



<b>1. Project Data:</b>		<b>Date Posted :</b> 08/20/2001	
<b>PROJ ID:</b> P005904		<b>Appraisal</b>	<b>Actual</b>
<b>Project Name:</b> Basic Education	<b>Project Costs (US\$M)</b>	33.5	29.1
<b>Country:</b> Yemen	<b>Loan/Credit (US\$M)</b>	19.7	18.7
<b>Sector(s):</b> Board: ED - Primary education (76%), Tertiary education (17%), Central government administration (7%)	<b>Cofinancing (US\$M)</b>	8.5	8.1
<b>L/C Number:</b> C2412			
	<b>Board Approval (FY)</b>		92
<b>Partners involved :</b> Netherlands Government	<b>Closing Date</b>	06/30/1998	04/30/2001
<b>Prepared by :</b>	<b>Reviewed by :</b>	<b>Group Manager :</b>	<b>Group:</b>
Helen Abadzi	William B. Hurlbut	Alain A. Barbu	OEDST
<b>2. Project Objectives and Components</b>			
<b>a. Objectives</b>			
The SAR objectives were to:			
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Increase the school participation rate for girls in rural areas by increasing the number of classrooms, improving their utilization and promoting recruitment of female teachers .</li> <li>2. Lay the foundation for improvement of the quality of basic education through developing a cost -effective distance education, a system for in-service teacher training, a unified curriculum, a textbook series and a standardized student achievement test .</li> </ol>			
<b>b. Components</b>			
Project costs of \$29.1 million comprised:			
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Civil works (64%)</b></li> <li>2. <b>Equipment, furniture, materials and vehicles (21%)</b></li> <li>3. <b>Technical assistance and training (14%)</b></li> <li>4. <b>Project Implementation Unit Costs (2%)</b></li> </ol>			
The cost components given in the annex do not correspond to components discussed in the text . The headings used in the text are a listing of the activities sorted by order of the objectives .			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Expansion of education and access for girls</b> - (i) classroom construction, furnishing and maintenance; and (ii) recruitment and training of female teachers for project schools, including provision of housing and promotional campaigns.</li> <li>• <b>Improvement of Educational Quality</b> - comprising two inter-related activities of curriculum and textbook development, and training for supervision and testing .</li> <li>• <b>Enhancement of Teacher Effectiveness</b> - Establishment of a Distance Education Center (DEC) which would provide unqualified teachers with training through a combination of self -learning materials, personal contact sessions and student counselling .</li> </ul>			
<b>c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates</b>			
Additional funding from the Netherlands allowed the number of classrooms constructed to be increased from 600 to 1124. The provision of a special housing and transportation allowance, planned as an incentive for recruitment of female teachers, was cancelled when a new "Teacher Law" established a system of rural allowances for all teachers in remote areas.			
<b>3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:</b>			
<b>Expansion of education and access to girls</b> - Enrollments in project schools increased from 23,721 to 73,768 during the period from 1990/91 to 1999/00. Female enrollment increased from 34% to 43% during the same period. It is impossible to separate the contribution of the project from that of general social change in Yemeni society . Despite the achievements, data show that class repetition and drop -out remain critical issues for girls in rural areas; for 1999/2000 female enrollment in project schools was 52% in first grade, declining to 37% by sixth grade. Nationwide in rural areas only 28% of school age girls attend schools . Classroom construction targets were met and			

50% allocated for girls. There was some promotion to increase female recruitment, but the increases achieved were not sufficient to match the requirements of project classes (452 female teachers available versus an SAR target 800.)

**Enhancement of teacher effectiveness** - This has not yet been achieved although indirectly the curriculum subcomponent under Improvement of Educational Quality did improve teacher effectiveness . The Distance Education Center (DEC), the main means for providing in-service training, is still not operational owing to the adoption of inappropriate technology at the design stage and delays in delivery of equipment .

**Improvement of Educational Quality** - Significant contributions were made to laying the foundation for improving quality of basic education by providing higher -quality inputs - (a) a new curriculum and textbooks for grades 1-6 were developed; (b) training sessions, to introduce the new curriculum, were conducted as planned and then extended to reach 100,000 teachers; (c) the capacity of the Educational Research and Development Center was increased; (d) the first two of three evaluations of training have been carried out and achievement was rated as positive; (e) outputs of teacher supervision and student achievement evaluation were only modest . Funding is inadequate for both and standardized achievement tests are not conducted on a regular basis .

#### 4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:

1. The project provided incremental assistance to Yemen's ongoing program of school construction and has improved the quality of inputs through staff, curriculum and instructional development .
2. The project work on resolving construction quality issues, and providing in -service teacher training through distance education, is being continued under the auspices of the Basic Education Expansion Project (BEEP).
3. The new curriculum has corrected shortcomings in the old . There were two political regimes before reunification and the new curriculum helped to integrate the Yemeni child's conflicting ideological and cultural perceptions . The new syllabi are represented by 70 textbooks and accompanying teacher's manuals for six grades . These have been distributed and training conducted .
4. The agreement between IDA and Government on principles governing project management units in Yemen has now limited the functions of PIUs to administrative matters . The Ministry of Education (MOE) has been the first to consolidate existing operations under the management of one agency; this has reduced the isolation of the project unit from the line directorates of the ministry .

#### 5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):

1. Supervision of the construction program was inadequate and there were also delays and inadequacies in design.
2. Project management arrangements were not effective initially, but they were improved by major revisions during implementation. Financial management and internal control were weak, both because of ineffective project structure and lack of financial operations manuals .
3. The program, designed to reach 6,000 teachers through the DEC was very expensive and lacked means for effective interaction between targeted trainees . A new approach using 20 regional teacher training institutes will be substituted under the follow-on BEEP.
4. Pilot-testing of textbooks before going to full-scale production was bypassed by the MOE . Errors were subsequently discovered leading to delays in production and distribution .
5. The Educational Development Centre's (EDC) technical assistance team did not establish a good working relationship with the staff. This contributed to the low level of achievement of the EDC subcomponent and failure to complete the development of a model mechanism for testing school achievement .
6. Overall progress was slow, partly due to the civil war conditions .

6. Ratings :	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
<b>Outcome :</b>	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
<b>Institutional Dev .:</b>	Modest	Modest	
<b>Sustainability :</b>	Highly Likely	Likely	But still fragile because of the high dependency on IDA and other donor funding.
<b>Bank Performance :</b>	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	However the skills mix was not always adequate (especially for procurement) and there were 4 task managers during the life of the project.
<b>Borrower Perf .:</b>	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
<b>Quality of ICR :</b>		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '\*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

#### 7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

1. Women teachers in Yemen - married or unmarried - prefer to get allowances in cash and to have their accommodations in villages where the social life is better compared to living in schools .
2. For Yemen's education sector it is better to enhance the Ministry's normal services and have them execute the

- functions of the PIU and other implementing institutions, rather than establish the PIU as an independent body .
3. Weak consultation processes increases construction costs and the number of land -related disputes.
  4. A procurement capacity assessment should be part of the project's appraisal .
  5. The Borrower has concluded that long-term technical assistance contracts have "more disadvantages than advantages" and short-term low-cost contracts for partial tasks are both more effective and efficient .
  6. High technology approaches to training should only be used when a client has the capacity to support its use .

**8. Assessment Recommended?** ☐ Yes ☒ No

**9. Comments on Quality of ICR:**

Satisfactory.