



**Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
Irrigated Agriculture Improvement Project (KPIAIP)**

INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLAN FRAMEWORK

January 2019

**Directorate of On-Farm Water Management
Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa**



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

With geographical proximity and community ties to Afghanistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has suffered from the fallout of the Afghan conflicts, which has given rise to a precarious security situation as well as prolonged sociopolitical and economic instability. In order to overcome this difficult situation, the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has reached an agreement with the World Bank to develop a broad program for economic development in the province with financial assistance from the Bank: the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Irrigation Agriculture Improvement Project. It consists of three components: on-farm water management infrastructure; on-farm water management techniques; and agriculture. The direct beneficiaries are the farmers and rural communities.

PROJECT DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVE

The Project Development Objective is to improve the performance of irrigated agriculture on smallholder farms in the project area. This objective will be achieved through: (i) improving on-farm water management (OFWM) system by upgrading watercourses, introducing advanced irrigation technologies, and strengthening the capacity of communities, farmers, and OFWM Directorate; and (ii) increasing agriculture productivity as well as promoting agro-processing and value addition. The Project would cover all districts and tehsils of the province.

KALASH – BACKGROUND AND CHARACTERISTICS

The Kalash people in the Chitral district of the province consider themselves indigenous due to their distinct language, folklore, and polytheistic religion; differentiate them from the other communities in the area who migrated to Chitral at a later time. They satisfy the qualifications as indigenous people in the World Bank Operational Policy 4.10: a distinct, vulnerable, social and cultural group. Known as Kafirs or infidels, the Kalasha tribe represents a unique culture dating back to at least 3,000 years. Some call them descendants of Alexander the Great. Once scattered all over Chitral, they are now confined in three main valleys of Bumburet, Rumbur, and Birir. Due to their conversion to Islam, high infant and maternal mortality rate among Kalasha women and increasing migration of many Muslim outsiders to Kalasha valleys, their population and influence has decreased in the area. If the trend continues, the Kalasha culture may soon be extinct.

NEEDS FOR INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLAN – WEAK LEGAL STATUS OF INDIGENOUS PEOPLES IN PAKISTAN

The Constitution of Pakistan 1973 does not recognize Indigenous Peoples; the word “indigenous” is not found in the Constitution. Hence, there is no particular law to safeguard Indigenous Peoples rights and privileges. However, the tribal people living in various parts of Pakistan have been acknowledged in Article 1 of the Constitution, and given certain rights and privileges under Articles 246 and 247. They have been given political representation in the Parliament under Articles 51 and 59. The national and provincial laws can be extended to the Tribal Areas only with the consent of the President of Pakistan, despite the country’s ratification of ILO

Convention 107 on Indigenous and Tribal Populations. In the absence of any other legal instrument for the indigenous peoples, they can be treated under the category of people living in the Tribal Areas.

NEEDS FOR INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLAN –PAKISTAN’S INTERNATIONAL OBLIGATIONS TOWARD INDIGENOUS PEOPLES

Pakistan has signed or ratified several international human rights treaties and declarations, including ILO Convention 107 on Indigenous and Tribal Populations, the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, International Convention on Civil and Political Rights, Convention on the Rights of the Child and the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination. Pakistan voted in favor of the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples in 2007. Pakistan has so far not signed the ILO Convention 169 on Indigenous and Tribal peoples, an update to ILO Convention 107.

NEEDS FOR INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLAN AND FRAMEWORK - WORLD BANK OPERATIONAL POLICY

The World Bank recognizes that the identities and cultures of indigenous peoples are inextricably linked to the lands on which they live and the natural resources on which they depend. These distinct circumstances expose indigenous peoples to different types of risks and levels of impacts from development projects, including loss of identity, culture, and customary livelihoods, as well as exposure to disease. In addition, gender and intergenerational issues among indigenous people are complex. The World Bank Operational Policy 4.10 on Indigenous Peoples (2013) aims at ensuring poverty reduction and sustainable development by respecting the dignity, human rights, economies, and cultures of indigenous peoples. For all projects that are proposed for Bank financing and affect indigenous peoples, the Bank requires the borrower to engage in a process of free, prior, and informed consultation, resulting in broad community support to the project by the affected indigenous peoples.

An Indigenous Peoples Plan must be established if the subprojects to be funded under the project are considered to incur more than negligible negative impacts on the indigenous peoples in terms of: (i) customary rights of use and access to land and natural resource; (ii) socioeconomic status; (iii) cultural and communal integrity; (iv) health, education, livelihood, and social security status; or (e) recognition of indigenous knowledge; and (v) the level of vulnerability of the affected indigenous community. This Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework is elaborated to provide guidance and stipulate requirements for establishing an Indigenous Peoples Plan for subprojects under the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Irrigation Agriculture Improvement Project, which must be based on the subproject details to render it operational and effective on the ground.

FREE, PRIOR AND INFORMED CONSENT

The World Bank Operational Policy 4.10 on indigenous peoples requires a process of free, prior and informed consent (FPIC) leading to broad community support from indigenous peoples benefiting from, or affected by, Bank-financed subprojects. The principle of FPIC recognizes the indigenous people’s inherent and prior rights to their lands, territories and resources and respects their legitimate authority and requires processes that allow and support meaningful choices by the people about their development path. According to the Policy, the borrower needs to use participatory consultative methods that are appropriate to the social and cultural values

of the affected communities and their local conditions. In designing these methods, the borrower must give special attention to the concerns of indigenous women, youth, and children and their access to development opportunities and benefits.

PROJECT IMPACTS AND MITIGATION MEASURES

The project can bring about major positive impacts, as the overall objective is to increase agriculture production through improved irrigation system and to enhance climate resiliency of the most vulnerable farmers. The most effective approach to achieve this objective is to manage the resources holistically and based on ecosystems and watersheds. In view of the growing population and decreasing water resources, agriculture should be intensified to produce more with less input, relying on design, management methods and local specificities. The increased frequency and intensity justify the full integration of flood-control capacities in irrigation systems.

Given the possible magnitude of adverse impacts from land acquisition on livelihood and culture, no subproject requiring land acquisition will be approved. The indigenous customs and traditions are being threatened by increasing influx of tourists, and the situation will be exacerbated if laborers are hired for the project from outside the communities. In order to avoid intrusion of outsiders and erosion of the culture, the project activities for the Kalash people will build on the indigenous knowledge of water, agriculture and natural resources management while integrating practices that make them more sustainable and resilient to climate change. Special attention will be paid to hydrology, as a number of waterbodies are considered sacred. The Framework for Indigenous Peoples Plan addresses these concerns.

خلاصہ

جغرافیائی قربت اور لوگوں کے افغانستان سے تعلقات کے باعث صوبہ خیبر پختونخوا افغان تنازعات کے اثرات سے متاثر ہوا ہے جو سیکورٹی کی نازک صورتحال اور طویل سماجی و سیاسی اور اقتصادی عدم استحکام کی وجہ سے پیدا ہوئے ہیں۔ اس مشکل صورتحال پر قابو پانے کے لئے خیبر پختونخوا کی حکومت عالمی بینک کے ساتھ ایک معاہدے تک پہنچی ہے تاکہ صوبے میں عالمی بینک کی مالی معاونت کے ساتھ اقتصادی ترقی کے لئے وسیع پروگرام تیار کیا جا سکے:

خیبر پختونخوا میں زرعی آبپاشی کی بہتری کا منصوبہ تین حصوں پر مشتمل ہے: آبپاشی؛ فارم پر پانی کا انتظام؛ زراعت اور مال مویشی۔ اس سے براہ راست فائدہ اٹھانے والوں میں کسان بشمول گلہ بان اور دیہی باشندے شامل ہیں۔

منصوبے کی تیاری کا مقصد

منصوبے کا مقصد منصوبے کے متعلقہ علاقوں میں پانی کا انتظام، پیداواری صلاحیت، اضافی قدر اور سیراب کی گئی زرعی زمینوں پر موسمیاتی اثرات کی برداشت کو بڑھایا جا سکے۔ یہ مقصد مندرجہ ذیل عوامل کے ذریعے حاصل کیا جائے گا (i) آبپاشی کے نظام میں جدت لانا اور محکمہ آبپاشی کی استعداد کار بڑھانا؛ (ii) کھالہ جات کی بحالی اور بہتری کے ذریعے کھیتوں پر پانی کے انتظام کو بہتر بنانا، آبپاشی کے لئے جدید ٹیکنالوجی متعارف کرنا، اور مقامی آبادی / کسانوں اور کھیتوں پر پانی کے انتظام کے محکمہ کی استعداد کار اور صلاحیت کو بہتر کرنا (iii) زرعی پیداواری صلاحیت بڑھانا اور ویلیو چین ڈویلپمنٹ (VCD) کو فروغ دینا۔

کالاش۔۔ پس منظر اور خصوصیات

صوبے کے ضلع چترال میں کالاش کے لوگ اپنے آپ کو اپنی مخصوص زبان، لوک ریت اور مشرکانہ مذہب کی وجہ سے قدرتی طور پر اس علاقے کے باسی سمجھتے ہیں جو انہیں بعد میں ہجرت کر کے چترال منتقل ہونے والے لوگوں سے مختلف بناتا ہے۔ وہ عالمی بینک کی آپریشنل پالیسی 4.10 کے مطابق: ایک منفرد، کمزور، سماجی اور ثقافتی گروپ میں بطور مقامی باسیوں کے معیار کو پورا کرتے ہیں۔ کافر یا بے دین کے طور پر پہچان رکھنے والا کالاش قبیلہ تین ہزار سال قبل ایک منفرد ثقافت کی نمائندگی کرتا ہے۔ کچھ اپنے آپ کو سکندر اعظم کی اولاد کہلاتے ہیں۔ پورے چترال میں پھیل جانے والے یہ مقامی لوگاب تین بڑی وادیوں بمبوریت، رومبور اور بیریر تک محدود ہو چکے ہیں۔ وقت کے ساتھ ان کی اسلام قبول کرنے کی شرح، کالاشا خواتین میں بچوں اور زچہ کی زیادہ شرح اموات اور کالاشا وادیوں میں باہر سے زیادہ مسلمانوں کی ہجرت کے بڑھتے ہوئے رجحان کے باعث ان کی علاقے میں آبادی اور اثر و رسوخ کم ہو گیا ہے۔ اگر یہ رجحان جاری رہا تو کالاشا ثقافت بہت جلد ناپید ہو سکتی ہے۔

مقامی عوام کی منصوبہ بندی کے لئے ضروریات۔پاکستان میں مقامی عوام کا کمزور قانونی درجہ

پاکستان کا 1973 کا آئین مقامی لوگوں کو تسلیم نہیں کرتا؛ لفظ "مقامی لوگ" آئین میں موجود نہیں۔ اس لئے یہاں مقامی لوگوں کے حقوق اور استحقاق کو تحفظ دینے کے لئے کوئی مخصوص قانون نہیں ہے۔ تاہم پاکستان کے مختلف حصوں میں رہنے والے قبائلی لوگوں کو آئین کے آرٹیکل ایک کے تحت تسلیم کیا جاتا ہے اور انہیں آرٹیکل 246 اور 247 کے تحت مخصوص استحقاق دیا جاتا ہے۔ انہیں آرٹیکل 51 اور 59 کے تحت پارلیمنٹ میں سیاسی نمائندگی دی جاتی ہے۔ مقامی لوگوں اور قبائلی آبادی پر آئی ایل او کنونشن 107 کی ملکی توثیق کے باوجود قومی اور صوبائی قوانین کو صرف صدر پاکستان کی مرضی سے قبائلی علاقوں تک توسیع دی جا سکتی ہے۔ مقامی لوگوں کے لئے کوئی دوسرا قانون نہ ہونے پر ان کے ساتھ قبائلی علاقوں میں رہنے والے لوگوں کی درجہ بندی کے تحت سلوک کیا جا سکتا ہے۔

مقامی عوام کی منصوبہ بندی کے لئے ضروریات۔مقامی لوگوں کی جانب پاکستان کی بین الاقوامی ذمہ داریاں

پاکستان بہت سے انسانی حقوق کے بین الاقوامی معاہدوں اور اعلامیوں پر دستخط یا توثیق کر چکا ہے جس میں مقامی افراد اور قبائلی آبادی پر آئی ایل او کے کنونشن 107، اقتصادی، سماجی اور ثقافتی حقوق پر عالمی عہد، سول اور سیاسی حقوق پر عالمی کنونشن، بچوں کے حقوق پر کنونشن اور تمام اقسام کے نسلی امتیاز کے خاتمے پر عالمی کنونشن شامل ہیں۔ پاکستان نے 2007 میں مقامی لوگوں کے حقوق پر اقوام متحدہ کے اعلامیے کے حق میں ووٹ دیا تھا۔ پاکستان نے ابھی تک مقامی لوگوں اور قبائلی عوام پر آئی ایل او کے کنونشن 169 پر دستخط نہیں کئے جو آئی ایل او کنونشن 107 کا ترمیم شدہ مسودہ ہے۔

مقامی عوام کی منصوبہ بندی کے لئے ضروریات اور فریم ورک۔ عالمی بینک کی آپریشنل پالیسی

عالمی بینک کے مطابق مقامی لوگوں کی شناخت اور ثقافت ہر لحاظ سے اس خطے اور اس کے قدرتی وسائل سے منسلک ہوتی ہے جہاں وہ رہتے ہیں۔ ان مخصوص حالات کی وجہ سے مقامی لوگوں کو مختلف نوعیت کے خطرات اور ترقیاتی منصوبوں کے اثرات کا مختلف سطحوں پر سامنا رہتا ہے جن میں شناخت، ثقافت، روایتی ذریعہ معاش، اور بیماری کے نقصان کا سامنا شامل ہے۔ اس کے علاوہ مقامی لوگوں کو صنفی اور بین النسلی مسائل کی پیچیدگی کا بھی سامنا ہوتا ہے۔ مقامی لوگوں پر عالمی بینک کی آپریشنل پالیسی 4.10 (2013) کا مقصد مقامی لوگوں کے وقار، انسانی حقوق، معیشت، اور ثقافت کو ملحوظ خاطر رکھتے ہوئے غربت کو کم کرنا اور پائیدار ترقی کو یقینی بنانا ہے۔ ایسے تمام منصوبوں میں جو کہ بینک کی مالی معاونت کے ذریعے تجویز کئے جاتے ہیں اور جو مقامی لوگوں کو متاثر کر سکتے ہیں ان میں ضروری امر یہ ہے کہ قرض خواہ مقامی لوگوں کو پہلے اطلاع شدہ مشاورت میں زادانہ طور پر شامل کریں تاکہ مقامی لوگوں کی منصوبہ کے لئے وسیع تر حمایت حاصل ہو سکے۔

مقامی لوگوں کا منصوبہ لازمی طور پر تیار ہونا چاہیئے اس صورت میں کہ اگر منصوبے کے تحت فنڈ ہونے والے ذیلی منصوبوں میں مقامی لوگوں پر نظر انداز ہونے سے زیادہ منفی اثرات مرتب ہوں جیسا کہ (i) زمین اور قدرتی وسائل تک رسائی اور استعمال کے روایتی حقوق (ii)، سماجی و اقتصادی حیثیت، (iii) ثقافتی اور کمیونٹی کی سطح پر سالمیت، (iv) صحت، تعلیم، روزگار اور سماجی تحفظ کا درجہ؛ یا مقامی علم کی شناخت؛ اور (v) متاثرہ مقامی کمیونٹی کے کمزور ہونے کی سطح۔ مقامی لوگوں کے منصوبے کا یہ

فریم ورک خیبر پختونخوا آبپاشی زرعی بہتری کے منصوبے کے تحت مقامی لوگوں کے منصوبے کے لئے ذیلی منصوبوں کے قیام کے لئے رہنمائی کی فراہمی اور ضروریات کے تعین کی وضاحت کرتا ہے جسے ذیلی منصوبے کی تفصیلات پر لازمی طور مبنی ہونا چاہئے تاکہ اسے آپریشنل اور حقیقی طور پر موثر بنایا جا سکے

آزادانہ ، قبل از وقت اطلاعی رضامندی (FPIC)

عالمی بینک کی مقامی لوگوں پر آپریشنل پالیسی 4.10 ایک آزادانہ ، قبل از وقت اطلاعی رضامندی (FPIC) کا تقاضہ کرتی ہے جو مقامی آبادی کی وسیع حمایت کا باعث بنے اور بینک کی طرف سے فراہم کی گئی مالی معاونت کی مدد سے ذیلی منصوبوں سے مقامی لوگ فائدہ اٹھائیں یا متاثر ہوں۔ ایف پی آئی سی کا اصول مقامی لوگوں کی موروثیت اور ان کی زمینوں ، علاقوں اور وسائل پر پہلے سے حقوق کو تسلیم کرتا ہے اور ان کے جائز اختیار کو احترام دیتا ہے اور ایسے عوامل کا تقاضہ کرتا ہے جو لوگوں کی اپنی ترقی کی طرف بامعنی پسند کی اجازت اور حمایت کرے۔ پالیسی کے مطابق قرض حاصل کرنے والے کے لئے ضروری ہے کہ وہ شراکتی مشاورتی طریقوں کو استعمال کرے جو متاثرہ کمیونٹیز کی سماجی اور ثقافتی اقدار اور ان کی مقامی صورتحال کے لئے مناسب ہوں۔ ایسے طریقوں کو ڈیزائن کرتے ہوئے قرض حاصل کرنے والے کے لئے لازمی ہے کہ وہ مقامی خواتین ، نوجوان اور بچوں کے خدشات ، ترقی کے مواقع اور فوائد تک رسائی پر خصوصی توجہ دے۔

منصوبے کے اثرات اور تخفیفی اقدامات

اس منصوبے کے اہم مثبت اثرات مرتب ہو سکتے ہیں جیسا کہ مجموعی طور پر اس کا مقصد بہتر آبپاشی کے نظام اور موسمیاتی تغیر کے خلاف کسانوں میں بہتر مدافعت کے ذریعے زرعی پیداوار بڑھانا ہے۔ اس مقصد کو حاصل کرنے کے لیے موثر ترین نقطہ نظریہ ہے کہ وسائل کو کلی طور پر منظم کیا جائے جس کا انحصار ماحولیاتی نظام اور قدرتی پانی کے زرائع کے نظام پر ہے بڑھتی ہوئی آبادی اور پانی کے کم ہوتے ہوئے وسائل کو مد نظر رکھتے ہوئے محدود پیداواری وسائل ، موجودہ مقامی انتظامی طریقہ ہائے کار پر اکتفا کرتے ہوئے زراعت کو مزید پرائر کرنا چاہیے۔ اور آبپاشی کے نظام میں سیلابی صورت حال پر قابو پانے کی صلاحیت کا انتظام پیداواری بڑھوتری کی توثیق کرتا ہے۔ زمین کے حصول سے روزگار اور ثقافت پر ممکنہ منفی اثرات کو دیکھتے ہوئے کسی ذیلی منصوبے کو درکار زمین کے حصول کی منظوری نہیں دی جائے گی۔ سیاحوں کی بڑھتی ہوئی آمد سے مقامی تہذیب اور روایات کو خطرات لاحق ہو سکتے ہیں اور صورتحال مزید بدتر ہونے کا امکان ہے اگر منصوبے کے لئے مقامی افراد کے بجائے باہر سے مزدوروں کو حاصل کیا گیا۔ بیرونی مداخلت اور ثقافت کو لاحق خطرات سے بچنے کے لیے کالاش کے لوگوں کے لئے منصوبے سے متعلق سرگرمیاں پانی ، زراعت اور مال مویشی کے انتظام مقام طور پر رائج طریقہ کار پر کیا جائے گا اور انتظامی طریقے اپنائے جائیں گے جو انہیں موسمیاتی تبدیلی سے نمٹنے کے لیے زیادہ مستحکم اور پرائر بنائیں گے۔ آبی علم پر خصوصی توجہ دی جائے گی جیسا کہ کچھ پانی کے ذخائر مقدس تصور کئے جاتے ہیں۔ روایتی زراعت کے مقابلے میں مال مویشی کی سرگرمیاں زیادہ اہم تصور ہوتی ہیں۔ چارے اور گھاس کے میدانوں پر انحصار کی وجہ سے پانی کو مال مویشیوں کی سرگرمیوں کے لئے اہم سمجھا جاتا ہے۔ مقامی لوگوں کے پلان کافریم ورک ان خدشات کو دور کرتا ہے

Acronyms and Abbreviations

AKRSP	Aga Khan Rural Support Programme
BP	Bank Policy
CPS	Country Partnership Strategy
EA	Executive Agency
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
ESM	Environmental and Social Management
ESMF	Environmental and Social Management Framework
FPIC	Free Prior Informed Consultation
GRM	Grievance Redress Mechanism
GRC	Grievance Redress Committee
HEIS	High Efficiency Irrigation System
IDA	International Development Association
IA	Implementing Agency
ILO	International Labor Organization
IP	Indigenous People
IPP	Indigenous Peoples Plan
ITP	Indigenous Tribal People
IPPF	Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework
KP	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
LSO	Local Support Organization
LGRC	Local Grievance Redress Committee
LAR	Land Acquisition & Resettlement
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NDRA	National Database Registration Authority
OFM	On Farm Management
OP	Operational Policy
PIU	Project Implementation Unit
PD	Project Director
PDO	Project Development Objectives
PPAF	Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund
RAP	Resettlement Action Plan
UC	Union Council
UN	United Nation
UNDRIP	United Nation Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People
VC	Village Council

GLOSSARY

Ancestral Domain	Ancestral domain or ancestral lands refer to the lands, territories and resources of indigenous peoples.
Ancestral Land	Land occupied, possessed and utilized by individuals, families and clans who are members of the IPs since time immemorial, by themselves or through their predecessors-in-interest.
Culture	Ways, in which a society preserves, identifies, organizes, sustains and expresses itself.
Customs	Norms of conduct and patterns of relationships or usages of a community over time accepted and recognized as binding on all members.
Empowerment	A process that enables people to make their choices, have a say in decisions that affect them, initiate actions for development, cause change of attitude and enhance increased consciousness of equal access to and control of resources and services so as to take charge of development opportunities.
Free, Prior and Informed Consent	<p>A consensus of all members of an IP community to be determined in accordance with their respective customary laws and practices, free from any external manipulation, interference and coercion, and obtained after fully disclosing the intent and scope of the activity, in a language and process understandable to the community.</p> <p>The aim of Free Prior Informed Consent (FPIC) is to establish bottom up participation and consultation of an Indigenous Population prior to the beginning of a development on ancestral land or using resources within the Indigenous Population's territory, to fully identify their views and ascertain their broad community support for the project;</p>
Gender	The social and cultural construct of the roles, responsibilities, attributes, opportunities, privileges, status, access to and control over resources as well as benefits between men and women, boys and girls in a given society.
Human Rights	Inherent, inalienable and indispensable entitlements that protect every person from abuse and deprivation.
Indigenous People	A group of people or homogenous societies who has historical continuity with pre-colonial or pre-settler societies; a strong link to territories and

surrounding natural resources; a distinct social, economic, or political system; a distinct language, culture and beliefs; individuals that form non-dominant groups of society and those that resolve to maintain and reproduce their ancestral environments and systems as distinctive peoples and communities.

Marginalized groups	Persons or groups of persons deprived of opportunities for living a respectable and reasonable life as provided for in the Constitution of Pakistan.
Migrant	A person who is not a native to the ancestral domain or not a part owner of ancestral land but who, as a consequence of social, economic, political or other reasons, such as displacement due to natural disasters, armed conflict, population pressure, or search for seasonal work, opted to occupy and utilize portions of the ancestral land/domain and have since then established residence therein.
<i>Qazi</i>	A member of Kalash communities who is appointed by the community to decisions and resolve the local conflicts.
Tribal Areas	The Federally Administered Tribal Areas(FATA) was a semi-autonomoustribal region in northwesternPakistanthat existed from 1947 until being merged with neighboring province Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, in 2018. It consisted of Seven tribal (districts) and six frontier regions and was directly governed by Pakistan's Federal Government through a special set of laws called the Frontier Crimes Regulations.
Vulnerability	A state of being in or exposed to a risky situation where a person is likely to suffer significant physical, emotional or mental harm that may result in his/her humanrights not being fulfilled.
Youth	Youth is defined as a period during which a person prepares himself/herself to be an active and fully, responsible member of the society. It is a period of transformation from family dependent childhood to independent adulthood and integration in the society as a responsible citizen. National Youth Policy of Pakistan-2008 defines youth as the population in the age group of 15-29 years.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	1
GLOSSARY.....	VIII
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	X
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
1 INTRODUCTION.....	1
2 PROJECT DESCRIPTION.....	1
2.1 Project Development Objective.....	1
2.2 Project Description.....	2
3 LEGISLATIVE, POLICY AND INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK FOR INDIGENOUS PEOPLES	3
3.1 Overview	3
3.2 Constitution of Pakistan 1973.....	4
3.3 Executive Order for the Protection of Kalash Communities.....	6
3.4 Kalash and National Database and Registration Authorities.....	6
3.5 United Nations Protection for Kalash Cultural Heritage.....	6
3.6 International Labor Organization Conventions 107 and 169.....	7
3.7 United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People	7
3.8 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	7
3.9 World Bank Policy on Environmental Assessment – Operational Policy 4.01.....	9
3.10 World Bank Policy on Indigenous Peoples- Operational Policy 4.10.....	9
4 INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLAN FRAMEWORK AND INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLAN	10
4.1 Criteria for Indigenous Peoples.....	10
4.2 Rationale for Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework	11
4.3 Objectives of Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework.....	11
4.4 Scope of Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework	12
4.5 Category of Subproject	12
4.6 Rationale for Indigenous Peoples Plan	13
4.7 Objectives of Indigenous Peoples Plan	13
5 Methodology for Preparation of Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework	14
5.1 Documents Review	14

5.2	Field Visits and Stakeholder Consultations.....	14
6	Socioeconomics and Culture of Kalash	14
6.1	Overview	14
6.2	Kalash Population.....	15
6.3	Language	16
6.4	Kalasha Women	16
6.5	Access to Education and Official Documentation.....	17
6.6	Economy.....	17
6.6.1	Non-Timber Forest Products.....	18
6.6.2	Animals Products	19
6.6.3	Timber Products.....	19
6.7	Main Festivals	20
6.8	Spiritual Lakes	20
6.9	Spiritual Places	21
6.10	Identity, Rights and Voice	21
7	STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATIONS	22
7.1	Focus Group Discussions in Anish Village - Bumburet Valley	22
7.1.1	Major Food Items.....	22
7.1.2	Irrigation.....	23
7.1.3	Forests.....	23
7.1.4	Irrigation.....	23
7.2	Focus Group Discussions with Women in Anish Village - Bumburet Valley	24
7.3	Focus Group Discussions in Groom Village - Rumbur Valley	24
7.3.1	Major Food Items.....	24
7.3.2	Irrigation.....	24
7.3.3	Forests.....	25
7.3.4	Livestock.....	25
7.4	Focus Group Discussions in GrambetGool Village - Birir Valley.....	25
7.4.1	Major Food Items.....	25
7.4.2	Irrigation.....	25
7.4.3	Forest	26
7.4.4	Livestock.....	26
7.5	Focus Group Discussions in the Three Valleys - Methods of Agriculture	26

7.6	Focus Group Discussions in the Three Valleys – Division of Labor and Mobility of Women.....	27
7.7	Focus Group Discussions in the Three Valleys –Social Cohesion.....	27
7.8	Key Informant Interviews.....	27
7.9	Institutional Stakeholder Interviews.....	28
8	POTENTIAL IMPACTS OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA IRRIGATED AGRICULTURE IMPROVEMENT PROJECT .	28
8.1	Potential Positive Impacts.....	28
8.2	Potential Negative Impacts.....	30
8.2.1	Irrigation Watercourses	30
8.2.2	Technology for Efficient Water Use	31
8.2.3	Horticulture: Diversification and Value Addition.....	32
8.3	Mitigation Measures.....	33
8.3.1	Integrated Resources Management: Climate Change, Food Security and Disaster Risk Reduction	33
8.3.2	Watercourses and Climate Change.....	34
8.3.3	On-Farm Water Use Efficiency.....	35
8.3.4	Horticulture and Indigenous Agriculture	35
9	GRIEVANCE REDRESS MECHANISM	36
9.1	Objectives.....	36
9.2	Structure	37
9.3	Resolution Process.....	37
9.4	Legal Process.....	38
10	ELABORATION OF INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLAN	38
10.1	Free, Prior and Informed Consent	38
10.2	Screening for Indigenous Peoples Plan.....	39
10.3	Due Diligence Report	40
10.4	Social Impact Assessment.....	40
10.5	Benefit Sharing and Mitigation Measures	41
10.6	Establishment of Indigenous Peoples Plan	42
10.6.1	Overview	42
10.6.2	Consultation	43
10.6.3	Disclosure.....	43
11	IMPLEMENTATION OF INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLAN	44
11.1	Project Management Unit	44
11.2	Monitoring and Evaluation	44

11.3	Budget	46
	Annex A: Consultation Questions in the Field	50
	Annex B: Issues raised by Prominent Community Members.....	55
	Annex C: Indigenous Peoples Impact Screening Checklist.....	57
	Annex D: Gender and Social Protection Checklist	62
	Annex E: Indicative Annotated Outline of Indigenous Peoples Plan	67

List of Tables

Table 6-1: Kalash Population Details in Kalash Valleys (Bumburet, Rumbur, and Birir).....	15
Table 10-1: Prior and Informed Consent	38

1 INTRODUCTION

With geographical proximity and community ties to Afghanistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has suffered from the fallout of the Afghan conflicts. Associated hostilities and extremist violence have caused far-reaching disruption to economic activity and inflicted extensive damage on livelihoods, public infrastructure, and private properties, which resulted in a precarious security situation as well as prolonged sociopolitical and economic instability and generated significant negative impacts on government's institutional and implementation capacity.

Most socioeconomic indicators, such as literacy, infant mortality, school enrollment, employment, and out-migration rates compare quite unfavorable to the rest of the country, which as a whole already ranks toward the end on the list of income. In order to overcome this difficult situation, the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has reached an agreement with the World Bank to develop a broad program for economic development in the province with financial assistance from the World Bank: the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Irrigation Agriculture Improvement Project. It consists of three components: on-farm water management infrastructure; on-farm water management techniques; and agriculture.

The tentative project cost is estimated at approximately USD182 million, of which the World Bank would finance up to USD130 million from the International Development Association. The project will contribute to the development of the agriculture sector through addressing: (i) water management as an important and limiting factor to productivity and overall production; and (ii) training and technology for improving productivity, post-harvest management and value addition. It will support six key priority areas in the government strategy for the sector: (i) improving performance of the delivery system and reducing water wastages; (ii) making water distribution equitable; (iii) increasing financial sustainability of the irrigation system management; (iv) increasing climate resilience; (v) increasing productivity and promoting high value agriculture (production, processing and marketing); and (iv) strengthening the relevant department for improved service delivery and governance. The project has identified Kalash Valleys, where indigenous people called Kalash reside, as some of the possible intervention areas.

2 PROJECT DESCRIPTION

2.1 Project Development Objective

The Project Development Objective is to improve the performance of irrigated agriculture on smallholder farms in the project area. This objective will be achieved through: (i) improving on-farm water management (OFWM) system by upgrading watercourses, introducing advanced irrigation technologies, and strengthening the capacity of communities, farmers, and OFWM Directorate; and (ii) increasing agriculture productivity as well as promoting agro-processing and value addition. The Project would cover all districts and tehsils of the province.

Project Beneficiaries: The majority of beneficiaries will be smallholder farmers with less than 5 hectares of land. They account for 96% of total farms in the province and 540,000 farmer households, or 4.3 million people. Rural communities will also benefit, since the project activities include improvement of community

mobilization for enhance water use on farm. The capacity of the government institutions involved will also be strengthened on management of water resources, provision of public services and development of policies and programs. The project aims at paying particular attention to gender and providing equal opportunities for women to participate in project activities.

Indicators for Project Development Objectives: The achievement of the Project Development Objective will be measured with the following indicators:

- (i) Area provided with new/improved Irrigation services (ha);
- (ii) Water productivity at farm level (kg agricultural production/m³ water consumption);
- (iii) Crop structure changed (% of high value crops); and
- (iv) Direct beneficiaries reached (number of direct beneficiaries and % share of women).

2.2 Project Description

The project comprises of the following components:

Component A: Improving Community Irrigation Systems (USD118.6 million, of which USD91.3 is from International Development Association). The objective of this component is to improve the efficiency of on-farm water delivery. It consists of four sub-components: (A1) watercourse improvement in canal command areas; (A2) watercourse improvement in non-canal-command areas, in particular, very large watercourses or channels shared by many users; (A3) other watercourses in non-canal-command areas; and (A4) piped water schemes in non-canal-command areas whose water sources are tube wells, springs, or tanks.

In order to enhance management of on-farm irrigation systems, water user associations (WUAs) will be developed, or strengthened if they have been already established. The associations will be responsible for organizing the labor required for the upgrading of watercourses. They must procure the necessary material, which will be finance by loans under this project.

Component B: Promoting Innovative Technologies for Efficient Water-Use (USD 35.8 million, of which USD 21.1 25 million is from International Development Association). This component consists of: (B1) installation of high efficiency irrigation systems; (B2) installation of water storage tanks and ponds; and (B3) strengthening precision-land-leveling service in the private sector.

The component will support installation of drip, trickle, bubbler, or sprinkler irrigation systems for improvement in water use efficiency at the farm level. The financial costs of systems installation will be shared by the farmers and the project: 40% and 60% respectively. Other associated costs, such as administration and management, will be shouldered by the project. Technical assistance will be provided by system vendors to farmers; further assistance and training will be provided under Component C of the project. Increase in water use efficiency obtained is expected to contribute to crop diversification and higher productivity. Water storage tanks and ponds will be constructed; they will contribute to water conservation by allowing intermittent and

timely releases at higher volumetric flow rates. As in the case of watercourses, farmers would provide labor and the project will pay for the material.

Uneven terrain causes inefficient water use and low yields. Laser land leveling can save up to 30% of irrigation water, allow uniform seed germination, and increase fertilizer uptake efficiency so that crop yields is increased as much as 20%. The leveling equipment will be made available to service providers on a shared cost basis. The service providers are to run a business of land leveling for the farmers. The providers will be selected according to a determined set of criteria, which will be updated every six months to reflect the monitoring results.

Component C: Increased Productivity, Value Addition and Diversification (USD27 million, of which USD 15 million is from International Development Association). The project will help the beneficiaries in capitalizing on the farming opportunities created by improvement in water use efficiency; the focus will be on high-value crop farming. This Component consists of two subcomponents: (C1) strengthening capacity in farming, processing and marketing; and (C2) investing in production, processing, and value addition.

The capacity of the farmers will be strengthened through: participatory training; demonstration and assistance on new technologies and practices; farmer-to-farmer study tours; and establishment of ICT based Farmers Service Center. The subjects to be touched upon include: farm management; irrigation agronomy; marketing and value addition; and operation and maintenance of high efficiency irrigation systems. The ultimate goal is to promote diversification into high-value crops. The smallholders should take advantage of growing urban population, which is more demanding in terms of assortment of vegetables and fruits as well as processing; post-harvesting management can be improve through adequate practices and equipment, in addition to participation of women. Matching grants will be used for financing farmers' access to: post-harvest practices and technology; storage and product delivery mechanisms; and market.

Component D: Project Management and Technical Assistance (USD30 million, of which USD20 million is from International Development Association). This component is to ensure that all project activities are carried out according to the provisions in the Financing Agreement, the World Bank-approved project documents as well as its Project Implementation Manual and applicable environment and social policies and fiduciary guidelines.

This component will finance: (D1) project management supervision and monitoring and evaluation; (D2) technical assistance, capacity building and training; (D3) integrated water resources management planning and strategic studies.

3 LEGISLATIVE, POLICY AND INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK FOR INDIGENOUS PEOPLES

3.1 Overview

The Constitution of Pakistan 1973 does not recognize Indigenous Peoples – even the word ‘indigenous’ is not found in the Constitution. Hence, there is no particular law to safeguard indigenous people’s rights and privileges. The Constitution mentions “minority” several times, but does not reference indigenous peoples. Instead, the federal government emphasizes minorities within Pakistan as religious minorities – not racial or

linguistic minorities, or indigenous peoples. According to United Nation High Commissioner for Refugees the Koochis, Rebari, Bakarwal, Kehal, Jogi, Kabootra, Sanyasi and Kalash are indigenous peoples in Pakistan.

The tribal people living in various parts of Pakistan have been acknowledged in Article 1 of the Constitution, and given certain rights and privileges under Articles 246 and 247. They have been given political representation in the Parliament under Articles 51 and 59. The national and provincial laws can be extended to the Tribal Areas only with the consent of the President of Pakistan. In the absence of any other legal instrument for the Indigenous Peoples, they can be treated under the category of people living in the Tribal Areas.

Pakistan has voted in favor of the United Nation Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples in 2007. The Declaration provides for all sorts of rights for the indigenous peoples but does not bind the member states to legislate for the rights of indigenous peoples; hence is of limited value to the Indigenous people as far as practical benefits to them are concerned. This limitation has overshadowed any efforts to provide constitutional and legal protection to these vulnerable communities.

Earlier Pakistan had ratified the International Labor Organization (ILO) Convention on Indigenous and Tribal Populations 1957. However, it was later replaced by the ILO Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention 1989 which Pakistan has not yet ratified. Pakistan has signed and ratified some other international human rights instruments, treaties and conventions which are not directly binding towards indigenous and tribal peoples, but they can serve as practical guidance to the Government and concerned institutions on the subject.

The most important of these conventions is the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 1966, which Pakistan has ratified with reservations on its Article 3 (equality of men and women) and Article 25 (election to the public posts), as women do not have equal right of testimony and a non-Muslim cannot become President or Prime Minister according to the Constitution of Pakistan. Pakistan did not ratify its Optional Protocol. This Covenant does not mention the indigenous people *per se* but can be used to provide them relief. Given the lack of legal definition for the indigenous peoples in Pakistan, there have always been varying claims by different societal groups. The term “indigenous peoples” has been used interchangeably with tribal peoples, and ethnic and religious minorities.

3.2 Constitution of Pakistan 1973

The equality of citizens, protection of minority groups and freedom of religion in Pakistan is guaranteed by the Constitution of Pakistan, amended in 2012. The constitutional provision regarding minorities implies religious minorities, but over the years it has extended to ethnic minorities and indigenous people.

Article 2 (a) the Objectives Resolution was passed by the Constituent Assembly of Pakistan in March 1949, and was made a substantive part of the Constitution of Pakistan by the Presidential Order No. 14 of 1985, Art. 2 and Sch. item 2 (with effect from March 2, 1985). It guarantees equality of rights to the minorities stating:

The people of Kalash have traditionally practiced subsistence agriculture focused on grain production and livestock rearing. Their diet of cereals and dairy products is supplemented with fruits and nuts from the forests. Component C will integrate them further into the existing cash economy and increase their income.

- Where in the State shall exercise its powers and authority through the chosen representatives of the people ; Where in the principles of democracy, freedom, equality, tolerance and social justice as enunciated by Islam shall be fully observed;
- Wherein adequate provision shall be made for the minorities to [absent in 1985-2010, re-added in 2010] freely profess and practice their religions and develop their cultures; Wherein the territories now included in or in accession with Pakistan and such other territories as may hereafter be included in or accede to Pakistan shall form a Federation wherein the units will be autonomous with such boundaries and limitations on their powers and authority as may be prescribed;
- Wherein shall be guaranteed fundamental rights including equality of status, of opportunity and before law, social, economic and political justice, and freedom of thought, expression, belief, faith, worship and association, subject to law and public morality; Wherein adequate provisions shall be made to safeguard the legitimate interests of minorities and backward and depressed classes;

The Constitution of Pakistan 1973 states that “all citizens are equal before law and are entitled to equal protection of law” under Article 25 (1) of the Constitution. The Fourth Amendment to the Constitution of Pakistan was made that became part of the Constitution of Pakistan on November 21, 1975, which decreed the seats for minorities and non-Muslims representation to the government of Pakistan and the Parliament of Pakistan, to protect the minority rights in the country.

There are other beneficial provisions to safeguard and protect minorities in the constitution:

Article 20. Freedom to profess religion and to manage religious institutions: Subject to law, public order and morality: (a) every citizen shall have the right to profess, practice and propagate his religion; and (b) every religious denomination and every sect thereof shall have the right to establish, maintain and manage its religious institutions.

Article 21. Safeguard against taxation for purposes of any particular religion: No person shall be compelled to pay any special tax the proceeds of which are to be spent on the propagation or maintenance of any religion other than his own.

Article 22. Safeguards as to educational institutions in respect of religion, etc.: (1) No person attending any educational institution shall be required to receive religious instruction, or take part in any religious ceremony, or attend religious worship, if such instruction, ceremony or worship relates to a religion other than his own. (2) In respect of any religious institution, there shall be no discrimination against any community in the granting of exemption or concession in relation to taxation. (3) Subject to law: (a) no religious community or denomination shall be prevented from providing religious instruction for pupils of that community or denomination in any educational institution maintained wholly by that community or denomination; and (b) no

citizen shall be denied admission to any educational institution receiving aid from public revenues on the ground only of race, religion, caste or place of birth. (4) Nothing in this Article shall prevent any public authority from making provision for the advancement.

Article 28. Preservation of language, script and culture: Subject to Article 251 any section of citizens having a distinct language, script or culture shall have the right to preserve and promote the same and subject to law, establish institutions for that purpose.

Article 36. Protection of minorities: The State shall safeguard the legitimate rights and interests of minorities, including their due representation in the Federal and Provincial services.

3.3 Executive Order for the Protection of Kalash Communities¹

Prior to 1970s there was a growing trend in Kalash which allowed outsiders to appropriate or mortgage the prime resources of Kalash, the land and trees at a token price. The federal and provincial government realized the seriousness of this issue and the Government of Pakistan passed an executive order in 1974 to redeem Kalash people's land and tress against mortgages. The Government also provided loans to Kalash communities to recover their assets. Government legally forbade the purchase of land or any new construction by outsiders, forcible conversion of any Kalashand cutting of trees by outsiders.

3.4 Kalash and National Database and Registration Authorities²

While the Pakistani Government has yet to recognize the Kalash as indigenous peoples, the government did recognize, after much advocacy from Kalash members, the Kalasha as a separate religion in the National Database and Registration Authority in 2015. Kalash can now be listed on government documents requiring religious identification, such as birth certificates. Despite Pakistan's recognition of Kalash by the National Database and Registration Authorities, issues that threaten the Kalash's religious identity as indigenous peoples and practicing paganism---such as forced religious conversions to Islam and religious-based discrimination---remain to this day.

3.5 United Nations Protection for Kalash Cultural Heritage³

Since 2008 the Kalash People's Development Network, a non-governmental organization, has sought protection bythe United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) for Kalash cultural heritage through its inclusion in the Intangible Cultural Heritage list. The National Institute of Folk and Traditional Heritage in Pakistan have been working since the 1980s to preserve Kalash Culture and sponsored a conference on the issue in 2012. In June 2016, UNESCO Islamabad, through the Convention for Safeguarding the Intangible Cultural Heritage, proposed to add the Kalash to the list. The Committee meets annually to decide on proposals; as of today ithas not yet decided whether to add the Kalash to the list.

¹ PPAF Indigenous People Planning Framework

² Cultural Survival (2017)

³ Cultural Survival (2017)

3.6 International Labor Organization Conventions 107 and 169⁴

The International Labor Organization (ILO) has been working with indigenous and tribal people since 1920. The ILO adopted Indigenous and Tribal People Convention 107 in 1958 with the support of UN system; it was the first international convention on the subject to address the problems of indigenous and tribal people (ITP), which was ratified by 27 countries. This Convention was revised through adoption of Convention 169 in 1989, ratified by 20 countries. The revised ILO Convention 169 is certainly a prominent example of international standard-setting for ITP. Pakistan ratified ILO Convention 107, which is still in force in Pakistan, but it would automatically be denounced if once it ratifies Convention 169. Pakistan reports on its implementation of Convention 107 every 5 years as per its requirements. The ILO Committee of Experts examined ITP situation in Pakistan and drew attention of the Government of Pakistan towards forced labor, health, human rights abuses and land rights. ILO has been working with the Government of Pakistan and ITP partners for the implementation of Convention 107. Their activities involve awareness raising, training of government and ITP representatives, and capacity building on special needs of ITPs.

3.7 United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People

United Nations General Assembly adopted the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People in 2007 on the recommendation of Human Rights Council resolution of 2006. Pakistan voted in favor of this Declaration along with 143 countries. As a General Assembly Declaration it is not a legally binding instrument under international law, but it does "represent the dynamic development of international legal norms and it reflects the commitment of the UN's member states to move in certain directions."

The Declaration sets out the individual and collective rights of indigenous peoples, as well as their rights to culture, identity, language, employment, health, education and other issues. It also "emphasizes the rights of indigenous peoples to maintain and strengthen their own institutions, cultures and traditions, and to pursue their development in keeping with their own needs and aspirations". It "prohibits discrimination against indigenous peoples", and it "promotes their full and effective participation in all matters that concern them and their right to remain distinct and to pursue their own visions of economic and social development". The goal of the Declaration is to encourage countries to work alongside indigenous peoples to solve global issues, like development, multicultural democracy and decentralization. Article 31 of the Declaration emphasizes that the indigenous peoples will be able to protect their cultural heritage and other aspects of their culture and tradition.

3.8 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights⁵

Pakistan ratified the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR) in 2008. Under the Convention, Pakistan recognized the "right of everyone to an adequate standard of living for himself and his family, including adequate food, clothing and housing, and to the continuous improvement of living

⁴International labour standards regarding indigenous and tribal peoples

⁵Convention on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Violations of Indigenous Peoples' Rights in Pakistan (2017)

conditions.” The commitments made extend to indigenous peoples of Pakistan. UNDRIP further recognizes that rights enshrined in various treaties apply to indigenous peoples.

General Comment no. 21 of the Covenant expands upon the right to take part in cultural life---enshrined in Article 15 of the Covenant---which is especially important to indigenous peoples. It asserts that “cultural rights are an integral part of human rights and, like other rights, are universal, indivisible and interdependent.” Key elements of the right to take part in cultural life include: availability; accessibility; acceptability; adaptability; and appropriateness. The General Comment identifies communities that require special protection as women, children, older persons, persons with disabilities, minorities, migrants, persons living in poverty, and indigenous peoples. The Comment also states that “the protection of cultural diversity is an ethical imperative, inseparable from respect for human dignity.

3.9 World Bank Policy on Environmental Assessment – Operational Policy 4.01

The World Bank requires environmental assessment (EA) of proposed projects to ensure that they are environmentally sound and sustainable, and Operational Policy 4.01 defines the assessment process and its instruments.

The policy is triggered by the proposed project, as it consists of activities which may cause environmental or social impacts: rehabilitation of existing irrigation watercourses; strengthening water user associations; introduction of modern technologies for efficient on-farm water use; promotion of horticulture and high value crops. In the absence of project details required to carry out impact assessment, an Environmental Safeguards Management Framework (ESMF) has been developed to guide the assessment when the details become available. The framework sets out the obligations of the executing agency in identifying and addressing environmental and social risks and impacts that may require particular attention.

3.10 World Bank Policy on Indigenous Peoples- Operational Policy 4.10

The Bank recognizes that the identities and cultures of indigenous peoples are inextricably linked to the lands on which they live and the natural resources on which they depend. These distinct circumstances expose Indigenous Peoples to different types of risks and levels of impacts from development projects, including loss of identity, culture, and customary livelihoods, as well as exposure to disease. Gender and intergenerational issues among indigenous peoples also are complex. The World Bank Operational Policy 4.10 ensures that the development process fully respects the dignity, human rights, economies, and cultures of Indigenous Peoples. For all projects that are proposed for Bank financing and affect indigenous peoples, the Bank requires the borrower to engage in a process of free, prior, and informed consultation, resulting in broad community support to the project by the affected indigenous peoples. All such Bank-financed projects must include measures to:

- (i) Avoid potentially adverse effects on the Indigenous Peoples' communities; or
- (ii) When avoidance is not feasible, minimize, mitigate, or compensate for such effects.

The projects are also designed to ensure that the Indigenous Peoples receive social and economic benefits that are culturally appropriate and gender and inter-generationally inclusive. The policy requirements for the projects to be financed by the Bank that affects indigenous peoples are:

- (i) Screening by the Bank to identify whether Indigenous Peoples are present in, or have collective attachment to, the project area;
- (ii) If, based on the screening, the Bank concludes that Indigenous Peoples are present in, or have collective attachment to, the project area, the borrower undertakes a social assessment to evaluate the project's potential positive and adverse effects on the Indigenous Peoples, and to examine project alternatives where adverse effects may be significant. The breadth, depth, and type of analysis in the social assessment are proportional to the nature and scale of the proposed project's potential effects on the Indigenous Peoples, whether such effects are positive or adverse;

- (iii) A process of free, prior, and informed consultation with the affected Indigenous Peoples' communities at each stage of the project, and particularly during project preparation, to fully identify their views and ascertain their broad community support for the project;
- (iv) The preparation of an Indigenous Peoples Plan or an Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework; and
- (v) Disclosure of the draft Indigenous Peoples Plan or draft Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework.

The World Bank Operational Policy 4.10 on Indigenous People is triggered when a project/sub-project either positively or negatively and directly or indirectly effects the indigenous people's dignity, human rights, livelihood systems or culture; or affects the territories, natural or cultural resources that they own, use, occupy or claim as their ancestral domain. While the details of subproject interventions---their sites, scale and nature---are unknown at this stage, sufficient information is available to determine that the Policy is triggered and an Indigenous Peoples Plan will be necessary for some of the subprojects. This Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework was prepared alongside Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF), and information about nature and type of subprojects' impacts has been taken from ESMF.

4 INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLAN FRAMEWORK AND INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLAN

4.1 Criteria for Indigenous Peoples

In Pakistan, the term "ethnic minority" is used to refer to Kalash indigenous peoples. However, for this framework, the World Bank criteria to identify indigenous peoples have been adapted: Operational Policy 4.10 on Indigenous Peoples. The Policy states that it does not seek to define the term, indigenous peoples, "because of the varied and changing contexts in which Indigenous Peoples live and because there is no universally accepted definition of 'Indigenous Peoples.'" It continues:

Indigenous Peoples may be referred to in different countries by such terms as "indigenous ethnic minorities," "aboriginals," "hill tribes," "minority nationalities," "scheduled tribes," or "tribal groups." For [the] purposes of this policy, the term "Indigenous Peoples" is used in a generic sense to refer to a distinct, vulnerable, social and cultural group possessing the following characteristics in varying degrees:

- (a) *Self-identification as members of a distinct indigenous cultural group and recognition of this identity by others;*
- (b) *Collective attachment to geographically distinct habitats or ancestral territories in the project area and to the natural resources in these habitats and territories.*
- (c) *Customary cultural, economic, social, or political institutions that are separate from those of the dominant society and culture; and*
- (d) *An indigenous language, often different from the official language of the country or region.*

In an implicit gesture to acknowledge the presence and uniqueness of the Kalash people, the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa reserved a separate seat for the Kalash people in the Provincial Assembly in election 2018. However, no inventory of indigenous peoples has been conducted in Pakistan, and any effort aimed at identification of indigenous peoples and inventorying across Pakistan needs extensive academic and field research. The proposed project is committed to identifying marginalized groups, including indigenous peoples, in its intervention areas as early as possible for developing relevant tools before undertaking any interventions. To this end, project screening for indigenous people will be carried out during subproject planning (see Section 10.2).

4.2 Rationale for Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework

The Indigenous Kalash people live in three remote mountain valleys named Bumburet, Rumbur, and Birir, which are situated in Ayun Union Council of Chitral District in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province. Kalash people consider themselves indigenous; they have been lived in the area for thousands of years, and their distinct language, folklore, and polytheistic religion differentiate them from the other communities in the area who had migrated to Chitral at a later time. The community still relies mainly on their indigenous sources of livelihood including livestock and small-scale cultivation. However, the community does not have a unique source of livelihood as these traditional occupations are shared with other ethnicities and tribes in the region.

The Kalash people have socioeconomic and cultural characteristics of indigenous people as defined by the World Bank Policy on Indigenous People; they are identified as an indigenous community due to their distinct tribal customs, religion and a unique language. The World Bank Policy on Indigenous People OP 4.10 requires that the borrower prepares and submits, to the Bank, an Indigenous People Planning Framework (IPPF) consistent with the policy prior to project appraisal. A Framework, instead of a Plan itself is prepared at this time, because the zone of impact is roughly known but precise sitting alignments cannot be determined. The Framework will guide formulation of a Plan by stipulating all necessary conditions that it needs to satisfy.

4.3 Objectives of Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework

The overall objective of Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework is to facilitate the subproject's compliance with the requirements specified in the World Bank Operational Policy 4.10 on Indigenous People and to work within the legal framework of Pakistan. In other words, the framework is for designing and implementing a subproject and its Indigenous Peoples Plan in a way that fosters indigenous peoples' dignity, human rights, and cultural uniqueness; they should receive culturally compatible social and economic benefits and not suffer adverse effects during the development process.

The specific objectives of this Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework are to provide:

- (i) Policy and legal framework and procedures to plan and manage subprojects in indigenous peoples' areas, in conformity with the World Bank OP 4.10 on Indigenous People as well as applicable local laws and regulations, international laws ratified by the Government of Pakistan and the Environment and Social Management Framework.

- (ii) Guidance to project staff and its line department for subprojects selection, screening, socioeconomic assessment; and free, prior and informed consent; and
- (iii) Guidance to project staff and its line department staff on preparation and implementation of Indigenous Peoples Plan (IPP) for a sub-project in indigenous peoples' areas.

By fulfilling these objectives, the subproject will ensure: (i) participation in the form of informed decision-making of indigenous peoples who are by subprojects, (ii) culturally compatible social and economic benefits to indigenous peoples; (iii) no adverse effects on indigenous peoples by subproject implementation, (iv) active participation of and lead by indigenous peoples in designing, developing, and implementing subprojects, and (v) provision of feedback to indigenous peoples on project implementation, benefits and risks.

4.4 Scope of Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework

The application of this Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework is limited to activities under the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Irrigated Agriculture Improvement Project in three Kalash Valleys, namely Bumburet, Rumbur, and Birir. The scope of this Framework is:

- Potential positive and adverse effects of subprojects on the Kalash people;
- Plan for social assessment for sub-projects areas;
- Guidance on obtaining free, prior, and informed consent of the affected Kalash people at each stage of subproject preparation and implementation;
- Institutional arrangements including capacity building, for screening activities supported by subprojects, evaluating their effects on Kalash people, preparing Indigenous Peoples Plans, and addressing any grievances;
- Guidance on monitoring and reporting arrangements, including mechanisms and benchmarks appropriate to each subproject; and
- Disclosure arrangements for Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework and Indigenous Peoples Plan.

4.5 Category of Subproject

Subprojects will be screened for indigenous people impacts in accordance with the World Bank categorization, classifying subprojects by the significance of their impacts:

- (i) Category A Projects: A proposed subproject is classified A if it is likely to have significant impacts on Indigenous Peoples. An Indigenous Peoples Plan, including assessment for social impacts, is required;
- (ii) Category B Projects: A proposed subproject is classified as category B if it is likely to have limited impacts on Indigenous Peoples. An Indigenous Peoples Plan, including assessment of social impacts, is required.
- (iii) Category C Projects: A proposed project is classified C if it is not expected to have impacts on Indigenous Peoples. No further action is required.

The above category is determined by assessing the magnitude of impact in terms of : (i) customary rights of use and access to land and natural resource; (ii) socioeconomic status; (iii) cultural and communal integrity; (iv) health, education, livelihood, and social security status; or (v) recognition of indigenous knowledge; and (ii) the level of vulnerability of the affected indigenous peoples' community. Any subproject involving land acquisition will be considered too harmful to the indigenous peoples and not be approved.

4.6 Rationale for Indigenous Peoples Plan

While an Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework lays the operational principles for an Indigenous Peoples Plan (IPP), the latter constitutes directly implementable actions under a subproject to comply with the World Bank Operational Policy on Indigenous Peoples as well as local legislations and international obligations of Pakistan.

4.7 Objectives of Indigenous Peoples Plan

An Indigenous Peoples Plan (IPP) aims at fulfilling the aspirations, needs, and preferred options of the affected indigenous peoples through mitigation of potentially negative impacts, modification of subproject design and development assistance. An IPP takes into consideration the marginalized status of such communities and offers them development options while respecting their socio-cultural distinctiveness. It also aims to strengthen the existing capacity of the affected indigenous community to participate and benefit from project interventions. An IPP must satisfy the following key conditions:

- (i) All development plans for indigenous people are based on full consideration of the options and approaches that best meet the interests of individuals and communities affected by the project;
- (ii) Scope and impact of adverse effects are assessed, and appropriate mitigation measures identified;
- (iii) Subproject takes into account the social and cultural context of affected peoples, and their skills and knowledge relating to local resource management;
- (iv) During subproject preparation, formation and strengthening of indigenous peoples' organizations are promoted as well as communication to facilitate their participation in subproject identification, planning, execution, and evaluation;
- (v) Where previous experience and knowledge of working successfully with indigenous peoples is lacking, pilot scale operations are carried out and evaluated prior to the execution of full-scale efforts;
- (vi) Experienced community organizations, nongovernment organizations, and consultants are mobilized to collect information and knowledge regarding indigenous peoples for preparation of the Plan;
- (vii) A responsible agency or consulting firm formulates IPP implementation schedule, which will be periodically monitored by the project management units as well as an independent or external monitoring agency; and
- (viii) The responsible agency prepares a budget for IPP implementation and a financing plan to ensure smooth progress.

5 Methodology for Preparation of Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework

5.1 Documents Review

The Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework for the proposed project was prepared based on information from internet research, review of relevant research papers, and consultations with Kalash community members as well as government officials in the fields of on-farm water management and agriculture.

5.2 Field Visits and Stakeholder Consultations

The Safeguards team comprising three safeguards specialists consulted their irrigation, on-farm management, agriculture and livestock officials in Chitral district on 23 November 2018 and the Kalash community members (14 women and 46 men) in three valleys, Bumburet, Rumbur, and Birir, on 24 November 2018. An Integrated Pest Management Specialist also visited the district 11-12 December 2018 to collect information primarily on pest management; agriculture and livestock officials as well as Kalash persons (10 men) were consulted. Primary data was collected through key informant interviews and focus group discussions on the basis of the questionnaires in Annex ****. Some questions to commence the process of free, prior and informed consent were also asked. These consultations included some of the Muslims residing in the Kalash villages.

6 Socioeconomics and Culture of Kalash

6.1 Overview

Pakistan is a country of varied geography and environment as well as diverse ethnic groups having with particular subcultures. Kalash Valleys situated in the northwestern area of Pakistan, whose mountains, springs, rivers, and snowy hills render it very scenic, are home to more than 2,500 people called Kafirs or Kalashi. They are considered unique thanks to their culture, language and religion, and are well-known to ethnographers and linguists around the world.

The Kalash people currently live in three valleys of Kalash---Bumburet, Rumbur, and Birir---is an ancient pagan tribe which is recognized as Kafir-Kalash. There are different thoughts about the foundation of Kalash people. Some believe that the soldiers from the Alexander the Great who settled in Chitral are the progenitors of Kalash. Others believe that they are indigenous to Asia and migrated from the Nuristan area of Afghanistan. Yet others believe that their ancestors migrated from a remote region in Afghanistan. According to the third hypothesis, the people came to Chitral from Afghanistan the 2nd century B.C, and ruled over Chitral in the 10th century A.D.

Lately, more and more changes are observed in the life of Kalash due to increasing influences of nearby regions. The Kalash of Birir follow the traditions more faithfully according to their religion, as compared to Kalash of Bumburet and Rumbur. The Kalash have their own religion, which is described by some as a kind of ancient Hinduism combined with animistic beliefs, but many of them have converted to Islam. The Kalash tend

to live in the mountainous areas above their agricultural lands, whereas the Muslims tend to live near the rivers or on the agricultural lands. Both groups may live together in the same village, or even as a family.

6.2 Kalash Population

According to the 2017 census report, Ayun Union Council has 27 villages with total population of 28,182 individuals and 3,983 households. The average household size is 7.07. The information specific on Kalash was provided by Ayun and Valleys Development Programme of the Local Support Organization (LSO)⁶ which completed census in the three valleys in October- November 2018; there are 523 households and 4,178 people in the three valleys (Table 6.1).

Table 6-1 Kalash Population Details in Kalash Valleys (Bumburet, Rumbur, and Birir)

Name of Valley	Name of Village	Number of Kalash Households	Number of Kalash Persons
Bamburet	Palawanandeh	15	120
	Ahmad Abad	03	24
	Anish	62	496
	Broon/ SarokJall	58	464
	Batrik	16	128
	Krakal	60	480
Total		214	1712
Rumbur	Koldesh	09	72
	Chet Kuru/ Baladesh	15	120
	Groom	41	328
	Bateht	20	160
	Kalash Gram	24	192
	Balang Kuru	65	520
Total		174	1392
Birir	Sandik	15	120
	Oruli	08	64
	Gurul	18	144
	GrambetGool	42	336
	Asper	19	152
	Beshal	06	42
	Guz Kuru	03	24
	Gree/ XhagharGool	06	48
	Bihal	18	144
Total		135	1074
Grand Total		523	4178

Source: Census of Ayun and Valleys Development Programme (2018)

⁶Local Support Organization (LSO) is an alliance or federation of Village and Women Organizations and other village-based institutions and self-help groups, which are primarily formed at the Union Council level and in some cases at valley or watershed levels in Northern Areas and Chitral.

6.3 Language⁷

The Northern Pakistan, a mountainous area where the Kalash Valleys are located, is characterized by high linguistic diversity. Most languages in the area belong to the Indo-European language family, but to different branches of this family: Dardic, Iranian and Indic languages. The three branches are sometimes dealt with together as Indo-Iranian languages. Like many languages in the southern Himalaya, Kalasha is a Dardic language; the Dardic branch is close to Indic languages in the Indo-Iranian branch and known for considerable differences among its languages. Many Kalasha speakers know Khowar, another Dardic language used in the region in interethnic contacts, and Urdu, a national language of Pakistan, of the Indic branch of Indo-European languages.

There is some discussion of whether Kalasha is historically related to Greek. It is true that both Kalasha and Greek are part of the Indo-European language family, and thus distantly related, having an ancestor language spoken 8,000 years ago. However, Greek and Dardic languages are so distantly related that the mutual intelligibility is close to zero. Kalasha is hardly more closely related to other Indo-European languages---such as, English, Spanish or Russian---than to Greek or Bulgarian. Some of the proposed closer similarities between Greek and Kalasha go back to Proto-Indo European, whereas others do not stand up to the standards of comparative linguistics.

6.4 Kalasha Women⁸

No matter in what situation they are the Kalash people greet each other with a friendly smile and kiss on each other's hands, the Kalasha way. Despite the harsh environment and rather Spartan way of living---their only fuel being the wood they have to cut and carry on their back---their life is a constant festival. Apart from the religious celebrations held in all four seasons of the year, there is always a social event for them to celebrate and have a good time: A birth of a baby, a six-year-old child entering the Kalasha society (*Butt sanbiyek*) or a wedding or even a funeral is an occasion for dancing, singing, playing the drum and drinking wine. In short, they enjoy life.

The primary role in the social and cultural life is played by the Kalasha women. Unlike the male members of the community, a Kalash woman wears her headdress and her costume no matter where she is and whatever she is engaged in. She always looks stylish and clean and extremely meticulous with her appearance. On special occasions, such as the spring festival (*Zhoshi*), for example, she would paint her face with a cream made from burnt goat horn and butter, which also has healing effects. She would also make up her face and eyes with different color paints. A Kalasha woman's dress consists of *cew*, the woven woolen dress, and *piran*, the machine made cotton dress. For hundreds of years the Kalasha women had been wearing a black woolen garment, all woven by hand. The headdresses come in two types: *shushut* and *kupas*. The *shushut* is a ring around the head from which a 'tail' hangs down the back. It is less formal than the *kupas* and is worn every day all day long and it is taken off only when the woman goes to bed or when in mourning. The *pat'lis* is a long belt

⁷Aymeric and Markussen (2016).

⁸Elizabeth Mela (2012).

made of woven woolen or cotton for women with borders and long fringes. It is wound around the hips, letting the *piran* hang loose and baggy.

All Kalasha females from puberty up to the end of menstruation are considered unclean, especially during their menstruation period and at childbirth. During those times, they must go and stay in the *bashali*, an isolated house usually outside the village and in some villages near the cemeteries. This seclusion results in many restrictions in their daily life and participation in religious rites and festivals. It may even pose danger to their health and life as is the case with similar customs in Western Nepal.

6.5 Access to Education and Official Documentation

Many Kalash children attend primary school, and some attend secondary school and university. In August 2012, there were nine Kalasha primary schools, funded partly or fully by non-profit organizations, including the Aga Khan Foundation. In Kalasha schools, children are taught in the Kalasha language and learn about their religion and culture. There is not enough space at the private Kalasha schools, however, for all of the Kalasha children of primary school age. Nearby primary schools run by the government of Pakistan are not taught in the Kalash language, but in Urdu and English. For secondary education, only the government-run schools are available in the region; they do not teach in the Kalasha language or about Kalasha religion and culture, and have mandatory Islamic studies as part of the curriculum.

Such situation goes against the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, which Pakistan voted in favor of. According to the Declaration, indigenous peoples have the right to education in their language. They also have the right “to establish and control their educational systems and institutions providing education in their own language, in a manner appropriate to their cultural methods of teaching and learning.” Further, indigenous children have the right to all levels of state education.

6.6 Economy

The Kalasha economy is based on agriculture which is mostly women's work, and transhumant animal husbandry, which takes the men and their flocks to the lower pastures for winter and then to high mountain pastures in summer. The crops grown are maize, wheat, and beans on small irrigated fields. Fruits and nuts, such as walnuts, grapes, apples, pears, apricots, mulberry, are also grown in Bumburet and Rumbur Valleys. Together with mushrooms gathered in the forests, they are sold outside the communities for cash income.

Goats are not only the main animal herded, but they are considered as a gift of the gods. Men must not let them become unclean through women or be possessed by demons. Kalasha agriculture, despite its use of the plough, is dependent upon highly labor-intensive techniques of hoeing, weeding and watering by women, as well as regular manuring with goat dung by men.

Previously wealth was measured in livestock and crops, but the Kalash people have recently begun to move towards a cash economy, triggered by the influx of tourists in the area. To cater to these new visitors, small stores and guest houses have been established, providing new luxury for visitors of the valleys. Tourism now

makes up a large portion of the economic activities of the Kalash. Other communities in the region have developed more complex economic systems with links to regional markets and are better off than the Kalash. The Pakistani government levies a toll to persons who enter the Valleys, whose purpose is to collect funds for assisting the Kalash people in preservation of their culture.

6.6.1 Non-Timber Forest Products⁹

Kalash Valleys are located in the remote southwestern part of Chitral District and are gifted with unique biological diversity. The natural forests of the area mainly consist of chhgozapine (*Pinus gerardiana*), deodar (*Cedrus deodara*) and broad leaf species like oak (*Quercus incana*). Some of the important non-timber forest products in Bumburet Valley are mushrooms, honey, medicinal plants, pine nuts, silk cocoons and other equally valuable products. The people rely on their indigenous knowledge for collection, packing and drying of these forest products. Most of the local people are dependent on the following products for income generation and also for their own everyday needs.

6.6.1.1. Wild Nuts and Fruits

Pine nuts: Chilgoza (*Pinus gerardiana*) is found in the small patches of southern Chitral at elevation ranging from 1,800 m to 3,500m. It is associated with deodar (*Cedrus deodara*) and blue pine (*Pinus willichiana*) at higher elevation, and oak (*Quercus ilex*) at lower elevation. The pine nuts are called nuts, but are biologically seeds. They are collected from the green cones by climbing the trees; sometimes the people remove all the cones from the tree, prohibiting natural regeneration. In past, the nuts were consumed at home or gifted to friends and guests. During the recent years, they have been traded outside the community and have become an important source of cash income to the local population.

Walnuts: Walnut (*Juglans regia*) kernels are a favorite nut in Kalash Valleys. In order to improve the livelihood of Kalash people through walnut production, a project to redeem mortgaged walnut trees was launched in 1984-1995 by the Deputy Commissioner of Chitral. The project aimed at returning the ownership right of Kalash people over their ancestral walnut trees purchased by their Muslim neighbors. A second phase of the project followed in 1997-2003. It gave confidence to the Kalash community in improving their own economy.

Mulberries: Mulberry is a fast growing, deciduous woody perennial plant. The fruits are collected for domestic uses and commercial purposes. Mostly women and children collect the fruits, who often eat on the spot. The dried fruits are sold in the local markets. Mulberry wood is used for making agriculture tools and furniture. The mulberry trees are vanishing from the Valleys due to inattention.

Wild pomegranate: Dried seeds of wild pomegranate (*Punicagranatum*), locally known as *anar dana*, are widely used in cooking to develop a sour taste in dishes. They also have medicinal properties. The tree grows naturally in sub-mountainous tracts of the country from 900 to 1,800 m. An average tree yields 15 to 25 kilograms of fresh fruit.

⁹Ajaz (undated).

Russian olives: Olive trees grow near the water channel and agriculture land. The fruits are collected by children who often eat on the spot. Olives are consumed at home. The community members consider olives profitable products but very rare in the Valleys. If proper assistance is provided, it would be an additional support to their livelihood.

Medicinal Plants: Medicinal plants continue to be extensively used as major source of drugs for the treatment of many health disorders all over the world, and Kalash Valleys are not an exception. Many endemic and economically important medicinal plants are known in the area. Medicinal plants are valuable health products and also an important source of income for the local people.

6.6.1.2 Other Food Products

Honey: Honey collected from traditional bee hives is an important source of nutrition and income for the dwellers of Kalash Valleys. Traditionally, bees are reared in wall hives (*kator*) fixed to house walls. According to Kalash mythology, the honey (*Ushniru*) means cleanliness. The Kalash faith forbids the women from touching the wall hives and their honey, but they may touch and eat honey extracted from wild.

Mushrooms: Variety of edible mushrooms are found in Kalash Valleys: *quchi*, *brangaluandshuntiin* the local language. A person who finds mushrooms is often referred to by the local people as “the luckiest person.” Local people are secretive of where the mushrooms are found. The Kalash community has their own indigenous knowledge for mushroom collection. Morels are collected in Kalash Valley for sale to the outside communities for income generation, but they are occasionally used as traditional medicine and a flavoring agent. Morel collection is usually a part-time activity besides farming and livestock keeping for poor villagers.

Cumin seeds: Cumin seeds are a perennial herb with thick tuberous roots. It grows wild in dry temperate regions of the country. The plant is known locally as *hojo* and is widely used to flavor bread, biscuits, cakes and cheese. It is also an ingredient of nine pickling spices. In addition, the herb is a stomach soothing medicine, occasionally used for flatulent colic and as an adjuvant or corrective for other medicines. The fruit is collected before ripening. The plants are dried and fruits are thrashed, cleaned, and stored in bags.

6.6.2 Animals Products

Silk Cocoons: The Kalash women have largely been involved in rearing of silk worm (*Bombox mori*), since long through traditional means.

6.6.3 Timber Products

Branches of wild almond and willow: The Kalash are very professional in making of *vesku* (a big basket used for carrying fire woods and walnuts as well as for shifting of organic fertilizer) from the young branches of wild almond (*Prunus amygdalus*), locally called *kandu*. Every household keeps one or more *vesku* trees in their yards. Willow is also used to prepare various types of products, such as baskets, trays, grain bins and decoration products, which have attracted the attention of tourists. However, they are not commercially available.

Walnut bark: Particularly the women frequently use the stem bark of walnut (*muswak*), as it imparts a pinkish color to the lips. Removal, however, injures the tree. In extreme cases, the trees are killed. Occasionally small amount of *muswak* appear in the local market for sale.

Timber: Obtaining torchwood by hollowing the tree bottom, as observed in Hazara and other part of the province, is not practiced in Chitral. In Kalash Valleys, the entire tree is felled and converted into torchwood. The preferred species for torchwood are Chilgoza (*Pinus gerardianana*), kail (*Pinus wallichiana*) and deodar (*Cedrus deodara*).

6.7 Main Festivals¹⁰

The Kalash celebrate five festivals in a year. For each one, they prepare food, offer sacrifices on altars to please the gods, and dance in their traditional ways for a week. The religious rituals are executed according to the Kalash mythology, with high regards to supernatural beings. The festivals are as follows:

Chilim-Jusht : *Chilim-Jusht* is one of their biggest festivals, celebrated during May 13 - 16. This spring festival is to ask for the gods' blessing on the herds and crops.

Utchal: *Utchalis* their second festival and is celebrated during August 18 - 21. The festival is meant for enjoying summer and the peak season of dairy products.

Phoo: There is no fixed date for this autumn festival, because it depends on the ripening of the crops and fruits; usually it is in mid-October. This festival also celebrates the return of the livestock herds from the pastures.

Chaomos: *Chaomos* is celebrated between December 8 and December 21: one of the biggest festivals in Kalash culture. The purpose of the festival is to offer sacrifices to the grand Kalash god, *Mahandeo*.

Rot-Not: *Rot-Not* is a festival that takes place during June 21 to August 21. Young women and men meet in special places in the valleys to sing and dance. It culminates at the *Utchal* festival.

6.8 Spiritual Lakes¹¹

The following three lakes are considered important for the Kalash.

Lake Bahuk: This Lake is located between Bumburet and Rumbur Valleys and known as a holy lake of the Kalash ancestors. The turquoise hued glacier-lake is located at the altitude of 4,000 meters, surrounded by an amphitheater of rough peaks. The view of Tirich Mir, one of the world's highest mountains, from Lake Bahuk is well known. The Kalash believe that this is the place where their souls reside after their death. The area is famous amongst both the Kalash and the Muslim Kho community as the resting place of fairies.

¹⁰Waqas (2014).

¹¹Waqas (2014).

Lake Awazak: Lake Awazak is situated in the southwest of Bumburet Valley, on the border of Pakistan and Afghanistan, more than 12 hours of trekking from the settlements. It is believed that when an ill-fortuned person looks into the lake, the water will look blood red, a likely a bad omen foreboding his or her death. The flora around the lake attracts shepherds for grazing.

Lake Shawal: The Lake is located in the south of Bumburet Valley and between high peaks and glaciers. A path from the lake to Nuristan (Afghanistan) exists.

6.9 Spiritual Places

The Kalash holy places are very much revered by the people. The list below includes places for other purposes determined by the custom.

Malosh: The places where the Kalash people offer sacrifices to their gods are called *malosh*. Holy places are not found in every village. The famous Malosh are in Batrik, Krakal, Birir, Ramboor and Gromun.

Jastakan: *Jastakanis* a large hall bedecked by effigies as well as animal figures. Rituals are performed at a *jastakan* at the time of birth, death, and festival.

Bashali: *Bashaliis* a Kalash house for secluded women, which is located close to watercourses in every village. Men are not allowed to enter into these houses.

Madokjal: *Madokjalis* a Kalash burial ground. In the past, a deadbody was placed in a wooden box and in the open air. For reasons unknown, they have recently shifted to burying the coffins.

Charsu: One of the places used by young women and men during the *Rot-Not* festival in summer for singing and dancing.

6.10 Identity, Rights and Voice¹²

Kalasha have survived centuries of subtle and elaborate onslaughts on their culture which included recent invasions from Afghanistan. They suffered greatly from the invasion; they were assaulted, and their cattle were forcibly taken away. The Kalash have endured more hardship than other minorities because they are non-Muslims and very few in number; they could never become the core concern of policy makers and political parties dealing with the issues of rights of various communities. The Kalash people embody one of the oldest traditions and cultures in the world, but their socioeconomic and political systems that are not aligned with the modern society make them extremely vulnerable. They do not have enough means to manage and control their fate.

The scenic beauty of the area coupled with the uniqueness of Kalash culture attracts a large number of domestic tourists who are not trained to respect the culture. Such tourism and related market forces can

¹²Javed and Arshad (2005).

destroy the local culture and their way of living. Even before the development of tourism, non-Kalasha preachers have been trying to change their belief system.

As prevailing legal, social and economic systems are not sensitive to their unique cultural needs, hardly any constitutional safeguards are available to protect them. The national government yet needs to give them security, restore their confidence by treating them as a special case, put safeguards in place to protect their identity and create conditions in which they could practice their culture and living without fear. In order to ensure political representation, the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa designated a separate seat for the Kalash in the Provincial Assembly in 2018.

7 STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATIONS

Three indigenous communities, one each in Bumburet, Rumbur, and BirirValleys, were consulted for preparing of this Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework. Each community is made up of clusters of households that are ethnically, linguistically, and culturally homogenous. Under the leadership of village chiefs and *Qazi* (traditional/religious leaders whose jurisdictions cover several villages), communities follow their own traditional social hierarchies. Everyone in the three communities speaks the Kalash language, while a few speak Urdu---the official language of Pakistan---and some speak Khowar---the Chitrali language.

Information was gathered from farmers through focus groups discussions, based on the questionnaires in Annex A, on 24 November 2018 in Bumburet and Rumbur Valleys and on 25 November 2018 in Birir Valley. The topics included irrigation, agriculture, livestock, forestry, and culture. The participants were informed of the objectives of the consultation, the project components and the concept of free, informed and prior consent (Annex A). Key informant interviews were conducted with eminent and influential members of the community and non-Kalash people, including government officers on irrigation, on-farm management, agriculture and livestock for the Chitral District.

7.1 Focus Group Discussions in Anish Village - Bumburet Valley

A discussion was held with a mixed group of 16 women and 15 men.

7.1.1 Major Food Items

The major food items grown or collected by the villagers are: wheat, maize, kidney beans, walnuts, grapes, apples, pears, apricots, and mulberries. Maize is sown after April 20, and wheat during September 25- November 10. In most cases the fruit and nut trees are scattered on the roadside, in the fields, around the houses and in the foothills. Women also practice kitchen gardening.

Crops grown and fruits and nuts gathered are mostly for home consumption, and excess is sold in the market. Since the majority of the farmers are subsistence farmers, they are hardly able to sell any produce in the market. It was that: "the tourists pick fruit without permission, but due to our hospitable nature we are unable to object to this practice. Only 1% of tourists or less pays us for the fruit they pick."

7.1.2 Irrigation

The main source of irrigation water is the irrigation canals, which have been in use since many generations ago. The canals are fed with snowmelt and spring, with respective contribution of 60% and 40%. Wheat is given water five to six times per season, whereas maize is irrigated seven times. There are huge water losses from the irrigation system, and the water hardly reaches the fields; the available water is insufficient for what they would like to grow.

7.1.3 Forests

The forests are maintained by the government, but the locals are allowed to take the cattle to forests for grazing, and collect morels and fuel wood. These tasks are undertaken by men. The government discourages cutting small plants and trees.

Morels fetch a price of PKR12,000 per Pao. (1 Pao is equal to 250 grams); the last 5 years have been bad for morel business. Cedar, chestnut and pine trees are used as fuel wood, and cedar is used for construction. The price of cedar in market is: PKR 450-500 per square feet.

7.1.4 Irrigation

Livestock plays an important role in the economy of the people of Bumburet valley. It provides livelihood and income generating opportunities to the majority of the local population, although sale of animals and their parts is limited. They assume that they will have to become hire hands if traditional ways of livestock keeping becomes impossible for some reason.

The animals kept are: bulls, sheep, goats and cows. Separate grazing areas are identified for every village, and goats and sheep are taken to high altitude for grazing. The livestock is the source of milk, meat, ghee, butter and cheese for their daily consumption. Horns and skin are also utilized. The male members of the community are responsible for the animals' grazing, while women are responsible for milking. Cows and goats are considered potential items that could increase their income through sale of cheese, butter, milk and ghee, but hindered by diseases, lack of vaccination facility, unavailability of fodder (especially in snow period) and government assistance.

People are not aware of the link between animal diseases and sickness among people. Water availability affects livestock keeping, because pastures are dependent on water. Excessive snowfall negatively affects water availability and accessibility.

Goat meat and cheese are usually used also for funerals, marriage ceremonies and in other festivals. The community members help each other by contributing animals for funerals. Goats are considered a gift from the gods, and hence sacred. Only men allowed to go to the place where goat is sacrificed and offer prayers. After the prayers they come back home with the meat. One of the famous festivals involve bull fights.

7.2 Focus Group Discussions with Women in Anish Village - Bumburet Valley

A group of 14 women in Anish Village were asked about field irrigation, crop cultivation and livestock rearing. The discussions revealed that women are heavily involved in agriculture and livestock activities. From sowing to harvesting and storage, the Kalasha women play a key role in growing staple crops including maize, kidney beans, and wheat. It is predominantly the women's responsibility to manually prepare the soil during the sowing season as well as perform weeding and pest management activities. Similarly, with the exception of grazing the livestock in the forests, a task mostly reserved for men in the Kalasha culture, women are the primary custodians of livestock keeping activities including, housing, rearing, and feeding.

The major concerns of the women were as follows. Most households have a small piece of land; any assistance from the government or an NGO to level the land will result in higher yields. A great quantity of fruits is wasted, because no processing or storage facility exists. The government should take action against the shortage of fodder during winter.

Women think that trainings on skill development outside the fields of agriculture and livestock can create more economic opportunities. They lament the paucity of opportunities to sell their handicrafts and dresses.

They also reported that no health facilities exist, although they are needed. Tourists' behavior toward Kalash women is not appropriate, and security measures are required. Women are also being forced to convert to another faith.

7.3 Focus Group Discussions in Groom Village - Rumbur Valley

A discussion was held with a group of 9 men; no women were present.

7.3.1 Major Food Items

The major food items grown or gathered by the villagers are: wheat, maize, kidney beans, pine nuts, walnuts, grapes, apples, pears, apricots, and mulberries. Wheat and maize are grown on a rotation basis. Maize is sown during April 25-May 25 and wheat during September 25- November 10. Women also practice kitchen gardening and grow potatoes, tomatoes, and onions.

Pine nuts are a big source of income, as most of them are sold. Other crops and fruits are grown or gathered mostly for home consumption. The majority of the farmers are subsistence farmers; they have hardly any produce to sell in the market other than the pine nuts, which have a big market demand. Pine nuts are harvested in October and fetch PKR 2,200-2,400/kg, while the price of a sac containing the pine cones is PKR 14,000/80kg.

7.3.2 Irrigation

The main source of irrigation water is the irrigation canals which have been in use since many generations ago. The main source of canal water is snowmelt (20%) and spring (80%). Various NGOs have helped the villagers in

the past to maintain the irrigation system: Agha Khan Rural Support Program, Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund and Community Driven Local Development Program (funded by the European Union). The situation is similar with the village in Bumburet Valley: water leaks from the system and insufficient water on the field.

7.3.3 Forests

Men take the cattle to forests for grazing, and also collect morels, honey, and fuel wood. Morels and honey are collected in March and April. Since it is troublesome to harvest pine nuts and honey, the farmers chop down the entire branches, which is highly damaging to the trees. According to the local belief, a thunder in the sky is a sign of morels bursting in the forest. Forests are major sources of the local livelihood, but the Forest Department is involved in the illegal trade of timber, which must be stopped.

7.3.4 Livestock

Just as in Bumburet Valley, the Kalash in Rumbur Valley think that their culture would not survive if traditional livestock keeping becomes impossible, as they are important in their socioeconomic life. One of the famous festivals also involve bull fights. The villagers will need to seek employment elsewhere for their living. The animals are kept for milk, animal parts (meat, skin, horns) as well as for use with carriages. Goats, sheep, cows, bull, horses and asses are raised, and about half of animal-related production is sold. Income increase is possible by selling cheese, milk, butter and ghee from goats, sheep and cattle, but is limited by lack of water, fodder, vaccination and government assistance.

Pastures are about 10-12 km away from the village. The available grazing area is limited in size, but well defined. Skin diseases can be transmitted from livestock to people. Water scarcity affects livestock, as fodder and pasture are diminished.

7.4 Focus Group Discussions in Grambet Gool Village - Birir Valley

A discussion was held with a group of 15 men; no women were present.

7.4.1 Major Food Items

The major food items grown and gathered in the area are: wheat, maize, kidney beans, barley, vegetables, pine nuts, walnuts, grapes, apples, pears, apricots, and mulberries. Women also practice kitchen gardening and grow potatoes, tomatoes, and onions, just as in Rumbur Valley. The beans and maize are sown in June, wheat in November, and vegetables in April and May. The main source of sustenance is cultivated crops. While fruits and nuts from the trees---walnuts, grapes, apples, mulberry and pears---help them survive throughout the year.

7.4.2 Irrigation

The main source of irrigation water is the irrigation canals, which carry snowmelt like other in two valleys. Several NGOs helped in the past to maintain the irrigation system: Agha Khan Rural Support Program, Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund and Community-Driven Local Development Program (funded by the European Union).

The situation with the irrigation system is exactly like in other valleys: water losses from the infrastructure, and consequently insufficient water for the crops.

7.4.3 Forest

The forests are maintained by the government, but the locals are allowed to take the cattle to forests for grazing and collect morels and fuel wood. These tasks are for men.

7.4.4 Livestock

The livestock are so important to the Kalash in Birir Valley, just like in other two valleys that they will have to seek new livelihood, such as working as hired hands or start a small business, if traditional livestock keeping becomes impossible. Bulls, cows, goats, sheep and donkeys are kept for milk, meat, horns and skin. Sale of these items is very limited, but income increase may be possible if cheese, milk, butter and ghee from cows and goats could be sold. The obstacles to such scheme are: diseases; lack of vaccination facility; lack of fodder, especially in snowy season; and lack of government assistance.

Goats and sheep are taken to the forest for grazing. Separate grazing areas are identified for every village and in some cases for individuals. Government forests are considered communal grazing grounds. People have observed that skin diseases are transmitted from livestock to people, especially children. When water is not available sufficiently, it affects livestock through unsatisfactory growth of rangeland grasses.

7.5 Focus Group Discussions in the Three Valleys - Methods of Agriculture

At the time of land preparation, women dig holes in the field and fill it with ash to strengthen the soil. The current practice is to use local fertilizer such as animal waste. Some households do not own any cattle, and hence, do not have access to such fertilizer.

When maize is 5-6 inches high, women manually dig the field to soften the soil and remove the weed around the crop for better yield. This is quite a laborious process as it takes 3-4 women a month to treat 1 jareeb of land (1 jareeb is equivalent to 0.08 kanal, and 1 kanal to 510 m²). Wheat and maize are grown on crop rotation basis in Bumburet and Bibir Valleys.

People who can afford pesticides also try to avoid them, but it controls pests and bring better yields. When maize is 3-4 feet high, pest attacks are frequent. On such occasions, instead of using pesticide which most of the locals cannot afford, women smoke the fields by burning goat horns, herbs, plastic, animal waste, and worn out shoes, etc. to repel insects. The farmers in Rumbur believe that smoking the fields is more effective than pesticides.

7.6 Focus Group Discussions in the Three Valleys – Division of Labor and Mobility of Women

Some tasks are assigned to either women or men, but many are undertaken by both. In the past, agriculture activities were women's responsibilities, but more men are participating of late.

Men are responsible for taking animals to the forests or to grazing areas. It is mostly men's responsibility to fetch fodder from the forests, but assistance is given by women. Women collect woods from locations close to the villages, and men do so from locations further away.

Both women and men collect fruits, mushrooms and nuts from the forests and their own fields. Their storage and maintenance are the responsibility of women. The women are involved in rearing of silk worm. Cooking, sewing, knitting, and child rearing is the sole responsibility of the women. They also create from willow trees various types of crafts, such as baskets, trays, grain bins and items for decoration. Women engage in weaving and embroidery as well.

When going outside the valleys, women have to be accompanied by male relatives. They can move in groups within the valleys. It is known that all Kalasha women must stay in the *bashali*, an isolated house usually outside the village and in some villages near the cemeteries, during menstruation and childbirth when they are considered particularly unclean. This seclusion results in many restrictions in their daily life.

7.7 Focus Group Discussions in the Three Valleys – Social Cohesion

Some Kalash people have converted to Islam, but they live in communal and social harmony. With the exception of a few ceremonies, which the Muslims do not attend due to religious beliefs, Kalash celebrations are attended by all.

7.8 Key Informant Interviews

Key informant interviews were held with the eminent and influential members of the community as well as non-Kalash persons. The concerns expressed by one informant were also shared by others, and their demands with respect to the project also formed a unified view. They requested that the government pay attention to the Kalash community and provide assistance to them in crop agriculture and livestock. Intrusions across the international borders and tourists are great nuisance to them. They also want protection of their graveyards and other sacred sites. It was recommended that land acquisition be avoided, as the land available for agriculture is already too small. Deforestation was another major concern.

Other requests not directly related to the project were: provision of educational, health, and water and sanitation facilities; construction of access road; provision of protection measures against interference from the Muslim community regarding conversion; construction of new worship places. The details of the interviews are given in Annex B.

7.9 Institutional Stakeholder Interviews

Consultation meetings were conducted with government officials of irrigation, on-farm management, agriculture and livestock departments of the Chitral District from 23 to 25 November 2018. The main questions asked are listed in Annex A. The primary concern of the irrigation officials is rehabilitation of the canals. They are damaged and not fully functional due to landslides, earthquakes and the age of the infrastructure (more than 20 years old); the capacity is reduced to 30-40%. Theft and conflicts on water rights further affects water availability. The period suitable for civil works is limited because of snowfall from November to May and cold weather. The topography of the area poses challenges in terms of design, according to them. Funding is also a problem.

The on-farm management officials stated that the watercourses were lined more than 15-20 years ago, and hence need repair. About 70% of water is wasted along the unlined watercourses. Issues of water availability at tail ends are common because of seepage from watercourses. The major challenges in the area are landslides, short working-season and accessibility to sites. Funds availability, design and water distribution among the communities are also important challenges. Regarding the material and design that would improve the ecosystem, they were of the opinion that the following pipes are the best: high-density polyethylene (HDPE) lining and pressure class PN8 or 10; and composite lining.

The officials from the agriculture department shared their views that integrated pest management is necessary, particularly in the lower regions of Chitral. They also added that most farmers are poor and cannot afford expensive pesticides. They either do not use any, or purchase cheap, low grade and uncertified pesticides. However, pesticides use is gaining momentum and so is the pesticide business. There is no laboratory in Chitral for integrated pest management, biological control or toxicology; it is not possible to conduct chemical residue analyses of produce, soil, water or human bodies. They were of the opinion that such institutional facilities are essential to the area.

The official's from the livestock department explained that animal husbandry is common in Chitral and that the most popular animals are the local breeds of cow (Achai, Batani and Badakhshi), goats and sheep. At the same time, farmers want crossbreeding, for which artificial insemination is used; crossbred animals are more productive in terms of milk and meat. They stated that the government should launch crossbreeding programmes to meet such needs.

8 POTENTIAL IMPACTS OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA IRRIGATED AGRICULTURE IMPROVEMENT PROJECT

8.1 Potential Positive Impacts

The project aims at improving the efficiencies of irrigation water use and agricultural production. It also aspires to strengthen the resilience of irrigated agriculture to climate change. It is possible to obtain the following positive impacts through the project:

- Improved efficiency of use of water for crop cultivation, which is also a measure for climate change adaptation;
- Decrease in waterlogging and salinity;

- Increase in available water downstream;
- Increase in agricultural production;
- Increase in crop diversification, and hence in resilience to climate change;
- Increase in production of non-timber forest products;
- Improvement in forest and rangeland qualities and quantities, which is also a measure for climate change mitigation;
- Improvement in food and nutritional security;
- Decrease in poverty;
- Increase in application of indigenous knowledge on ecosystems, agriculture, flora and fauna for climate-change resilience;
- Enhanced awareness on climate change and its implications;
- Improved knowledge on measures for climate change adaptation and mitigation;
- Decrease in use of synthetic agrochemicals, including pesticides, that are harmful to the environment and people;
- Enhanced awareness on products that are non-biodegradable and harmful to the environment and people;
- Strengthened capacity to interact with the outside communities and to self-govern;
- Creation of a platform to voice the concerns of the Kalash to the provincial government;
- Empowerment of vulnerable groups within the communities; and
- Reaffirmation of Kalash heritage.

One of the necessary conditions for realizing positive impacts and co-benefits for climate change adaptation and mitigations to design subprojects in a participatory approach, which is more amenable to introducing intervention activities that are built on the strength of the indigenous agricultural methods; indigenous agriculture is usually ecosystem based and much more climate change resilient than the conventional modern agriculture. A participatory approach will also allow leadership of the Kalash communities in and their strengthened ownership of the activities.

If increased availability of water from improved irrigation systems does not lead to wasteful use of water, it will contribute to decrease in water logging---which is expected to worsen under climate change---and salinity, as well as increased availability of water downstream and related benefits to riparian and coastal ecosystems. If higher agricultural production leads to higher income, it can have positive spillover effects on education, health and social inequalities, including gender.

In order to realize the possible positive impacts, the project should not promote methods that are considered superior based on short-term outcomes of a single variable, such as annual yield of one crop and milk production per year. Integrated resources management methods should be adopted so that no activity comes at the expense of another. For example, milk production increase by crossbred animals is achieved in exchange for lower resilience of the cattle to climate change from lower genetic diversity. It is often the case that crossbred animals require more fodder or water. Higher crop production can be made possible by increased

use in pesticides, which destroy soil fertility, pollute the environment, poses health risks to useful insects, animals and humans.

Empowerment of vulnerable people should also be planned well with the participation of the beneficiaries. Additional tasks for women to generate cash income stress the women, if their other chores are not shouldered by men in exchange.

8.2 Potential Negative Impacts

Potential negative impacts of the project and their mitigation measures are described below. We note that indigenous people are intimately connected with their lands, environment and natural resources. This relationship is the very basis of their socioeconomic, spiritual and cultural systems, their knowledge, and their identities as distinct peoples. Their traditional livelihoods range from agriculture to gathering, trapping, and pastoralism. Because of these distinct characteristics, climate change affects them in a particularly adverse manner.

8.2.1 Irrigation Watercourses

Livelihood and Lifestyle: The component on irrigation systems will involve civil works and possibly land acquisition, affecting their houses, livelihoods---crops, livestock, businessesand lifestyle. If the civil works are carried out during the festivals and local people are required to contribute labor, it will be a major disruption to their lives.

The consultations indicated that the local population considers their landholdings too small; they identified it as one of the biggest challenges in their lives. Land acquisition is very likely to mean loss of income, depending on how much the improvement in irrigation systems benefits theirlivelihoods. If resettlement is required, it will be extremely difficult, if not impossible, to keep intact their livelihoods, beliefs and religious practices.

Spiritual Places and Festivals: The Kalash people have spiritual places, including graveyards that constitute important elements in their lives, and land acquisition, if deemed unavoidable, may involve such cultural sites. Rehabilitation of watercourses may hinder access to such places, and noise, dust and the presence of outsiders, vehicle and machinery relatedto the civil works may disturb festivals.

Spiritual Lakes and springs: Changes in hydrology from modification in the irrigation system is inevitable, even without canal construction. The Kalash have identified Lake BahukandOus Spring as sacred, and they may be affected. The LakeBahuk is of considerable importance as a holy lake of ancestors; it is the place where people reside after their physical death. Lake Awazak is known to have supernatural powers to turn its water blood red, when an ill-fortuned person looks at it, possibly foreboding death.Ous spring was once a very sacred one, but due to water shortage, people have been forced to use it as a water supply source; its spiritual value has diminished.

Culture: Rehabilitation of watercourses is unlikely to lead to land acquisition and resettlement, but likely to require laborers from outside communities. Influx of labor from outside communities is necessary if the irrigation system is to be rehabilitated according to the philosophy and methods that are not well known to the Kalash people. Theinhabitants could face behavior insensitive to their culture, especially with respect to their

women, as they have witnessed among the tourists. As the workers would stay near or in the communities much longer than the tourists, the problems could be more serious.

The Kalash do not have a coded account of their customs and traditions; culture and myths are transferred orally through generations. This oral tradition can be endangered by influence of outsiders and further involvement in modernization.

If land acquisition becomes necessary, it will mean reduction in agricultural land or pastures, which will greatly affect the Kalash livelihood and culture dependent on various animals raised.

Gender and Social Inclusion: The presence of outsiders may restrict mobility of women by harassing them, as it has happened with the tourists. The laborers may need to work close to *bashali*, a Kalash structure exclusively for secluded women and located close to watercourses in every village, further becoming an unintended, but serious, nuisance to Kalash women.

Biodiversity, Livelihood and Quality of Life: Loss of lands due to civil works could greatly affect the Kalash life dependent on local ecosystems---such as forests---for livestock fodder and other non-timber forest products to supplement food, obtain medicinal plants and cash income, as it would mean loss of habitats for wildlife and possibly forests. Habitat loss is directly linked to loss of biodiversity and ecosystem resilience; it will negatively impact the community's resilience to climate change.

Careless disposal of material excavated from the watercourses, of chemicals and fuel used during rehabilitation, or of waste from workers camp degrades the ecosystems and poses risks to the health of people through pollution of water, soil, vegetation and animals.

Traffic created by construction vehicles may pose risks to people on foot. Vehicles and construction machinery may create noise and dust, cause air pollution and disturbance to festivals and sleep, especially to infants.

Sustainability: Civil works and technology based on the knowledge that the indigenous people cannot fully comprehend or manipulate will perpetuate dependence on external help for maintenance, operation and rehabilitation.

8.2.2 Technology for Efficient Water Use

The technologies for efficient water use on farm to be promoted include, but not limited to, high efficiency irrigation system, precision land leveling, and water storage tanks.

Culture: Influx of labor from outside communities is necessary if the technologies based on philosophy and methods that are not well known to the Kalash people. The inhabitants could face behavior insensitive to their culture, especially with respect to their women, as they have witnessed among the tourists. The workers could have closer contact with the inhabitants than the tourists; the problems could be more serious.

The Kalash do not have a coded account of their customs and traditions; culture and myths are transferred orally through generations. This oral tradition, including indigenous agricultural systems, can be endangered by influence of outsiders and further involvement in modernization.

Gender and Social Inclusion: The presence of outsiders may restrict mobility of women by harassing them, as it has happened with the tourists. Activities to promote social inclusion may be met with resistance by the powerful members of the society, creating conflicts among the people.

Sustainability: For Kalash people, who have relatively little contact with the outside world, there are likely to be obstacles in properly using and maintaining the machinery effectively. It also means high financial burden that continues into the future. Technology based on the knowledge that the indigenous people cannot fully comprehend or manipulate will perpetuate dependence on external assistance for maintenance, operation and repair.

8.2.3 Horticulture: Diversification and Value Addition

Promotion of horticulture may involve exotic varieties and species, or be based on conventional modern agriculture, including use of synthetic fertilizers and other agrochemicals. High income generating power of one crop or forest product may put undue pressure on the ecosystem through overharvesting and monoculture.

Indigenous Knowledge and Climate Change Resilience: Introduction of non-Kalash agricultural crops and varieties, technology and practices may undermine the indigenous agricultural systems, if they are based on conventional agriculture that emphasizes high yields of a single crop and is dependent on inputs foreign to ecosystems, such as synthetic fertilizers and pesticides. The environmental and social negative impacts of conventional monoculture are well known, but it is less well recognized that indigenous agricultural systems with their reliance on the functionalities of local ecosystems hold keys to climate change adaptation and mitigation. The local varieties are often rejected for their low yields, but their other useful attributes, such as resistance to local diseases, suitability to local climate and environmental conditions, symbiosis with other local plants or animals, preference by the local palate, are very often ignored.

Culture: Enlarging market opportunities for the Kalash people may contribute to increasing their cash income and ultimately to better education and health. It will also signify their further integration to the modern cash economy, where the most important yardstick is profits. Their lifestyle may become more materialistic like the rest of the world, which will most likely entail loss of their spirituality. Contemporary education and influence of outsiders may threaten the oral tradition.

Gender and Social Inclusion: The presence of outsiders may restrict mobility of women by harassing them, as it has happened with the tourists. Activities to promote social inclusion may be met with resistance by the powerful members of the society, creating conflicts among the people.

Biodiversity, Climate Change Resilience and Lifestyle: Plant species that are exotic to the subproject area may be invasive and destructive of the local ecosystem. If so, they will end up weakening the ecosystems and lower their resilience to climate change. The exotic species may well crowd out the indigenous species that are important to the diet and beliefs of the people.

If one crop or forest product becomes highly popular in the markets outside the communities, the local people may overharvest it or attempt to produce more than the ecosystem can sustainably do by resorting to agrochemicals.

Biodiversity, Livelihood and Quality of Life: If use of agrochemicals is promoted without raising awareness on their harmful effects, it will negatively affect the soil productivity and biodiversity, jeopardizing viability of agriculture in the long run. Application of pesticides and herbicides require increasing amounts as the pests and weeds acquire resistance; it ruins in the end the environment and the health of the farmers as well as their balance sheets. While some Kalash people are aware of its health effects and its efficacy which may not be any better than smoke produced by simple burning of any material, many others believe that the “sprays” are a sort of necessary evil.

Expansion of agricultural lands would mean loss of habitats for wildlife and most likely forests. Habitat loss is directly linked to loss of biodiversity and ecosystem resilience, and the community’s resilience to climate change will diminish. The Kalash life will be heavily impacted for its dependence on local ecosystems to procure livestock fodder and other non-timber forest products to supplement food as well as medicinal plants. The forest products are also sold outside the community to generate cash income.

Sustainability: Dependence on imported inputs will require technical knowledge and skills to use or operate them. When the country does not have the capacity to produce them, it often means that insufficient knowledge and skills exist to satisfactorily use or operate the goods. For Kalash people, who have relatively little contact with the outside world, they are likely to face obstacles in properly cultivating the crop that they have never eaten. It also means high financial burden that continues into the future.

8.3 Mitigation Measures

8.3.1 Integrated Resources Management: Climate Change, Food Security and Disaster Risk Reduction

Advantages of the Project: The objective of the project is to improve the efficiency of irrigation water use so that agricultural production would benefit. It also aims to render agriculture resilient to climate change. If the concerned departments---on-farm water management and agriculture---set their targets independently toward the goal, each one with the tools that are available to them, the project will not be able to take advantage of the great opportunity provided by the fact that many actors involved in irrigation water are gathered under one project for water use efficiency and climate change adaptation and mitigation.

Enhancement Water Use Efficiency and Responsibilities of the Departments: If simply more irrigation water is made available, farmers may opt for crops that are water-guzzling but generates high income. Under climate change---which is likely to increase the available water in the short term due to faster glacier melt from higher temperature and then to dramatically decrease as the glaciers disappear--- preference for crops that require great amounts of water should be discouraged, and agriculture that is less dependent on water from outside the agroecosystem must be promoted. Increased efficiency in use of irrigation water can be achieved at the farm level through mulching, green manure, cover crops, appropriate choice of crops to grow and agroforestry, but such techniques are not part of the tools available to On-Farm Water Management Directorate. Rainwater harvesting is much less disruptive to the environment than canals, is possible at a much lower cost, but does not match with the mandate of On-Farm Water Directorate which takes care of watercourses. Irrigation Department may know that watershed management, hence forestry, is the most effective means to reduce siltation in the canals, but reforestation and afforestation are not their responsibilities.

Holistic Approach for Maximum Impact: Instead of On-Farm Water Directorate aiming for higher efficiency of water use through watercourses management, Agriculture Department for higher income through crops of higher market value, the stakeholders, including the farmers, should jointly address the water management issue in a holistic manner, which will enable a subproject to mitigate the negative impacts most effectively. In other words, World Bank Operational Policy on Indigenous Peoples OP 4.10—which requires its projects to pay particular attention to ancestral domain and natural resources, commercial development of natural and cultural resources, and physical relocation of indigenous peoples—is most adequately satisfied through integrated resources management. It will also facilitate integration of climate change adaptation and mitigation measures, which require holistic, ecosystem-based approaches. Put differently, focusing on strengthening the functions of the ecosystems and strengthening them are the surest path for climate change resilience, food security and disaster risk reduction.

Ecosystems, Watersheds and Climate Change: The project and subproject design will be based on integrated management of water resources for improved water use efficiency, climate change adaptation and mitigation. It will avoid each Department independently attempting to reach its own goal, which results in overall inefficiency. The best approach is to start from re-examining the choice of crops and breeds from environmental and socioeconomic points of view. It should also be recognized that climate change is an event that has profoundly changed the manner in which water resources are replenished. An analysis at the ecosystem and watershed levels is required for a project that minimizes negative impacts and creates truly sustainable and climate-change proof livelihoods.

8.3.2 Watercourses and Climate Change

Land Acquisition: Considering the numerous impacts that land acquisition will bring to the lives of the indigenous peoples, no subproject requiring land acquisition will be approved.

Climate Change and Hydrology: The changes in rainfall pattern brought about by climate change will be taken into account in rehabilitation of watercourses. Its hydrological impacts will be re-examined, and no rehabilitation that could have negative effects on the sacred lakes and springs will be undertaken.

Flood and Landslide Control: Climate change has altered the timing, duration and intensity of rainfall, or how water is supplied. Floods and landslides that occur more frequently with higher intensity than before need to be controlled so that they make positive contributions to water resources. Irrigation systems are not only a mechanism to supply water but also to regulate floods, and hence landslides. Schemes to rehabilitate irrigation systems must incorporate flood control functions.

Local Knowledge and Material: Rehabilitation will be conducted by using local knowledge and material for civil works as much as possible so as to reaffirm their culture, in ensure ownership and to minimize influx of labor from outside. Indigenous knowledge will be supplemented by mainstream scientific information, such as on nature-based solutions. Minimum reliance on imports will improve sustainability of the project.

Indigenous Agricultural Knowledge and Skills: Improvement in water use efficiency will integrate agricultural techniques: mulching, green manure, cover crops, appropriate choice of crops and agroforestry. The practices to be promoted will be based on indigenous knowledge and skills related to local ecosystems.

8.3.3 On-Farm Water Use Efficiency

Local Knowledge and Material: Methods to improve the efficiency of on-farm water use will be explored with the Kalash people so as to utilize local knowledge and material as much as possible, to reaffirm their culture, to ensure ownership and to minimize influx of labor from outside. It will be supplemented by mainstream scientific information, such as on nature-based solutions. Minimum reliance on imports will improve sustainability of the project.

Indigenous Agricultural Knowledge and Skills: Improvement in water use efficiency will integrate agricultural techniques: mulching, green manure, cover crops, appropriate choice of crops and agroforestry. The practices to be promoted will be based on indigenous knowledge and skills related to local ecosystems.

8.3.4 Horticulture and Indigenous Agriculture

Endogenous and Indigenous Species and Varieties: The priority will be given to promote the endogenous and indigenous species and varieties, which are best suited to local climate and ecosystems. They are more tolerant of weather that is extreme by local standards and contribute to climate resilience and disaster risk reduction. Any introduction of species and varieties exotic to the subproject area will be carefully analyzed beforehand with the consultation of the local communities. Both the environmental and social aspects will be examined, including climate change adaptation and mitigation, the role of plant in the local livelihood and belief system, and its relation to gender and social inclusion.

Forests and Agricultural Intensification: Since forests constitute an extremely important element in water management (especially through watershed protection), climate change adaptation and mitigation as well as in cash income generation and fuel procurement for the local population, no forest clearing will take place under the project. Rather subprojects will search for methods of agricultural intensification that boost the production with less inputs, including land and other inputs not found locally. Sufficient production will be sought through design and management that relies heavily on local specificities, ecological and socioeconomic.

Locally Supplied Inputs and Knowledge: Minimum reliance on imports will improve sustainability of the project. Indigenous knowledge will be utilized for this purpose and also for ownership, supplemented by mainstream scientific information, such as on agroforestry. As indigenous agriculture is important in finding appropriate adaptation measures to climate change, the subprojects will aim at enhancing the functionality of indigenous agriculture, rather than imposing conventional agriculture with an unbalanced focus on yield and synthetic inputs. The importance of genetic diversity will be informed, especially in light of climate change, and discussed, together with the advantages and disadvantages of local species and varieties.

Integrated Pest Management and Indigenous Knowledge: The possibility of highly productive agriculture without costly agrochemicals that are harmful to the environment and the people will be explored, relying on the indigenous knowledge on the subject and supplemented by occidental scientific information, such as on regenerative agriculture. The entire community will be informed on the effects of synthetic agrochemicals and non-biodegradable products, including petrochemical goods, on the environment and the health of people. An integrated pest management plan will be formulated based on the indigenous knowledge on pest management and with the guidance of Integrated Pest Management Plan Framework of this project.

Integration into Cash Economy: What the integration into the modern cash economy may entail in terms of income and culture will be thoroughly discussed with community members. Examples of other indigenous peoples around the world with the same dilemma will be shared with the people for discussion. Value-chain enhancement will take into account both positive and negative effects that increase in interactions with outside communities may have. Respect and appreciation will be required of indigenous peoples and their systems by the project and the wider Pakistani society.

Gender Empowerment and Social Inclusion: Activities to promote gender empowerment and social inclusion will be formulated in a participatory approach, giving voices to the vulnerable groups as well as the powerful ones so that the idea of social equality is embraced by all. Any additional activity given to the vulnerable must be compensated by reduced responsibility in other areas; they often work longer hours and on more strenuous tasks than others, and cannot afford to take on more, even if the new tasks are meant to bring them income.

9 GRIEVANCE REDRESS MECHANISM

9.1 Objectives

A grievance redress mechanism (GRM) will put in place in order to allow indigenous Peoples raise a grievance about any issues covered in this Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework or Indigenous Peoples Plans during subproject designing and implementation. A Grievance Redress Mechanism must provide a predictable, transparent and creditable process to all parties, resulting in outcomes that are seen as fair, effective and lasting. It ensures provision of a cost-effective method to the locals to report their grievances and complaints, establishes a forum and a structure to report their grievances with dignity and access to a fair hearing and remedy, provides means to negotiate and influence decisions and policies of the project that might adversely affect them, and facilitates access to information on the subproject. The GRM will address indigenous affected people's concerns and complaints regarding subproject implementation proactively and promptly, using an understandable and transparent process that takes vulnerable groups' conditions into account, culturally appropriate and readily accessible to all segments of the affected people at no cost and without retribution.

Operationally, a good GRM resolves grievances and disputes at the lowest level and relatively quickly before they escalate to an unmanageable level, facilitates effective communication between the project and affected women and men, helps win the trust and confidence of the locals, creates productive relationships between the parties; ensures equitable and fair distribution of benefits, costs and risks, mitigates or prevents adverse

impacts of the subproject on communications and produces appropriate corrective or preventive actions; helps to avoid project delays and cost increase, and improve quality of work.

In accordance with Article 40 of the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, which states that the resolution of grievances should “give due consideration to the customs, traditions, rules and legal systems of the indigenous peoples concerned and international human rights,” the GRM for the project will be based on customary practices of the indigenous peoples. At present, a *Qazi* with the help of village elders plays the mediator role for conflict resolution in all Kalash communities; the same institution will be used as first line of GRM.

The mechanism should be established as soon as possible so that the subproject design phase will not be without one. The communities to be affected will be informed about the mechanism immediately after its establishment.

9.2 Structure

A grievance redress mechanism must have a clear structure and well-defined functions, including its boundaries, role and responsibilities assigned to different personnel for handling the grievance resolution process, such as receiving, recording and sorting complaints, conducting assessments and resolution processes, coordination and monitoring.

In each subproject area, a grievance redress committee (GRC) of indigenous communities will be formally established and will function as open forums for hearing complaints and exploring quick resolution to resolve conflicts. A local chapter of the GRC, Local Grievance Redress Committee (LGRC), will also be established to provide easy access to the mechanism. The LGRC serves as the lowest level grievance mechanism and will deal with a wide variety of complaints. For a GRC based on the existing mechanism in the communities, a LGRC must comprise one *Qazi*, three to five local indigenous community elders, the social specialist under the PIU, and one representative from the contractor. The PIU will help in formulation of LGRCs and project directors will formally be notified of LGRCs for all subprojects.

At the PIU level, GRCs will be headed by the Project Director and will be comprised of PIU staff, two members from local indigenous communities and one member from the executing agency. The role of the GRCs at PIU is to address the project related grievance of the affected parties that could not be resolved satisfactorily at LGRCs. If needed, the World Bank Islamabad Office can also be contacted by communities.

The detailed working of the mechanism and related contact information will be disseminated through public consultations to the people who may be affected by the subproject at an earliest opportunity.

9.3 Resolution Process

See Section 8.9.3 Resolution Process of the Environmental and Social Management Framework.

9.4 Legal Process

See Section 8.9.4 Legal Process of the Environmental and Social Management Framework.

10 ELABORATION OF INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLAN

10.1 Free, Prior and Informed Consent

The World Bank Operational Policy on Indigenous Peoples requires a process of free, prior and informed consent (FPIC) throughout the project; the process is to lead to broad community support from indigenous peoples benefiting from, or affected by the subproject. The requirement is in recognition of the indigenous peoples' inherent and prior rights to their lands, territories and resources and respects their legitimate authority. The FPIC process allows and supports meaningful choices by the indigenous peoples about their lives. The borrower needs to use participatory consultative methods that are appropriate to the social and cultural values of the affected indigenous communities and their local conditions and, in designing these methods, give special attention to the concerns of indigenous women, youth, children and other vulnerable groups and their access to opportunities and benefits.

Free, prior, informed, culturally appropriate and socially inclusive consultations will take place with the indigenous communities at all stages of the subproject from planning to implementation. Consent of the indigenous peoples is to be sought sufficiently in advance of any authorization or commencement of activities in accordance with time requirements of indigenous consultation and consensus processes. The elements of free, prior and informed consent are summarized in Table 2.

Table 10-1 Prior and Informed Consent

Free	Prior	Informed	Consent
No manipulation	<p>None of the following should be undertaken before consent of the indigenous peoples concerned:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Authorization or commencement of project activity; • Finalization of development plans; and • Specific time requirements of the consultation and consensus process should be set. 	<p>Information to be provided should be accurate and conveyed in a form and manner that is understood by the indigenous peoples concerned and in keeping with their traditions.</p>	<p>Consent may be oral or written, but will always involve consultation and participation.</p> <p>It must be recorded by the Project Management Unit with sufficient evidence.</p>
No intimidation or coercion		<p>Use appropriate language without perception of threats or coercion</p> <p>It must be in a form that is</p>	<p>Consent should be obtained through a participatory process.</p>

		understandable and in line with the traditions of the community.	
No incentives		Share with the concerned communities all information available on social, economic, environmental and cultural impacts as well as reasons for proposed activities, duration, affected locality, proposed benefits sharing and legal arrangements and people likely to be involved.	Decision-making should not exclude or marginalize individuals due to gender, ethnicity or other factors.

Source: Indigenous People Planning Framework of Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund (undated).

10.2 Screening for Indigenous Peoples Plan

During the screening stage, the officials of the Project Implementation Unit (PIU) will visit all indigenous peoples' communities and villages in the area where subproject may cause impacts.

The PIU will arrange public meetings in selected communities at a pre-announced place and date to provide information on the project and subprojects; the communities will be chosen so that all people who may be impacted by the project will be able to attend a meeting. The very first visit will be accompanied by a screening exercise, which will be undertaken by the PIU with the help of indigenous people community leader to document the following:

- Presence and names of indigenous people community groups in the area;
- Cultural and religious distinction of the indigenous groups vis-à-vis other communities;
- Laws, regulations and customs related to indigenous people groups;
- Total number of indigenous people and indigenous communities as well as percentage of indigenous people population to total population in the area;
- Number and percentage of indigenous people households likely to be affected by the subproject; and
- Vulnerability of the indigenous people, such as socioeconomic conditions that may further deteriorate due to project impact.

During the visits, community leaders and other participants will present their views on the merits, benefits, and envisaged constraints of the project and subproject components.

10.3 Due Diligence Report

A due diligence report is to be prepared if no impact on the indigenous people is identified. If unexpected and significant impacts become likely during project implementation, the Indigenous Peoples Plan will be updated in accordance with this Framework. The Plan must be implemented before commencement of the activity that could cause significant impacts.

10.4 Social Impact Assessment

If the results of the preliminary screening show that there are indigenous households in the proposed subproject area, a social impact assessment will be conducted to capture issues specific to the indigenous peoples. If vulnerable groups among the indigenous people are identified within the project area, they warrant attention so that their sociocultural identity and baseline economic standards would be improved by the project.

An analysis will be conducted to identify subprojects' stakeholders, particularly the positively or negatively affected and persons vulnerable to the subproject. Social impact assessment will be conducted in consultation with the indigenous communities, in particular with persons who will be affected by the project, through focus group discussions, interviews of key informants, women only meetings and other informal gatherings to record their views and recommendations for the subproject preparation. The process will adhere to the principles of free, prior and informed consent.

The assessment will ensure that all potential positive and adverse effects of the subproject on the indigenous people are fully understood and accounted for in the subproject design, in accordance with the Framework guidelines to avoid any adverse effects, or if not possible, then minimize, mitigate or compensate for such effects. It will also ensure that the indigenous communities receive culturally appropriate benefits of the subproject. Annex D shows a checklist that may be used for this purpose.

Specific consultations will be carried out with the persons who are likely to be negatively affected to identify their needs and preferences for compensation and rehabilitation measures; the affected persons will be thoroughly informed on the results of the census and impact assessment. This process will include the following actions:

- Inform affected indigenous communities about subproject objectives and activities;
- Discuss and assess possible adverse impacts and ways to avoid or mitigate them;
- Discuss and assess potential project benefits and how these can be enhanced;
- Discuss and assess land and natural resource use and how management of these resources may be enhanced;
- Identify customary rights to land and natural resource use and possible ways of enhancing them;
- Identify and discuss potential conflicts with other communities and how these might be avoided;
- Elicit and incorporate indigenous knowledge into subproject design;
- Ascertain the affected communities' broad support for the project; and

- Develop a strategy for indigenous people's participation and consultation during project implementation, including monitoring and evaluation.

The interests, needs and priorities of vulnerable segments of indigenous communities---especially women, the elderly, the youth, and the handicapped---may vary, and they may be affected differently from others. It is important to have in-depth consultations with such vulnerable groups to assess their needs, priorities and nature of their interests in the subproject. In particular, the economic gap between the vulnerable and the rest of the community should not be widened by the project, but narrowed. The consultation process will ensure their participation in decision making at all stages of the subproject, explicitly or implicitly. If explicit participation of vulnerable groups through their inclusion in consultation meetings with other stakeholders does not prove effective, other participatory techniques---such as separate meetings for each vulnerable group, household level discussions, structured or unstructured interviews---will be used. Gender and Social Protection Checklist (Annex E) can help the process.

The processes and mechanisms ensuring the active involvement of affected persons and other stakeholders will be detailed in the Indigenous Peoples Plan, which will include an Appendix with a list of participants, location, date and minutes of consultation meetings. The consultations at later stages of the subproject will be documented and reported in the Quarterly Progress Reports.

The level of detail and comprehensiveness of the assessment will correspond to the complexity and severity of the impacts. The assessment will contain: a baseline socioeconomic profile of the indigenous peoples in the subproject area; the nature and degree of environmental and socioeconomic impacts to the indigenous peoples by the subproject; suggestions on enhancement of positive impacts and elimination or mitigation of negative impacts and feasibility of implementing an Indigenous Peoples Plan. Feasibility should be assessed based on the following issues:

- Resolution of grievances, especially those that could not be resolved at the local level and require resolution at the higher levels as in the Environmental and Social Management Framework;
- Documentation of subproject resettlement and compensation, if applicable, including temporary losses;
- Evaluation of the quality of compensation or other relevant mitigation measures, including impacts on livelihoods; and
- Mitigation measures when strategic interventions are required---for example, if the vulnerable groups are not receiving sufficient support from the subproject.

10.5 Benefit Sharing and Mitigation Measures

Where impacts on indigenous households are potentially positive, measures will be undertaken to ensure that benefits are equally shared. To this end, indigenous peoples must be firmly involved as stakeholders at all stages of the subproject. Where impacts are potentially negative, all such affected indigenous households will be provided with assistance to improve their living standards without risking community disintegration.

Indigenous people as a whole are vulnerable and are entitled to receive special assistance not only to restore and improve their income and livelihood, but also to maintain their distinct cultural identity.

Indigenous peoples are likely to have traditional land rights; these will be honored, and the absence of land titles will not disqualify them for receiving compensation. Their compensation entitlements will be the same as those listed in the Resettlement Plan Framework (RPF) of the project, which recognizes the indigenous people as vulnerable people.

10.6 Establishment of Indigenous Peoples Plan

10.6.1 Overview

An Indigenous Peoples Plan will establish the measures through which the borrower will ensure that: (i) indigenous people affected by the subproject receive culturally appropriate social and economic benefits; and (ii) when potential adverse effects on indigenous people are identified, the adverse effects are avoided, minimized, mitigated, or compensated for. The Plan should be prepared in a flexible and pragmatic manner, and its level of detail will vary depending on the subproject and the nature of effects to be addressed. Its contents should include:

- Project description and summary description of issues relating to indigenous peoples;
- Summary of legal and institutional framework applicable to indigenous peoples;
- Summary of social impact assessment, including baseline information on demographics, social, cultural, and political characteristics of the affected indigenous peoples, land and territories that they have traditionally owned or customarily used or occupied, and natural resources on which they depend;
- Summary of the process leading to free, prior and informed consent;
- Framework to ensure consultations with the affected indigenous peoples during subproject implementation in line with the principles of free, prior and informed consent;
- Measures to ensure that the affected indigenous people receive social and economic benefits that are culturally appropriate;
- Description of institutional arrangements for the implementation of the Plan;
- Measures to avoid, minimize, mitigate, or compensate for adverse effects;
- Cost estimates and financing plan for the Plan;
- Grievance redress mechanisms accessible to the affected indigenous peoples, and
- Monitoring, evaluating and reporting on the implementation of the Plan, along with specific monitoring indicators disaggregated by communities, gender and age.

Annex F shows an indicative annotated outline of an Indigenous Peoples Plan.

The Project Implementation Unit is required to prepare an Indigenous Peoples Plan for each of the subprojects, prior to implementation. Given the substantial presence of Muslim community in some villages of the Kalash valley, a Mixed Community Development Plan¹³ can also be prepared if required. The PIU will submit the Plan

¹³A mixed community development plan assesses project impacts, devise mitigation measures and compensation for indigenous and non-indigenous people who belong to the same geographical community and have social ties with each other.

to the World Bank for review and approval prior to the finalization of the subproject formulation. The measures in the Plan must comply with World Bank Operational Policy 4.10, and the Plan must be integrated into subproject design.

10.6.2 Consultation

Consultations are necessary to ensure that needs, priorities, and preferences of indigenous peoples are adequately dealt with; the principal strategy of Indigenous Peoples Plan would be to promote participation of the indigenous peoples. Thorough consultation and broad community support will be sought prior to undertaking any project activities that affect the communities, and the affected indigenous people will be informed and consulted in preparing the Plan.

The participation of affected indigenous peoples in planning will enable them to benefit the most from the project and to protect them from any potential adverse impacts of the subproject. The Project Implementation Unit will ensure that adequate funds are available for consultation and facilitation. Indigenous peoples may be particularly vulnerable when project activities include: (i) commercial development of their cultural resources and knowledge; (ii) physical displacement from traditional or customary lands; and (iii) commercial development of natural resources within customary lands under use that would impact livelihoods or cultural, ceremonial, or spiritual uses that define the identity and community of indigenous people. In deciding whether to proceed with a project involving such activities, the borrower will seek the consent of affected indigenous people communities.

10.6.3 Disclosure

In the subproject initiation phase, the implementing Project implementation Unit will be responsible for the issue of public notice to acquire particular land or property for the subproject, along with dissemination of information on the subproject. The notice will be published twice in local newspapers, with a week's interval. In addition, the PIU, along with local revenue officials and officials from the district collector's office, will conduct meetings to ensure that the information reaches all indigenous people affected by the subproject.

The documents to be elaborated by the PIU for disclosure on the World Bank's website are:

- (i) Draft Indigenous Peoples Plan and Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework, including social impact assessment;
- (ii) Final IPP; and
- (iii) New or updated IPP and a corrective action plan prepared during implementation, if any.

For the benefit of the local community, indigenous people in particular, summary of this Framework and each Plan will be made available in local languages during public meetings at the community level and will be disclosed in public places prior to subproject appraisal, allowing stakeholders to provide inputs on the subproject in a timely manner.

Each subproject IPP will be disclosed to the affected indigenous people communities by the PIU, including measurement of losses, detailed asset valuations, entitlements and special provisions, grievance procedures, timing of payments, and displacement schedule. Information sharing will be through public consultations. The key information in the IPP---such as entitlements and implementation arrangements---will be made available as brochures, leaflets, or booklets, using the language most understood by the indigenous people in question. Posters designed to disseminate the most important elements of the IPP will be distributed in different localities to generate mass awareness.

As soon as the Plan is finalized, hard copies of the IPP in the local indigenous language will also be made available at: (i) offices of the Project Implementation Unit; (ii) Deputy/Assistant Commissioner's office; (iii) Union Council office; and (iv) any other local level public offices. For non-literate people, other communication methods will be used; a report of this disclosure with dates and locations will be shared with the World Bank. The Project Implementation Unit will ensure that adequate funds are available for consultation and facilitation.

Efforts should be made to put electronic version of the Framework and the Plan on the official website of the PIU, provincial government, and World Bank after approval and endorsement of the documents by them.

11 IMPLEMENTATION OF INDIGENOUS PEOPLES PLAN

11.1 Project Implementation Unit

The Project Implementation Unit is overall responsible for functions related to indigenous people, including preparation, implementation, financing and supervision of all subproject activities and interagency coordination. It will also be responsible for the day-to-day activities of project implementation in the field. The project will engage one environmental specialist, one social specialist, one resettlement specialist and one social inclusion specialist (who covers gender) to oversee safeguard issues.

A consulting firm will be hired by the PIU for the overall program implementation, progress review, contracting, supervision, and progress monitoring as well as preparation of all documentation needed for the subproject, including matters related with indigenous peoples.

The PIU will receive and review all quarterly reports and address all queries from the agencies working in the field. It will coordinate with all other project stakeholders at the PIU level.

11.2 Monitoring and Evaluation

The project will monitor and evaluate the activities with a focus on possible negative impacts. As required by the Environmental and Social Management Framework, monthly, quarterly and semi-annual monitoring reports will be prepared in order to:

- (i) Improve environmental and social management practices;
- (ii) Ensure the efficiency and quality of the environmental and social assessment processes;

- (iii) Establish evidence- and results-based environmental and social assessment for the sub-projects; and
- (iv) Provide an opportunity to report the results of safeguards, impacts and proposed mitigation measures' implementation.

The Project Implementation Unit will conduct internal monitoring activities during the design of the subproject to determine the extent to which mitigation measures are successfully implemented: compliance monitoring, which verifies that the Environmental and Social Management Framework is effectively implemented.

Once the subproject is under implementation, impacts will be monitored, instead of compliance. The environmental and social safeguards documents will be shared with the contractor, and the PIU will monitor to ensure that works are proceeding in accordance with the agreed mitigation measures. The safeguard specialists will conduct internal quarterly monitoring activities, whose report will be submitted to the PIU, the relevant government departments and the World Bank for review.

An independent monitoring agent may be recruited by the project to assess potential subproject impacts if the nature and extent of impacts are considered of great concern to the indigenous people. Their reports will be submitted to the PIU and the World Bank.

Evaluation is an assessment of the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, performance and sustainability of a project. Evaluation requires an in-depth review at specific points in the life of a project, usually at the mid-point and at the end, to verify whether project objectives have been achieved or not. It is a management tool which will assist in evidence-based decision making and provides valuable lessons to the provincial government.

Monitoring and evaluation of the social impacts concern:

- Impacts on the standard of living of affected indigenous people at individual, household and community levels – the standard must be the same or better after project implementation;
- Gender and age differentiated impacts – the negative impacts must be avoided or minimized;
- Post project socioeconomic status of affected communities – the status must be better after project implementation;
- Management of disputes or conflicts – disputes and conflicts must have been resolved to the satisfaction of all parties involved.

In order to measure these impacts, the PIU must:

- Identify specific indicators to be monitored with gender and age disaggregated data;
- Define how indicators will be measured on a regular basis; and
- Identify key monitoring milestones.

In order to ensure that indigenous people are engaged in the monitoring and evaluation process, a monitoring committee will be established for each beneficiary community. The composition of this committee will be

subject to a process of free, prior and informed consent and will build on the decision-making structures of each indigenous community, as well as requirements for inclusion of vulnerable groups. The monitoring committees will be involved in elaboration of monitoring reports. The village elders and *Qazi* (religious leader) will be consulted on the subproject activities within village boundaries to confirm whether construction, contracting arrangements, and other aspects have been implemented appropriately.

11.3 Budget

The budget for implementing the Indigenous Peoples Plan Framework and Indigenous Peoples Plan will be part of the project budget. It will be used to cover project staff allowances and costs to collect data and prepare various documents: compliance reports, supervising and monitoring reports, and an Indigenous Peoples Plan. The Plan will indicate detailed costs of mitigation measures and other rehabilitation entitlements for indigenous peoples in the affected areas as well as administrative and monitoring costs of the Plan.

The exact sources of funding and financing plans for Plan implementation will be developed together with other elements in the Plan. Costs for land expropriation, if any, shall be financed by the counterpart funds, while the training and consultation cost shall be financed by the World Bank.

Bibliography

Awan, A.W. (2013). An Ethnic Group: Kafir-Kalash:

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/272696339_An_Ethnic_Group_Kafir-Kalash

Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights, and Labor. (2017). International Religious Freedom Report for 2017:

<https://www.state.gov/documents/organization/281276.pdf>

Cambodia - Agricultural Sector Diversification Project. (2018). Indigenous people planning framework:

http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/970741531219851249/Indigenous_people-planning-framework

Cambodia - Water Supply and Sanitation Improvement Project. (n.d.). Indigenous Peoples Plan: Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework:

<http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/571111538726306095/Indigenous-Peoples-Planning-Framework>

Chitral Growth Strategy. (2017). Devising our own identity –“A model for celebrative Partnership for inclusive And sustainable growth in Chitral”:

<http://www.ppaf.org.pk/doc/regional/CGS.pdf>

Country Technical Note on Indigenous Peoples' Issues Islamic Republic of Pakistan. (2012):

https://www.ifad.org/documents/38714170/40224860/pakistan_ctn.pdf/e61c7750-b616-423d-a7b3-cf2f886b47ae

Critical Ecosystem Partnership. (n.d.), Fund Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework:

https://www.cepf.net/sites/default/files/cepf_planning_framework.pdf

Cultural Survival. (2017). Observations on the State of Indigenous Human Rights in Pakistan:

<https://www.culturalsurvival.org/sites/default/files/PakistanUPR2017.pdf>

FPIC. (2017). A report on lessons learned from the Merian Mine prepared by an Expert Advisory Panel, organized by RESOLVE:

http://solutions-network.org/site-fpic/files/2017/07/Merian-Expert-Advisory-Panel_FINAL-REPORT.pdf

Free prior And Informed Consent. (n.d.). An indigenous peoples' rights and a good practice for local Communities:

<https://www.un.org/development/desa/indigenouspeoples/publications/2016/10/free-prior-and-informed-consent-an-indigenous-peoples-right-and-a-good-practice-for-local-communities-fao/>

Gettleman, J. (2018). "Where a Taboo is Leading to the Deaths of Young Girls." *The New York Times*. June 19,2018:

<https://www.nytimes.com/2018/06/19/world/asia/nepal-women-menstruation-period.html>

Human Rights Library. (n.d.). "Ratification of International Human Rights Violations of Indigenous Peoples' Rights in Pakistan". University of Minnesota:

<http://hrlibrary.umn.edu/research/ratification-pakistan.html>

Indigenous People Planning Framework. (n.d.).Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund (PPAF):

[http://www.pfaf.org.pk/doc/regional/3-Indigenous%20People%20Policy%20Framework%20\(IPPF\).pdf](http://www.pfaf.org.pk/doc/regional/3-Indigenous%20People%20Policy%20Framework%20(IPPF).pdf)

Indigenous Peoples Safeguards. (2013). A Planning and Implementation Good Practice Sourcebook:

<https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/institutional-document/33748/files/ip-good-practices-sourcebook-draft.pdf>

IPPF (Ogiek and Sengwer). (2009). Kenya agricultural productivity and agribusiness project (KAPAP):

<https://docplayer.net/41617957-Republic-of-kenya-indigenous-peoples-planning-framework-ogiek-and-sengwer-kenya-agricultural-productivity-and-agribusiness-project-kapap.html>

Malik, A.A. and Waheed, A. (2005). KALASH, The Challenge of Development with Identity: Meanings and Issues. Islamabad: Institute of Social Policy:

<http://ispislamabad.org/attachments/article/30/KALASH%20POSITION%20PAPER-.pdf>

Markussen, A.D. (May 2016). "Linguistic and Genetic Roots of the Kalasha":

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/318054967_Linguistic_and_Genetic_Roots_of_the_Kalasha

Mela, E. (2017).The Kalasha Woman Today: The rights of indigenous people in Asia.(ILO):

http://www.ijhssnet.com/journals/Vol_2_No_17_September_2012/10.pdf

NWFP and IUCN Pakistan. (2004). Chitral an integrated development Vision:

<http://solutions-network.org/site-fpic/>

Naz, A. Sheikh, I. Khan, W. and Saeed, J. (2015). "Traditional Wedding System and Marriage by Elopement among Kalasha Tribe of District Chitral, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan". FWU journal of social sciences:

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/283243529_Traditional_Wedding_System_and_Marriage_by_Elopement_among_Kalasha_Tribe_of_District_Chitral_Khyber_Pakhtunkhwa_Pakistan

OP 4.10. (2005). Indignons People:

<https://policies.worldbank.org/sites/ppf3/PPFDocuments/090224b0822f89d5.pdf>

Sheikh, I. Chaudhry, H. and Mohyuddin, A. (2014). "Religion as a Space for Kalash Identity". A Case Study of Village Bumburetin Kalash Valley, District Chitral:

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/259821328_Religion_as_a_Space_for_Kalash_Identity_A_Case_Study_of_Village_Bumburetin_Kalash_Valley_District_Chitral

Sri Lanka: Second Integrated Road Investment Program (2017). Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework:

<https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/linked-documents/50301-001-ippfab.pdf>

The Constitution of Islamic Republic Of Pakistan. (2012):

http://na.gov.pk/uploads/documents/1333523681_951.pdf

The World Bank Operations Manual OP 4.10. (2013). Indigenous Peoples:

<http://go.worldbank.org/6L01FZTD20>

United Nations Economic and Social Council. (21 Dec, 2009):

<https://www.refworld.org/docid/4ed35bae2.html>

ANNEXES

AnnexA: Consultation Questions in the Field

Consultation Questions for Irrigation Officers

- Why do you think rehabilitation of canals is necessary?
- What will be the challenges of rehabilitation work?
- How will the rehabilitation affect the livelihoods of the farmers? Construction of new canals?
- Do you interact with male farmers often? How and on what subject? Female famers?
- Will the farmers need to move out of where they currently live when the canals are rehabilitated? If canals are newly constructed?
- If yes, what would be the best way to organize resettlement?
- What do you plan to do with the excavated material?
- What would be the effects of their disposal, in your opinion?
- How would climate change affect your work on irrigation?
- What were the other possibilities for this project?
- Does the project design fit the needs of your Department?
- Could you share with us the information on past irrigation interventions by the government, NGO, etc. for the Kalash people?
- What were the effects on irrigation systems of the flooding in 2015?
- What are the indigenous ways of irrigation?
- Do you think the indigenous irrigation should be integrated with the other conventional canals?
- What may be the strengths of indigenous irrigation?

Core Consultation Questions for On-Farm Water Management Officers

- Why do you think rehabilitation of watercourses is necessary?
- What kind of design and material would improve the ecosystem?
- What will be the challenges of rehabilitation work?
- How will the rehabilitation affect the livelihoods of the farmers?
- Do you interact with male farmers often? How and on what subject? Female famers?
- How are the Water User Associations organized?
- How are Water User rights defined in the area? Do women have the rights?
- How can the associations be strengthened, organizationally and financially? Women's participation?
- What would be your role in the strengthening efforts?
- What are other means, in your opinion, that would help increase soil moisture and maintain it longer?
- How would water storage tanks affect water-borne diseases?
- How do you mitigate waterlogging and salinization?
- How would climate change affect your work on on-farm water management?
- What were the other possibilities for this project? Why did you choose watercourse rehabilitation and water storage tank installation?
- Does the project design fit the needs of your Department?
- Could you share with us the information on past OFWM interventions by the government, NGO, etc. for the Kalash people?
- What were the effects on OFWM of the flooding in 2015?

- What are the indigenous ways of on-farm water management?
- What may be the strengths of indigenous on-farm water management?

Consultation Questions for Agriculture Extension Officers

- Why do you think Integrated Pest Management is necessary?
- What are the main elements of IPM, in your opinion?
- Do women handle agrochemicals, including storage and cleaning of clothes used when spraying?
- Do male farmers know the hazards of agrochemicals? Female farmers?
- How will IPM affect the livelihoods of the farmers?
- How do you think horticulture will benefit the farmers?
- What kind of organization is necessary to accommodate new horticulture crops?
- How do you decide on which new crops to introduce?
- Do you interact with male farmers often? How and on what subject? Female farmers?
- How many male extension officers work in the District? Female officers?
- How would climate change affect your work on agriculture extension?
- What were the other possibilities for this project? Why did you focus on horticulture?
- Does the project design fit the needs of your Department?
- Could you share with us the information on past agriculture interventions by the government, NGO, etc. for the Kalash people?
- What were the effects on agriculture of the flooding in 2015?
- Please share with us the statistics for the three valleys on:
 - Land availability
 - Total acreage of tillage
 - Total acreage by crops grown
 - Average agricultural land holding per household
 - Average household income from agriculture
- What are the indigenous ways of agriculture?
- What may be the strengths of indigenous agriculture?

Consultation Questions for Livestock Extension Officers

- Do you think crossbreeding with exotic races is necessary? Why?
- Are there distinct local breeds in the District? What are they?
- What are the main livestock products?
- Do you recommend use of antibiotics? What are the advantages and disadvantages?
- Do you have access to vaccines?
- Do you think animal health and human health are linked? Have you ever heard of One Health concept?
For the team: <http://www.oie.int/en/for-the-media/onehealth/>
- Do you have plans for medical and non-biodegradable waste generated from artificial insemination?
- Do you interact with male farmers often? How and on what subject? Female farmers?
- How many male extension officers work in the District? Female officers?
- How would climate change affect your work on livestock extension?
- What were the other possibilities for this project? Why did you choose crossbreeding, artificial insemination, liquid nitrogen plants, vaccine manufacturing, etc.?
- Does the project design fit the needs of your Department?

- Could you share with us the information on past livestock interventions by the government, NGO, etc. for the Kalash people?
- What were the effects on livestock of the flooding in 2015?
- Please share with us the statistics for the three valleys on:
 - Livestock ownership and type by household
 - Average household income from livestock
- What are the indigenous ways of livestock management?
- What may be the strengths of indigenous livestock management?

Consultation Questions for Indigenous Farmers

Preamble

- Explain who we represent, our mandate and the nature of the project
- Explain that this is the first of a series of discussions on the proposed project

Agriculture

- What are the major crops and steps involved in their cultivation?
- Which crop is grown in which season?
- What are the water sources for each of them: rainfall, groundwater, canal water, springs, streams, etc.?
- Are any of the crops sold outside the village for cash?
- What kind of crops do you think will increase your income?
- What may be the obstacles in increasing your income?
- Do different households work together in the fields, or does each household have a separate cultivation area that is exclusively their responsibility?
- Do you think the use pesticides, herbicides, fungicides, etc. help increase your income? What kind of other effects do they have?
- Do you make use of synthetic fertilisers? Do you think that their use would increase your income?
- It is possible to reduce the use of such chemicals if you grow different crops and fruit trees in the same plot. Has traditional culture incorporated chemicals?
- If traditional agriculture becomes impossible, how would that affect your life?
- What are the festivals and rituals related to agriculture?

Water

- Is any of the water sources sacred?
- What are the rules for sharing water?
- What are the problems when there is not enough water for agriculture?
- How do you think you can use the water more efficiently?
- How does the availability of water affect drinking water and sanitation in the village?
- How is climate change affecting the water situation? Planting and harvesting practices? Pests and weeds?

Livestock

- What kind of animals do you keep and what are the various tasks involved in keeping them?
- Which animal products do you consume (milk, meat, intestines, blood, horn, skin, bones, etc.)?

- Are any of the animals (whole live or parts) sold outside the village for cash?
- What kind of animals and their products do you think will increase your income?
- What may be the obstacles in increasing your income?
- Do different households work together for animal keeping, or does each household have animals that are exclusively their responsibility?
- What are the main sources of animal feed?
- Who has access to which pastures for grazing? How is it determined?
- If traditional livestock raising becomes impossible, how would that effect your life?
- What are the festivals and rituals related to animals?
- Have you seen any link between the health of animals and the health of people?
- Are they affected by availability of water? Why?

Forestry

- Do you go to the forest to collect fruits, nuts, honey, mushrooms and medicinal plants?
- If yes, are they only for use at home, shared among the villagers, or sold for cash income?
- What is your main source of fuel?
- How are forests maintained? Are there any rules for what not to do, etc.?

Labor Division

- How is work outside the house (field work; taking animals out in the field, collecting fodder, fuel, fruits, nuts, mushrooms, etc.) divided between women and men?
- How are the youth involved in work outside the house?
- How is work in and near the house (food preparation, child and elderly care, laundry, cleaning, fodder preparation, bathing children/elderly and animals, etc.) divided between women and men?
- How are the youth involved in work in and near the house?
- How are the elderly involved in work in and near the house?

Spirituality and Land ownership

- Which animals, plants, forests, trees, rivers, lakes, mountains, archaeological sites, etc. are considered sacred? Why?
- Which animals, plants, forests, trees, rivers, lakes, mountains etc. appear in myths?
- Which ones are sources of food/drink important to the community? Why?
- What are the rules on how and when to use/kill them?
- Do lands belong to the entire community? Are any lands owned by individuals?
- Have you experienced intrusion of people/activities in your community without any notification? If yes, what are they? How did you solve the issue?

Consultation Questions for Farmers on Free, Prior and Informed Consent

- General Considerations for Consultations
 - Understand Kalash Interpretation of Free, Prior and Informed Consent (FPIC);
 - identify the hierarchy, organizational structure and Kailash representative bodies to engage;
 - Establish an appropriate framework for consultations which brings out the views of the vulnerable (women, elderly, youth and handicapped) and engage with Kailash representative organizations
 - Share key information on the project objectives,

- Obtain communities' perceptions of impacts;
- Assess change that may be brought about in Kalash cultural practices, customary rights and their general way of life;
- Assess the customary rights of the Kalash, both individual and collective, pertaining to lands, customary use of the land; and natural resources vital to the sustainability of their cultures and livelihoods;
- Assess the need to protect their lands and resources against illegal intrusion and/or encroachment; and
- Assess the cultural and spiritual values that the Kalash attribute to lands and resources.
- Information Sharing on Free, Prior and Informed Consent (FPIC)
 - It is a specific right pertaining to Indigenous Peoples, including the Kalash. FPIC ensures that the communities are duly consulted and that consent is obtained from them through a decision-making process prior to the implementation of any project activity (road construction, timber harvesting, canal/dam construction, etc.) that affects their lives.
- What kind of consultation do you think is necessary so as not to negatively disrupt the lives of the community?
 - Who should meet the project promoters, how often, where and what should they discuss?
- What kind of negotiation do you think is necessary so as not to negatively disrupt the lives of the community?
 - Who should negotiate with the project promoters in what way?
 - What should be subject to negotiation?
- If a community representative is necessary for consultation or negotiation, how should that person be selected?
 - Should it be a group of several people, instead of one person?
 - How can we ensure that the representative/s think of the welfare of the entire community and not personal gains (i.e., how do we ensure that representative/s of the community are accountable and legitimate to those they represent)?
- Do you think involvement of is necessary?
 - If yes, how can we ensure broader community participation that include women, elderly, youth, disabled and any marginalized groups (for example, separate talks with each group)?
 - If yes, how can we make sure that their concerns are addressed in the consultations and negotiations?
 - If no, why should they be excluded? What can be lost/gained from involving them?

AnnexB:Issues raised byProminent Community Members

<p>Mr. Barzangi Khan, Social Activist of Kalash Community, Rumbur Valley</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Most tourists use wine and create problem for the Kalash women. • Touriststry to attract the attention of women by raising voices when passing by them. • The Muslim community members do not want to shake hands the Kalash or eat food that Kalash prepared. • During festivals some outsiders make social problems. • The Pathan Community members from outside Chitral abducted the Kalash women and forcibly converted them into Islam. • The Kalash suffered considerably due to the invasion from Noristan (Afghanistan); they not only assaulted them but forcefully took away their cattle’. • The sacred spring was now used to supply water, but it usedto have a great spiritual value for them. • The Kalash culture is unlike others and must be preserved. • The government should protect them from tourists who come only to create problems.
<p>Mr. Ajab Khan, Village elder, Rumbur Valley</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The project has the capacity to boost the socioeconomic life of the Kalash people, who are dependent on agriculture and livestock. • Accessibility to roads is very poor. • Medical/health facilities do not exist. • The existing educational facilities do not meet the needs. • Construction of irrigation system and water courses is needed. • No facility exists for storing and processing local fruits and mushrooms.
<p>Mr. Wazir, Village elder, Bumburet Valley</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participation of the locals is necessary so that the cultural and religious aspects would not be affected. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ A second story of <i>JastKhana</i>, where they perform the ceremony for funerals and dance, must be constructed. ▪ There is a dire need to protect their graveyards. ▪ Health and education facilities are needed. ▪ Access roads should be constructed. ▪ The Kalash culture must be protected.
<p>Sher Muhammad Khan, Village elder, Bumburet Valley</p> <p>(in addition to the points raised by Mr. Wazir)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Tourists take photographs of Kalash women; their behavior is overall humiliating. ▪ Most of the Kalash People are poor; there is a need to arrange incentives to satisfy the socioeconomics need of the people. ▪ Need to protect their forests. ▪ The Kalash community mostly depends on livestock and agriculture. Some assistance should be for vaccination of livestock and provision of fertilizer.

<p>Mr. Shah Husain, Councilor of Union Council (young), Birir Valley</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Government never pays attention to Kalash community for any development project. ▪ There is a great need of a veterinary hospital. ▪ New watercourses must be constructed. ▪ Border security is required for Kalash people as intruders from Noristan (Afghanistan) murdered the Kalash and took away their cattle. ▪ The mobility for women has become very difficult, as there are no rules and regulations for tourists. ▪ Government should provide incentives for better seeds and new technologies in agriculture. ▪ In winter, due to snow, economic activities are completely come to an end. People also face a lot of difficulties in fetching water and other use of daily life necessities in winter. ▪ In winter, government should provide food items, medical aid and fodder for their animals.
<p>Mr. Irfan Village elder, Birir Valley</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Most people have small land holdings, and if government helps leveling uneven land it will greatly increase agricultural production. ▪ Access to markets and facilities for preservation of fruits and other food items can help the Kalash community. ▪ Provision of solar panels can ease extraction of groundwater for agriculture. ▪ Infrastructure development is required. ▪ There should be representation of Kalash people in local government and in national government agencies. ▪ There is a serious need to take care of Kalash culture and tradition; the government should confer rights to Kalash people according to international conventions.

AnnexC:Indigenous Peoples Impact Screening Checklist

A. Project Profile

Subproject Title:

Implementing Agency: Processing Stage:

Valley/Village _____ UC _____ Tehsil _____

District _____ Province _____ Pakistan

Categorization Status: New subproject Revision subproject of Other

B. Identification of Impacts on Indigenous Peoples in Project Area

Key Concerns	Not Known	Yes	No	Remarks or identified problems, if any
Indigenous Peoples Identification				
Are there socio-cultural groups present in or use the project area who may be considered as "tribes" (hill tribes, schedules tribes, tribal peoples), "minorities" (ethnic or national minorities), or "indigenous communities" in the project area?				
Are there national or local laws or policies as well as anthropological researches/studies that consider these groups present in or using the project area as belonging to "ethnic minorities", scheduled tribes, tribal peoples, national minorities, or cultural communities?				
Do such groups self-identify as being part of a distinct social and cultural group?				

Do such groups maintain collective and distinct habitats or ancestral territories and/or to the natural resources in these habitats and territories?				
Do such groups maintain cultural, economic, social, and political institutions distinct from the dominant society and culture?				
Do such groups speak a distinct language or dialect?				
Has such groups been historically, socially and economically marginalized, disempowered, excluded, and/or discriminated against?				
Are such groups represented as "Indigenous Peoples," "ethnic minorities," "scheduled tribes," or "tribal populations" in any formal decision-making bodies at the national or local levels?				
Identification of Potential Impacts				
<p>Will the project affect the livelihood systems of Indigenous Peoples?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • food production system • natural resource management • crafts and trade • employment status 				
<p>Will the project directly or indirectly affect Indigenous Peoples' traditional socio-cultural and belief practices?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • child-rearing • health • education • arts • governance • rituals and festivals • worship places and sacred landscapes 				
Will there be any impact on the women that may hinder their mobility and safekeeping?				

Will the project alter or undermine the recognition of their knowledge, preclude customary behaviors or undermine customary institutions?					
Will the project be in an area (land or territory) occupied, owned, or used by Indigenous Peoples, and/or claimed as ancestral domain?					
Will the project require physical displacement from traditional or customary lands?					
Will the project require acquisition of lands that are traditionally owned or customarily used, occupied or claimed by indigenous peoples?					
In case no disruption of indigenous community life as a whole, will there be loss of housing, strip of land, crops, trees and other fixed assets owned or controlled by individual indigenous households?					
Identification of Special Requirements					
Will the project activities include:	Commercial development of cultural resources and knowledge of Indigenous Peoples?				
	Commercial development of natural resources (such as minerals, hydrocarbons, forests, water, hunting or fishing grounds) within customary lands under use that would impact the livelihoods or the cultural, ceremonial, spiritual uses of Indigenous Peoples?				
	Establishing legal recognition of rights to lands and territories that are traditionally owned or customarily used, occupied or claimed by indigenous peoples?				

C. Anticipated Project Impacts on Indigenous Peoples

Project Activity and Output	Anticipated Positive Impact	Anticipated Negative Impact
1.		
2.		
3.		

11.3.1.1 D. Decision on Categorization and Required Actions (Please Tick)

After reviewing the answer above, the Project Implementation Unit agrees that the project:

- Should be categorized as a subproject with high negative impacts; it should not be financed as is.
- Should be categorized as a subproject with moderate negative impacts; an Indigenous Peoples Development Plan (IPDP) and a Gender Action Plan are required.
- Should be categorized as a subproject with little negative impact; a specific action favorable to indigenous peoples/ethnic minority, together with a Gender Action Plan and a Community Participatory Plan, are required.
- Should be categorized as a subproject with no negative impact; no plan, framework or specific action is required.

Project Team Comments:

Proposed by Project Implementation Unit:

Reviewed by Project Consultant

Project Director

Social Safeguard Specialist, World Bank

Date:

Date:

AnnexD: Gender and Social Protection Checklist

A. Project/Subproject Profile

Project/Subproject Title:

Implementing Agency: Processing Stage:

Valley/Village _____ UC _____ Tehsil _____

District _____ Province _____ Pakistan

Categorization Status: New project/subproject Revision of project/subproject Other

B. Identification of Impacts in Project/Subproject Area

Key Concerns	Not	Yes	No	Remarks or identified problems, if any
	Known			
Gender				
Does the project/subproject take gender issues explicitly into account?				If negative, exclude from financing.
Does the background/context analysis of the project/subproject examine: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The difference in the situations of women and men; and, • The impacts of the project/subproject on different social groups. 				If negative, exclude from financing.
Are women/gender-focused groups, associations or organizations consulted for the project/subproject?				
Does the project/subproject ensure that both women and men can participate in project activities – from planning, implementation to monitoring and evaluation?				

Are outcomes, outputs and activities designed to meet the different needs and priorities of women and men?				If negative, exclude from financing.
Does the results framework include gender responsive indicators, targets and baselines?				If negative, exclude from financing.
Will the project/subproject collect and use age and sex disaggregated data and qualitative information to analyze and monitor gender issues?				
Does the project/subproject include gender sensitization activities for male and female stakeholders?				
Does the project/subproject management has an adaptive mechanism to address gender issues as they emerge?				
Have adequate financial resources been allocated to the proposed gender activities?				
Has a gender expert been recruited for the project/subproject?				
Will all project management members and technicians be sensitized on gender?				
Is the project/subproject personnel balanced in terms of gender?				
Will the monitoring and evaluation of the project/subproject cover gender issues and monitor behavioral changes towards gender equality?				
Will any project/subproject activity demand women's time without reducing the time required for their household responsibilities?				
Will there be any impact on women that may hinder their mobility and safekeeping?				If negative, exclude from financing.

Will there be impacts on women's opportunities to earn cash income?				If negative, exclude from financing.
Does the project/subproject lessen constraints on women's access to various resources?				If negative, exclude from financing.
Does the project/subproject provide opportunities for women to build their capacities to access information and to make decisions?				
Social Protection				
How many workers (male/female) will be employed under the project/subproject?				
Will the enterprise chosen by the project/subproject hire workers (male/female) from the local community?				
If workers from outside are indispensable, how many will move to live in the community?				
If workers from outside are indispensable, will the community members be involved in deciding: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • where they would live; • where they would be allowed to set their feet; • where they would obtain the resources needed for their everyday life (water, fuel, food); • how they would dispose of their waste; and, • how they communicate with the community members. 				If negative, exclude from financing.
Will the enterprise chosen by the project/subproject ensure that its contractor agrees, monitor, and comply with the national and provincial labor policy and laws?				

Will the enterprise chosen by the project/subproject and its contractor establish a reliable two-way communication channel with the community members?				If negative, exclude from financing.
Does the enterprise chosen by the project/subproject and its contractor have a policy on women's rights and gender equality?				

C. Anticipated Project Impacts on Women and Social Protection

Project Activity and Output	Anticipated Positive Impact	Anticipated Negative Impact
1		If negative, exclude from financing.
2.		If negative, exclude from financing.
3.		If negative, exclude from financing.
4.		If negative, exclude from financing.
5.		If negative, exclude from financing.
6.		If negative, exclude from financing.

D. Decision on Categorization and Required Actions (Please Tick)

After reviewing the answer above, the Project Implementation Unit agrees that the project:

- Should be categorized as a project/subproject with high negative impacts; it should not be financed as is.
- Should be categorized as a project/subproject with moderate negative impacts; a gender analysis, a gender action

plan and a community participation plan is required.

Should be categorized as a project/subproject with little or no negative impact; specific actions that empower women and other vulnerable groups and a community participation plan, are required.

Project Team Comments:

Proposed by Project Implementation Unit:

Reviewed by Project Consultant

Project Director

Social Safeguard Specialist, World Bank

Date:

Date:

Annex E: Indicative Annotated Outline of Indigenous Peoples Plan

1. Preliminaries
 - a. Table of Contents
 - b. List of Acronyms and Abbreviations
 - c. Executive Summary
2. Introduction and Context
 - a. Introduction of the proposed project and/or activities
 - b. Rationale for IPP
3. Legal and Institutional Framework

Which national and provincial laws are applicable in regard to the Indigenous Peoples under consideration?
4. Baseline Socioeconomic Information

Socioeconomic information about the Indigenous Peoples collected through primary and secondary resources

 - a. Socio-cultural setup
 - b. Economic infrastructure (resources) and activities
 - c. Summary of the Social Assessment
5. Free, Prior and Informed Consent
 - a. Summary of the process to obtain free, prior and informed consent with indigenous community during project preparation
 - b. Framework for ensuring free, prior and informed consultation with affected Indigenous community during project implementation
6. Action Plan
 - a. Measures to ensure that IP community receives culturally appropriate socioeconomic benefits from project
 - b. Measures to avoid, minimize, mitigate, or compensate for any adverse effects arising from the project
7. Financing Indigenous Peoples Plan

Cost Estimates and Financing Plan for the IP
8. Grievance Redressal

Procedures to address grievances by the affected indigenous community arising from the project implementation

9. Monitoring, Evaluating and Reporting

Mechanisms and benchmarks for monitoring, evaluating and reporting on the implementation of the Indigenous Peoples Plan

10. Annexes

- a. List of proposed activities in the indigenous communities
- b. List of participants to the consultations
- c. Any other information deemed necessary to be included in the Plan