CASCR Review Independent Evaluation Group

1. CAS Data	
Country: Guyana	
CAS Year: FY2002	CAS Period : FY2003 – FY2005
CASCR Review Period: FY2003 - FY2008	Date of this review: May 18, 2009

2. Executive Summary

- (i) The CAS's main development objective was to help create the conditions for a sustained reduction of poverty levels in Guyana. The objective was supported by three reform pillars that corresponded to the key priorities outlined in the country's Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP): (1) stimulate economic growth through sound macroeconomic management, efficient implementation of the public investment program (especially in the sugar sector), and improved environment for private business; (2) improve public governance and accountability by strengthening oversight systems and building capacity; and (3) enhance the provision of, and access to, basic services and safety nets. The Bank's assistance strategy was supported by programmatic loans and three investment projects amounting to US\$47.7 million and five grants/trust funds amounting to US\$16.09 million. It also provided substantial complementary analytical and advisory services.
- (ii) Although Guyana's macroeconomic performance was acceptable and some progress was shown in advancing the reforms agenda, reduction in poverty was below target: the rate of poverty remained the same during the review period. Giving more weight to the poor outcome in poverty reduction, IEG rates the overall outcome as *moderately unsatisfactory*. The Bank's assistance strategy was overly ambitious although it made adjustments during the implementation period. Its contribution to the outcome is rated as *moderately satisfactory*.
- (iii) Under Pillar I: The objective of stimulating economic growth was partially achieved. Although the target was not met, average GDP growth was 2.4 percent per annum for the 2003-2008 period, almost double the rate for the three prior years. Macroeconomic performance was acceptable and fiscal policy and budget management reforms were partially achieved. Measures were implemented to improve the environment for private sector development and the performance of the sugar sector, but they have not been effective. The reforms of the forestry and mining sectors did not progress much. IEG rates the achievement of Pillar I's objectives as moderately satisfactory.
- (iv) Under Pillar II: The objectives of improving public governance and accountability and strengthening oversight systems were modestly achieved with some progress in public procurement and finance management where laws were passed, but institutional follow through was weak. Little progress was made in local government reform and the PRSP monitoring and evaluation was established for a few years, but disbanded in 2007. The modest progress made was despite the government's tepid support for these reforms. IEG rates the achievement of Pillar II's objectives as moderately unsatisfactory.
- (v) Under Pillar III: The objectives of enhancing basic services and safety nets were partially achieved. The objectives of improving access to quality education and addressing the HIV/AIDS problem were substantially achieved, but water sector reforms suffered when the public-private partnership collapsed and were only partially achieved and efficiency in social assistance programs did not improve. IEG rates the achievement of Pillar III's objectives as moderately satisfactory.
- (vi) The CASCR focuses on outcomes and discusses their attribution to Bank interventions where appropriate. The key lesson from this review is that Bank's assessment of the government's commitment to, and capacity for, implementing reforms is vital for success of its program.

CASCR Reviewed by:	Peer Reviewed by:	CASCR Review Coordinator
Ashok Khanna	Yadviga Semikolenova	Jaime Jaramillo-Vallejo
Consultant, IEGCR	Economist, IEGCR	Lead Economist, IEGCR



3. CASCR Summary

Overview of CAS Relevance

- 1. <u>Country Context:</u> With a population of less than one million, Guyana is the third smallest and also the third poorest country in the Western Hemisphere with a GDP per capita of US\$1,300 in 2007. It is rich in resources with tropical forests, fertile agricultural land, bauxite, and gold. Guyana has a multi-ethnic population that has led to a fractured democratic polity along racial lines, social unrest, and security problems. Partly for this reason, about half of Guyana's population has emigrated (and over 80 percent with tertiary education) and provides about one-third of GDP in remittances. Despite substantial external assistance, GDP growth stagnated during 1998-2001 and the poverty level was at 36 percent.
- 2. <u>Strategy Objectives:</u> With extensive participation, the government completed a PRSP in 2001, building on an earlier National Development Strategy. The Bank's assistance strategy was to help create conditions for sustained reductions in poverty levels by supporting key PRSP priorities that corresponded to three pillars of the CAS: (1) stimulating economic growth through sound macroeconomic management, efficient implementation of the public investment program (especially in the sugar sector) and improving the environment for private business; (2) improving public governance and accountability by strengthening oversight systems and building capacity; and (3) enhancing the provision of, and access to, basic services and safety nets. Although the Bank's strategy was consistent with Guyana's priorities, the CAS was inconsistent at three levels. First, the CAS objectives were much broader and ambitious compared to the narrow and focused nature of areas and instruments selected to achieve those objectives, calling into question the relevance of the design. Second, the CAS performance indicators did not fully concord with the pillar objectives. And third, those performance indicators did not fully correspond with the country program matrix.
- 3. <u>Services:</u> Prior experience with project lending to Guyana had been uneven because of poor design, inadequate local capacity and procurement issues. Moreover, IDA lending was small compared with other donors. For these reasons, the Bank decided to emphasize its comparative advantage in policy dialogue and donor coordination by supporting policy reforms through annual single-tranche poverty reduction support credits and technical assistance to develop capacity for implementation. This strategy was buttressed by economic and sector work that would refine the policy agenda and monitor and evaluate the impact of the PRSP. The conditions for a *low case* scenario that would delay adjustment lending were clearly stated, but their achievement relied on subjective judgment. While the Bank's proposed lending and non-lending assistance was consistent with its strategy, it may not have been realistic in view of the recognized difficult social, political, and security situation and low implementation capacity.

Overview of CAS Implementation

Lending

4. Over the entire FY2003-09 period covered by the CASCR, Bank lending amounted to US\$47.7 million. Of this amount, 45 percent was allocated to two programmatic loans and the remainder to three projects. In addition, the Bank was also involved in Guyana through trust funds and grants amounting to US\$16.09 million during FY2003-09. It managed three Education for All/Fast Track Initiative (EFA/FTI) grants of US\$4 million each during FY2005-07. The Global Environment Facility (GEF) grant for National Protected Area Systems was dropped, but a GEF grant of US\$3.8 million for preservation of conservancy areas was started in 2008. Finally, the country received a Trust Fund grant of US\$285,000 in 2006 for capacity building in the Bureau of Statistics.



- 5. Bank lending for FY2003-05 was US\$26.8 million, which fell somewhat short of the planned base case program of US\$30 million. The proposed reliance on programmatic lending reflected past problems with project execution and the need to address important policy issues. Difficulties arose with this approach early when PRSC I's effectiveness was delayed by ten months because of tardy revisions of the Procurement Act. At the same time, the macroeconomic program temporarily went off-track and political disruptions accelerated, hampering the implementation of the poverty reduction strategy. These developments exposed the weakness of the government's commitment to the reform agenda and proved the CAS's original annual PRSC schedule to be overly ambitious and unrealistic. The CAS had assumed strong government commitment to reforms, but progress was patchy at best. Although the CASCR is silent on whether the low case scenario was triggered, the planned adjustment lending was halted. The Bank also processed the planned Public Sector Technical Assistance Credit (PSTAC) and HIV/AIDS Prevention projects; the amount of the latter was doubled to US\$10 million.
- 6. During FY2006-09, Bank lending amounted to US\$20.9 million, although there was no CAS for this period. Because of weak government commitment to reforms PRSC II was dropped. Instead, the Bank processed the Poverty Reduction and Public Management Operation (PRPMO), also a budget support operation, but focused on a few areas where the government had already made progress, building partly on the studies under PSTAC. However, the government did not follow up on its commitments in some key policy reforms such as the regulatory framework for mining and forestry, local government reform, limiting the use of officials' discretionary powers, and failed to establish an effective framework for monitoring PRSP's implementation. Judging the policy reform process to be difficult, the Bank decided to return to project lending by adding a Water Sector Consolidation project.

Portfolio Performance

7. IEG rated six projects that exited the portfolio during FY2003-09. Their satisfactory outcome rating both by number and amount was about 80 percent, approximately the same level as for the region and the Bank. Among the completed projects, QAG rated the quality at entry for PRPMO as moderately unsatisfactory because the government's ownership of the project and its focus on poverty alleviation were weak. QAG also reviewed the quality of supervision for the Secondary Education project and rated it as satisfactory. Currently, there are two projects in the portfolio and they are not considered at risk. In the latest implementation status and results reports (ISRs), the development objective and implementation progress ratings for the HIV/AIDS Prevention project are satisfactory and for the Water Sector Consolidation project moderately satisfactory. Two grants are also active. Their latest ISR ratings for development objective and implementation progress are Highly Satisfactory for EFA/FTI and Satisfactory for GEF Conservancy Adaptation. IDA's net disbursement for FY2003-08 was US\$50.18 million.

Non-Lending Services

8. Except for the Governance review, which was substituted for by two studies (see below), all the planned analytical and advisory services were delivered, although the poverty assessment was delayed by four years. In addition, several unplanned reports were completed or are on-going, including an Investment Climate Assessment, Financial Sector Assessment Program (FSAP), Public Expenditure and Financial Accountability Review (PEFA), and Integrated Fiduciary Assessment (substitutes for the Governance Review). Moreover, informal technical assistance was provided by reviewing several client documents such as on water supply and flood control. QAG did not review the analytical work for Guyana. The technical reports such as on investment climate, poverty and public expenditure informed policy dialogue with the government and facilitated donor coordination, but the general reports, such as the Development Policy Review, had less impact.



Overview of Achievement by Objective:

- 9. The CAS's overall objective was to help create the conditions for a sustained reduction of poverty levels in the country. Achieving this objective was supported by PRSC I, PSTAC, PRPMO, EFA-FTI (school feeding program) and the Development Policy Review and Poverty Assessment, although the latter was completed towards the end of the period under review.
- 10. Despite progress in improving macroeconomic performance and advancing some reforms, both the overall and extreme poverty rates have remained unchanged since 1999. Thus, the targeted reduction in overall poverty incidence to 31 percent by 2005 was not achieved, primarily because of low per capita GDP growth (see below). Some progress was registered in the urban and rural coastal areas, but the population in the interior remains very poor. Although Guyana has several social protection programs, the safety net system is weak and the coverage is limited. Moreover, the poverty monitoring and evaluation system included in PRPMO and supported by PSTAC, was established, but later disbanded when the technical assistance funds ended (see below).

Pillar I: Stimulate Economic Growth

11. The objective under this pillar was to stimulate economic growth through sound macroeconomic management, efficient implementation of the public investment program (especially in the sugar sector) and improving the environment for private business. The Bank supported the achievement of these objectives with PRSC I, PSTAC, PRPMO, and the Financial and Private Sector Development Project, which was ongoing at the start of the CAS period. The Bank also provided analytical support from the Development Policy Review, Public Expenditure Review, Investment Climate Assessment, FSAP Guyana and the PEFA, Integrated Fiduciary Assessment, and Reports on the Observance of Standards and Codes Accounting and Auditing Module (ROSC A&A).

(a) <u>Maintain macroeconomic stability under the PRSP and the IMF's Poverty Reduction and</u> Growth Facility (PRGF)

12. Macroeconomic targets were substantially met. Inflation averaged 6 percent between 2002 and 2006, slightly higher than the target of 5 percent, but shot up to 12 percent in 2007. The fiscal deficit remained under the 9 percent target until 2005 and 2006 when it overshot to accommodate investments in the sugar sector and infrastructure. It came down to 9 percent in 2007 because revenue increased after the VAT was introduced and tax administration improved. Expenditure was also contained by an improved Public Sector Investment Program process. Economic growth did not meet the PRSP/PRGF target of 2.7 percent per annum, averaging 2.4 percent for the 2003 to 2008 period.

(b) Strengthen fiscal policy and budget management

- 13. Although there was no detailed medium term expenditure framework, almost all ministries and regions have program budgets, but the use of performance indicators remains weak and the integration of capital and recurrent expenditures has just begun. Thus, investment decisions are not yet linked to sector strategies. Moreover, the five-year Public Sector Investment Program was neither produced on time nor prioritized. An integrated financial management and accounting system that helps expenditure control has been implemented, however. The government agreed on a formula for public sector wage increases, a condition of PRSC I.
- 14. In 2003, the government began to reform the tax system. It has since introduced the VAT and complementary excise regulations, eliminated discretionary tax exemptions, limited tax holidays, increased withholding taxes and strengthened the Guyana Revenue Authority with technical assistance support from PSTAC.

CASCR Review
Independent Evaluation Group

(c) Private sector development

15. An Investment Act (prepared with IFC support) and a Small Business Act were passed, providing transparency and clarifying investor rights. A new chief executive was appointed for the investment promotion agency. A Competition and Fair Trading Bill was passed, that enabled establishing the National Competition Commission and designing a National Competitiveness Strategy. Despite these measures, as the Investment Climate Assessment points out, private sector development is constrained by security difficulties, cumbersome legal and judicial enforcement, long customs clearance times and poor, unreliable, and expensive infrastructure.

(d) Sugar sector modernization

16. The sugar sector is critical for Guyana as it accounts for 16 percent of GDP, 25 percent of foreign exchange earnings and affects the livelihood of 75,000 people. Because of its importance, the Bank and other donors helped to design a comprehensive restructuring program for the sector that included a large new sugar mill. After initial delays, and with the Bank's support under PRSC, Guyana Sugar Corporation's implementation of reforms is on track. It has strengthened its financial viability, introduced a wage policy and agreed on a management contract with a private operator. However, the projected profitability and labor force downsizing have not been attained, but the company operates without a government subsidy. The Bank also helped prepare and implement an Environmental Management Plan for the new sugar mill and GEF (2008) funding will assist with water management in the conservancy area. Its analytical support included a Poverty and Social Impact Analysis (PSIA).

(e) Regulatory framework for forestry and mining

- 17. The forestry and mining sectors are important for Guyana's future exports and growth. The government was expected to submit a Mining Bill to Parliament to improve regulations. It was drafted with the support of the Bank's technical assistance, but its approval has been delayed repeatedly. On the other hand, the government passed a Forestry Bill in January 2009, to help improve the sustainable management of Guyana's forest resources. Preparation and submission to Parliament of these laws were included as conditions in PRSC I and PRPMO.
- 18. The pillar's objective of stimulating economic growth was partially achieved. Although the target was not met, average GDP growth was 2.4 percent per annum for the 2003-2008 period, almost double the rate for the three prior years. While macroeconomic performance was acceptable and fiscal policy, budget management, and private and sugar sector reforms were partially achieved, forestry and mining sectors reforms did not progress much. For these reasons, IEG rates achievement of Pillar I's objectives as moderately satisfactory.

Pillar II. Improve Public Sector Governance and Accountability

19. The objectives under this pillar were to improve public sector governance and accountability by strengthening oversight systems and increase efficiency by building capacity. The Bank supported the achievement of these objectives with PRSC I, PSTAC, PRPMO and the Trust Fund grant to the Bureau of Statistics. The Bank also provided analytical support from the Country Procurement Assessment Report (CPAR, 1999), Integrated Fiduciary Assessment, Country Financial Accountability Assessment (CFAA, 2002), Public Expenditure Review, Poverty Assessment, and PEFA.

(a) Public procurement reform

20. The National Procurement Act (2002) and the amending Tender and Procurement Act (2003) incorporated CPAR recommendations and provided the basis for regulations and oversight. PRPMO



supported the adoption of regulations and preparation of international standard bidding documents and evaluation criteria. The Parliamentary Public Procurement Commission that was supposed to provide oversight was not created, however. The burden of providing guidance has fallen on the overstretched National Procurement and Tender Administration. Its staff has received training from PSTAC, but attrition has eroded capability. A Procurement System Assessment done as a part of the Integrated Fiduciary Assessment rated Guyana's system as "moderately low" for its legislative and regulatory framework and "very low" for its institutional framework, operations and integrity and transparency. Guyana's Corruption Perception Index score has remained steady at about 2.6 between 2002 and 2008.

(b) Improve public sector financial management

- 21. The CFAA pointed out weaknesses in Guyana's budgeting, accounting, auditing, and oversight of public finances. Since 2003, various initiatives have addressed these weaknesses. Financial controls have improved with the introduction of the Integrated Financial Management System. With PRPMO support, an Audit Act was passed in 2004 and the Audit Office has begun to use international audit standards and delivered an audit opinion on the 2004 and 2005 government financial statements, but these reports have not been reviewed by Parliament's Public Accounts Committee for over two years.
- 22. Under PRSC I, measures were introduced to strengthen fiduciary oversight. Consultants financed by PSTAC prepared a study on parliamentary oversight that has improved its review of the budget and external audits. Tax reforms mentioned above have reduced officials' discretionary powers, but no progress was made in the public disclosure of their assets.

(c) Implement local government reform

23. Actions under PRSC I included improving the framework for fiscal transfers to local authorities and building their capacity to mobilize revenue. The government made little progress in this area, but did take steps to improve the system of local tax assessments and ease the seizure of defaulter's property. Overall, there was no support from the government for serious reform of local government.

(d) Establish effective monitoring and evaluation of PRSP implementation

- 24. A Policy Coordination and Program Management Unit (PCPRMU) was established in the Office of the President in 2003 with support from PRSC I and PSTAC. Its mandate was to coordinate PRSP strategy implementation, conduct policy analysis, and produce the annual PRS progress report. The Statistics Bureau is being strengthened with the support of PSTAC and the National Statistics Strategy and Statistical Development (TFSCG) grant. There is still no system for tracking budget expenditure that could also permit monitoring of government programs by sector or theme such as poverty alleviation. The PCPRMU was disbanded after the PSTAC fund ended in 2007, seriously reducing the government's ability to prepare the new PRSP. A plan to establish a similar unit in the Ministry of Finance was not carried out.
- 25. The objectives of this pillar were partially achieved with some progress in public procurement and finance management and little progress in local government reform and PRSP monitoring and evaluation. The modest progress made was despite the government's tepid support for these reforms. Thus, IEG rates the achievement of Pillar II's objectives as moderately unsatisfactory.

Pillar III. Improve the Delivery of Social Services and Strengthen the Safety Net

26. The objectives under this pillar were to enhance the provision of, and access to, basic services and safety nets. The Bank supported the achievement of these objectives with PRSC I,



PSTAC, HIV/AIDS project, Water Sector Consolidation Project the on-going Secondary School Reform and Water Supply Technical Assistance and Rehabilitation projects and EFA/FTI grants. The Bank provided analytical support by the Public Expenditure Review, Poverty Assessment, and Water and Sewerage Modernization Report.

(a) Increased access by the poor to quality education

27. The sub-objective was supported by the Secondary School Reform project, PRSC I and three EFA/FTI grants. Outcomes by 2005 were broadly in-line with PRSP targets. Guyana reached 100 percent primary enrollment in 2004 and is making steady progress towards full secondary school enrollment. Repetition and drop-out rates in secondary school remain high, however, and quality indicators are below expectations. Despite training almost 5,000 teachers in the past five years, the student to trained teacher ratio remains high partly because many trained teachers emigrate. Also, the formula system for allocating resources to schools, introduced on a trial basis in PRSC I, was not broadly applied. Nevertheless, despite substantial emigration and poor security Guyana is set to reach the MDG goals for education.

(b) Address the spread of HIV/AIDS

28. Guyana achieved the objective of addressing the HIV/AIDS problem, but did not reverse the spread of the disease as the PRSP intended. The number of reported cases has risen since 2000, but the increase could reflect better outreach, identification, and treatment. The National Plan for HIV/AIDS was prepared with the support of PRSC I. Later, a new plan followed after broad consultations, which is being implemented with the support of the HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control project. Measures include expanding key services for prevention, treatment, care, and support. About 50 percent of the people needing anti-retroviral (ARV) treatment are receiving it and 80 percent of pregnant women have accessed prevention of mother to child transmission (PMTCT) services. Moreover, many government and civil society organizations are helping to reach vulnerable groups. Finally, the Guyana HIV Prevention and Control Act has been revised and it is expected to be approved soon.

(c) Improve the efficiency of social assistance programs

29. Guyana has a number of social assistance programs administered by the Ministry of Labor, Human Services and Social Security, but the benefits are small, poorly targeted and inefficiently provided. With support from PRSC I and PSTAC, four studies made recommendations to ameliorate social assistance programs, but implementation has made little progress and social programs continue to be poorly administered.

(d) Framework for the water sector

30. The government has enacted a new legal and regulatory framework, merged two public water companies and contracted a private operator to manage the new entity. It also launched a program to increase services, reviewed the tariff structure and implemented other measures to improve performance. After disappointing performance, frictions between the government, Guyana Water Incorporated and the managing contractor led to the termination of the contract. The goals for improving access to water and its quality were not met and the integration of accounting systems of the two original companies was not accomplished. Water sector reforms were supported by the Water Sector Consolidation Water Supply Technical Assistance and Rehabilitation projects and Water and Sewerage Modernization Report. In the latest ISR for the Water Sector Consolidation project, the ratings of moderately satisfactory for development objective and implementation progress were



questioned by management because disbursement of project funds was only 37 percent after three years and the Guyana Water Incorporated financial audit for 2007 was not considered satisfactory.

31. The education and HIV/AIDS objectives under this pillar were substantially achieved, but water sector reforms were only partially achieved and efficiency improvements in social assistance programs were limited. Thus, IEG rates the achievement of Pillar III's objectives as moderately satisfactory.

Achievement of CAS O	bjectives		
Objectives	CASCR Rating	IEG Rating	Explanation / Comments
Pillar I: Stimulate Economic Growth	NA	Moderately Satisfactory	While macroeconomic performance was acceptable, economic growth did not reach the target. Fiscal policy and budget management, private and sugar sector reforms were partially achieved; forestry and mining sectors reforms did not progress much.
Pillar II: Improve Public Sector Governance and Accountability:	NA	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Some progress in public procurement and finance management and little progress in local government reform and PRSP monitoring and evaluation.
Pillar III: Improve the Delivery of Social Services and Strengthen the Safety Net	NA	Moderately Satisfactory	The education and HIV/AIDS objectives under this pillar were substantially achieved; water sector reforms were partially achieved; and efficiency improvements in social assistance programs were limited.

Comments on Bank Performance:

- 32. The CAS objectives were aligned with Guyana's PRSP and therefore targeted issues of relevance to Guyana's development challenges. However, the CAS objectives and performance indicators were much broader and ambitious vis a vis the narrow and focused nature of areas and instruments selected to achieve those objectives and targets. As a result, the overall strategic framework seems weak and lacks relevance due to limitations in the design. Its choice of budget support lending instruments was based on the need to tackle a range of important policy issues. This approach was too ambitious and proved to be unrealistic. The Bank adjusted its approach by focusing on a few reforms where the government had already made progress. But the government did not keep its promises even in these areas. Subsequently, the Bank adjusted its approach again to provide support from project lending and grant and trust fund resources. Judging by the performance of projects (see above) that closed or are on-going during the CAS period, supervision was satisfactory.
- 33. Virtually all the planned analytical and advisory services were delivered. In addition, several unplanned reports that were consistent with lending were completed or are on-going. Also, informal technical assistance was provided by reviewing several client documents on topics relevant to the program such as on water supply and flood control. The technical reports, such as on the investment climate, poverty and public expenditure, informed policy dialogue with the government and facilitated donor coordination.



- 34. Although the Bank provides only 6 percent of official assistance to Guyana, it plays an important role in donor coordination. Sector coordination groups are active in many areas including agriculture, water, governance, and public financial management. They are chaired by the government or a lead donor and function with varying degrees of effectiveness. Most coordination still occurs directly between donors, however, and is generally considered to be good.
- 35. The CASCR does not mention any safeguard or fiduciary issues.

4. Overall IEG Assessment

Outcome:	Moderately Unsatisfactory
Bank Performance:	Moderately Satisfactory

Outcome

36. Although Guyana's macroeconomic performance was acceptable, economic growth and reduction in poverty were both below target despite an extension of the CAS period from three to six years. The government substantially achieved the objectives in education and HIV/AIDS. However, it made only partial progress in procurement, public financial management, private sector development and sugar and water sector reforms and little progress in forestry, mining and local government reforms or in improving social assistance programs. Moreover, PRSP monitoring and evaluation was weak. As Guyana is among the poorest countries in the Western Hemisphere, the overall objective of reducing poverty was appropriate and central to the Bank's assistance strategy. Not achieving that objective in an extended CAS period is given more weight than the performance in other pillars in rating the overall outcome. Thus, IEG rates the overall outcome as moderately unsatisfactory.

Bank Performance

37. The Bank's assistance strategy was relevant, but too ambitious and proved to be unrealistic. When it became clear that the government's commitment and capacity were too weak to implement the reform agenda, lending instruments were adjusted. Portfolio performance was in line with regional and Bank-wide experience. The Bank's advisory services provided good support to the lending program. Nevertheless, many objectives were not achieved mainly because the Bank's assessment of the political situation and the government's ownership of the program, and its capacity to implement it were not accurate. Thus, IEG rates bank performance as moderately satisfactory.

5. Assessment of CAS Completion Report

38. The CASCR is candid and well-written. It clarifies the confusion in the CAS between the CAS performance indicators and the Country Program Matrix in Annex 2. It discusses CAS performance indicators, but concentrates on outcomes and attributes them to Bank interventions where appropriate. In a few places, the paper does not discuss developments through 2008. IEG agrees with its findings, especially the lack of consensus for reform and limited capacity for implementation. The CASCR would have benefited by providing more information on achieving some sub-objectives such as education.

6. Findings and Lessons

- 39. IEG agrees with the CASCR's findings and lessons. Salient among them are:
 - (i) Strong government ownership and close cooperation with stakeholders and civil society are critical for formulating and implementing PRSPs. Building this consensus takes time. The Bank's assessment of the consensus and the government's technical capacity for implementing reforms is vital for the success of its program; and
 - (ii) In a socially and politically fractured country with considerable security problems, the Bank's program should factor in more carefully the political economy considerations.

IEG CASCR Review Independent Evaluation Group

Annex Table 1: Planned and Actual Lending, FY03-05 CAS and FY06-08

Base Case Scenario

Annex Table 2: Planned and Actual Analytical and Advisory Work, FY03-08

Annex Table 3a: IEG Project Ratings for Guyana, FY03-08

Annex Table 3b: IEG Project Ratings for Guyana and Comparators, FY03-08

Annex Table 4: Portfolio Status for Guyana and Comparators, FY03-08

Annex Table 5: IBRD / IDA Net Disbursements and Charges Summary Report for Guyana

Annex Table 6: Guyana - Total Net Disbursements of Official Development Assistance and

Official Aid, 2001-2007

Annex Table 7: Economic and Social Indicators for Guyana and Comparators, 2002-2007

Annex Table 8: Guyana -Millennium Development Goals

Annex Table 9: Summary of Achievements of the CAS Objectives

Annex Table 1: Planned and Actual Lending, FY03-05 CAS and FY06-08 Base Case Scenario

	Proposed FY	Approval FY	Proposed Amount	Approved Amount
	гі	F1	(in US\$	million)
Programmed projects				
Public Sector Technical Assistance Credit	2003	2003	4.0	4.8
Poverty Reduction Support Credit I (PRSC)	2003	2003	12.0	12.0
HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control	2004	2004	5.0	10.0
Poverty Reduction Support Credit II	2005	dropped	9.0	dropped
Total Programmed projects FY03-08			30.0	26.8
Non-programmed projects				
Poverty Reduction and Public Management Operation		2006		9.6
Water Sector Consolidation Project		2006		11.3
Total Non-programmed projects FY03-08				20.9
Total projects FY03-08			30.0	47.7

Source: Guyana 2002 CAS and WB Business Warehouse Table 2a.1, 2a.4 and 2a.7 as of 01/29/09.

Annex Table 2: Planned and Actual Analytical and Advisory Work, FY03-08

	Proposed FY	Delivered to Client FY	Output Type
Economic and Sector Work			
Planned (CAS FY03-05)			
Development Policy Review	2003	2003	Report
Poverty Assessment	2004	2008	Report
Governance Review	2005	Dropped	·
Planned Delivery prior to FY03			
PER Update	2002	2003	Report
Non-planned			
Investment Climate Assessment		2006	Report
FSAP Guyana		2006	Report
Integrated Fiduciary Assessment		2008	Report
(IFA/PEFA)			•
ROSC A&Á		Ongoing	
Technical Assistance	·		
Non-planned	,		
Guyana Water & Sewerage (PPIAF)		2003	Client Document Review
Guyana Floods Disaster Assessment		2005	Model/Survey
Poverty Measurement NL TA		2008	Client Document Review

Source: Guyana 2002 CAS and WB Business Warehouse Table ESW/TA 8.1.4 as of 01/29//2009.

Annex Table 3a: IEG Project Ratings for Guyana, FY03-08

Exit FY	Project Name	Total Evaluated (US\$M)	IEG Outcome	IEG Sustainability *	IEG ID Impact *
2003	Financial and Private Sector Institutional Development Project	4.5	Moderately Satisfactory	Unlikely	Negligible
2004	Water Supply TA and Rehabilitation Project	17.3	Satisfactory	Likely	Substantial
	Poverty Reduction Support Credit I (PRSC)	13.4	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Likely	Modest
2005	Secondary Education	15.1	Satisfactory	Likely	Substantial
2007	Poverty Reduction and Public Management Operation	9.8	Satisfactory	#	#
2008	Public Sector Technical Assistance Credit	4.2	Satisfactory	#	#

Source: WB Business Warehouse Table 4a.5 and 4a.6 as of 01/29/09.

Annex Table 3b: IEG Project Ratings for Guyana and Comparators, FY03-08

Region	Total Evaluated (\$M)	Total Evaluated (No)	Outcome % Sat (\$)	Outcome % Sat (No)	Sustainability % Likely (\$)	Sustainability % Likely (No)	Inst Dev Impact % Subst (\$)	Inst Dev Impact % Subst (No)
Guyana	64.3	6	79.2	83.3	91.1	75.0	64.5	50.0
LCR	29,436.7	339	80.9	82.4	73.5	81.3	55.4	56.5
World Bank	100,390.1	1,479	83.5	78.0	73.5	81.3	55.4	56.5

Source: WB Business Warehouse Table 4a.5 and 4a.6 as of 01/29/09.

^{*} With IEG new methodology for evaluating projects, institutional development impact and sustainability are no longer rated separately.

Annex Table 4: Portfolio Status for Guyana and Comparators, FY03-08

	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008
Guyana	•					
# Proj	4	3	2	4	3	2
# Proj At Risk	0	0	0	0	1	0
% At Risk	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	33.3	0.0
Net Comm Amt	51.6	32.1	14.8	35.7	26.1	21.3
Comm At Risk	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	11.3	0.0
% Commit at Risk	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	43.4	0.0
Bolivia						
# Proj	16	14	11	6	5	11
# Proj At Risk	3	4	4	2	2	1
% At Risk	18.8	28.6	36.4	33.3	40.0	9.1
Net Comm Amt	582.5	537.7	462.7	265.6	190.4	272.8
Comm At Risk	111.5	61.8	127.3	105.4	97.0	20.0
% Commit at Risk	19.1	11.5	27.5	39.7	50.9	7.3
Nicaragua						
# Proj	15	16	13	13	11	13
# Proj At Risk	4	1	2	1	2	1
% At Risk	26.7	6.3	15.4	7.7	18.2	7.7
Net Comm Amt	428.1	498.7	369.2	357.3	210.6	250.6
Comm At Risk	94.2	13.5	39.6	12.0	49.6	32.6
% Commit at Risk	22.0	2.7	10.7	3.4	23.6	13.0
Paraguay						
# Proj	5	4	7	6	4	4
# Proj At Risk	3	4	1	3	3	2
% At Risk	60.0	100.0	14.3	50.0	75.0	50.0
Net Comm Amt	152.3	123.0	151.2	117.5	129.0	153.5
Comm At Risk	80.5	123.0	24.0	46.5	120.0	98.0
% Commit at Risk	52.9	100.0	15.9	39.6	93.0	63.8
El Salvador						
# Proj	7	6	8	8	3	2
# Proj At Risk	2	0	2	3	0	0
% At Risk	28.6	0.0	25.0	37.5	0.0	0.0
Net Comm Amt	396.8	380.8	476.0	436.0	184.8	160.8
Comm At Risk	160.8	0.0	160.8	145.2	0.0	0.0
% Commit at Risk	40.5	0.0	33.8	33.3	0.0	0.0
LCR						
# Proj	285	265	268	256	247	261
# Proj At Risk	70	46	59	44	58	60
% At Risk	24.6	17.4	22.0	17.2	23.5	23.0
Net Comm Amt	19,480.0	18,911.1	18,595.3	16,208.0	16,408.1	18,420.6
Comm At Risk	5,836.2	3,580.1	3,831.7	2,557.7	3,584.2	3,666.6
% Commit at Risk	30.0	18.9	20.6	15.8	21.8	19.9

Source: WB Business Warehouse Table 3a.4 as of 01/29/09.

Annex Table 5: IBRD/IDA Net Disbursements and Charges Summary Report for Guyana (in US\$ million)

FY	Disb. Amt.	Repay Amt.	Net Amt.	Charges	Fees	Net Transfer
2003	6.24	5.73	0.51	1.73	0.01	-1.23
2004	20.93	5.01	15.92	1.74	0.03	14.15
2005	3.65	3.60	0.04	1.84	0.03	-1.83
2006	2.50	3.96	-1.46	1.71	0.01	-3.18
2007	12.28	0.13	12.16	0.08	0.00	12.08
2008	4.58	0.13	4.45	0.04	0.04	4.37
Total (2003-08)	50.18	18.56	31.62	7.14	0.12	24.36

Source: 1WB Loan Kiosk, Net Disbursement and Charges Report as of 01/28/09.

Annex Table 6: Guyana - Total Net Disbursements of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid, 2001-2007 (in current US\$ million)

Donor	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2001-2007
Bilaterals								
Australia						0.03		0.03
Belgium				0.04				0.04
Canada	4.73	4.17	7.09	7.54	8.85	6.36	7.04	45.78
Denmark		1.14						1.14
Finland	0.01	0.01	0.02	0.03	0.07	0.04		0.18
France	0.15	0.54	0.47	1.92	0.40	0.23	0.36	4.07
Germany	1.55	0.24	0.31	5.12	0.29	0.45	0.55	8.51
Greece			0.03		,,	0.01	0.04	0.08
Ireland	0.03	0.03	0.07			0.01	:	0.14
Italy			0.01	0.02	0.08	3.82		3.93
Japan	4.77	0.69	2.85	10.72	0.50	5.63	4.23	29.39
Luxembourg		0.02		0.02	0.03	:	0.05	0.12
Netherlands	0.81	0.74	0.01	4.85	0.01	:		6.42
New Zealand	0.01	0.01	11		0.11	0.09	0.06	0.28
Norway		:	1.	0.03	.,	2	:	0.03
Spain		:				:	1.97	1.97
Sweden	0.07	:	0.02	0.01				0.10
United Kingdom	18.13	14.87	9.42	20.29	12.09	6.33	4.63	85.76
United States	15.75	11.51	8.39	19.71	17.60	23.55	21.14	117.65
DAC Countries, Total	46.01	33.97	28.69	70.30	40.03	46.55	40.07	305.62
Korea	0.03	0.09	0.06	0.01	0.06	0.07	0.67	0.99
Turkey					0.01			0.01
Other Donor Countries, Total	.,		0	0	0.03	0.01	0.01	0.05
Non-DAC Countries, Total	0.03	0.09	0.06	0.01	0.1	0.08	0.68	1.05
Multilaterals				<u> </u>		-		
Arab Agencies	-0.08		-1.52	-1.52	0.01	6.96	-0.59	3.26
CarDB (Carribean Dev. Bank)	4.53	4.42	7.83	14.09	8.57	12.79	9.34	61.57
Global Fund			.,		3.27	2.5	2.27	8.04
EC	8.71	2.04	1.44	9.42	21.9	17.76	16.6	77.87
IDA	7.29	5.86	19.81	5.94	1.22	10.55	2.47	53.14
IDB Spec. Fund	48.22	24.57	36.78	43.8	48.44	44.88	46.04	292.73
IFAD	0.51	0.12	0.35	0.59	0.96	1.46	4.22	8.21
IMF (SAF,ESAF,PRGF)	-5.48	-1.83	0.16	2.71	21.51	27.24		44.31
UNAIDS		.,			0.29		0.78	1.07
UNDP	1.13	1.12	0.9	1.13	1.14	0.9	0.59	6.91
UNFPA	0.07	0.19	0.03					0.29
UNICEF	0.63	0.82	0.69	0.81	1.42	0.8	1.09	6.26
UNRWA								0
UNTA	0.56	0.45	0.67	0.5	0.62	0.46	0.46	3.72
WFP					0.24			0.24
Multilateral Agencies, Total	66.09	37.76	67.14	77.47	109.59	126.3	83.27	567.62
All Donors, Total	112.13	71.82	95.89	147.78	149.72	172.93	124.02	874.29

Source: OECD DAC Online database, Table 2a. Destination of Official Development Assistance and Official Aid - Disbursements, as of 01/29/09.

CASCR Review Independent Evaluation Group IEG

Annex Table 7: Economic and Social Indicators for Guyana and Comparators, 2002-2007

			Guvana	 					Ave	Average 2002-2007	200	!	
Series Name	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	Guyana	Bolivia	Nicaragua	Nicaragua Paraguay El Salvador	El Salvador	LCR	World
Growth and Inflation												Š	
GDP growth (annual %)	1.1	-1.0	3.3	-1,9	5.1	5.4	2.0	3.9	3.5	3.6	3.0	3.9	3.3
GDP per capita growth (applied %)	0.9	-1.2	3.1	-2.0	5.2	5.5	1.9	1.9	2.1	1.6	1.5	2.6	2.1
GNI per capita DPP (current international \$)	2.190	2.230	2.180	2.440	2.640	2,880	2,427	3,577	2,173	3,788	4,985	7,884	8,488
GNI ner canita Atlas method (current US\$)	890	920	940	1,080	1,160	1,300	1,048	1,033	852	1,252	2,472	4,142	6,588
Inflation, consumer prices (annual %)	5.3	0.9	4.7	6.9	9.9	12.3	7.0	4.5	7.9	8.9	3.6	=	:
Composition of GDP (%)													
Agriculture, value added (% of GDP)	30.8	31.4	31.3	29.6	:	:	30.8	14.6	19.1	21.3	10.0	6.5	3.4
Industry value added (% of GDP)	28.6	27.2	27.0	23.4	:		26.5	31.0	29.6	20.6	30.5	30.4	27.7
Services etc. value added (% of GDP)	40.6	41.4	41.7	47.1	:		42.7	54.5	51.3	58.0	59.5	63.1	68.9
Gross fixed capital formation (% of GDP)	21.0	21.0	23.6	24.8	:	:	22.6	13.0	26.6	19.1	16.1	18.7	20.6
Gross domestic savings (% of GDP)	8.3	11.0	13.7	-9.8	:	:	5.8	16.5	-0.4	13.8	-1.5	21.7	21.1
External Accounts													
Exports of goods and services (% of GDP)	92.8	89.8	95.8	84.5	:	:	200.7	31.8	29.9	48.5	56.9	24.7	25.4
Imports of goods and services (% of GDP)	105.5	96.8	105.7	119.0	:	:	107.5	28.6	58.2	55.3	44.7	22.4	25.4
Current account balance (% of GDP)	-8.6	-6.0	-2.5	-11.6	-12.3	-	-8.2	3.7	-16.2	0.9	4.3	:	:
External debt. total (% of GNI)	205.6	207.2	201.7	163.1	134.8	:	182.5	67.8	132.1	50.2	50.6	37.9	•••
Total debt service (% of GNI)	9.6	8.4	7.1	4.4	3.8		9.9	5.5	3.5	6.2	5.3	7.7	• • •
Total reserves in months of imports	4.4	4.4	3.3	3.1	3.2	:	3.7	6.3	2.5	3.5	2.9	6.2	6.9
Fiscal Accounts 11 12							-						
Noninterest revenue and grants (% of GDP)	:	39.6	44.0	44.1	46.6	43.9	43.6	***************************************					
Expenditure (% of GDP)	48.5	47.8	48.5	57.7	58.2	53.0	52.3	***************************************					
Overall Balance (% of GDP)	-7.0	-8.7	4.5	-13.6	-11.7	-9.1	-9.1						
Social Indicators													
Health										17.0	11.0	306	0.7.0
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	63.5	:	•	65.6	66.3	:	65.1	64.6	71.8	71.3	7.17	0.77	0.70
Immunization, DPT (% of children ages 12-23 months)	91.0	90.0	91.0	93.0	93.0	•	91.6	81.0	84.6	74.0	4.18	91.0	0.03
Improved sanitation facilities (% of population with access)	:	:	• •	:	81.0	•	81.0	43.0	48.0	77.0	0.08	70.3	0.00
Improved water source (% of population with access)	•	•		: !	93.0	•	93.0	80.U	0.87	7.7.0	04.0	91.4	00.6
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	:	:	:	47.0	46.0	:	46.5	50.9	29.0	19.7	4:77	0.77	5.6
Population	,	1	1	0	7 0	100	7.0	6	5.1	2,7	99	5456	64222
Population, total (in million)	0.7	0.7	0.7	7.0	7.0	0.7	00.0	- 6	4.50	1 04	111	1.20	121
Population growth (annual %)	0.7	0.7	0.17	90 <u>.</u> 0	-0.00	-0.07	0.00	1.91	00.1	1.31	1.41	20 22	07.07
Urban population (% of total)	28.4	28.4	28.28	28.20	28.26	28.32	28.31	63.95	22.80	28.10	70.80	07.11	40.43
Education							0.00	9	200	0 66	54.4	1,02	38.0
School enrollment, preprimary (% gross)	114.6	104.4	101.6	99.2	99.2		103.8	49.0	38.3	33.9	21.1	470 4	30.0
School enrollment, primary (% gross)	124.7	124.3	125.3	124.3	:		124.7	112.8	111.4	113.3	114.8	116.4	103.0
School enrollment, secondary (% gross)	92.6	92.3	100.3	104.1	104.6	••	99.4	85.8	63.8	66.4	63.0	8/.8	04.4
1/ IMF. Public Information Notice (PIN) No. 08/45 and No. 07/53 for the Guyana 2007 and 2006 Article IV. Completion Point Document under the Enhanced Heavily Indebted Poor Countries (HIPC) Initiative,	53 for the	Guyana 20	07 and 200	36 Article IV	/. Completi	on Point D	ocument und	er the Enhan	ced Heavily I	ndebted Poor	Countries (HI	IPC) Initiative	

IMF. Public Information Notice (PIN) No. 08/45 and No. 07/55 for the Guyana zour and zoub Afficie in Court
November 2003.
 2/ 2007 data are estimates.
 Source: WB World Development Indicators (September 2008 update) for all indicators excluding those noted.

Annex Table 8: Guyana - Millennium Development Goals

	1990	1995	2000	2007
Goal 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger				
Employment to population ratio, 15+, total (%)	52	53	55	58
Employment to population ratio, ages 15-24, total (%)	40	41	42	43
Income share held by lowest 20%		4.4	4.5	
Malnutrition prevalence, weight for age (% of children under 5)			11.9	
Poverty headcount ratio at national poverty line (% of population)		43.2	35	
Prevalence of undernourishment (% of population)	21	12		
Vulnerable employment, total (% of total employment)			***************************************	
Goal 2: Achieve universal primary education			L	11
Literacy rate, youth female (% of females ages 15-24)	1		τ	
Literacy rate, youth male (% of males ages 15-24)		**	ļ	
Persistence to last grade of primary, total (% of cohort)	**	***	65	
		77		400
Primary completion rate, total (% of relevant age group)	90	77	114	. 123
Total enrollment, primary (% net)	<u> </u>			
Goal 3: Promote gender equality and empower women			T	
Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament (%)	37	20	19	29
Ratio of female to male enrollments in tertiary education	,			217
Ratio of female to male primary enrollment	99		97	99
Ratio of female to male secondary enrollment	106		103	98
Ratio of young literate females to males (% ages 15-24)		L		.,
Share of women employed in the nonagricultural sector (% of total nonagricultural employment)	37.6	38.5		
Goal 4: Reduce child mortality			_	
Immunization, measles (% of children ages 12-23 months)	73	77	86	90
Mortality rate, infant (per 1,000 live births)	64	58	52	46
Mortality rate, under-5 (per 1,000)	88	79	70	62
Goal 5: Improve maternal health		1,	1	
Adolescent fertility rate (births per 1,000 women ages 15-19)		78	74	64
Births attended by skilled health staff (% of total)		95	86	
Contraceptive prevalence (% of women ages 15-49)	31		37	35
Maternal mortality ratio (modeled estimate, per 100,000 live births)			İ	470
Pregnant women receiving prenatal care (%)			81	
			01	**
Unmet need for contraception (% of married women ages 15-49)				
Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria, and other diseases	τ			
Children with fever receiving antimalarial drugs (% of children under age 5 with fever)			3	1
Condom use, population ages 15-24, female (% of females ages 15-24)				**
Condom use, population ages 15-24, male (% of males ages 15-24)	**		.,	**
Incidence of tuberculosis (per 100,000 people)	44	67	101	164
Prevalence of HIV, female (% ages 15-24)	**			1.7
Prevalence of HIV, total (% of population ages 15-49)	.,		2.5	2.5
Tuberculosis cases detected under DOTS (%)			10	45
Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability			_	
Annual freshwater withdrawals, total (% of internal resources)	.,		0.7	
CO2 emissions (kg per PPP \$ of GDP)	1.4	1.1	1	.,
CO2 emissions (metric tons per capita)	1.5	2	2.1	
Forest area (% of land area)	77		77	77
Improved sanitation facilities (% of population with access)		82	82	81
Improved water source (% of population with access)		88	89	93
Marine protected areas, (% of surface area)			1	
Nationally protected areas (% of total land area)	ļ	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	
Goal 8: Develop a global partnership for development		<u>. </u>		
Aid per capita (current US\$)	230	116	146	234
Debt service (PPG and IMF only, % of exports of G&S, excl. workers' remittances)	20.6	16.9	***************************************	3.3
Internet users (per 100 people)	***************************************	0.1	11.8	***************************************
	0		6.8	25.7
Mobile phone subscribers (per 100 people)	0	0.2	5.4	38
Telephone mainlines (per 100 people)	2.2] 6	9.3	14.9
Other			ī	
Fertility rate, total (births per woman)	2.6	2.5	2.5	2.4
GNI per capita, Atlas method (current US\$)	380	720	890	1300
GNI, Atlas method (current US\$) (billions)	0.3	0.5	0.7	1
Gross capital formation (% of GDP)	31.1	33.2	23.8	24.8
Life expectancy at birth, total (years)	62	62	63	66
Literacy rate, adult total (% of people ages 15 and above)		,,	7	
Population, total (millions)	0.7	0.7	0.7	0.7
Trade (% of GDP)	142.6	213.3	206.8	203.6
	1		1 200.0	_,,,,

Source: World Development Indicators database as of 01/29/09.



Annex Table 9: Summary of Achievements of the CAS Objectives

	uvana CAS 03-05: Pillar 1	Actual Results	Comments
·	imulate economic growth	(as of February 2009)	
<u>Objective</u>			
Sub-objectives/ Major Outcome Measures	Maintain macroeconomic stability under the PRSP and the IMF's Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility (PRGF) Overall public sector deficit as percentage of GDP consistent with the medium term macroeconomic framework for the PRSP and the PRGF. (NFPS Overall Balance after grants: -8.7% of GDP in 2003)	-7.6% of GDP in 2007.	Good progress. (PRS Medium term projections: -13.5% of GDP in 2007)
	Strengthen fiscal policy and budget management Comprehensive tax reform underway	VAT introduced in 2007, as part of a comprehensive tax reform	Good progress. (Performance Indicator in Annex A2 of the CAS)
	Multi-year public sector wage policy agreed	Agreement on multi-year wage setting was reached, but not fully implemented (wage adjustments have not kept pace with inflation and productivity).	Good progress. (Performance Indicator in Annex A2 of the CAS)
	Private Sector Development		
	Introduce new Investment Code	Investment Code introduced in 2004	Good progress. (Performance Indicator in Annex A2 of the CAS)
	Sugar Sector Modernization Implement Sugar Sector modernization and restructuring strategy	Sugar sector restructuring undertaken, new sugar mill is close to completion. GUYSUCO is able to meet operating costs, but there has been little reduction in redundant staff.	Some progress. (Performance Indicator in Annex A2 of the CAS)
	Regulatory Framework for Forestry and Mining Introduce new mining and forestry legislation	New forestry law drafted and sent to Parliament, but not approved. Sector Environment Assessment completed for mining, but no new legislation has been drafted	Some progress. (Performance Indicator in Annex A2 of the CAS)
Ongoing pre CAS 03-05 IDA Support	Financial and Private Sector Institutional Development Project	Approved FY00. Closed FY03.	IEG Outcome Rating: Moderately Satisfactory.
New IDA	Public Sector Technical Assistance Credit	Approved FY03. Closed FY08.	IEG Outcome Rating: Satisfactory.
<u>Lending</u> Support	Poverty Reduction Support Credit I (PRSC)	Approved FY03. Closed FY04.	IEG Outcome Rating: Moderately Unsatisfactory.
	Poverty Reduction Support Credit II Poverty Reduction and Public Management Operation	Dropped. Approved FY06. Closed FY07.	IEG Outcome Rating: Satisfactory.
Planned AAA	Development Policy Review	Delivered FY03.	Report
Additional AAA	PER Update Investment Climate Assessment	Delivered FY03. Delivered FY06.	Report (Planned Delivery prior to FY03). Report
	FSAP Guyana	Delivered FY06.	Report
	Integrated Fiduciary Assessment	Delivered FY08.	Report.
Tenet Eurada	ROSC A&A	Ongoing.	
Trust Funds	Conservancy Adaptation Project (GEF)	Approved FY08. Active.	į

IEG

CASCR Review Independent Evaluation Group

	GY CAS 03-05: Pillar 2	Actual Results	Comments
Improve pu		(as of January 2009)	
<u>Objective</u>			
<u>Sub-</u> objectives/	Public Procurement Reform Completion of procurement reforms, with new	New procurement law and regulations	Limited progress.
<u>Major</u>	systems and procedures operational.	have been approved, but the capacity	Ziimiou progressi
<u>Outcome</u>		of the NPTA is not sufficient to fully	
<u>Measures</u>		implement the law and there is no	
		fiduciary oversight by a Public Procurement Commission.	
	New Procurement and Tenders Act passed	New law passed and regulation	Some progress.
	and operational	enacted. PSTAC provided some	(Performance Indicator in Annex A2 of
	· ·	institutional strengthening to NPTA, but	the CAS)
		weaknesses remain. Legislative	
		oversight by proposed Public	
	Rating of lower than High Risk on the Bank's	Procurement Commission still lacking. According to Procurement System	Not evaluable since Governance Review
	upcoming Governance Review.	According to Procurement System Assessment in IFA:	was dropped.
	ap a summer of the summer of t	Legislative and regulatory framework:	
		"Moderately low"	
		Institutional framework, operations and	
	Improve Dublic Costor Financial Managers	integrity and transparency: "Very low"	1
}	Improve Public Sector Financial Management Timely presentation of the consolidated	Budgets are presented on a timely	Some progress.
	budget to Parliament, fully integrating capital	basis, and beginning in 2007 they are	Some progress.
•	and recurrent expenditures over a medium	cast in a medium term framework.	
	term time frame.	However, there has been no integration	
		of capital and recurrent expenditures.	_
	New Audit Act passed and operational	New Audit Law has been passed and	Some progress.
		auditor general office strengthened, but capacity is still weak. General review of	(Performance Indicator in Annex A2 of the CAS)
		accounts have been made in recent	tile OAO)
		years and sent to Parliament, but	
		review by the Parliament lags.	
	Completion of the program to strengthen the	New audit law and regulations adopted.	Some progress.
	independent Auditor General's Office and	Attempts to strengthen AG office	
	initiation of regular full Parliamentary discussions of timely Audit Reports.	undercut by staff attrition. Overall audit reports have been done and presented	
	discussions of timely Addit Reports.	to Parliament generally within a year of	
		the end of the fiscal year.	
	Implement Local Government Reform		
	Establish Effective Monitoring and Evaluation		
	of PRSP Implementation		12.90.1
	Regular public progress reports and consultations on the implementation of	Two progress reports were issued, in 2004 and 2006. There has been little or	Limited progress
	PRSP, with civil society and local government	no regular consultation on the	
:	participation.	implementation of PRSP.	
New IDA	Public Sector Technical Assistance Credit	Approved FY03. Closed FY08.	IEG Outcome Rating: Satisfactory.
<u>Lending</u>	Poverty Reduction Support Credit I (PRSC)	Approved FY03. Closed FY04.	IEG Outcome Rating: Moderately
Support	Donate Deduction Occupation (1971)		Unsatisfactory.
	Poverty Reduction Support Credit II	Dropped.	IEG Outcomo Bating: Satisfactors
	Poverty Reduction and Public Management Operation	Approved FY06. Closed FY07.	IEG Outcome Rating: Satisfactory.
<u>Planned</u>	Poverty Assessment	Delivered FY08.	Report
AAA	Governance Review	Dropped.	
<u>Additional</u>	PER Update	Delivered FY03.	Report (Planned Delivery prior to FY03).
AAA	Integrated Fiduciary Assessment	Delivered FY08.	Report.
Trust Funds	Poverty Measurement NL TA National Statistics Strategy and Statistical	Delivered FY08.	Client Document Review
	National Statistics Strategy and Statistical	Approved FY06. Active.	



CASCR Review Independent Evaluation Group

GY CAS 03-05: Pillar 3 Improve the delivery of social services and strengthen the safety net		Actual Results (as of January 2009)	Comments	
Objective		: is and safety nets.		
Sub-objectives/ Major Outcome Measures	ncreased access by the poor to quality aducation mplementation of a transparent method for allocating public resources across schools.	Done on a trial basis, but not implemented country wide.	Limited progress. (This relates to Performance Indicator in Annex A2 of the CAS)	
	Address the spread of HIV/AIDS Containment of the increase in prevalence rates of HIV/AIDS. Prevalence of HIV, total (% of population ages 15-49): 2.5 in 2000] National Strategic plan for HIV/AIDS approved and implemented	2.5 in 2007 A National strategic plan for HIV/AIDS was approved and is being implemented with the assistance of other donors.	Some progress. (Number of cases have increased since 2000 but that could reflect better outreach, identification an treatment) Good progress. (Performance Indicator in Annex A2 of the CAS)	
	Improve the efficiency of social assistance programs Increases in social sector expenditures in line with E-HIPC targets, and adequate balance between recurrent and capital expenditures.	2004: Social Sector Spending: 17.1% GDP Recurrent spending: 11.5% GDP Capital Spending: 5.6% GDP	Good progress. 2004 HIPC Target: Social Sector Spending: 13.0% GDP Recurrent spending: 10.6% GDP Capital Spending: 2.4% GDP (Source: 2000 Decision Point Document and 2005 PRSP Progress Report)	
	Framework for the water sector New water bill passed and utilities merged	New water bill passed and in operation, water regulatory framework established. Institutional restructuring undertaken and two water companies merged.	Good progress. (Performance Indicator in Annex A2 of the CAS)	
	Private management contractor appointed (Water and sanitation)	Private contractor did not perform according to plan, and contract terminated by government.	Some progress. (Performance Indicator in Annex A2 of the CAS)	
Ongoing pre CAS 03-05 IDA Support	Secondary Education	Approved FY96. Closed FY05.	Quality of Supervision Overall Rating: Satisfactory (QAS2: FY98–99); Satisfactory (QAS6: 08/10/2004). IEG Outcome Rating: Satisfactory.	
	Water Supply TA and Rehabilitation Project	Approved FY94. Closed FY04.	IEG Outcome Rating: Satisfactory.	
<u>New IDA</u> Lending	Poverty Reduction Support Credit I (PRSC)	Approved FY03. Closed FY04.	IEG Outcome Rating: Moderately Unsatisfactory.	
Support	Poverty Reduction Support Credit II	Dropped.		
	HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control	Approved FY04. Active.	Latest PDO Rating: Satisfactory (12/16/2008).	
	Water Sector Consolidation Project	Approved FY06. Active.	Latest PDO Rating: Moderately Satisfactory (11/30/2008).	
Additional AAA	Guyana Floods Disaster Assessment	Delivered FY05.	Model/Survey	
	Guyana Water & Sewerage (PPIAF)	Delivered FY03.	Client Document Review.	
Trust Funds	EFA/ Fast Track Initiative (EFA/FTI)	Approved FY06. Active.		