



1. Project Data :		Date Posted : 06/27/2000	
PROJ ID : P001552 OEDID : C2382		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name : Manpower Training Project	Project Costs (US\$M)	31.5	27.46
Country : Madagascar	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	22.8	23.04
Sector, Major Sect .: Other Social Sector, Social Protection & Other Sector	Cofinancing (US\$M)	3.9	2.28
L/C Number : C2382			
	Board Approval (FY)		92
Partners involved : UNDP	Closing Date	06/30/1998	06/30/1999
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group :
Helen Abadzi	Ridley Nelson	Ridley Nelson	OEDST

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives
(a) establish a system to develop technical vocational education and training (TVET) policy and promote, coordinate, finance training by private and public training institutions and employers; (b) establish a system to provide information about labor market needs; (c) rehabilitate and reform the public TVET system, increase quality and external efficiency; (d) commence the process of agricultural education and training reform; (e) develop a training system for senior civil servants.

b. Components
(a) Development of the National Council of Technical and Vocational Education, including a training fund; (b) technical assistance and civil works towards restructuring the TVET system; (c) labor market information system development; (d) agricultural education training and reform; (e) training for senior civil servants. The project financed training, civil works, equipment, and technical assistance.

c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates
The project became effective on 1/15/1993, disbursed completely, and closed one after the initial closing date of 6/30/98.

3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives :
Implementation of project objectives proved unrealistic given the magnitude of reforms required and degree of commitment and mobilization of the main players involved. Most objectives were not achieved or were partially achieved, and the quality of preservice vocational -technical education remains very poor. The system to generate and analyze labor market information did not function. Agricultural training reform did not take place, senior civil servants were not trained during the life of the project. However, the private sector received much training, information, and coordination, and private-sector provision of training has greatly increased.

4. Significant Outcomes /Impacts :
Physical activities, such as civil works and equipment were substantially completed, and the institutions increased enrollments by 4000 students. Modular vocational training courses were developed, attended by 2067 students in 30 specialties in 1998/99, but their quality was uncertain. Training activities were carried out for 140 center managers and 200 teachers, and 638 subprojects were executed, benefiting 18,277 workers, 25% of whom were women. For the academic year 1999/2000, training was planned for 168 senior civil servants. TVET activities were refocused to target the poorest trainees.

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):
Objectives were too disparate and encompassed multiple institutions. Government commitment to the project was limited, there was no monitoring and evaluation system. The amount spent in various activities (US\$27.46 million) vs. the poor outcomes raises questions regarding the efficiency of the operation.

--	--	--	--

6. Ratings:	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome:	Satisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Objectives were not achieved or were partially achieved.
Institutional Dev .:	Partial	Modest	
Sustainability:	Uncertain	Uncertain	
Bank Performance:	Deficient	Unsatisfactory	Low quality at entry
Borrower Perf .:	Deficient	Unsatisfactory	Limited government commitment
Quality of ICR:		Unsatisfactory	

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability :

It is hard to carry out extensive systemic reforms when government commitment is low .

Disparate objectives contribute to unsatisfactory project outcomes .

It is very difficult to ascertain what a project has accomplished without a monitoring and evaluation system .

Lessons for implementing vocational education reform include : (i) need to reinforce the strategic steering of the reform; (ii) need to define or clarify government responsibilities and integrate the private sector in the strategy; (iii) importance of autonomy and a implementation of reform at the training institute level; (iv) use of inservice training as a model for preservice programs; (v) need for financing arrangements and modalities consistent with the targeting of beneficiaries.

8. Audit Recommended? Yes No

Why? The region and OED disagree on the outcome rating of the project .

9. Comments on Quality of ICR :

The ICR gave confusing information with respect to accomplishments in each objective and did not base its evaluations on the objectives as listed in the Staff Appraisal Report or on targets achieved (e.g. how many buildings were built, how technical assistance funds were spent). Though expected outcomes were often described as not having been achieved, they were nevertheless rated as satisfactory .