



**WORLD BANK (WB) FINANCED
SECOND REGIONAL AND MUNICIPAL INFRASTRUCTURE DEVELOPMENT
PROJECT (RMIDP II)
PROJECT #:P147521**

RESETTLEMENT POLICY FRAMEWORK

March 20, 2014

PREFACE

This Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF), covering **involuntary resettlement and land acquisition issues** has been prepared by the Municipal Development Fund of Georgia. It is one of key safeguard documents for the Regional Municipal Infrastructure Development Project supported by the World Bank. The other safeguards are reflected in the Operational Manual (OM). Present RPF is supplementary document to the OM and should be considered as its essential part. The screening tools mentioned in the RPF are found in the OM.

Site Specific resettlement action plans will be prepared based of RPF after identification of the sub-project sites, which will trigger OP/BP 4.12 Involuntary Resettlement.

Present document takes into account the approaches to land acquisition and resettlement issues by the Government of Georgia, and the World Bank, and best international practice. The document prepared by the MDF provides the framework for assuring mutually accepted compliance to the concerns of all parties, with the understanding that the most stringent requirements of any party would prevail and be respected.

The Resettlement Policy Framework is elaborated for the Regional Municipal Infrastructure Development Project II financed by the WB. The Regional Municipal Infrastructure Development Project II has multiple components (project with financial intermediaries) focused on support for local municipalities in rehabilitation of existing and development of new municipal infrastructure systems, like roads, water and sanitation, wastewater treatment, solid waste management, street lighting, municipal markets, community facilities, bridges, tunnels, sport facilities, health and educational facilities, communication lines, gas supply, bank reinforcement. It will also finance public infrastructure (PPP - Public-Private Partnership) that will attract private sector investments in tourism and agro-processing.

The organization accomplishing Regional Municipal Infrastructure Development project and concrete subprojects is the Municipal Development Fund of Georgia.

The Municipal Development Fund of Georgia is a Legal entity under public law with the aim to promote the institutional and financial strengthening of the local self-governing bodies, investments in the local infrastructure and services, sustainable progress of the principal economic and social services for the local population (communities), as well as rehabilitation of the irrigation and drainage systems.

The Fund is responsible for managing the finances received from the central and local budgets, international financial institutions and other donors and proceeds gained through the Fund loans as principal and interest amounts used to finance local and regional infrastructure and investment projects and appropriate technical assistance in the field of service.

The Municipal Development Fund of Georgia, within the limits of the programs accomplished by it, is responsible for purchasing the projects/plans and EIA research, as well as construction and rehabilitation works of the municipal infrastructural object. During the deals of purchase, the Fund is obliged to follow the legislation of Georgia under the established rule and by observing the environmental and social requirements of donor organizations. The Municipal Development Fund of Georgia is responsible for proper consideration of the environmental and social safeguards of donor organizations in relation with the accomplished projects.

Projects similar to the Regional Municipal Infrastructure Development Project II are implemented by

MDF in cooperation with different multilateral donor organizations, such as EBRD, ADB as well as bilateral donors such as USAID, SIDA, Netherlands etc. Present Resettlement Policy Framework builds on the Framework elaborated specifically for the Regional Development Project II financed by the WB. However, it may serve as guiding document for implementation of similar projects financed by other donors, in cases when the project is associated with the social impacts, regulated by the Resettlement Policy. Similarity of safeguard policies of different donor organizations makes this document applicable for the projects financed by different donor organizations.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	2
Abbreviations	5
Glossary	6
1. Objective and Components of RMIDP II	9
2. Policy, Legal and Administrative Framework in Georgia	12
2.1. Institutional Responsibilities	12
2.2. Resettlement Related Legislation of Georgia	13
3. The World Bank Policy, Safeguards and Georgian Legislation	14
3.1 The World Bank Safeguards and Involuntary Resettlement Policy	14
3.2 Comparison of Georgia Land Acquisition Law and WB Resettlement Policy	15
4. Principles for Resettlement and Land Acquisition	17
5. Eligibility and Entitlements, Entitlement Matrix	20
6. Implementation	24
7. Agreements	29
8. Grievance Redress Mechanism	29
Annex 1 Synopsis of Selected Georgia Laws and Regulations on LAR	30
Annex 2 OP 4.12 Involuntary Resettlement Involuntary Resettlement Instruments	37
Annex 3 Outline of a Resettlement Action Plan	55
Annex 4 Sample Demarcation Act	58
Annex 5 Public Consultation Meeting Minutes	60
Annex 6 Participants' Registration List	65
Annex7 Photo material of public consultation meeting	68
Annex 8 Tables and forms for description of the affected people and private business	69

ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	Asian Development Bank
AF	Affected Family
AH	Affected Household
AP	Affected Person
BP	Bank Procedure
CDD	Community-driven Development
DP	Displaced Person
EA	Executing Agency
EBRD	European Bank for Reconstruction and Development
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
ESSU	Environmental and Social Safeguards Unit
GEC	Grievance Examination Commission
GIZ	German Technical Cooperation
IFI	International Financial Institutions
IMA	Independent Monitoring Agency
IPSA	Initial Poverty and Social Assessment
LAR	Land Acquisition and Resettlement
LSG	Local Self Government
MCC	Millennium Challenge Corporation
MCG	Millennium Challenge for Georgia
MDF	Municipal Development Fund
MLARO	Municipal Land Acquisition and Resettlement Office
NAPR	National Agency for Public Registration
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
OD	Operational Directive
OP	Operational Policy
PAP	Project Affected Person
PIC	public information center
RAP	Resettlement Action Plan
ROW	Right of Way
RP	Resettlement Plan
RPF	Resettlement Policy Framework
WB	World Bank

Glossary

1. **Affected Person (or household)** - People (households) affected by project-related changes in use of land, water or other natural resources. These include permanent and temporary loss of land, assets, and income. Affected persons entitled for compensation or at least rehabilitation provisions under the Project are: all persons losing land, or access to land, permanently or temporarily either covered by legal title/traditional land rights or without legal status; tenants and sharecroppers whether registered or not; owners of affected buildings, crops, plants, or other objects attached to the land; and affected persons losing business, income, and salaries.
2. **Asset Inventory** - A complete count and description of all property that will be acquired.
3. **Compensation** - Loss reimbursement for the Project affected persons; Cash payment or in-kind compensation in the due amount in return for the loss of assets (property), resources or income
4. **Direct road impact** - When privately owned land parcels are physically affected by the road rehabilitation works
5. **Economic Rehabilitation** - Economic Rehabilitation implies the measures taken for income restoration or economic recovery so that the affected population can improve or at least restore its previous standard of living.
6. **Eligibility** - The criteria for qualification to receive benefits under a resettlement program.
7. **Eminent Domain** - The right of the state to acquire land, using its sovereign power, for public purpose. National law establishes which public agencies have the prerogative to exercise eminent domain.
8. **Expropriation** - Process whereby a public authority, usually in return for compensation, requires a person, household, or community to relinquish rights to land that it occupies or otherwise use
9. **Grievance Procedures** - The processes established under law, local regulations, or administrative decision to enable property owners and other displaced persons to redress issues related to acquisition, compensation, or other aspects of resettlement.
10. **Initial Baseline Survey** - The population census, asset inventory, and socioeconomic survey together constitute the baseline survey of the affected population.
11. **Income restoration** - Re-establishing income sources and livelihoods of people affected
12. **Involuntary resettlement** - Development project results in unavoidable resettlement losses that people affected have no option but to rebuild their lives, income and assets bases elsewhere.
13. **Land Acquisition** - The process of acquiring land under the legally mandated procedures of eminent domain.

14. **Land parcels under road impact** - When only privately owned land parcels are physically affected by the Motor Road rehabilitation activities
15. **Land parcel with residential house attached under road impact** - When privately owned land parcels as well as residential houses are physically affected by the Motor Road rehabilitation activities and require demolition of the house
16. **Land parcel with supplementary structure under road impact** - When privately owned land parcels as well as any non-residential and non-commercial structures are physically affected by the Motor Road rehabilitation activities and may require demolition of the residential house as well
17. **Population Census** - A complete and accurate count of the population that will be affected by land acquisition and related impacts. When properly conducted, the population census provides the basic information necessary for determining eligibility for compensation.
18. **Project Cycle** - the cycle of project development from initial phases of identification and assessment of feasibility, until its final implementation. From standpoint of the project implementing agency, it is convenient to represent the project cycle as consisting of following phases: Pre-feasibility Assessment, Feasibility Studies, Project Design and Appraisal, Project Implementation.
19. **Rehabilitation** - Re-establishing incomes, livelihoods, living, and social systems
20. **Relocation** - Rebuilding housing, assets, including productive land, and public infrastructure in another location
21. **Replacement rates** - Cost of replacing lost assets and incomes, including cost of transactions
22. **Resettlement** - Term – “Resettlement” in accordance to the World Bank Involuntary Resettlement Operational Policy Document 4.12 considers alienation of land parcels and/or physical relocation (moving to other place) of households being appeared within the project affected area
23. **Resettlement Entitlements** - Resettlement entitlements with respect to a particular eligibility category are the sum total of compensation and other forms of assistance provided to displaced persons in the respective eligibility category.
24. **Resettlement effects** - Loss of physical and non-physical assets, including homes, communities, productive land, income-earning assets and sources, subsistence, resources, cultural sites, social structures, networks and ties, cultural identity, and mutual help mechanisms
25. **Resettlement plan** - A time-bound action plan with budget setting out resettlement strategy, objectives, entitlements, action, responsibilities, monitoring and evaluation
Resettlement (Action) Plan - A resettlement action plan [RAP] is the planning document that describes what will be done to address the direct social and economic impacts associated with involuntary taking of land.

26. **Resettlement Strategy (Rehabilitation Strategy)** - The approaches used to assist people in their efforts to improve (or at least to restore) their incomes, livelihoods, and standards of living in real terms after resettlement. The resettlement strategy typically consists of payment of compensation at replacement cost, transition support arrangements, relocation to new sites (if applicable), provision of alternative income-generating assets (if applicable), and assistance to help convert income-generating assets into income streams.
27. **Socioeconomic Survey (SES)** - A complete and accurate survey of the project-affected population. The survey focuses on income-earning activities and other socioeconomic indicators.
28. **Stakeholders** - A broad term that covers all parties affected by or interested in a project or a specific issue—in other words, all parties who have a stake in a particular issue or initiative. Primary stakeholders are those most directly affected—in resettlement situations, the population that loses property or income because of the project and host communities. Other people who have an interest in the project—such as the project authority itself, the beneficiaries of the project (e.g., urban consumers for a hydro-power project), and interested NGOs are termed secondary stakeholders.
29. **Task Manager or Task Team Leader** - In Bank parlance, the officer in charge of a Bank-supported project or activity.
30. **User** - Physical person not registered as the owner at the Public Register, or holding the right to use the land
31. **Usufruct** - The right to use and profit from land belonging to other person, or group of persons but in difference with the owner he/she will have no right to alienate, mortgage or bequeath of the land parcel
32. **Vulnerable groups** - Distinct group of people who might suffer disproportionately from resettlement effects

1. Objective and Components of RMIDP II

Proposed Project Description

The priority of the project would be to improve the ability of subnational levels government to carry out their core functions related to service delivery to the population and accountability through facilitating LSGs access to viable financing to implement priority infrastructure investments. In this context, it was noted that main areas of emphasis could include: financial management, investment identification, preparation and implementation, better management of existing local assets, for example maintenance of local roads and also active engagement the civil society and local beneficiaries in decision making process.

The Project consists of two components: (1) infrastructure investments and (2) institutional development.

Component 1: Infrastructure Investments (IBRD: US\$42 million)

This component will finance infrastructure investment for the rehabilitation and expansion of priority municipal services such as roads, water and sanitation, wastewater treatment, solid waste management, street lighting, municipal markets, community facilities, bridges, tunnels, sport facilities, health and educational facilities, communication lines, gas supply, bank reinforcement.

It will also finance public infrastructure (PPP - Public-Private Partnership) that will attract private sector investments in tourism and agro-processing. The latter builds on a series of successful interventions piloted under the Regional Development Project where private sector entities were willing to invest in an area but required complementary public infrastructure to make their investments viable (e.g. public facilities within vicinity of the investments, road/sidewalk, water/sanitation, etc.). The investment decision would be based on agreed criteria.

This component will be driven by demand from LSGs. Consequently, the full pipeline of subprojects will not be known a-priori. However, investments will be based on a clearly defined framework and criteria and the Operations Manual (OM) will include a list of eligible investments.

Financial resources will be provided on a combined credit and grant basis to large LSGs based on their borrowing capacity. Performance-based grants will be provided to LSGs with weaker capacity based on a list of eligibility criteria aiming to improve their service delivery.

It is expected that this Project will implement some of the studies developed under RMIDP and RMIDP-AF, such as the Road Design Guidelines and the Wastewater Management Strategy. It is also expected that selected investments would be informed by feasibility studies for wastewater treatment plants in six cities (financed under RMIDP and RMIDP-AF), and the Tbilisi City Development Strategy (financed by the Cities Alliance).

Component 2: Institutional Development (IBRD: US\$ 3 million)

This component will support LSGs and the Municipal Development Fund in improving their institutional capacity and performance. It will also finance Project Management activities.

Enhancing the institutional capacity and performance of LSGs: LSGs will be supported in a) developing human resource plans; b) improving fiscal discipline, accounting, budgeting, and reporting; c) developing participatory strategic plans, building civic engagement and social accountability; and d) developing technical standards, specifications, and asset management plans to

ensure sustainability of investments.

Enhancing the institutional capacity and performance of the Municipal Development Fund: TheMDF will be supported in strengthening its technical appraisal capacity, credit risk management ability and fiduciary functions.

Project Management: This component will also finance feasibility studies, engineering designs, construction supervision, and monitoring and evaluation of Project outcomes, with special attention to the gender dimensions of project impacts.

The proposed Project will build on the successful implementation of RMIDP and RMIDP-AF, but will also:

- Support the decentralization agenda in line with overall Government reform strategy through financing investment priorities identified under the regional development strategies, prepared with technical assistance from EU, GIZ, and UNDP.
- Strengthen the MDF to support the Government's decentralization agenda through enabling it to facilitate citizen feedback and beneficiary participation.
- Assist the Government in leveraging additional financial resources from CEB and SDC.
- Expand the menu of eligible investments to include municipal markets.
- Identify and pilot social accountability measures.
- Introduce performance-based grants to build incentives for better LSG performance.
- Scale up energy efficiency in water supply, street lighting, and municipal buildings.

Total Project Cost

The estimated total Project cost (subject to preparation and appraisal), including physical and price contingencies, is about \$45 million which will be provided by World Bank, with a possible additional loan from Council of Europe Development Bank and \$4 million grant from SDC.

Resettlements cost will be financed by the Government of Georgia.

Below is the summary of resettlement related issues that may occur, the likelihood of such issues actually happening, and proposed actions to be taken.

Resettlement Situational Scenarios	Probability	Status/Action
Temporary impact on the visual quality of private land; disturbance during construction works without any losses of income or property;	moderate	Allowed/ impact mitigation measures within EMP
Temporary impact on the private land; disturbance during construction works associated with the losses of income (loss of harvest and annual income for farmers; losses of income for small businesses, like roadside commercial activities etc.)	moderate	Allowed/ Abbreviated RAP, compensation of losses
Temporary impact on the private land; losses of productive assets (trees; ancillary buildings)	low	Allowed/ Abbreviated RAP, compensation of losses
Land take; (less than 10 affected households) Acquisition of certain part of private land parcels without or with associated loss of assets	moderate	Allowed/ Abbreviated RAP, compensation of losses
Land take; (more than 10 affected households) Acquisition of certain part of private land parcels without or with associated loss of assets	extremely low	Allowed/ RAP, compensation of losses
Structural demolition resulting in physical relocation of households or businesses	high	Allowed/ RAP, compensation of losses
Restriction of access to land or natural resources, including informal users	moderate	Allowed/ RAP, compensation of losses

It is thus anticipated that there would be physical relocation of households or businesses under this project. There would also be temporary loss of income and other productive assets during civil works. The exact footprints of civil works or the impact of the Project are still unknown, however, and the Resettlement Action Plan (RAP) cannot be prepared prior to Project Appraisal. The present Resettlement Policy Framework, prepared by the MDF in line with OP 4.12, sets out the principles and procedures that will govern resettlement and land acquisition activities, identify categories of affected persons and their respective entitlements, and describe the analytical work and documentation to be prepared before, during and after implementation of the RAPs.

In addition to issues directly concerning land acquisition, the RPF will also cover issues related to informal use of public land and restriction of access to resources.

2. Policy, Legal and Administrative Framework

2.1. Institutional Responsibilities

Table 1. State Institutions that may be involved in land acquisition process

The Government of Georgia

Ministries and Departments	Responsibilities
1. Ministry of Economic Development	Matters pertaining to the project site approval, for the projects of Specific Importance (approval within the Construction Permit).
2. Ministry of Justice - National Agency of Public Registry	Identifies the land plots and ownership rights and their registration into the Public Registry.
3. Ministry of Environmental Protection and Natural Resources	Resolves the issues related to the changes of the designation of land. Site approval within the Construction Permit.
4. Tourism Department	Site approval within the Construction Permit. Certain restrictions on construction in a sanitary protection zones of resorts.
5. Ministry of Culture, Monuments Protection and Sports	Site approval within the Construction Permit. Certain restrictions on construction in a archaeologically valuable sites.
6. Ministry of Agriculture	Information regarding the yield capacity of given agricultural lands

Regional/local Authorities

Regional/local Authorities	Responsibilities
7. Regional Governor	
8. Local Rayon Gamgeoba	
9. Local Rayon Sakrebulo	
10. Local governing Units and their architectural and Construction service units	Implement the decisions on the land parcellation

Table 2. The responsibilities of the entities involved in the process of expropriation as defined under the Legislation of Georgia

Measures/activities	Responsible Body
Presidential Decree on Assigning the Right of an Expropriator	The President of Georgia
Right on Undertaking Expropriation	Through the Court Decision
Conducting appraisal (evaluation) of land and real property	Independent expert invited by the Expropriator
Information regarding the yield capacity of given agricultural lands	Ministry of Agriculture

2.2. Resettlement Related Legislation of Georgia

The table below provides a list of legal acts directly regulating or having regard with the land acquisition issues.

	The Frame Legislation	Issues addressed
1	The Constitution of Georgia, August 24, 1995;	Frame legislation covering private ownership, privatization, compensation, expropriation and publicity issue.
2	The Civil Code of Georgia, June 26, 1997;	Frame legislation covering Ownership Rights, Construction Right, Servitude Right and Necessary Right of Way issues.
	The Laws Regulating Land and Property Ownership and Land Acquisition Issues	
3	The Law of Georgia on Ownership Rights to Agricultural Land, March 22, 1996; as amended	The sphere of regulation of the Law on ownership right to agricultural land mainly extends over the agricultural land parcels.
4	The Law of Georgia on Compensation of Compensatory Land Cultivation Costs and Sustained Damage in Case of Allocation of Agricultural Land for Non-Agricultural Purposes, October 2, 1997, and the last amendment to this Law made on July 11, 2007;	The law establishes the rules and compensation levels (according to municipalities and recreational zones) for allocation of agricultural lands for non-agricultural land use purpose.
5	The Law of Georgia on the Property of Local Self-governing Units.	identifies property categories, its creation rules and property rights of local self-governing
	Legislation Regulating Land and Property Expropriation	
6	The Law of Georgia on the Rules for Expropriation of Ownership for Necessary Public Need, July 23, 1999	Eminent Domain Law – regulates expropriation of land or property for Necessary Public Need
7	Procedural Civil Code of Georgia, November 14, 1997	The general courts of Georgia consider the cases (including land ownership expropriation cases) according to the rules identified under the Procedural Civil Code of Georgia.
	Other Laws Having Regards to Land Acquisition	
8	The Law of Georgia on Motor Roads, November 11, 1994.	Permits for the issue of land allocation for the needs of the motor road construction through referring to the active legislation
9	The Law of Georgia on Environmental Impact Permit, 2008	Permits and procedures for the RoW approval through EIA process
10	The Law of Georgia on Protection of Cultural Heritage, 2007	Permits and procedures for the RoW approval through Archaeological clearance (within the Construction Permit)

11	Precedents of Expropriation	
12	Presidential Decree No 588, October 1, 2007 about Granting of Ownership Expropriation Rights for Necessary Public Need	Related to expropriation of the private land plot needed for the project of public importance – “Modernization of the Natakhtari - Agaiani Section of the Tbilisi – Senaki – Leselidze Highway”

A more expanded review of the Georgian legislation pertinent to the resettlement issues is provided in the Annex 1 of this RPF. Below we will present a brief summary:

Overall the above laws/regulations provide that the principle of replacement cost compensating at market value is reasonable and legally acceptable. The laws also identify the types of damages eligible to compensation and indicate that compensation is to be given both for loss of physical assets and for the loss of incomes. Finally, these laws place strong emphasis on consultation and notification to ensure that the Project Affected People(PAP) participate in the process. As in practice, public opposition to expropriation is very strong, eminent domain is very rarely used by public authorities, to be exercised only when negotiations between the agency acquiring the land and the owners fail. Indeed, in the example of expropriation cited above, the acquiring agency resorted to expropriation only with a limited number of land owners with whom negotiation failed.

3. The World Bank Policy, Safeguards and Georgian Legislation

3.1. The World Bank Safeguards and Involuntary Resettlement Policy

All projects funded by WB must comply with the WB social and environmental safeguards. The WB financed projects, in their turn, require compliance with the WB safeguards and guidelines. WB BP/OP 4.12 Involuntary Resettlement is one of the most important safeguards guiding land acquisition and related resettlement/compensation issues during project implementation. In line with the principles of host-country responsibility, Georgia is committed to implement the WB financed projects in compliance with the requirements of WB BP/OP 4.12.

Generally, the Georgian legislation is compatible with the major provisions of the WB Resettlement Policy but a few important differences are to be noted¹. The WB resettlement policy is directed at improving (or at least restoring) incomes and living standards, rather than merely compensating people for their expropriated assets. This improvement of incomes and living standards broadens the objective of the policy to include the restoration of income streams and retraining of people unable to continue their old income-generating activities after displacement. The emphasis on incomes and living standards, in contrast to the conventional emphasis on expropriated property, expands the range and number of people recognized as adversely affected. Recognition of this broader range of adverse impacts leads to a greater appreciation of the issues to be considered in resettlement and consequently requires careful delineation of responsibilities, elaborate risk management and explicit and distinct resettlement planning.

The WB policy complements the Georgian legislation/regulation with certain additional requirements, which are mandatory for the WB financed projects. In particular, appropriate planning/management instruments must be developed prior to project appraisal, like **Resettlement**

¹ See RPFs for “Georgia Methane Leak Reduction from Gas Pipeline Project” and for the “East – West Highway Improvement Project”.

Policy Framework (RPF) and Resettlement Action Pan (RAP), as appropriate.

Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF). A policy framework needs to be prepared if the extent and location of resettlement cannot be known at appraisal because the project has multiple components, as typically happens in projects with financial intermediaries or multiple sub-projects. The policy frame works establishes resettlement objectives and principles, organizational arrangements, and funding mechanisms for any resettlement operation that may be necessary during project implementation. The framework also assesses the institutional capability to design, implement, and oversee resettlement operations.

Resettlement Action Pan (RAP). All projects that entail involuntary resettlement require a **RAP**. “The scope and level of detail of the resettlement plan vary with the magnitude and complexity of resettlement” (OP 4.12, Annex A, para. 2).RAP is location-specific and comprehensive action plan including preliminary studies (socio-economic assessment, sociological survey, census, valuation of impacts, and consultation with affected persons), a set of compensation/mitigation measures for each affected person/household, and detailed implementation plan with indication of responsible parties and schedule.

The WB Policy on Involuntary Resettlement, as defined in the OP/BP 4.12, is based on the following principles:

- Involuntary resettlement is to be avoided or at least minimized.
- Compensation/Rehabilitation provisions provide affected persons with opportunity to improve, or at least restore, pre-project incomes and living standards.
- Affected Persons should be fully informed and consulted on Land Acquisition and Resettlement compensation options.
- Affected Persons’ socio-cultural institutions should be supported/used as much as possible.
- Compensation will be paid at replacement cost to affected persons, without deduction for depreciation or any other purpose.
- Lack of legal title should not be a bar to compensation or alternative forms of assistance as needed to achieve policy objectives.
- Particular attention should be paid to households headed by women and other vulnerable groups.
- Land Acquisition and Resettlement should be conceived and executed as a part of the project, and the full costs of compensation should be included in project costs and benefits.
- Compensation and resettlement subsidies will be fully provided prior to clearance of right of way/ ground leveling and demolition.

3.2 Comparison of Georgian Legislation on LAR and WB Resettlement Policy

Generally the Georgian legislation is compatible with major provisions of the WB Resettlement Policy but a few differences are to be noted. The most significant of these differences is that under Georgian legislation/regulation, emphasis is put on the definition of formal property rights and on how the acquisition of properties for public purposes is to be implemented and compensated while in the case of WB policy emphasis is put both on the compensation of rightfully owned affected assets and on the general rehabilitation of the livelihood of the Project Affected People (PAP) and Households (AH). Also, in addition, the legislation of Georgia does not require any specific

planning/implementation instrument like RPF or RAP based on extensive public consultations. The differences between the legislation of Georgia and WB policy are outlined in Table below.

Table 2: Comparison of Georgia Laws/Regulations on LAR and WB Resettlement Policy

Georgia Laws and Regulations	WB Involuntary Resettlement Policy	Proposed approach to meet the Gaps
Land compensation only for titled landowners	Lack of title should not be a bar to compensation or alternative forms of assistance. Non-titled landowners may receive alternative forms of assistance in lieu of formal compensation payments, .	Cash compensation for the loss of land will be provided only to the title holder. MDF will assist land owners with the preparation of the cadastral drawings and will consult them how to register the land ownership.
Only registered houses/buildings are compensated for damages/demolition caused by a project	All affected houses/buildings are compensated for the damages/demolition caused by a project	All affected houses/buildings are compensated for the damages/demolition caused by a project OR All project affected structures compensated in cash based on the replacement cost free of deductions for depreciation, salvaged materials and transaction costs irrespective of the registration status.
Crop losses compensation provided only to registered landowners.	Crop losses compensation provided to landowners and sharecrop/lease tenants whether registered or not	Crop losses compensation will be provided to landowners and sharecrop/lease tenants irrespective the status of title registration
Land valuation based on replacement cost: (i) current market value where active land markets exist; (ii) Reproduction cost of an identical plot where no active land markets exist.	Land valuation based on replacement cost.	Land valuation will be based on replacement cost: (i) current market value where active land markets exist; (ii) Reproduction cost of an identical plot, where no active land markets exist. This applies not only to land but also to land based assets.
PAP the grievance should lodge the complaints at the court.	Adequate grievance redress mechanism (GRM), which consists of both formal and informal venues, should be developed and made accessible to all PAP	Adequate grievance redress mechanism, which consists of both formal and informal venues, swill be developed and made accessible to all PAP. The GRM is a project specific mechanism meant to reduce the number of court cases but in no way precludes the PAP's right to go to court.

No formal requirements to organize public consultation to inform the PAP on the nature of the project and expected impacts	Information on quantification, affected items value assets, entitlements, amounts of cash compensation financial assistance, additional rehabilitation measures is to be disclosed to the APs prior to appraisal.	Information on quantification, affected items value assets, entitlements, and compensation/financial assistance amounts is to be disclosed to the APs prior to appraisal
--	---	--

4. Principles of Resettlement and Land Acquisition Adopted for the Regional Municipal Infrastructure Development Project II

Considering the above-mentioned differences, WB policy complements the Georgian legislation/regulation with additional requirements related to (i) the economic rehabilitation of all AP/AF (including those who do not have legal/formal rights on assets acquired by a project); (ii) the provision of indemnities for loss of business and income, (iii) and the provision of special allowances covering PAP expenses during the resettlement process or covering the special needs of severely affected or vulnerable PAPs. Therefore, during implementation of the Regional Municipal Infrastructure Development the MDF is committed to ensure that:

1. For each subproject that involves acquisition of private land, temporary or permanent income loss, physical displacement of households or businesses, or other impact that triggers the OP 4.12, a Resettlement Action Plan (RAP) will be developed in compliance with policies and procedures set out in this RPF, the WB OP 4.12 and Georgian legislation.
2. Municipalities that propose subprojects to the MDF will be responsible for implementing the relevant RAP, and the MDF will provide technical support, including the preparation of the RAP.
3. No civil work can start at the section where impacts that trigger OP 4.12 occur before a RAP is deemed acceptable by the Bank.
4. PAP will receive compensation or support of various kinds, without regard to the status of land registration and ownership, in accordance with the entitlement matrix included in this RPF and in compliance with the active legislation of Georgia and the World Bank safeguard policy.
5. PAP will be informed about their rights and existing alternatives;
6. PAP will be consulted on, offered choices among, and provided with technically and economically feasible resettlement alternatives;
7. PAP will be offered effective compensation at full replacement cost for losses of assets;
8. PAP will be offered additional support in case impact is considered to be severe, to support their livelihood during the transition period, based on a reasonable estimate of the time likely to be needed to restore their livelihood and standards of living;
9. PAP will be provided with development assistance in addition to compensation measures described, such as land preparation, credit facilities, training, or job opportunities;
10. Special attention will be paid to the needs of the most vulnerable groups of the population – children, women, the elderly, those below the poverty line, disabled, refugees, etc.;
11. A fair and accessible grievance redress mechanism will be developed;

12. Compensation measures are completed prior to start up of the particular construction activities that trigger OP 4.12.

5. Eligibility and Entitlements

Eligibility

PAPs entitled for compensation or at least rehabilitation provisions under the Project are:

1. All PAPs losing land, or access to land, permanently or temporarily either covered by legal title/traditional land rights or without legal status;
2. Tenants and sharecroppers whether registered or not;
3. Owners of affected buildings, crops, plants, or other objects attached to the land; and
4. PAPs losing business, income, and salaries.

Compensation eligibility will be limited by a cut-off date to be set for each subproject on the day of the beginning of the Census. Persons who settle in the affected areas after a locally publicized cut-off date will not be considered project-affected, and persons initiating improvements to land or structures after a locally publicized cut-off date will not be eligible for additional compensation. They, however, will be given sufficient advance notice, requested to vacate premises or dismantle affected structures prior to project implementation. Their dismantled structures materials will not be confiscated and they will not pay any fine or suffer any sanction.

Entitlements

At present, following categories of people are expected to be affected by the project (see Entitlement Matrix, below):

- Private landowners (with or without an established legal title to the land) whose land will be purchased or expropriated to implement subprojects.
- Private owners (with or without an established legal title to the property) whose assets such as residence, stables, workshops, fences, barns, warehouses, trees, standing crops, and other valuable assets need to be damaged, purchased, or expropriated.
- PAPs (including formal and informal businesses) who experience temporary loss of income or asset as a results of restriction of access to land or assets during civil works.
- PAPs (including formal and informal businesses) who experience loss of income or asset as a result of purchase or expropriation of land for implementation of subprojects.
- Leaseholders (individual and enterprise) who have lease agreements with the Municipalities or other owners in existing and alternative alignments and sites
- Informal/illegal occupants and land users on existing rights of way and new alignments and sites.

Affected persons will be compensated for land purchased for permanent structures and for servitude agreements (i.e., easements) on existing and new alignments for land they own or use, formally or informally. Affected persons (i.e., owners, informal users and leaseholders) will also be compensated for damages and structures, standing crops, trees and other economic assets that are affected. If permanent relocation is involved, whenever possible, and when acceptable to MDF, the affected persons will be relocated to new properties of equal quality identified by the Project. Affected persons will be compensated for transportation costs if relocation is involved.

Persons affected temporarily by construction activities will be compensated for any lost income, assets and damages.

Assessment of Compensation Unit Values

The methodology for assessing unit compensation values of different items is as follows:

Agricultural Land will be valued at replacement rates according to two different methodologies depending on whether in affected areas active land markets exist or not.

Where active land markets exist, loss of land will be compensated at the replacement rate based on a survey of land sales in the year before the impact survey. Where active land markets do not exist, loss of land will be compensated based on the cost of reproduction of a plot with equal characteristics, access and productivity to the plot lost. A clear valuation methodology for these cases will be detailed in RAPs.

If damages to residences or commercial structures occur, houses/buildings will be valued at replacement value based on the cost of materials, types of construction, labor, transport and other construction costs. No deductions will be applied for depreciation, salvaged materials and transaction costs.

Annual crops will be valued at net market rates at the farm gate for the first year crop. In the event that more than one-year compensation is due to PAPs, the crops after the first year will be compensated at gross market value (total farm gate sales value minus input costs).

Trees will be valued according to different methodologies depending whether the tree lost is a wood tree or a productive tree.

- Wood trees will be valued based on age category (a. seedling; b. medium growth and c. full growth) and wood value and volume
- Fruit/productive trees will be valued based on age (a. seedling; b. adult-not fruit bearing; and c. fruit bearing) whereas trees at stage a and b will be compensated based on the standard value of the investment made; trees at stage c, instead will be compensated at the net market value of 1 year income x the number of the MDF needed to grow a new fully productive tree

The unit compensation rates will be assessed by Project consultants based on clear and transparent methodologies acceptable to WB. The assessed compensation rates will then be verified and certified by the Municipality Resettlement Officer and by MDF.

Entitlement Matrix

Type of Loss	Application	Definition of PAPs	Compensation Entitlements
Land			
Permanent loss of agricultural land	AH losing agricultural land regardless of impact severity	Owner with full registration	Cash compensation at replacement cost.
		Legalizable Owner	These PAP will be supported to obtain legalisation and provided with cash compensation at replacement cost.
		Informal Settlers (AHs with no registration/valid documentation and non legalizable)	One time self-relocation allowance in cash. The relocation allowance is not dependent on the number of AH members or land characteristics and is a fixed amount per family equal to 1 year of minimum subsistence income ² .
Non-Agricultural Land	AH losing their commercial/residential land	Owner with full registration	Cash compensation at replacement cost.
		Legalizable Owner	These PAPs will be legalized and provided with cash compensation at replacement cost.
		Renter/Leaseholder	Rental allowances in cash equal to 3 months of leasing costs, according to leasing fees approved by the municipalities for leasing the land of such category.
		Informal Settlers (AHs with no registration/valid documentation and not legalizable).	One time self-relocation allowance in cash The relocation allowance is not dependent on the amount of AH members or land characteristics and constitutes fixed amount per family equal to 1 year at minimum subsistence income.
Non-viable (“orphan” land)	Land that is affected partially but to such to an extent that the remainder is not usable	Owner with full registration or legalizable owner (subject to legalisation)	Subject to a request being lodged by the land owner, orphan land may be compensated in full if the review of the request indicates that the remainder cannot be used economically
Buildings and Structures			

² The minimum subsistence income is calculated based on a 5 people family and the monthly-updated benchmarks indicated by the National Statistics Office of Georgia at the end of the impacts survey (January 2014: 312 GEL x month).

Type of Loss	Application	Definition of PAPs	Compensation Entitlements
Residential and non residential structures/assets		All AHs regardless of their legal ownership/ registration status (including legalizable and Informal Settlers)	Full impact: Cash compensation for loss of building/ structures at full replacement costs free of depreciation and transaction costs Partial impact: compensation for repairs
Loss Of Community Infrastructure/Common Property Resources			
Loss of common property resources	Community/Public Assets	Community/Government	Reconstruction of the lost structure in consultation with community and restoration of their functions
Loss of Income and Livelihood			
Crops	Standing crops affected	All AHs regardless of legal status (including legalizable and Informal Settlers)	Crop compensation in cash at market rate at gross crop value of expected harvest.
Trees	Trees affected	All AHs regardless of legal status (including legalizable and Informal Settlers)	Cash compensation at market rate on the basis of type, age and productive value of the trees. In addition, trees will be cut by the construction contractor and made available to PAPs for timber

Type of Loss	Application	Definition of PAPs	Compensation Entitlements
Business/Employment	Business/employment loss	All AHs regardless of legal status (including legalizable and Informal Settlers)	<p>Owner:</p> <p>(i). (permanent impact) cash indemnity of 1 year net income; and technical and administrative support from the RU to relocate the business in appropriate premises</p> <p>(ii) (temporary impact) cash indemnity of net income for months of business stoppage. Income will be calculated based on tax declaration or in its absence on minimum subsistence income.</p> <p>Permanent worker/employees:</p> <p>(i) indemnity for lost wages equal to 3 months of minimum subsistence income AND</p> <p>(ii) support to business owner to relocate the business as quickly as possible (see above) AND</p> <p>(iii) support from RU to enrolment into existing livelihood restoration programmes such as business training and micro-credit</p>
Allowances			
Severe Impacts	>10% land impact Physically displaced households Owners of businesses that have to interrupt activity permanently or temporarily	All severely affected AHs including informal settlers	<p>Agricultural income: additional crop compensation covering 1 year yield from affected land.</p> <p>Other income: additional compensation for 3 months of minimum subsistence income.</p>
Relocation/Shifting	Transport/transition costs	All AHs to be relocated	<p>Assistance to identification of a suitable replacement dwelling</p> <p>Provision of an allowance of 312 GEL covering transport expenses and livelihood expenses for a 3 months transitional period.</p>
Vulnerable People (including IDPs) Allowances		AHs below poverty line, headed by Women, disabled or elderly	Allowance equivalent to 3 months of minimum subsistence income and employment priority in project-related jobs

Type of Loss	Application	Definition of PAPs	Compensation Entitlements
IDPs living in municipal or other housing	Support to relocation	Registered IDPs	Assistance to the identification of suitable municipal housing in cooperation with relevant authorities in charge of support to IDPs
Other Losses			
Temporary impact during construction		All AFs	A Rent fee will be assessed and paid based during construction.
Damages during construction		All AHs	Case by case basis: compensation will be assessed and paid based on rates in this RPF if damages occur during construction.

5. Implementation

This policy framework will be implemented in four stages, each of which is described briefly below.

a) **Resettlement Screening and Scoping.** The MDF environmental and social specialist will ensure that ToR for the Feasibility Studies (FS) and EIA for each subproject (including the private sector investments to be supported under Component 1.2) includes resettlement screening/scoping paragraph. Resettlement screening will provide sufficient information to determine whether the subprojects trigger OP 4.12 and to identify broad scope and scale of impact. If a private sector investment triggers OP 4.12, it will be removed from the competitive selection process for support under Component 1.2. This is also the case for any sub-project that requires the resettlement of households or businesses.

b) **Preparation of RAPs.** The Consultant to be hired by the MDF to conduct the FS will, at an early phase of the FS, carry out a field survey and consult with the land cadastre, to determine if OP 4.12 is triggered. If it is determined that the OP 4.12 will be triggered, then the Consultant will prepare the RAP, under the guidance of the environmental and social specialist of the MDF. The environmental and social specialist will swiftly inform the Bank task team that OP 4.12 will be triggered and that a RAP will be prepared. If it is determined that OP 4.12 will not be triggered, the FS for the particular subproject will clearly state to the effect.

Once it is determined that OP 4.12 will be triggered, the Municipality responsible for RAP implementation will establish special Commission (RAP Implementation Unit) consisting of municipal officials, head of land use and land management services of municipalities, heads of other relevant services of Municipalities, head of legal services, the environmental and social specialist and the lawyer of MDF etc. The Working Group will consist of specialists of the land use and land management services of Municipalities (topographers, GIS and land cadastre specialists, etc.), highly skilled experts of economic and law procured to fit the purpose. On a basis of agreement with MDF management and the Commission, if necessary the structure of the Working Group can be expanded on the account of the invitation of professionals of different spheres in view of the specification of the concrete project.

The MDF will also procure Consultant to prepare a RAP that complies with OP 4.12 for each subproject requiring RAP. The MDF will ensure that RAP preparation process will meet Bank's consultation and disclosure requirements and will submit draft RAPs to the Bank and other stakeholders for review and clearance. Approval of the RAP by the Bank is required before imposition of impacts and initiation of works.

The preparation and implementation of RAP includes as below:

1. The preliminary screening and identification of the key problems, selection of the appropriate mechanisms for the organization of the resettlement as well as the collection of the information necessary for the preparation of resettlement actions under the component or sub-component of the Project linked with the resettlement. The use and details of such working mechanisms on the settlement depend on the scales and complexity of the supposed action.
2. The disclosure of all legal and physical entities affected by the resettlement, the collection of related socio-economic information about all affected people;

3. The appointment of the cut-off date by which affected persons will be identified. All claims for compensations received after the cut-off date will not be eligible; this includes properties and assets appearing on the site after the cut-off date, and census of affected persons and assets.
4. The elaboration of the compensatory strategy and valuing of the compensatory measures. The certified appraiser shall be engaged in the evaluation of the properties and assets. The public debates on the compensatory measures.
5. The development of the resettlement schedule and procedures, including timely and adequate disclosure of information and public discussions involving the affected people.
6. The implementation of RAP including defining implementing actors/agencies and their responsibilities
7. The audit and monitoring of RAP.

c) **Implementation of the RAPs.** The Client (local municipality) will be responsible for the implementation of the RAPs, while the environmental and social specialist of the MDF will assist the municipalities through participation in Working Groups and Commission. The Municipalities will assist affected persons in protecting their rights and preparing documentation required to register land purchases, land use agreements and servitude agreements. Compensation/rehabilitation measures will be implemented as the civil works progress but prior to the start of the construction on a particular section.

The details of land acquisition procedure will be spelled out in RAP(s), but they will include:

- Initial consultation to PAP to notify the project and board impact
- Census, geographic survey and socioeconomic survey of PAP
- Determination of PAP and scope/ scale of impact
- Compensation package and drafting of RAP
- Consultation with PAP
- Negotiation with PAP and payment of compensation
- Payment of compensation and implementation of rehabilitation measures

In the process of implementation of concrete projects, the most important function of the Working Group is to check the alienation of affected land and the demarcation made by the contractor, also to correct measuring and inventory data stipulated by project possible changes. The Working Group will implement its activities in intimate contact with society. Namely, all implemented inventory processes by this group should be held in witness as of the owner, also his/her neighbors, representatives of Sakrebulo and rayon administration. When developing an inventory of impact, the Demarcation Act, similar to what is developed for the East-West Highway Improvement project and attached to the RPF, will be developed and used to ensure that all stakeholders, including the affected persons, their neighbors, the Municipality and the representative of MDF agree on the scope and scale of impact.

In accordance with approved RAP and active legislation, the Working Group will prepare all necessary documentation (extract from public registry, demarcation act, audit conclusion, copy of ID, bank requisites, etc.), which should be presented then to the Commission. On the basis of these submitted documents the Commission makes a decision concerning the delivery of compensation and in case of owner's consent makes a deed of purchase. Based on contract with the owner the amount will be transferred on private bank account, and afterwards MDF will obtain its right on the land.

If Municipality fails to reach agreement over terms of compensation, then it may either revise the design of civil works to accommodate requests of PAP, or start a process of expropriation. The Constitution of Georgia establishes the right to involuntary expropriation of property for public needs. The Law of Georgia on the Rules for Expropriation of Ownership for Necessary Public Need (July 23, 1999) defines the procedures, obligations and the rules of implementation of expropriation. The permit on property expropriation should be issued by the District (City) Court Decision on the basis of the Presidential Decree. Expropriation can be undertaken only after the compensation that regional court has judged as fair and equal to the market value has been paid to the relevant land owners. The PAP may lodge a complaint over the amount compensated, however, the Municipality will be granted right to expropriate and initiate civil works once the court decision for expropriation is established and compensation as considered fair by the court is paid into the PAP.

The project shall resort to property expropriation only in exceptional cases as the last resort: (i) when negotiation over the purchase price of land and other project affected properties fails; and (ii) re-design of investments is impossible. When an empty land or abandoned structures whose owners cannot be physically identified needs to be acquired, the compensation amount due to the PAP shall be deposited in an escrow account and saved at the bank account, and the notice will be posted in national newspapers, until the PAP is identified.

The elaborated RAP shall cover the aspects below:

1. Identify all residents to be displaced or affected by the project;
2. Explain the reasons and efforts made to avoid or minimize the resettlement; or negative impacts;
3. Describe the consultation process with the affected people, including all reasonable alternatives discussed and the participation of the people of the people in decision-making process;
4. Describe the rights of all categories subject to the resettlement;
5. Give the examples of compensation rates for the loss of the properties and prove the adequacy of such rates, i.e. the equality of the rates to the replacement costs, at least (the total sum needed for the property replacement);
6. Describe the assistance that will be rendered during the resettlement;
7. Describe the institutional responsibilities for RAP and the grievance redress procedure and mechanisms;
8. Describe the monitoring and evaluation measures for the Project implementation;
9. Describe the schedule and budget assigned for RAP implementation;

10. Describe the assistance rendered to the most vulnerable groups;
11. Describe the measures aimed at the adaptation of the resettled people.

The approval of each RAP by the World Bank is required prior to displacement and initiation of works.

d) Methods of consultations with and participation of affected people

The Operating Policy OP 4.12 envisages the following measures:

- i) The resettled people shall be duly informed about the opportunities and rights during the resettlement;
- ii) The people shall participate in the consultations and may select among the various resettlement options reasonable technically and economically.

The public consultations shall be carried out at every stage of the resettlement:

- At the preliminary state;
- During the resettlement;
- At the stage of monitoring and “valuing of adequacy of compensatory measures and resettlement proper to achieve the results in compliance with the requirements to this Action Standard”.

Special attention shall be paid to the consultations with the most vulnerable groups. PIU shall promote the decision-making process related to the resettlement among the public.

PIU shall prepare the program of consultations comparable with the scope of resettlement or other negative impacts.

The key method of the consultations is the public hearings aimed at the discussion of the resettlement and its consequences. The owners and users of the affected properties and assets shall be invited to participate in the discussion. According to the Georgian legal frameworks the appropriate municipalities and/or other authorities are responsible for the public hearings. PIU shall not transfer the task to the municipal authorities, but engage the independent consultants who undertake the necessary steps to guarantee the consultations with the affected people. The content and results of the consultations shall be recorded and kept together with other Projects documents and submitted to the World Bank as well.

Besides the public hearings it is essential to conduct the series of consultations with various groups/particular representatives depending on the volume of resettlement actions. The results of the consultations shall be recorded, signed by PIU and the representative of the affected people. All documents relevant to Project Affected Persons such as Resettlement Policy Framework, Resettlement Action Plans, contact and process information on grievance mechanisms, time and agenda of public consultations will be disclosed publicly by the PIU and municipal authorities.

d) Monitoring. The MDF and Municipalities will develop a mechanism to monitor implementation of the RAPs.

The assessment and monitoring are the fundamental components of the resettlement plan and are essential for the quality implementation of the targeted actions. Proper assessment and monitoring are significant requirements of the international credit organizations and aimed at supporting the principles of safeguard documents in compliance with OP 4.12.

The assessment is aimed at the following:

- The appraisal and monitoring of the resettlement process in compliance with targeted RAP
- The adjustment of RAP depending on the practical measures aimed at the achievement of the targeted purposes
- The monitoring and evaluation of the economic and social changes upon the resettlement
- The identification of the problems to be resolved in compliance with the documents as above

The assessment shall be done to confirm the compliance with the documents as follows:

- The present document
- Russian legal frameworks
- The Operating Policy OP 4.12

It is assumed to assess the following resettlement aspects:

- The compliance with the targets and purposes of the present document
- The public consultations on the preparation of mutually accepted terms of the resettlement
- The displacement process
- The assistance and support of the vulnerable groups of the population
- The impact on the living standards of the resettled people
- The resettlement costs and compliance with the budget
- The monitoring indicators for every sub-project include as follows:
- Number of households to be displaced, including number of people in every household;
- Number of legal entities subject to the resettlement, including number of employees;
- Number of resettled households, including number of people;
- Number of resettled legal entities, including number of employees;
- Number of individuals/households whose income lessens due to the sub-project and related works (number of people);
- Number of individuals/households, who received the support in search for the alternative income sources (number of people);
- Number of redressed grievances;
- Number of settled complaints;
- The sums of monetary compensations;
- Types and value of non-cash compensations;
- Types of rendered assistance (except for compensations).

(see annex 6)

6. Agreements

- Land acquisition and income loss will be kept to an absolute minimum.
- Wherever possible, the Municipality will negotiate with the PAPs to agree on the terms of compensation and avoid expropriation.
- The MDF will report to the Bank Task Team immediately once it is determined that OP 4.12 will be triggered for particular subprojects.
- MDF will develop an implementation plan based on OP4.12 and the approved RAPs.
- The Bank, will review drafts of the respective RAPs and recommend revisions, as needed. Bank approval of each RAP is required prior to imposition of impacts and initiation of works.
- The MDF will establish a monitoring capacity in the Municipality where relevant RAP is implemented to monitor preparation and implementation of the RAPs
- The environmental and social specialist of the MDF will provide necessary support to ensure that municipalities implement relevant RAPs satisfactorily.
- The Bank, and other stakeholders, will participate in different aspects of preparation, implementation and monitoring of the RAPs during regular missions.
- The MDF will promptly inform the Bank and other stakeholders of significant unforeseen problems or circumstances that may affect outcomes of the RAPs and implementation plans.
- The MDF will submit to the Bank RAP completion reports for each subproject for which a RAP is developed.

7. Grievance Redress Mechanism

- PAPs dissatisfied with compensation or other resettlement assistance at any stage of the process can complain directly to the environment and social specialist for MDF. A phone number, email address, postal address, and SMS service will be available for this purpose, in order to resolve grievances within a matter of days (maximum 3 days).
- If the PAP is not satisfied with the solution provided by the environment and social specialist, then the Municipal Commission can be called together, to hear the case of the PAP. This meeting should be chaired by an independent third party (e.g. NGO, Academic, Retired Judge etc.). This commission should be formed and its findings completed within two weeks of the complaint being lodged.
- If the PAP is still not satisfied, then MDF will put together an ad-hoc committee at the national level to review the complaint. This committee will include representatives of the MDF, Municipality, and independent third parties, and its work will be completed within a month of the complaint being lodged.
- At any point an independent valuation or assessment of the value of the asset to be acquired can be conducted in order to support the grievance redress process.
- At any point, the PAP is entitled to go to court in order to resolve the grievance.
- PAPs will be made aware of their rights under the grievance redress mechanism and Georgian law as soon as it is clear that they will be affected.

ANNEX 1

SYNOPSIS OF SELECTED GEORGIAN LAWS AND REGULATIONS ON RAP

The Ministry of Economic Development (MoED). The projects related to construction or reconstruction of the Highways of international and national value are classified as the projects of Special Importance. MoED is responsible for carrying out the review of technical documentation (including conclusion of an independent experts) and issuing Permits on Construction for such projects. Construction permitting procedure comprises approval of technical design and considers consent of the other ministries and responsible bodies upon the route and RoW. Therefore, Construction Permit issued by the MoED represents integrated decision of the government on granting the permit to use the RoW for construction of the road, and this is precondition for completion of land acquisition process.

The Roads Department of the Ministry of Regional Development and Infrastructure of Georgia (RDMRDI). Within the Georgian Government, the Road Department of the Ministry of Regional Development and Infrastructure of Georgia (RDMRDI) has the lead responsibility for the management of road construction projects and for land acquisition as the significant component of the project. In more general scope, the RDMRDI is responsible for elaboration of policy and strategic plans related to developing motor roads, management of road and traffic related issues and construction, rehabilitation, reconstruction and maintenance of the roads of public use of international and national significance, utilizing funds from the state budget, loans, grants and other financial sources.

Within the frames of the programs and projects, where the RDMRDI is appointed by the Government as implementing agency, the RDMRDI is responsible for the procurement of design and EIA studies, as well as works on construction and rehabilitation of roads of international and national significance, and is responsible for ensuring compliance with the Georgian legislation and environmental and social requirements of the relevant donor organizations. Land acquisition and accordingly development and implementation of the Resettlement Action Plan (RAP) is direct responsibility of the RDMRDI. The RAPs are usually prepared by the independent specialized consultants, but the consultant's services are procured by the RDMRDI. The approved RAPs are implemented by the RDMRDI staff. Therefore the RDMRDI should have sufficient experience for procurement of the consultant services and RAP preparation, as well as adequate capacity to ensure review and approval of the RAP and its follow up implementation in compliance with Georgian legislation and IFI's requirements.

Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources Protection. Pursuant to the active legislation of Georgia the Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources Protection is responsible for environmental protection.

Land Resources Protection and Mineral Resources Service is under the Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources Protection. To the competence of Land Resources Protection and Mineral Resources Service belongs:

- Participation in the process of development and implementation of governmental policy of sustainable management and targeted using of land resources and fossil;
- Coordination of planning and implementation of measurements for land degradation and desertification prevention.

- Consideration and negotiation of projects/plans on removing, storing and using of fertile level of soil
- Creation of database of polluted lands by hazardous substances and waste.
- Consideration and negotiation of projects/plans on rehabilitation of degraded, eroded and recultivated land.
- Creation of soil degradation and pollution assessment system.

The Ministry of Justice. The Ministry of Justice shall lead the most significant role in registration and declaration of ownership rights to land and real property. Declaration and registration of ownership rights to land and real property is undertaken solely by the National Agency of Public Registry at the Ministry of Justice.

Framework Legislation

The Constitution of Georgia, August 24, 1995;

The Constitution determines the essence of **private ownership** and defines presumption of inviolability however also determines the issues related to legislative frames of **compensation** issues and **expropriation** of land and immovable property for necessary public need. The Constitution of Georgia ensures the **publicity** of information. Pursuant to the Article 21 of the Constitution of Georgia "the right of ownership and inheritance is declared and secured". Nobody is eligible to cancel the universal right of ownership and legacy. Throughout of the necessary public need or in case of emergency necessity the Article 21.3 of the Constitution the expropriation of the private ownership is allowed however, only according to the Court Decision or under the rules identified in the organic laws on basis of the appropriate (fair) reimbursement. The present law regulates **privatization** issues of the existing lands at state ownership and out of subject its topicality less presumable (Existing private owned land parcels assignation to the State). **Herewith is to be noticed that in present some draft law is submitted to the Parliament and after they are adopted they may make influence of the discussion of the existing document.** Organic law is among Constitution and other laws in the hierarchy of the legislation, which underlines its particular importance. Other articles of the Constitution also create legislative basis related to resettlement measures of the motor road construction. **This includes State expropriation of land for urgent public necessity by power of eminent domain, information disclosure and public consultation, protection of cultural property, and grievance resulting** from land acquisition and displacement of the population. The stated regulations create the set of procedures that allow obtaining the land ownership rights for road construction from private owners.

The Article 42 of the Constitution makes the citizens eligible to claim, in particular protects them and encourages appealing to the court for protection of their rights and freedom.

The Civil Code of Georgia, June 26, 1997;

The Civil Code of Georgia regulates private civil relationships, and it evolves property rights, the law of obligations, family law and the law of inheritance. Those regulations of the Civil Code particularly relevant in the property law section where the ownership, construction and servitude rights are discussed, and other type rights directly spreads on the existing project.

Ownership Rights. The ownership right entitles its beneficiary to freely possess and use property. Mentioned right can be limited within legislative or other agreement. Ownership on the land parcel

gives implicit right to land owner to implement construction activities if it is not restricted by any agreement or law.

Construction Right. The owner is allowed to transfer a land plot to another person in temporary usage (not to exceed 59 years) for charge or free of charge. The transferee obtains the right to build a building/construction on or under the land plot, as well as to assign and transfer this right under inheritance or tenancy, borrowing or renting. The construction right may cover such part of a land plot that is not necessary for the actual construction but allows a better use of the facility constructed on the basis of the construction permit. Termination of the construction right requires consent from the landowner. However, as the terms of construction right refer to motor road construction aside to this approach also possible to be utilized the right to request necessary right of way. On the basis of the Article 180 of this Code, if a land parcel lacks the access to public roads that are necessary for its adequate use, the other owner may claim from a neighbor to tolerate the use of his land parcel by the owner for the purpose of providing the necessary access. The mentioned article may be used for road construction, though the determination of necessary right of way is rather complicated procedure

and in case of road construction evolves the obligations to prove the existence of the elements of such rights. In case of necessary right of way, the implementer of road project shall have the right to undertake road construction notwithstanding the owner's will.

It should be noted also Servitude Right on the property, that due to Georgian Civil Code presents establishment the limits on land parcel or on other property in favor to other land parcel or owner of the property (beneficiary). The Beneficiary is granted the right to use land parcel under restriction with some conditions and /or restrict concrete activities or prohibits land owner from using significant rights against this land parcel. Necessary Right of Way. The Georgian Civil Code gives utilities and state agencies the ability to obtain rights of way under the Necessary Right of Way provision

However, in regard with this project, any rights (among them ownership, construction, inevitable road or servitude) the terms and conditions for transfer the right for construction shall be defined against each land parcel in accordance to the identified rules and on the basis of entered and registered agreement entered by a landowner and the party holding the corresponding right of construction.

Land and Property Ownership Related Legislation

In Georgia, land acquisition for public use is governed by the following laws, reviewed below:

The Law of Georgia on Ownership to Agricultural Land, March 22 1996, as amended;

The current law is completely different from the initial version adopted in 1996. The changes made to this law in different times (among them the amendments on the basis of the Law # 389 as of July 14, 2000) have significantly changed its initial format and simplified to maximum extent the procedures considered under the Law.

The sphere of regulation of the Law on ownership right to agricultural land mainly extends over the agricultural land parcels.

Article 3.1. Defines that "a land parcel with or without household structure that is registered at the public register and used for cattle-breeding and plant cultivation produces is considered as an agricultural land parcel" with existing household and additional structures or without them. Also the share of a member of household community within the shared hay fields, grazing lands or forestry

areas and the part of the agricultural land that may be the object "of separate ownership right" (Article 3.2).

The Law determines that the ownership right to agricultural land is granted to the State, physical person, household community (Komli) and legal entity registered in accordance to the legislation of Georgia, which carries out his activities in agricultural sphere. Besides, the Law declares the form of village and household community (Komli) ownership to state-owned grazing lands, private and form of community ownership in high mountain regions (Article 4.3).

According to the Articles 6 and 8, acquisition of agricultural land is allowed on the basis of ordinary rules and general restrictions. Ordinary rule considers land alienation without any permits and other limitations, and general restrictions consider land alienation only on the basis of the consent of co-owner of shared property. In case of agricultural land acquisition the lessee has the priority right to purchase the land. (Article 10). Alienation is restricted if the area after this action will be less than 5 hectare.

The Law defines Tax sanctions if land has not been cultivated for 2 years and for non-payment of land tax and non transmission to the other person in lease condition. In such cases the law does not directly state any type of penalty and only refers that in described cases shall be exercised the sanctions under the Tax legislation (Article 20).

The Law of Georgia on Compensation of Compensatory Land Cultivation Costs and Sustained Damage in Case of Allocation of Agricultural Land for Non-Agricultural Purposes, October 2, 1997, as amended July 11, 2007;

The objective of the law is to establish regulation for allocation, use or dispose of the agricultural land plot for non-agricultural purpose and related compensation values corresponding to municipalities and recreational territories in Georgia, as well as terms of payment. Aside that, the law defines compensations to the private landowners or land leasers for limiting their ownership rights or for worsening the land plot quality and productivity.

According to clause 3 of the law, the land plots beyond the recreational zones owned by the citizens of Georgia (families, komlis) are not subject for the change of the land category from agricultural into non-agricultural in case of need for constructing on the mentioned land plot the leaving house for the owner or any barns and utility rooms. This protects the private landowner from additional compensation payments related with the changes of the land category. At the same time, the outcome of this clause pertinent to resettlement is that certain houses and buildings could be situated on the agricultural land plots and this may have additional impact on replacement cost calculations.

Legislation and Procedures Related to Expropriation of Ownership

In Georgia the legislative acts given below regulate the issues related to legal ownership rights to land and real property and the expropriation of land for public needs: The Law of Georgia on the Rules for Expropriation of Ownership for Necessary Public Need July 23, 1999 and Procedural Civil Code of Georgia

In general terms, the above-listed laws and regulations give the possibility of applying the following three mechanisms for legal application of the property rights:

- Obtaining the right on way without expropriation though the payment of due compensation (on the basis of negotiations or a court decision) prior to commencement of the activities;

- Expropriation which gives the possibility of obtaining permanent right to land and/or necessary road on the basis of Eminent Domain Law or a court decision through the payment of due compensation;
- Expropriation of ownership for urgent public necessity, which gives the possibility of obtaining permanent rights on land and/or necessary road for the purpose of national security or accident prevention. Expropriation is to be made on the basis of the

In more details the legal requirements and procedures are described below:

The Law of Georgia on the Rules for Expropriation of Ownership for Necessary Public Need July 23, 1999

The aim of this Law is to determine rules of granting the Right to Expropriation for pressing public needs and rules of implementing Expropriation. Expropriation for pressing public needs may be effected on the basis of an Order issued by the Georgian Minister of Economy and Sustainable Development (hereinafter, “the Minister) and a court decision, in favor of a State body, a local self-governance body, a public law entity or a private law entity, which has been granted the Right to Expropriation under this Law.

It is allowed to take away property for pressing public needs in accordance with Article 21 of the Georgian Constitution. The Right to Expropriation may be granted through an Order issued by the Minister and by a decision of a court. A ministerial order shall determine the inevitability of expropriation for pressing public needs and the subject who may be granted the Right to Expropriation.

Only a court may decide on expropriation. A court decision must indicate the State body, the local self-governance body, the public law entity or the private law entity, which has been granted the Right to Expropriation. A court decision shall also include a detailed description of the property subject to expropriation and a reference to the obligation to provide the proprietor with proper compensation.

After the relevant ministerial order has been promulgated, the person seeking the Right to Expropriation shall provide every proprietor whose property is subject to Expropriation with information, which shall be published in the central and the relevant local press. The information shall include a brief description of the project, the scope and the territorial area of its implementation, and the property that may be subject to expropriation.

Every proprietor indicated in the first paragraph shall also be informed about the date when the application has been lodged with the court and the scheduled date of hearing the application by the court.

District (town) courts are empowered to decide on granting the Right to Expropriation.

A person seeking the Right to Expropriation shall apply to a district (town) court with an application for granting the Right to Expropriation. The application shall include

- (a) The name of the district (town) court;
- (b) The name and the legal address of the applicant;
- (c) The first name, the last name and the address of the representative, if the application is being lodged by a representative;
- (d) The applicant’s request;
- (e) Circumstances on which the applicant bases his/her request;
- (f) Evidence corroborating these circumstances;
- (g) A list of documents attached to the application.

3. An application shall also be accompanied with:

- (a) A detailed description of a project for which the Right to Expropriation is being sought;
- (b) A relevant ministerial order
- (c) A detailed description of the property subject to expropriation;
- (d) A document confirming that the information indicated in Article 4 of this Law has been published.

A district (town) court will hear the application according to this Law and in accordance with terms and rules prescribed by the Georgian Civil Procedure Code. A decision of a district (town) court will be enforced pursuant to rules applicable to decisions subject to immediate enforcement.

If an Expropriator and a proprietor cannot agree about a market value of the property or a compensation sum or another property to be transferred to the proprietor as compensation, each party shall have the right to file a lawsuit with a court having jurisdiction over the subject matter.

An Expropriator's lawsuit must be accompanied with:

- (a) A detailed description of the property subject to Expropriation;
- (b) Documents confirming the existence of a pressing public need for expropriating the property;
- (c) Documents about the project to be implemented for pressing public needs;
- (d) A district (town) court decision granting the Right to Expropriation.

3. A court is authorized to determine the type of compensation of the property subject to Expropriation on its own, based on a reasoned motion of a party.

A court is authorized to appoint an independent expert to have the property evaluated, according to rules prescribed by the Georgian Civil Procedure Code. An independent expert shall, within a term indicated, furnish the court with a report about market values of the property subject to expropriation and other property offered to the proprietor as compensation in lieu of his/her property. Based on the expert's report and evidence submitted by the parties, a court will make a final determination about the value of compensation to be awarded to the proprietor in exchange for the property subject to Expropriation.

Procedural Civil Code of Georgia, November 14 1997, as amended;

The general courts of Georgia consider the cases according to the rules identified under the Procedural Civil Code of Georgia. The requirements of the procedural law are exercised during the lawsuit, during implementation of separate procedural actions or execution of the court decision.

The Procedural Civil Code of Georgia also regulates those cases when determination of the defendant is impossible. This may be important for the Project in the cases when the landowner is not found and correspondingly ownership to his/her land parcel cannot be obtained in legally valid manner, i.e. it is impossible to enter corresponding agreement with the landowner or him/her cannot sign other type of document.

According to article 18 of the Procedural Civil Code of Georgia if the claim refers to real property the claimant has the right to submit a claim to the court against the owner according to the land parcel location.

According to Article 78, of the Procedural Civil Code, when the location of the defendant is unknown, there are two alternative ways to provide him/her the information on lawsuit: (1) notice of lawsuit appointment is delivered to local self-government or government bodies; or (2) makes a decision on public notification through publication. Public notification is in written format and contains major data of the documents that the defendant shall be introduced to. Public notification is placed on the Board for Applications in the Court. However, the claimant is eligible to ensure the distribution of public notification on its own expenses.

In both cases, the Civil Code defines one-month term for considering the notification on appointment of a lawsuit as delivered. However, the legislation allows the Court to extend this term not more than for a month. The consideration of notification on application of a lawsuit as delivered

allows the judge to conduct the sitting of the court and make a default judgment in regard with real property.

Summary

Overall the above laws/regulations provide that the principle of replacement cost compensating at market value is reasonable and legally acceptable. The laws also identify the types of damages eligible to compensation and indicate that compensation is to be given both for loss of physical assets and for the loss of incomes. Finally, these laws place strong emphasis on consultation and notification to ensure that the AP participate in the process. As in practice, public opposition to expropriation is very strong this instrument to acquire land is used only in extreme cases when negotiations between the agency acquiring the land and the owners fail. Usually once public interest is established, the investor (RDMRDI, in this case) negotiates compensation for the sale or use of land with landowners and land users.

Other Laws having regard to the land acquisition process.

The Law of Georgia on Motor Roads, November 11, 1994.

Clause 27 only briefly addresses the issue of land allocation for the needs of the motor road construction through referring to the active legislation.

The Law of Georgia Licenses and Permits, 2005

The law specifies permits and license required in Georgia. Amongst the others the law mentions Construction Permit and Environmental Impact Permit, which have regard to the highway modernization projects and related activities (construction, upgrading etc.) and RoW or route approval.

The Laws of Georgia on Environmental Impact Permit (2008) and on Cultural Heritage (2007) describe permits, related studies and clearance procedures applicable to the construction projects.

ANNEX 2

OP 4.12 INVOLUNTARY RESETTLEMENT

OP 4.12
December 2001

These policies were prepared for use by World Bank staff and are not necessarily a complete treatment of the subject.

Involuntary Resettlement

This Operational Policy statement was revised in April 2004 to ensure consistency with the requirements of [OP/BP 6.00](#), issued in April 2004. These changes may be viewed [here](#).

OP 4.12 (revised April 2004) applies only to projects that are governed by [OP/BP 6.00](#), *Bank Financing* - that is, those in countries with [approved country financing parameters](#). Other operational policy statements governing Bank financing that have been amended to reflect OP/BP 6.00 also apply to these projects, click to view a full [Table of Contents \(blue\)](#).

Projects in countries without approved country financing parameters continue to be subject to other operational policy statements governing Bank financing; click here for a full [Table of Contents \(yellow\)](#) that includes these statements.

Note: OP and [BP 4.12](#) together replace OD 4.30, *Involuntary Resettlement*. These OP and BP apply to all projects for which a Project Concept Review takes place on or after January 1, 2002. Questions may be addressed to the Director, Social Development Department (SDV).

1. Bank¹ experience indicates that involuntary resettlement under development projects, if unmitigated, often gives rise to severe economic, social, and environmental risks: production systems are dismantled; people face impoverishment when their productive assets or income sources are lost; people are relocated to environments where their productive skills may be less applicable and the competition for resources greater; community institutions and social networks are weakened; kin groups are dispersed; and cultural identity, traditional authority, and the potential for mutual help are diminished or lost. This policy includes safeguards to address and mitigate these impoverishment risks.

Policy Objectives

2. Involuntary resettlement may cause severe long-term hardship, impoverishment, and environmental damage unless appropriate measures are carefully planned and carried out. For these reasons, the overall objectives of the Bank's policy on involuntary resettlement are the following:

- (a) Involuntary resettlement should be avoided where feasible, or minimized, exploring all viable alternative project designs.²
- (b) Where it is not feasible to avoid resettlement, resettlement activities should be conceived and executed as sustainable development programs, providing sufficient investment resources to enable the persons displaced by the project to share in project

benefits. Displaced persons³ should be meaningfully consulted and should have opportunities to participate in planning and implementing resettlement programs. (c) Displaced persons should be assisted in their efforts to improve their livelihoods and standards of living or at least to restore them, in real terms, to pre-displacement levels or to levels prevailing prior to the beginning of project implementation, whichever is higher.⁴

Impacts Covered

3. This policy covers direct economic and social impacts⁵ that both result from Bank-assisted investment projects⁶, and are caused by
- (a) the involuntary⁷ taking of land⁸ resulting in
 - (i) relocation or loss of shelter;
 - (ii) lost of assets or access to assets; or
 - (iii) loss of income sources or means of livelihood, whether or not the affected persons must move to another location; or
 - (b) the involuntary restriction of access⁹ to legally designated parks and protected areas resulting in adverse impacts on the livelihoods of the displaced persons.
4. This policy applies to all components of the project that result in involuntary resettlement, regardless of the source of financing. It also applies to other activities resulting in involuntary resettlement, that in the judgment of the Bank, are (a) directly and significantly related to the Bank-assisted project, (b) necessary to achieve its objectives as set forth in the project documents; and (c) carried out, or planned to be carried out, contemporaneously with the project.
5. Requests for guidance on the application and scope of this policy should be addressed to the Resettlement Committee (see [BP 4.12http://wbln0011.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/BProw/383197ED73D421A385256B180072D46D?OpenDocument](http://wbln0011.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/BProw/383197ED73D421A385256B180072D46D?OpenDocument), para. 7).¹⁰

Required Measures

6. To address the impacts covered under para. 3 (a) of this policy, the borrower prepares a resettlement plan or a resettlement policy framework (see paras. 25-30) that covers the following:
- (a) The resettlement plan or resettlement policy framework includes measures to ensure that the displaced persons are
 - (i) informed about their options and rights pertaining to resettlement;
 - (ii) consulted on, offered choices among, and provided with technically and economically feasible resettlement alternatives; and
 - (iii) provided prompt and effective compensation at full replacement cost¹¹ for losses of assets¹² attributable directly to the project.
 - (b) If the impacts include physical relocation, the resettlement plan or resettlement policy framework includes measures to ensure that the displaced persons are
 - (i) provided assistance (such as moving allowances) during relocation; and

(ii) provided with residential housing, or housing sites, or, as required, agricultural sites for which a combination of productive potential, locational advantages, and other factors is at least equivalent to the advantages of the old site.¹³

(c) Where necessary to achieve the objectives of the policy, the resettlement plan or resettlement policy framework also include measures to ensure that displaced persons are

(i) offered support after displacement, for a transition period, based on a reasonable estimate of the time likely to be needed to restore their livelihood and standards of living;¹⁴ and

(ii) provided with development assistance in addition to compensation measures described in paragraph 6(a) (iii), such as land preparation, credit facilities, training, or job opportunities.

7. In projects involving involuntary restriction of access to legally designated parks and protected areas (see para. 3(b)), the nature of restrictions, as well as the type of measures necessary to mitigate adverse impacts, is determined with the participation of the displaced persons during the design and implementation of the project. In such cases, the borrower prepares a process framework acceptable to the Bank, describing the participatory process by which

(a) specific components of the project will be prepared and implemented;

(b) the criteria for eligibility of displaced persons will be determined;

(c) measures to assist the displaced persons in their efforts to improve their livelihoods, or at least to restore them, in real terms, while maintaining the sustainability of the park or protected area, will be identified; and

(d) potential conflicts involving displaced persons will be resolved.

The process framework also includes a description of the arrangements for implementing and monitoring the process.

8. To achieve the objectives of this policy, particular attention is paid to the needs of vulnerable groups among those displaced, especially those below the poverty line, the landless, the elderly, women and children, indigenous peoples,¹⁵ ethnic minorities, or other displaced persons who may not be protected through national land compensation legislation.

9. Bank experience has shown that resettlement of indigenous peoples with traditional land-based modes of production is particularly complex and may have significant adverse impacts on their identity and cultural survival. For this reason, the Bank satisfies itself that the borrower has explored all viable alternative project designs to avoid physical displacement of these groups. When it is not feasible to avoid such displacement, preference is given to land-based resettlement strategies for these groups (see para. 11) that are compatible with their cultural preferences and are prepared in consultation with them (see [Annex A](http://Inweb18.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocument), <http://Inweb18.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocument> para. 11).

10. The implementation of resettlement activities is linked to the implementation of the investment component of the project to ensure that displacement or restriction of access does not occur before necessary measures for resettlement are in place. For impacts covered in para. 3(a) of this policy, these measures include provision of compensation and of other assistance required for relocation, prior to displacement, and preparation and provision of resettlement sites with adequate facilities, where required. In particular, taking of land and related assets may take place only after compensation has been paid and, where applicable, resettlement sites and moving allowances have been provided to the displaced persons. For impacts covered in para. 3(b) of this policy, the measures to assist the displaced persons are implemented in accordance with the plan of action as part of the project (see para. 30).

11. Preference should be given to land-based resettlement strategies for displaced persons whose livelihoods are land-based. These strategies may include resettlement on public land (see footnote 1 above), or on private land acquired or purchased for resettlement. Whenever replacement land is offered, resettlers are provided with land for which a combination of productive potential, locational advantages, and other factors is at least equivalent to the advantages of the land taken. If land is not the preferred option of the displaced persons, the provision of land would adversely affect the sustainability of a park or protected area,¹⁶ or sufficient land is not available at a reasonable price, non-land-based options built around opportunities for employment or self-employment should be provided in addition to cash compensation for land and other assets lost. The lack of adequate land must be demonstrated and documented to the satisfaction of the Bank.

12. Payment of cash compensation for lost assets may be appropriate where (a) livelihoods are land-based but the land taken for the project is a small fraction <http://wbln0011/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/8BC51CC87982E5BD85256B18006D964D?OpenDocument>¹⁷ of the affected asset and the residual is economically viable; (b) active markets for land, housing, and laborexist, displaced persons use such markets, and there is sufficient supply of land and housing; or (c) livelihoods are not land-based. Cash compensation levels should be sufficient to replace the lost land and other assets at full replacement cost in local markets.

13. For impacts covered under para. 3(a) of this policy, the Bank also requires the following:

(a) Displaced persons and their communities, and any host communities receiving them, are provided timely and relevant information, consulted on resettlement options, and offered opportunities to participate in planning, implementing, and monitoring resettlement. Appropriate and accessible grievance mechanisms are established for these groups.

(b) In new resettlement sites or host communities, infrastructure and public services are provided as necessary to improve, restore, or maintain accessibility and levels of service for the displaced persons and host communities. Alternative or similar resources are provided to compensate for the loss of access to community resources (such as fishing areas, grazing areas, fuel, or fodder).

(c) Patterns of community organization appropriate to the new circumstances are based on choices made by the displaced persons. To the extent possible, the existing social and cultural institutions of resettlers and any host communities are preserved and resettlers' preferences with respect to relocating in preexisting communities and groups are honored.

Eligibility for Benefits¹⁸

14. Upon identification of the need for involuntary resettlement in a project, the borrower carries out a census to identify the persons who will be affected by the project (see the [Annex](http://Inweb18.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocument) <http://Inweb18.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocument><http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/whatnewvirt/CA2D01A4D1BDF58085256B19008197F6?OpenDocument>, para. 6(a)), to determine who will be eligible for assistance, and to discourage inflow of people ineligible for assistance. The borrower also develops a procedure, satisfactory to the Bank, for establishing the criteria by which displaced persons will be deemed eligible for compensation and other resettlement assistance. The procedure includes provisions for meaningful consultations with affected persons and communities, local authorities, and, as appropriate, nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), and it specifies grievance mechanisms.

15. *Criteria for Eligibility.* Displaced persons may be classified in one of the following three groups:

- (a) those who have formal legal rights to land (including customary and traditional rights recognized under the laws of the country);
- (b) those who do not have formal legal rights to land at the time the census begins but have a claim to such land or assets—provided that such claims are recognized under the laws of the country or become recognized through a process identified in the resettlement plan (see [Annex](http://Inweb18.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocument) <http://Inweb18.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocument><http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/whatnewvirt/CA2D01A4D1BDF58085256B19008197F6?OpenDocument>, para. 7(f)); and¹⁹
- (c) those who have no recognizable legal right or claim to the land they are occupying.

16. Persons covered under para. 15(a) and (b) are provided compensation for the land they lose, and other assistance in accordance with para. 6. Persons covered under para. 15(c) are provided resettlement assistance²⁰ in lieu of compensation for the land they occupy, and other assistance, as necessary, to achieve the objectives set out in this policy, if they occupy the project area prior to a cut-off date established by the borrower and acceptable to the Bank.²¹ Persons who encroach on the area after the cut-off date are not entitled to compensation or any other form of resettlement assistance. All persons included in para. 15(a), (b), or (c) are provided compensation for loss of assets other than land.

Resettlement Planning, Implementation, and Monitoring

17. To achieve the objectives of this policy, different planning instruments are used, depending on the type of project:

- (a) a resettlement plan or abbreviated resettlement plan is required for all operations that entail involuntary resettlement unless otherwise specified (see para. 25 and [Annex](http://wbln0011.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/OPolw/C19E5F010F97E04485256B180070DD3E?OpenDocument) <http://wbln0011.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/OPolw/C19E5F010F97E04485256B180070DD3E?OpenDocument><http://Inweb18.worldbank.org/In>

[stitutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocument](http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocument)<http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/whatnewvirt/CA2D01A4D1BDF58085256B19008197F6?OpenDocument>);

(b) a resettlement policy framework is required for operations referred to in paras. 26-30 that may entail involuntary resettlement, unless otherwise specified (see [Annex A](http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocument)<http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/whatnewvirt/CA2D01A4D1BDF58085256B19008197F6?OpenDocument>); and

(c) a process framework is prepared for projects involving restriction of access in accordance with para. 3(b) (see para. 31).

18. The borrower is responsible for preparing, implementing, and monitoring a resettlement plan, a resettlement policy framework, or a process framework (the “resettlement instruments”), as appropriate, that conform to this policy. The resettlement instrument presents a strategy for achieving the objectives of the policy and covers all aspects of the proposed resettlement. Borrower commitment to, and capacity for, undertaking successful resettlement is a key determinant of Bank involvement in a project.

19. Resettlement planning includes early screening, scoping of key issues, the choice of resettlement instrument, and the information required to prepare the resettlement component or subcomponent. The scope and level of detail of the resettlement instruments vary with the magnitude and complexity of resettlement. In preparing the resettlement component, the borrower draws on appropriate social, technical, and legal expertise and on relevant community-based organizations and NGOs.²² The borrower informs potentially displaced persons at an early stage about the resettlement aspects of the project and takes their views into account in project design.

20. The full costs of resettlement activities necessary to achieve the objectives of the project are included in the total costs of the project. The costs of resettlement, like the costs of other project activities, are treated as a charge against the economic benefits of the project; and any net benefits to resettlers (as compared to the “without-project” circumstances) are added to the benefits stream of the project. Resettlement components or free-standing resettlement projects need not be economically viable on their own, but they should be cost-effective.

21. The borrower ensures that the Project Implementation Plan is fully consistent with the resettlement instrument.

22. As a condition of appraisal of projects involving resettlement, the borrower provides the Bank with the relevant draft resettlement instrument which conforms to this policy, and makes it available at a place accessible to displaced persons and local NGOs, in a form, manner, and language that are understandable to them. Once the Bank accepts this instrument as providing an adequate basis for project appraisal, the Bank makes it available to the public through its InfoShop. After the Bank has approved the final resettlement instrument, the Bank and the borrower disclose it again in the same manner.²³

23. The borrower’s obligations to carry out the resettlement instrument and to keep the Bank informed of implementation progress are provided for in the legal agreements for the project.

24. The borrower is responsible for adequate monitoring and evaluation of the activities set forth in the resettlement instrument. The Bank regularly supervises resettlement implementation to determine compliance with the resettlement instrument. Upon completion of the project, the borrower undertakes an assessment to determine whether the objectives of the resettlement instrument have been achieved. The assessment takes into account the baseline conditions and the results of resettlement monitoring. If the assessment reveals that these objectives may not be realized, the borrower should propose follow-up measures that may serve as the basis for continued Bank supervision, as the Bank deems appropriate (see also [BP 4.12](#)<http://wbIn0011.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/BProw/383197ED73D421A385256B180072D46D?OpenDocument>, para. 16).

Resettlement Instruments

Resettlement Plan

25. A draft resettlement plan that conforms to this policy is a condition of appraisal (see [Annex A](#)<http://Inweb18.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocument><http://wbIn0018.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/whatnewvirt/CA2D01A4D1BDF58085256B19008197F6?OpenDocument>, paras. 2-21) for projects referred to in para. 17(a) above.²⁴ However, where impacts on the entire displaced population are minor,²⁵ or fewer than 200 people are displaced, an abbreviated resettlement plan may be agreed with the borrower (see [Annex A](#)<http://Inweb18.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocument><http://wbIn0018.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/whatnewvirt/CA2D01A4D1BDF58085256B19008197F6?OpenDocument>, para. 22). The information disclosure procedures set forth in para. 22 apply.

Resettlement Policy Framework

26. For sector investment operations that may involve involuntary resettlement, the Bank requires that the project implementing agency screen subprojects to be financed by the Bank to ensure their consistency with this OP. For these operations, the borrower submits, prior to appraisal, a resettlement policy framework that conforms to this policy (see [Annex A](#)<http://wbIn0011.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/OPolw/C19E5F010F97E04485256B180070DD3E?OpenDocument><http://Inweb18.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocument><http://wbIn0018.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/whatnewvirt/CA2D01A4D1BDF58085256B19008197F6?OpenDocument>, paras. 23-25). The framework also estimates, to the extent feasible, the total population to be displaced and the overall resettlement costs.

27. For financial intermediary operations that may involve involuntary resettlement, the Bank requires that the financial intermediary (FI) screen subprojects to be financed by the Bank to ensure their consistency with this OP. For these operations, the Bank requires that before appraisal the borrower or the FI submit to the Bank a resettlement policy framework conforming to this policy (see [Annex A](#)<http://wbIn0011.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/OPolw/C19E5F010F97E04485256B180070DD3E?OpenDocument><http://Inweb18.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocument><http://wbIn0018.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/whatnewvirt/CA2D01A4D1BDF58085256B19008197F6?OpenDocument>, paras. 23-25). In addition, the framework

includes an assessment of the institutional capacity and procedures of each of the FIs that will be responsible for subproject financing. When, in the assessment of the Bank, no resettlement is envisaged in the subprojects to be financed by the FI, a resettlement policy framework is not required. Instead, the legal agreements specify the obligation of the FIs to obtain from the potential sub-borrowers a resettlement plan consistent with this policy if a subproject gives rise to resettlement. For all subprojects involving resettlement, the resettlement plan is provided to the Bank for approval before the subproject is accepted for Bank financing.

28. For other Bank-assisted project with multiple subprojects²⁶ that may involve involuntary resettlement, the Bank requires that a draft resettlement plan conforming to this policy be submitted to the Bank before appraisal of the project unless, because of the nature and design of the project or of a specific subproject or subprojects (a) the zone of impact of subprojects cannot be determined, or (b) the zone of impact is known but precise sitting alignments cannot be determined. In such cases, the borrower submits a resettlement policy framework consistent with this policy prior to appraisal (see [Annex A](#)<http://Inweb18.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocument><http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/whatnewvirt/CA2D01A4D1BDF58085256B19008197F6?OpenDocument>, paras. 23-25). For other subprojects that do not fall within the above criteria, a resettlement plan conforming to this policy is required prior to appraisal.

29. For each subproject included in a project described in paras. 26, 27, or 28 that may involve resettlement, the Bank requires that a satisfactory resettlement plan or an abbreviated resettlement plan that is consistent with the provisions of the policy framework be submitted to the Bank for approval before the subproject is accepted for Bank financing.

30. For projects described in paras. 26-28 above, the Bank may agree, in writing, that subproject resettlement plans may be approved by the project implementing agency or a responsible government agency or financial intermediary without prior Bank review, if that agency has demonstrated adequate institutional capacity to review resettlement plans and ensure their consistency with this policy. Any such delegation, and appropriate remedies for the entity's approval of resettlement plans found not to be in compliance with Bank policy, are provided for in the legal agreements for the project. In all such cases, implementation of the resettlement plans is subject to ex post review by the Bank.

Process Framework

31. For projects involving restriction of access in accordance with para. 3(b) above, the borrower provides the Bank with a draft process framework that conforms to the relevant provisions of this policy as a condition of appraisal. In addition, during project implementation and before enforcing of the restriction, the borrower prepares a plan of action, acceptable to the Bank, describing the specific measures to be undertaken to assist the displaced persons and the arrangements for their implementation. The plan of action could take the form of a natural resources management plan prepared for the project.

Assistance to the Borrower

32. In furtherance of the objectives of this policy, the Bank may at a borrower's request support the borrower and other concerned entities by providing

- (a) assistance to assess and strengthen resettlement policies, strategies, legal frameworks, and specific plans at a country, regional, or sectorial level;
- (b) financing of technical assistance to strengthen the capacities of agencies responsible for resettlement, or of affected people to participate more effectively in resettlement operations;
- (c) financing of technical assistance for developing resettlement policies, strategies, and specific plans, and for implementation, monitoring, and evaluation of resettlement activities; and
- (d) financing of the investment costs of resettlement.

33. The Bank may finance either a component of the main investment causing displacement and requiring resettlement, or a free-standing resettlement project with appropriate cross-conditionalities, processed and implemented in parallel with the investment that causes the displacement. The Bank may finance resettlement even though it is not financing the main investment that makes resettlement necessary.

-
1. “Bank” includes IBRD and IDA; “loans” includes IDA credits and IDA grants, guarantees, Project Preparation Facility (PPF) advances and grants; and “projects” includes projects under (a) adaptable program lending; (b) learning and innovation loans; (c) PPFs and Institutional Development Funds (IDFs), if they include investment activities; (d) grants under the Global Environment Facility and Montreal Protocol, for which the Bank is the implementing/executing agency; and (e) grants or loans provided by other donors that are administered by the Bank. The term “project” does not include programs under development policy lending operations. “Borrower” also includes, wherever the context requires, the guarantor or the project implementing agency.
 2. In devising approaches to resettlement in Bank-assisted projects, other Bank policies should be taken into account, as relevant. These policies include [OP 4.01, Environmental Assessment](#), [OP 4.04, Natural Habitats](#), [OP / BP 4.10, Indigenous Peoples](#), and [OP 4.11 \(forthcoming\), Management of Cultural Property in Bank-financed Projects](#).
 3. The term “displaced persons” refers to persons who are affected in any of the ways described in para. 3 of this OP.
 4. Displaced persons under para. 3(b) should be assisted in their efforts to improve or restore their livelihoods in a manner that maintains the sustainability of the parks and protected areas.
 5. Where there are adverse indirect social or economic impacts, it is good practice for the borrower to undertake a social assessment and implement measures to minimize and mitigate adverse economic and social impacts, particularly upon poor and vulnerable groups. Other environmental, social, and economic impacts that do not result from land taking may be identified and addressed through environmental assessments and other project reports and instruments.
 6. This policy does not apply to restrictions of access to natural resources under community-based projects, i.e. where the community using the resources decides to restrict access to these resources, provided that an assessment satisfactory to the Bank establishes that the community decision-making process is adequate, and that it provides for identification of appropriate measures to mitigate adverse impacts, if any, on the vulnerable members of the community. This policy also does not cover refugees from natural disasters, war, or civil strife (see [OP/BP 8.50, Emergency Recovery Assistance](#)).
 7. For purposes of this policy, “involuntary” means actions that may be taken without the displaced person’s informed consent or power of choice.
 8. “Land” includes anything growing on or permanently affixed to land, such as buildings and crops. This policy does not apply to regulations of natural resources on a national or regional level to promote their sustainability, such as watershed management, groundwater management, fisheries management, etc. The policy also does not apply to disputes between private parties in land titling projects, although it is good practice for the borrower to undertake a social assessment and implement measures to minimize and mitigate adverse social impacts, especially those affecting poor and vulnerable groups.
 9. For the purposes of this policy, involuntary restriction of access covers restrictions on the use of resources imposed on people living outside the park or protected area, or on those who continue living inside the park or protected area during

and after project implementation. In cases where new parks and protected areas are created as part of the project, persons who lose shelter, land, or other assets are covered under para. 3(a). Persons who lose shelter in existing parks and protected areas are also covered under para. 3(a).

10. The *Involuntary Resettlement Sourcebook* provides good practice guidance to staff on the policy.

11. “Replacement cost” is the method of valuation of assets that helps determine the amount sufficient to replace lost assets and cover transaction costs. In applying this method of valuation, depreciation of structures and assets should not be taken into account (for a detailed definition of replacement cost, see [Annex](#)

[A,http://Inweb18.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocumenthttp://wbln0018.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/whatnewvirt/CA2D01A4D1BDF58085256B19008197F6?OpenDocument](http://Inweb18.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/58AA50B14B6BC071852565A30061BEB6/46FC304892280AB785256B19008197F8?OpenDocumenthttp://wbln0018.worldbank.org/Institutional/Manuals/OpManual.nsf/whatnewvirt/CA2D01A4D1BDF58085256B19008197F6?OpenDocument)

footnote 1). For losses that cannot easily be valued or compensated for in monetary terms (e.g., access to public services, customers, and suppliers; or to fishing, grazing, or forest areas), attempts are made to establish access to equivalent and culturally acceptable resources and earning opportunities. Where domestic law does not meet the standard of compensation at full replacement cost, compensation under domestic law is supplemented by additional measures necessary to meet the replacement cost standard. Such additional assistance is distinct from resettlement assistance to be provided under other clauses of para. 6.

12. If the residual of the asset being taken is not economically viable, compensation and other resettlement assistance are provided as if the entire asset had been taken.

13. The alternative assets are provided with adequate tenure arrangements. The cost of alternative residential housing, housing sites, business premises, and agricultural sites to be provided can be set off against all or part of the compensation payable for the corresponding asset lost.

14. Such support could take the form of short-term jobs, subsistence support, salary maintenance or similar arrangements

15. See [OP / BP 4.10](#), *Indigenous Peoples*.

16. See [OP 4.04](#), *Natural Habitats*.

17. As a general principle, this applies if the land taken constitutes less than 20% of the total productive area.

18. Paras. 13-15 do not apply to impacts covered under para. 3(b) of this policy. The eligibility criteria for displaced persons under 3 (b) are covered under the process framework (see paras. 7 and 30).

19. Such claims could be derived from adverse possession, from continued possession of public lands without government action for eviction (that is, with the implicit leave of the government), or from customary and traditional law and usage, and so on.

20. Resettlement assistance may consist of land, other assets, cash, employment, and so on, as appropriate.

21. Normally, this cut-off date is the date the census begins. The cut-off date could also be the date the project area was delineated, prior to the census, provided that there has been an effective public dissemination of information on the area delineated, and systematic and continuous dissemination subsequent to the delineation to prevent further population influx.

22. For projects that are highly risky or contentious, or that involve significant and complex resettlement activities, the borrower should normally engage an advisory panel of independent, internationally recognized resettlement specialists to advise on all aspects of the project relevant to the resettlement activities. The size, role, and frequency of meeting depend on the complexity of the resettlement. If independent technical advisory panels are established under [OP 4.01](#), *Environmental Assessment*, the resettlement panel may form part of the environmental panel of experts.

See [The World Bank Policy on Disclosure of Information](#), para. 34, (Washington, D.C.: World Bank, 2002).

24. An exception to this requirement may be made in highly unusual circumstances (such as emergency recovery operations) with the approval of Bank Management (see [BP 4.12](#), para. 8). In such cases, the Management’s approval stipulates a timetable and budget for developing the resettlement plan.

25. Impacts are considered “minor” if the affected people are not physically displaced and less than 10% of their productive assets are lost.

26. For purpose of this paragraph, the term “subprojects” includes components and subcomponents.

.....

These policies were prepared for use by World Bank staff and are not necessarily a complete treatment of the subject.

Involuntary Resettlement Instruments

1. This annex describes the elements of a resettlement plan, an abbreviated resettlement plan, a resettlement policy framework, and a resettlement process framework, as discussed in [OP 4.12](#), paras. 17-31.

Resettlement Plan

2. The scope and level of detail of the resettlement plan vary with the magnitude and complexity of resettlement. The plan is based on up-to-date and reliable information about (a) the proposed resettlement and its impacts on the displaced persons and other adversely affected groups, and (b) the legal issues involved in resettlement. The resettlement plan covers the elements below, as relevant. When any element is not relevant to project circumstances, it should be noted in the resettlement plan.

3. *Description of the project.* General description of the project and identification of the project area.

4. *Potential impacts.* Identification of

(a) the project component or activities that give rise to resettlement;

(b) the zone of impact of such component or activities;

(c) the alternatives considered to avoid or minimize resettlement; and

(d) the mechanisms established to minimize resettlement, to the extent possible, during project implementation.

5. *Objectives.* The main objectives of the resettlement program.

6. *Socioeconomic studies.* The findings of socioeconomic studies to be conducted in the early stages of project preparation and with the involvement of potentially displaced people, including

(a) the results of a census survey covering

(i) current occupants of the affected area to establish a basis for the design of the resettlement program and to exclude subsequent inflows of people from eligibility for compensation and resettlement assistance;

(ii) standard characteristics of displaced households, including a description of production systems, labor, and household organization; and baseline information on

- livelihoods (including, as relevant, production levels and income derived from both formal and informal economic activities) and standards of living (including health status) of the displaced population;
- (iii) the magnitude of the expected loss—total or partial—of assets, and the extent of displacement, physical or economic;
 - (iv) information on vulnerable groups or persons as provided for in [OP 4.12](#), para. 8, for whom special provisions may have to be made; and
 - (v) provisions to update information on the displaced people’s livelihoods and standards of living at regular intervals so that the latest information is available at the time of their displacement.
- (b) Other studies describing the following
- (i) land tenure and transfer systems, including an inventory of common property natural resources from which people derive their livelihoods and sustenance, non-title-based usufruct systems (including fishing, grazing, or use of forest areas) governed by local recognized land allocation mechanisms, and any issues raised by different tenure systems in the project area;
 - (ii) the patterns of social interaction in the affected communities, including social networks and social support systems, and how they will be affected by the project;
 - (iii) public infrastructure and social services that will be affected; and
 - (iv) social and cultural characteristics of displaced communities, including a description of formal and informal institutions (e.g., community organizations, ritual groups, nongovernmental organizations (NGOs)) that may be relevant to the consultation strategy and to designing and implementing the resettlement activities.

7. Legal framework. The findings of an analysis of the legal framework, covering

- (a) the scope of the power of eminent domain and the nature of compensation associated with it, in terms of both the valuation methodology and the timing of payment;
- (b) the applicable legal and administrative procedures, including a description of the remedies available to displaced persons in the judicial process and the normal timeframe for such procedures, and any available alternative dispute resolution mechanisms that may be relevant to resettlement under the project;
- (c) relevant law (including customary and traditional law) governing land tenure, valuation of assets and losses, compensation, and natural resource usage rights; customary personal law related to displacement; and environmental laws and social welfare legislation;
- (d) laws and regulations relating to the agencies responsible for implementing resettlement activities;
- (e) gaps, if any, between local laws covering eminent domain and resettlement and the Bank’s resettlement policy, and the mechanisms to bridge such gaps; and

(f) any legal steps necessary to ensure the effective implementation of resettlement activities under the project, including, as appropriate, a process for recognizing claims to legal rights to land—including claims that derive from customary law and traditional usage (see [OP 4.12](#), para.15 (b)).

8. *Institutional Framework*. The findings of an analysis of the institutional framework covering

(a) the identification of agencies responsible for resettlement activities and NGOs that may have a role in project implementation;

(b) an assessment of the institutional capacity of such agencies and NGOs; and

(c) any steps that are proposed to enhance the institutional capacity of agencies and NGOs responsible for resettlement implementation.

9. *Eligibility*. Definition of displaced persons and criteria for determining their eligibility for compensation and other resettlement assistance, including relevant cut-off dates.

10. *Valuation of and compensation for losses*. The methodology to be used in valuing losses to determine their replacement cost; and a description of the proposed types and levels of compensation under local law and such supplementary measures as are necessary to achieve replacement cost for lost assets.¹

11. *Resettlement measures*. A description of the packages of compensation and other resettlement measures that will assist each category of eligible displaced persons to achieve the objectives of the policy (see [OP 4.12](#), para. 6). In addition to being technically and economically feasible, the resettlement packages should be compatible with the cultural preferences of the displaced persons, and prepared in consultation with them.

12. *Site selection, site preparation, and relocation*. Alternative relocation sites considered and explanation of those selected, covering

(a) institutional and technical arrangements for identifying and preparing relocation sites, whether rural or urban, for which a combination of productive potential, locational advantages, and other factors is at least comparable to the advantages of the old sites, with an estimate of the time needed to acquire and transfer land and ancillary resources;

(b) any measures necessary to prevent land speculation or influx of ineligible persons at the selected sites;

(c) procedures for physical relocation under the project, including timetables for site preparation and transfer; and

(d) legal arrangements for regularizing tenure and transferring titles to resettlers.

13. *Housing, infrastructure, and social services*. Plans to provide (or to finance resettlers' provision

of) housing, infrastructure (e.g., water supply, feeder roads), and social services (e.g., schools, health services);² plans to ensure comparable services to host populations; any necessary site development, engineering, and architectural designs for these facilities.

14. *Environmental protection and management.* A description of the boundaries of the relocation area; and an assessment of the environmental impacts of the proposed resettlement³ and measures to mitigate and manage these impacts (coordinated as appropriate with the environmental assessment of the main investment requiring the resettlement).

15. *Community participation.* Involvement of resettlers and host communities,⁴ including

(a) a description of the strategy for consultation with and participation of resettlers and hosts in the design and implementation of the resettlement activities;

(b) a summary of the views expressed and how these views were taken into account in preparing the resettlement plan;

(c) a review of the resettlement alternatives presented and the choices made by displaced persons regarding options available to them, including choices related to forms of compensation and resettlement assistance, to relocating as individuals families or as parts of preexisting communities or kinship groups, to sustaining existing patterns of group organization, and to retaining access to cultural property (e.g. places of worship, pilgrimage centers, cemeteries);⁵ and

(d) institutionalized arrangements by which displaced people can communicate their concerns to project authorities throughout planning and implementation, and measures to ensure that such vulnerable groups as indigenous people, ethnic minorities, the landless, and women are adequately represented.

16. *Integration with host populations.* Measures to mitigate the impact of resettlement on any host communities, including

(a) consultations with host communities and local governments;

(b) arrangements for prompt tendering of any payment due the hosts for land or other assets provided to resettlers;

(c) arrangements for addressing any conflict that may arise between resettlers and host communities; and

(d) any measures necessary to augment services (e.g., education, water, health, and production services) in host communities to make them at least comparable to services available to resettlers.

17. *Grievance procedures.* Affordable and accessible procedures for third-party settlement of disputes arising from resettlement; such grievance mechanisms should take into account the availability of judicial recourse and community and traditional dispute settlement mechanisms.

18. *Organizational responsibilities.* The organizational framework for implementing resettlement, including identification of agencies responsible for delivery of resettlement measures and provision of services; arrangements to ensure appropriate coordination between agencies and jurisdictions involved in implementation; and any measures (including technical assistance) needed to strengthen the implementing agencies' capacity to design and carry out resettlement activities; provisions for the transfer to local authorities or resettlers themselves of responsibility for managing facilities and services provided under the project and for transferring other such responsibilities from the resettlement implementing agencies, when appropriate.

19. *Implementation schedule.* An implementation schedule covering all resettlement activities from preparation through implementation, including target dates for the achievement of expected benefits to resettlers and hosts and terminating the various forms of assistance. The schedule should indicate how the resettlement activities are linked to the implementation of the overall project.

20. *Costs and budget.* Tables showing itemized cost estimates for all resettlement activities, including allowances for inflation, population growth, and other contingencies; timetables for expenditures; sources of funds; and arrangements for timely flow of funds, and funding for resettlement, if any, in areas outside the jurisdiction of the implementing agencies.

21. *Monitoring and evaluation.* Arrangements for monitoring of resettlement activities by the implementing agency, supplemented by independent monitors as considered appropriate by the Bank, to ensure complete and objective information; performance monitoring indicators to measure inputs, outputs, and outcomes for resettlement activities; involvement of the displaced persons in the monitoring process; evaluation of the impact of resettlement for a reasonable period after all resettlement and related development activities have been completed; using the results of resettlement monitoring to guide subsequent implementation.

Abbreviated Resettlement Plan

22. An abbreviated plan covers the following minimum elements:⁶

- (a) a census survey of displaced persons and valuation of assets;
- (b) description of compensation and other resettlement assistance to be provided;
- (c) consultations with displaced people about acceptable alternatives;
- (d) institutional responsibility for implementation and procedures for grievance redress;
- (e) arrangements for monitoring and implementation; and
- (f) a timetable and budget.

Resettlement Policy Framework

23. The purpose of the policy framework is to clarify resettlement principles, organizational arrangements, and design criteria to be applied to subprojects to be prepared during project implementation (see [OP 4.12](#), paras. 26-28). Subproject resettlement plans consistent with the policy framework subsequently are submitted to the Bank for approval after specific planning information

becomes available (see [OP 4.12](#), para. 29).

24. The resettlement policy framework covers the following elements, consistent with the provisions described in [OP 4.12](#), paras. 2 and 4:

- (a) a brief description of the project and components for which land acquisition and resettlement are required, and an explanation of why a resettlement plan as described in paras. 2-21 or an abbreviated plan as described in para. 22 cannot be prepared by project appraisal;
- (b) principles and objectives governing resettlement preparation and implementation;
- (c) a description of the process for preparing and approving resettlement plans;
- (d) estimated population displacement and likely categories of displaced persons, to the extent feasible;
- (e) eligibility criteria for defining various categories of displaced persons;
- (f) a legal framework reviewing the fit between borrower laws and regulations and Bank policy requirements and measures proposed to bridge any gaps between them;
- (g) methods of valuing affected assets;
- (h) organizational procedures for delivery of entitlements, including, for projects involving private sector intermediaries, the responsibilities of the financial intermediary, the government, and the private developer;
- (i) a description of the implementation process, linking resettlement implementation to civil works;
- (j) a description of grievance redress mechanisms;
- (k) a description of the arrangements for funding resettlement, including the preparation and review of cost estimates, the flow of funds, and contingency arrangements;
- (l) a description of mechanisms for consultations with, and participation of, displaced persons in planning, implementation, and monitoring; and
- (m) arrangements for monitoring by the implementing agency and, if required, by independent monitors.

25. When a resettlement policy framework is the only document that needs to be submitted as a condition of the loan, the resettlement plan to be submitted as a condition of subproject financing need not include the policy principles, entitlements, and eligibility criteria, organizational arrangements, arrangements for monitoring and evaluation, the framework for participation, and mechanisms for grievance redress set forth in the resettlement policy framework. The subproject-specific resettlement plan needs to include baseline census and socioeconomic survey information;

specific compensation rates and standards; policy entitlements related to any additional impacts identified through the census or survey; description of resettlement sites and programs for improvement or restoration of livelihoods and standards of living; implementation schedule for resettlement activities; and detailed cost estimate.

Process Framework

26. A process framework is prepared when Bank-supported projects may cause restrictions in access to natural resources in legally designated parks and protected areas. The purpose of the process framework is to establish a process by which members of potentially affected communities participate in design of project components, determination of measures necessary to achieve resettlement policy objectives, and implementation and monitoring of relevant project activities (see [OP 4.12](#), paras. 7 and 31).

27. Specifically, the process framework describes participatory processes by which the following activities will be accomplished

(a) *Project components will be prepared and implemented.* The document should briefly describe the project and components or activities that may involve new or more stringent restrictions on natural resource use. It should also describe the process by which potentially displaced persons participate in project design.

(b) *Criteria for eligibility of affected persons will be determined.* The document should establish that potentially affected communities will be involved in identifying any adverse impacts, assessing of the significance of impacts, and establishing of the criteria for eligibility for any mitigating or compensating measures necessary.

(c) *Measures to assist affected persons in their efforts to improve their livelihoods or restore them, in real terms, to pre-displacement levels, while maintaining the sustainability of the park or protected area will be identified.* The document should describe methods and procedures by which communities will identify and choose potential mitigating or compensating measures to be provided to those adversely affected, and procedures by which adversely affected community members will decide among the options available to them.

(d) *Potential conflicts or grievances within or between affected communities will be resolved.* The document should describe the process for resolving disputes relating to resource use restrictions that may arise between or among affected communities, and grievances that may arise from members of communities who are dissatisfied with the eligibility criteria, community planning measures, or actual implementation.

Additionally, the process framework should describe arrangements relating to the following

(e) *Administrative and legal procedures.* The document should review agreements reached regarding the process approach with relevant administrative jurisdictions and line ministries (including clear delineation for administrative and financial responsibilities under the project).

(f) *Monitoring arrangements.* The document should review arrangements for participatory monitoring of project activities as they relate to (beneficial and adverse) impacts on persons within the project impact area, and for monitoring the effectiveness of measures taken to improve (or at minimum restore) incomes and living standards.

1. With regard to land and structures, “replacement cost” is defined as follows: For agricultural land, it is the pre-project or pre-displacement, whichever is higher, market value of land of equal productive potential or use located in the vicinity of the affected land, plus the cost of preparing the land to levels similar to those of the affected land, plus the cost of any registration and transfer taxes. For land in urban areas, it is the pre-displacement market value of land of equal size and use, with similar or improved public infrastructure facilities and services and located in the vicinity of the affected land, plus the cost of any registration and transfer taxes. For houses and other structures, it is the market cost of the materials to build a replacement structure with an area and quality similar to or better than those of the affected structure, or to repair a partially affected structure, plus the cost of transporting building materials to the construction site, plus the cost of any labor and contractors’ fees, plus the cost of any registration and transfer taxes. In determining the replacement cost, depreciation of the asset and the value of salvage materials are not taken into account, nor is the value of benefits to be derived from the project deducted from the valuation of an affected asset. Where domestic law does not meet the standard of compensation at full replacement cost, compensation under domestic law is supplemented by additional measures so as to meet the replacement cost standard. Such additional assistance is distinct from resettlement measures to be provided under other clauses in [OP 4.12](#), para. 6.
2. Provision of health care services, particularly for pregnant women, infants, and the elderly, may be important during and after relocation to prevent increases in morbidity and mortality due to malnutrition, the psychological stress of being uprooted, and the increased risk of disease.
3. Negative impacts that should be anticipated and mitigated include, for rural resettlement, deforestation, overgrazing, soil erosion, sanitation, and pollution; for urban resettlement, projects should address such density-related issues as transportation capacity and access to potable water, sanitation systems, and health facilities.
4. Experience has shown that local NGOs often provide valuable assistance and ensure viable community participation.
5. OP 4.11 (forthcoming), [Management of Cultural Property in Bank-Financed Projects](#).
6. In case some of the displaced persons lose more than 10% of their productive assets or require physical relocation, the plan also covers a socioeconomic survey and income restoration measures.

ANNEX 3

Outline of a Resettlement Action Plan

This section provides an annotated outline for a Resettlement Action Plan. The outline is adapted from the World Bank, *Resettlement and Rehabilitation Guidebook*, which is available on CD-ROM from the World Bank InfoShop. Excerpts from the *Guidebook*, as well as other information related to resettlement, can be found on the World Bank internet web site, <http://www.worldbank.org/essd/essd.nsf>. And selecting "Involuntary Resettlement" from the "All Topics" drop down menu.

Introduction

- Briefly describe the project.
- List project components including associated facilities (if any)
- Describe project components requiring land acquisition and resettlement; give overall estimates of land acquisition and resettlement.

Minimizing Resettlement

- Describe efforts made to minimize displacement.
- Describe the results of these efforts.
- Describe mechanisms used to minimize displacement during implementation.

Census and Socioeconomic Surveys

- Provide the results of the census, assets inventories, natural resource assessments, and socioeconomic surveys.
- Identify all categories of impacts and people affected.
- Summarize consultations on the results of the various surveys with affected people.
- Describe need for updates to census, assets inventories, resource assessments, and socioeconomic surveys, if necessary, as part of RAP monitoring and evaluation.

Legal Framework

- Describe all relevant local laws and customs that apply to resettlement
- Identify gaps between local laws and World Bank Group policies, and describe project-specific mechanisms to address conflicts.
- Describe entitlement policies for each category of impact and specify that resettlement implementation will be based on specific provisions of agreed RAP.

- Describe method of valuation used for affected structures, land, trees, and other assets
- Prepare entitlement matrix.

Resettlement Sites

- Does the project require community relocation sites? Have affected people been involved in a participatory process to identify sites, assess advantages and disadvantages of each-site, and select preferred sites?
- Have the affected people been involved in developing an acceptable strategy for housing replacement? Will new housing be constructed/allocated?
- Does the project involve, allocation of agricultural land or pasture/rangeland? Have the individual households that will be allocated lands been involved in identifying-potential new sites, and have they explicitly accepted the selected sites?
- Describe the specific process of involving affected populations in identifying potential housing sites, assessing advantages and disadvantages; and selecting sites.
- Describe the feasibility studies conducted to determine the suitability of the proposed sites, including natural resource assessments (soils and land use capability, vegetation' and livestock carrying capacity, water resource surveys) and environmental and social impact assessments of the sites.
- Demonstrate that the land quality sand area are adequate for allocation to all of the people eligible for allocation of agricultural land. Provide data-on land, quality and capability, productive potential, and quantity.
- Give calculations relating to site requirements and availability.
- Describe mechanisms for:1) procuring, 2)developing and 3) allotting resettlement sites, including the awarding of title or use rights to allotted lands.
- Provide detailed description of the arrangements for site development for agriculture, including funding of development costs.
- Have the host communities been consulted about the RAP? Have they participated in the, identification of likely impacts on their communities, appropriate mitigation measures, and preparation of the RAP? Do the host communities have a share of the resettlement benefits?

Income –Restoration

- Are the compensation entitlements sufficient to restore income streams for each category of impact? What additional economic rehabilitation measures are necessary?

- Briefly spell out the restoration strategies for each category of impact and describe their-institutional, financial, and technical aspects.
- Describe the process of consultation with affected populations and their participation in finalizing strategies for income restoration.
- How do these strategies vary with the area of impact?
- Does income restoration require change in livelihoods, development of alternative farmlands or some other activities that require a substantial amount of training, time for preparation, and implementation?
- How are the risks of impoverishment to be addressed?
- What are the main institutional and other risks for the smooth implementation of the resettlement programs?
- Describe the process for monitoring the effectiveness of the income restoration measures.
- Describe any social or community development programs currently operating in or around the project area. If programs exist, do they meet the development priorities of their target communities? Are there opportunities for the project proponent to support new programs or expand existing programs to meet the development priorities of communities in the project area?

Institutional- Arrangements

- Describe the institution(s) responsible for delivery of each item/activity in the entitlement policy; implementation of income restoration programs; and coordination of the activities associated with and described in the resettlement action plan.
- State how coordination issues will be addressed in cases where resettlement is spread over a number of jurisdictions or where resettlement will be implemented in stages over a long period of time.
- Identify the agency that will coordinate all implementing agencies. Does it have the necessary mandate and resources?
- Describe the external (non-project) institutions involved in the process of income restoration (land development, land allocation, credit, and training) and the mechanisms to ensure adequate performance of these institutions.
- Discuss institutional capacity for and commitment to resettlement.
- Describe mechanisms-for ensuring independent monitoring, evaluation, and financial audit of the RAP and for ensuring that corrective measures are carried out in a timely fashion.

Implementation Schedule

- List the chronological steps in implementation of the RAP, including identification of agencies responsible for each activity and with a brief explanation of each activity.
- Prepare a month-by-month implementation schedule (using a Gantt chart, for example) of activities to be undertaken as part of resettlement implementation.
- Describe the linkage between resettlement implementation and initiation of civil works for each of the project components.

Participation and Consultation

- Describe the various stakeholders.
- Describe the process of promoting consultation/participation of affected populations and stakeholders in resettlement preparation and planning.
- Describe the process of involving affected populations and other stakeholders in implementation and monitoring.
- Describe the plan for disseminating RAP information to affected populations and stakeholders, including information about compensation for lost assets, eligibility for compensation, resettlement assistance, and grievance redress.

Grievance Redress

- Describe the step-by-step process for registering and addressing grievances and provide specific details regarding a cost-free process for registering complaints, response time, and communication modes.
- Describe the mechanism for appeal.
- Describe the provisions for approaching civil courts if other options fail.

Monitoring and, Evaluation

- Describe the internal/performance monitoring process.
- Define key monitoring indicators derived from baseline survey. Provide a list of monitoring indicators that will be used for internal monitoring.
- Describe institutional (including financial) arrangements.
- Describe frequency of reporting and content for internal monitoring.
- Describe process for integrating feedback from internal monitoring into implementation.
- Define methodology for external monitoring.
- Define key indicators for external monitoring.
- Describe frequency of reporting and content for external monitoring.
- Describe process for integrating feedback from external monitoring into implementation.
- Describe arrangements for final external evaluation.

ANNEX 4

Demarcation Act No ___
of the
Land Parcel located within the
Georgia Road Construction Project affected area

Date: _____ **2014**

Land Parcel Location: _____ Rayon, Village _____

We,

(Names of: the landowner, village Municipality Rtsmunebuli, representative of Rayon Municipality Gamgeoba, surveyor)

Composed the hereby Act on the following:

1. In respect with Georgia, -----Auto Road -----Section Road Construction Project the survey and demarcation activities have been undertaken to land parcel located on the territory of village _____ and is under private ownership of

(landowner's full name and ID number)

2. The location and the boundaries of the stated land parcel are endorsed and confirmed by:

Chief land arranger of _____ rayon:

Owner of the land parcel:

Owner(s) of the adjacent land parcel:

Full name: _____
Representative (Rtsmunebuli) of _____ rayon Municipality in village _____

3. We, hereby endorse the fact of conducting Demarcation and survey activities to the stated Land Parcel:

Land parcel Owner:

Full name: _____
Representative (Rtsmunebuli) of _____ rayon Municipality in village Agaiani

Land surveyor:

Representative of _____ rayon Municipality Gamgeoba

ANNEX5. Minutes of Public Consultation Meeting on the RPF



**Regional Municipal Infrastructure Development Project II
(RMIDP II)**

**Public Hearing
On**

**Environmental and Social Environmental Impact Management and Resettlement Policy
Frameworks**

**MINUTES
Municipal Development Fund, Tbilisi
(III floor, conference room)
March 18, 2014**

Agenda:

14:00	Opening	
14:10	Brief overview of the RMIDP II	Shalva Kokochashvili, Donor Relations Team Specialist, Municipal Development Fund of Georgia
14:20	Overview of Environmental and Social Management Framework	Ana Rukhadze, Environmental Safeguard Specialist, Municipal Development Fund of Georgia
14:40	Resettlement Policy Framework	Davit Arsenashvili, Social Safeguard Specialist, Municipal Development Fund of Georgia
15:00 - 17:00	Discussion	

Those present:

1. Tengiz Topuridze, Ministry of Regional Development and Infrastructure of Georgia;
2. Maya Beradze, Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources Protection of Georgia;
3. Besik Basiashvili, Ministry of Economy and Sustainable Development of Georgia;
4. Medea Chachkhiani, Solid Waste Management Company - LTD;
5. Khatuna Chikviladze, Solid Waste Management Company - LTD;
6. Ketil Chomakhidze, United Water Supply Company of Georgia;
7. Rusudan Lolijashvili, Roads Department of Georgia;
8. Maya Vashakidze, Roads Department of Georgia;
9. Nugzar Gabelia, Samegrelo, Zemo Svaneti Territorial Administration;
10. Nikoloz Chikhladze, Imereti Territorial Administration;
11. Davit Khandolishvili, Kakheti Territorial Administration;
12. Amiran Shavishvili, Shida Kartli Territorial Administration;
13. Natalia Oniashvili, Black Sea Ecoacademy;
14. Nino Sulkhaniashvili, Ecovision;
15. Rusudan Simonidze, Greens Movement of Georgia / Friends of the Earth;
16. Mariam Begiashvili, Institute of Social Research (ISR);
17. Ketil Jibladze, Regional Environmental Center for Caucasus (REC);
18. Grigory Mamaladze, „Gergili“ LTD;
19. Levan Kakubava, „Gergili“ LTD;
20. Nino Metreveli, World Bank, Social Development Specialist;
21. Nino Kharazi, Municipal Development Fund, Director Advisor;
22. Nino Jangulashvili, Municipal Development Fund;
23. Shalva Kokochashvili, Municipal Development Fund;
24. Nino Nadashvili, Municipal Development Fund;
25. Ana Rukhadze, Municipal Development Fund;

Shalva Kokochashvili opened the meeting, greeted the participants and stated objectives of the meeting. He briefed the public on the Regional Municipal Infrastructure Development Project II, which will be implemented with the WB support. The RMIDP 2 is mainly aimed at improvement of the municipal infrastructure. He explained that it is a new project of the WB, which actually is the continuation of the existing project and its duration is the following period: 2104-2018. The tentative budget is allotted as follows: WB portion – USD 30 mln., portion of the Government of Georgia - USD 12 mln. He briefly discussed those 7 initial project sites, which were selected for funding under the new program.

Ana Rukhadze presented information on the natural and social environmental impact management framework. She noted that the RMIDP II falls under Category B and thus only B or C category projects will be eligible within its framework. She briefly discussed safety regulations of the WB applicable to RMIDP II; presented a structure of the natural and social environmental impact management plan, as well as the simplified environmental management plan checklist

applicable to low risk sub-projects (small scale construction and rehabilitation works). She reviewed public hearing issue for environmental management plans, and environmental procedures, which are applied by the MDF at the sub-project identification, assessment and implementation stages.

Davit Arsenashvili presented information on the resettlement policy framework. He noted that the document specifies principles and procedures of resettlement and land acquisition under RMIDP II, as well as the categories and rights of persons affected by the sub-project and analytical works and documents to be prepared prior to, during and after Resettlement Action Plan implementation. He also reviewed the main principles of WB safeguard policies (OP/BP 4.12) and Georgian legislation on Involuntary Resettlement and coherent principles of their implementation under RMIDP II, public hearing procedures for the Resettlement Action Plans and grievance redress mechanism.

Following the above mentioned presentations, participants posed questions. Major part of the questions was dedicated to project selection and financing procedures and priorities. In respect of resettlement issues, interest was provoked by compensation and reimbursement mechanisms.

Questions asked and comments made:

Questions:	Comments:
<p>How are projects selected for funding, how are priorities determined, what is the complete cycle, which stages are to be covered from the beginning till the end, are there any time frames?</p>	<p>The participants received clarification on procedures and arrangements of project selection and funding. The projects are selected based on the needs and demands of the municipalities. There are no standard timeframes and limitations set against the selection process. If there is any kind of urgent problem requiring solution, it is possible to retroactively finance the project, provided that it is proposed in line with the required standards and quality. If the municipality is unable to come up with the adequately designed project, than the MDF itself gets involved in the project preparation process and ensures development of the municipality's demand-oriented projects.</p>
<p>Who is in charge of environmental assessment of the projects? Who develops environmental management plans for the projects?</p>	<p>A full environmental and social impact assesment report is prepared for those sub-projects which, despite of belonging to categy B, involve relatively high risks and their potential negative impact is not clearly identified in advance, and for such projects, which pursuant to Georgian legislation require State ecological expertise and environmental impact permit. For preparation of the full environmental and social impact assesment report, consultancy service is procured through bidding.</p> <p>For low risk sub-projects (small scale construction and rehabilitation works) is used a simplified</p>

	<p>environmental management plan checklists will be prepared by the MDF's environmental specialists.</p> <p>Environmental management plan and environmental impact permit requirements constitute part of biddings announced for any of the projects and further become part of the contract.</p>
<p>The EMP checklist specifies that, toxic/ hazardous waste disposal should be performed at the specially licensed landfills, though currently there are no such landfills existing in Georgia, except for the Iaghluja closed landfill.</p> <p>Is it possible for the MDF to consider the landfill arrangement issue, including the one for the disposal of toxic waste?</p>	<p>In case of toxic/hazardous waste generation, services of the organizations holding the appropriate permit will be procured.</p> <p>As for asbestos containing waste (asbestos sheeting), it will be disposed at the existing landfills, pursuant to the legislation in force.</p> <p>Only B and C category projects are funded under RMIDP II, therefore arrangement of a new landfill cannot be funded due to its belonging to category A.</p>
<p>In the first question of the social screening form, the word „affiliation and ownership“ should be complemented with the word „land use status“, the following should be added to question 2: “sites of common public use”, and the following should be added to question 3, list of domestic infrastructure: “ancillary facilities, fence, canal”.</p>	<p>Respective changes were made to the social screening form.</p>
<p>Are the municipalities adequately informed by the MDF and do they have sufficient information available on project financing facilities?</p>	<p>Numerous meetings were conducted in the municipalities; their representatives underwent respective training, and were furnished with requisite information. There is permanent media coverage of the MDF completed and ongoing projects.</p>
<p>What are the principles of resettlement and evaluation of the assets of affected persons?</p>	<p>The Resettlement Policy Framework is prepared based on the WB's Operation Policy and the Georgian legislation in force. Compensation will be granted to every single person, which is directly affected by the project implementation. Registered formal owners of land titles as well as informal land users will be eligible for some compensation, but the type of compensation will differ: cost of the land plot will be paid only to those holding a land title. In other cases, the affected persons will be entitled for compensation of crops, plants and other type of economic activity led without having formal rights to the land.</p> <p>The assets are valued according to market price or at replacement rates. For example: a land plot is valued at market price, while plants are</p>

	compensated at the replacement rate.
Is it possible to appeal against the valuation results?	Of course, it is possible. The local grievance redress mechanism and court are designated for this purpose.
What happens when a person claims compensation, which is more than the actual cost of his asset and what happens when a person refuses to relocate?	The procedure of expropriation is applied for both cases. In the process of expropriation, the affected person is entitled to conduct alternative valuation and if the court decides that the mentioned person is eligible for more compensation, than his claim will be met. Otherwise, if agreement is not reached with the owner, the person is subjected to expropriation, which is to be conducted based on a fair compensation rate. Though, all possible mechanisms should be triggered in order to avoid expropriation.
What is the compensation for demolished housing?	Demolished housing is compensated in monetary terms.
What happens in case if the affected person spends the whole amount and remains without housing?	Parties to an agreement are legally capable persons responsible for their own actions. If such danger arises (in respect of the legally incapable person) than social services have to get involved. Otherwise, we are not entitled to instruct a private individual on means of spending an amount received as a result of compensation.
We have a kindergarten, which is inhabited by IDPs, are we entitled to propose the kindergarten rehabilitation project?	The RPF does not restrict submission of such project proposals on rehabilitation of buildings inhabited by IDP-s. A resettlement action plan will be prepared for such projects. As for the IDPs, their resettlement issue should also be approved by the Ministry of Refugees and Accommodation of Georgia.

Representatives of territorial administrations and other participants of the meeting emphasized the necessity of strengthening cooperation between the MDF, territorial administrations and municipalities. At the end of the meeting, Sh. Kokochashvili wrapped up the suggestions and remarks expressed at the meeting and stated that the final versions of Natural and Social Environmental Impact Management and Resettlement Policy Frameworks will be posted on the MDF website.

Minutes prepared by: Nino Nadashvili and Ana Rukhadze

Annex 6. Participants' Registration List

რეგიონული და მუნიციპალური ინფრასტრუქტურის განვითარების მეორე პროექტი (RMIDP 2)

ბუნებრივ და სოციალურ გარემოზე ზემოქმედების მართვისა და
განსახლების პოლიტიკის ჩარჩო დოკუმენტების სამუშაო ვერსიების განხილვა

18 მარტი, 2013

მონაწილეთა სია

	სახელი, გვარი	ორგანიზაცია	საკონტაქტო ინფორმაცია
1	თენგიზ თოვუჩიძე	საქართველოს ჯგერონული გეგმ- თა ხევისა და ინფრასტრუქტურის სამინისტრო.	599 551 751 t.topuridze@mrdi.gov.ge
2	მანა ზაქაძე	გეგმვა და მართვის ინჟინერიის სამსახური	599-44-44-45 M.beradze@mce.gov.ge
3	ქრიკორე გუგუშვილი	შპს "კურიერ"	599 300 638 gugushvili@curier.com
4	ლევან კაცუბავა	შპს "გერგელი"	599-976252 L.Kakubava@gergili.ge
5	ბესიკ ბასიაშვილი	საქართველოს ეკონომიკის და სტატისტიკის სამსახური	591 19 7798 bbasiasvili@economy.ge
6	ნატალია გაბელია	ბათუმის რაიონის მუნიციპალიტეტის მერიის განყოფილება	599 02 400 nat.gabelia@gmail.com
7	ნიკოლოზ ჩიქლიძე	სსიპ "იმერეთის რეგიონული ინფრასტრუქტურის განვითარების სამსახური"	595 30 45 30 n.chikhladze@imereti.ge

8	მედიკალინური სახეობა	ქ.ბ. შიგინი გუბერნიის მხარის პრეზიდენტი მედიკალინური სახეობის მფლობელი	57492512 medeatchkhiani@gmail.com
9	ბაიოტექნიკური სახეობა	ქ.ბ. შიგინი გუბერნიის მხარის მთავარი სამსახურის მფლობელი	599107328 khatunac@hotmail.com
10	ინჟინერული სახეობა	ქ.ბ. შიგინი გუბერნიის მხარის სამსახურის მფლობელი	595 97 26 96 eniashvili@gmail.com
11	ინჟინერული სახეობა	ECOVISION	574738871 n.sulkhanishvili@ecovision.ge
12	ინჟინერული სახეობა	საქართველოს მთავრობის მხარის სამსახურის მფლობელი	5-99-53-2611 rusudan.simonidze@ grecns.ge
13	ინჟინერული სახეობა	სამსახურის მფლობელი სამსახურის მფლობელი	595070444 hjangalashvili.mdfocq.ge
14	ინჟინერული სახეობა	სამსახურის მფლობელი სამსახურის მფლობელი	577380309 Chomakhidze@yahoo.com
15	ინჟინერული სახეობა	სამსახურის მფლობელი სამსახურის მფლობელი	577744088 begiashvili@isr.ge

სამსახურის მფლობელი
სამსახურის მფლობელი
სამსახურის მფლობელი
სამსახურის მფლობელი
სამსახურის მფლობელი
სამსახურის მფლობელი

16	հայկազ Թամանյան	Լժպետաբանական կենտրոնի կոնսուլտանտ (հա. թեթ. և սննդ. կենտրոն)	599 214048 rusudani@gmail.com
17	Ժուլիա Յակոբյան	ԿԲ-ով կազմակերպող ծրագրի կոորդինատոր շրջանի ղեկավար	593 32 30 77 mayer_vashtadze@yahoo.co.uk.
18	Դրոշ Կարապետյան	ՃՀ, Կրթության- յուրաքանչյուր Լճային	558 845719 skokochashvili@mdf.org.ge
19	Նոնա Եսայան	ՃՀ, ջրային ռեսուրսների կոնսուլտանտ	n.nadashvili@mdf.org.ge
20	Բյուրիս Կարապետյան	Տեղանի կենտրոնի տնօրեն	regionaluri@yahoo.com

21. Ժոն Գրիգորյան REC Caucasus keti.jibladze@rec-caucasus.com

22. Նոնա Կարապետյան WB, կապիտալի կառավարման կենտրոնի
նախագահ n.nadashvili@worldbank.org

23. Իմաստասեր Կարապետյան Կոնսուլտանտ կենտրոնի տնօրեն
am.shavshvili@mail.ru

24. Մարիա Կարապետյան ՃՀ, ջրային ռեսուրսների
կոնսուլտանտ արևածաղկ adze@mdf.org.ge

25. Նոնա Կարապետյան ՃՀ | Կոնսուլտանտ ծրագրի
նախագահ n.nadashvili@mdf.org.ge

26

Annex 7. Photo material of public consultaiton meeting



ANNEX 8. TABLES AND FORMS FOR DESCRIPTION OF THE AFFECTED PEOPLE AND PRIVATE BUSINESS

1. The characteristics of affected families and households

Household no.	Name of head of household	Number of members	Number of children older than 13 years	Number of adults older than 60 years	Number of socially disadvantaged people (unemployed, veterans, students, etc.)	Source of income and average annual income per family member	Legal status (owner, owner without proving documents, tenant, etc.)	Occupied property (area, number of rooms, conditions, etc.)	Remarks

2. The characteristics of the affected business and assets

Business no.	Name of business owner	Activities	Number of employees	Average monthly income	Duration of the business at this location	Legal status (owner, owner without proving documents, tenant, etc.)	Occupied property (total area, conditions, etc.)	Remarks

3. The impacts resulting from the resettlement (Household)

Household no.	Loss of residential property	Loss or reduction of income	Loss of potential education or difficulties with access to the education	Loss of access to the public health services	Loss of access to utilities	Loss of social relations	Remarks

4. The impacts resulting from the resettlement (Business)

Business no.	Loss of business place	Loss or reduction of income	Loss of economic relations	Remarks