrakech has a US $2 million pilot accessibility project underway financed by grant from the government of Japan. The grant will finance infrastructure-upgrading work in the city to improve the accessibility of selected infrastructure. To a lesser extent, other cities like Rabat and Oujda have also started undertaking accessibility infrastructure-upgrading work.

### 3.3 Justification of Overall Outcome Rating

**Rating:** Moderately Satisfactory

97. The high continued relevance of objectives, design and implementation and Bank support to urban transport sector through the DPL instrument, combined with the achievement of the main indicators with shortcomings on three expected outcomes justify a rating of Moderately Satisfactory. The fact that the CNDU, which will have to play an important role in the urban transport sector, has not effectively started its activities is an important shortcoming that impacts the rating.

### 3.4 Overarching Themes, Other Outcomes and Impacts

(a) **Climate change mitigation and energy efficiency.**

98. The impact of DPL measures in terms of reduction of Greenhouse Gas (GHG) emissions was estimated by the DPL preparation team at about 400,000 Tons/year. These reductions result primarily from the implementation of the vehicle inspection centers’ reforms (GHG emissions reduction of about 350,000 Tons/year) and the restructuring of bus operations in Rabat and Casablanca (GHG emissions reduction conservatively estimated at about 50,000 Tons/year): The reform of vehicle inspection centers has improved the quality and regularity of vehicle inspections, which in turn leads to an
improved maintenance and operations of the existing vehicle fleet in Morocco, and an improved quality of imported second-hand vehicles. Meanwhile, the restructuring of bus services improves buses’ technical quality and efficiency of operations. Both measures have a large effect on fuel efficiency and GHG emissions. The introduction of Euro 4 norms and tighter vehicle emissions thresholds will likely induce additional reduction in GHG emissions.

(b) Social development impact.

99. **Accessibility of people with limited mobility.** The efforts that took place through the DPL have created a positive dynamic and raised the awareness on the issue of the accessibility of people with limited mobility, both at the national and at the local level. The result is that several public and private agencies have been taking measures to address accessibility: the railway company is including accessibility in its station upgrading plans, bus operators are increasingly aware of the needs of persons with disabilities, and select cities are attempting to improve the accessibility of sidewalks and pedestrian environment. In addition, the Bank assisted in mobilizing a US $3 million PHRD grant to finance a pilot accessibly project in Morocco for persons with limited mobility. The grant will primarily finance infrastructure-upgrading work in the city of Marrakesh (about US $2 million) to improve the accessibility of sidewalks, pedestrian crossings, public spaces/gardens and select public buildings in the city. The remaining US $1 million will fund a technical assistance program that will support the four ministries involved in the implementation of the government action plan on accessibility through revising and producing the necessary regulations, technical guidelines, norms and standards for physical accessibility, and launching awareness campaigns on accessibility in Morocco.

100. **Gender issues.** A study on gender and transport was completed for the city of Casablanca as part of the dialogue on urban transport, the results of which were presented in a workshop. The Casablanca workshop, which was a success, included municipalities, civil society organizations and the press, and it helped put the issue of gender and urban transport in the limelight in Morocco.

(c) Capacity building and human resources development in the sector

101. Participants to the training program provided a positive feedback on the program and there are indications that they constitute now a core group of managers that function as a network and as a professional practice. Additional important actions are also currently being envisaged by the government and academic institutions, such as the training of elected officials, the creation of a specialized master degree in urban transport, and the organization of yearly events to strengthen the emerging urban transport network. As it is, the training component of the DPL has contributed to the emergence of a broader human resource development strategy in the urban transport sector in Morocco, something that was called for by the national strategy for urban transport.

(d) Increased technical assistance for urban transport investment projects.

102. A broad policy dialogue on the urban transport sector took place within the context of the DPL, involving both central and local governments. This dialogue allowed the World Bank to engage government agencies on specific investment projects and to
bring a small and yet important technical assistance to planned investments in select Moroccan cities, such as the tramway and Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) projects in Casablanca and the BRT project in Marrakech. Besides providing support to policy reforms, the DPL thus helped increase the technical assistance for transport investment projects in Morocco.

(e) Increased governments support to urban transport project investments

103. The DPL and the preparation of the country’s national urban transport program provided the opportunity for central and local authorities to engage in a broad policy dialogue on the urban transport sector. In the course of this, the Moroccan Government became more aware of the limited capacity of local authorities to finance urban transport projects. Indeed, large undertakings such as BRT and tramway projects cannot be achieved by municipalities without state financing and support. The DPL helped put in place a governance structure at the local level to facilitate the management of urban transport in Morocco, such as with the ramping up of Casablanca’s AODU. The strengthening of governance and the setting up of central government financing eligibility criteria encouraged municipalities to heighten their financial discipline and to put in place a stronger sector planning. As a result, central authorities in Morocco have a greater confidence in the quality of projects proposed for state financing as they are based on sounder economic assessments and thorough studies. Consequently the Government of Morocco has been increasing its financing of investments in the sector, which had started with the Rabat and Casablanca’s tramways. As such, the DPL contributed indirectly to increasing central government support to urban transport projects in Morocco.

4. Assessment of Risk to Development Outcome

Rating: Moderate

104. Commitments to the reform and interagency cooperation risk. Urban transport is usually a complicated issue which requires continuous and significant coordination between the various relevant ministries at the central level, and the coordination between the central and local authorities. Despite measures taken to address these issues in Morocco, inter-ministerial cooperation is appearing difficult and is not yet fully institutionalized, and this is witnessed by the fact that the meeting of the CNDU has been substantially delayed, despite the important role it is expected to assume in following up on the sector strategy and reinforcing inter-ministerial cooperation.

105. The potential risk is mitigated by the fact that despite initial delays, the CNDU has finally met on May 23, 2012 and started its operations. Delays were explained on a pure administrative basis and there do not seem to be major hindrances for the CNDU to assume its role properly. In the meantime, and while awaiting for an institutionalized collaboration on urban transport, government agencies have been increasingly taking measures, separately or through informal cooperation, to tackle urban transport issues, each within their own competency. This of course is less efficient or preferred to a properly coordinated approach; nevertheless it has been important in addressing some of the sector challenges and highlights the government commitment to reforming the sector.
106. **The risk that a modest performance of the sector’s institutions might diminish the authorities’ interest in continuing the reform program as planned.** Institutional building is a lengthy process that requires sustained efforts. The institutions created or supported through this reform program need to benefit from continuous monitoring and assistance from relevant authorities to ensure their success in meeting their objectives. This is particularly important for Casablanca’s AODU given that it is the first metropolitan transport agency in Morocco of some sort. The relative success of Casablanca’s AODU will have substantial impact on the decision of other Moroccan agglomerations to adopt a similar governance structure for the management of the urban transport sector.

107. This potential risk is mitigated by the following: as discussed in section 3 of this report, while Casablanca’s AODU has not yet become a full fledged urban transport authority, with financial and institutional independence, it nevertheless already assumes an important role in transportation planning and coordination and enjoys the authorities support. The ICR team has learned that the further reinforcement of the AODU role will be among the important reform actions to be supported in the planned second urban transport DPL. In addition, the government seems keen in having metropolitan authorities in other large agglomerations, and such an authority, with role and functions to be yet defined, is already being discussed for Rabat.

108. **Risk of financial sustainability of the sector and efficient allocation of resources:** The capacity of local authorities to provide co-financing for their planned mass transit systems, and notably to cover the expected operation and maintenance deficits of these systems is currently limited. The DPL has supported the definition of eligibility criteria to rationalize urban transport investments. Nevertheless, local authorities still find it challenging to mobilize co-financing for the capital investments, and most importantly to find the necessary resources to cover the operating and maintenance costs of these systems. With the Rabat tramway now operational, and Casablanca’s tramway soon to follow, the financial sustainability of the sector, partially addressed by the eligibility criteria, might become at risk and needs to be properly assessed.

109. This potential risk is mitigated by the fact that authorities were initially primarily concerned in ensuring proper mechanisms for financing and launching important urban transport investments in Morocco. With the tramways now operational, the O&M costs have become real and the ICR team has found authorities quite aware of this additional challenge. There are ongoing discussions between authorities on ways to systematically address this, including possibly allowing additional tax revenues to municipalities to cover such expenses.

---

1 In many cities around the world, fares on mass transit systems are set at low levels, below that required to cover O&M costs, in order to meet socio-economic objectives. This usually results in recurrent deficits which are covered from subsidies (usually from local authorities) and/or additional revenue generating mechanisms (vehicle registration taxes, parking charges...).
110. **Private sector participation in the financing and operations of public transport remain fragile.** As discussed in section 1.1.2, bus service contracts are currently net cost contracts that shift all commercial risks to operators. While the failure of Stareo in Rabat could be attributed to multiple reasons, it could be argued that some reasons behind this failure resulted from the contract conditions.

111. The Rabat recent bus concession experience has brought the issue of contract conditions for transport operators to the attention of the authorities, and resulted in a dialogue on ways to better address these issues in the future, including possibly a revision to contract conditions. In addition, it should be noted that while this model has recently failed in Rabat, private sector bus concessions have been relatively successful for a long time in other cities in Morocco, notably Marrakesh and Tangier.

112. Overall, and following the above analysis, it is not very likely that any single risk stemming from the institutional complexity of the sector, combined with financial, and economic risks will materialize. Further, mitigation measures are in place going forward and the government remains fully committed to the program justifying an overall risk rating of moderate.

5. **Assessment of Bank and Borrower Performance**

5.1 **Bank Performance**

(a) **Bank Performance in Ensuring Quality at Entry**

Rating: Satisfactory

113. The DPL reform areas were very well aligned with the main themes of the government strategy for the sector. The design choice of a single tranche DPL, to be later followed by other single tranches to further support the reforms, has permitted to advance the more matured reform actions in the overall government program, thus ensuring flexibility and realism while meeting the government reform program’s objectives. The Bank played an important catalytic role in facilitating inter-agency dialogue on contentious issues, as well as transferring knowledge based on international experience. The design of the DPL program benefited greatly from a base of analytical work done in a highly participatory way and the project team has allocated the necessary effort and time for project preparation to ensure that the reform program had matured.

(b) **Quality of Supervision (including M&E arrangements)**

Ratings: Satisfactory

114. Despite being a single tranche DPL with a short supervision time (of almost 5 month only), the DPL program implementation has been supervised thoroughly by the Bank task team. Two missions were carried out during implementation with detailed supervision reports and aide memoires. The supervision included a detailed follow up on the progress of the different components with all agencies involved, with each agency responsible for the collection of the M&E indicator relevant to its respective actions. The findings were discussed with the government and corrective measures taken when needed. The careful supervision helped to build strong relation between the client and the Bank, as confirmed by government counterparts during the ICR mission.
Justification of Rating for Overall Bank Performance

Ratings: Satisfactory

A satisfactory Bank performance for both quality at entry and supervision justifies an overall satisfactory Bank performance which underlines a well-designed and implemented operation.

5.2 Borrower Performance

(a) Government Performance

Ratings: Satisfactory

The implementation of the reform program required the execution of the prior actions by multiple ministries, namely the ministries of Interior, Transport, and Social Development. Several other ministries were substantially consulted during the program preparation and implementation (Housing, Energy and Environment, Finance, and General Affairs) in addition to local authorities in the major agglomerations. M&E data was collected by the relevant departments and discussed during supervision missions. The substantial efforts undertaken by all involved in the program to implement prior actions and follow up on shortcomings in implementation highlighted the government commitment to the program and to achieving its development objectives, overall resulting in a satisfactory rating of government performance.

(b) Implementing Agency or Agencies Performance

Ratings: Moderately Satisfactory

The implementation of the program involved multiple ministries as discussed above, nevertheless the Ministry of Interior was the designated implementing agency given that urban transport falls under its responsibilities. The Ministry of Interior played an important role in coordinating the actions of this program and in facilitating the dialogue with several agencies, notably at local level. The Ministry of Interior was also responsible in directly implementing a large number of prior actions, some of which were very important to the reform of the sector and notably to its governance, and it was generally successful in doing so.

Nevertheless, and despite its efforts, inter-ministerial coordination during the project preparation and implementation was only partially achieved and the Bank team had sometimes to follow up directly with other relevant ministries. There were also some delays in the execution of some of the reform actions, notably regarding the issuance of the Circular establishing the CNDU, and in following up on the implementation of the reforms, such as calling a meeting for the CNDU.

The above analysis justifies a moderately successfully rating for the implementing agency.

(c) Justification of Rating for Overall Borrower Performance

Ratings: Moderately Satisfactory
120. The government and implementing agency have made important efforts for implementing this reform program for a relatively complex sector. The ratings of (a) and (b) above justify an overall borrower performance rating of moderately satisfactory.

6. Lessons Learned

121. Given its important policy implications, the timely and successful implementation of the DPL reform program requires continuous support from senior government counterparts. Moroccan authorities generally have the know-how to prepare and carry out large investments, whereas it is more difficult for them to improve policy and regulatory frameworks with the required institutional and capacity building. The success of DPL thus hinges on ensuring ownership at the highest levels of government as well as at the technical levels as it increases commitment to the project development objectives and facilitates implementation. Experience with past projects shows that successful DPLs ensured counterparts commitment and ownership from the onset of the project, something confirmed by the DPL under review. Indeed, the risks associated with the multiplicity of implementing agencies, and the sometimes divergent views regarding the respective roles of the various existing and newly created agencies (such as the role and composition of the CNDU, the role and governance structure of the AODU…) were assuaged by the strong involvement of senior Moroccan counterparts on key issues, thus ensuring the progress on reforms during the implementation of the DPL.

122. While awaiting the development of the required institutions to fully assume their intended functions, the Bank has to initially play an important role as a catalyst in fostering program coordination. A main lesson from this urban transport DPL is that reforms requiring inter-ministerial coordination have moved more slowly than others. The DPL involved various stakeholders in different ministries and government agencies, both nationally and locally. In order to achieve a successful implementation of the proposed reforms, it was essential to build consensus among the different stakeholders and ensure smooth cooperation. The World Bank, as is the case with other past DPLs, played the role of catalyst to foster such coordination among implementation agencies. The CNDU, which is the newly created commission in charge of initiating and coordination Government action in Morocco’s urban transport sector, was not yet fully operational by the closing date of the DPL. In the case of future urban transport DPLs, this commission should take on an important monitoring and coordination role. The potential second urban transport DPL currently under consideration should thus make sure that the CNDU has become fully operational. It should also consider all possible actions to strengthen coordination of DPL stakeholders during the implementation phase.

123. Future urban transport DPLs should be accompanied by investment lending and technical assistance operations. The DPL is an appropriate instrument for supporting urban transport sector institutional and legal reforms in Morocco, as the country is proceeding step by step in a medium term program. However, while the DPL was a well designed and implemented operation which was clearly aligned with both the Bank and the borrower’s objectives, by its nature, it could not affect decision making at the local level since this depends on many factors, mainly political, which were beyond the DPL. Since urban transport strategies and projects are conceived and implemented by
local authorities, building capacity there and handholding/incentivizing their decision making process is therefore essential. This can be done by accompanying urban transport DPLs with investment lending and technical assistance projects. Indeed, this type of operations can help ensure that there is acquisition of technical expertise by local stakeholders, thus allowing for the successful achievement of the DPL’s reform objective. The accessibility component of the DPL under review is a good example of such parallel operations. The mobilization of a grant to finance a pilot accessibility and technical assistance project in Marrakech markedly contributes to the successful implementation of the social development reform of the DPL and by allowing local implementing agencies to gain financial and technical capacity.

124. **Single tranche DPLs are an adequate instrument to undertake urban transport sector reform in Morocco, provided they are allowed a longer implementation period to properly measure the impacts of the reforms.** Morocco is a good case of using successive single tranche adjustment loans as an effective way to assist structural reform, provided there is a link to an agreed medium-term reform program with well broadly defined milestones and transparent triggers per subsequent operation. In a complex sector such as urban transport, series of single tranche DPLs allow for flexibility in pushing reforms that are implemented at different speeds. Furthermore, they make it easier to adapt and accompany reforms when priorities shift with time. Given their short implementation period however, it is difficult to assess the full success of single tranche DPLs. In the case of the DPL under review the implementation period of the program was only about 5 month, and the improvement of the regulatory and institutional framework for public private partnerships could not be tested as no new concessions were issued before the DPL’s closing date. Similarly, no new project came forward for central government financing this past year and it was not possible to measure the improvement of the funding of urban transport services and infrastructure following the implementation of the actions planned by the DPL. On this specific aspect, programmatic DPLs provide additional insurance for the sustainability of reform as they build more directly on previous reforms. The definition of indicators and end target when preparing a single tranche DPL has thus to be done while bearing in mind the short monitoring time frame allowed by this type of lending instrument.

7. **Comments on Issues Raised by Borrower/Implementing Agencies/Partners**

125. The draft ICR was discussed and shared with the borrower and implementation agency during its preparation. Counterparts share the overall assessment of the Bank. The borrower own assessment of the project is attached in annex 4.
Annex 1. Bank Lending and Implementation Support/Supervision Processes

(a) Task Team members

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Names</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>Responsibility/Specialty</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fatiha Amar</td>
<td>Program Assistant</td>
<td>MNSSSD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gael Gregoire</td>
<td>Senior Environmental Specialist</td>
<td>AFTEN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anas Abou El Mikias</td>
<td>Senior Financial Management Specialist</td>
<td>MNAFM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jean-Charles Crochet</td>
<td>Senior Transport Economist</td>
<td>AFTTR</td>
<td>TTL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jean-Charles De Daruvar</td>
<td>Senior Counsel</td>
<td>LEGEM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maryvonne Dejeamnes</td>
<td>Consultant</td>
<td>MNSSD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ziad Salim EL Nakat</td>
<td>Transport Specialist</td>
<td>MNSTR</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khalid El Massnaoui</td>
<td>Senior Economist</td>
<td>MNSED</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andrea Liverani</td>
<td>Senior Social Development Spec</td>
<td>MNSSSO</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul Noumba Um</td>
<td>Sector Manager</td>
<td>AFTFW</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stefano Paternostro</td>
<td>Lead Economist</td>
<td>MNSED</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilles Georges Jean Leon Pipien</td>
<td>Consultant</td>
<td>MNSSD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khadija Sebbata</td>
<td>Program Assistant</td>
<td>MNCMA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Supervision

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Names</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Unit</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yassine Cherkaoui</td>
<td>Consultant</td>
<td>MNSEG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jean-Charles Crochet</td>
<td>Senior Transport Economist</td>
<td>AFTTR</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paolo Custodio</td>
<td>Consultant</td>
<td>MNSSD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ziad Salim EL Nakat</td>
<td>Transport Specialist</td>
<td>MNSTR</td>
<td>TTL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olivier Le Ber</td>
<td>Lead Transport Specialist</td>
<td>MNSTR</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angeline Mani</td>
<td>Program Assistant</td>
<td>MNSSD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khadija Sebbata</td>
<td>Program Assistant</td>
<td>MNCMA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(b) Staff Time and Cost

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage</th>
<th>Staff Time and Cost (Bank Budget Only)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. of staff weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lending</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervision/ICR</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annex 2. Beneficiary Survey Results

Not Applicable
Annex 3. Stakeholder Workshop Report and Results

Not Applicable
Annex 4. Summary of Borrower's ICR and/or Comments on Draft ICR

LE MINISTRE DE L’INTERIEUR

A

MONSIEUR SIMON GREY
DIRECTEUR DU DEPARTEMENT
MAGHREB MOYEN ORIENT ET AFRIQUE DU NORD
BANQUE MONDIALE

7, rue Larbi Ben Abdellah, Souissi Rabat - Maroc

Objet : Rapport d’achèvement du Prêt de Politique de Développement (PPD) au secteur des déplacements urbains.

Conscient de l’importance de l’efficacité des transports urbains comme levier pour le développement socio-économique, la cohésion sociale et la compétitivité des villes, le Ministère de l’Intérieur s’est engagé dans un processus de réforme et de redynamisation du secteur des déplacements urbains à travers l’élaboration, en 2008, d’une Stratégie Nationale des Déplacements Urbains.

Pour la mise en œuvre de cette Stratégie, le Maroc a bénéficié, en 2011, de l’accompagnement de la Banque Mondiale à travers un Prêt de Politique de Développement de 100 M€ sur la base du Programmes d’Actions Prioritaires, dont les mesures ont été en grande partie réalisées et satisfaites.

En égard à ce qui précède et suite à la clôture du 1er PPD, le 31 décembre 2011, et à la demande de la Banque Mondiale, le Ministère de l’Intérieur a élaboré un rapport d’achèvement de ce projet, dont ci-joint copie, pour l’évaluation de l’état d’avancement des différentes mesures de réformes, à travers les indicateurs de suivi adoptés en 2010 à l’occasion de la préparation du PPD.

En vous remerciant pour l’intérêt que la Banque Mondiale porte au développement du secteur, tout en souhaitant que son appui se poursuive sous d’autres formes que nous serons heureux de définir en temps opportun, je vous prie de croire Monsieur le Directeur, à l’expression de ma considération distinguée.
INTRODUCTION

Le Maroc a entamé, depuis quelques décennies, un processus de développement économique et social accompagné d’une dynamique urbaine et d’une croissance rapide des villes. Désormais la population urbaine représente près de 60% de la population total, soit 18 millions de citadins sur une population globale de 30 millions d’habitants. L’accroissement de la population urbaine de 2,85% par an, le développement des activités et les mutations économiques et sociales contribuent fortement à la croissance de la mobilité des individus et des besoins en déplacements. Cependant, l’offre du service de transport public ne permet pas d’accompagner ces mutations et de répondre au mieux aux attentes des citoyens.

De ce fait, le Maroc est appelé à faire face à de grands défis dans les années à venir pour satisfaire les besoins grandissants des citoyens en transports publics et améliorer les conditions de la mobilité dans les villes.

C’est pourquoi l’État a élaboré avec l’appui de la Banque Mondiale et en concertation avec les différents acteurs concernés, une Stratégie Nationale des Déplacements Urbains pour la réforme du secteur du transport public et l’amélioration de la mobilité urbaine dans les grandes villes.

Pour l’accompagnement de la mise en œuvre de cette stratégie, le Gouvernement a introduit une requête auprès de la Banque Mondiale en vue de bénéficier des Prêts de Politique de Développement (PPD). Suite à cette requête et aux chantiers engagés sur la voie de la réforme, un premier PPD de 100 M€ a été accordée au Maroc, en juin 2011, sur une série de 3 prêts de 100 M€ qui seront débloqués sur 2 à 3 tranches, étalées sur une période de 3 à 5 ans.

Le déblocage du 1er PPD a été sur la base de l’engagement d’un ensemble de mesures de réformes retenues dans le Programme d’Actions Prioritaires.

Le présent rapport a pour objet d’évaluer l’état d’avancement de ces différentes mesures de réformes, à travers des indicateurs de suivi adoptés en 2010 à l’occasion de la préparation du PPD.

I- CONTEXTE ET OBJECTIFS DE LA STRATEGIE NATIONALE DES DEPLACEMENTS URBAINS

1- Contexte de la mobilité urbaine

Le service du transport public urbain souffre depuis plusieurs décennies de nombreuses insuffisances qui se manifestent par la faiblesse de l’offre et son incapacité à satisfaire les
besoins des citoyens en déplacements. A titre d’illustration, le mode autobus n’assure aujourd’hui que 14% des déplacements à Rabat, 13% à Casablanca et seulement 4% à Marrakech. La marche-à-pied reste le mode prépondérant, avec respectivement 66%, 54% et 60% de l’ensemble des déplacements.

La faiblesse de l’offre en transport collectif se conjugue avec une mauvaise gestion de la voirie et de la circulation pour aboutir à un dysfonctionnement global de la mobilité urbaine.

A l’origine de ce dysfonctionnement, la fragilité du cadre institutionnel, organisationnel, de planification et surtout de financement.

2- Objectifs et axes des réformes


La Stratégie Nationale des Déplacements Urbains, largement concertée et validée en 2008 par tous les partenaires, fixe les orientations et les principaux axes de la réforme du secteur, déclinés en un plan d’action qui vise :

1- le renforcement du cadre institutionnel, législatif et réglementaire ;
2- l’ancrage de la planification ;
3- la priorité au transport public ;
4- l’amélioration de la gestion de la voirie et de l’utilisation de l’espace ;
5- la mise en place de mécanismes durables de financement.

3- Les premières réalisations

D’importantes avancées sont déjà enregistrées dans le processus de mise en œuvre de cette stratégie, suite à l’engagement de plusieurs actions, dont on peut citer :

- La réforme du cadre institutionnel, législatif et réglementaire

Les premières réformes initiées ont visé le renforcement du cadre institutionnelle et de gouvernance. L’amendement de la charte communale (Loi 17-08 du 18 Février 2009) a été l’occasion pour introduire un nouveau instrument institutionnel permettant aux Collectivités Territoriales de se constituer en Groupements d’Agglomérations pour la réalisation et la gestion de services d’intérêt commun. L’objectif est l’amélioration des mécanismes de gestion des services publics en réseau, notamment les transports publics, ainsi que la mutualisation des moyens et l’optimisation de l’emploi des ressources.

La nouvelle charte communale a également accordé aux Collectivités Territoriales le droit de créer des Sociétés de Développement Locale (SDL) et de participer à leur capital et ce, pour l’exécution d’une activité à caractère commercial et industriel.

Un projet de Loi spécifique aux déplacements urbains a été élaboré. Il prévoit l’ancrage de la planification à travers la généralisation des plans de déplacements urbains (PDU), la
définition et l’organisation des transports publics et le renforcement de la gouvernance du secteur au niveau local.

Une autorité organisatrice des déplacements urbains et des transports à Casablanca (AODU) à été créée à Casablanca en juillet 2008, dans un cadre conventionnel, comme action pilote.

- **L’appui financier**

L’Etat a créé en 2007 un fonds de soutien au transport public de 400 MDH, dont 200 MDH pour le transport rurbain (150 MDH pour la compensation du manque à gagner scolaire et universitaire et 50 MDH pour la réforme du secteur des taxis).

Pour le développement et la modernisation de l’offre en transports public, l’Etat apporte un soutien financier aux projets de transport de masse en site propres, notamment aux projets de tramway de Casablanca et de Rabat-Salé. Le montant d’investissement du projet de tramway de Casablanca est de 6,4 Mds DH et celui de Rabat-Salé, est de 3,8 Mds de DH.

- **L’appui à la planification**

L’objectif de la planification est de remédier aux divers dysfonctionnements dans le système de mobilité urbaine et de satisfaire les besoins en transport public dus à la croissance rapide de la demande.

De ce fait, les Plans de Déplacements Urbains (PDU) sont des documents incontournables de planification en matière de mobilité urbaine et dont la mise en œuvre contribue substantiellement à l’amélioration des conditions de la mobilité et au développement d’une offre en transport public moderne et compétitive.

En vue d’inciter les villes à élaborer leurs PDU, le Ministère de l’Intérieur s’est engagé à les appuyer aussi bien sur le plan financier que sur le plan technique et méthodologique :

- **Soutien Financier à la planification**


Suite à cette circulaire, le feed-back a été positif et traduit l’adhésion des Collectivités Territoriales à cette logique PDU.

- **Appui technique**

Sur le plan méthodologique, le FEC s’est associé à la DGCL pour mettre en place une démarche qui consiste à élaborer les PDU en deux étapes :

- **Étape 1 : phase de pré-diagnostic**
  Mettre à la disposition des villes concernées un consultant chargé de l’élaboration d’un pré-diagnostic, la préparation d’un dossier d’appel d’offres pour l’étude PDU (CPS et règlement de consultation).

- **Étape 2 : lancement des marchés des études PDU**
  La mission des BET sélectionnés dans la 1ère phase pourrait se prolonger dans cette seconde phase à travers l’assistance à la Maîtrise d’Ouvrage pour le suivi de ces études afin de garantir une meilleure qualité à cette première génération de PDU au Maroc.

- **Normalisation de la démarche PDU**

Pour la normalisation de la démarche de planification, la DGCL envisage l’élaboration d’un guide PDU et d’un guide de plan de circulation qui aideront les Collectivités Territoriales à renforcer leurs capacités de maîtrise d’ouvrage dans le domaine de la planification des déplacements urbains et de la gestion de la circulation et du stationnement.

**- Le renforcement des capacités des Collectivités Locales**

Conformément aux orientations de la stratégie, une Division des Déplacements Urbains et des Transports a été créée au sein de la DGCL pour la mise en œuvre des programmes d’accompagnement des Collectivités Territoriales en matière de politiques des déplacements urbains.

Un premier programme de formation a été organisé en 2008 à l’Ecole Hassania des Travaux Publics (EHTP), en partenariat avec la Banque Mondiale et le Programme d’Appui à la Décentralisation (PAD Maroc). Il a été destiné à une trentaine de cadres des Communes Urbaines, de l’Administration Territoriales et Centrale (DGCL/DPE, Département de l’Equipement et Agence Urbaine de Casablanca).

**II- BILAN DES REALISATIONS DU PROGRAMME D’ACTIONS PRIORITAIRES AU TITRE DU PPD**

Dans la dynamique enclenchée par la stratégie et dans le cadre de l’appui de la Banque Mondiale à travers les PPD, un Programme d’Actions Prioritaires a été élaboré en concertation avec les acteurs concernés. Ce programme vise à mettre en œuvre des réformes selon trois objectifs :

1- **Amélioration de la gouvernance du secteur des déplacements urbains**

   a- **Mise en place d’un cadre institutionnel approprié dans chaque grande agglomération**

Le Ministère de l’Intérieur a accompagné, en juillet 2008, la ville de Casablanca pour la création d’une autorité organisatrice des déplacements urbains et du transport (AODU), dans un cadre conventionnel, regroupant les différents acteurs territoriaux du Grand Casablanca. Les missions confiées à l’AODU sont :
1. l’élaboration et le suivi de la mise en œuvre du plan de déplacements urbains (PDU) notamment :
   - la mise en œuvre d’une stratégie cohérente et concertée des déplacements urbains ;
   - l’évaluation de la demande et l’adaptation de l’offre en matière des transports urbains ;
   - le développement des outils d’observation, de suivi et d’évaluation de la mobilité et des déplacements urbains ;
   - la proposition d’un réseau de transport public répondant à la demande des usagers de façon optimale ;
   - la définition des modalités techniques d’offre du service des transports publics urbains ainsi que les conditions générales d’exploitation ;
   - le développement des aménagements garantissant la sécurité routière, la fluidité du trafic et le partage entre les modes ;
2. Le contrôle des opérateurs des transports publics urbains, le suivi d’exécution du service et le constat du respect de la réglementation en vigueur et des clauses des contrats d’exploitation et de gestion ;
3. La coordination entre les différents acteurs pour l’harmonisation de la gestion du trafic ;
4. La recherche des financements des projets liés aux déplacements urbains.

L’AODU est opérationnelle grâce à ses plans d’actions adoptés par son Conseil d’administration, au recrutement d’une assistance technique et de cadres chargés de la préparation des décisions et de l’exécution des orientations stratégiques ainsi qu’au budget créé pour le financement de ces activités.

A cet égard, l’AODU a initié deux études majeures pour optimiser le système de transport collectif actuel et améliorer la gestion de la circulation dans la Région du Grand Casablanca, en préparation de la mise en service du tramway prévue à fin 2012. Ces études auront probablement un impact significatif et structurant sur la mobilité urbaine de l’agglomération dès la mise en œuvre de leurs orientations :
   - l’étude de restructuration du réseau de transport collectif, vise l’amélioration de la desserte et du niveau de service par un réseau de transport collectif efficace et multimodal, en tenant compte de la viabilité économique du système ;
   - l’étude du plan de circulation a pour objectif de doter la métropole d’un plan de circulation pour la gestion du trafic et l’amélioration de l’accessibilité ainsi que l’organisation et l’aménagement de la voirie et de l’espace public.

L’AODU prévoit également la revue du contrat de gestion déléguée du transport collectif urbain par autobus, signé en 2004 entre le groupement de la commune urbaine de Casablanca et des communes des provinces de Nouaceur, Médiouna et Mohammedia et la société M’dina Bus. Cette revue visera à introduire les mécanismes garantissant l’équilibre économique et financier tel que prévu dans le contrat. Elle visera également à mettre à niveau le contrat notamment en rapport avec les évolutions institutionnelles, techniques et environnementales intervenues, et à améliorer ses mécanismes de suivi.
b- **Mise en place d’un cadre institutionnel national de coordination des actions du gouvernement**

Pour l’organisation des concertations, la coordination de la mise en œuvre, le suivi et l’évaluation des actions de la Stratégie Nationale des Déplacements Urbains, le Ministère de l’Intérieur a émis une circulaire en date du 14 octobre 2010 instituant une Commission Nationale des Déplacements Urbains (CNDU) composée des principaux partenaires de l’Etat intervenant dans le secteur.

De ce fait, la commission intervient pour :

- examiner les politiques publiques sectorielles des départements ministériels concernés par la problématique des déplacements urbains et ce dans un souci de cohérence et de convergence de ces politiques ;
- préparer les mesures à prendre par les instances de l’Etat, en appui aux Collectivités Territoriales, pour favoriser la mise à niveau et la modernisation du secteur des déplacements urbains et la professionnalisation de ses modes de gestion ;
- coordonner la mise en œuvre des mesures contenues dans le plan d’actions de la stratégie pour optimiser leur efficience ;
- examiner les différents programmes d’actions, soumis par les Collectivités Territoriales intéressées et nécessitant l’appui financier de l’État ;
- assurer le suivi des actions et des réalisations et évaluer leur mise en œuvre.

La CNDU est présidée par Monsieur le Wali, Directeur Général des Collectivités Locales et composée des représentants, à haut niveau, des Départements Ministériels concernés :

- Ministère de l’Intérieur :
- Ministère de l’Economie et des Finances :
- Ministère de l’Equipement et des Transports :
- Ministère de l’Habitat, de l’Urbanisme et de la Politique de la Ville :

En raison de la diversité des actions et de la multiplicité des acteurs dans le traitement des projets initiés par la commission ou ceux qui lui sont soumis par les Collectivités Territoriales, le président de la CNDU peut inviter tout autre département ministériel ou organisme à participer aux travaux de la dite commission. Il peut également mettre en place, chaque fois que nécessaire, un comité technique ad hoc chargé d’étudier et d’approfondir une action ou un projet relatif au développement du secteur, soumis à l’examen de la CNDU.

Il est à signaler que le CNDU n’a tenu aucune réunion avant la fin de l’année 2011, alors qu’Il a été prévu qu’elle tienne au moins deux réunions.

**c- Promouvoir la planification des déplacements urbains**

La première phase qui consiste en la réalisation d’un prédéagnostic et du CPS des études PDU étant achevée, les villes concernées ont entamé la deuxième phase de lancement de
l’étude PDU. A cet égard les villes d’Oujda et d’Agadir ont déjà lancé les appels d’offres y afférents.

En matière de soutien financier, Marrakech a bénéficié de 8 MDH, en 2009. Les villes d’Oujda, Agadir et Kenitra ont bénéficié chacune de 5 MDH et El Jadida de 4,5 MDH.

### Situation globale des PDU au Maroc

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>État d’avancement des études PDU</th>
<th>Nombre de PDU</th>
<th>Villes concernées</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>lancés</td>
<td>02</td>
<td>Oujda et Agadir</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A lancer prochainement</td>
<td>07</td>
<td>Fès, Settat, El Jadida, Safi, Kénitra, Nador et Meknès</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Dans l’absence de textes juridiques contraignants imposant l’élaboration des PDU et la mise en œuvre de leurs orientations, le Ministère de l’Intérieur a établi des conventions de partenariat avec les Collectivités Territoriales permettant de mieux les engager et les accompagner dans le processus de planification.

Quatre conventions de partenariat, avec les villes d’Oujda, Agadir, Kénitra et Settat, ont été approuvées.

Ces conventions ont pour objet de définir le cadre général de partenariat, entre le Ministère de l’Intérieur et les Collectivités Territoriales, favorisant la concertation, la coordination et la création de synergies pour le développement et la promotion du secteur des déplacements urbains.

Au titre de ces conventions, le Ministère de l’Intérieur accompagne les Collectivités Territoriales pour élaborer et mettre en œuvre des PDU en parfaite cohésion avec les documents de l’urbanisme.

Le Ministère de l’Intérieur se chargera des actions suivantes :

- la participation au financement de l’étude PDU à hauteur de 50% de son coût de réalisation ;
- le renforcement des capacités et la formation des cadres responsables de la mobilité urbaine pour la réalisation et la gestion des infrastructures et des équipements en rapport avec les déplacements urbains ;
- l’appui et l’accompagnement pour élaborer et mettre en œuvre une politique multimodale des déplacements urbains ;
o l’appui pour la gestion de la voirie, de la circulation et du stationnement ainsi que pour l’amélioration de la sécurité routière

En contre partie, les Collectivités Territoriales sont appelées à mettre en œuvre des actions dans les domaines suivants :

- **Planification des Déplacements urbains**

  o la réalisation d’un diagnostic avec une analyse chiffrée de la demande de toutes les catégories de population, y compris celle des personnes à mobilité réduite (PMR) ainsi que l’analyse des impacts social et environnemental ;

  o l’élaboration du PDU qui permettra l’identification des dysfonctionnements en terme de mobilité urbaine et des problèmes de la circulation et du stationnement en tenant compte du phénomène de l’étalement urbain et du contexte de la ville et de son évolution en matière d’urbanisme, d’infrastructures et de transport ;

  o l’organisation des transports de personnes et de marchandises et la maîtrise de la circulation automobile et du stationnement ;

  o le développement des transports publics urbains et la coordination de tous les modes de déplacements ;

  o le développement des aménagements garantissant la sécurité des déplacements, la fluidité du trafic et le partage équitable de la voirie entre les différents modes de déplacements ;

  o l’amélioration du cadre urbain en diminuant les nuisances environnementales (pollution, congestion du trafic) et en renforçant la sécurité routière ;

  o les réservations d’emprises à effectuer pour préserver les possibilités de développement futur des réseaux, en fonction de l’évolution projetée de l’agglomération ;

  o l’évaluation globale des coûts d’investissement et des effets attendus sur la mobilité urbaine.

- **Elaboration d’un plan d’actions**

Il consiste à décliner le PDU, document stratégique, en plan d’actions pré-opérationnel ou « Programme d’Investissement Prioritaire (PIP) », considérant essentiellement le court-moyen terme (3 à 5 ans). Le plan d’actions devra permettre :

  o la définition d’un programme d’actions détaillées, chiffrées et financièrement réalisistes concernant les différents réseaux de la mobilité (transport public, circulation, stationnement, trame piétonnière, aménagement de la voirie et de l’espace public…) ;

  o l’évaluation des résultats des actions en matière d’efficacité énergétique et d’impacts social et environnemental ;

  o l’optimisation de l’utilisation des infrastructures existantes, la prise en compte des capacités de financement et de la mobilisation des fonds nécessaires.

Développement d’un système d’information sur les déplacements
o le développement de bases de données sur les déplacements urbains pour le suivi et l’évaluation continus des déplacements urbains.

Pour assurer une bonne gouvernance du projet PDU, il est créé une structure de gestion des déplacements urbains et de la circulation et des comités de pilotage et technique.

o la structure de gestion des déplacements urbains et de la circulation chargée de la conduite et de la mise en œuvre des PDU ;

o le Comité de pilotage présidé par le Wali de la Région et composé des différents responsables de la politique des déplacements urbains ;

o le Comité technique relevant des Collectivités Territoriales, de l’administration déconcentrée et territoriale.

o un comité de suivi pour le suivi des réalisations du PDU, a pour le suivi des réalisations de la convention.

**d- renforcement des capacités**

Le renforcement des capacités des Collectivités Territoriales en matière des déplacements urbains revêt un caractère crucial. C’est pourquoi, le Ministère de l’Intérieur a créé une Division des Déplacements Urbains et des Transports (DDUT) à travers laquelle il apporte tout son appui aux Collectivités Territoriales.

En effet, la DDUT a élaboré un plan d’actions qui prévoit :

o la mise en place d’une base de données et d’informations pour le suivi du secteur ;

o la normalisation de la démarche de planification des déplacements urbains et de gestion de la circulation et du stationnement grâce à des guides méthodologiques ;

o la préparation de programmes de formation au profit des cadres et responsables locaux.

Dans ce cadre, il est envisagé de lancer deux marchés pour l’élaboration des deux guides comme outils d’appui méthodologique, technique et d’aide à la prise de décision.

D’autre part, un ambitieux programme de formation a été élaboré au profit des Communes Urbaines et de l’Administration Territoriale et Centrale pour le développement d’une expertise dans :

o la préparation et le suivi des stratégies de développement des infrastructures et des services de déplacements urbains ;

o l’organisation des transports publics et le partenariat public-privé ;

o la gestion de la circulation et du stationnement.

Suite au premier programme de formation organisé en 2008 et en vue de pérenniser cette action, une convention cadre dans le domaine de la formation et du renforcement des capacités, entre la DGCL et l’EHTP, a été signée en 2009.

L’objet de cette convention est :

o la formation et le perfectionnement des compétences, notamment dans les domaines techniques et d’ingénierie ;
o l’échange d’expériences en matière de formation ;

o l’échange de documentation et d’information.

Dans le cadre de cette convention, un deuxième programme de formation a été lancé en 2010 en partenariat avec la DFCAT/SEGMA.

L’effectif des participants à ce cycle de formation est de 32 cadres supérieurs responsables des déplacements urbains des villes engagées dans la réalisation des PDU Locales : Casablanca, Rabat, El Jadida, Fès, Meknès, Kénitra, Marrakech, Agadir, Settat, Oujda, Nador. L’effectif est répartir comme suit :

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Wilayas, Préfectures et Provinces.</th>
<th>Communes Urbaines</th>
<th>Autorité Organisatrice des Déplacements Urbains</th>
<th>Administration centrale</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>02</td>
<td>04</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2- Amélioration de l'efficacité de l'offre des services des déplacements urbains et des infrastructures

a- Restructuration des services autobus dans l’agglomération de Casablanca

Vu la demande croissante en transport urbain à Casablanca et les difficultés financière du délégataire de service public M’dina Bus, des mesures ont été prises pour la restructuration de M’dina Bus qui consistent en la conclusion de trois conventions :

o Convention Commune Urbaine de Casablanca– Mdina Bus ;

o convention d’investissement CDG, Transinvest et la RATP-Développement ;

o convention d’investissement Etat – Mdina Bus.

Convention Commune Urbaine de Casablanca– Mdina Bus

Une convention a été conclue entre la Commune Urbaine de Casablanca et l’opérateur M’dina Bus pour l’octroi d’une subvention de 200 million de Dirhams, réservée à l’achat de bus neufs et la réalisation d’un plan de réduction du personnel.

Convention d’investissement CDG, Transinvest et RATP-Développement

La CDG, Transinvest et la RATP-Développement ont signé, le 9 novembre 2009, une convention d’investissement et un pacte d’actionnaire en vue de déterminer les modalités de prise d’une participation par la CDG dans le capital de M’dina Bus par voie d’augmentation de capital.

Ainsi, le capital de M’dina sera augmenté à 410 avec un apport de la CDG de 140 MDH, sur un montant global de l’ordre de 170 MDh, réparti comme suit :

- 25% des actions seront libérées immédiatement, soit un apport de 42,5 MDH ;
- Le reliquat devant être libéré en une ou plusieurs augmentations sur demande du CA de M’dina bus au plus tard dans les trois années suivantes.

Après cette opération, la CDG détient 34% des actions de M’dina Bus.
Convention d'investissement Etat – Mdina Bus

Suite à l’entrée de la CDG dans le capital de M’dina Bus, cette dernière a déposé auprès de l’Agence Marocaine de Développement des Investissements un projet de convention d’investissement qui la lie avec l’Etat sur la période 2010-2012.

Cette convention tient compte aussi bien de la demande en transport, estimé à 800 000 personnes/jour, que de la fin des contrats des concessionnaires, de l’importance des investissements à réaliser et de la réforme des bus usagés acquis en urgence.

Le programme d’investissement, objet de la convention, est estimé à 736 MDH dont 561 MDH sont destinés à l’acquisition de 510 bus neufs montés localement et la création de 1900 emplois directs stables

La société est autorisée, au titre de cette convention, à importer 300 bus d’occasion maximum, répondant à la norme EURO 3 ou équivalent, pour garantir l’offre en transport et faire face à la période de transition vers l’exclusivité, suite au retrait des autres concessionnaires. La totalité de ces bus seront réexportés ou réformés au plus tard 36 mois à compter de leur date de mise en circulation et remplacés par des bus neufs.

La société bénéficiera d’une exonération de droit d’importation, appliquée aux équipements nécessaires à la réalisation du programme d’investissement. En contrepartie, la société s’engage à :

- La mise en place d’un parc moderne d’autobus de dernière génération ;
- L’accompagnement des réaménagements de la voirie en vue de fluidifier le trafic ;
- La mise en place d’une billettique ;
- La formation des ressources humaines ;
- L’amélioration des équipements du réseau pour une meilleure lisibilité de ce dernier.

IL y a lieu de rappeler qu’une première convention d’investissement entre le groupement et l’Etat a été signée en aout 2004. Elle a permis, au 31 aout 2009, la constitution d’un parc de 540 bus circulants, dont 200 montés au Maroc, et l’emploi de plus de 4000 personnes avec un investissement de 400 MDH.

L’indicateur de résultat, retenu pour cette mesure qui vise à atteindre une offre de 2,6 milliards de sièges-km en 2011, a été partiellement atteint, puisque l’offre enregistrée, en 2011, a été de 2,4 milliards de sièges-km, contre 1,9 milliards de sièges-km en 2009.

b- Restructuration des services autobus dans l'agglomération de Rabat-Salé-Témara

L’agglomération de Rabat-Salé-Témara a confié la gestion du service de transport par autobus, assuré jusqu’à 2009 par 7 concessionnaires, au délégataire Staréo, dont le capital a été détenu à plus de 75% par le groupe Veolia. L’objectif a été de déléguer ce service à un opérateur qui témoigne de grandes capacités en matière d’investissement et de gestion du service

Cependant, après l’entrée en vigueur du contrat de gestion délégué, le 29 octobre 2009, le service a connu des perturbations et des dysfonctionnements dus à des facteurs
conjoncturels liés aux conditions de démarrage de l’exploitation et d’autres structurels impactant l’économie globale du contrat.

A cause des pertes accumulées et à l’incapacité du délégataire de poursuivre la gestion du service, un nouveau schéma d’exploitation du service plus approprié a été mis en place. Le schéma a nécessité la création d’un groupement d’agglomérations, en juin 2011, et la reprise, par ce groupement, des actions détenues par Veolia au sein du capital de Staréo.

Le nombre de bus a évolué de 535 en 2009, à 576 en 2010 pour attendre 558 en 2012. Le nombre de bus de moins de cinq ans d’âge s’est renforcé en passant respectivement de 232, à 388 et 429 autobus.

Ceci a permis d’atteindre une offre de 2,26 milliards de sièges-km en 2011, dépassant l’indicateur de suivi, adoptés en 2010 à l’occasion de la préparation du PPD, qui fixe un objectif de 2 milliards de sièges-km.

**c- Amélioration du cadre réglementaire et institutionnel pour les partenariats public-privé**

Le Ministre de l’Intérieur a signé un arrêté, en date du 25 août 2010, définissant le processus de sélection des délégataires des services publics, en application des dispositions de la loi 54.05 relative à la gestion déléguée des services publics. Ce texte n’est pas encore publié au bulletin officiel.

**d- Le financement des services des déplacements urbains et des infrastructures.**

Vu l’importance du volume des investissements que nécessite le secteur et les ressources limitées des Collectivités Territoriales, l’Etat est souvent sollicité pour apporter son appui à l’action locale en vue de financer des projets d’infrastructure et moderniser l’offre en transport public en termes de capacité et de qualité.

Cependant, la mobilisation de tout financement est tributaire de l’implication des Collectivités Territoriales et de leur engagement à inscrire leurs actions selon une approche stratégique, globale et intégrée.

C’est pourquoi le Ministre de l’Intérieur a établis des critères d’éligibilité définissant les conditions que doivent remplir les projets d’infrastructures de transport des Collectivités Territoriales proposés à un soutien financier de l’Etat. Ces critères, diffusés dans une lettre circulaire du 4 novembre 2010, invite les Collectivités Territoriales qui souhaite un appui financier de l’Etat de :

- disposer d’un plan de déplacements urbains (PDU), document stratégique permettant à la ville de développer une politique multimodale cohérente et intégrant toutes les composantes de la mobilité : transport public, gestion du trafic, stationnement, trame piétonnière, aménagement de la voirie… ;
- élaborer un plan d’actions, ou Programme d’Investissement Prioritaire (PIP) pour la mise en œuvre du PDU, avec une programmation à court et moyen termes (3 à 5 ans) et ce, pour une meilleure visibilité de l’emploi des ressources ;
- arrêter une estimation financière du PIP en proposant les montages financiers et les partenariats possibles ainsi que les modalités institutionnelles et opératoires pour la réalisation et l’exploitation ;
o engager le processus de professionnalisation de la gestion des transports publics urbains et promouvoir les partenariats public-privé ;

o accorder la priorité aux projets impactant le développement social pour garantir l’accessibilité des citoyens aux services et à l’emploi ;

o favoriser les projets à impact positif sur l’environnement en vue de réduire la consommation de l’énergie et d’améliorer la qualité de l’air.

Seule la ville de Marrakech a soumis au Ministère de l’Intérieur, pour soutien financier, un projet multimodal de déplacement (lignes BHNS, aménagement voirie et carrefours, régulation de la circulation…). Après étude du projet, par les services du Ministère de l’Intérieur, des remarques ont été émises, insistant sur la nécessité de la finalisation du montage financier établi, la programmation détaillée des réalisations et l’élaboration des études nécessaires à leur exécution.

3- Amélioration de la soutenabilité sociale et environnementale du secteur des déplacements urbains

a- Amélioration de la qualité de l’air dans les grandes agglomérations

Le Ministère de l’Equipement et des Transports a achevé la restructuration des centres de visite technique des véhicules en prenant les mesures suivantes :

o signature d’un contrat avec un troisième opérateur national pour appuyer les centres de visite technique existants ;

o mise en place d’un processus électronique automatisé de préparation des procès verbaux de visite technique ;

o signature d’un contrat pour l’audit des centres de visite technique.

o une inspection efficace des véhicules et des systèmes de suivi ont été mis en place.

Le nombre de visites qui ont reçu le procès verbal automatisé d’inspection technique a été de l’ordre de : 1. 100 000 visites techniques en 2009. Ce chiffre est passé à 1 660 013 en 2011 soit un écart de 39 987 par rapport à l’objectif fixé dans le cadre du Programme d’Actions Prioritaires (1 700 000).

b- Amélioration de l'accessibilité pour les personnes à mobilité réduite

Conscient de l’importance des accessibilités dans la vie des personnes en situation d’handicap, Les accessibilités constituent une des préoccupations majeures du Ministère de la Solidarité, de la Femme, de la Famille et du Développement Social (MSFFDS).

L’adoption de la loi n°10.03 relative aux accessibilités, le 21 mai 2003, a constitué un fait marquant dans le processus de renforcement des droits des personnes en situation de handicap, vu le rôle vital qu’assume l’accessibilité en matière d’intégration sociale. Des actions ont été prises que ce soit dans la mise en accessibilité des espaces publics dans certaines villes (Khémisset, Settat, Martil et Rabat-Hassan) ou dans la formation des professionnels et en matière de sensibilisation.

Après, la ratification de la Convention Internationale des Personnes Handicapées par le Maroc en 2009, qui perçoit l’accessibilité en étant un droit fondamental des personnes
handicapées, le MSFFDS s’est impliqué fortement dans le processus de mise en place de la Stratégie Nationale des Déplacements Urbains, qui prévoit la réforme du secteur du transport public et l’amélioration de la mobilité urbaine dans les grandes villes, en intégrant la thématique « accessibilité » dans ce grand projet et ce, via un plan d’action, élaboré en partenariat avec les départements ministériels concernés et avec l’appui technique de la Banque Mondiale, comportant plusieurs actions regroupées en quatre volets :

- la création d’un cadre juridique et réglementaire nécessaire pour définir les besoins en matière d’accessibilité ;
- le renforcement des capacités institutionnelles des parties prenantes sur les questions d’accessibilité, et l’établissement de mécanismes de coordination ;
- le renforcement des capacités techniques par l’élaboration de guides, la formation et la normalisation des équipements de transport ;
- le développement des actions de sensibilisation et de communication.

Pour l’appui à la réalisation de ce plan d’actions, un don a été octroyé par le gouvernement japonais dont l’accord sera signé incessamment.

En application de ce plan, le MSFFDS a préparé un programme de travail, étalé sur trois ans, et qui comporte trois volets : formation des intervenants dans le domaine de l’habitat et de l’urbanisme, la sensibilisation de la société civile et du grand public et le réaménagement de quelques espaces publics phares dans une ville pilote.

A cet égard, le MSFFDS a constitué une commission composé des acteurs impliqués dans le PDD pour le suivi et l’exécution de ce plan d’action.

Sur le plan opérationnel, le MSFFDS est en train de finaliser une étude pilote sur le niveau d’accessibilité de la ville de Marrakech pour les personnes à mobilité réduite, ce projet sera validé vers fin mars 2012. L’étude permettra l’identification des principaux problèmes et de proposer des solutions.

En matière de sensibilisation, le Ministère a élaboré un guide unifié des normes d’accessibilité architecturales et urbanistiques. Ce guide a été diffusé le 06 avril 2011 aux ONGs et secteurs concernés. Il sera transmis par la suite aux agences urbaines et aux Collectivités Territoriales afin de veiller à l’application des accessibilités sur le terrain.

Concernant le volet formation, le MSFFDS a signé en avril 2010 une convention de partenariat avec l’Ordre National des Architectes, dont l’objet consiste à l’organisation de sessions de formation en faveur des professionnels de l’urbanisme et à l’accompagnement technique des projets réalisés par le Ministère.

En matière d’amélioration des accessibilités des espaces publics, une convention a été signée avec la Wilaya de la Région de Marrakech Tensift Al Haouz et le Conseil de la ville de Marrakech, et vise l’intégration des accessibilités dans les principaux lieux et espaces ouverts au public.

En vue de disposer d’un cadre juridique cohérent qui répond aux attentes des personnes en situation de handicap et dans le cadre de l’harmonisation de la législation marocaine avec la Convention Internationale des Droits des Personnes Handicapées, le MDSFS a
élaboré un projet de décret portant application de la loi 10-03, qui comprend les dispositions générales et les caractéristiques techniques relatives aux accessibilités urbanistiques, architecturales, de transport et de la communication. Ce décret a été promulgué le 13 octobre 2011.

III- EVALUATION DE LA DEMARCHE DU PROGRAMME D’ACTIONS PRIORITAIRES

1- Facteurs clés ayant contribués à la réussite du programme

Le programme de réforme engagé avec l’appui de la Banque Mondiale a été établi dans une démarche participative et à l’issue d’une longue concertation avec les partenaires de ce projet et ce, dès l’élaboration du diagnostic en 2006 jusqu’à la validation de l’étude sur les déplacements urbains et de la stratégie sectorielle ainsi que la préparation du programme du PPD.

Les ateliers organisés en 2006 ont suscité un débat riche et fructueux et ont abouti à un diagnostic partagé entre toutes les parties prenantes, qu’elles soient, Collectivités Territoriales, Départements Ministérielles ou Administration Locale. Les journées thématiques, couronnées par l’organisation du Séminaire Régional sur les Déplacements Urbains en Méditerranée à Skhirat en 2008 ont permis d’unifier la vision et d’arrêter les orientations et les recommandations de la Stratégie Nationale des Déplacements Urbains.

Cette concertation s’est poursuivie dans le cadre du travail du comité interministériel chargé de la préparation du programme du PPD, facilitant ainsi la coordination et l’implication de l’ensemble des intervenants, chacun en ce qui le concerne, pour :

- l’identification des mesures de réforme prioritaires à court terme ;
- la finalisation du Programme d’Actions Prioritaire ;
- l’élaboration d’un calendrier préliminaire de préparation du PPD ;
- la mise en œuvre des réformes selon les objectifs arrêtés.

2- Appréciation des résultats

Le bilan des réalisations au titre du premier PPD est globalement positif. Toutes les mesures, contenues dans la matrice du Programme d’Actions Prioritaires du PPD ont été réalisées et achevées à l’exception de la mesure qui consiste en la tenue des réunions du CNDU. Cette action sera satisfaite au cours de l’année 2012.

Par ailleurs, les réformes engagées pour l’amélioration des transports publics et des conditions de la mobilité urbaine dans les villes s’inscrivent dans la durée et leur impact ne peut être palpable qu’à moyen et à long terme. Les efforts doivent se poursuivre pour améliorer, surtout la gouvernance du secteur en renforçant les capacités des Collectivités Territoriales et en mettant en place des mécanismes de financement pérennes.

A ce titre, l’appui financier aux Collectivités Territoriales doit servir de levier pour asseoir les bases d’une bonne gouvernance qui consiste à positionner tout projet dans une vision globale et intégrée, exigeant l’atteinte d’objectifs et de résultats sur le plan de planification et de gestion de la mobilité urbaine, d’organisation des réseaux de transport,
d’amélioration du niveau de service, avec la prise en considération des aspects sociaux et de leurs impacts.

3- Evaluation de la performance de la Banque Mondiale et de l’emprunteur

l’apport de la Banque Mondiale a été considérable au niveau de l’appui technique à travers les études et les rapports engagés sur le secteur des déplacements urbains et qui ont abouti à l’élaboration du document de stratégie ; en plus des études d’accompagnement élaborées lors de l’engagement du processus de préparation du PPD, à savoir les études d’évaluation des impacts sur l’environnement et d’analyse d’impact sur la pauvreté et le social.

L’élaboration du programme de réforme a bénéficié également de l’accompagnement et du soutien de la Banque Mondiale. Plusieurs missions de cette institution ont été mobilisées pour contribuer, dans un cadre d’échange et de dialogue constructif, à la préparation des mesures qui ont été incluses dans le Programme d’Actions Prioritaires et du plan d’actions pour les PMR.

Le Ministère de l’Intérieur a joué un rôle déterminant dans l’aboutissement de ce projet. Dès le départ, il a participé à l’élaboration des études, à l’organisation et au pilotage des négociations et des concertations avec les parties prenantes sur les principales composantes de la Stratégie Nationales des Déplacements Urbains et du Programme d’Actions Prioritaire relatif au PPD.

Les premières réformes pour le renforcement du cadre institutionnel et des capacités locales et pour l’appui à la planification ainsi que les chantiers ouverts pour le développement et la modernisation de l’offre du transport public ont été possibles grâce à la mobilisation, par le Ministère de l’Intérieur, des moyens et des ressources et à l’implication de ses partenaires.

4- Les perspectives d’avenir


L’appui de la Banque Mondiale peut également être envisagé dans le cadre de projets d’investissement dans l’infrastructure des transports urbains en sites propres de type BHNS, prévus notamment à Casablanca, à Marrakech et à Agadir, vu leur coût d’investissement peu élevé et leur impact sur la qualité et l’efficacité des transports publics.
Annex 5. Comments of Cofinanciers and Other Partners/Stakeholders

Not Applicable
Annex 6. List of Supporting Documents

- Program Document
- Aide-Memoires
- ISR}s