



1. Project Data:		Date Posted : 07/25/2002	
PROJ ID: P005806		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name: Ry-multi-mode Transport	Project Costs (US\$M)	43	40.92
Country: Yemen	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	30	36.14
Sector(s): Board: TR - Roads and highways (100%)	Cofinancing (US\$M)	0	0
L/C Number: C2177			
	Board Approval (FY)		91
Partners involved :	Closing Date	06/30/1997	06/30/2001
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group:
Kavita Mathur	Jorge Garcia-Garcia	Alain A. Barbu	OEDST
2. Project Objectives and Components			
a. Objectives			
The key objectives of the project were to:			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • improve access to important agricultural areas; • address the institutional needs and improve the management of CAMA (Civil Aviation and Meteorological Authority), GCYP (General Corporation of Yemen Ports), and GCMA (General Corporation for Marine Affairs); and • support transport sector training. 			
b. Components			
To achieve the above objectives, the project included four components:			
1. Harad Huth Road: Civil works for improvement of 157 km of Harad-Huth road and technical assistance for construction supervision.			
2. Institutional development of Highway Authority.			
3. Technical Assistance to CAMA to carry out strategic development study to improve cost accounting, analyze user charges and to improve airport efficiency; training to CAMA staff; and procurement of most urgently needed safety and meteorological equipment.			
4. Technical Assistance to GCYP to carry out strategic development study to improve port maintenance operations and policies and cost accounting system, and to review linkages between port and road traffic; training of GCMA staff; and procurement of most urgently needed tools, spare parts and equipment for maintenance.			
c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates			
At appraisal, total project cost was estimated at US\$43 million. The final cost was US\$40.92 million. The difference in total cost is largely due to the depreciation of the Yemeni Riyal. At appraisal, the credit was SDR 22.7 million (US\$30 million equivalent. This was fully disbursed (US\$32.5 million equivalent). A supplemental credit of US\$5.8 million was signed on June 3, 1998. About 1.85 million of the supplemental credit was canceled. The project took over ten years to complete.			
3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:			
1. The objective to improve the access to important agricultural areas through rehabilitation of Harad-Huth road was partially achieved. About 153 km of Harad-Huth road were constructed. Travel time has decreased from eight hours to three hours. The ICR reports expansion of commercial activities at various locations along the road including the western terminus near Harad, Suk Khamis, and the eastern terminus near Huth. However, due to the on-going tribal conflicts in the area which makes safe passage unpredictable, full utilization of the Harad-Huth road has not occurred.			
2. The objective of addressing the institutional needs and improving the management of roads, ports and civil aviation subsectors was achieved.			

- In the roads subsector, the project assisted in building the capacity of GCRB staff to design, plan and construct roads through training and regional seminars. Also, technical assistance was provided to improve GCRB's financial operations by identifying and appointing private sector accountant.
- Under the project, strategic development studies for both the civil aviation and port subsectors were undertaken. Recommendations about investment in equipment and training to strengthen institutional capacity were made and according to the ICR many of the recommendations were adopted by the government.
- The efficiency of Yemen's airports was significantly improved as a result of equipment purchased under the project. Navigational and communications equipment was replaced or upgraded at Sanaa, Tiaz and Hodeidah airports and a number of back-up power supply units were introduced.
- To improve port performance, participants from the port sector undertook a study tour to the United States to learn about container operations, procedures for handling bulk grain, and management of ships crew.

4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:

The project assisted in the rehabilitation of Yemen's secondary roads network to improve the access to agricultural areas.

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):

The project experienced implementation delays due to frequent tribal conflicts. The main shortcomings of the project are:

- Poor construction quality - foundation of Wadi Mawr Bridge was weak and the bridge was damaged due to flash flood. By project completion, the damages to Wadi Mawr Bridge had not been repaired.
- Part of the road works were not completed. Four kilometers of road between Wadi Mawr Bridge and Huth were not paved.

6. Ratings:	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome:	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	The outcome of the project is rated moderately satisfactory (a rating which is not allowed under the ICR's 4-point scale) because the damages to Wadi Mawr Bridge that have not been repaired.
Institutional Dev .:	Substantial	Substantial	
Sustainability:	Unlikely	Unlikely	
Bank Performance:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Borrower Perf .:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Quality of ICR:		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

The ICR identified following well known lessons of broad applicability:

1. For successful implementation of the project, it is important to build local support for the project right from the beginning and to regularly update local leaders and beneficiaries of project performance.
2. The Bank needs to articulate its procurement procedures clearly to the implementing agency to avoid delays and misunderstanding.

8. Assessment Recommended? ☐ Yes ☒ No

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The overall quality of the ICR is satisfactory. However, it could have been improved as follows:

- It could have elaborated on the sizeable purchase of equipment purchased under the project since it was an important sub-component.
- the ICR could have provided some hard facts, rather than saying for example "... power supply units were introduced to numerous other airports."
- The section on the achievement of institutional development objectives could have been strengthened by a more thorough discussion of the recommendations of the strategic development studies that were adopted by the government.

