

ICR Review
Operations Evaluation Department

1. Project Data:	Date Posted : 08/19/2002		
PROJ ID : P043923	Appraisal		Actual
Project Name : Gd- Basic Education Ref	Project Costs 9,92		11.16
	US\$M)		
	(US\$M)		
Country : Grenada	Loan/ US\$M) 7.65		
	Loan /Credit (US\$M)	7.65	
Sector (s): Board: ED - Primary	Cofinancing		
education (35%),	US\$M)		
	(US\$M)		
Secondary education			
(35%), Central government			
administration (21%),			
Tertiary education (9%)			
L/C Number : C2804; L3970			
	Board Approval	96	
	FY)		
	(FY)		
Partners involved :	Closing Date 06/30/2001		12/31/2001
Prepared by : Helen Abadzi	Reviewed by : Martha Ainsworth	Group Manager : Alain A. Barbu	Group : OEDST

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives

Project objectives were to: (a) strengthen management, educational planning and central planning in the sector; (b) improve the quality of basic education (grades 1-9); and (c) expand access to secondary education and rehabilitate primary and secondary school facilities.

b. Components

Major components were: (a) strengthening management and planning with focus on reorganizing the management of the school system, upgrading staff, improving coordination among key Ministry of Education (MOE) operating units; building capacity in sector planning and analysis and formulating a long-term sector plan; strengthening central planning to better support and assist in educational planning; developing an integrated education data system; establishing a permanent project development and management capacity; strengthening financial management; and financing studies to assist in formulating future policy and program development (US\$1.7 million); (b) improving the quality of basic education through investments in teacher training; school supervision; curriculum development; educational materials; and educational measurement (US\$2.2 million); and (c) expansion of access to schools by (i) increasing secondary school places in the most under-served districts by constructing 1 new school and expanding another; (ii) replacing 2 primary schools in unsatisfactory buildings; (iii) rehabilitating selected primary and secondary

schools with urgent needs; (iv) providing furniture and equipment; and (v) training selected school staff in preventive maintenance and mobilization of community support for maintenance (US\$4.7 million).

c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates

The project was estimated to cost a total of US\$9.92 million with a contribution of US\$7.65 million from the World Bank. There was considerable delay in implementing the civil works activities. This factor coupled with an underestimation of costs contributed to lower than expected disbursements.

3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:

The major objectives of the project were achieved. The teacher training capacity at the T. A. Marryhow Community College was strengthened; specialists received training and equipment for science, and language teaching was provided. Trainee teachers are reported to be using innovative and interactive teaching methods during practice teaching. The Curriculum Development Unit has been restructured and capacity enhanced through training of 4 members of staff. New curricula for the lower secondary level have been developed, and these have been described as "very useful" by persons interviewed during the completion mission. Fifty eight primary schools benefited from a supply of mathematics kits, science kits, teaching aids and textbooks. All secondary schools were provided textbooks, and one secondary school was equipped with equipment for metalwork and woodwork. Albeit with some delays and shortcomings, civil works were carried out at 14 schools, though some had a reduced capacity. Furniture and equipment was provided as planned.

4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:

The Educational and Testing Unit established under the project has contributed to the redesign of the content of the Common Entrance Examinations and the School Leaving Examinations, and the introduction of the Minimum Competency Tests in English and Mathematics for Grade 4 and Grade 9 (Form 3). Feedback to the schools is reported to be useful for early diagnosis and intervention. MOE completed a long-term development plan, created a new Education Planning and Statistics Unit, and issued statistical annual reports. The project also supported planning capacity at the Ministry of Finance. Overall, this project substantially improved the statistical database for making education decisions and monitoring trends, although more remains to be done to attribute the trends to specific actions.

Several positive changes took place in the system, though it is uncertain to what extent they were due to project interventions. For example, the repetition rate at the primary level was cut in half and at the secondary level dropped by 90%. Enrollments at the secondary level rose substantially (gross enrollment ratio rose from 63% to 88% against a target of 66%). The secondary level teacher-student ratio rose from 1:19 to 1:23 (target was 1:23.5), improving efficiency, though this is likely due to trends in enrollment rather than deliberate actions by the MOE. (Efficiency decreased at the primary level, however, because the growth of enrollments was less than the growth in teachers.) The share of budget spent on salaries at the secondary level dropped from 93% to 88.5% (target was 89%), in favor of higher spending on complementary inputs, although there was no change at the primary level.

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):
 Implementation delays, necessitating an extension of 6 months were partly due to a change in the location of the MOE complex, delays in obtaining topographical surveys for the construction some schools, and failure to take into account the inexperience and limited project management capacity. The delay in constructing the MOE buildings led to delays in the full implementation of the skills of returned fellows since there was inadequate space for needed equipment. Failure to replace the planner in a timely way "seriously hampered the effectiveness of the unit's work and its leadership". Project efficiency was modest. There was little progress in establishing a system for collection and analysis of data or resource allocation in incorporating financial analysis into MOE decisionmaking. Studies of the effectiveness of teacher training were not carried out, and school supervision was not institutionalized. Studies on the effectiveness of the syllabi and curriculum were not done before project closing. Under- budgeting coupled with implementation delays led to reductions in the scope of works for some of the school construction. . Some of the repairs undertaken at the remaining schools, required rectification due to the initial poor quality. One secondary school was built but with only 315 instead of 525 places, and the other secondary school that was supposed to be expanded by 140 places was not expanded at all. No maintenance plan was implemented (although there is a draft), so "there is no maintenance capacity inside of any of the new or rehabilitated schools". Despite initiation of activities towards the formulation of a school maintenance policy, it was not completed.

6. Ratings :	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome : Satisfactory achieved, project		Moderately Satisfactory	Though major objectives were efficiency was modest, and many important activities that contribute to project outcomes were not carried out satisfactorily. For example, data collection and analysis of resource mobilization and incorporation of financial analysis in MOE decisionmaking was not accomplished. Studies of teacher attrition and the effectiveness of teacher training were not completed by the end of the project. The sub-component on institutionalizing better supervision of schools fell far short of the objective.
Institutional Dev .:	Substantial	Substantial	
Sustainability :	Likely	Likely	
Bank Performance :	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Borrower Perf .:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Quality of ICR :		Exemplary	

NOTE:

NOTE ICR rating values flagged with ' * ' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

- Provision of teacher training is not sufficient to guarantee changes in behavior; hands-on work in the classroom is necessary.

-Project design should reflect capacity of the implementation agency. Inexperienced project management units ought not be implementing heavily "front loaded" projects since there is need to factor in a period for assimilating Bank's procedures.

- Project costs should be based as far as possible on actual designs in order to reduce cost over runs.

8. Assessment Recommended? Yes No

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The ICR was very well written, thorough, and balanced. It provided good statistics for documenting the more and less successful parts of the project. It also provided useful insights into factors affecting implementation. Nevertheless, there were a few arithmetic errors, such as the size of government counterpart.