POLICY BRIEF
KERTAS KEBIJAKAN

GENDER EQUALITY
KESETARAAN GENDER

INDONESIA
Indonesia has experienced an improvement in narrowing the gender gap in some key areas of endowment (e.g. health and education), opportunities, voice and agency, and necessary legislation for gender mainstreaming, but challenges remain. Gender parity index in education has been achieved. Maternal health has significantly improved. There are no pronounce gender disparities in infant and under five mortality rates and other health outcomes. Women labor’s participation rate continues to grow with better return for educated women than men. Women’s political representation has increased. Challenges persist in MMR, HIV/AIDS, stunting and wasting, gender streaming in education, economic opportunities, access to legal justice, and voice and agency in influential decision makings. These challenges juxtapose the emerging trends of human trafficking and non-women friendly policies at sub national levels.

The key achievements and outstanding-issues are presented in the eight Policy Briefs, developed by the Government (the Ministry of National Planning and The Ministry of Women’s Empowerment and Child Protection) and development partners (the World Bank, AusAID, CIDA, The Netherlands Embassy, DFID, and ADB).

**Policy Brief 1: Gender Mainstreaming** has been adopted since the issuance of Presidential Instruction No 9/2000. Presidential Instruction No 3/2010 and other ministerial regulations on gender mainstreaming further stipulate efforts on equitable and inclusive development. The emerging non-women friendly legislation at the local level signifies the importance of enforcing the aforementioned legislative and policy frameworks, coordination among national ministries and all levels of public institutions, and replication of good practices.

**Policy Brief 2: Gender Equality and Health** in Indonesia shows positive results and remaining challenges in the four key health areas related to the MDGs. Important efforts have been made to increase women’s access to health services but Indonesia needs to work hard on reducing the high maternal mortality rate, increasing access to water and sanitation as well as HIV prevention and treatment for the increasing number of adult women living with HIV.

**Policy Brief 3: Gender Equality and Education** has been one of the key achievements for Indonesia. The MDG targets on gender parity in net enrollment are on track to be met by 2015, especially if disparities at the provincial level are addressed. Focus is now on systematic measures to increase access to improved outcomes from a more gender responsive education. The challenge remains to mainstream a gender perspective in education which involves assessing the implication of any planned educational actions (legislation, policies or programs) to boys and girls, in all areas and at all levels.

**Policy Brief 4: Employment, Migration, and Access to Finance** remain a challenge in that without proper measures may impede development. The average annual growth of women entering labor market is higher than men, but women continue to face lower labor’s participation and higher unemployment rates, poorer quality work and lower wages, limited access to resources, discrimination in hiring and promotion, and a higher level of economic informality. Women constitute most of self-employed, unpaid family workers, and migrant workers, making them susceptible to personal and financial insecurity, trafficking and other human rights violations. Closing these gender gaps requires focusing on the equal employment opportunities, link and match of women’s trainings and skills with the labor market, underlying factors of labor market segmentation, and wage gaps and career opportunities.
Policy Brief 5: Poverty, Vulnerability and Social Protection has been one of the current highest government’s development priorities. Whilst the national poverty rate fell from 16.7% (2004) to 13.3% (2010) and poverty rates amongst female-headed households (FHH) remain lower than male-headed households (MHH), the overall rate of poverty reduction for FHH is lower than MHH. This is notwithstanding the well-targeted FHH in all Social Protection programs. Improved targeting techniques will reduce exclusion and inclusion errors and ensure that more poor households receive social protection. The challenge will be to ensure the new targeting mechanisms to include poverty indicators which reflect characteristics of poor and vulnerable FHHs and the male-female intra-household equal access to program benefits.

Policy Brief 6: Gender Equality in Disaster Management and Climate Adaptation highlights the gendered differentiated impact of disasters. There has been significant learning from Aceh Tsunami on good practices for gender responsive disaster management. These need to inform and further strengthen all related national and local-level policies, institutions and programs to tackle the root causes of gender-based vulnerabilities, ensure use of gender analysis and sex-disaggregated data, as well as give equal weight to men’s and women’s rights and capacities.

Policy Brief 7: Women’s Voice in Politics and Decision Makings in Indonesia has increased due to, among others, affirmative action for women candidacy and political participation in 2008. Women’s representation in the Parliament (DPR) increased from 11% (2004-2009) to 18% (2009-2014). Representation remained below the desired 30% and inadequate in other critical areas of public service and decision-making roles. Significant disparities within political parties and across levels of national and sub national government constrain the MDGs’ achievement for women’s empowerment. Indonesia’s Constitution and legal framework assure the equal rights of women. Strengthening current laws/regulations as well as implementation and monitoring could more effectively address women’s institutional and socio-cultural barriers.

Policy Brief 8: Violence Against Women (VAW): Domestic Violence and Human Trafficking in Indonesia show both important progress and outstanding issues. More efforts are needed for law enforcement, capacity building of service provider and wider community, and extend services to urban and rural areas. The increased trend of human trafficking demands more integrated efforts for prevention, protection, prosecution and reintegration.
This Policy Brief provides an overview of key achievements and outstanding issues in carrying out Presidential Instructions on Gender Mainstreaming (INPRES No. 9/2000), aimed at reducing the gap between Indonesian women and men in accessing and obtaining development benefits, as well as to increase participation in and control over the development process. These Guidelines created a momentum for the advancement of women and the promotion of gender equality, which recently extended to gender-inclusive planning and budgeting. There has been some shift in socio-cultural norms and values to better protect the rights of women and men as reflected in several laws that have been revised. There are also signs, however, of an emergence of religion-inspired discriminatory legislation at the local level. The challenge now is to strengthen the implementation of gender mainstreaming by improving legislative and policy frameworks, to enforce coordination of gender mainstreaming efforts among national ministries and all levels of public institutions, and to replicate good practices displayed throughout Indonesia.

Current Status

Indonesia’s Gender Development Index shows that challenges remain to achieving gender equality.

The 2010 Human Development Report (HDR), commissioned by the United Nations Development Programme, ranked Indonesia 108 out of 182 countries according to a Human Development Index (HDI), which measures development by combining indicators of life expectancy, educational attainment and income. The Report also highlighted Indonesia as a country with the greatest progress in recent decades, along with China, Nepal, Lao PDR and the Republic of Korea. The HDI, however, does not measure the degree of gender equality within these development indicators. The Gender Development Index (GDI) aims to show inequalities between men and women in the following areas: health, education, and standard of living. In 2009, Indonesia ranked 93 out of 155 countries. There has been consistent improvement in Indonesia’s GDI, but the country still faces challenges in achieving gender equality in all key development indicators. [Note: GDI is the HDI adjusted downwards for gender inequality. This means that GDI falls when the disparity between the achievement levels of men and women increases. If there is no inequality, the HDI and the GDI will be equal (UNDP.org, 2010)].
Indonesia’s Gender Development Index shows that challenges remain to achieving gender equality.

The current President of Indonesia recognizes gender equality as a development issue (see Box 1). The Medium Term Development Plan (RPJM 2004-2009) contains 38 gender-responsive programs, an increase from 19 in the 2000-2004 Plan. Twenty sector Ministries have now established working groups and gender focal points to mainstream gender in their policies and programs (UN ESCAP, 2010). The 2005 National Poverty Reduction Strategy explicitly includes gender as an element in poverty reduction and commits to work toward gender equality. This Strategy is seen as a ‘test case of the Indonesian government’s ability to realize its pledge to mainstream gender across government sectors’ (Schech and Mustafa, 2010). In addition, the RPJM 2010-2014 reiterates the government’s efforts to mainstream gender with further emphasis on the need to improve women’s quality of life and women’s involvement and consideration in planning, budgeting, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of development policies and programs at both the national and local levels.

Gender mainstreaming in development planning and budgeting is not well understood.

The prevailing view that gender relations are both a private and culturally specific matter hampers gender mainstreaming efforts at the national and local level.

There is a fundamental lack of understanding about the benefits and importance of mainstreaming gender in Indonesia. The term ‘gender’ is not easily translated into Indonesian and is often misunderstood as a term referring only to women or as an imported Western concept. Gender mainstreaming efforts in both government and non-government sectors remain narrowly focused on increasing female participation rather than more broadly focused on issues of human rights, advancement and empowerment, and disparities between women and men’s economic opportunities.

Box 1: Presidential Commitment to Gender Equality

“I see democratic development as a constant process of expanding opportunities and empowerment of the people. It is a process to promote gender equality and bring more women into politics. It is a process to reach out to those that are still marginalized”.

President Susilo Bambang Yudhiono, Keynote Speech, Meeting of World Movement for Democracy, April 2010
gender in development planning and budgeting. The budgets studied had various and diverse effects on the arrangement of advocacy programs, program implementation, and the selection of strategies for the given year. The same study revealed that only nine local governments provided facilitation for the implementation of the Ministry of Home Affairs (MoHA) and Bappenas Joint Circular Letter that include provision for minimum number of women’s participation during preparation of Musrenbang (Budget Information Indonesia, 2010).

The successful use of awards to encourage gender mainstreaming efforts at the local level suggests the value of incentives to encourage good practice.

Anugerah Paharita Ekapraya (APE) awards are given in recognition and appreciation of provincial and district governments, as well as sector ministries, that have implemented gender equality through the use of gender-responsive budgeting (GRB). This initiative, from the Ministry of Women’s Empowerment and Child Protection (MoWECP), has improved institutional compliance with gender mainstreaming requirements, including the submission of progress reports. The province of Central Java received the award in December 2009 and the province of DKI Jakarta received the award for their P2TP2A program that networks services to empower women and children victims of violence (Website P2TP2A, DKI Jakarta). This type of encouragement and accountability needs to be institutionalized further.

While the Government of Indonesia has advanced the protection and empowerment of women by removing gender bias from some laws and regulations, many challenges in national and local laws remain.

A 1999 Decree required the Government of Indonesia to review and improve “laws inherited from colonial era and national laws that are discriminatory, including those that discriminate based on gender and those conflicting with reformasi demand, through a legislation program” (Consultative Assembly Decree No. IV/MPR/1999). With encouragement from civil society organizations and the MoWECP, some laws have been made more gender sensitive and advance the protection of women’s rights, including the following:

- Population Growth and Family Development Law No. 52/2009, which specifies that demographic data should be disaggregated by gender and that poverty should be eradicated among female-headed households
- Elimination of Domestic Violence Law No. 23/2004, which strengthens efforts to eliminate domestic violence and requires provision of services to victims
- Citizen Administration Law No. 23/2006, which adopts a nondiscriminatory principle in serving citizens
- Political Party Law No. 2/2008 and General Election Law No. 10/2008, which requires the nomination of at least 30% women candidates for national, provincial, and district/city level parliaments
- Human Trafficking Law No. 21/2007, which focuses on countering and criminalizing trafficking in persons
A number of national laws are still gender-biased despite advocacy and debate led by the National Commission on Anti-Violence against Women (Komnas Perempuan), civil society organizations, and women’s organizations.

The Ministry of Law and Human Rights reviewed 20 laws and regulations that were considered discriminatory against women. Report on discriminative laws and regulations was also conducted by the Komnas Perempuan in 2009. The following were found to be particularly discriminatory toward women: the Criminal Code (1/1946), the Marriage Law (1/1974), and the Labor Law (13/2003). Controversy remains regarding the Law on Pornography (44/2008) and the Law on Health (36/2009) as well. Both laws contain articles that potentially impair women’s right to make choices regarding her health and expression. There is a current debate regarding a proposed Law on Gender Equality to further strengthen the legal foundation for promoting gender equality.

At the local level, a number of discriminatory laws have been enacted because of decentralization.

While decentralization did make possible regulations that more directly improve the lives of women throughout Indonesia, some regulations enacted since decentralization discriminate against women. Approximately 154 such regulations issued at the provincial, municipal, and village levels from 1999 to 2009 were identified by Komnas Perempuan in 2010 (see Figure 1), of which 63 violate women’s rights concerning expression, protection and work (Komnas Perempuan, 2010).

Regional and district level revivals of conservative religious interpretations of gender roles in recent years have led to religion-influenced regulations that restrict human freedoms and rights. At least 82 religion-inspired regulations are violating human rights including restricting women’s movement and choice of clothing as well as freedom to worship according to one’s faith (Komnas Perempuan, 2010). Progress in consolidating Indonesia’s democracy is at risk of being undermined by emerging anti-pluralism and anti-women sentiments that lead to marginalization and the exclusion of minority groups.

Policy Issues

Indonesia’s legal and policy framework for gender mainstreaming creates a strong foundation for improving gender equality and reducing discrimination but is not enforced consistently across Indonesia.

Gender mainstreaming is mandated through the Presidential Instruction on Gender Mainstreaming (INPRES No. 9/2000), that requires all government agencies at national and local levels to mainstream gender into planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of all policies and programs. According
to the Instruction, ministries and agencies at national and local levels are to address gender inequality and eliminate gender-based discrimination. The MoHA regulation No. 15/2008 provides guidelines for gender mainstreaming implementation at the provincial and district level. Indonesia’s Constitution and the ratification of various international conventions show the country’s commitment to gender equality and have influenced the development of effective local laws (see Box 2). In addition, for the first time in the National Medium Term Development Plan (RPJMN) 2010-2014, gender mainstreaming policies are integrated into the planning and budgeting process, which include gender disaggregated policies, indicators and targets from various ministries and agencies. While these regulations, and particularly the gender mainstreaming instruction, have created momentum for gender equality programs and initiatives, the influence is limited by the classification of INPRES No. 9/2000 as an “instruction” as opposed to a “law”, thus differs in their implementation at the local level.

Regional Gender Focal Points from each sector ministry promote gender mainstreaming and work to increase the awareness of government officials on issues of gender equality at the provincial and district level. Women’s empowerment units have also been set up but vary structurally across provinces as a division, unit or badan. Women’s Study Centers have increased from 70 in 1995 to 111 in 2009 in public and private universities across 30 provinces to advise on gender sensitive policy research and assist regional gender focal points to strengthen the capacity of local government staff. About half of the local governments have formed gender mainstreaming working groups (Pokja PUG), of which more than half are not officially recognized. In addition, only five regencies/cities have established gender mainstreaming focal points in each local government office (Satuan Kerja Pemerintah Daerah (SKPD). Overall, more attention is needed to improving coordination and collaboration between all those invested in gender issues and to improve compliance with MoHA Regulation 132/2003 to submit six-monthly progress reports on gender mainstreaming.

**Box 2: Influence of International Conventions on Village Regulations**

The village government of Desa Arjowilangun, Kabupaten Malang, East Java province has issued Village Regulation No. 5/VI/2007 to protect migrant workers from human trafficking. Law No. 07/1984 on the ratification of CEDAW is referred to in the consideration section. In addition, the Laws on Human Rights, Child Protection, and Elimination of Domestic Violence were also mentioned. (Vita, F. et al, 2010)
Gender mainstreaming tools are being incorporated into national and local planning and budgeting processes.

The Mid-Term Development Plan for 2010-2014 stipulated that the mainstreaming of gender is required, along with the mainstreaming of sustainable development and good governance, in all policies and program. The 2010 General Guidelines to Implementing Gender Mainstreaming in Local Development from the MoHA mandates all government agencies use gender analysis in the budgeting process. This guideline was further elaborated in the Ministry of Finance (MoF) Regulation PMK No. 119/2009. In 2011, the Gender Budget Statement introduced by this regulation will be expanded to include other sectors, and in 2012 it will extend to the regional level. A pilot was conducted in seven ministries revealing positive outcomes, including programs from the Ministry of Agriculture concerning food security enhancement, and programs from the Ministry of Health concerning the attainment of personal health and public health (Financing for Gender Equality, Deputy Minister for Gender Mainstreaming, 2010).

Other agencies have also formally committed to gender mainstreaming (see Box 3). A number of local governments have started to introduce gender analysis in developing their budgets. Local governments in Java, Sulawesi, Kalimantan and Sumatra are now collaborating with civil society organizations to conduct gender analysis of sectors including health and education, and looking at how budgets for those sectors are able to decrease identified gender gaps. With mandatory women’s participation in the Musrenbang process at village, sub-district, and district/municipality level, stipulated in annual Joint Circulars issued by the Minister for National Development Planning and Minister of Home Affairs, this setting should create more opportunities for women’s concerns to be considered in the development planning process.

The Government and its bilateral development partners have made a strong commitment to improving aid effectiveness, including harmonizing approaches for gender equity.

Indonesia’s development partners have gender equity policies and requirements that are enacted in their programs and are jointly monitored by donors and the Government of Indonesia. The Paris Declaration of 2005 establishes that “gender equality, respect for human rights, and environmental sustainability are cornerstones for achieving enduring impact on the lives and potential of poor women, men, and children. It is vital that all our policies address these issues in a more systematic and coherent way”, (OECD, Aid Effectiveness 2005/2008). Mechanisms are being put in place to increase the harmonization of government and external development partners including more gender assessments of donor projects, such as PNPM.
Recommendations

- MoWECP and DPR to raise the status of the Gender Mainstreaming (2000) legislation from a presidential instruction to a law so that it can command the legal power to make obligatory the implementation of gender mainstreaming as a national development strategy. In addition, to further strengthen the legal foundation for promoting gender equality, the MoWECP and the DPR should expedite the deliberation of the Law on Gender Equality.

- MoHA to develop a standard mechanism with the MoWECP to screen local regulations for gender and social discrimination. This could be modeled on the monitoring and abolishing mechanism mandated to the MoF and the MoHA to control anti-business regulations.

- MoWECP to focus on strengthening gender analysis capabilities and forge stronger links with Indonesian gender-concerned NGOs and research institutions.

- All line Ministries, in coordination with MoWECP, to initiate a systematic effort to ensure that all institutions at the national and local level collect sex disaggregated data supported by technical guidelines from the sector Ministries and agencies.

- Bappenas, MoF and MoHA, in consultation with the MoWECP, to ensure that decrees and guidelines promote the use of gender-responsive budgeting at the national level.

- MoWECP to establish gender-sensitive standard performance criteria for all local government programs, requiring reports from the regional and local administration that demonstrate how various sectors and agencies have carried out their responsibilities for gender mainstreaming.

- MoWECP to establish a more efficient and widespread incentive and reward program at the local and provincial level to support and encourage the use of gender-responsive budgeting.

- Bappenas, MoF and MoWECP to improve implementation of Government Regulation No. 8/2008 to ensure women’s full participation in the Musrenbang forum.

References


