

Document of  
**The World Bank**  
**FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY**

Report No: ICR00004288

IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION AND RESULTS REPORT

TF - 12500

ON A

GRANT

IN THE AMOUNT OF US\$41.4 MILLION

TO THE

REPUBLIC OF COTE D'IVOIRE

FOR AN

EMERGENCY BASIC EDUCATION SUPPORT PROJECT - GPEF GRANT ( P119328 )

May 30, 2018

Education Global Practice  
Africa Region

## CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(Exchange Rate Effective May 9, 2018)

Currency Unit = CFAF

CFAF 552.27 = US\$1

US\$ 1.0 = 0.701 SDR 1

FISCAL YEAR

July 1 - June 30

Regional Vice President: Makhtar Diop

Country Director: Pierre Frank Laporte

Senior Global Practice Director: Jaime Saavedra Chanduvi

Practice Manager: Meskerem Mulatu

Task Team Leader(s): Patrick Philippe Ramanantoanina

ICR Main Contributor: Richard J. Carroll

## ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

<b>CAFOP</b>	<i>Centre d'Animation et Formation Pédagogique</i> (Teacher Training Center)
<b>CFAF</b>	Central African Franc
<b>CMEF</b>	<i>Club des Mères d'élève fille</i> (Mothers – Student-daughters club)
<b>COGES</b>	<i>Comité de Gestion Scolaire</i> (School-based management committee)
<b>CTMO</b>	<i>Comité Technique de Mise en Oeuvre</i> (Implementation Technical Committee)
<b>DPES</b>	<i>Direction de la Planification, de l'Evaluation et des Statistiques</i> (Directorate of Planning, Evaluation and Statistics)
<b>DREN</b>	<i>Direction Régionale de l'Education Nationale</i> (Regional Education Directorate)
<b>EBESP</b>	Emergency Basic Education Support Project
<b>EMIS</b>	Education Management Information System
<b>ENSETÉ</b>	<i>Enquête nationale sur la situation de l'emploi et du travail des enfants</i>
<b>EPP</b>	Emergency Project Paper
<b>ERR</b>	Economic Rate of Return
<b>ESP</b>	Education Sector Plan
<b>GA</b>	Grant Agreement
<b>GPEF</b>	Global Partnership for Education Fund
<b>IDP</b>	Internally Displaced Person
<b>ISR</b>	Implementation Status and Results Report
<b>M&amp;E</b>	Monitoring and Evaluation
<b>MCC</b>	Millennium Challenge Corporation
<b>MDG</b>	Millennium Development Goal
<b>MEF</b>	<i>Ministère de l'Economie et des Finances</i> (Ministry of Economy and Finance)
<b>MEN</b>	<i>Ministère de l'Education Nationale</i> (Ministry of National Education)
<b>MTEF</b>	Medium-term Expenditure Framework
<b>MTR</b>	Mid-Term Review
<b>NPV</b>	Net Present Value
<b>PASEF</b>	<i>Projet d'Appui au Secteur Educatif et Formation</i>
<b>PCU</b>	Project Coordination Unit
<b>PDO</b>	Project Development Objective
<b>PPU</b>	<i>Programme Présidentiel d'Urgence</i> (Presidential Emergency Program)
<b>PUAEB</b>	<i>Projet d'Urgence d'Appui à l'Education de Base</i> (Emergency Basic Education Support Project - EBESP)
<b>RF</b>	Results Framework
<b>RP</b>	Restructuring Paper

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>DATASHEET .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>I. PROJECT CONTEXT AND DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES.....</b>	<b>5</b>
A. CONTEXT AT APPRAISAL .....	5
B. SIGNIFICANT CHANGES DURING IMPLEMENTATION .....	13
<b>II. OUTCOME .....</b>	<b>15</b>
A. RELEVANCE OF PDOs .....	15
B. ACHIEVEMENT OF PDOs (EFFICACY) .....	16
C. EFFICIENCY .....	23
D. JUSTIFICATION OF OVERALL OUTCOME RATING .....	25
E. OTHER OUTCOMES AND IMPACTS (IF ANY).....	26
<b>III. KEY FACTORS THAT AFFECTED IMPLEMENTATION AND OUTCOME.....</b>	<b>27</b>
A. KEY FACTORS DURING PREPARATION .....	27
B. KEY FACTORS DURING IMPLEMENTATION .....	28
<b>IV. BANK PERFORMANCE, COMPLIANCE ISSUES, AND RISK TO DEVELOPMENT OUTCOME ....</b>	<b>29</b>
A. QUALITY OF MONITORING AND EVALUATION (M&E) .....	29
B. ENVIRONMENTAL, SOCIAL, AND FIDUCIARY COMPLIANCE .....	30
C. BANK PERFORMANCE .....	31
D. RISK TO DEVELOPMENT OUTCOME .....	32
<b>V. LESSONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....</b>	<b>33</b>
<b>ANNEX 1. RESULTS FRAMEWORK AND KEY OUTPUTS.....</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>ANNEX 2. BANK LENDING AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT/SUPERVISION .....</b>	<b>43</b>
<b>ANNEX 3. PROJECT COST BY COMPONENT .....</b>	<b>45</b>
<b>ANNEX 4. EFFICIENCY ANALYSIS.....</b>	<b>46</b>
<b>ANNEX 5. BORROWER, CO-FINANCIER AND OTHER PARTNER/STAKEHOLDER COMMENTS ...</b>	<b>50</b>
<b>ANNEX 6. SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS .....</b>	<b>59</b>
<b>ANNEX 7. RESULTS FRAMEWORK AND OFFICIAL REVISION.....</b>	<b>60</b>
<b>ANNEX 8. L'APPUI A LA SCOLARISATION DES FILLES .....</b>	<b>62</b>

**DATA SHEET****BASIC INFORMATION****Product Information**

Project ID	Project Name
P119328	COTE D'IVOIRE - Emergency Basic Education Support Project - GPEF Grant
Country	Financing Instrument
Cote d'Ivoire	Investment Project Financing
Original EA Category	Revised EA Category

**Organizations**

Borrower	Implementing Agency
Ministry of Finance	Ministry of Education

**Project Development Objective (PDO)****Original PDO**

The objectives of the Project are: (i) restoring and increasing access to basic education; (ii) rehabilitating and improving the conditions for teaching and learning; and (iii) restoring and strengthening institutional capacity to deliver quality basic education.



## FINANCING

	Original Amount (US\$)	Revised Amount (US\$)	Actual Disbursed (US\$)
<b>World Bank Financing</b>			
TF-12500	41,400,000	41,400,000	41,349,656
<b>Total</b>	<b>41,400,000</b>	<b>41,400,000</b>	<b>41,349,656</b>
<b>Non-World Bank Financing</b>			
Borrower	0	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Total Project Cost</b>	<b>41,400,000</b>	<b>41,400,000</b>	<b>41,349,656</b>

## KEY DATES

Approval	Effectiveness	MTR Review	Original Closing	Actual Closing
04-Apr-2012	15-Oct-2012	15-Jul-2014	30-Sep-2015	30-Aug-2017

## RESTRUCTURING AND/OR ADDITIONAL FINANCING

Date(s)	Amount Disbursed (US\$M)	Key Revisions
18-Aug-2015	22.36	Change in Results Framework Change in Components and Cost Change in Loan Closing Date(s) Reallocation between Disbursement Categories
05-Oct-2016	34.25	Change in Loan Closing Date(s)
10-May-2017	39.56	Change in Results Framework Change in Components and Cost Reallocation between Disbursement Categories

## KEY RATINGS

Outcome	Bank Performance	M&E Quality
Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Substantial



## RATINGS OF PROJECT PERFORMANCE IN ISRs

No.	Date ISR Archived	DO Rating	IP Rating	Actual Disbursements (US\$M)
01	29-Dec-2012	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	1.97
02	24-Jun-2013	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	2.40
03	30-Dec-2013	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	3.08
04	28-Jun-2014	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	8.33
05	25-Dec-2014	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	13.34
06	10-Jul-2015	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	20.95
07	08-Feb-2016	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	29.30
08	19-Aug-2016	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	31.98
09	11-Mar-2017	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	39.48
10	30-Aug-2017	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	41.14

## SECTORS AND THEMES

### Sectors

Major Sector/Sector (%)

**Education 100**

Primary Education 80

Secondary Education 10

Other Education 10

### Themes

Major Theme/ Theme (Level 2)/ Theme (Level 3) (%)



<b>Social Development and Protection</b>	<b>10</b>
Fragility, Conflict and Violence	10
Conflict Prevention	5
Post-conflict reconstruction	5
<b>Human Development and Gender</b>	<b>90</b>
Gender	10
Education	70
Access to Education	35
Education Financing	35
Nutrition and Food Security	10
Nutrition	5
Food Security	5

#### ADM STAFF

Role	At Approval	At ICR
Regional Vice President:	Obiageli Katryn Ezekwesili	Makhtar Diop
Country Director:	Madani M. Tall	Pierre Frank Laporte
Senior Global Practice Director:	Ritva S. Reinikka	Jaime Saavedra Chanduvi
Practice Manager:	Peter Nicolas Materu	Meskerem Mulatu
Task Team Leader(s):	Hamoud Abdel Wedoud Kamil	Patrick Philippe Ramanantoanina
ICR Contributing Author:		Richard J. Carroll





## I. PROJECT CONTEXT AND DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES

### A. CONTEXT AT APPRAISAL

#### Context

1. **Côte d'Ivoire is a West African Country, which, at the time of appraisal of the Emergency Basic Education Support Project (EBESP), had an estimated population of 20.9 million in 2011, half of which was younger than 15 years old.** The per capita gross national income was US\$1,130, the gross enrollment rate (GER) was 81.6 percent, and life expectancy at birth was 51 years in 2011 (World Bank).<sup>1</sup> Côte d'Ivoire is the second largest economy in the West African Economic and Monetary Union (WAEMU), accounting for 40 percent of its Gross Domestic Product (GDP). While the average per capita income was among the highest in West Africa, it was unevenly distributed, with a Gini coefficient of 0.5 in 2008. The proportion of the population living below the poverty line had increased dramatically over the previous 25 years from around 14 percent in 1985, to 38 percent in 2002, and to 43 percent in 2008.<sup>2</sup> Poverty had increased most in rural areas and in the North, reaching over 60 percent, and was much lower in the South, around 21 percent.
2. **The country is the largest exporter of cocoa and raw cashew nuts in the world, the largest African exporter of rubber and palm oil, and the third largest exporter of non-oil products in sub-Saharan Africa.** At the time of project appraisal, it had a relatively diversified agricultural economy (contributing to approximately 24 percent of GDP), significant manufacturing (16 percent of GDP) and services sectors (53 percent of GDP) and oil, gas and energy (7 percent of GDP). The Emergency Project Paper (EPP) (April 2, 2012) for the EBESP described short- to medium-term growth prospects as “very good,” provided there were a steady post-conflict recovery.
3. **Côte d'Ivoire underwent a period of severe political crisis beginning in the late 1990s, owing to issues of national identity and exclusion.** In September 2002, a troop mutiny in the northern region escalated into a full-scale rebellion. The Linas-Marcoussis Peace Agreement brokered by the French in January 2003 created the framework for resolution of some key issues. UN peacekeeping forces (ONUCI) and French forces (Licorne) created a buffer zone between the two areas in conflict, i.e. the Center North West and the South. From 2003 to 2007, mediation efforts failed to help the country make sufficient progress toward national elections. A peace agreement was brokered in 2007 with the support of the UN, the Ouagadougou Peace Accord, mapping the way for national elections.
4. **There was further violent conflict following the November 2010 elections, which took a heavy toll on human life with more than 3,000 dead during violent street clashes. Such violence had negative repercussions for the economy, the provision of key social services (including education), and on infrastructure.** There were 2.3 million internally displaced persons (IDPs), more than 10 percent of the population. The damage to the economy was estimated at 40 percent of one-year's GDP. Though there is a lack of hard data, it is estimated that GDP declined by roughly 15 to 20 percent in the first four months alone of 2011 due to the crisis. As a result of the crisis, the education sector also suffered damage from neglect and loss of class time. Further, government

<sup>1</sup> See website: <https://data.worldbank.org/country/cote-divoire>

<sup>2</sup> The poverty rate in 2015 was 46.3 percent - CIA world factbook - <https://www.indexmundi.com/g/g.aspx?c=iv&v=69>



capacity in education sector management at the national, regional and local levels, had been seriously weakened during the crisis.

5. The EBESP of US\$41.4 million (funded by a Global Partnership for Education Fund-GPEF Grant) was prepared and appraised on an emergency basis (under OP/BP 8.00)<sup>3</sup> given the urgent need to restore and improve the provision of basic education services.

### Education Sector Context

6. **Côte d'Ivoire's education system was seriously disadvantaged in the decade leading up to project appraisal, especially in the former conflict zones of the North and North-West.** At the time of appraisal, 84 percent of school-age children in the South had access to primary education, compared to only 35 percent and 41 percent in the North and North West, respectively. Primary completion rates declined overall with only 46 percent of children completing primary school (52 percent of boys and 39 percent of girls). Demand for education had fallen during the crisis as household incomes fell due to disruptions in economic activity. Income declines increased the opportunity costs of education because child labor was needed by the household to help sustain incomes through increased participation in agriculture and commercial activities. The EPP for the EBESP noted that studies on Côte d'Ivoire estimated that a 10 percent fall in household income was associated with a 3.2 percent decrease in school enrolment and a 5.1 percent increase in child labor. This situation was aggravated by the declining *quality of schools* which was a disincentive for parents to enroll and keep their children in school.

7. **Although schools were supposed to reopen in early 2011, new political unrest caused further delays and as a result, 800,000 children missed four to six months of school.** In the West and South, many teachers, students and their families fled to other regions or to neighboring countries due to the deteriorating security situation. Schools were abandoned and many school facilities, equipment and supplies were (partially) destroyed or pilfered (e.g., as a desperate measure, student desks were sometimes used as firewood). Overall, approximately one million children normally enrolled in school in Côte d'Ivoire were out of school at the height of the post-electoral crisis.

8. The resolution of the crisis and the commitment of resources to the education sector through the EBESP were expected to lead to a rapid increase in demand for schooling in all regions, especially with the return of IDPs, as well as refugees who had temporarily fled to neighboring countries. The EBSEP was aligned with the *2012-2014 Plan d'Actions à Moyen Terme (PAMT)* which emphasized three areas for the sector: (i) strengthening access to education; (ii) improving education quality; and (iii) improving institutional capacity and governance, which the EBESP also emphasized.

9. **At the time, investments in new primary school classrooms and maintenance were needed, especially in the most seriously affected areas.** Complicating this challenge was that the capacity to construct, repair and maintain schools also had eroded during the crisis. The option of using communities to compensate for this erosion in the construction industry was limited due to dislocation of some communities in an insecure

---

<sup>3</sup> OP/BP 8.00 "Post Conflict and Emergency Operations" (February 27, 2007): The policy sets out a framework for a more rapid and effective response to crises and emergencies that is better aligned with borrower needs and the Bank's experience and current engagement. It supports the Bank's complementary role to other partners, including the United Nations (UN) and regional organizations, and includes provisions to facilitate the Bank's participation in and/or support to integrated international response to crises and emergencies.



environment. As a result, school places were becoming increasingly limited, not only because of a lack of investment in new schools, but also because the utility of existing classrooms was reduced as they fell into disrepair. These demand and supply side factors help explain the high drop-out rates and the increasing number of illiterate young children. However, during the three years leading up to appraisal, communities had constructed 3,800 classrooms using a community-based approach.<sup>4</sup> In contrast, the government had not built any schools, thus forcing communities to mobilize their own resources to meet education infrastructure and teacher needs. Moreover, the government did not have accurate statistics on the number of classrooms that could be or needed to be rehabilitated.

10. **These deficiencies in access to schools affected girls in rural communities more than those in urban areas.** Girls' participation was more affected because the opportunity cost of girls' labor in the home was higher than for boys. Historically, girls in rural areas were more likely to be employed in household work, farming and commerce than boys. In addition, there was a disincentive for girls to travel to schools far from home as it was unsafe to travel long distances in an insecure environment. These factors are in addition to other institutional and cultural barriers to girls' participation in the system.

#### **Rationale for Bank Involvement**

11. **The Bank and the GPE rationale for assistance was predicated, in part, on the fact that not enough donors were active in supporting basic education.** The Bank had been supporting various pieces of analytical work on the sector and promoting initiatives to monitor the evolution of the education system, especially learning assessment. To complement this, the GPEF had helped prepare sector plans and promote increased collaboration among partners to increase efficiency in the use of sector resources. The Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) also acted as a stimulus for the government to pursue universal completion of primary education more aggressively. The Bank concentrated its support in the southern, central and eastern parts of the country, while the French government concentrated its efforts in the northern region.

12. **The main challenges that the EBESP intended to help the Government address were also areas of Bank comparative advantage and included:**

- Shortage of classrooms in basic education due to neglect in maintenance and new construction, along with a diminished capacity in the construction sector;
- Low teacher quality, partly because of an erosion of the pre-service teacher training capacity;
- Weak system of teacher supervision, support and accountability as well as infrequent standardized student learning assessments also denied the system the possibility to properly monitor the pedagogical processes to identify and adequately address student learning weaknesses at the school, regional and national levels;
- Severe shortage of textbooks and teaching materials during the crisis period;
- Deterioration of the nutritional and health status of students;
- Substantial inefficiencies and administrative and pedagogical management weaknesses in the education system; and

---

<sup>4</sup> To give an idea of the significance compared to the country as a whole, the MEN School Statistics publication 2016/17 reported there were a total 16,324 primary schools (13,195 public, 2,128 private and 1,001 communal) and 90,970 primary classrooms. Total primary enrollment increased from 2.9 million in 2012/13 to 3.8 million in 2016/17, an increase of 31 percent.



- A collapse of essential administrative functions and pedagogical support, monitoring and management.

13. **The project, with Bank/GPE support, would help address a funding gap and would promote attainment of MDGs.** The estimates of the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) for the 2011-2014 period and the Government's Medium-Term Action Plan (2012-2014) revealed a significant funding gap for basic education, even after factoring in considerable government support. In order to capitalize on Côte d'Ivoire's commitment to invest in education and implement the Action Plan, GPEF financial resources would help support the most urgent and critical interventions and ensure the strategic and efficient use of scarce financial resources. In particular, the EBESP would directly support the following Medium-Term Action Plan (2012-2014) activities: (i) increasing access to primary education; (ii) improving the learning environment; (iii) improving pre-service teacher training; (iv) providing adequate in-service teacher training; (v) systematically evaluating student learning achievements at the primary level; and (vi) acquisition of student textbooks and teachers' guides. The project also aimed at the attainment of two MDGs: Goal 2: "Achieving universal primary education"; and Goal 3: "Promoting gender equality and empowering women". The project contributed to the Country Partnership Strategy (CPS, 2010-2013), in particular, to the objectives of Pillars One ("Strengthening Governance and Institutions") and Four ("Infrastructure Renewal and Basic Services").

#### Theory of Change (Results Chain)

14. **The set of activities and interventions to be supported under the Project aimed to: (i) restore and increase access to basic education; (ii) rehabilitate and improve the conditions for teaching and learning; and (iii) restore and strengthen institutional capacity to deliver quality basic education.** These changes incorporated a number of key reforms for the education sector, such as teacher training reform, the establishment of small *collèges (collèges de proximité)*, use of the community-based approach for construction, and the sub-cycle approach to grade promotion.<sup>5</sup> The project reforms were also concerned with reducing the repetition rate which was above 15 percent. The regular learning assessment and the set-up of the directorate in charge of learning assessment were also key measures in the theory of change. A number of other measures of change included: a shift in the reading method (to a syllabic one) following the reading assessment; a study on early pregnancy which was taken into account in the demographic dividend strategy; and an audit of the curriculum which led to the reform of the curriculum and the implementation of a curriculum policy framework. This was a challenging program particularly given that it was launched only a few months after the crisis had ended.

15. **The Project-financed classroom construction was expected to provide classrooms to accommodate the expected increase in demand for primary education mainly in the central, central-western and south-eastern areas of the country.** The project aimed at rehabilitating classrooms as well as undertaking new classroom construction. With the increase in demand there would also be a need for more teachers. The project, therefore, supported an increased supply of teachers, not only for the new classrooms, but for other classrooms as well. In addition, it was important that uncertified teachers receive additional training to improve quality of instruction.

---

<sup>5</sup> Primary education in Cote d'Ivoire is divided into three sub-cycles: 1st and 2nd grades (« Cours Préparatoires 1ère année » and « Cours Préparatoires 2ème année » - CP1 and CP2); 3rd and 4th grades (« Cours Élémentaires 1ère année » and « Cours Élémentaires 1ère année » - CE1 and CE2); 5th and 6th grades (« Cours Moyens 1ère année » and « Cours Moyens 2ère année » - CM1 and CM2). With sub-cycles, there is not a high stakes assessment between grades in a sub-cycle, so that students can continue to upper grade and catch up without repeating the grade if they are lagging behind.



The project also supported institutional strengthening which was critical in a post crisis environment. It was necessary to restore and improve the capacity of the Ministry of National Education (*Ministère de l'Éducation Nationale*) to generate data and to be able to design and implement policies based on reliable data. This trio of interventions was designed to improve the environment for teaching and learning as well as to strengthen the institutional environment for delivery of basic education services.

**Table 1: Theory of Change for Access to Basic Education, Teaching and Learning and Educational Policies**

Inputs	Outputs	Intermediate Outcomes	Long-Term Outcomes
Providing resources and training to communities to build and rehabilitate primary and lower secondary schools, mainly through a community-based approach.	Completed classrooms for primary and lower secondary schools	Children attending schools built by the project and teachers graduating from - Teacher Training Centers (CAFOPs) <sup>6</sup> that received support from the project.	Children better able to make life choices, better able to matriculate to higher levels of education. Teachers delivering higher quality instruction, institutions supporting teachers and students more effectively.
Fund education campaigns in areas of low female enrolment.  Incentives for high test performance by females	Completed education campaigns in 67 low-female enrolment areas  Textbooks and laptops provided to females with highest test scores	Communities placing higher value on education for girls and maintaining and increasing female enrolment.	
Providing funding for CAFOP (teacher training centers) both for new construction and rehabilitation.	Construct and operationalize teaching training centers	Greater supply of certified teachers, thus reducing the teacher deficit. These would help limit an increase in the Student: Teacher ratio of 43:1 expected from universal education policy.	

<sup>6</sup> CAFOP stands for *Centre d'Animation et Formation Pédagogique*.



Funding for PIU, trainers, consultants, equipment and Bank staff supervision to improve education institutional capacity at all levels.	Central-PIU head leads ESP, train DPES <sup>7</sup> staff, assistance for legislation to establish roles at all levels of govt.  Regional-Shift decision power to DREN, training of regional staff including DRENS  School level-clarify Comité de Gestion Scolaire (COGES) roles, sensitize and provide training to carry out new roles.	More timely publishing of education statistics to help improve policy. Improve DRENs' <sup>8</sup> efficiency in decision making, collaboration with school officials, and better ability to carry out new roles. COGES better able to carry out responsibilities such as financial and school resource management.	
---	---	---	--

### Project Development Objectives (PDOs)

16. The objectives of the project were to assist in: (i) restoring and increasing access to basic education; (ii) rehabilitating and improving the conditions for teaching and learning; and (iii) restoring and strengthening institutional capacity to deliver quality basic education.<sup>9</sup>

### Key Expected Outcomes and Outcome Indicators

17. **Restoring and increasing access to basic education.** As a result of an increase in the supply of classrooms constructed by the project, it was expected that a greater number of students would have access to basic primary and lower secondary education. The project's support to increasing the supply of qualified teachers<sup>10</sup> also aimed to contribute to access by ensuring students will have instruction in the classroom. This outcome was measured in the project results framework (RF) by the numbers of direct project beneficiaries reaching the targeted number of students enrolled in primary and secondary schools built/rehabilitated by the project, with girls accounting for at least 45 percent of total enrollment.

18. **Rehabilitating and improving conditions for teaching and learning.** Achieving improved conditions for teaching and learning would be supported by: i) rehabilitation of classrooms; ii) the increased supply of qualified

<sup>7</sup> DPES is the *Direction de la Planification, de l'Evaluation et des Statistiques* (Directorate for Planning, Evaluation and Statistics).

<sup>8</sup> DREN is the *Direction Regionale de l'Education Nationale* (Regional Education Directorate).

<sup>9</sup> The PDO in the Grant Agreement and the Emergency Project Paper are identical.

<sup>10</sup> A qualified teacher means a teacher who graduates from pre-service teacher training delivered by the CAFOP. During the crisis communities recruited untrained teachers to respond to the demand.



teachers; and iii) support for a school health and nutrition program. The project RF included an intermediate results indicator that indirectly measured learning conditions: the student-teacher ratio is maintained at 43:1.

19. **Institutional capacity strengthening.** The project aimed to achieve this objective through capacity-building activities and support to new policies. The project RF measured this outcome through two indicators: the implementation of a system for learning assessment at the primary level (scale of 3)<sup>11</sup>, and reliable annual data on the education sector produced on time. Intermediate results indicators measure the number of Regional Education Directorate (Direction Regionale de l'Education Nationale – DRENs) and other regional staff trained on what the project was expected to deliver and how, including the community approach, increase in certified teachers, and data requirements, all of which indicate institutional strengthening.

## Components

**Component 1: Restoring and increasing access to basic education services (US\$20 million; US\$19.25 million; Actual: 96.25 percent)**

20. **The project promoted access to basic education by expanding the number of classrooms at primary and lower secondary (*collège*) levels through construction and rehabilitation.** This included: (i) construction and equipment of 1,000 new classrooms, using community-based approaches, or private contractors; (ii) rehabilitation and replacement of (originally estimated) 500 existing classrooms as well as installation of latrines and water points; (iii) provision of desks in existing schools; (iv) introduction of incentive schemes to promote girls' education, including awards for girls<sup>12</sup> who have scored highest on exams and special ceremonies for graduating girls, similar to successful programs run in Mauritania<sup>13</sup> and information and sensitization campaigns (see Annex 8); and (v) restoration of administrative services.

**Component 2: Rehabilitating and Improving the Quality of Teaching and Learning (US\$12 million; US\$13.17 million; Actual: 109.75 percent)**

21. **This component addressed the issue of poor teaching quality in large part because the pre-service teacher training was weak and lacked clear standards.** The initial comprehensive audit of the teacher training system revealed a number of weaknesses in the system: i) lack of standards for teacher skills; ii) disparities between the curriculum and what was actually taught in the schools; iii) weak selection criteria for student teachers; iv) teacher trainers who did not master professional skills; and v) mentors who were not sufficiently trained to supervise in-class training. In light of these needs, the project aimed to increase quality and capacity of

<sup>11</sup> This indicator is measured on a scale of 0-4 based on the following criteria:

### STAGE 1

Official purpose of the assessment is to measure overall student progress toward agreed system learning goals YES or NO  
Assessment is given to a representative sample or census of the target grades or age levels YES or NO

Score of 0 if NO on either one of the two Stage 1 criteria

### STAGE 2

Data are analyzed and results are reported to education policymakers and/or the public YES or NO

Results are reported for at least one of the following student subgroups: gender, urban/rural, geographic region YES or NO

The assessment exercise is repeated at least once every 5 years for the same subject area(s) and grade(s) YES or NO

Score of 2 if YES, on any one of the three criteria, 3 if YES on any two of the three criteria, 4 if all criteria are met.

<sup>12</sup> The awards were textbooks for primary and lower secondary female students and laptops for upper secondary females.

<sup>13</sup> Implementation Completion and Results Report for the "Education Sector Development Program," The World Bank, Report No: ICR00001567, April 15, 2011. Awards also include certificates of achievement from the minister and international organizations.





teachers by, among other things, financing the construction of two new teacher training centers (Centres d'Animation et de Formation Pédagogique - CAFOP) and rehabilitating and equipping seven existing CAFOPs. The government selected about 24,000 new student teachers to benefit from the CAFOPs. Component 2 also included a program of *in-service* teacher training designed to upgrade teaching skills of teachers already in the education system and a program of training for the improvement of the assessment system for student learning. There would also be support to the system for learning assessment to improve its ability to properly measure student learning outcomes and achievements to guide efforts to improve quality and relevance. The project also supported the training of headmasters and inspectors to improve school-level pedagogic support.

**22. Component 2 also aimed to improve the availability of pedagogical inputs in primary and lower secondary education.** The target of providing one million textbooks was exceeded. The textbooks covered math and reading at each of the six primary levels. This covered 24 percent of the nation's primary schools. The component intended to promote school health and nutrition through a school-based program of feeding and health services. School feeding was later dropped from the project, though the health component (vaccinations, limited health services and hand washing campaign) remained.

**Component 3: Restoring and strengthening institutional capacity to deliver quality basic education (US\$9.4 million; US\$8.98 million; Actual: 95.53 percent)**

**23. The main activities were to rebuild a solid basic education sub-sector through:** (i) the collection and analysis of data to produce a reliable Annual School Statistics Report at the end of the 2011/2012 school year; and (ii) the development of the training program for inspectors to be trained under Component 2. In addition, Component 3 supported: (i) reinforcing the capacity of key central-level departments involved in the planning and monitoring of the ESP, and clarifying roles and responsibilities at national, central and school levels; (ii) re-establishing capacity at the regional level to manage responsibilities devolved to the regions, through clarification of the respective mandates of central and regional levels; and (iii) at the local level, clarifying and strengthening the roles and responsibilities of school-based management committees (*Comités de Gestion Scolaire – COGES*) in close collaboration with regional directorates and local public administration officials.





## B. SIGNIFICANT CHANGES DURING IMPLEMENTATION

### Revised PDOs and Outcome Targets

24. The PDO was not revised, but there were three level 2 restructurings which included a number of revisions to the outcome targets, which are detailed in Annex 7. The three restructurings are described in Table 2.

**Table 2: Summary of EBESP Restructurings**

<b>Restructuring 1. (August 2015) - 54 percent disbursed</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The closing date was extended by 12 months (from September 30, 2015 to September 30, 2016).</li> <li>• US\$3 million in grant proceeds were reallocated from components 2 and 3 to component 1 (The reallocation was possible because of (i) efficiency gains realized in the procurement of textbooks under component 2, and (ii) availability of funds (due to exchange rate gains and the cancellation of the EMIS activity) re-directed towards construction costs for classrooms.</li> <li>• The PDO-level indicator target for the “number of classrooms rehabilitated at primary level” was revised downwards from 500 to 267 to reflect realities on the ground (some schools for “rehabilitation” were temporary structures).</li> </ul>
<b>Restructuring 2 (October 2016) - 83 percent disbursed</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The closing date was extended by 11 months (from September 2016 to August 2017).</li> <li>• Two subcomponents (school feeding program and EMIS platform), were proposed to be revised though these revisions were not enacted until the third restructuring.</li> <li>• Because GPE Board Approval was given in October 2016, this was an Interim Restructuring. Changes to the RF were mentioned but not proposed since they were dependent on GPE approval. They were approved by GPE in late October and proposed in a third restructuring. (see Annex 7).</li> </ul>
<b>Restructuring 3 (May 2017) - 96 percent disbursed</b>
<p><b>Changes to the RF:</b></p> <p><b>PDO-level indicators:</b></p> <p>(i) Downward revision of the targets for “Total number of direct beneficiaries” and for “Students enrolled in primary schools built by the project” both to account for changes in number of classrooms rehabilitated.</p> <p><b>Intermediate results indicators:</b></p> <p>(ii) Removal of “Number of children receiving food supplies as a result of project intervention”; and “EMIS system in place and functioning”;</p> <p>(iii) Upward revision of the targets for the indicators: “Number of heads of DREN, school directors, inspectors”; and “Number of teachers trained in-service”; and</p> <p>(iv) Downward revision of target for indicator “Student teacher ratio” to account for actual enrollment growth.</p>



25. **The main changes to the indicator targets under the first restructuring included: a reduction in the number of rehabilitated classrooms (Restructuring 1-RP 1-August 5, 2015) and related number of beneficiaries as well as change student-teacher ratio target.** The number of classrooms that could be rehabilitated was overestimated by the MEN during appraisal owing to the extremely weak education database in the post-crisis environment. Given that the Project was prepared on an emergency basis, a thorough assessment could not be undertaken. However, a more thorough examination by engineers undertaken later in the project life found that many of the classrooms were in such a state of disrepair that they could not be rehabilitated. Thus, on the basis of this assessment the estimated number of classrooms to be rehabilitated was revised. The target number was reduced from 500 to 267. (The commensurate reduction in the number of students enrolled in classrooms—beneficiaries—built/rehabilitated by the Project was not made until the second restructuring—October 2016). In addition, because of the lower number of classrooms, and savings resulting from the efficient procurement of textbooks, US\$3 million of funds were reallocated to components 1 and 2. The target change during the second restructuring (October 17, 2016) was increasing the student-teacher ratio from its initial target of 40:1 to 43:1. This change (i.e., maintaining the existing ratio) was justified by the institution of the new national policy for a free and compulsory basic education (primary and lower secondary) which increased the demand for student places.<sup>14</sup>

#### Revised PDO Indicators

26. Annex 7 provides a comprehensive review of the modifications to the RF throughout the Project life. The changes to the RF aimed to ensure that the project could continue to systematically track and measure the outputs and outcomes achieved during project implementation.

#### Revised Components

27. **The school feeding program under the Project was dropped as was the Project's support to establishing a comprehensive education management information system (EMIS) was scaled back.** The Bank worked closely with the Government to design and undertake this activity to increase health and nutritional well-being among targeted students and to incentive increased enrollment. Given the decentralized nature of this activity, and that the Government had not yet developed an official school feeding policy, the Bank insisted that a policy to include a systematic tracking system be established by the Government to monitor this activity and that household contributions to the activity would be eliminated (and these provisions figured in the Grant Agreement). As this policy did not materialize, the Bank redirected resources for this activity to interventions which would ensure the judicious use of resources and contribute to the further achievement of the PDO (US\$3.745 million was reallocated from category 1 to categories 2 and 3 (RP 2) – supporting construction and other aspects of the *collèges de proximité*, in particular, the provision of potable water and sanitation. Further, in line with the original aim of the sub-component, limited health services, vaccinations and a handwashing campaign at the school level were supported (some of which were implemented with UNICEF in response to the Ebola Virus Disease crisis). The establishment of an EMIS was no longer feasible within the project timeframe due to accumulated delays in implementation, the complexity and the time required of unifying several platforms in a post-crisis context, and

---

<sup>14</sup> In 2011, the Government announced a free basic education policy and after the crisis the government integrated community schools into its education system, which put upward pressure on the student teacher ratio. In 2016, the Government announced a mandatory basic education policy. The increase in the number of students resulted in a higher student teacher ratio.



the decision by the Islamic Development Bank to finance this activity moving forward. Despite this adjustment to the design, the Project supported improvements in the collection, analysis and dissemination of education system data (see Section II for additional details).

28. **The third restructuring of the project reallocated the Grant proceeds between disbursement categories and changed the cost of components.** The RP reports that with the updating of the project accounting system, following the second restructuring and the hiring of a new financial management (FM) specialist in the PIU, it was discovered that component 1 was overfunded, while components 2 and 3 required additional funds to pay for activities that were validated as part of the extension (a reverse shift of the reallocation under RP 2). Additional component 2 costs included the procurement of 1,550 pedagogic tablets, 36,000 wall boards, in-service training activities and other smaller items. Component 3 required funding for training 1,500 teachers and 500 headmasters and project management for the 11 months of extension. The funds from component 1 were available because of the reduction in the number of rehabilitated classrooms (267 instead of 500) and more importantly because of gains linked to the increased value of the US dollar during the implementation of the project.

### Other Changes

N.A.

### Rationale for Changes and Their Implication on the Original Theory of Change

29. **Despite changes in some activities during the course of the project, the project's theory of change was preserved.** Building and rehabilitating classrooms contributed to increases in access to education. Although the number of rehabilitated classrooms was reduced, the government's program compensated for this reduction by rehabilitating 233 classrooms. Training of teachers, both in-service and pre-service, exceeded targets and helped to improve teaching and learning conditions. The dropping of the nutrition activity was mitigated by providing health services. The potential negative effect on school attendance was not measured, but the project did meet its revised enrollment targets.

## II. OUTCOME

### A. RELEVANCE OF PDOs

Rating: High

#### Assessment of Relevance of PDOs and Rating

30. **The PDOs have been and continue to be highly relevant:** i) Increasing access to education; ii) improving the conditions for teaching and learning; and iii) restoring and strengthening institutional capacity. The PDO was consistent with the recommendations of the 2011 World Development Report *"Conflict, Security and Development"*, which emphasized the key roles that re-establishing social services for communities and addressing social exclusion can play in restoring cohesion in post-conflict situations. This included financing of institutional and technical activities to help restore government capacity in education sector management at the national, regional and local levels, which had been seriously weakened during the crisis.



31. **The EBESP also mirrored the national education strategy as expressed in the Government's Medium-Term Action Plan (2012-2014).** This Action Plan had identified the following three priorities: (i) strengthening access to education; (ii) improving education quality; and (iii) improving institutional capacity and governance. In addition to supporting the objectives of the Action Plan, the EBESP's objectives were also strongly aligned with the President's Emergency Recovery Plan (Plan Présidentiel d'Urgence). The PDOs were consistent with the CPS (2010-2013) which emphasized the importance of "continued progress in crisis recovery and improved prospects for sustained peace", as well as "improved basic social service delivery". While the PDO-level indicator targets were ambitious for a three-year timeframe, it is important to note that a three-year implementation period was required by the GPE.<sup>15</sup> Moreover, as noted previously, this operation was prepared and appraised on an emergency basis with limited access to reliable figures – especially with regards to the number of classrooms that needed rehabilitation or replacement. However, the extension of the project's closing date ultimately allowed the project to either achieve or exceed the vast majority of indicator targets (refer to last two columns in Table 3).

32. **The PDOs are also relevant to the current Country Partnership Framework for FY2016-19 (August 17, 2015) –aligned with Focus Area 2 Building Human Capital for Economic Development and Social Cohesion.** Under this focus area, the CPF has three objectives one of which is to improve education service delivery and youth employability (Objective 5). Education and market-responsive skills are critical for the economic transformation sought by the Government, for which a sounder basic education system is a pre-requisite. The CPF also states that integration of youth into the labor market will be pursued through targeted support to educational services at primary, secondary and higher levels.

33. Despite a shift in the context and recent gains in the sector, the current relevance of the PDO remains high. Consistent with the PDO of the EBESP, the recently submitted Education Service Delivery Enhancement Project (P163218) seeks to improve learning outcomes and supports some of the same activities (e.g., teacher training, capacity-building, school health, etc.) Moreover, the PDO remains consistent with one of the key sought outcomes of the current Education Sector Plan (ESP) (2016-2025) which is for children (ages 6 to 11 years) to have access to and to complete primary education. In light of the above, the relevance of the objectives is rated high.

## B. ACHIEVEMENT OF PDOs (EFFICACY)

34. **The PDO consisted of three sub-objectives:** (i) restoring and increasing access to basic education; (ii) rehabilitating and improving the conditions for teaching and learning; and (iii) restoring and strengthening institutional capacity to deliver quality basic education. Each of these sub-objectives is assessed separately and according to the established time intervals (see below).

35. **The ICR splits the rating at two points, the first and second restructurings (with the analysis focusing therefore on three intervals of time) and weights the final outcome rating on a 6-point scale.** With the first restructuring and the reduction in the targeted number of rehabilitated classrooms (and by extension, the targeted students enrolled in project built/rehabilitated classrooms) on August 5, 2015, US\$22.36 million (54

---

<sup>15</sup> This policy has been modified in recent years, allowing for a longer implementation timeframe – especially in post-conflict and/or fragile contexts.



percent of project funds) had been disbursed. Between the first and the second restructuring, approximately US\$11.9 million of the grant was disbursed (the next 29 percent). After the second restructuring, US\$7.2 million (17 percent) of the total amount was disbursed. In addition to looking at the project's performance in this more compartmentalized fashion, the ICR also provides a global assessment of achievement on each of the sub-objectives as these remained unchanged throughout the life of the project.

### Assessment of Achievement of Each Objective/Outcome

36. The three intervals for the split efficacy ratings are described below. The rating for each interval is provided in the heading for each sub-objective:

1. *Pre-Restructuring 1: Effectiveness to Restructuring 1*—October 15, 2012-August 2015 (54 percent disbursed)
2. *Restructuring 1 to Restructuring 2*—August 2015-October 17, 2016 (additional 29 percent disbursed)
3. *Restructuring 2 to Project Close*—October 17, 2016-August 31, 2017 (final 17 percent disbursed)

37. The sub-ratings are based on progress in meeting key indicators relative to the plan at appraisal. The overall efficacy rating and justification is provided for each sub-objective. Table 3 provides the planned and actual achievement of results indicator targets at each of the three restructuring. The numbers in bold are actual achievements reported at the time of the restructuring.

**Table 3: Planned and Actual Achievement of PDO-level and Intermediate Results Indicator Targets for Restructurings 1, 2 and 3**

Indicator	Rest. 1-Aug. 2015- Project Year 3		Rest. 2-Oct. 2016- Project Year 4 (ext.)		Rest. 3-Aug. 2017- Project Year 5 (ext.)	
	Planned	Actual	Planned	Actual	Planned	Actual
<b>PDO-level</b>						
No. Additional qualified primary teachers	7,500	<b>15,253</b>	7,500	<b>15,253</b>	15,200	<b>24,000</b>
No. additional primary classrooms-total	1,500	<b>470</b>		<b>1,212</b>	1,267	<b>1,272</b>
Built	1,000	<b>303</b>	1,000	<b>996</b>	1,000	<b>1,002</b>
Rehabilitated	500	<b>167</b>	267	<b>216</b>	267	<b>270</b>
Direct project beneficiaries:	62,400	<b>18,800</b>	62,400	<b>41,000</b>	53,080	<b>53,280</b>
Students enrolled in primary schools built by EBESP	60,000	<b>18,800</b>	60,000	<b>38,760</b>	50,680	<b>50,880</b>
Students enrolled in "collèges de proximité" built by the project	2,400	<b>0</b>	2,400	<b>2,240</b>	2,400	<b>2,400</b>
% Female	45%	<b>46.6%</b>	45%	<b>47%</b>	45%	<b>47%</b>
System for learning assessment at the primary level	3	<b>1</b>	3	<b>3</b>	3	<b>3</b>
Timely annual production of reliable school statistics	Yes	<b>Yes</b>	Yes	<b>Yes</b>	Yes	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Intermediate Results</b>						
Number of girls receiving incentives	450	<b>300</b>	450	<b>463</b>	450	<b>463</b>
Teachers trained in service	15,000	<b>887</b>	15,000	<b>15,020</b>	16,500	<b>16,797</b>
No. of textbooks purchased and distributed	1 million	<b>1 million</b>	1 million	<b>1,000,267</b>	1 million	<b>1,000,267</b>
Student-teacher ratio	40:1	<b>43:1</b>	40:1	<b>43:1</b>	43:1	<b>43:1</b>



Number of children receiving food supplies as result of intervention	60,000	0	60,000	0	Dropped	Dropped
EMIS System in place and functioning	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Dropped
Number of heads of DREN, school directors, inspectors and pedagogical advisors trained	3,000	556	3,000	8,000	8,500	8,670
Number of COGES trained	3,000	4,790	3,000	4,790	3,000	4,790

Note that project years 4 and 5 are in the extensions of closing date periods as the original project was originally for 3 years. Project year 3 shows the original PDO targets from the results framework in the EPP.

**Sub-objective 1: Restoring and increasing access to basic education: 1. Modest; 2. Substantial; 3. Substantial—Overall: Substantial**

38. **The EBESP helped restore and increase access to basic education through the building and rehabilitation of mainly primary schools but also secondary school classrooms and by increasing the supply and qualification of teachers.** It also promoted girls' education through additional incentives for girls' performance in schools. With these interventions, students who would not otherwise have had access were able to be enrolled in school.

39. **Pre-restructuring 1: Implementation progress was modest leading up to the first restructuring (August 2015).** The progress in classroom construction reached about one-third of rehabilitated and new classrooms of the original target of 1,500 (which was to be reached by project year 3). The construction of lower secondary schools in rural areas had commenced in October 2014, but it was behind schedule. Only 19 percent of the construction of the new CAFOPs (which also contributed to sub-objective 2) had been completed and three of the eight centers had been rehabilitated. Support to school feeding was delayed. Based on the information provided above, the level of attainment of this sub-objective during this period is rated modest.

40. **Restructuring 1-2:** The pace of project implementation significantly improved with 969 of the, ultimately 1,002 classrooms built by the second restructuring, more than triple the amount completed since the first restructuring (only 14 months earlier). All of the "*collèges de proximité*" were completed by the second restructuring and enrollment had reached 2,240 students (more than 90 percent of the project's final target).<sup>16</sup>

41. **Restructuring 2 - Project close:** The number of classrooms built or rehabilitated was 1,002 (against a target of 1,000). All other targets were met/exceeded for this sub-objective including enrollment of students in "*collèges de proximité*" (2,400); total beneficiaries (revised target for students enrolled was 53,080 with the actual number of students enrolled of 53,280) and the percentage of females enrolled (47 percent), for a substantial rating.

42. **Overall: The project met several of the relevant targets of indicators for classroom construction and teacher training that are evidence of achievement of this PDO sub-objective.** First the target of building 1,000 additional classrooms was met (1,002 actual), and the revised target for rehabilitating classrooms was also met (267 target vs. 270 actual). The reduction in the target from 500 to 267 was compensated for by the Presidential emergency program which funded the construction of 233 new classrooms (the amount of the shortfall). The completion of these activities allowed the project to exceed/meet the revised targets for direct beneficiaries (i) in primary schools (50,680 target vs. 50,880 actual) and (ii) secondary schools (2,400 target and actual). Thus, restored and increased access to basic education was achieved because of the additional capacity for students





at the primary and secondary levels. With the reduction in the outcome target in the case of classroom rehabilitation, there is a basis for a split rating of project outcome at this point even though this initial overestimate was affected by the emergency circumstances under which the project was prepared and the fact that accurate rehabilitation estimates often require a more thorough examination of the condition of classrooms than was feasible at preparation (even under more favorable conditions).

43. **The increase in the supply of teachers (discussed below) also contributed to increased access by ensuring that the new classrooms would have teachers (and with improved qualifications).** The intermediate results indicator for access was the number of girls receiving incentives (i.e., awards, textbooks, laptops) and the target of 450 girls receiving awards was exceeded (463 actual). See Annex 8 for more details. In addition, the target for the indicator on proportion of beneficiaries who were female was also exceeded (45 percent target vs. 47.5 percent actual). See section on Gender for additional details.

**Sub-objective 2: Rehabilitating and improving the conditions for teaching and learning-1. Modest; 2. Substantial; 3. Substantial—Overall: Substantial.**

44. **The project helped improve the conditions for teaching and learning, not only by constructing new classrooms, but also by providing support for training teachers.** By setting up CAFOPs, the supply of trained teachers could be increased. The constraint of time and cost for boarding teachers was avoided because CAFOPs did not require teachers to be housed at the training facility. With improved qualifications and better adherence to the school curriculum, learning conditions could improve.

45. **Pre-restructuring 1:** Indicator progress during this period was better for sub-objective, but was still mixed: (i) the target of 7,500 for the number of additional qualified teachers was exceeded as the actual number was 15,253; (ii) out of 15,000 teachers to receive an in service training, only 887 had been trained (falling short of the target); and (iii) for the rehabilitation of eight pre-existing teacher training centers (CAFOPs) and the construction of two new CAFOPs, about 19 percent of the work had been completed, though there was progress on all eight. Out of the eight pre-existing centers, the refurbishing of three centers was completed, while the rehabilitation of the other five centers was underway. This achievement of this sub-objective during this period is rated modest since although the pre-service teacher training greatly exceeded its target, the in-service teacher training lagged, along with CAFOP renovation.

46. **Restructuring 1-2.** Key PDO-level indicators had improved and most met their targets: (i) the number of additional qualified primary teachers as a result of project interventions had previously met its target, which was revised upward from 7,500 to 15,200; (ii) the number of students enrolled in “*collèges de proximité*” constructed by the project stood at 2,400 (against the target of 2,400); and (iii) 15,020 teachers were trained in service (meeting the original target of 15,000) by the time of the second restructuring supporting a substantial rating for this period.

47. **Restructuring 2- Project close.** The pace of implementation of most activities accelerated and most targets were either met or exceeded. For pre-service training, the original target was 7,500 which was revised upward to

---

<sup>16</sup> Between Restructurings 1 and 2, because of exchange rate changes with the U.S. dollar, the project gained substantial resources of CFAF 4.05 billion (US\$6.9 million equivalent). While this was beneficial to the project, the measured disbursement rate was only 78.14 percent rather than the 92.70 percent without the exchange rate gain.



15,200 teachers. The actual achieved was 24,000 teachers (or 157.9 percent of the revised target). The number of in-service teachers trained increased to 16,797 exceeding the upward-revised target of 16,500 (originally 15,000). These achievements allowed for the student-teacher ratio to remain 43:1 meaning that the increase in teachers had kept up with the increased demand for schooling. With respect to the school feeding program, as explained previously, since a policy was not adopted by the Government (a provision in the Grant Agreement), the school feeding activity was dropped and instead this sub-component supported health related items and activities (micronutrients, deworming, handwashing, etc.) As a result, the ICR lowers the sub-rating from high to substantial for this sub-objective.<sup>17</sup>

48. **Overall: The main PDO-level indicator supporting achievement of this sub-objective was the increase in qualified primary teachers – the target of which was exceeded.** The increase in qualified teachers helped meet the objective of improved learning conditions for students. At the same time, however, there was a large influx of students (due to the policy of universal education), which required revising the targeted student-teacher ratio (intermediate results indicator) from 40:1 to 43:1 a ratio that was almost met (43.6:1). Without the large number of additional teachers, this ratio would have been significantly higher and conditions for learning less favorable. Another important consideration for the overall rating is that the RF likely underestimated the number of beneficiaries because that estimate was only explicitly linked to the number of classrooms (40 students times the 1,267 classrooms or 50,680 beneficiaries). The fact that there was a much larger increase in trained teachers than targeted translates into a higher number of beneficiaries than just those being taught in new and rehabilitated classrooms. Though that number was not estimated, in all likelihood the original target number of beneficiaries, 60,000, was surpassed.

49. **Also contributing to the improved learning environment was the supply of textbooks, updated school curriculum and adherence to that curriculum by better trained teachers.** An important intermediate results indicator was the provision of more than 1 million textbooks (exceeding the target of 1 million), which were distributed to the schools. This contributed to an improved teaching and learning environment, particularly since recently trained teachers were more inclined to actually use the distributed texts.

**Sub-objective 3: Restoring and strengthening institutional capacity to deliver quality basic education-1. Modest; 2. Substantial; 3. Substantial—Overall: Substantial**

50. **The Project made a strong contribution to the improvement of the quality of national education data and its timely availability.** Since 2012 school statistical surveys have been fully supported through the domestic budget and education statistics are regularly produced during the academic year. This is an important achievement as it informs MENETFP's planning related to education service delivery. In addition, data quality (including its completeness) has improved, allowing the production of specific analyses on teacher deployment and sector efficiency. This was made possible by the fact that: (i) the project encouraged the government to include this activity in the Government budget and (ii) the project supported the implementation of the national strategy for the production of key statistics.

---

<sup>17</sup> The PIU could not confirm whether the cancellation of the nutrition activity hurt the learning environment because it could not determine whether nutrition was provided from another source. In addition, while the project measured enrollment, it did not measure attendance. An impact evaluation was not carried out given difficulties in carrying out random sampling during project preparation





51. **Pre-restructuring 1:** In terms of institutional capacity, the pace of attainment of most targets was delayed: (i) The learning assessment system was established but its utility was still rated 1 out of 3; (ii) only 556 heads of DREN, school directors, inspectors and pedagogical advisors had been trained, against the Project target of 3,000 which was to be achieved by project year 3. Thus, the rating for this sub-objective is modest for this time period.
52. **Restructuring 1-2:** By the time of the second restructuring, 93 percent of heads of DREN, school directors, inspectors and pedagogical advisers had been trained, most other project outputs were completed and the majority of outcomes were achieved, and exceeded, in some cases. The number of COGES trained reached 4,790, well in excess of the target of 3,000 meaning that 50 percent more school-based management committees benefited from the EBESP than originally planned. The number of DRENs and regional staff trained increased to 8,000, far in excess of the target of 3,000. The system for learning assessment at the primary level attained the target level of 3 and there was 'Timely annual production of reliable school statistics'. Based on this performance the achievement of this sub-objective during this period was high.
53. **Restructuring 2-Project close:** All project indicators' revised targets were met or exceeded for this sub-objective. The PDO-level indicator to establish a learning assessment system at the primary level (scale of 3) was met. This activity is evidence of a stronger institutional capacity because the MEN has a critical tool to determine where school performance is lagging. A score of 3 means that the assessment's purpose is to measure overall student progress toward agreed goals, and that the assessment uses a representative sample of the target grades or age level. It also means that the data are analyzed and results are reported to policy -makers and/or the public, is carried out at least once every five years and produces results for student sub-groups: gender, urban/rural, and geographic region. Capacity was also promoted through extensive training of heads of DREN, school directors and other staff. The original target was revised upward from 3,000 to 8,500 and was exceeded (with the total number trained reaching 8,670) . The target of number of COGES trained was exceeded target (5,232 actual vs. 3,000 target). While the indicator on the establishment and functioning of EMIS was formally dropped. Although this activity did not materialize, much was achieved in establishing timely production of reliable data. Separate efforts to collect and report education sector data were successful resulting in a number of national publications of education sector data. On balance the achievement of this sub-objective during this period is rated substantial.
54. **Overall: The project supported capacity-building at the school, regional and central levels.** At the local level, as stated, the number of COGES trained was much greater than the end-of-project target. This is expected to have a positive impact on community participation and enhance accountability of teachers, school staff and contractors who built or rehabilitated classrooms. The project also financed the training of 8,170 school heads of administrative and pedagogic management of schools. At the regional level, the project supported the training of 500 staff of inspectorates and regional directorates of education as well as the establishment of regional offices of General Inspectorate of Education, through equipment. At the central level, activities implemented by the project include the training of six groups of staff from General Inspectorate of Education, Department of Finance, Department of Statistics and Planning, Department of Pedagogy and in-service training on various themes, such as M&E, results based management, planning, use of learning assessments, etc. A key output of the project is the automatization of the deliberation of national exams as well as the setting up of a platform to archive, store and secure all national certifications from primary to upper secondary education. The project helped the government undertake a national learning assessment for Grade 1 to Grade 3 in reading and mathematics. Following the assessment, the MEN changed the reading method by the introduction of the syllabic approach. With the project



there was a strong emphasis on capacity building and the government has been able to continue implementing national standardized student learning assessments in primary and secondary education. Remedial actions are also designed and teachers trained but continued improvements are still needed. Cote d'Ivoire has successfully collected, analyzed and published national education data, a vast improvement and significant achievement over the relative absence of data in the post-crisis period, thus meeting the PDO-level indicator target. The statistics have also been widely distributed in the form of pocket sized booklets. Though a comprehensive EMIS was not produced, this is only a moderate shortcoming because it is mitigated by the improvements in education sector data reporting.

55. **There were also positive impacts of the project that were not explicitly measured by the RF.** Reforms supported by EBESP were introduced in the education sector strategy (2016-2025), which will allow for consolidation of project achievements. For example, the new model of lower secondary school in remote rural areas is being implemented by other development partners providing financing to the education sector, such as the Millennium Challenge Corporation (MCC). The reform of initial teacher training led to the development of a new curriculum, as well as changes in the governance of the training centers. Furthermore, with the support of the project, sub-cycles in primary education have been created. With the community-based approach for construction in primary education, local communities were fully involved in the construction and maintenance of the new infrastructure, in particular, with the local water management committees they are highly committed to preserving the new system of potable water, which is benefitting participating schools as well as surrounding villages. There were some temporary labor benefits because under the community approach, local contractors that were hired used local labor.

56. The evidence thus supports an overall substantial rating for this sub-objective.

### Justification of Overall Efficacy Rating

57. **The overall efficacy rating is Substantial.** Following the analysis provided above, Table 4 provides the sub-objective ratings for each interval.

**Table 4: Summary of Overall Efficacy Rating**

Period	Sub-objective		
	Restoring and Increasing Access to Basic Education	Rehabilitating and Improving Teaching/Learning Conditions	Restoring and Strengthening Institutional capacity to Delivery Quality Basic Education
1: Pre-Restructuring	Modest	Modest	Modest
2: Restructuring 1 – 2	Substantial	Substantial	Substantial
3: Restructuring 2 – Project close	Substantial	Substantial	Substantial
<b>Overall</b>	<b>Substantial</b>	<b>Substantial</b>	<b>Substantial</b>

58. Despite the challenges in establishing accurate target values for some of the project indicators and activities initially given that the project was prepared under emergency conditions as well as some challenges with undertaking the school feeding activity and establishing a fully-fledged EMIS, the Project substantially



achieved its stated objectives. What began as an emergency project, evolved into an operation which provided key inputs to provide quality education in Cote d'Ivoire and to strengthen capacity to manage and to deliver effective education services in the medium- to long-term. In addition to providing a number of critical inputs into a damaged system following the crisis, the Project supported several institutional and innovative changes in the education sector (e.g., *collèges de proximité*, strengthening community-based construction, etc.) In addition to ensuring that the education system could accommodate the expected increase in enrollment as a result of government policy, the Project also provided training to a larger number of teachers than initially planned – a critical input to the quality of education provided. The Project was also instrumental in rebuilding the Ministry's capacity to provide such training and strengthened its capacity to carry out regular learning assessments at the primary level. These contributions are likely to continue to be useful in informing decision-making and guiding policies and efforts to further strengthen the quality and delivery of education services.

## C. EFFICIENCY

### Assessment of Efficiency and Rating

59. Efficiency over the life of the Project is rated substantial. There were some initial delays in implementation including those related to the identification of construction sites and to develop local communities' capacity to support this and other activities. This resulted in the need to extend the closing date from the original three-year time frame (which had been mandated by GPE). Despite this, the vast majority of project outputs and outcomes were either achieved or exceeded by the project closing date and approximately 99 percent of the grant was disbursed by the project closing date. Available evidence as presented below points to substantial efficiency gains realized over the life of the Project.

### Economic Analysis

60. **Analysis of the project's quantifiable financial benefits show the returns to education to be high.** The financial benefits estimate takes into account the incremental income that will be earned by children enrolled in project-built classrooms. Income flows are based on wages expected to be earned by the students during their working years, minus the opportunity costs (forgone earnings). The salary corresponds to the average wage of workers with primary and lower secondary education. The assumed lifetime of primary classrooms is 5 years and 10 years for lower secondary classrooms. Lastly, given that the total wage income depends on the unemployment rate, the net present value (NPV) and Internal Rate of Return (IRR) of the project are estimated using the unemployment rates for primary and lower secondary education, estimated using 2013 Enquête Nationale sur la Situation de l'Emploi et du Travail des Enfants (ENSETE) data. In terms of investment, the analysis takes into consideration the whole cost of the project, depreciation and recurrent cost of education in primary and lower secondary education. With these parameters, the NPV is US\$151.8 million. The economic rate of return (ERR) is 27.5 percent. The appraisal did not estimate an ERR for the project.



**Table 5: Parameters and Returns from Economic Analysis**

Variables / Assumptions	Values
Number of direct beneficiaries	278,400
Activity time (years)	20
Average annual salary, primary education (US\$)	1,327
Lifetime of primary education classrooms (year)	5-10 years
Annual unit cost (recurrent) (US\$)	265-556
Annual opportunity cost (US\$)	1,184 – 1,421
Discount rate (percent)	15
Project cost, depreciation and recurrent costs (I, US\$)	87,169,291
NPV (US\$)	151,799,751
Economic rate of return	27.5%

61. **There were also several positive developments that increased implementation efficiency.** The project approach promoted efficiency gains in public expenditures on capital investments. All financial audits were of unqualified opinion providing evidence that resources were used in judicious manner and for intended purposes. When the policy required for the school feeding activity did not materialize (and a robust tracking mechanism was not established), the Bank redirected resources to activities which were strongly tied to the PDO and were value-for-money could be better assured. The introduction of the new model for lower secondary schools, “*collèges de proximité*” in rural areas resulted in lower student unit costs with the introduction of bivalent teachers (teachers trained to teach two subjects). In addition to increasing efficiency, this also increased equity. The government is using this low-cost model for the expansion of the supply of secondary education in rural areas at lower costs using this model -- and parents in rural areas will no longer have to bear any additional costs to enroll their children in distant secondary schools. Support to community-based construction led to important efficiency gains with the unit cost of classroom construction being US\$12,000 – significantly lower than the cost using the traditional approach of approximately US\$26,000. Annex 4 provides additional information on efficiency gains realized under the life of the Project and lists some positive externalities associated with some of the project-supported activities.

62. **Early in the project there were implementation delays in project implementation and slow progress resulting in a modest rate of implementation efficiency during that time.** While 54 percent of the project proceeds were disbursed by the first restructuring, a number of quantitative indicators were below half of their targets. Project outputs lagged behind disbursements in part because advances from the project were made to school management committees upon the signing of financing agreement for school/classrooms construction, while the actual works were delayed. The delays were also because of the prolonged time required to identify



the sites and to develop local communities' capacity. Once going, however, the community approach to classroom construction worked well; it saved money and achieved a high level of satisfaction according to beneficiaries interviewed during the ICR. The CAFOP model also alleviated the constraint in training teachers by offering a model where teacher trainees did not have to be boarded, thus saving budget resources and time of the student teachers.

63. **The overall rating for efficiency is substantial.** Implementation efficiency began as modest but then recovered to a substantial level. It also validated the community approach to school construction and the CAFOP model for teacher training. With the strong economic returns to education, the efficiency demonstrated by the project was substantial.

#### **D. JUSTIFICATION OF OVERALL OUTCOME RATING**

64. **The overall outcome rating is moderately satisfactory.** Based on the project's performance during the pre- and post-restructuring periods, weighted by the portion of the grant disbursed at each interval, the overall outcome score is 3.92 (rounded to 4) or moderately satisfactory (Table 6). This rating is also consistent with the substantial efficiency rating and the high relevance rating. All PDO-level indicator targets were met, five intermediate results targets were met, and one almost met (Table 7). Two indicators were dropped because they were no longer relevant to the project's activities. Efficacy during the pre-restructuring period was modest because the initial project implementation period experienced significant delays in the implementation of most project's activities, but the project implementation caught up rapidly after a few years. Under the project, the majority of indicator targets were achieved, or exceeded, providing evidence of achievement of the PDO.

**Table 6: Outcome Ratings Calculation**

<b>Period</b>	<b>Efficacy</b>	<b>Relevance</b>	<b>Efficiency</b>	<b>% disbursed</b>	<b>Outcome by interval</b>	<b>Weighted Score</b>
Pre-RP 1-08/05/2015	Modest	High	Substantial	54%	Mod. Unsat.=3	1.62
RP 1-RP 2-10/17/2016	Substantial	High		29%	Satisfactory=5	1.45
Post-RP 2-Close-08/31/2107	Substantial	High		17%	Satisfactory=5	0.85
<b>Total Overall Score</b>	<b>Substantial</b>	<b>High</b>	<b>Substantial</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>Mod. Satisfact.</b>	<b>3.92</b>



**Table 7: Summary of Achievement Final Results Indicators**

Component/PDO	Achieved	Mostly Achieved	Not achieved	Dropped	Total
PDO	5	0	0	0	5
<b>Intermediate Results Indicators</b>					
Comp. 1- Improve Access to Basic Education Services	1	0	0	0	1
Comp. 2-Improve Quality of Teaching and Learning	2	1	0	1	4
Comp. 3-Strengthen Institutional Capacity	2	0	0	1	3
<b>Total</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>13</b>

## E. OTHER OUTCOMES AND IMPACTS (IF ANY)

### Gender

65. The project introduced measures to promote girls' education and community participation in schools in areas most affected by the conflict. These measures complemented initiatives to foster state/society compact in the Fourth Economic Governance and Recovery Grant financed by the Bank. The project design recognized the fact that 67 localities had under-enrollment of girls and sought to address the issue through several measures. One was to provide incentives for female enrollment and for girls' academic performance. The incentive provided to girls through awards for academic achievement sent a strong signal to girls and communities that their educational achievement was of high value. Another important initiative promoting girls' education was a sensitization campaign implemented by non-governmental organizations (NGOs), the Club des Mères d'élève fille (CMEF) (Mother – Student-Daughters Club)—which helped sensitize mothers in the role they could play in ensuring that their daughters are educated. In one school in Bodokro where this initiative was started there were fewer girls at the beginning of the year, but over the course of the year there were more girls than boys, better reflecting the population of the village. Project-wide, the target of 45 percent enrollment for females was met by the project, with 47.5 percent actually achieved. There was also a study conducted under the project on the determinants of pregnancies during schooling. The study's recommendations contributed to a campaign to reduce pregnancies among school-age girls.

66. The *“collèges de proximité”* are expected to have significant impact on gender disparity and early pregnancy. Lower secondary school is key for girls to acquire life skills and avoid early pregnancy. In terms of gender disparities, overall there are issues in access to secondary education as the gender parity index in gross enrollment in secondary education was only 0.71 in 2014. This index is likely to be lower in rural areas because girls are more likely to be employed as housekeepers, rural workers and in trade compared to boys. Moreover,



the importance of the distance between schools and dwellings is a serious discouraging factor for girls for whom it is risky to travel long distances.

### **Institutional Strengthening**

67. **The project contributed to an increase in institutional capacity, particularly in the areas of teacher and school officials' training, and production for reliable sector data.** The support to CAFOPs helped create an institution that could train and certify much-needed teachers. Support to MEN helped build capacity to develop and publish data needed for transparency and planning in the education sector. The project focused also on regional capacity with resources allocated to training for heads of DREN, school directors, inspectors and pedagogical advisors.

68. **There was also institutional capacity building of the school-based management committees (COGES) to ensure success of the community approach.** This led to generally good implementation with low cost and good quality of construction in building the 3- or 6-classroom school buildings. Beneficiaries reported in ICR field interviews that the experience of using the community-based approach helped bring the community closer together and build a sense of common purpose. This approach is now part of MEN's model for classroom construction. It is expected that the ministry will make wider use of this approach in the coming years.

### **Mobilizing Private Sector Financing**

Not applicable

### **Poverty Reduction and Shared Prosperity**

69. **The project responded to the emergency situation under OP/BP 8.00 with funds to address the education sector's most critical needs.** The funding supported institutional and technical activities to help restore government capacity in education sector management at the national, regional and local levels, which was damaged during the crisis. The project focused on areas most affected by the conflict and introduced measures to promote girls' education. Therefore, the beneficiaries were among the poorer segments of the population. Initiatives such as the "*collèges de proximité*" were aimed at rural areas and are likely to have helped reduced educational and social disparities between rural and urban areas.

### **Other Unintended Outcomes and Impacts**

Not applicable

## **III. KEY FACTORS THAT AFFECTED IMPLEMENTATION AND OUTCOME**

### **A.KEY FACTORS DURING PREPARATION**

70. **The Project's objectives were aligned with the Government's strategic agenda as outlined in the Medium-Term Action Plan (2012-2014) and the President's Emergency Recovery Plan (Plan Présidentiel**





**d'Urgence) which included education as a national priority.** The original objectives of the Project were also consistent with the CPS (2010-2013) which emphasized the importance of “continued progress in crisis recovery and improved prospects for sustained peace”, as well as “improved basic social service delivery”. (Additional details can be found in the relevance of PDO section).

71. **The original design was informed by findings from the Education Country Status Report (RESEN) developed in 2009, which highlighted the main challenges for the education system in Cote d'Ivoire.** The major issues identified included limited and inequitable access to primary and secondary education resulting mostly from supply-side constraints, poor quality and low internal efficiency (high repetition and dropout rates), low institutional capacity for systems management, and inadequate funding and sub-optimal allocation and management of resources, particularly at the school level.

72. **The project design benefited from lessons learned from other projects in Cote d'Ivoire and in other countries.** One lesson was to mainstream project implementation for better results, unlike for the previous education project, the implementation of the EBESP was mainstreamed within the MEN and used the existing MENETFP structures. The design also considered lessons from similar projects in other countries. These lessons included the importance of capacity building to enhance community participation in project implementation, the need to strengthen M&E, as well as the need to set up relevant incentives to enhance girls' attendance. In the case of M&E, while the EBESP tried to improve this function, it was not until late in the project that capacity was present in the form of a qualified M&E officer. The Project's results chain was clear insofar as the activities and objectives supported across each of the Project's components were logically linked to the overall objectives, as described in Table 1. However, the original Project design did not fully take into consideration the time required to: (i) identify the sites for classroom construction and the classrooms to be rehabilitated; and (ii) train local communities for school construction.

## B. KEY FACTORS DURING IMPLEMENTATION

73. **For the earlier stages of implementation, the administration of the project was affected by changes in the team at the Ministry and time needed to gain an understanding of the project.** At the same time administrative capacity needed to be rebuilt, which took time and energy for the Bank team to support on a day to day basis.

74. **Other factors contributing to the slow implementation during the early years of the project include weak project management and some delays in establishing a fully functional M&E system.** The original project coordinator did not have, nor did he acquire adequate technical engineering expertise to oversee the building of classrooms and COFEP. Consequently, implementation was slow, and promised deadlines for completion were not realistic. For the Project team, the Bank raised many times to the Government the need to change the Project Coordinator, but there was resistance from the Ministry. The decision was made after a meeting with the Prime Minister.

75. **After the second extension of the closing date and the change of key staff of the PIU in September 2016, implementation improved rapidly.** Key members of the Project team, including the coordinator, were replaced. The new team added an engineer to better manage the classroom construction. It also updated the project accounting system. This contributed to a rapid increase of the disbursement rate with the registration of





all commitments. A key success factor was that the new project coordinator had experience in a Bank project that had recently closed and could apply that knowledge to improve implementation of the EBESP.

76. **Achievement of the PDO and implementation under the Project were both upgraded to Moderately Satisfactory (MS).** The project experienced a significant improvement of its overall management, after the extension of the closing date by 11 months to August 31, 2017 in September 2016. The project disbursement rate has increased from 54 percent at the first restructuring, to 79.13 percent at the second restructuring and was fully disbursed at project closure.

77. **Project financing was significantly affected by the increase in the exchange rate of the US dollar against the CFA Franc.** The project benefited from additional resources of 4.05 billion CFA Franc in comparison to what was originally planned. Although it allowed the project to cover some of the financing gap for construction, for instance, this represented a challenge, as it contributed unexpectedly to lower the project disbursement rate, compared to what it would have been without the increase in the exchange rate.

#### IV. BANK PERFORMANCE, COMPLIANCE ISSUES, AND RISK TO DEVELOPMENT OUTCOME

##### A. QUALITY OF MONITORING AND EVALUATION (M&E)

Rating: Substantial

###### M&E Design

78. **The project RF captured project activities and linked them with the PDO and components reasonably well.** The six PDO-level indicators and the intermediate results indicators covered access to basic education (numbers of classrooms and beneficiaries), quality of learning and teaching environment (teachers trained and student-teacher ratio) and improved sector capacity (reliable statistics, system for learning assessment and trained regional staff and school management committees). The indicators were feasible to be measured and did not pose any undue challenge in their monitoring. One omission was the measurement of school attendance. This was important because the project initially had planned to provide school feeding which was viewed as an important incentive to attend school. The omission of an attendance indicator precluded a determination of whether attendance was affected by cancellation of this activity. The project's design itself promoted M&E by the government. The project's support to national M&E capacity in the production of education statistics was beyond the project M&E, and aimed at facilitating policy analysis for the sector. Specifically, the project supported the establishment of a directorate which carries out learning assessments on a periodic basis, a system for monitoring teacher performance and to record inspectors' feedback, and a secure system for tracking/archiving examination results. Further, the Project has supported the production of annual statistical yearbooks since 2013. Each of these were useful in guiding efforts to improve sector performance.

###### M&E Implementation

79. **There was regular reporting on project activities, but it was not until a new M&E officer was in place, the team was able to more fully track PDO and intermediate results targets.** M&E implementation was weak in the earlier years of the project, mainly because the M&E officer was not adequately qualified to carry out the duties. To compensate for this weakness, additional human resources were allocated to produce a detailed mid-



term review (MTR) which was carried out in August 2014. The MTR laid out detailed progress of the project's activities and identified areas where implementation needed to improve. In addition, the restructurings also were key to project M&E. The first restructuring included a good stocktaking of results indicators. When the project team was overhauled in September 2016 with new management, including a new M&E officer, project results monitoring improved. The results framework was fully supported and all indicators were regularly updated. The RF did not undergo significant revisions (though school attendance should have been measured), attesting to its stability from the beginning. Quarterly progress reports provided detailed tracking of all project activities. These reports also cited problems with implementation and recommended measures for their resolution (for example see quarterly report for April 1 to June 30, 2017)<sup>18</sup>. The support to the national M&E system for MEN was successful, resulting in timely reporting of reliable education statistics, including "School Statistics 2016-2017" in both English and French.

### **M&E Utilization**

80. **The M&E function was useful for managing the project, particularly for the three restructurings.** The MTR provided a good quality review of the project's progress, and led, with a slight lag, to a beneficial restructuring. Project M&E provided critical inputs to the decisions made in the first restructuring and was critical to restructuring and management of the project thereafter. As M&E improved, monitoring data and regular reporting later in the project helped determine what was required to ensure project relevance and improved implementation through the second and third restructurings, in particular, adjustments to the components and RF.

### **Justification of Overall Rating of Quality of M&E**

81. With design rated substantial, implementation modest and utilization substantial, the overall rating for the quality of M&E is substantial.

## **B. ENVIRONMENTAL, SOCIAL, AND FIDUCIARY COMPLIANCE**

82. **Financial Management (FM) is rated Moderately Satisfactory.** Early in the project FM capacity issues arose, but even then, annual audit reports were received on time, revealed no irregularities, and were of unqualified opinion. Interim unaudited financial reports were also submitted in a timely manner and in accordance with Bank procedures. In instances in which minor issues were identified, corrective actions were enacted by the Bank and the Government. Bank supervision missions were conducted regularly and where required, appropriate mitigation measures were put in place. The final ISR and the ICR rate FM moderately satisfactory.

83. **Procurement performance is rated Satisfactory.** From the beginning of the project to the project close, procurement performance remained strong with 725 bidding process completed out of 726 planned (nearly a 100 percent execution of the plan). The payment time for invoices improved during the course of the project averaging 35 days on average before the second restructuring to 15 days thereafter. In addition, the final bid amounts were aligned to the estimated amounts in the project procurement plan. Initial delays were not related to any procurement bottlenecks. During implementation, the Project complied with the

---

<sup>18</sup> Rapport Trimestriel (01 avril-30 juin 2017), Don IDA No.TF12500, Juillet 2017.



procurement procedures and there were no procurement issues. The final ISR rated procurement for the project satisfactory.

84. **Environmental and social safeguards are rated Moderately Unsatisfactory.** Civil works commenced without completed environmental studies and thus an Environmental Audit and a Social Audit were conducted. The main issue identified was that communities needed to be compensated for the land/sites they were offering for schools because these were government schools. Both environmental and social studies were done and actions plans developed to reverse the situation, i.e., appropriate compensation from the government to the communities, were established. Still, the action plans were not implemented with the appropriate sequence, with the environmental and social assessments done prior. Rather civil works continued although the Environmental and Social Impact Assessment were not completed. Consequently, the rating in the final ISR for environmental and social safeguards and this ICR is Moderately Unsatisfactory.

## C. BANK PERFORMANCE

### Quality at Entry

85. **Moderately Satisfactory. The Bank worked with the education sector counterparts to design a project of high relevance to the urgent needs in the education sector in an emergency context that ultimately required only moderate design and results framework changes to complete.** There were significant challenges posed in a post-crisis context, including the lack of good data for setting some of the indicator targets that could have been available had it been possible to conduct a full needs assessment. Despite these challenges, the original results framework was relevant to both the project activities and assessment of the PDO. One shortcoming was the underestimation of the cost of rehabilitating classrooms and of identifying classrooms that actually could be rehabilitated. But this was a minor shortcoming that was remedied when school rehabilitation targets were revised and the government compensated for the reduction in the number of schools rehabilitated.

86. **The project's objectives, as further defined by indicator targets were ambitious in light of the original three-year implementation period, which may be viewed as a quality at entry shortcoming.** Two extensions of the project's closing date were needed to complete implementation during which most of original targets were reached. These restructurings maintained project relevance, but also were somewhat of a reduction in project scope mainly because of the cancellation of the school feeding program and of the EMIS. The former change was forced in compliance with the GPEF Grant agreement. The latter change may have been too ambitious in that unifying data platforms in a post-conflict context was not realistic. The latter shortcoming was mitigated by the fact that data collection and reporting improved considerably from the post-crisis status, but that the data platforms (schools, human resources, pupils enrolled) were not yet consolidated under a formal EMIS.

### Quality of Supervision

87. **Moderately Satisfactory. The Bank conducted regular supervision from the field and supported three restructurings which improved project implementation and achievement of the PDOs.** The changing of the project team at the ministry was key to concluding the project successfully. Several key people had successfully implemented another Bank-supported project that had recently closed. This change of the team might have been



carried out earlier, rather than simply wait for the contracts to expire. However, restructurings were appropriate both in terms of component adjustments and modifications to the results framework. The extension of the Project closing date had also allowed further progress on intermediate-level indicators, many of which met or exceeded their targets. The restructuring papers and ISRs were complete and discussed issues clearly. FM and procurement were well supervised with good compliance with Bank requirements. Safeguards were rated moderately unsatisfactory however because an assessment needed to be carried out regarding community school sites. Though the issue was resolved with compensation to the communities, it was a shortcoming on the Bank's part not to have ensured that the assessment took place prior to starting civil works.

88. **The Bank made the difficult decision to cancel the school feeding program, though it was forced by the Grant agreement.** The school feeding program was cancelled because the appropriate mechanisms were not in place to adequately monitor how contributions from school families are spent for this activity. The Government was to have created such a mechanism but did not do so. The team was concerned by the equity aspect of requiring family contributions and related reputational risk for the Bank. Consequently, the activity was dropped. The Bank might have done a better job mitigating this policy by arranging for some back up program for school nutrition. School nutrition was highlighted in the context section of the PAD and was linked to attendance. However, the project only measured enrollment, not attendance.

#### Justification of Overall Rating of Bank Performance

89. **Moderately Satisfactory.** Both quality at entry and supervision are rated moderately satisfactory based on reasonably good performance with moderate shortcomings, and so the overall rating is moderately satisfactory, which is also consistent with the outcome rating.

#### D. RISK TO DEVELOPMENT OUTCOME

90. **Moderate.** The general security situation has improved with the number of IDPs falling from a peak of 2.3 million in 2011 to 300,000 by the end of 2016 (<http://www.internal-displacement.org>). A number of important measures under the project will help reduce any risk to development outcome going forward. One measure is the community approach for building and rehabilitating classrooms. With the community-based approach for construction in primary education, local communities were fully involved in the supervision of the construction and a mechanism for maintenance of the new infrastructure was established with the *Comité Technique de Mise en Oeuvre (CTMO)* for each COGES

91. **In particular through the local water management committees they are firmly committed to preserve the new system of potable water, which benefits participating schools as well as surrounding villages.** This approach has led to cost savings which provides incentives for sustainability in efficiency in the use of education funds (see Box 1 for an example of successful application of the community approach). The reform of initial teacher training has led to the development of a new curriculum, as well as changes in the governance of the training centers. The overall reduction in political turmoil has also created an environment where educational investments can expand, as shown in the FY 2016-19 CPF. The upcoming Education Services Delivery Enhancement project will follow up in several areas of EBESP including curriculum content in primary education, teacher training and the community approach for construction. It is hoped that the government will adopt this approach on a wider basis for future school construction.



**Box 1: Use of the expertise of the MCTOs by the heads of the decentralized communities**

In the Guenon Region, the village of Bagouho benefited from the construction of three classrooms using the community approach. The construction was exceptionally well supervised by the CTMO team with a quick and effective result. Having observed the good result from this team, the Regional Council of Guenon requested the same team to help him to supervise another construction site and to complete the building of three more classrooms whose work had been halted for quite a while. These classrooms are now satisfactorily completed.

92. **The “*collèges de proximité*” in rural areas, the CAFOPs and the CMEF are expected to promote sustainability and are receiving broader support.** The “*collèges de proximité*” will help achieve an increase in access to lower secondary schools. During the project, this model achieved lower student unit costs which allowed the government to increase the supply for secondary education services in rural areas. The low student unit cost is a combined result of the introduction of bivalent teachers, the adaptation of curriculum content to five blocks of disciplines and the changes in teacher training. With the expansion of this new model the government is also expected to stimulate the demand from parents in rural areas who will no longer have to pay additional costs to enroll their children in distant secondary schools after completion of primary school. This new model of lower secondary schools in remote rural areas has been adopted by the French Development Agency (*Agence française de développement* - AFD), MCC, Japanese Aid Agency (JICA) and the U.S. Agency for international Development (USAID). CAFOPs contribute to sustainability because they also offer a lower cost option to train teachers because the teachers are not boarded at the training facility. CAFOPs have also attracted support from the MCC. The CMEF has created a supportive structure to help maintain and increase girls’ enrollment in school.

93. **The Project emphasized capacity-building at all levels of the education system in an effort to promote skills transfer and sustainable development of the system.** The Project supported the continued development of statistical capacity within the central ministry while it also worked to encourage the government to secure continued funding and resources from the national budget to finance the yearly production of statistical data for the sector (statistical yearbook). Along with this, the Project also supported the development of a national strategy for statistics production. In addition to this, the Project’s support to the establishment of a directorate in charge of evaluations (with an autonomous budget), the development of a system for monitoring teachers and recording inspectors’ findings, and to archive examination results – are likely to be useful tools to guide decision-making in the sector moving forward.,

## V. LESSONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

94. **Lesson 1: Ingredients in improved project management include: knowledge of Bank operations, regular communication with the project team, and a willingness to respond to issues arising in the project.** The EBESP implementation struggled for several years precisely because of the lack of these factors and improved substantially when a new core of the team was introduced. One action of the new team was not to renew the



contract of the engineering team which had not performed satisfactorily in advancing the construction of classrooms. Key members of the new team were taken from the Post-Conflict Assistance Project.

95. **Lesson 2: An audit of the pre-service teacher training can form a critical basis for effective reform if it covers all stages of the process.** The education sector audit financed prior to the project was key in providing details for the recruitment, training and development of competences and all the way to certification. The important thing was for the audit to cover the whole process of teacher development so that all the pieces of the reform fit together.

96. **Lesson 3: Decentralized (regional) teacher training is a model that can save money and lower the cost of pre-service teacher training.** A lot of teacher training includes boarding at the training facility. This might be good for a fuller emersion experience, but it is costly because the facility must board the students and it lowers capacity because lodging replaces classrooms. The capacity constraint is severe in Cote d'Ivoire and the CAFOP model helped ease the constraint.

97. **Lesson 4: Tracking textbook delivery at the central level is a good way to ensure that the right number of textbooks is delivered to the Regions when there are multiple suppliers and funders.** In other projects, there were instances of regions misreporting the numbers of textbooks received. This risk can lead to over-supply and profiting from the sale of textbooks which are supposed to be provided free of charge. In addition, the textbooks financed by the project (1,000,270) had cover stamp prohibiting any sale of the textbook.

98. **Lesson 5: In the case of an emergency project, it is important that the project design has activities that are 'ready to go.'** The EBESP was partially successful in this in that it identified and pursued the most urgent priorities, though it did not anticipate two difficulties. It was not anticipated that the school feeding program would run into difficulty as it was not yet settled whether beneficiary contributions would be eliminated or properly monitored (if not eliminated). As a result, there was no back up plan when school feeding fell through, though the team was able to effectively redirect funds to other activities critical to the aims of the sub-component and of the PDO more broadly. The other example was that of EMIS, as it was rather ambitious to expect that a consolidated data system could be achieved under an emergency project. That said, important progress was made in upgrading data collection and reporting for the education sector.

99. **Lesson 6: The community approach used by EBESP is cost-effective in building local schools and it may have a positive impact on social cohesion.** This approach lowered construction costs while also engaging the community which may have had gains in terms of strengthening community cohesion which can often be damaged as a result of conflict. The community approach also built capacity of the COGES which put the training provided by the EBESP to practical use. Field visits during the ICR mission to a number of villages in the eastern part of the project area, confirmed through interviews improvements in community cooperation in planning and building primary school classrooms.



## ANNEX 1. RESULTS FRAMEWORK AND KEY OUTPUTS

### A. RESULTS INDICATORS

#### A.1 PDO Indicators

**Objective/Outcome:** Restoring and increasing access to basic education

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Number of additional classrooms built or rehabilitated at the primary level resulting from project interventions.	Number	0.00 02-Apr-2012	1500.00 02-Apr-2012	1267.00 30-Aug-2017	1272.00 22-Dec-2017
Number of classrooms rehabilitated	Number	0.00 02-Apr-2012	500.00 02-Apr-2012	267.00 30-Aug-2017	270.00 31-Mar-2017
Number of classrooms built	Number	0.00 02-Apr-2012	1000.00 02-Apr-2012	1000.00 30-Aug-2017	1002.00 31-Jan-2017
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b> Archived revised targets.					



Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Direct project beneficiaries	Number	0.00 02-Apr-2012	62400.00 02-Apr-2012	53080.00 30-Aug-2017	53280.00 31-Mar-2017
Female beneficiaries	Percentage	0.00 02-Apr-2012	45.00 02-Apr-2012	45.00 30-Aug-2017	47.50 31-Mar-2017
students enrolled in colleges de proximite constructed by the project	Number	0.00 02-Apr-2012	2400.00 02-Apr-2012	2400.00 30-Aug-2017	2400.00 31-Jan-2017
students enrolled in primary schools built by the project	Number	0.00 02-Apr-2012	60000.00 02-Apr-2012	50680.00 30-Aug-2017	50880.00 31-Mar-2017
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b> Achieved revised targets. (DSPS/MEN for % of females)					

**Objective/Outcome:** Rehabilitating and improving the conditions for teaching and learning

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Teachers recruited or trained	Number	0.00 02-Apr-2012	7500.00 02-Apr-2012	15200.00 30-Aug-2017	24000.00 30-Aug-2017
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b> Achieved and exceeded (157.9% of target).					





Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Number of additional classrooms built or rehabilitated at the primary level resulting from project interventions.	Number	0.00	1500.00	1267.00	1272.00
		02-Apr-2012	02-Apr-2012	30-Aug-2017	22-Dec-2017
Number of classrooms rehabilitated	Number	0.00	500.00	267.00	270.00
		02-Apr-2012	02-Apr-2012	30-Aug-2017	31-Mar-2017
Number of classrooms built	Number	0.00	1000.00	1000.00	1002.00
		02-Apr-2012	02-Apr-2012	30-Aug-2017	31-Jan-2017
Comments (achievements against targets): Archived revised targets.					

**Objective/Outcome:** Restoring and strengthening intuitional capacity to deliver quality basic education

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Timely annual production of reliable school statistics (yes/no)	Text	No	No	Yes	Yes
		02-Apr-2012	02-Apr-2012	30-Aug-2017	23-Sep-2016
Comments (achievements against targets):					



### Unlinked Indicators

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
System for learning assessment at the primary level	Yes/No	N 02-Apr-2012	N 02-Apr-2012	Y 30-Aug-2017	Y 23-Sep-2016
Utility of the learning assessment system	Number	0.00 02-Apr-2012	0.00 02-Apr-2012	3.00 30-Aug-2017	3.00 23-Sep-2016
Comments (achievements against targets): Achieved					

### A.2 Intermediate Results Indicators

**Component:** Restoring and increasing access to basic education services

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Number of girls receiving incentives	Number	0.00 02-Apr-2012	450.00 02-Apr-2012	450.00 30-Aug-2017	463.00 23-Sep-2016
Comments (achievements against targets):					

**Component:** Rehabilitating and improving the quality of teaching and learning

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised	Actual Achieved at
----------------	-----------------	----------	-----------------	------------------	--------------------



				Target	Completion
Teachers trained in-service	Number	0.00	15000.00	16500.00	16797.00
		02-Apr-2012	02-Apr-2012	30-Aug-2017	23-Sep-2016
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b> Target achieved (101.8%)					

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Number of textbooks purchased and distributed	Number	0.00	1000000.00	1000000.00	1000270.00
		02-Apr-2012	02-Apr-2012	30-Aug-2017	23-Sep-2016
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b> Target achieved (100.2%)					

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Student:teacher ratio in publicly financed schools (disaggregated by region)	Text	42:1	40:1	43:1	43.63:1
		02-Apr-2012	02-Apr-2012	30-Aug-2017	23-Sep-2016
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b> Target mostly achieved. The revised target reflected the increasing demand for education owing to the new universal education policy and the post crisis recovery.					

**Component:** Restoring and strengthening institutional capacity to deliver quality basic education

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised	Actual Achieved at
----------------	-----------------	----------	-----------------	------------------	--------------------



				Target	Completion
Number of heads of DREN, school directors, inspectors and pedagogical advisors trained	Number	0.00	3000.00	8500.00	8670.00
		02-Apr-2012	02-Apr-2012	30-Aug-2017	23-Sep-2016
Comments (achievements against targets): Target revised at 2nd restructuring and achieved (102.0%). (DPFC)					
Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Number of COGES trained	Number	0.00	3000.00	3000.00	5232.00
		02-Apr-2012	02-Apr-2012	30-Sep-2016	23-Sep-2016
Comments (achievements against targets): Target exceeded (174.4%)					



## B. KEY OUTPUTS BY COMPONENT

Objective/Outcome 1	
Outcome Indicators	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Number of additional classrooms at the primary level resulting from project intervention, (i) built-1000 (ii) rehabilitated 500</li> <li>2. Direct project beneficiaries: (i) students enrolled in primary schools built by the project (ii) students enrolled in collèges de proximité constructed by the project including total no; (iii) of which % of female (45%)</li> </ol>
Intermediate Results Indicators	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Number of girls receiving incentives</li> <li>2. Establishment of CMEF (not part of results framework)</li> </ol>
Key Outputs by Component (linked to the achievement of the Objective/Outcome 1)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. 1,002 newly constructed classrooms</li> <li>2. 267 rehabilitated classrooms</li> <li>3. 463 girls received academic awards for high performance on tests</li> <li>4. 50,880 primary school enrollees</li> <li>5. 2,400 secondary school enrollees</li> </ol>
Objective/Outcome 2	
Outcome Indicators	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Number of additional qualified primary teachers resulting from project intervention</li> </ol>
Intermediate Results Indicators	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Teachers trained in-service</li> <li>2. Number of textbooks purchased and distributed (cumulative)</li> <li>3. Student-teacher ratio in publicly financed schools (disaggregated by region)</li> <li>4. Number of children receiving food supplies as a result of project intervention (indicator dropped in favor of health services)</li> <li>5. Student-teacher ratio maintained at 43.6 vs. revised target of 43.0</li> </ol>



Key Outputs by Component  
(linked to the achievement of the Objective/Outcome 2)

1. 24,000 additional qualified primary teachers trained
2. 16,797 in-service teachers trained
3. 60,000 children receiving basic health services (hand washing, vitamins and de-worming, but not nutrition)
4. 1,000,267 textbooks distributed



## ANNEX 2. BANK LENDING AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT/SUPERVISION

### A. TASK TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Role
<b>Preparation</b>	
Hamoud A.W. Kamil	Task Team Leader(s)
<b>Supervision/ICR</b>	
Hamoud A.W. Kamil	Task Team Leader(s)
Patrick Philippe Ramanantoanina	Task Team Leader(s)
Maurice Adoni	Procurement Specialist(s)
Jean Charles Amon Kra	Financial Management Specialist
Abdoul Wahabi Seini	Social Safeguards Specialist
Andre Francis Ndem	Team Member
Abdoulaye Gadiere	Environmental Safeguards Specialist
Haoua Diallo	Team Member
Alison Marie Grimsland	Team Member
Oumou Coulibaly	Team Member

### B. STAFF TIME AND COST

Stage of Project Cycle	Staff Time and Cost	
	No. of staff weeks	US\$ (including travel and consultant costs)
<b>Preparation</b>		
FY11	0	59,455.67
FY12	45.363	400,732.31
FY13	0	1,592.37



<b>Total</b>	<b>45.36</b>	<b>461,780.35</b>
<b>Supervision/ICR</b>		
FY12	0	0.00
FY13	15.200	115,565.30
FY14	26.007	195,945.24
FY15	27.774	151,567.08
FY16	53.763	253,719.10
FY17	54.062	221,916.51
FY18	1.922	43,395.26
<b>Total</b>	<b>178.73</b>	<b>982,108.49</b>



**ANNEX 3. PROJECT COST BY COMPONENT**

Components	Amount at Approval (US\$M)	Actual at Project Closing (US\$M)	Percentage of Approval (US\$M)
Component 1: Restoring and increasing access to basic education services	20.0	19.25	96.25
Component 2: Rehabilitating and improving the quality of teaching and learning	12.0	13.17	109.75
Component 3: Restoring and strengthening institutional capacity to deliver quality basic education	9.4	8.98	95.53
<b>Total</b>	<b>41.40</b>	<b>41.40</b>	<b>100.0</b>



## **ANNEX 4. EFFICIENCY ANALYSIS**

1. This annex provides an overview of the social, economic and financial benefits of the project, including the following: (i) project outputs in terms of enrolment, (ii) social outcomes and positive externalities associated to the project, (iii) efficiency of implementation and efficiency gains in education sector linked to the project, (iv) returns to education and cost-benefit analysis of the project's quantifiable financial benefits and (v) fiscal sustainability in the post-project period.

### **(i) Enrolments in primary and lower secondary education, as a result of project implementation**

2. At the project's closing, a large number of outputs were completed and the majority of outcomes were achieved, if not exceeded. With regards to enrolments in primary and lower secondary education, the project financed the construction or the rehabilitation of 1272 classrooms in primary education and 7 schools in secondary education. This contributed to the enrolment of 50680 students in primary education and 2400 students in lower secondary, as direct beneficiaries of the project, out of which 47.5 % of girls. However, it's important to take into account the fact that the final number of direct project beneficiaries will be much higher, as the classrooms and school built will continue to operate years after the project's closing.

3. With the assumption that lifetime of the constructions will go 5 years after the project for primary school and 10 years for lower secondary schools (which is an underestimation) the final numbers of direct beneficiaries would be 254400 in primary and 24000 in lower secondary education.

### **(ii) Social outcomes and positive externalities associated to the project**

#### **In the short term**

4. In the short term, beyond the enrolment of children to main activities can be taken into account in terms of positive externalities of the project.

- The construction of 7 water points in the lower secondary schools allowed to have a clean water supply for the whole community in each of the concerned village. Even if the number of beneficiaries cannot be estimated this will have an impact in several social dimensions. With regards to the health status of the population, it will limit the frequency of water related diseases (especially for young children) as the families will have access to a quality water point. It will also enhance women autonomy and girls' attendance in school, as access to water will not be a constraint any more. In those case, women and girls generally have to devote a significant amount of their time to water collection with important consequences on their ability to engage in other economic activities or to go to school.
- The "college de proximite" will also have important positive externalities. Indeed, these *colleges* will diminish the distance between home and schools, reducing transport costs with disproportionate benefits for poor families that are facing harder budget constraints. They will also encourage girls' attendance since they are often the most penalized by poor families in rural areas. Indeed, distance between schools and dwellings is a serious discouraging factor for girls for



whom it is risky to travel long distances in an environment of uncertain security and other risks such as early pregnancies.

### **In the long term**

5. A large number of social outcomes are linked to higher education attainment, especially for women, including children's schooling, literacy, demographic variables, maternal health, child health and mortality, etc. This analysis takes into account variables related to demography, maternal health, and child health and mortality. The table below presents the relationship between education and some variables in the areas indicated, in Cote d'Ivoire.

	<b>No schooling</b>	<b>Primary</b>	<b>Lower secondary</b>	<b>Upper secondary</b>	<b>Tertiary</b>
Age on giving birth to first child (years)	17,81	18,01	19,15	20,68	24,50
Use of contraception (percent)	12,73	24,84	29,85	30,76	30,76
Birth spacing (years)	2,99	3,36	3,70	3,99	4,56
Medically-assisted childbirth (percent)	54,57	66,00	71,88	75,30	79,89
Mortality before the age of 5 (‰)	121,58	93,93	78,82	69,01	55,19

6. The estimation shows that the age of women at the birth of their first child grows from 17.8 years for women who never attended school to 19.1 for those who reached the end of lower secondary and 24.5 in higher education. Regarding the maternal health, the percentage of medically assisted childbirths is 54.6 for women without schooling but 79.9 percent for women with tertiary education level. Under five-year mortality also varies significantly with the schooling duration of the mother, falling from 121.6 deaths for 1,000 childbirths when the mother has never attended school to around 94 for 1,000 when she has completed primary education, and 69 for 1,000 for complete upper secondary education.

### **(iii) efficiency of implementation and efficiency gains in education sector linked to the project**

7. The Project has contributed to important innovations and reforms in education system, with a significant impact on the overall sector efficiency and which will require further support. These include: (i) the community-based approach for classrooms' construction; (ii) the reform of initial teacher training; and (iii) the creation of a new model for lower secondary schools in remote rural areas (*collèges de proximité*), based on the bivalence of teachers.

8. As forecasted at appraisal stage, the unit cost for classroom construction with the community based approach stood at around FCFA 5 million per classroom, much lower compared to higher cost for classrooms built using other procurement methods. The Project approach allowed efficiency gains in public expenditures on capital investments. In addition, the Project contributed to the piloting of a new model of lower secondary schools, "*collèges de proximité*" in rural areas and to evidence the low student unit costs with the introduction of bivalent teachers. This has two-fold advantages, better efficiency and



increased equity. The government will be able to expand the supply for secondary education service in rural areas at lower costs and parents in rural areas will no longer have to afford additional costs to enroll their children in distant secondary schools after completion of primary school.

9. Streamlining the community-based approach for construction regardless of the source of funding is key to ensure a lower construction unit cost. The new model of lower secondary school in remote rural areas is being adopted by other development partners in the education sector, such as Millennium Challenge Corporation (MCC) and Agence Française de Développement (AFD).

**(iv) returns to education and cost-benefit analysis of the project's quantifiable financial benefits**

10. The project is financially profitable, with a Net Present Value (NPV) that, although underestimated, is higher than the project investment cost.

11. The financial benefits estimate takes into account the income of children who will be enrolled in classrooms built or rehabilitated by the project. Income flows are represented by wages to be earned by the pupils enrolled, throughout their careers, minus the opportunity costs (forgone earnings). The salary corresponds to the average wage of workers with primary and lower secondary education. The life time of infrastructures is 5 years for primary education and 10 years for lower secondary education. Lastly, given that the total wage income depends on the unemployment rate, the Net Present Value (NPV) and Rate of Return (RR) of the project are estimated using the unemployment rates for primary and lower secondary education, estimated via ENSETTE 2013 data. In terms of investment, the analysis takes into consideration the whole cost of the project, depreciation and recurrent cost of education in primary and lower secondary education.

12. In light of the assumptions used, the Net Present Value stands at US\$151.8 million. The Internal Rate of Return is 74.1 percent for a discount rate of 15 percent, and the Economic Rate of Return is 27.5 percent.

<b>Variables / Assumptions</b>	<b>Values</b>
Number of direct beneficiaries	278,400
Activity time (years)	20
Average annual salary, primary education (USD)	1,327
Lifetime of primary education classrooms (year)	5-10 years
Annual unit cost (recurrent) (UDS)	265-556
Annual opportunity cost (USD)	1,184 – 1,421
Discount rate (percent)	15
Project cost, depreciation and recurrent costs (I, USD)	87,169,291
NPV (USD)	151,799,751
Internal rate of return	74.14
Economic rate of return	27.5



**(v) fiscal sustainability in the post-project period**

13. Several activities or strategies implemented in the project represent efficiency gains for service delivery in education sector and some of them are being scaled up. As indicated the new model for rural lower secondary school based on recruitment of multidisciplinary teachers is adopted by several donors, and constitutes the reference for expansion of lower secondary education. The community based approach for classroom construction in primary education not only can be adopted in the national investment budget in education sector to save resources, but it could also be adopted for infrastructure development in other sectors (health, water, etc.), in order to reduce the costs of corresponding investments, alleviate the burden on the overall national investment budget, while empowering the communities for better citizen participation and service delivery.

14. The Project has contributed to important innovations and reforms in education system, which are supported and financed on the national resources. These include: (i) the reform of initial teacher training, (ii) the establishment of national learning assessment system, (iii) the strengthening of data collection and statistical activities, (iv) the informatization of national examinations in primary and secondary education, and (v) the decentralization of the General Inspectorate of Education, in charge of evaluation and overall reforms.



## **ANNEX 5. BORROWER, CO-FINANCIER AND OTHER PARTNER/STAKEHOLDER COMMENTS**

### **RESUME EXECUTIF**

1. Le PUAEB a bénéficié du Fonds du Partenariat Mondial pour l'Éducation, à travers l'accord de Don n° 012500 signé le 16 juillet 2012 entre l'IDA et la République de Côte d'Ivoire, un Don d'un montant équivalent à 41,4 millions de Dollars USD. Le PUAEB avait pour objectifs (i) de restaurer et d'accroître l'éducation de base ; (ii) réhabiliter et améliorer les conditions d'enseignement et d'apprentissage ; et (iii) rétablir et renforcer les capacités institutionnelles pour assurer un enseignement de base de qualité.

2. Conformément à l'Instruction n°192 du 22 septembre 2008, le Projet a bénéficié de la nomination par le Ministère de l'Economie et des Finances d'un Contrôleur Financier et d'un Agent Comptable. L'Agent Comptable a pris fonction le 09 novembre 2012, et le Contrôleur Financier le 24 juillet 2012. L'avance initiale d'un montant de 1 milliard de FCFA a été créditée sur le compte Désigné du projet le 29 novembre 2012. Une deuxième avance d'un montant de 1 milliard de FCFA a été créditée sur le compte Désigné du projet le 02 avril 2015, portant ainsi l'avance initiale à 2 milliards de FCFA.

#### **Etat d'exécution**

3. Compte tenu des difficultés d'exécution des différentes activités, le PUAEB a reçu une première prorogation ramenant la date de clôture du projet du 30 septembre 2015 au 30 septembre 2016, suite à une requête du Gouvernement en date du 1<sup>er</sup> juin 2015. Cette prorogation a permis d'enregistrer des progrès considérables qui ont permis d'atteindre les résultats acceptables dans la mise en œuvre des activités de toutes les composantes opérationnelles.

4. Du fait de l'évolution constante du cours du Dollar qui a permis au projet de disposer d'un montant de 1,6 milliard de F CFA non engagés à quelques jours de sa date de clôture, le PUAEB a sollicité et obtenu une extension et une restructuration prorogeant la date de clôture définitive du projet au 30 août 2017. Cette seconde prorogation a été accompagnée de mesures de restructuration suivantes : (i) la nomination d'un nouveau Coordonnateur, (ii) le recrutement d'un nouveau RAF ; (iii) le non renouvellement du contrat du RSE ; et (v) la restructuration de certaines activités du Projet qui ont conduit à des modifications d'indicateurs de résultats :

- suppression de l'indicateur relatif aux cantines scolaires et l'indicateur relatif à la mise en place d'un SIGE ;
- ajustement de l'indicateur relatif au nombre de salles de classe à réhabiliter qui est passé de 500 à 267 ;
- ajustement de l'indicateur relatif au nombre de bénéficiaires.

5. La composante 1 : « *Restauration et accroissement de l'accès à l'enseignement de base* » a permis d'accroître modérément l'offre scolaire publique au primaire et au premier cycle du secondaire en répondant à des besoins d'urgence en matière de construction et d'équipement des établissements scolaires.

6. En ce qui concerne le primaire, (i) 1 002 salles de classes dont 201 par appel d'offres et 801 selon l'approche communautaire comprenant 192 bureaux et magasins pour les directeurs d'écoles ont été



construites et équipées en mobiliers et matériels didactiques ; (ii) 20 040 table-bancs, 1002 bureau-maitres et 192 bureaux-directeurs sont acquis et livrés dans les écoles construites ; (iii) 270 salles de classes ont été réhabilitées ; (iv) 142 blocs latrines de 3 cabines ont été construits ; (v) 25 069 table-bancs additionnels ont été acquis et distribués dans 521 écoles primaires réparties dans 9 DRENET. Ces infrastructures ont permis à un peu plus de 40 000 enfants principalement en zone rural d'avoir accès à l'école dans de meilleures conditions environnementales.

7. Par ailleurs, le projet a expérimenté l'approche communautaire ou DDP pour la réalisation des infrastructures scolaires. A ce titre outre les classes réalisées, (vi) 24 030 membres des COGES et des organes additionnels (CTMO et CIC) ont eu leurs capacités renforcées sur 5 modules de formation en gestion à la base ; (vii) 5 232 membres des 267 organes de gestion constitués ont été formés sur les modules organisation de la dynamique communautaire, passation des marchés, gestion financière suivi-évaluation participatif et entretien maintenance des infrastructures scolaires. Cette approche s'est avérée pertinente car elle a permis de réduire de manière significative les coûts de réalisation des salles de class. Ainsi le coût unitaire est en moyenne entre 5 et 6 millions de FCFA contre 8 à 10 millions FCFA pour l'approche classique appel d'offre et des investissements réalisés sur d'autres financements. En outre, l'implication des bénéficiaires à travers les COGES, améliore l'appropriation des investissements par les populations bénéficiaires et rassure quant au suivi de l'entretien des bâtiments et équipement.

8. Concernant le secondaire, 7 collèges de proximité ont été construits et accueillent les élèves depuis décembre 2015. Ils sont tous équipés de mobiliers de bureau et de matériel didactique et de forages de type HVA pour assurer l'accès à l'eau potable des usagers. Le matériel scientifique est également acquis pour les 7 collèges. Il faut préciser que tous les collèges sont terminés et réceptionnés. En plus des 7 collèges, le collège de la ville d'Abongoua a connu une extension avec la construction et l'équipement en mobiliers de 12 salles de classes et 3 salles spécialisées en sciences physiques.

Ces résultats ont eu un impact en termes d'équité car les enfants en milieu rural peuvent accéder au secondaire dans de meilleur condition puisqu'il reste à proximité de leur famille. Mieux, cela assure un meilleur taux d'accès aux filles dont à tort ou à raison, les raisons craignent de les envoyer « en ville » d'où elles reviennent avec des grossesses non désirées.

9. Concernant l'appui aux enfants défavorisés, 1 512 enfants ont été eu l'opportunité de retourner dans le système éducatif à travers 46 classes passerelles. Aussi pour encourager la scolarisation de la jeune fille, le Projet a initié deux cérémonies de récompense des meilleures élèves. A ce titre, 463 filles lauréates ont été récompensées. Dans le même sens, des campagnes IEC ont été organisées dans 67 localités de sous-scolarisation dans le cadre de l'encouragement à la scolarisation de la jeune fille. Enfin, **le PUAEB a également réalisé une étude sur les déterminants des grossesses en milieu scolaire. La restitution publique des résultats a été effectuée le 22 décembre 2016 afin de sensibiliser la communauté éducative de l'ampleur du phénomène et les permettre de comprendre les facteurs de risque et les pistes de remédiation à explorer.**

10. Dans le cadre de la réalisation des deux CAFOP, un audit social et un audit environnemental conformément aux recommandations de la Banque mondiale ont été réalisés. Les principales conclusions de ces audits ont été exploitées par le projet, et les rapports transmis à la Banque mondiale.



11. La composante 2 « *Réhabilitation et amélioration de la qualité de l'enseignement et de l'apprentissage* » a permis de réaliser plusieurs activités, notamment : (i) la construction de 2 CAFOP (Bondoukou et à San Pedro) dont celui de San-Pedro, équipé d'un système autonome d'eau potable ; (ii) la réhabilitation de 7 CAFOP (Odienné, Daloa, Gagnoa, Abengourou, Dabou, Aboisso et Bassam) ; (iii) l'équipement des CAFOP de Bondoukou, San Pedro et des 7 CAFOP réhabilités en mobiliers ; (iv) l'équipement du CAFOP de Gagnoa d'un système d'alimentation en eau potable de type HVA. Ces investissements ont permis d'accroître de près de 30% les capacités d'accueil et de formation des élèves-maîtres au niveau national. De plus et surtout, les nouveaux types de CAFOP ont montré que ce choix était pertinent tant au niveau du coût que la flexibilité qu'ils offrent en termes d'effectifs d'accueil comparativement aux anciens CAFOP.

**D'autres résultats ont marqué également cette composante, il s'agit :**

- ✓ L'incitation du Gouvernement à faire un recrutement relativement massif de **24 000** instituteurs (inscrit comme indicateur de résultats) entre 2013 et 2016 pour combler le déficit d'enseignants et contribuer à la mise en œuvre de la politique de scolarisation obligatoire (PSO) ;
- ✓ Une contribution substantielle à l'amélioration de la qualité de l'école à travers la réforme de la formation initiale. Il s'est agi l'élaboration du référentiel de compétences du maître du primaire et du plan de gouvernance des CAFOP. Cela conformément aux actions prioritaires identifiées par l'audit de la formation initiale pour résoudre les dysfonctionnements relevés : ces travaux ont déjà abouti à la prise de textes réglementant ce pan important du Ministère en charge de l'éducation nationale. Toutefois, il reste la phase expérimentale qui permettront d'apporter les derniers ajustements sanctionnés par l'édiction des deux derniers textes.
- ✓ L'élaboration d'un nouveau régime pédagogique, de programmes recadrés et d'un cadre curriculaire pour intégrer les faiblesses du système et aboutir à un enseignement de base de meilleure qualité.
- ✓ L'amélioration de la qualité avec la formations de **70 000** enseignants du primaire et **42 000** enseignants du secondaire suivant l'approche de formation en cascade dont l'efficacité est mitigée. Cette méthode a permis d'atteindre un grand nombre d'enseignants en un temps relativement court, mais cela s'est fait au détriment de la qualité car il y a une déperdition au niveau du contenu des informations transmises ;
- ✓ L'acquisition et la distribution de **1 000 270** manuels scolaires au bénéfice de 3 816 écoles et **52 500** livres pour coins de lecture ont certainement contribué au maintien des élèves dans le système car cela constitue une aide aux ménages dont le poids économique des intrants scolaires sur les budgets des familles, constitue parfois un facteur limitant au maintien des enfants à l'école ou à leur scolarisation. Par ailleurs, la création de coin de lecture dans chacune des classes devrait favoriser l'apprentissage en lecture et relever ainsi les niveaux en matière d'acquis de compétences des enfants.





12. Au titre de cette composante, le Projet a également renforcé les capacités de la Direction ayant en charge l'évaluation des acquis des élèves à travers :

- ✓ Le renforcement des capacités de 4 membres du DVSP/MEN sur le thème « analyse et planification au service du développement » à l'IIPE-Paris (formation courte), et au Centre International d'Etudes Pédagogiques à Sèvres en France ;
- ✓ Le financement de la logistique pour la réalisation de trois (3) évaluations portant sur le quantum horaire ; les apprentissages de la lecture au CP1 ; et l'apprentissage de la lecture et mathématiques au CE1.
- ✓ L'évaluation du quantum horaire a d'ailleurs été exploité pour justifier le retour du mercredi matin dans l'emploi du temps des élèves du primaire.
- ✓ Enfin, pour assurer une bonne santé des enfants pour mieux apprendre à l'école, le projet a financé des campagnes de sensibilisation et de campagnes de vaccination au profit de **60 000** élèves répartis dans 200 écoles par l'UNICEF en partenariat avec UNICEF dans le cadre de son programme « WASH ».

13. Cette composante a également permis de réaliser des activités additionnelles et d'atteindre les résultats suivants :

- ✓ L'impression de **36 000 planches pédagogiques** pour les classes de CP mises à la disposition du MEN ;
- ✓ L'usage du numérique dans les activités pédagogiques par (i) la formation d'un pool de **6 formateurs** à l'ingénierie de production de ressources pédagogiques numériques en Suisse ; (ii) la formation de **80 formateurs régionaux relais** pour démarrer le processus de formation des enseignants du primaire et du secondaire au numérique et à leur usage pédagogique ; et (iii) et **l'acquisition de 2 00 tablettes pédagogiques QELASY**.

14. Ces réalisations contribuent certainement au renforcement des pratiques d'enseignements des instituteurs et de là au renforcement de la qualité de l'enseignement susceptible d'améliorer les acquis des élèves.

15. La composante 3 « **Rétablissement et renforcement des capacités institutionnelles pour assurer une éducation de base de qualité** » a permis de réaliser les activités ci-après :

- ✓ Le renforcement de capacités des directions centrales et des services rattachés au Cabinet du MEN en matériels informatiques et de communication ainsi qu'il suit :

IGEN	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>✓ 31 ordinateurs de bureau</li><li>✓ 10 ordinateurs portables</li><li>✓ 31 onduleurs 650VA</li><li>✓ 01 onduleur 1000VA</li><li>✓ 14 imprimantes Laser</li><li>✓ 01 Imprimante réseau</li><li>✓ 01 serveur</li></ul>
DECO	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>✓ 196 ordinateurs portables</li></ul>



<b>DSPS</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ 50 ordinateurs de bureau</li> <li>✓ 40 ordinateurs portables</li> <li>✓ 50 onduleurs 650VA</li> <li>✓ 01 onduleur 1000VA</li> <li>✓ 37 imprimantes Laser</li> <li>✓ 13 serveurs</li> <li>✓ 03 scanners</li> </ul>
<b>DIRECTIONS CENTRALES ET CABINET MEN</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ 01 photocopieur HP PRO M4510DN</li> <li>✓ 01 imprimante réseau laser couleur HP PRO</li> <li>✓ 26 imprimantes HP P2055</li> <li>✓ 25 ordinateurs de bureau</li> <li>✓ 25 ordinateurs portables</li> <li>✓ 25 onduleurs 650VA</li> <li>✓ 23 Vidéo projecteurs + écrans</li> <li>✓ 02 camera professionnelle HVR 1000 SONY</li> <li>✓ 02 Caméscopes</li> <li>✓ 02 Dictaphone Phillips DVT1200</li> <li>✓ 01 appareil photo numérique CANON A2300</li> <li>✓ 21 photocopieurs Canon IR 1730i</li> <li>✓ 21 Scanner HP 5590</li> <li>✓ 20 Fax Canon L170</li> </ul>

✓ L'appui aux grandes réformes de pilotage du Ministère qui sont :

Structures bénéficiaire	Projet	Types d'interventions précises	Etat d'avancement
<b>Secteur Education-Formation</b>	Définition de la nouvelle stratégie sectorielle 2016-2025	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Réalisation du diagnostic du secteur Education/Formation (RESEN) et l'actualisation du modèle de simulation financière du secteur avec l'appui du pôle de Dakar ;</li> <li>- Recrutement de consultant pour l'appui à la définition de la politique sectorielle</li> </ul>	Achevé
<b>Inspection générale (IGEN)</b>	Modernisation de l'IGEN	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Acquisition d'équipements informatiques et bureautiques</li> <li>- Acquisition de matériel roulant</li> </ul>	Achevé
	Déconcentration de l'IGEN	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Financement du plan de déconcentration de la gestion et pilotage du système éducatif (stratégie pour le développement progressif des Coordinations de l'IGEN en Région ainsi qu'un manuel de procédures des missions de l'IGEN et des indicateurs pour la mise en œuvre d'une Coordination de l'IGEN en Région)</li> <li>- Mise en place du plan pluriannuel de renforcement des capacités des IGEN avec la Chaire UNESCO en développement curriculaire de l'UQAM</li> <li>- Renforcement des capacités de l'IGEN à travers des voyages d'études et des formations : <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 4 voyages d'études (2 au Canada en faveur de 7 IGEN. 2 en France (CIEP et IIPE) °</li> <li>• 1 formation en France sur le contrôle de gestion</li> <li>• 2 sessions de formation en faveur de 82 IGEN-formateurs</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Achevé



		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Financement de la mise en place d'un système de pilotage et d'aide à la décision de l'inspection générale du MENET-FP</li> <li>- Acquisition de trois (3) véhicules pour les coordinations déconcentrées et l'antenne de Yamoussoukro</li> </ul>	
	Réforme du redoublement (réduction de la fréquence du redoublement dans le système éducatif)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Elaboration d'une note conceptuelle de la politique de réduction du taux de redoublement dans le système éducatif intégrant deux options stratégiques : l'adoption de textes réglementaires et l'adoption d'un plan national d'implantation du projet de réduction du taux de redoublement dans le système éducatif ;</li> <li>- Elaboration de projets de textes (validation et adoption attendues) ;</li> <li>- Création de la cellule opérationnelle de coordination par arrêté ministériel, et appui à la phase expérimentale de la stratégie par la formation des formateurs nationaux ;</li> <li>- Acquisition et distribution de <b>1.000.270</b> manuels scolaires pour <b>3.816</b> écoles ;</li> <li>- Acquisition et distribution de <b>52.500</b> livres pour les coins de lecture pour les écoles construites (DDP).</li> </ul>	Achevées en termes d'appui en 2016. Il reste cependant la traduction dans la pratique après la prise d'un texte instituant les sous-cycles au primaire
<b>Direction des Examens et Concours et de l'Orientation (DECO)</b>	Mise en place du système de délibération assistée par ordinateur (DAO)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Acquisition d'équipement informatiques et bureautiques (ordinateurs Laptop et imprimantes) ayant permis d'équiper toutes les équipes et d'y installer l'appliquet de délibération. Cet appui a permis à la DECO de passer à 100% d'application de la DAO en 3 ans. Les impacts de ce projet sont : <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Rapidité au niveau des délibérations</li> <li>• Equité entre tous les candidats sur le territoire nationale</li> <li>• Transparence</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Activité achevée en mars 2015
	Mobilité des équipes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Acquisition d'un car de transport des équipes</li> </ul>	Activités achevées en 2016
	Dématérialisation des procès-verbaux de délibération et de la gestion électronique des documents (GED)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Equipements informatiques et bureautiques de la DECO pour la numérisation</li> <li>- Numérisation des archives ;</li> <li>- Mise en place qu'un système de gestion des données</li> </ul>	Activités achevées en 2016
<b>Direction des Stratégies, de la Planification et des Statistiques (DSPS)</b>	Mise en place du plan d'action intégré de production des statistiques de la DSPS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Renforcement de capacités de 42 correspondants en région ;</li> <li>- Renforcement des capacités de 10 chargés d'études de la DSPS au niveau Central ;</li> <li>- Financement du volet équipement non compris le matériel roulant du plan stratégique de production des statistiques scolaires ;</li> <li>- Acquisition d'un véhicule ;</li> <li>- Statistiques scolaires disponibles à temps depuis 2012.</li> <li>- Statistiques 2016-2017 restituées le 31mars 2017.</li> </ul>	



<b>Direction de la Mutualités des œuvres sociales en milieu scolaire (DMOSS)</b>	Stratégie de lutte contre les grossesses en milieu scolaire	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Campagne de sensibilisation à la scolarisation et au maintien des jeunes filles à l'école réalisée par 5 ONG dans 67 localités de sous scolarisation des filles en 2013</li> <li>- Célébration et récompense de 463 filles ayant obtenu les meilleurs résultats aux examens à grand tirage</li> <li>- Financement d'une étude sur les déterminants des grossesses en milieu scolaire dans les DREN de Bondoukou, Daloa, Yamoussoukro et Abidjan 4, réalisée par la Chaire Unesco de Bioéthique de l'Université Alassane Ouattara de Bouaké.</li> <li>- Diffusion des résultats à travers une cérémonie de restitution des résultats</li> </ul>	Appui achevé
<b>Direction des Affaires Financières (DAF)</b>	Equipement des directions centrales et autres structures du MEN	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Acquisition de matériel roulant pour les structures décentralisées du MENET-FP : 10 Inspection d'Enseignement Primaire (10) pour renforcer la capacité de, l'encadrement des enseignants.</li> <li>- Fournitures d'équipement informatiques et bureautiques aux structures du MENET-FP</li> </ul>	Achevée en 2016

- ✓ La formation approfondie de 3 agents du MEN et du MESRS à l'IIPE-Paris en planification de l'éducation.

## Evaluation du Projet

16. **L'efficacité globale** du PUAEB a été très partielle. Plusieurs actions importantes ont été abandonnées pour des raisons de procédures, de compétences limitées des acteurs, et de prise des décisions au niveau de la tutelle et du Gouvernement ramenant à revoir les objectifs du projet à la baisse, et notamment la réhabilitation des classes du primaire (de 500 à 267 classes) ; des CAFOP (de 8 à 7 CAFOP) et l'abandon de l'appui aux cantines scolaires en faveur de 60 000 enfants. A cela s'ajoute la faible performance des entreprises chargées de construire les CAFOP de San Pedro et de Bondoukou. Malgré un démarrage lent, l'efficacité de la mise en œuvre s'est considérablement améliorée dans la phase de prolongation du projet.

17. **L'efficience globale** est satisfaisante si l'on tient compte des résultats obtenus à la date de clôture du PUAEB du fait de la restructuration du projet et de la mise en place d'une nouvelle équipe au cours de la phase de prolongation. Il faut cependant dire que la mise en œuvre du projet a révélé plusieurs insuffisances dans son montage: (i) absence de fonctionnement du Comité Interministériel de Coordination du Secteur de l'Education et de la Formation (CICSEF) dont l'un des rôles fondamental était de procéder à un suivi pour s'assurer du respect des objectifs de performance et de calendriers convenus ; (ii) les indicateurs de gestion à atteindre par périodes successives sur la durée du projet prévus dans le cadre des résultats n'ont pas été respectés ; (iii) l'absence de maîtrise de l'approche communautaire utilisée ; (iv) le cloisonnement des composantes, et une absence de coordination des activités du Projet. Par ailleurs, l'articulation des structures partenaires impliquées dans la mise en œuvre du projet n'a véritablement pas fonctionné. En effet le fonctionnement de la DMP et des BET recrutés n'a pas facilité la mise en œuvre des activités du projet. D'autre part, la mauvaise organisation et la faible capacité technique de certaines entreprises ont retardé considérablement l'exécution des activités du projet. L'organigramme du PUAEB avec la création d'une structure de coordination du pôle infrastructure non prévue dans la conception de la structure de base a présenté d'énormes insuffisances et a favorisé l'absence d'un suivi efficient. On a également noté



d'importantes défaillances dans le suivi évaluation, la gestion administrative, le suivi du personnel, l'enregistrement comptable et un classement des archives mal organisé.

18. Les objectifs réajustés du projet ont été formalisés. En effet, certains indicateurs ont été redéfinis avec la réallocation qui a entraîné des modifications des catégories des dépenses. Il s'agit particulièrement de la suppression dans le cadre de résultats de l'indicateur relatif aux cantines scolaires, et de l'indicateur relatif à la mise en place d'un SIGE. La construction des classes et des collèges a été réalisée à 100%. Les indicateurs de scolarisation ainsi que les résultats des élèves dans l'ensemble se sont considérablement améliorés. La disponibilité en manuel scolaire s'est accrue. On note cependant une dégradation des ratios d'encadrement par rapport à 2011/2012. Le ratio élèves/maîtres est passé de 39 en 1998/1999 ; 46 en 2011/2012 et 43,5 en 2015/2016 dépassant la norme nationale qui est de 40 élèves par maître.

19. ***Au niveau de l'impact***, le PUAEB a contribué d'une part au développement de l'enseignement par l'accroissement des effectifs aux différents niveaux du sous-secteur éducation nationale, et d'autre part à l'amélioration de la capacité d'accueil à chaque niveau du sous-secteur et du taux brut de scolarisation. La gratuité des manuels scolaires dans le primaire a permis de soulager certains parents d'élèves. Cependant des efforts restent encore à faire puisque près de 2 enfants sur 10 en âge d'aller à l'école n'y vont pas. Le Projet a également eu un impact positif sur le renforcement et la consolidation des relations de travail entre le Gouvernement, les établissements / administrations et les communautés. Nombre des activités soutenues par le projet ont accru et renforcé l'interaction des pouvoirs publics et des communautés locales au sein desquelles l'État a réussi à susciter la confiance. Les pouvoirs publics, soutenus par le projet, ont pu y parvenir en : (i) faisant une offre de services efficaces et transparents (au moyen de l'utilisation de comités d'établissement comprenant les parents, responsables des frais de fonctionnement de l'établissement) ; (ii) fournissant un financement pour couvrir les frais de fonctionnement des établissements et le salaire des enseignants ; (iii) permettant aux parties prenantes de participer au processus de prise de décision et de suivre l'utilisation des fonds ; et (iv) modernisant le cadre juridique du secteur éducatif.

20. ***L'évaluation économique et financière*** du PUAEB s'est faite à partir du coût de base du projet, des demandes de remboursement des fonds (DRF), et surtout du suivi à partir des documents de la Banque tirés dans « World Bank Client Connection ». Le PUAEB a été très lent à s'exécuter. Le rapport de septembre 2014 (revue à mi-parcours) donne un très faible taux de décaissement (25%) et l'on peut dire que l'activité n'a vraiment démarré qu'en septembre 2015 et a atteint un taux de décaissement de 82,73% en fin septembre 2016. Le niveau de décaissement s'est accéléré avec la restructuration intervenue le 30 septembre 2016 pour atteindre un taux de décaissement de 98,82% le 25/07/2017, soit un montant global décaissé de **\$ US 40,9 millions**.

21. Le financement du PUAEB dans sa formulation n'a pas prévu de contrepartie ivoirienne. Toutefois et malgré les difficultés de trésorerie, la partie ivoirienne a pu soutenir les actions du projet en injectant 986,940 millions de FCFA. Ces fonds ont servi au paiement des indemnités du Contrôleur Financier et de ses agents ; de l'Agent comptable ; et du personnel du PUAEB non pris en charge par l'IDA ; la période de grâce et la purge des droits coutumiers (indemnités d'éviction des exploitants agricoles).

22. Le PUAEB a connu d'énormes difficultés dans sa gestion financière et technique. Les principales insuffisances portent sur : **(i)** la qualité du personnel recruté, qui pour la plupart n'avait pas une



expérience suffisante en matière de gestion des projets ; **(ii)** des partenaires qui n'avaient pas la même compréhension de la gestion du projet ; **(iii)** l'absence de programmation des activités et d'un suivi technique insuffisant ; et **(iv)** l'absence d'une véritable programmation budgétaire et d'un suivi financier efficient. Ces difficultés rencontrées au cours de la mise en œuvre du PUAEB devraient aider à mieux adapter les moyens aux différentes actions à engager dans le futur.

### **En guise de conclusion**

23. Le PUAEB, au moment où il s'achève, laisse au système éducatif ivoirien, des équipements, du matériel roulant, des salles de classes, du matériel de qualité (programmes APC, manuels et guides pédagogiques et une structure d'évaluation). La fin du projet laisse entrevoir des risques de détérioration des acquis, essentiellement liés aux difficultés de suivi et d'entretien de ces immobilisations (véhicules ; matériel informatique et matériel de bureau ; matériel didactique des CAFOP ; et réalisations). La stratégie pour la rénovation et la construction d'écoles de qualité à moindre coût et les directives associées développées et adoptées pour ce projet constitue une réalisation importante. Le soutien à ce type de stratégies, associées à des normes et des directives, peut être un instrument utile pour une construction scolaire économique. *Certes les coûts de construction ont diminué tout au long du projet, parfois au détriment de la qualité. Des réflexions du genre faut-il construire le même type d'école avec des modes différents et les mêmes coûts comme c'est le cas, ou alors adapter un plan type par mode avec des coûts réalistes ?*



## **ANNEX 6. SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS**

Country Partnership Framework for the Republic of Cote d'Ivoire, for the period FY16-19, August 17, 2015.

Emergency Project Paper on a Proposed Global Partnership for Education Fund Grant in the Amount of US\$41.4 Million to the Republic of Cote D'Ivoire for an Emergency Basic Education Support Project, April 2, 2012.

Global Partnership for Education Fund Grant Agreement, Emergency Basic Education Support Project between Republic of Cote d'Ivoire and International Development Association acting as Administrator of the Global partnership for Education Fund, June 16, 2012.

Plan Sectoriel Education/Formation 2016 – 2025, April 2017.

Rapport d'achèvement de la mise en œuvre et des résultats sur un don d'un montant de 41,4 millions \$US à la République de la Côte d'Ivoire pour un Projet d'Urgence d'Appui à l'éducation de base (TF 12500) document définitif 31 juillet 2017. (Full Borrower's ICR).

Rapport a Mi-Parcours du PUAEB, August 2014. (Mid-term Review)

Rapport Trimestriel (01 avril-30 juin 2017), Don IDA No.TF12500, Juillet 2017 (and other Quarterly Reports)

Restructuring Papers 1 (August 2015), 2 (October 2016) and 3 (May 2017).



**ANNEX 7. RESULTS FRAMEWORK AND OFFICIAL REVISION**

<b>Project Appraisal Document 04/2011</b>	<b>Restructuring Paper 1 08/05/2015</b>	<b>Restructuring Paper 2 10/17/2016</b>	<b>Restructuring Paper 3 04/06/2017</b>
<b>PDO Indicators and targets</b>			
1. Number of additional qualified primary teachers resulting from project intervention-7,500	No change	Target increased to 15,200	No change
2. Number of additional classrooms at the primary level resulting from project intervention, (i) built-1000 (ii) rehabilitated 500	Change target from 500 to 267	No change	No change
3. Direct project beneficiaries (number) (i) students enrolled in primary schools built by the project-60,000; (ii) students enrolled in "collèges de proximité" constructed by the project-2,400; (iii) of which % of female-45%	RP states 235,000-no change, but appears to add detail and raise targets. Colleges-72,000 Primary-135,000	62,400 (same as original)	Total-53,080 Primary-50,680
4. System for learning assessment at the primary level-rating scale-3	No change	No change	No change
5. Timely annual production of reliable school statistics (yes/no)	No change	No change	No change
	Utility of the learning system-rating of 3 out of 4. Triggered because of "Yes" answer to creation of learning assessment.	No change	No change
<b>Intermediate Indicators and Targets</b>			
<b>Component 1: Restoring and Increasing Access to Basic Education Services</b>			
Number of girls receiving incentives-450	No change	No change	No change
<b>Component 2: Rehabilitating and improving the quality of teaching and learning</b>			
Teachers trained in service-15,000	No change	Target increased to 16,500	No change
Number of textbooks purchased and	No change	No change	No change





distributed-1,000,000 (cumulative)			
Student-teacher ratio in publicly financed schools (disaggregated by region)-40:1	No change	Target changed to 43:1, mainly because of decree of mandatory universal primary and lower secondary education.	No change
Number of children receiving food supplies as a result of project intervention-60,000	No change	Dropped food, but not health portion	No change
<b>Component 3: Restoring and strengthening institutional capacity to deliver quality basic education</b>			
EMIS in place and functioning-yes/no	No change	No change-proposed though decision made to drop was formalized in RP3	Dropped (formally)
Number of heads of DREN, school directors, inspectors and pedagogical advisors trained-3,000	No change	Target increased to 8,500	No change
Number of COGES (SMCs) trained-3,000	No change	No change	No change

Restructuring Paper 1-US\$22.36 disbursed of US\$41.40

Restructuring Paper 2-US\$34.25 disbursed of US\$41.40

Restructuring paper 3-US\$39.48 disbursed of US\$41.40

In several instances, the PIU increased the target though it did not have to. This was to signal that project efforts need not stop at the original target level. In other words, the results framework was communicating to the project that it could and should attain higher targets.



## **ANNEX 8. L'APPUI A LA SCOLARISATION DES FILLES**

Trois activités :

- (i) la réalisation de campagne de sensibilisation à la scolarisation et au maintien des jeunes filles à l'école dans 67 localités de sous-scolarisation des filles ayant permis la création de 67 Club de Mères d'Elèves Filles (CMEF) pour assurer la veille et la continuité de la sensibilisation.

Les effets sont captés à travers les témoignages des directeurs d'établissements. Ainsi, à l'EPP Konan Cocotikro (IEP Bobokro), le directeur a indiqué que suite à la campagne, l'effectif du CP1 est passé de 27 enfants inscrits à 77 dans le courant du 1<sup>er</sup> trimestre dont 24 filles.

- (ii) l'organisation de deux sessions de récompenses des filles les plus méritantes (463 filles) aux trois examens de grands tirages (CEPE ; BEPC, BAC) sur toute l'étendue du territoire. Les prix étaient constitués de manuels scolaires pour les filles du CEPE et du BEPC et d'ordinateurs Laptop pour le niveau BAC. A ces présents, les lauréats recevaient des diplômes d'honneur et recevaient les félicitations de hautes personnalités (ministres, premiers responsables d'organisations internationales).

Critères de sélection des filles excellentes :

- **CEPE**

Critère éligibilité

- Avoir une moyenne à l'examen supérieure à 16/20

Nombre de bénéficiaires :

- 1<sup>ere</sup> édition : 150 meilleures
- 2<sup>e</sup> édition : 82 meilleures

- **BEPC**

Critère éligibilité

- Avoir une moyenne à l'examen supérieure à 16/20

Nombre de bénéficiaires :

- 1<sup>ere</sup> édition : 100 meilleures
- 2<sup>e</sup> édition : 41 meilleures

- **BAC**

Critère éligibilité

- Avoir une moyenne à l'examen supérieure à 14/20

Nombre de bénéficiaires :

- 1<sup>ere</sup> édition : 50 meilleures
- 1<sup>ere</sup> édition : 40 meilleures

- (iii) le financement d'une étude sur les déterminants des grossesses en milieu scolaire et le partage des résultats avec la communauté éducative.

Cette étude a eu le mérite de relancer les débats sur le phénomène et ainsi de poursuivre la sensibilisation.

Toujours est-il que les 2017-2018, indique une régression des cas de grossesse qui sont passé de 4 717 cas à 3 935 cas de grossesse en, cours de scolarité entre 2015 et 2017.