



1. Project Data :		Date Posted : 06/27/2000	
PROJ ID : P003966 OEDID: L3431		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name : Third Nonformal Education Project	Project Costs (US\$M)	99.3	95
Country : Indonesia	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	69.5	64.7
Sector, Major Sect .: Other Education, Education	Cofinancing (US\$M)		
L/C Number : L3431			
	Board Approval (FY)		92
Partners involved :	Closing Date	03/31/1998	03/31/1999
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group:
Helen Abadzi	John Heath	Ridley Nelson	OEDST

2. Project Objectives and Components
a. Objectives
 The project aimed to assist the Directorate for Community Education in addressing basic illiteracy, providing higher levels of functional literacy to neoliterates, and developing new programs to meet the changing needs of its clientele . It also provided support for income-generating activities and vocational training to increase the productivity and employment prospects of poor people (particularly women) working in the informal sector . It was the third project to support nonformal education .
b. Components
 (a) Basic literacy and provision of primary-school equivalence; (b) intensive training delivery system to low-income beneficiaries; (c) national support services to strengthen capacity to manage, deliver, monitor, and evaluate the nonformal education programs . The project financed equipment, technical assistance, training, learning materials .
c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates
 The project closed after a 12-month extension. Overall, US\$4.7 million was cancelled.

3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives :
 Objectives were partly achieved . Delivery of basic literacy was expanded, as was vocational training, and numerical targets were met or exceeded . However, income-generation activities could not be successfully managed . The monitoring and evaluation system was not successfully implemented .

4. Significant Outcomes /Impacts :
 As expected, activities took place in 1000 subdistricts of 27 provinces . The basic literacy program expected to enroll 900,000 illiterates, but reached 5.3 million . The intensive program reached 855,000 learners (against a target fo 600,000), and the junior secondary equivalence program reached 1.89 million learners (against a target of 18,000) . However, the apprenticeship and income generating programs reached fewer than half of their intended beneficiaries . Lack of systematic assessment raises questions regarding the amount and quality of learning that has taken place in the project's classrooms .

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):
 Despite a satisfactory level of access, program quality was often poor . Many participants dropped out of the 3-year literacy program early, often after 1.6 years . Supplementary learning materials were few, classes were too large to be supervised, the quality of most tutors was poor, and income generation groups were underdeveloped . District learning and resource centers could not support the literacy efforts and did not produce the expected books and services . Bank supervision was infrequent, given project size, complexity, and quality problems . The project was top-down and managed almost completely by government officials . The 1997 financial crisis resulted in major budgetary cutbacks .

6. Ratings :	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome :	Satisfactory	Marginally Satisfactory	Lack of systematic assessment raises

			questions regarding the amount and quality of learning that has taken place in the project's classrooms, particularly given the view that quality of instruction was poor.
Institutional Dev .:	Partial	Modest	
Sustainability .:	Uncertain	Uncertain	
Bank Performance .:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Borrower Perf .:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Quality of ICR .:		Satisfactory	

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability :

- Overly complex projects should be avoided when local capacity is weak and national leadership is unclear of policy direction and scope. Project objectives should be clear and monitorable .
- It is hard to obtain good performance from teachers when salaries and transportation allowances are very low .
- Community and beneficiary involvement are necessary to ensure a useful and sustainable product . When courses are too long to fit the schedules of beneficiaries, they may be abandoned .

8. Audit Recommended? Yes No

Why? To understand better the problems and obstacles involved in implementing a successful literacy project

9. Comments on Quality of ICR :

The ICR is satisfactory and clearly lays out the problems and achievements of the project .