Civil Service Reform in Francophone Africa

Proceedings of a Workshop, Abidjan, January 23-26, 1996

Edited by
Ladipo Adamolekun
Guy de Lusignan
Armant Atomate
RECENT WORLD BANK TECHNICAL PAPERS

No. 274 Govindaraj, Murray, and Chellaraj, Health Expenditures in Latin America
No. 275 Heggie, Management and Financing of Roads: An Agenda for Reform
No. 276 Johnson, Quality Review Schemes for Auditors: Their Potential for Sub-Saharan Africa
No. 277 Convery, Applying Environmental Economics in Africa
No. 278 Wijetilleke and Karunaratne, Air Quality Management: Considerations for Developing Countries
No. 279 Anderson and Ahmed, The Case for Solar Energy Investments
No. 280 Rowat, Malik, and Dakolias, Judicial Reform in Latin America and the Caribbean: Proceedings of a World Bank Conference
No. 281 Shen and Contreras-Hermosilla, Environmental and Economic Issues in Forestry: Selected Case Studies in Asia
No. 282 Kim and Benton, Cost-Benefit Analysis of the Onchocerciasis Control Program (OCP)
No. 283 Jacobsen, Scobie and Duncan, Statutory Intervention in Agricultural Marketing: A New Zealand Perspective
No. 286 Tavoulareas and Charpentier, Clean Coal Technologies for Developing Countries
No. 287 Gillham, Bell, Arin, Matthews, Rumeur, and Hearn, Cotton Production Prospects for the Next Decade
No. 288 Biggs, Shaw, and Srivastava, Technological Capabilities and Learning in African Enterprises
No. 289 Dinár, Seidl, Olem, Jorden, Duda, and Johnson, Restoring and Protecting the World’s Lakes and Reservoirs
No. 292 Gorriz, Subramanian, and Simas, Irrigation Management Transfer in Mexico: Process and Progress
No. 293 Preker and Feachem, Market Mechanisms and the Health Sector in Central and Eastern Europe
No. 294 Valdés and Schaeffer in collaboration with Sturzenegger and Bebczuk, Surveillance of Agricultural Price and Trade Policies: A Handbook for Argentina
No. 295 Pohl, Jedrzejczak, and Anderson, Creating Capital Markets in Central and Eastern Europe
No. 296 Stassen, Small-Scale Biomass Gasifiers for Heat and Power: A Global Review
No. 297 Bulatao, Key Indicators for Family Planning Projects
No. 298 Odaga and Heneveld, Girls and Schools in Sub-Saharan Africa: From Analysis to Action
No. 299 Tamale, Jones, and Psarayi-Riddihough, Technologies Related to Participatory Forestry in Tropical and Subtropical Countries
No. 300 Oram and de Haan, Technologies for Rainfed Agriculture in Mediterranean Climates: A Review of World Bank Experiences
No. 301 Mohan, editor, Bibliography of Publications: Technical Department, Africa Region, July 1987 to April 1995
No. 302 Baldry, Calamari, and Yaméogo, Environmental Impact Assessment of Settlement and Development in the Upper Léraba Basin
No. 303 Heneveld and Craig, Schools Count: World Bank Project Designs and the Quality of Primary Education in Sub-Saharan Africa
No. 304 Foley, Photovoltaic Applications in Rural Areas of the Developing World
No. 305 Johnson, Education and Training of Accountants in Sub-Saharan Anglophone Africa
No. 306 Muir and Saba, Improving State Enterprise Performance: The Role of Internal and External Incentives
No. 307 Narayan, Toward Participatory Research
No. 308 Adamson and others, Energy Use, Air Pollution, and Environmental Policy in Krakow: Can Economic Incentives Really Help?

(List continues on the inside back cover)
Civil Service Reform in Francophone Africa

Proceedings of a Workshop, Abidjan, January 23-26, 1996
Technical Papers are published to communicate the results of the Bank's work to the development community with the least possible delay. The typescript of this paper therefore has not been prepared in accordance with the procedures appropriate to formal printed texts, and the World Bank accepts no responsibility for errors. Some sources cited in this paper may be informal documents that are not readily available.

The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this paper are entirely those of the author(s) and should not be attributed in any manner to the World Bank, to its affiliated organizations, or to members of its Board of Executive Directors or the countries they represent. The World Bank does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this publication and accepts no responsibility whatsoever for any consequence of their use. The boundaries, colors, denominations, and other information shown on any map in this volume do not imply on the part of the World Bank Group any judgment on the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

The material in this publication is copyrighted. Requests for permission to reproduce portions of it should be sent to the Office of the Publisher at the address shown in the copyright notice above. The World Bank encourages dissemination of its work and will normally give permission promptly and, when the reproduction is for noncommercial purposes, without asking a fee. Permission to copy portions for classroom use is granted through the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., Suite 910, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Massachusetts 01923, U.S.A.

ISSN: 0253-7494

Lapido Adamolekun is principal public sector management specialist in the Learning and Leadership Center of the World Bank's Human Resources Group. Guy de Lusignan and Armand Atomate are consultants at the World Bank.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
2. Civil service reform—Africa, Sub-Saharan—Congresses.
JQ3349.5.C58 1997 97-9183
352.6'3'09660917541—dc21 CIP
Technical Paper Series

| No. 161 | Riverson and Carapetis, Intermediate Means of Transport in Sub-Saharan Africa: Its Potential for Improving Rural Travel and Transport |
| No. 165 | Kellaghan and Greaney, Using Examinations to Improve Education: A Study in Fourteen African Countries |
| No. 179 | Speirs and Olsen, Indigenous Integrated Farming Systems in the Sahel |
| No. 181 | Mining Unit, Industry and Energy Division, Strategy for African Mining |
| No. 188 | Silverman, Public Sector Decentralization: Economic Policy and Sector Investment Programs |
| No. 194 | Saint, Universities in Africa: Stabilization and Revitalization |
| No. 196 | Mabogunje, Perspective on Urban Land and Urban Management Policies in Sub-Saharan Africa |
| No. 197 | Zymelman, editor, Assessing Engineering Education in Sub-Saharan Africa |
| No. 199 | Hussi, Murphy, Lindberg, and Brenneman, The Development of Cooperatives and Other Rural Organizations: The Role of the World Bank |
| No. 203 | Cleaver, A Strategy to Develop Agriculture in Sub-Saharan Africa and a Focus for the World Bank |
| No. 208 | Bindlish and Evenson, Evaluation of the Performance of T&V Extension in Kenya |
| No. 209 | Keith, Property Tax: A Practical Manual for Anglophone Africa |
| No. 214 | Bonfiglioli, Agro-pastoralism in Chad as a Strategy for Survival: An Essay on the Relationship between Anthropology and Statistics |
| No. 218 | Mohan, editor, Bibliography of Publications: Technical Department, Africa Region—July 1987 to December 1992 |
| No. 225 | Dia, A Governance Approach to Civil Service Reform in Sub-Saharan Africa |
| No. 226 | Bindlish, Evenson, and Gbetibouo, Evaluation of T&V-Based Extension in Burkina Faso |
| No. 232 | Creightney, Transport and Economic Performance: A Survey of Developing Countries |
| No. 238 | Heath, Land Rights in Côte d’Ivoire: Survey and Prospects for Project Intervention |
| No. 250 | Rangeley, Thiam, Andersen, and Lyle, International River Basin Organizations in Sub-Saharan Africa |
| No. 251 | Sharma, Rietbergen, Claude R. Heimo, and Jyoti Patel, A Strategy for the Forest Sector in Sub-Saharan Africa |
| No. 255 | Mohan, editor, Bibliography of Publications: Technical Department, Africa Region, July 1987 to April 1994 |
| No. 276 | Johnson, Quality Review Schemes for Auditors: Their Potential for Sub-Saharan Africa |
| No. 277 | Convery, Applying Environmental Economics in Africa |
| No. 298 | Odaga and Heneveld, Girls and Schools in Sub-Saharan Africa: From Analysis to Action |
| No. 303 | Heneveld and Craig, Schools Count: World Bank Project Designs and the Quality of Primary Education in Sub-Saharan Africa |
| No. 305 | Johnson, Educating and Training Accountants in Sub-Saharan Anglophone Africa |
| No. 318 | Taylor, Boukambou, Dahniya, Quayyogode, Ayling, Noor and Toure, Strengthening National Agricultural Research Systems in the Humid and Sub-humid Zones of West and Central Africa: A Framework for Action |
| No. 326 | Colletta, Balachander and Liang, The Condition of Young Children in Sub-Saharan Africa: The Convergence of Health, Nutrition, and Early Education |
| No. 329 | Mohan, editor, Bibliography of Publications: Technical Department, Africa Region, July 1987 to April 1996 |
| No. 331 | Francis, with Akinwumi, Ngwu, Nkom, Odihi, Olomajeye, Okumnadewa, and Shehu, State, Community and Local Development in Nigeria |
| No. 336 | Francis, with Akinwumi, Ngwu, Nkom, Odihi, Olomajeye, Okumnadewa, and Shehu, State, Community and Local Development in Nigeria |
| No. 337 | Kerf and Smith, Privatizing Africa’s Infrastructure: Promise and Challenge |
| No. 356 | Aryeetey, Hettige, Nissanke, and Steel, Financial Market Fragmentation and Reforms in Sub-Saharan Africa |
No. 86 Galabawa, Implementing Educational Policies in Tanzania
No. 87 Thelejani, Implementing Educational Policies in Lesotho
No. 88 Magalula, Implementing Educational Policies in Swaziland
No. 89 Odaet, Implementing Educational Policies in Uganda
No. 90 Achola, Implementing Educational Policies in Zambia
No. 91 Maravanyika, Implementing Educational Policies in Zimbabwe
No. 132 Fuller and Habte, editors, Adjusting Educational Policies: Conserving Resources while Raising School Quality
No. 147 Jaeger, The Effects of Economic Policies on African Agriculture: From Past Harm to Future Hope
No. 175 Shanmugaratnam, Vedeld, Massige, and Bovin, Resource Management and Pastoral Institution Building in the West African Sahel
No. 181 Lamboray and Elmendorf, Combating AIDS and Other Sexually Transmitted Diseases in Africa: A Review of the World Bank's Agenda for Action
No. 184 Spurling, Pee, Mkamanga, and Nkwanyana, Agricultural Research in Southern Africa: A Framework for Action
No. 211 Weijenberg, Dioné, Fuchs-Carsch, Kéré, and Lefort, Revitalizing Agricultural Research in the Sahel: A Proposed Framework for Action
No. 219 Thillairajah, Development of Rural Financial Markets in Sub-Saharan Africa
No. 230 Saito, Raising the Productivity of Women Farmers in Sub-Saharan Africa
No. 231 Bagchee, Agricultural Extension in Africa
No. 234 Keck, Sharma, and Feder, Population Growth, Shifting Cultivation, and Unsustainable Agricultural Development: A Case Study in Madagascar
No. 242 Biggs, Moody, van Leeuwen, and White, Africa Can Compete! Export Opportunities and Challenges for Garments and Home Products in the U.S. Market
No. 251 Aryeetey, Baah-Nuakoh, Duggleby, Hettige, and Steel, Supply and Demand for Finance of Small Enterprises in Ghana
No. 252 Pinto and Mrope, Projectizing the Governance Approach to Civil Service Reform: An Environment Assessment for Preparing a Sectoral Adjustment Loan in the Gambia
No. 258 Duncan and Muvandi, The Rate of Fertility Decline in Botswana and Zimbabwe
No. 259 Scribner, Policies Affecting Fertility and Contraceptive Use: An Assessment of Twelve Sub-Saharan Countries
No. 260 Popiel, Financial Systems in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Comparative Study
No. 265 Gopal and Marc, World Bank-Financed Projects with Community Participation: Procurement and Disbursement Issues
No. 266 Venkatesan, Seed Systems in Sub-Saharan Africa: Issues and Options
No. 271 Parker, Riopelle, and Steel, Small Enterprises Adjusting to Liberalization in Five African Countries
No. 274 Marc, Graham, Schacter, and Schmidt, Social Action Programs and Social Funds: A Review of Design and Implementation in Sub-Saharan Africa
No. 280 Cleaver and Donovan, Agriculture, Poverty, and Policy Reform in Sub-Saharan Africa
No. 302 Harrold and Associates, The Broad Sector Approach to Investment Lending: Sector Investment Programs.
No. 311 Harrold, The Impact of the Uruguay Round on Africa.
No. 312 Gopal, Procurement and Disbursement Manual for Projects with Community Participation
No. 331 Colletta, Kostner, Wiederhofer with the assistance of Emilio Mondo, Taimi Sitari, and Tadesse A. Woldu, Case Studies in War-to-Peace Transition: The Demobilization and Reintegration of Ex-Combatants in Ethiopia, Namibia, and Uganda
No. 338 Adams and Hartnett, Cost Sharing in the Social Sectors of Sub-Saharan Africa: Impact on the Poor
No. 344 Barwell, Transport and the Village: Findings from African Village-Level Travel and Transport Surveys and Related Studies
No. 346 Biggs and Srivastava, Structural Aspects of Manufacturing in Sub-Saharan Africa: Findings from a Seven Country Enterprise Survey
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**FOREWORD** .................................................................................................................. vii

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS** .................................................................................................. ix

**INTRODUCTION** ......................................................................................................... 1

**PART ONE: BACKGROUND DOCUMENTS**

1. **NEW PUBLIC MANAGEMENT: CHALLENGES AND ISSUES IN AN INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE** ................................................................. 9
   David Shand

2. **CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS: LEARNING FROM COMMONWEALTH EXPERIENCES** ............... 19
   Dr. Mohan Kaul

3. **ETHICS, ACCOUNTABILITY AND TRANSPARENCY** .......................................................... 41
   Jeremy Pope

4. **GUIDING PRINCIPLES ON CIVIL SERVICE REFORM** ....................................................... 49

5. **RETHINKING DONOR APPROACHES TO CIVIL SERVICE REFORM** .................................. 57

**PART TWO: COUNTRIES’ EXPERIENCE**

6. **CIVIL SERVICE REFORM IN BOTSWANA SINCE THE 1980s: LESSONS OF EXPERIENCE** ...... 63
   Mogolori Modisi

7. **REGIONAL WORKSHOP ON CIVIL SERVICE REFORM IN FRANCOPHONE AFRICA: CASE STUDY - COTE D’IVOIRE** ................................................................. 79
   Alexis Hibault

8. **FROM MODERNIZATION OF THE ADMINISTRATION TO GOVERNANCE: BURKINA FASO** .................. 103
   Mme Juliette Bonkoungou

9. **WORKING WITH DONORS TO IMPLEMENT CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS: THE UGANDAN EXPERIENCE** ........................................................................... 123
   Dr. Mohammad A.M. Kisubi

10. **REDUCING POVERTY BY BUILDING LOCAL SERVICE DELIVERY CAPACITIES** .......... 131
    Armand Atomate

**PART THREE: WORKSHOP ON CIVIL SERVICE REFORM IN FRANCOPHONE AFRICA**

11. **THE WORKSHOP: SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS** ................................................... 139
    Guy de Lusignan

**ANNEXES**

**ANNEX A: SPEECH BY THE HONOURABLE MINISTER FOR EMPLOYMENT AND THE CIVIL SERVICE** ...................................................................................... 150
    Professor Atsain Achi

**ANNEX B: SPEECH BY H.E. MR. DANIEL KABLAN DUNCAN, PRIME MINISTER** ............... 153
FOREWORD

This publication of the proceedings of the Regional Workshop on Civil Service Reform in francophone Africa is a timely and useful addition to the studies in the field of public sector management. The Workshop was organized jointly by the Government of Cote d'Ivoire, the Public Administration Division of the United Nations Secretariat and the World Bank.

The presence of the Prime Minister of the host country, accompanied by his ministerial team, at the opening ceremony of the Workshop underscored the importance and relevance accorded to the exercise. A good illustration of this point is the opening speech of the Prime Minister which is provided as an annex.

The Workshop focused on four main themes:

- strategies and sequencing of civil service reform;
- improving the quality of public service delivery;
- ethics, transparency and accountability; and
- rethinking donor support for civil service reform.

In the treatment of each of these themes, special attention was paid to the comparative dimensions. This explains the fact that specific chapters are devoted to experiences in both anglophone and francophone Africa, the Commonwealth and OECD countries. Furthermore, the good practices in some of the countries are drawn together in the “Summary and Conclusions” of the Workshop.

The following are some of the highlights in the “Summary and Conclusions” of the Workshop:

- The need to create by the beginning of the twenty-first century, public administration systems in African countries that are competent, lean and efficient, while reflecting the concept of a State dedicated to public service and the values of loyalty, patriotism and equity.

- It is of the utmost importance to involve civil society in every phase of the reform process which emphasizes good governance at all levels. This will not only help promote a development ethic, but will encourage the kind of “bottom-up” approach that will allow people to take responsibility for their own development.

- If political will and commitment are needed to push the reform agenda, it is also necessary to stress the inculcation of new attitudes and behaviour that would help fight against poor work ethics, lack of professionalism and rent-seeking.

- Closely linked to the above are the important issues of transparency, professionalism and respect for the rule of law.

- The participants also stressed the need for concrete and practical follow-up actions to the Workshop at both the national and regional levels. Among others, exchange of
experiences among countries would be useful and understanding of some "success stories" of non-African countries would also be rewarding.

- Finally, there is need for better coordination of donor support for administrative reform in order to ensure that African countries benefit from the technical and financial assistance of donors. This would require a joint commitment by donors and recipient countries to support and pursue the reform process.

The proceedings are published simultaneously in English and French. This publication should prove useful to both scholars and practitioners interested in public administration in Sub-Saharan Africa.

Kevin Cleaver
Director, Technical Staff
Africa Region
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The editors would like to acknowledge with gratitude the important contributions of several Ivorien and Bank colleagues to the success of the workshop on which this publication is based. Messrs. Alexis Hibault, coordinator of the workshop planning committee in the host country, and Franz Kaps, champion of the workshop on the Bank side, deserve special mention. We would also like to record our deep appreciation to Sylvie Lelievre for her invaluable assistance in the production of this publication.
INTRODUCTION

Immediately after the majority of the African countries acceded to independence in the 1960s, their political leaders focused on 'Africanization' of the administrative systems inherited from the colonial era, an objective pursued through accelerated training programs both at home and abroad. Although the scarcity of qualified executive and managerial personnel was offset for the time being through reliance on expatriate members of the former colonial civil service—except in the case of Guinea, which had gained independence under conditions resulting in the immediate departure of almost the entire corps of French colonial officials—the paramount concern of the African leadership from 1960 to 1970 was to reinforce 'Africanization' by resorting to training and continual expansion of the civil service, the chief instrument available to governments for promoting economic and social development. Whatever ideological path, socialist or capitalist, the different countries chose for their development, the size of the "civil service" increased significantly in all of them. The usual practice was automatic recruitment of all those graduating from training institutions. Those not recruited into government administration were absorbed by the ever more numerous parastatal corporations, also created in the 1960s and 1970s, to handle the industrial and commercial ventures of the public sector.

To their credit, it was civil service institutions which effectively controlled the territories of the new states in the early days of their independence, and which contributed in varying degrees to the economic and social progress achieved, mainly in agriculture, education, health, social services, and transportation. The parastatals, too, made some contributions of their own, if relatively modest ones, in the commercial and industrial spheres.

On the negative side, however, it must be noted that the external shocks felt in the second half of the 1970s revealed the fragility of public sector institutions. It became apparent they were not capable of proposing constructive measures to their governments in response to these shocks, or of helping them put such measures into effect. The second phase of the administrative reform effort (following the Africanization and training phase) began with the introduction of mechanisms to decentralize government (particularly in Senegal in the early 1970s). Subsequently, it focused on strengthening training activities, on improving performance in essential government functional areas (especially tax and customs administration), and on the need for coordination in government (for example, by establishing organization and methods departments). These steps proved insufficient, so much so that in the early 1980s administrative reform became and has remained a priority concern among donors to the francophone African countries.

Because increasingly serious budget deficits were one of the major consequences of the economic crisis that the African countries experienced at the beginning of the 1980s, two of the key goals of administrative reform became fiscal stabilization and reduction of government payrolls. This marked the end of the expansion period for both civil services and parastatals.
The specific measures endorsed by donors, particularly the World Bank, throughout the 1990s are listed in the accompanying box.

**Civil Service Management**
- Staff reduction and growth control (including census of civil servants);
- Salary and compensation policies review;
- Job classification and evaluation;
- Documentation and records management (statistics management information system);
- Strengthening and reorganization of selected ministries and agencies, e.g. Office of the Head of Civil Service, Ministries of Public Service, Local Government/Interior;
- Promoting public service training through strengthening of national training institutions; and
- Administrative decentralization

**Economic and Financial Management**
- Strengthening and reorganization of economic planning and economic financial management institutions, notably Ministries of Planning and Finance;
- Improving formulation of economic policy, planning, and management;
- Public investment and expenditure planning;
- Reform of the budgetary system;
- Improving government accounting and auditing;
- Reform of tax administration and revenue mobilization;
- External financial management (aid, debt management); and
- Training for staff of economic institutions

Adamolekun, 1989

Toward the end of the 1980s, the weakness of civil service institutions was still evident: the reform measures carried out had produced mixed results. In particular, the external technical assistance that was such a vaunted element in what was to be the ‘resolution’ of the problems identified in the above box actually had only a limited impact on the implementation of projects, and since it led to no strengthening of local capabilities, contributed little to project sustainability. On the other hand, the measures being advocated toward the beginning of the 1990s relied less on technical assistance (especially of the long-term kind) and more on the need to link civil service reform and governance, specifically so that matters relative to the rule of law, accountability, and transparency and openness in the conduct of government business could be brought into the picture. The link between governmental institutional reform and the problem of governance had been very forcefully emphasized in the course of the Conference of Francophone States at La Baule, France, in 1990.

In 1990, the Sub-Saharan countries began a democratization process that was expected to reinforce the efforts launched during the preceding ten years to restructure their economies. Since then, the role of governments and governmental institutions has been studied intensively,

---

with a view not only to improving their effectiveness but also promoting that concern with good governance which has to be a normal feature of life in all modern or transition countries.

Given the strong trend toward the globalization of international relations, it had become increasingly clear that the machinery of government must be reformed, and that the African countries in particular needed to govern themselves differently. As a corollary to this, reform of the public sector and its institutions, the civil service in particular, was an imperative. It was against this backdrop that steps were taken to organize the Workshop on Civil Service Reform in Francophone Africa which was held January 24-27, 1996 in Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire, and which followed on from the similar workshop for anglophone Africa held in April 1995 in Cape Town.2

The Abidjan Workshop was organized by the Government of Côte d'Ivoire, the World Bank, and the Public Administration Division of the UN Secretariat (New York). The decision to publish the Proceedings of the Workshop reflects a belief in their potential value to governments, civil service departments; and users of public services throughout Africa, as well as to all those with a professional interest in the problems of public sector reform.

The first section of the Proceedings consists of the documents that provided the basis for Workshop debates. Our aim has been to focus, from two differing standpoints—that of the industrial countries and that of the developing countries—on the series of problems associated with public sector management. We are fortunate enough to have received one paper written by an OECD expert and another reviewing the experience of the Commonwealth countries. Given the existence of an already large body of research and analytical work on the field, we concluded that it was important to emphasize the question of ethics and the related topics of accountability and transparency, subjects dealt with by a member of the board of directors of Transparency International and former Director-General of the Commission for the European Union. This first section also includes an introduction to the basic principles3 of civil service reform, and an article on how better donor coordination can support such reform.

The second section of the Proceedings provides an overview of the experience of certain African countries:

1. **Botswana**, which has an exemplary record. As one a former senior civil servant in the country noted, its machinery of government, ever since independence, has always shown itself extremely flexible and adaptable. And it is this which explains why today, in contrast to the majority of African countries, it benefits from a climate of good governance.

2. **Côte d'Ivoire**, the subject of an address by its Director of Planning and Public Administration, whose paper is very illuminating on the subject of the obstacles a country with serious civil service overstaffing must surmount before it can succeed with a full-scale public sector reform program. It is also important to have a comprehensive view of the governmental institutions in place so that steps can be taken to encourage greater openness and participation

---


3 Formulated by the Civil Service Reform Working Group of the Special Program of Assistance for Africa.
between the public sector and civil society and to create the basic conditions conducive to changes in habits and behaviors.

3. *Burkina Faso*, the subject of a paper presented by its Minister for the Civil Service, which gives a detailed view of the definition of good governance, one of the essential conditions for development.

4. *Uganda*, another case history from anglophone Africa, presented by the country’s former Civil Service Director, who emphasizes the importance of closer coordination and collaboration among donors where implementation of civil service reforms is concerned.

5. *Senegal, Mali, et al.*, which provide the subjects for a brief survey of various local capacity building initiatives—mainly in the two countries named—focused on improving the quality of public services from the user standpoint by subcontracting them to the private sector.

The third and last section of the Proceedings consists of a general summary of Workshop debates, conclusions, and recommendations, providing a focus on its four thematic areas, namely strategies, quality of services, ethics, and donor support. Working groups studied each of these thematic concerns, issuing recommendations in each case. The Workshop in its plenary closing session commended the summary report. On the same occasion, participants underscored the importance of follow-up to the Workshop: on the thematic level (steps toward decentralization and deconcentration, reinforcement of the rule of law, and greater involvement of civil society in the reform process); on the regional level (through the African Civil Service Monitoring Agency - OFPA, existing information networks, and the African Capacity Building Foundation); and on the national level (better communication between civil servants, users/consumers and members of civil society, with a view to more successful civil service reforms).

The expectation is that the Workshop’s recommendations will be followed by specific action in the field. In other words, it is to be hoped that the future brings with it a re-examination of governmental institutions. It is by now widely accepted that government which is too authoritarian or centralizing stifles all initiative in both individuals and communities, especially at the grassroots level. Freedom of speech and freedom of action require that institutions be flexible, and, especially in the case of the African countries in their present circumstances, that they not only deconcentrate but also decentralize progressively and in all possible spheres. It is not a matter of replicating central government authoritarianism at regional or sub-regional levels, but of giving government an understanding of the points of view existing at the grassroots, thereby enabling it to express itself ‘democratically’ through institutions that will represent it accurately in both the public and private arenas. All Workshop communications, and the Summary Proceedings as well, are witness to this. Reduction of the size of the civil service is not in itself a problem of critical proportions, despite the inevitable negative social fallout from the dismissal of personnel at all levels. It becomes a very serious problem, however, if new employment opportunities are not created, and it is this fact that accounts for the importance of transferring activities up till now in government hands into those of the private sector, as a source of new jobs.

Another extremely important consideration has to do with the campaign against rent seeking and corruption. It is both impossible and unrealistic to imagine a corruption-free society. Today’s industrial countries are a good example. However, corruption can be fought with transparency, freedom to think and criticize, and introduction of a work ethic or, in other
words, of greater professionalism. It is inevitable, all the same, that a radical change in behaviors and attitudes will require a long and painstaking effort.

Finally, the experience of other countries has a potential for impact in Africa that should not be underestimated. This is why the Abidjan Workshop has drawn on the lessons provided by anglophone Africa and by Europe. But, in the future, more extensive collaboration among African countries belonging to the same sub-region and also with other developing countries and other regions of the world—Latin America, Southeast Asia and the Far East—may prove even more beneficial.
PART ONE

BACKGROUND DOCUMENTS
1. NEW PUBLIC MANAGEMENT: CHALLENGES AND ISSUES IN AN INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE

David Shand

Introduction

While there are many common themes among the twenty-five member countries of the OECD (Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development), there are also differences of substance, speed and emphasis in public management reform. (These are more fully analyzed in Public Management Services’ forthcoming publication, Governance in Transition). OECD experiences range from the so-called the “radicalism” of UK and New Zealand through the more “measured” approaches of Australia and the Nordic countries, to the smaller (so far) changes in most administrative law countries (Italy, Spain). There are some countries where public sector reform is not a major issue as yet—Germany at the national government level (although things are now beginning to happen) and perhaps Japan (although there appears to be a rapidly emerging consensus that fundamental reform including deregulation is required in the Japanese public sector to maintain Japanese economic growth). The USA illustrates significant reforms, in state and local governments, but with change in the federal government just beginning, reflecting both the National Performance Review and the Contract With America.

Public sector management reform is, of course, not new. In the last thirty years many countries have pursued “micro” reforms described variously as program budgeting, management by objectives and accountable management, to name but a few. And many individual organizations at both national and local government level have developed their own initiatives focusing on efficiency, effectiveness and customer service. (In some cases this raises questions about the value added by “central” initiatives). But generally what appears to be different about current reforms is their greater scope, involving in many cases significant changes to the boundaries and structure of the public sector, a greater sense of urgency and a more comprehensive or strategic, approach to reform, recognizing the interdependence of different aspects of reform. New Public Management (NPM) is not now generally regarded as another passing “fad”.

The origins of these changes are mixed. In all cases, increasing globalization forces or encourages a bit of “me-tooism” in the reforms. In some cases the changes may be ideologically driven, invoking the superiority of the private sector as in the case of Thatcherism (UK) or Rogernomics (New Zealand), although to be fair a strong intellectual paradigm based on public choice and agency theory has been developed in the New Zealand case. In others, the changes represent a more direct-response to government’s budgetary difficulties, themselves brought on by economic contraction. While their objectives and origins may differ between countries, the strategies and directions generally converge. There are perceived new limits to the ability of the state to solve economic or social problems. The sheer weight of the public sector in the economy has grown significantly and there is a generally acceptance of the view that
public sector performance has a significant impact on total economic performance. There is a consensus that public sector performance can be and needs to be improved.

While origins and objectives may differ between countries, the strategies and directions generally converge. The reforms are being promoted by governments of different political persuasions. While in some countries they may be aimed at reducing the role and size of the public sector (in these cases reforms to existing organizations are seen as a prelude to privatization), in other countries the reforms are perceived as defending and enhancing the public sector and its organizations and maintaining the legitimacy of the state. A well-performing public sector organization may equally be a candidate for retention or survival as for sale. And only the public sector may be considered the appropriate provider of many services.

While there may be a continuing role for the state, it may be to "steer" rather than to "row" or to facilitate rather than to do. At the same time, there is a greater willingness to think in terms of results of public interventions, rather than of rigid structures and processes governing such interventions. Perhaps, as has been said, the political right has become more dogmatic and the political left, less so.

Giving managers the tools and incentives to improve performance is seen as a way of enabling managers to do more with less, to minimize the impact on services of budget reductions. Public sector organizations face a more demanding public which expects better services, a say in what it gets and how it is delivered, and which is increasingly reluctant to pay higher taxes. At the same time, demographic and other changes are adding to demands for services.

**Evaluating New Public Management**

In evaluating NPM, much depends on whose viewpoint is adopted. There are three potentially conflicting interests and points of view, namely:

- consumers of government services;
- taxpayers; and
- public sector employees.

At this stage public sector reforms have probably had greater impact on public sector employees who in many cases have had to adjust to major changes in organizational structures and new work methods. They have been required to work smarter, to accept continuing change and to accept competition. But in many cases, their job content and individual autonomy have also been enhanced. Quite a number have lost their jobs. Overall, the working environment has been radically changed. This issue is discussed later.

The impact on consumers also appears to have been significant in many countries. The adoption of a client focus is a simple but powerful concept which is likely to have a major and enduring influence, as discussed later. But, at the same time, consumers’ perceptions will be influenced by any reductions in services. For example, train services may run on time but there may be fewer of them.

The impact on taxpayers in terms of their getting better value for money is also probably significant, but more difficult to prove and always less obvious in its impact.
In fact we lack objective aggregate information on just what has happened to the performance of the public sector. For example, our national statisticians do not measure public sector productivity. But there is plenty of anecdotal evidence of performance improvement and partial performance indicators and a number of interesting public opinion surveys. The overall circumstantial evidence of performance improvement is compelling.

I should make my own position clear. I believe there is a positive role for well-performing and responsive public institutions. I am a general supporter of the new public management and generally optimistic about where it is taking us. I am not a believer in the "good old days" of public management propounded by some anti-managerialists. More often than not, the "good old days" were characterized by inward-looking and unresponsive public sector organizations. But the new public management needs to be done "right". Exaggerated claims about its achievements are common. And mistakes have been made. But that is no reason for turning back.

It is useful to distinguish between changes which are concerned with changing the role, boundaries and structure of governments (the macro changes) and those more concerned with the internal management “paradigm” of the public sector (the micro changes). These are sometimes called the “what” and the “how” of public management reform. This is not a totally satisfactory distinction but reflects areas of lesser and greater convergence of approach.

**The "macro" Changes**

It is clear that the structure and boundaries of the state are changing in all countries. Governments of a range of political persuasions are showing themselves willing to privatize (or partly so) previously state-owned airlines and banks. But there is less unanimity about privatizing public utilities such as telecoms, gas and electricity (France). In the case of the macro public service there is even less commonality of approach. A number of governments have shown an interest in vouchers but these have yet to become significant. Other market-type mechanisms such as increased use of external charging and charging for services within government are more common. There is a general willingness to contract out housekeeping activities (printing, information technology, gardening, cleaning, internal audit, etc.), and to develop new relationships with both the non-profit sector and the private sector in new forms of service delivery. While the rhetoric may be more subdued in some countries, the reality may be stronger. For example, recent labor governments in Australia, both state and federal, have pursued significant privatization and contracting-out, but have not promoted these changes as policy planks.

Is privatization and contracting-out reducing the size of the public sector? Unfortunately, there are no adequate comparable and recent statistics to demonstrate changes in the size of the public sector. But it appears that in the last five years, only New Zealand and the UK have seen, a significant change (a reduction of over 5 per cent) in the public sector share of Gross Domestic Product (GDP). The size of the public sector appears to be “sticky” in terms of downward adjustment.

Are these changes a major once-and-for-all correction of the size and role of the public sector? Or are they more a correctional adjustment viewed from a longer-term perspective? I am not sure. But clearly, we need to distinguish the question of ownership from that of control or management. Modes of operation may be changing, the number of public servants may be diminishing, but the role and influence of the state is not as much affected.
There appear to be some benefits in privatization and contracting-out (lower real prices and improved customer service) although of course the real issue is whether these could have been achieved without privatization. And in few countries is privatization politically popular. Assessing the benefits of contracting-out is more complex, at least more than its proponents claim, but PUMA's work suggests that overall there are efficiency and service quality gains.

Another structural aspect of the changes particularly associated with the UK and New Zealand is the establishment of autonomous service delivery agencies separate from ministerial departments. Depending on one’s point of view, agencies involve either undesirable fragmentation or enhanced or clarified accountability. Nordic countries, particularly Sweden, have long had autonomous agencies. But in their case the agency may retain a major involvement in policy advice and evaluation as well as in service delivery. What appears to be lacking in the UK approach is comprehensive policy and program evaluation—either in ministries or in agencies. A greater focus on management which was previously lacking is commendable, but one also needs more and better policy, analysis and evaluation, not less of it.

The "micro" Changes

Changes in public sector management at the micro level have a more general level of acceptance and common pattern of implementation in OECD countries. They reflect a concern to improve the performance of the public sector or to do more with less through:

- more effective programs, e.g. through better-targeting;
- more efficient operations; economizing on staff and capital resources; and
- improved quality of-services and services delivery.

Public sector organizations are seen as needing to be customer-focused, flexible and outward-looking as opposed to the highly centralized, rule bound, inward-looking organizations of the past.

To some, this new public sector management paradigm simply means invoking private sector management-techniques, a view given credence by the rhetoric of Thatcherism in the UK, Rogernomics in New Zealand and the US National Performance Review. I do not see it this way. The tools of corporate planning, performance measurement and devolution to provide clearer accountability are general “common sense” management tools. They have been in use in many public sector organizations before government-wide reforms were commenced. And the accountability from mechanisms and ethical rules under which the public sector operates continue to be different from the private sector. Although there has been some convergence, public sector management remains much harder!

There is no need in this paper for a detailed or a tedious exposition of the themes “let the managers manager and “make the managers manage” in new public management. But the basic components of the new paradigm are worth restating:

- a closer focus on results in terms of efficiency and effectiveness, and service quality;

---

4 PUMA is the acronym for OECD’s Public Management (PUMA) Services.
- the replacement of highly centralized hierarchical organizational structures with decentralized management environments where decisions on resource allocation and service delivery are taken closer to the point of delivery, and which provide scope for feedback from clients and other interest groups;

- flexibility to explore alternatives to direct public provision which might provide more cost-effective policy outcomes;

- new personnel management policies to provide greater flexibility in the deployment of staff (e.g. through multi-skilling);

- the use of mechanisms to improve performance such as performance contracting and the creation of competitive and market environments within and between public sector organizations;

- incentives to improve performance (or at least removing disincentives) through enabling organizations to retain a portion of savings from improved performance;

- the strengthening of strategic capacities at the center to "steer" government to respond to external changes and diverse interests quickly, flexibly and at least cost; and

- greater accountability and transparency through requirements to report on results.

These are what I see as the components of a comprehensive approach to the new public management. Not all elements are present in all countries. Several of these aspects of the new paradigm are worth separate discussion, namely:

- a client or customer focus;
- devolution; and
- performance contracting.

A major theme associated with improving performance is the development of a customer or a client focus or service quality initiatives in the public sector. The UK Citizens Charter is probably the best-known example. These initiatives aim to improve performance in service delivery (timeliness, accuracy, etc.) as well as to provide services which meet people's needs. Thus they involve consultation with clients about what they want and aspects of services they particularly value. Much more information on available services may be provided. Commitments to provide a certain type, volume and quality of service may be made and performance measured against their commitments. They provide greater client choice and complaint and redress mechanisms. Services may be tailored to individual needs rather than standardized. Empowerment of staff to respond appropriately to client requirements is also stressed. In a number of countries, these reforms have a strong element of debureaucratization or administrative simplification: public servants are perceived as existing to help citizens, not to make their lives difficult. The long-term implications of this simple but powerful concept may be significant in terms of the type of decisions which may in the future be made by clients as opposed to elected officials or public servants. Developing a customer service has involved a major change in mind-set in many public sector organizations and all the difficulties in staff motivation and organization this entails.
While there is little doubt that performance has improved in many governments as result of client focus, client perceptions are, interestingly, more mixed. A commonly-quoted standard of improvement is the time taken and documentation required to obtain a passport—an example as common in client focus literature as is rubbish collection in discussions of contracting-out. One problem is that while the quality of individual services may be improved, their overall level may diminish.

Also, the focus of most service quality initiatives is on quality of service delivery rather than on service outcomes. While waiting times for medical operations may be reduced, what about the quality of medical staff and the medical success—or survival rate? Service quality is only one aspect of overall performance. A focus only on short-term service delivery questions may divert us from more important issues of public services.

A client focus also has a management dimension within public service organizations. Support units (accounts, personnel units, etc.) exist to provide a service to operational parts of the organization. They do not exist as ends in themselves. Their performance may be considerably improved if they can develop a client focus. The possibility of contracting-out may encourage them to do this.

Devolution has been a major theme of public sector reform. It has a number of related elements:

- devolution of responsibilities to other levels of government;
- devolution from the centre to operating departments, including the setting-up of autonomous agencies; and
- devolution within organizations.

In the latter two cases, a significant feature has been the removal of unnecessarily prescriptive rules and regulations.

In a number of countries, the devolution from national to lower levels of government has been substantial (Denmark, Finland, France, Sweden, but not UK). This devolution is a significant and probably enduring change. In some cases, this devolution of both responsibilities and finances has not been accompanied by clear accountability relationships between the levels of government. Arguably, if both responsibilities and financing are devolved, democratic accountability/means that each level of government can keep to its own/turf without the need for such accountability arrangements.

As mentioned previously, the creation of autonomous agencies or units (Canada, Denmark, France, Sweden, UK) is another development with long-term implications for accountability and performance. As mentioned earlier, the separation of policy from administration is part of this in only a few countries (New Zealand and UK); in others, such agencies may have significant policy monitoring, development and advice role (Sweden). Accountability for only outputs rather than also for outcomes may be clearer, but is worryingly narrow.

There is also the question of the adequacy of policy development and steering from the center. The greater the disaggregation, the more difficult is steering, a concern already expressed by New Zealand ministers. Clearly, there should be some sensible limit to disaggregation.
Autonomous agencies, central ministries agencies and portfolio ministries all need to transform themselves for this new regime. There is some evidence that not enough of this transformation is taking place to ensure sustainable and significant change.

In many countries, there has also been a substantial freeing-up of centrally imposed rules on budgetary and staffing matters (Australia, New Zealand). The level of autonomy in staffing manners raises yet unresolved issues about the future of a unified (but mobile and flexible) public service (New Zealand and UK). But while many governments have been prepared to free up appointments, job classification and promotions processes, there has been much less devolution in industrial relations and pay-fixing processes. Even in the former scenario, tight budget controls and requirements that managers live with the budgetary consequences of their negotiations have limited any "excesses".

As with any devolution, there are concerns about, for example, merit and equity policies not being observed, that some public servants may overclassify positions and pay themselves too much, and so on. But it needs to be remembered that devolution of operational decisions does not mean freedom to do as one wishes. On the contrary, decisions are devolved within a policy framework and managers must be held accountable for these decisions within this framework. Reporting on and audit of decisions made are part of this accountability.

Devolution is based on the view that decisions made closer to their actual point of impact, and therefore with greater knowledge of likely results, are likely to be better decisions. There is little evidence that centralized decision-making is any better than devolved decision-making in avoiding inappropriate decisions. Certainly, there is no evidence of budget blowouts from financial devolution. The reverse is the case-financial devolution has been a means to enable managers to achieve tight aggregate expenditure controls.

Nevertheless, "letting the managers manage" has been difficult to achieve in a number of countries. An interest in compliance rather than performance, a view that managerial autonomy may give too much power to public servants at the expense of elected officials and fears of increased risk of “impropriety” have limited its progress. But even in the USA, politicians have recognized the inefficiencies created by excessive rules and regulations, as reflected in the freeing-up of personnel and procurement regulations.

This is an appropriate point at which to discuss the issue of ethics and corruption which appears to be a concern in the UK and New Zealand, but less so in other countries which have extensively pursued NPM such as Australia and the Nordic countries. The issue of excessive pay for executives in the private sector is less important than the perception that NPM encourages the introduction of private sector values into public management. For a start this view is unfair to the private sector where many companies run frugal and ethical senior management regimes. The problem is that in many cases no rules or guidelines have been prescribed under the guise of “let the managers manage” or the need to use "private sector" practices. But this should be easily dealt with by clear signals and guidelines concerning executive remuneration and other "perks". Codes of conduct and ethics are essential. The public sector is not the private sector.

My own view is that devolution or freeing-up the rules and giving managers greater flexibility and autonomy has been the key factor in improving public sector performance. Performance contracting and even performance pay may have made a contribution but the simple act of freeing up the system has been incomparably important.
One important aspect of accountability is information. In many industrial countries, there has never been so much information publicly available on the operations of government organizations. In countries with Freedom-of-Information legislation, this situation is even more pronounced. But sheer quantity is not the point: relevance is an area where more work needs to be done. Audit institutions can play an important role in assuring the reliability and even relevance or validity of performance information while not detracting from the responsibility of management to develop good, performance information as part of self-evaluation.

The concept of performance contracting is to a large extent the other side of the autonomy coin. It involves both an increased emphasis on performance and the development of new, accountability instruments. Contracts may be between ministers and organizations, which specify levels of autonomy, required results and sanctions and rewards. They may include employment contracts for chief executives. While not normally a legal agreement, a performance contract involves mutual undertakings. As such, it may modify old, hierarchical relationships and will involve sanctions and rewards and other incentives of both a personal and institutional nature which are new in a public sector environment. It puts pressure on the performance measurement systems with all the limitations and the attendant possibilities, of game playing. Indeed, this appear to be a problem in the UK where the use of a relatively small number of broad performance indicators (frequently politically determined) reflects the private sector’s “rough and ready” use of performance indicators, with insufficient regard to unintended or dysfunctional consequences. Of course, in the private sector it matters less; there is always market survival as the ultimate test. We need to remember that performance measurement in the public sector is about getting a “better feel” for overall performance efficiency, effectiveness, and service quality, not about a single bottom line.

The "People" Dimension

Clearly, the new public management is not just a set of technical measures; it has a "people" dimension. In organizational terms, it implies flatter structures, some greater priority on operational units and broader or less specialized job specifications. It has seen greater emphasis on general management or supervisory skills as opposed to technical ones, as represented by the now-common concept of senior executive services (SES). In theory, public servants are more empowered and more broadly skilled; there are fewer of them, but they are better paid.

But are they appropriately motivated to regard performance and a client focus as part of their professional ethic and values? While this is not the place for a detailed discussion of this issue, signals and incentives to staff are clearly important and appear to be neglected in some country's approaches to the new public management. Performance pay which has been tried in a number of countries with mixed results, is only one aspect of this. Evidence suggests that consultation and management leadership are key in converting new public management theory into reality.

Conclusion

Taken together, customer focus, autonomy and performance contracting appear to be promoting a new spirit of innovation in public service managers. There is considerable evidence, particularly in state and local governments, of a major and enduring change where such strategies are coherently implemented. The interaction between citizens, public servants and elected officials has been changed beneficially and probably permanently. In local
government, there appear to be widely-accepted models of good governance and public sector management. But there is, as yet, less to report at the national government level. Of course, it is not easy to do it well. Experiences of OECD member countries suggest that success depends on sustained efforts, patience and clear and consistent signals. It is here that the role of leadership (not necessarily political), in public sector management reforms is so important.

But the changes are not yet fully in place. Some governments have scarcely begun and there are many obstacles to be overcome for those who are currently on the path. These include a failure to show demonstrable benefits, and inadequate strategic management of the change process.

The demise of the old “command and control” system of public management is not to be too much lamented. The real challenge is to get the new public management right. Care, thought, consultation and attention to the “people” dimension is what this challenge requires.
2. CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS: LEARNING FROM COMMONWEALTH EXPERIENCES

Dr. Mohan Kaul

Introduction

At their 1991 meeting in Harare, Commonwealth Heads of Government reaffirmed their commitment to the Commonwealth principles for democratic development and identified sound and accountable administration as a key priority for the Commonwealth. Subsequently, the Secretariat's Management and Training Services Division organized a series of Roundtables and consultations with Governments. The aim of these was to learn from successful experiences and explore ways and means of strengthening Commonwealth cooperation in the area of administration and managerial reforms.

The dialogue highlighted both the diversity and the commonality of reform programs, and the key distinctions between domestic and external pressures for change. Discussions also revealed a movement from "macro" concerns relating to the role of government in socioeconomic development, towards a more "micro" concern with the development of specific strategies for improvement in public sector management. In summary, the debate had moved from the problems to the solutions.

This paper illustrates the degree to which new areas of consensus are emerging in the implementation of reform. It reflects the findings of the Roundtables and proposes a framework for sharing experiences of successful civil service reforms.

Pressure For Reforms

Since the mid-1970s, governments have been increasingly concerned with adapting and developing structures and values of civil service which will achieve greater efficiency, and more responsive and flexible services. This movement has been motivated by unprecedented economic crises which led to reduced financial resources for governments and by rapid changes in political and public opinion.

A combination of economic pressures acted as forces for change. These included problems related to balance of payments faced by most countries in the Commonwealth which eroded their exchange rates and the purchasing government's power. The terms of trade were such that developing countries could not cover their needs for imports of manufactured products—many of which were needed by government agencies.

Also, the high levels of government expenditure as a proportion of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) were increasing every year, while the sources of government revenue could not keep pace. Thus, the cost of government was becoming unsustainable. Hence, there was a need for urgent reductions in government expenditure.
This concern with economic growth has led to reforms directed towards national goals affecting society generally, rather than those limited to improving administrative efficiency within government. Reforms have also attempted to improve the context for private sector development. In some settings, this has led to changes resting on the premise that government is intrinsically an obstacle to development which must be removed, rather than a potential solution which must be appropriately targeted.

Against this general background, managerial pragmatism and political conviction have both played their part in motivating reform programs. Whether explicitly stated as a goal or not, economic growth has been of paramount concern, particularly at a time of widespread recession.

The Changing Role Of Government

The role assigned to government in the planning and management of national economic and social activities has undergone fundamental reassessment in both the industrial and developing economies within the Commonwealth. At the same time, major political reorientations in the level of state intervention in social and economic spheres have taken place.

A crucial development has been the change in strategy being pursued by most countries for achieving economic growth and broader development objectives. In the late 1980s, the question of “perestroika” posed fundamental challenges far beyond the boundaries of the Soviet Union. This occurred at both a practical and an intellectual level and to both policy-makers and managers alike. The issue of moving from an economy in which activity has been planned mainly in terms of physical quantities, to one in which consumers indicate their preferences by means of the monetary valuations they put on at least some goods and services, is one of the key managerial and intellectual challenges of our time.

These developments, combined with political and social changes around the world, have had an impact on various economies. As well as reawakening a spirit of economic liberalism, they have also impacted on the functions of governments. However, despite consensus on the need for change, there continues to be controversy on what the appropriate role of the state should be.

In most industrial Commonwealth countries in the 1980s, market-oriented, private sector techniques emerged as the sole path to holding down public sector budgets while allowing some opportunity to meet increasing public expectations. As some of the ideological rigor underpinning this approach softened, a more dispassionate view of the advances made has been possible. Sound management supported by pragmatism, enterprise and a clear sense of mission, have emerged ahead of ideological conviction.

Many countries are now seeking modes of administration which avoid the errors of both Soviet-style planning and the grandiose corporate planning approaches popular in the 1960s. The need to change the role of the state has found acceptance as a route towards improved economic efficiency in many countries. The restructuring which followed has been shaped differently by the ideological, political, structural and cultural contexts in the perceived role of government from acting as the principal vehicle for socioeconomic development to guiding and facilitating that development.
Many of the difficulties faced by developing countries are due not only to defective and ineffective policy instruments but also to complex institutional mechanisms which make it difficult to implement various policies effectively. In this context, attention needs to be given to management structures and institutional mechanisms within the government for creating the capacity and capability for effective policy management, involving identification of strategic choices, policy analysis for outlining implementable programs of action and monitoring of policy implementation.

Although policy formulation remains one of the main functions of government, the role of the government in implementing policy decisions is changing. The strong movement towards liberalization of economies has been accompanied by a desire to appraise what government does best. As a result, issues related to economic liberalization, transfer of state-owned enterprises to the private sector, reductions in the size of state bureaucracies, and contracting out work, have been placed higher on the strategic agenda.

The situation, however, is far from straightforward. Underneath the general current towards “leaner and meaner” administrative structures, there are many eddies in the opposite direction. Economic liberalization brings with it an increased requirement for regulatory activity, as does the increasing concern for the environment. Equally, the strong pressure towards consumer-oriented services can lead to requirements for more rather than less government, with an emphasis on “transparency” rather than size.

Within this climate of change, there are underlying concerns to achieve efficiency, cost-consciousness, responsiveness and accountability. The motivation for such reforms are emphasized by increasing public expectations concerning the quality of government services.

This very striking managerial shift has been strongest in industrial and newly-industrialized countries, but the reform themes relate closely to the changing mood within other settings. Such managerial focus on systems and structures embodies a powerful set of ideals, and has recently been described as "the emergence of entrepreneurial government".

In different settings, different paths are being followed towards a similar set of goals. In UK and New Zealand, systemic and radical reform measure have been adopted, utilizing the new managerialism to the full to reorient the civil service and to decentralize its functions. In other settings, such as Singapore and Malaysia, the new approaches have added to the existing administrative tool kit available to government. These new tools have facilitated incremental reform of a more traditional and centralized position towards enhanced managerialism, within a broader focus on the "well-performing government organization".

Common Themes

The Roundtables highlighted several common themes to the introduction of reform programs. These individual components indicate that a substantial reform program, with roots deep in a changing conceptualization of government, is under way.

Examination of these themes emphasized the complexity of the challenges, the potential which such reform programs might realize, and the remarkable similarity about the concerns and changes taking place in very different settings. These themes are as follows:
Redrawing The Political/Administrative Boundary

The search for enhanced clarity of role and tighter lines of accountability extends to a desire to redefine the relationship between political policy-making, and administrative policy implementation. As a policy goal, its roots lie in the concern that the civil service requires a clearer political lead, and the belief that in distinguishing the role of senior administrators from that of politicians, strategic objectives will be more easily distinguished from operational processes.

Selecting Appropriate Options

In order to maintain an effective capacity for strategic intervention in all areas of socioeconomic activities, governments must select the most effective structured reform option from an increasingly broad portfolio, from corporatization through to contracting out. The difficulty is that this occurs within a climate of accelerating change and globalization. Selecting the appropriate option requires a willingness to dispassionately evaluate models for their effectiveness, regardless of whether those models are traditionally associated with the public or private sectors. Also, it implies a managerial style which facilitates a rapid response and which is capable of driving through change.

Emphasizing Accountability

This identification of responsibilities, where policy formulation is separated from implementation, is a necessary precursor to strengthening accountability. Enhanced accountability fits with a broader concern to adopt a more managerial approach. Such an approach suggests that accountability is enhanced by tighter definition of tasks, measurement of performance, devolution of resource control, strengthening monitoring, and clarifying incentives.

Achieving A “Synergy” Between The Public And Private Sector

Recognition that the public sector is dependent on the services of the private sector, as well as being ultimately responsible for the climate in which that sector thrives or otherwise, requires a clear conceptualization of the boundary between the two. This entails clarity in the mechanisms for the exchange of goods and services across that boundary. In turn, this requires a clear model for government purchasing of externally-produced services and an ability to specify the government's intended outcome in strengthening the capacity of the private sector. Within the more pragmatic management culture increasingly adopted by governments, a broader range of choices is available for the intervention in, and withdrawal from, areas of social and economic activity. The public/private “synergy” is maintained by a flexible and frequently tactical choice of strategies and actions.

A Concern For Efficiency

The reform programs reflected the two broad aims of increased efficiency and effectiveness. The concern for heightened efficiency is both an organizational value implying a moral dimension to any apparent waste in government, and an instrumental concern resting on the premise that inefficiency within government represents a drag on national productivity.

The concern to ensure efficiency in state-owned enterprises is mirrored in the concern to achieve a civil service more orientated towards achievements and outputs than consistency of
procedures - the model which has traditionally underpinned civil service activities. This refocusing of the civil service is made possible when clear lines of accountability and sharp definition of purpose are introduced into government.

Reducing Corruption

In varying degrees, corruption is a fact of life in all areas of government. While perceptions of its nature and extent vary, it provides a strong impetus for reform on two levels. First, concern exists in some countries that independence left a residue of endemic corruption. Fundamental reform was seen as necessary to change the value base and the procedures which sustained this state of affairs. Second, and contrast, other countries have more recent concerns regarding the growing number of public sector scandals, which could be related to the fast pace of change.

In both situations, the response of government has been to introduce widespread reform programs with the broad aim of reversing any perception that corruption is a "low risk-high reward" activity.

A Dual Focus On Staff And Structures

Discussions indicated clearly that successful reforms are built on a foundation of attention to both the organizational and attitudinal dimensions of public sector reform. In some settings, the comprehensive revision of traditional personnel policies within the civil service, supported by tight monitoring of total staff numbers and costs, have clearly assisted in developing a new culture in which quality and accountability to the public are being emphasized through a conscious process of reorientation.

Such a deliberate process of changing attitudes, in step with reforming structures, highlights the central role of staff commitment to change. The process of reform must capture the imagination of existing staff if they are to lead to sustainable service improvements.

Changing Values And Attitudes

The question of attitudes underpins all concrete issues concerning possible civil service reforms. Increasing concern with the quality of service provided to "customers" has acted as a particular catalyst in developing an organizational culture where concern for the finished product is a major preoccupation. Attitudes concerning commitment to the job, belief in quality, and flexibility, have been associated with many recent developments. Such reforms within the public sector have represented a major challenge to the traditions and assumed values of the civil service.

In some settings, a concern for quality and identification with the public served are important aspects of the new culture. This gives rise to the possibility that a new public sector value system is emerging. If this is the case, it might represent the ethical dimension of the revised boundary between the public and private sectors referred to earlier. Such developments raise fundamental questions about the very notion that the public sector is distinct and separate from the private sector and should operate on different principles.
Technological Opportunities

The growing power of information technology has opened up possibilities which have not existed previously. The rapid processing and dissemination of information is allowing the development of a broader range of organizational structures and systems. Flatter structures allowing for tighter monitoring of service outputs and delivery of better services to the customers and improved information interface with the public at large are some of the developments in this area.

Key Strategies Of Civil Service Reforms

Along with the common themes, a set of key strategies of civil service reform programs within the Commonwealth governments emerged. Details of these strategies are summarized below.

Securing Leadership for Change

The importance of securing the highest level of political authority, namely the commitment of Ministers and senior officials, to an administrative reform program, was identified. Equally important is the institutionalization within the government machinery of the skills necessary for the continuation and development of good management in government. Thus, reviewing and defining the relationship between Ministers and the most senior officials was particularly highlighted.

As well as high-level political support, encompassing both the Prime Minister and President and Cabinet, such reforms also require the support of the Chief Executives at the organization level.

Most successful reforms are politically driven at the highest levels as was the case in UK, Malaysia, Singapore and New Zealand. By contrast, Canada's Public Service 2000 was seen to have suffered from a deficiency of political will and intent.

Such support was evident in Jamaica when the Hon. Prime Minister stated that he did not envisage that the new role of government as minimalist or resulting in its eventual disappearance. Rather, he said that it suggested that government of a somewhat different nature and better kind. It certainly implied movement towards catalytic government: one that concentrates on facilitation, regulating, and monitoring; one that focuses more on “steering than rowing”.

In Uganda, a public service review and reorganization commission was appointed in 1989 with the major objective of redefining the role of government in meeting the development needs of Uganda and raising the efficiency and effectiveness of the public sector.

In Zimbabwe, civil service reforms involved the setting-up of institutional machineries to implement and monitor the reform program. In this regard, a number of units had been created. These include a monitoring and implementation unit in the office of the President and Cabinet, a human resource and management services directorate and efficiency unit in the Public Service Commission and the training directorate in the Ministry of the Public Service. A public service commission was appointed in 1987 by the President to undertake an in-depth study of civil service in Zimbabwe.
The Government of Malta appointed a Public Service Reform Commission when it initiated a radical reform of its civil service in 1987. The role of the Commission was to "examine the organization of the public service, and recommend means by which the Service can efficiently respond to the changing needs for effective government".

In Trinidad & Tobago, in 1991, a cabinet minister was appointed and given a mandate, for the first time, to implement public service reform.

**Policy Development and Strategic Planning**

Strategic planning deals with strengthening the core policy development, management and coordination capacity within the government. The lack of policy analysis skills has been identified as a key weakness within the civil service in many developing countries.

In some countries this has been addressed by strengthening offices of President/Prime Minister/Cabinet through development of policy units (Britain, Australia, New Zealand, Zambia). In other countries, inter-ministerial committees have been set up for special policy issues and national forums involving private and public sectors (Malaysia; Malaysia Inc. and Ghana; National Renewal Program). Also, special committees of secretaries and task forces have been set up (Zambia, Malaysia). Some countries have also facilitated the setting-up of independent policy institutions.

Strategic planning also deals with the civil service improvement programs, and, in particular, the development of priorities with responsibility through clear systems of delegation.

In Jamaica, one of the first priorities of the civil service reform was also to establish the necessary capability under the Prime Minister's personal authority to command and control the formation of strategy and the policies for development of resources, money and people to implement it. The Prime Minister's Office (OPM) has to take over full responsibility of bringing together issues which bear on government strategy and presenting them to Ministers and to take a lead role in corporate planning for the government as a whole.

In UK, most policy proposals originate from Ministers and all those civil servants who are especially designated to produce policy advice. Political advisers play a part in this process and the Prime Minister's Office has its own advisers in the form of the Number 10 Policy Unit. This Unit is headed by an officer of Deputy Secretary level who is in charge of a team of eight people producing ideas on domestic, economic and foreign affairs for the Prime Minister.

**Making the Most of Staff: Human Resource Management**

Improved human resource management systems within the public service should aim to encourage and reward both team and individual performance. Increasing managerial autonomy over departmental and agency human resources management practices allows for innovations in producing, measuring and rewarding individual performance.

A number of governments have successfully experimented in this regard: developing flexibility in working conditions (Australia and New Zealand); moving collective bargaining from the entire public service to the work-place (Australia and UK); and the application of private sector law to the public sector (New Zealand).
Some of the most successful Asian economies recognize the importance of recruiting the most talented people available and improving their skills through constant training. Hong Kong and Singapore carry out aggressive recruitment at entry level, entice high-flyers for further training and generally pay attractive salaries compared with the private sector.

**Tailored Training.**

Current reform programs are adopting a highly pragmatic approach to maximizing the effectiveness of all levels of staff. Training programs to ensure competency are increasingly tailored to individual needs. Performance appraisal techniques which identify the strengths and weaknesses of individual contributions, and personal career planning to ensure that personal ambitions and aspirations are harnessed towards the overall service of government, are also being introduced.

Imaginative training initiatives have been initiated in a number of countries. In UK and Mauritius, training is being tailored to rank; and Singapore, Ghana, Australia and Trinidad and Tobago have all instituted customized training for staff. The Malaysian government's focus on establishing key national institutions capable of providing highly targeted training to strategic personnel provides a useful example of current developments in this field. The Botswana government has set up a specialized training center, Botswana Productivity Center, for training in productivity and quality improvement programs. The Ghana Institute of Management and Public Administration (GIMPA) has expanded its activities to meet the increased demands of training as a result of civil service reforms in Ghana. Throughout the Public Service of Canada, staff training and development is given high priority. Close attention has been paid to the purposes, coordination and cost-effectiveness of training and development, so that overall effectiveness has increased.

**Rewarding Achievement.**

Incentive packages, such as the Malaysian New Remuneration System, which ensure that skills and, in particular, personal achievements, are recognized and rewarded, are also becoming more widespread.

Open recruitment procedures, with wider recruitment for senior posts, helps to ensure that vacancies are filled on the basis of skills and competence. As a result, the assumption of a career-based civil service with semi-automatic promotion is weakening. At senior levels, low-reward, high-security positions are being replaced with the exact opposite.

The Canadian government has made it a policy to inform employees of the results expected of them in the performance of their work; to make them aware of the standards against which their performance will be judged; to provide them with informal feedback on a continuing basis and periodic formal feedback; and to act upon the conclusions of employees' performance reports.

**Establishing A Fast Track.**

As the emphasis continues to shift from high-security careers, shaped by length of service and seniority, towards shorter term employment contracts and achievement-oriented promotion, a new cadre of responsive managers is emerging in many settings.
This shift away from a career civil service has been emphasized by the establishment of Senior Executive Services in Australia and New Zealand, offering appointment contracts, performance measurement, and intra-service mobility. The expectation is that public sector managers, often recruited from the private sector, will have a high level of managerial skills and talent and will be flexible enough to manage effectively in any government agency.

Singapore has maintained a systematic focus on efficiency as the sole criterion for retaining or retiring senior civil servants. Seniority is no longer the basis for promotion and many of Singapore's Permanent Secretaries are comparatively young.

Managing the Political/Administrative Boundary.

Reform programs are increasingly seeking to demarcate the political/administrative boundary more clearly. Authority is explicitly delegated to senior officials in exchange for accountability for performance. Power is provided on the basis that its use and, very particularly, the results achieved with it will be monitored.

Such monitoring is often achieved through performance agreements and the specification of expectations within short-term contracts for staff at senior levels to provide the basis for ministerial review of achievements.

Clarifying Public Service Accountability.

An emphasis on personal and institutional accountability runs through all the current reform programs. Personal contracts and public reporting of the planning and delivery of services are the practical mechanisms by which accountability is highlighted. This enables public exposure of poor performance by senior officials, agencies, departments or other institutions, including that caused by corrupt practices.

If enhanced accountability is to act as a pressure for performance improvement, it must be matched by enhanced managerial authority. Devolving responsibility to senior managers allows them the financial and procedural latitude necessary to deliver the outputs for which they are held responsible.

Modernizing the role of the Public Service Commission represents a particular aspect of this necessary devolution to managers or agency chief executives.

In Australia, state public service boards are being abolished in favor of smaller commissions, and their controlling role is changing to one of personnel service provider, training resource, and review body.

The nature of accountability is increasingly affected by the changing nature of relationships between the public sector and the community. A shift towards formalized and specified contractual relationships, capable of being monitored and where necessary enforced, is occurring. While this increased formality enhances accountability by offering rights of redress not previously available, some accountability is increasingly legalistic rather than cooperative.
Anti-Corruption Measures

Current reforms are translating the broad appeals for transparency and accountability in government into operational systems for specifying the expected performance of staff and institutions.

The experience of Singapore indicates how strong political leadership and rigorous anti-corruption measures, enforced by powerful and incorruptible idle agencies, can turn corruption from a low risk- high reward activity into high risk - low reward activity.

The increasingly business-like approach implicit within many reform programs is allowing anti-corruption measures to be supported by tighter employment frameworks for senior officials. Contracts are for short terms, with more detailed specifications, to ensure that performance monitoring is more rigorous. Significantly, the development of large sticks is being matched by the growth of larger carrots. Salary levels are increasingly comparable with private sector positions to reduce the temptation of inducements to corruption.

The Mauritius Civil Service, like all big organizations, is not exempt from various forms of malpractice. Corruption is one problem which is perceived to have reached disquieting proportions in some areas. To remedy the situation, the following measures have been taken: an Ombudsman's Office has been created, an Anti-Corruption Tribunal has been set up, a code of ethics to promote “responsible behavior” within the service is under preparation; and a Public Complaints Bureau will be set up to examine complaints from members of the public.

Redundancy Management

It was emphasized that the management of redundancies is a reform component of last resort. Ideal or otherwise, it is however a pressing issue within many Civil/Public Service bodies, particularly following structural adjustment programs.

Major programs of redundancy management within the public sector must be linked to more systemic approaches to controlling workforce size, and procedural mechanisms to achieve this must be founded on a “culture of realism”.

The Singapore experience of a zero growth strategy and financial capping, and the Malaysian experience of public sector salary cuts, introduced into these settings during periods of national economic difficulties, provide powerful examples of public sectors being tutored in this culture. The zero-based reviews of public sector structures and costs undertaken in Singapore every five years further emphasize this culture of realism by focusing on what is to be done rather than what has already been achieved.

It is essential to have clarity of purpose in driving through a contentious but unavoidable redundancy program. Experience emphasizes that a rational and purposeful approach is most politically and administratively feasible when popular support for the government is at its highest, and when there is internal political and managerial cohesion.

A major component of the Civil Service Reform Program in Zimbabwe is the reduction of the size of Zimbabwe's civil service. Since 1992, the Zimbabwean government, through the Public Service Commission, has adopted various strategies to reduce the size of the civil service. First, those posts that remain vacant in excess of twelve months were abolished. However, some
professional technical posts which remained unfilled for a long period because of shortages of required skills were reinstated. Second, obligatory reductions were effected in the form of giving up a certain percentage of their positions in each of the Ministries. Third, downsizing the service was done through voluntary retirement. The Zimbabwean civil service, as of 30 June 1994, had been reduced by 12,700 with a shortfall of 10,300 to reach the target of 23,000 posts.

Making Government More Efficient

Another common component was the need to review and re-examine structures of government, including the potential for decentralization and divestment, and to establish efficiency and market testing programs.

Structuring For Efficiency

Traditionally, the primary structural choices facing government concern the height and breadth of departmental bureaucratic pyramids. Accountability is assumed to flow upwards, with the administrative dimension funneled smoothly towards the Permanent or Chief Secretary and, in the political dimension, towards the Minister. By contrast, recent experience shows governments are choosing from a considerably broadened range of structural options. This development has reduced the previous consistency across the machinery of government. Unity remains a feature of the civil service, but uniformity is assuming less relevance.

The establishment of Statutory Boards in Singapore, Executive Agencies in the UK, and the experience of corporatization in Australia has allowed a clear delineation between the functions of policy formulation and policy implementation. In this way, areas of relative freedom from bureaucratic constraint have been created in which a more business-like climate can be maintained. Establishing an operational unit around a clearly demarcated and coherent set of functions allows the development of operational goals, uniting staff with a clarified sense of mission.

As a result, commercializing of government departments (Malaysia, Ghana) and decentralizing financial responsibilities through management contract the (India, UK) has been made possible. In some countries, responsibilities are being devolved to provincial and local levels (South Africa, Sri Lanka, India, Nigeria).

The Statutory Boards in Singapore were created to achieve specific social development goals. They were designed to counter the traditional civil service emphasis on regulation and monitoring, and were structured specifically to encourage the return of talent previously lost to the private sector.

The establishment of Executive Agencies in the UK were intended to redress the historical preference for policy development over service delivery within the civil service.

Where successful, such developments have been supported by a strengthened managerial role for senior staff. Traditional bureaucratic/administrative models have seen some separation between the financial, strategic, and personnel responsibilities of senior managers, particularly in the context of the historically strong roles given to Public Service Commissions and similar bodies. Within more autonomous functional units, these three responsibilities can be brought together, enhancing the managerial authority of the agency's chief executive.
The establishment of executive agencies or similar bodies has the consequence of fragmenting the traditionally uniform civil service, and is replacing the traditional procedural concerns of the public service with the pursuit of explicit objectives. In some settings, this re-orientation has served to emphasize the "vertical" relationships within government, increasing accountability to the political leadership, while simultaneously reducing "horizontal" linkages between ministries. As a result, this reduces the focus on the collective interest associated with more traditional models of public service.

In Trinidad and Tobago, the organizational structure of ministries/departments and their varying responsibilities fall under the preview of the Office of the Prime Minister who determines the functional description of ministries based on the political mandate. Each ministry/department has been asked to develop strategic plans which will identify core purpose statements and clarify their major function and sub-functions.

The Canadian Government, in its White Paper of December 1990, included the establishment of special operating agencies as one of the key items for public service reforms.

**Establishing An Efficiency Program.**

Efficiency programs comprise both cost reduction (without lower standards) and performance improvement (at no higher, and preferably lower, cost). They question whether a task should be done at all, whether it should be done by government directly or by contractors paid by government, or done by the private sector.

Since government resources are always under pressure (demand exceeds supply and expectations exceed what can be afforded) there is an ongoing requirement to review activities to ensure that resources are used to best effect and that government can demonstrate sound stewardship. Consequently, the point of entry for programs to improve efficiency is commonly a requirement to reduce operating costs as part of budgetary restraint.

Based on the UK experience, typical steps in establishing an efficiency program carried out with in-house skills include the establishment of a small unit (which may be directly accountable to the Prime Minister) which had the responsibility for vetting and approving proposals from various ministries for efficiency savings. Such a unit is responsible for reporting on savings and benefits, which are publicized in the public service to create a climate of achievement.

A more fundamental and sophisticated approach would be to progressively review, under the overall direction of an Efficiency Unit, the functions of all ministries with a view to ensuring that only essential activities are undertaken. Where there is no strategic reason why an activity should be conducted within the government, privatization, corporatization or contracting-out should be considered.

**Introducing Market Testing**

As part of the hierarchy of reforms in public service management, the policy of market testing has been increasingly introduced. Market testing works by putting the activity in question out to competitive tender, with internal and external bids assessed against the same criteria. Such market testing determines whether contracting out will be the most efficient way...
of carrying out a civil/public service activities which clearly need to remain the ultimate responsibility of the public sector.

There are a number of benefits from the market testing process. First, when considering whether to accept an in-house bid or give the work to an outside contractor, the evaluation will look at improvements in the quality of service available from innovative methods of service delivery.

Second, there may be cash savings. It is axiomatic that where an activity is market tested, and an external bid is successful, it will be because that bid offers greater overall long-term value for money than the current method of provision. Where an in-house bid succeeds, the process of opening up that public sector activity to competition in itself often creates opportunities for greater effectiveness. In the central government of one Commonwealth country, savings arising from market testing, in its initial stages, have averaged about 25 percent of the original cost whether or not the activity has remained in-house.

Third, experience suggests that market testing will lead to raised standards by making expectations explicit within contractual arrangements. Greater clarity about standards of service and better monitoring of performance against those standards, regardless of whether the work is retained in-house, is a vital feature of public sector reforms.

It is, however, important to note the dangers of rapid introduction of competitive tendering without preparation, and the weakness of the private sector in some settings. The process also opens up the possibility of cartel formation after abolition of in-house providers, and the problem of fixed wage costs even after staff transfers.

**Improving Quality Of Services**

The introduction of quality management and customer-oriented programs was also highlighted as a common component in reform.

**Introducing A Quality Management Approach**

Quality management is the creation of a culture of commitment to identifying and meeting customer requirements throughout the whole organization, within available resources. The approach defines standards for each area of activity, from which performance standards are set for each member of staff and unit of management. Performance is then regularly assessed against customer expectations and satisfaction. Commitment to quality management is openly avowed and performance is made public. The term customer has a broad meaning: any citizen engaged with government, or any person acting as proxy for the public. New Zealand includes the Minister as a proxy customer for the policy advice outputs of the department.

The idea of quality management originated in the private sector, but has become increasingly relevant to government as rising expectations have highlighted areas of unacceptably low standards of service to the public, to officials and to politicians. There is growing experience in Commonwealth countries in applying quality management approaches as a firm base for sound government..

Quality management is closely linked with human resource management, particularly leadership and team-building, training and development including management and leadership
training, performance management, especially specification of outputs, organizational change, frequently leading to flatter pyramids, and workforce reductions.

This change in work culture and systems has encouraged respect for excellence at all levels. Success within the public sector is recognized and rewarded. Practical and measurable quality standards are set, with participative mechanisms established to ensure that the need for quality has a broad "ownership" at all levels of staff. The Malaysian civil service provides a clear example of a successful strategy for recognizing excellence, through the series of awards it offers. Singapore was the first civil service to introduce Work Improvement Teams, developed from the Quality Control Circles employed in successful and innovative private sector companies to allow groups of staff from varying levels to discuss obstacles to quality openly and honestly, and to devise practical solutions for service improvement. India also has introduced some Work Improvement Teams. The Botswana government introduced the productivity and quality improvement program in 1993 by creating work improvement teams (WITS) within various institutions and departments.

**Developing A Customer Orientation**

Productivity improvement within government has encouraged acceptance within government that public services, like those produced in the private sector, are products to be tested against the needs of service users. This shifting emphasis has been encouraged by a conscious reshaping of the work culture to achieve a customer orientation. Courtesy campaigns, customer care training, and comprehensive complaints procedures ensure that service users are seen as active, freely choosing customers rather than passive recipients of monopolistically provided state services.

The Malaysian government has emphasized that its public administration is operating in an era where the customer's needs are paramount. The new public administration document emphasizes that the focus of the new public management has shifted from tasks to processes involved in delivering the final product or service. In the UK, two government documents "The Citizens Charter" and "Competing for Quality" provide a comprehensive agenda for change towards consumer culture. The broad principles in the government's Citizens Charter include standards, information and openness, choices and consultation, courtesy and helpfulness, putting things right and value for money. The main focus for the British government reforms are to widen choice and competition and improve value for money. Countries such as New Zealand, Malaysia, Namibia, Singapore and, Mauritius are seeking to emulate this innovation.

**Developing A Public Sector Ethos**

Creating a working culture based on quality, performance and openness and transparency necessarily involves employees and the public in the change process. The new civil service reforms are aimed at developing the organizational culture to manifest itself in strengthened employee involvement, consistency in the change process, rewards for team work and individual perfection and consultation with clients and users.

Trinidad & Tobago have recognized that the critical element for the successful implementation of civil service reforms is focusing on the process that will ensure successful change. Consequently, the government has developed processes which identify "Change Sponsors" and "Change Agents" and emphasize that members of the public service organizations
should feel a sense of involvement in the process, share the new vision and own the change. Malta has set up management committees in each ministry to aid internal consultative processes.

The formal development of codes of ethics within government marks a significant step in moves towards codifying public sector values at a time of rapid change within the culture and practice of the public sector. The Malaysian program for inculcating positive attitudes provides a successful example of a practical approach to the establishment of appropriate values within an increasingly entrepreneurial public sector.

**Improving Partnership With Organizations Outside Of Government**

The development of partnerships with non-governmental organizations (NGO's) and the private sector has emerged as a key element in implementing development policies and programs.

State monopolies have been maintained by complex regulatory regimes designed to ensure safety or equity. At the same time, these have served to maintain areas of public service as the exclusive preserve of government organizations. Opening up areas of public service to private or NGO suppliers, while maintaining standards in areas where consumer choice will have insufficient impact, requires a complex readjustment of such restrictions. Extensive and successful experience is now available illustrating strategies for measured deregulation and regulation.

An example of a government which has successfully facilitated and managed such partnerships is illustrated by the establishment of the Grameen Bank in Bangladesh which has effectively developed programs and direct benefits for poor sectors of society.

India has also had successful experiences with the NGO role in implementing education, national planning and rural development programs.

Partnerships have been built with the private sector in Britain, Australia, New Zealand through the contracting-out of work previously exclusive to the public domain. Contracting out has been well-tested within government. Although specialist services have always been purchased from the private and NGO sectors, it is the development of market-testing techniques which is providing a strategy for assessing the ability of the market to provide goods or services historically considered to lie at the core of government. Significantly, market-testing is showing considerable potential as a technique for stimulating change through the assessment of internal efficiency. In some limited situations where contracting-out is not feasible because of market weaknesses or political restrictions, the developments of internal markets is being explored with as yet uncertain results.

Efficiency within government has also been improved through some restructuring of central/local, or federal/state intergovernmental boundaries. Clarification of mutual roles and responsibilities and, in particular the rationalization of mechanisms for financial transfer between levels of government, has heightened efficiency and enhanced fiscal transparency. Flexibility and a concern for service quality and sustainability, rather than preconceptions concerning the efficiency of the private sector, have been the key features of successful initiatives.
Making Management More Effective

The use of information technology and the development and use of internal and external advising skills were highlighted in improving management systems and skills.

Information Technology

Major improvements have been achieved by the use of information technology (IT) for efficient revenue collection, financial management and accounting, and interdepartmental communication systems.

Significant automation programs have been implemented in Australia, Singapore, Malaysia, Malta, Mauritius and UK. Information technology has also been used in providing better interface with customers by developing "one-stop/non-stop" service centers and public information systems in Malaysia.

Within the UK civil service, a body called CCTA, the Government Center for Information Systems (part of the Office of Public Service and Science, itself part of the Cabinet Office) is responsible for promoting business effectiveness and efficiency in government through the use of information systems.

In Singapore the National Computer Board (NCB) was formed on 15 August 1981 to promote, implement, and guide the development of information systems in the Singapore Civil Service.

In Malaysia, IT planning takes place both at the macro and micro level. At the micro level, there is the National Committee on Data Processing (NCDP) which has been entrusted with the role to formulate national policies and that will promote the usage of IT for administrative modernization and national development. The Malaysian administration modernization and planning Unit (MAMPU) is the Secretariat to NCDP.

In Malta, one of the key parameters of the strategic plan for civil service reform is based on maximizing the information resource through the sharing of information within the confines of Malta's legislation, to avoid duplication in information collection and maintenance.

Internal Management Advisory Capacity

Successful developments within government have recognized that the need for an increasingly responsive government machinery provides little organizational stability in a rapidly changing climate. Shifting consumer needs, and funding and revenue assumptions, call for rapid structural and policy changes, and the broadened range structural options available to government emphasize the need for a strong evaluative capacity.

The work of the Canadian Auditor-General's office illustrates the degree to which internal advisor capacities are increasing. Recent institution audits have focused on constraints to productive management, attributes of well-performing organizations, and values which drive managers to perform well.
Participative Review Groups

Particular managerial review exercises can involve staff with direct experience of the areas requiring review. The UK scrutiny exercises, and the Singapore program for staff reduction, both relied heavily on staff seconded from their substantive positions for limited periods to assist the reviews. Training and technical support from specialist units within government is crucial in maintaining the quality of the review team's work.

External Policy Advice

External management advisory capacity available to governments is being strengthened to respond to these challenges. Outside government, a market of contestable policy advice is available to government by purchase or through presentations as lobbying platforms. This allows the independent testing of strategic options and increases both the planning capacity and the policy development transparency of government.

In Malaysia, the practice of opening ministries' doors to receive public views on policy formulation is highlighted under the Malaysian Incorporated policy. In the process of making a policy proposal, ministries solicit views from certain sections of the public. For example, the Ministry of International Trade and Industry through its annual trade and industry dialogue with trade associations gets feedback on the effectiveness of government policies on trade and industry.

In Trinidad & Tobago, formal consultations with the public take place through tripartite committees, a standing committee, which is chaired by the Ministry of Labor and comprises representatives of government, private and public enterprises and labor.

In UK, there are suggestions that the provision of policy advice should be put on the same customer basis through contractual basis that now applies to service delivered mechanisms for other departments. The Treasury and Civil Service Committee of the House of Commons recently examined this topic and heard suggestions from some quarters that senior officials should be employed on fixed term contracts with a clear remit related to producing answers on policy issues.

In Botswana, government is in the process of setting up an independent institute of development policy analysis.

Improving The Management Of Finance

Major structural and institutional reforms have taken place in the area of financial management, making it more performance-or output- oriented. Other developments in this area include the provision of efficiency dividends to the departments (UK, Australia), the introduction of developmental charges for the use of capital (New Zealand), payments by department for internal government services (Australia) and a shift from cash to accrual accounting (New Zealand). New Zealand's financial reporting is completely output oriented and Malta and Australia carry out three-year forward plan estimates.

The financial management reforms in New Zealand have illustrated the significance of adopting appropriate accountancy approaches from other sectors. Accrual accounting supplements cash accounting systems to ensure that the financial information available to
managers is current and provides a meaningful analysis of resource usage within the department. Capital charging ensures that the opportunity costs of tying up capital within departments are fully captured.

Capital charging underlines the significance of good estate management. The developments in UK and other settings indicate the growing concern of governments to ensure that fixed assets are fully utilized and regarded as investments requiring careful husbandry. The end point of these developments is ascertaining a market price while allowing other aspects of market discipline to be introduced, in a situation where government services are fully contestable. This encourages heightened efficiency and economy.

**Output-Oriented Procedures**

The traditional financial concerns of government emphasize probity. Public money must be fully accounted for and procedures must emphasize upward reporting of financial decisions, and strict enforcement of tightly specified budget headings.

Some current reforms are underpinned by fundamental changes in the emphasis of financial management systems. The concern with probity is matched by a growing concern to enable managers within government to act as public sector entrepreneurs, fully utilizing the value of capital, goods, and staff within government to deliver specified objectives.

In New Zealand, the output orientation is the main emphasis in financial accounting. This is coupled with capital charging, and the need for adequate information on capital investments and government subsidies.

**Delegation**

The move towards an output-orientation fixes attention on the range, quality and volume of services which government is seeking to provide within its financial allocations. Delegation of financial responsibility gives managers some leeway to consider alternative methods for ensuring that the agreed services are provided.

In New Zealand, this approach is developed to the point where Ministers are effectively purchasing the outputs (goods and services) from departments. The outputs required from departments are precisely detailed in the specification of the performance required of the fully accountable Chief Executives. This provides room for entrepreneurial flexibility in meeting targets by offering them greater control over the purchase, use and sale of departmental assets necessary to produce the required outputs.

The delegation of authority to levy user charges on corporate customers for some academic institutions in India is providing an incentive to market services more actively.

**Introducing Capital Charging**

The New Zealand experience of accounting for the cost of capital through a policy of explicit capital charging is conducive to good financial management in government. Benefits can be obtained from explicitly recognizing and accounting for the cost of capital. Capital charging makes clear the full costs of goods and services produced by departments, so that Ministers can make more informed decisions about the costs and benefits of government
policies. The specific objectives in doing this in a public sector entity are to provide information and the incentives needed for efficient management of the government's investment.

If departments do not bear the cost of capital, they may be seen as the preferred provider, even when more efficient producers exist. Therefore, ignoring this cost is likely to result in poorly-informed decision-making and misallocation of resources. The government is more likely to achieve value for money when capital is no longer treated as being free, because the bias in favor of capital-intensive production is addressed.

Many departments supply goods and services to third parties. If the price charged does not recover the total costs, including the cost of capital, then the government is effectively providing a subsidy. A government should be in position to decide explicitly whether to subsidize a particular activity, and the amount of the subsidy. If the total cost exceeds the price that the government wants consumers to pay, then transparency could be achieved by making a specific budget appropriation to cover the expected shortfall.

Capital charges are most effective when combined with a consistent financial management framework and accrual accounting. Together, these changes provide departmental Chief Executives with the opportunity, incentive and information to produce desired "outputs" at the lowest cost.

Incentives for efficient performance are also enhanced by delegating control over inputs (for example, cash, fixed assets and human resources) to Chief Executives, and then linking this increased authority with accountability for the production of agreed outputs.

Before implementation, reliable information on departments' net assets needs to be available. In New Zealand this information is provided in audited accrual accounts (including a balance sheet) which all departments are required to produce.

**Improving Estate Management**

The land, buildings (and equipment and, perhaps, infrastructure) owned by the government (the estate) represents a massive accrued investment. This huge resource is commonly neglected and often not systematically recorded or valued. Management of this resource is now being recognized as a key area for reform and development and is illustrated here on the basis of New Zealand experience.

Increased awareness and understanding of the size, nature, value and condition of property coupled with increased management authority, responsibility and accountability for the estate, brings added value for money to the public sector's mainstream activities by allowing for better use of these assets and releasing cash and management time. By making it apparent that the estate is not available free of charge, by allocating management time to its active development, by making the estate finances visible and by demonstrating a committed will to change ingrained habits and behaviors, the estate can and should make a valid contribution to better value-for-money from government expenditure.

Since the estate is a part of mainstream activity, it should feature as strongly as other topics in mainstream management training courses. The objective should be to train managers to take an active and informed interest in the whole of their asset base. Managerial awareness will
increase if managers’ performance on their property assets is judged and valued with the same
vigor as their people management or financial skills.

It must be recognized that the benefits are derived over a long time-scale. Major
restructuring of large and complex estates cannot be achieved quickly but with professional help,
significant benefits will be forthcoming.

**Introducing Accrual Accounting**

The experience in this area is very strongly influenced by the innovations implemented
within the New Zealand public sector.

Good practices in decision-making on the allocation of resources, and in the
specification and subsequent assessment of financial performance, require financial information
that is timely, relevant and reliable. In both the public and private sectors, accounting systems
are a major source of this information.

Since cash accounting records money received at the time it is banked and money spent
at the time it is paid out, it does not provide enough information to measure the full cost of
producing goods and services in a given period. In addition, it provides only limited information
on the value of assets and liabilities.

While cash-based accounts give an accurate view of an entity’s cash flows, accrual-based
accounts give a fuller picture of its operations and overall financial position, since it relates
activities to the period in which costs are incurred or revenue is earned, regardless of when or
whether money changes hands. It keeps track of assets and liabilities, and records change in their
values.

Accrual reporting thus gives a clearer view when financial implications extend beyond a
year and encourages a longer-term focus in decision-making. It also facilitates more meaningful
assessment by Ministers and legislators of the performance of government entities (including
departments), and of the managers responsible for them.

Accrual accounting is a logical tool of accountability when viewed from purchase and
ownership perspectives. In the case of departments, the government is in many cases the
principal purchaser of their "output" (the goods and services produced) and at the same time is
their owner.

The information yielded by accrual accounting is of use in specification and assessment
of performance in respect of both output delivery and stewardship of assets entrusted. The
purchase interest requires information on quantity, quality, time and place of delivery, and cost
of outputs. The ownership interest requires financial information which distinguishes capital and
current expenditure and revenue, and reflects a notion of capital maintenance. Accrual
accounting provides information relevant to these interests and facilitates comparisons between
competing providers.

The period required to implement full accrual accounting is heavily dependent upon the
level and availability of accounting skills.
In New Zealand, the move from cash to accrual accounting was scheduled to take two years. This involved departments in specifying their "outputs" as well as installing new computer software, and introducing new banking, costing, monitoring and reporting systems. The scale of the change to long-established procedures was huge. Most departments employed consultants to assist with the transition, and many have retained staff with scarce skills on contract.

Public Reporting

Developments in the style of public reporting by agencies and departments to expose the financial position and annual performance achieved to public scrutiny has further encouraged a climate of openness and public accountability. The annual audited financial summary statements in Canada and the consolidated balance sheets prepared for the Crown in New Zealand represent significant developments here. Strengthened roles for government auditors and the increasing use of value for money reviews are further steps in this direction.

Conclusion

Reducing the size of government while remaining effective and efficient has been the main objective of civil service reforms aimed at developing a new public administration capable of meeting the emerging and complex challenges. However, individual governments have adopted a much more discriminating approach in seeking to enhance civil service performance while maintaining the overall objective of improved public administration and the delivery of high-quality public service to citizens.

While global concern exists about the nature of civil service reforms, there is no unique solution or approach. There are as many lessons to be learned from the successful experiences of the developing countries, as from the industrial countries. Each country needs to identify its priorities according to the local circumstances, drawing upon the mix of other experiences from both industrial and developing countries, and look at achievements and implications. In short, countries have to develop local solutions to global challenges.

Most successful reforms are politically driven at the highest level. There should be sufficient political will in developing countries to implement such reforms. Reform programs should be holistic, have a clear vision and objectives and simple priorities.

Successful reform programs require support to be mobilized from within the civil service. In this context, it is important that successful organizations are recognized and that individuals who understand and support change are involved in the reform process. Governments must empower those who are working for change.

Although working in the civil service is about working with constraints, it is possible that amidst those real world constraints, civil servants do have choices available to them. Politicians and civil servants in developing countries should be prepared to make difficult choices. It is important to look for values which successful civil service reforms bring with them. Such reforms must emphasize accountability and transparency of government processes.

Finally, civil service must be a part of the international and national change process. For governments to succeed, civil service should be at the forefront of the national change process—initiating, guiding and managing change.
3. ETHICS, ACCOUNTABILITY AND TRANSPARENCY

Jeremy Pope

As one flies over Johannesburg, brightly-colored piles of mullock from the goldmines catch the eye. Nearly all of the goldmines have processing machinery at work on them, with the rubble being reprocessed for the fourth, fifth or sixth time, as newer and better gold extraction techniques are developed and applied. Now, of course, the particles of gold being gleaned are so small as to be invisible to the naked eye.

Many of the academics who write on corruption seem a little like today's goldminers. They keep returning to the same old pile of rubble—usually the times of Nkrumah's Ghana or Marcos's Philippines—and keep on turning over the same piles of stones to see if they can find some infinitesimal fleck of gold that those before them had overlooked. The recycling of the mullock goes on, but unfortunately, so, too, does the phenomenon of corruption. And corruption, of course, is not static. It is a living organism that rapidly adjusts all too readily to new environments. So a first comment would be, don't put too much faith in academics - too many of them staunchly hold their backs to the present as they gaze firmly at the past!

Breaking the taboo

A second comment is on how refreshing it is that one can now freely discuss and use the "c" word. For corruption is something that touches us all. Ministers from Southern Africa showed the way in Pretoria December 1994 when they met and formed a regional ministerial forum against corruption under the chair of South Africa's Minister of Justice. And the same month, the thirty-five elected leaders of the Americas announced their own action plan in Miami, becoming the first group of leaders to acknowledge frankly the problem. Perhaps Commonwealth Heads of Government will be as open, honest and as forthright when they meet in Auckland in October, 1995.

Culture And Colonialism

It is sometimes claimed that corruption is a part of African culture. In my paper I quote the strong denunciation of this claim by General Olusegun Obasanjo, who as a West African chief can speak with some authority. But when we look at what we see it is only fair to reflect on the state of affairs which African countries inherited on gaining independence. Colonialism was marked by a lack of accountability—other than to London, Paris, Lisbon or elsewhere. It was marked by an absence of transparency. The courts existed, not to do justice and enforce the rule of law but to sustain the imposition of colonialism. The judges were simply civil servants wearing wigs. And the style of governance was characterized by government being "done" to the people, rather than a people being governed by consent—and the instruments of repression were handed over, intact, to the incoming administrations. Against such a background, the positive achievements of some African countries have been little short of astonishing.
Corruption As A Universal Phenomenon

Which leads to the third point: that corruption is not something that only exists in the developing South. It is not a phenomenon of under development or of the developmental process. Every society has corrupt elements within it, and recent events in Europe show plainly that this is not a topic on which the individual North can preach to the developing South. Even as we meet, Europe is wracked by scandals, including massive frauds on the European Union’s agricultural subsidies scheme. In New Zealand, the Auditor-General was recently arrested by the Serious Fraud Office. Rather, corruption is a topic on which experience can be shared and it is an area in which cooperation is essential if the practice of corrupt leaders salting ill-gotten gains away is ever to be ended.

Bribes From The North

More than this—and this is the fourth point—much of the "grand corruption" that is so devastating in developing countries has its origins in the North. The large "illicit payments" that distort decision-making, and that mean all too often that the wrong firm is hired for the wrong reasons and at the wrong price (not too infrequently to undertake the wrong projects), are payments made usually by European in quest of business. Hence the litter of "white elephants". And in the North this conduct is defended vigorously. Then, to make matters worse, European countries all allow these bribes (however described) to be deductible for tax purposes, and refuse to regard bribery of officials abroad as criminal conduct. So elements in the North and the South are in partnership against the interests of ordinary people in the South.

And that, in a word, is how Transparency International (TI) came to be formed—as a result of discussions by African leaders in the Global Coalition for Africa. However, but it was an idea that the Americas quickly bought in to. The concept was to try a new approach—to form a coalition against corruption, comprising governments both North and South, the private sector and the public. A coalition that would work for consensus change in which the rules for international procurement might change for all and at the same time, in ways which would ensure that there were no winners and no losers other than the beneficiaries of the process. The private sector needed confidence that it could stop bribing without suffering a loss of business. A coalition which would provoke discussion of the problem, particularly in the North, and break the taboo that surrounds the topic. A coalition, too, which would not indulge in name-calling and condemnation but one which would work for constructive change.

What can make corruption in a developing country a greater problem is that whereas in an industrial country corruption can infest a single component of the body politic—a major union, one

5 There is hope for change. The OECD countries agreed in May 1994 on a non-binding recommendation that member countries and others should end tax deductibility and criminalize international corruption. Much work lies ahead to translate this into reality. However, Commonwealth countries are poised to be able to help each other already in the prosecution of these crimes through the Commonwealth Scheme for Mutual Legal Assistance. The recommendation needs to be supported by non-member countries, including, most important, countries in Africa. It is equally true that developmental agencies in Europe have supported the work of Transparency International (TI) very strongly.

42
perhaps, or a political party—a developing country is less well-protected by institutions, and corruption can actually become a part of the system. It can become systemic. This is not a situation in which a small clique or isolated individuals are behaving improperly, but one in which virtually everyone has irregular arrangements simply to survive.

To be a little more specific, in countries where corruption is systemic the pay scales are generally very low. Thus, without naming names, a senior civil servant may have—let us call it—an "arrangement", whereby part of his work is privatized. He contracts out his work for it to be done (for a reasonable fee) by his own private consulting firm. In the weekends, of course. Or again, officials in an Education Department find that the only way they can afford to send their children to school is for their wives to have businesses and sell school textbooks. But the wives have only one customer—the Education Department.

Both categories of behavior would be regarded as corrupt in the purest sense, but it is hardly sinful corruption. Nobody is getting very rich, all are simply making ends meet. It is simply a strategy for survival. These people are not corrupt individuals and they do not see themselves as such; rather we should think of them as victims of a systematically corrupt system. Yet, in a well-managed system these practices would not occur, or if they did, swift disciplinary action would be expected to follow. And just as surely, such conduct is not conducive to development in the countries where it occurs. So let us focus on systems, and not point fingers, seek scapegoats and leave stable doors open wide.

Strategies to combat corruption in such countries have to be very different from the reforms that can be effected where a country’s institutions are generally in good shape. Botswana could be placed in this category. This is a country where corruption has not been a problem. When it reared its head, swift remedial action was taken both against culprits and to tighten institutional arrangements which were demonstrated to be in need of repair. Much of what I am going to say has little application to a Botswana as it fine-tunes arrangements to meet changing challenges. As we have heard here, too, Mauritius would fit this description. But I think my fellow panelist would agree that the remarks may have some relevance to the predicament in which Uganda has found itself.

In an environment of systemic corruption, significant Civil Service Reform (CSR) can be a complete waste of time, money and energy if the corruption element is ignored. It has the capacity to derail the whole process. One can end up with a reformed and more efficient corrupt system. Indeed, corruption must be consciously taken on board from the outset of the process and dealt with as one of the component parts of the whole process.

And, of course, ways of containing corruption include the development of an ethical culture, and the implementation of practices of accountability and transparency. Light, it is sometimes said, is the enemy of corruption. If a deal is out on the table for all to see, then all are empowered to make up their own minds about its propriety or otherwise.

But many of the steps taken for other good reasons in the course of CSR can also have a positive effect towards restraining corruption. The abolition of unnecessary procedures; the ending of unnecessary licenses; the simplification of a tax system; the creation of jobs which people value and want to keep, rather than risk through corrupt conduct. All of these and many more can and do make for better service delivery, but also reduce the scope for corruption. Other steps, such as the monitoring of assets and income of senior public officials, have a clear
accountability and anti-corruption focus, but in so doing they also protect the notion of open
cOMPETITIVE TENDERING IN PUBLIC PROCUREMENT EXERCISES.

It is also sometimes said that all that needs to be done is for the law to be enforced, that
THE CRISIS IS ONE OF ENFORCEMENT. THIS SURELY CANNOT BE RIGHT. IF IT WERE JUST A MATTER OF LAWS AND
ENFORCEMENT, THE PROBLEM WOULD HAVE BEEN SOLVED LONG AGO. THE TRUTH OF THE MATTER IS THAT EVEN
THE COUNTRIES WITH THE WORST LEVELS OF CORRUPTION ALL HAVE LAWS OUTLAWING CORRUPTION THAT ARE
SIMPLY NEVER ENFORCED, AND SYSTEMS OF ACCOUNTABILITY THAT ARE IGNORED. MOST HAVE LEADERSHIP
CODES WITH GOOD INTENTIONS, BUT WHICH ARE, IN PRACTICE, TOTALLY MORIBUND. COUNTERING CORRUPTION
CANNOT BE SIMPLY A MATTER OF ENACTING LAWS. IT IS A MATTER OF MAKING SYSTEMS WORK OF CHANGING
THE WAY PEOPLE BEHAVE AND THIS CAN ONLY BE DONE BY ALTERING THE ENVIRONMENT IN WHICH THEY
BEHAVE.

There are three broad scenarios when it comes to tackling systemic corruption. The first
IS A GOOD, OLD-FASHIONED REVOLUTION, FOLLOWED WITH THE JAILING OF THE FORMER LEADERS (AS IN
BANGLADESH) OR PERHAPS SUMMARILY EXECUTING THEM (AS IN GHANA). THIS MAY OR MAY NOT SUCCEED:
IT HAS IN GHANA, BUT IT HAS FAILED IN BANGLADESH. HOWEVER, AT AN INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE SUCH AS
THIS ONE SHOULD HARDLY BE DISCUSSING THE FEASIBILITY OF ARMED INSURRECTION BY THE POPULACE. BUT
ONE SHOULD RECOGNIZE THAT CORRUPTION CAN, IN THE FINAL EVENT, TRIGGER EVENTS WHICH COMPLETELY AND
VIOLENTLY OVERTURN THE ESTABLISHED ORDER.6

The second scenario—which is the most challenging and to which no answers have yet
BEEN FOUND—is how to reform a static system which is systematically corrupt without demanding
that the leaders commit political suicide, or go into exile. Take an election in which the
opposition parties boldly stated the crimes with which they intended to charge the incumbents
once the opposition had won the election. However, they do not win. Now those groups will be
forced to face up to reality. If a fundamental shift in political power is to take place peacefully,
it has to do so with the acquiescence, however grudging, of those who presently hold that power.
And it is unrealistic to expect someone in high office simply to step aside certain in the
knowledge that jail is waiting. Blanket amnesties may be politically unpalatable, but some sort
of understanding may be necessary before such a change can take place peacefully.

Even more difficult is the generation of political will to reverse corruption at the top.
KLEPTOMANIA, IT SEEMS, IS HABIT-FORMING, AND MANY OF THE WORLD’S MOST CORRUPT LEADERS, ALREADY
WITH MORE MONEY THAN THEY COULD EVER HOPE TO NEED, SEEM ADDICTED TO THE ACQUISITION OF MORE.
HOW CAN THEY BE PERSUADED TO ACCEPT THAT SYSTEMS OF TRANSPARENCY AND ACCOUNTABILITY ARE NEEDED
WHICH WOULD END SUCH PRACTICES, LET ALONE ONES WHICH WOULD REVEAL THE EXTENT OF THE RICHES THEY
HAD ACQUIRED?

The third scenario is the Ugandan model: a society in transition which is reforming an
INHERITED SYSTEM FROM TOP TO BOTTOM WITH THE FULL PACKAGE OF CSR, MOST USUALLY POSSIBLE WHERE
THE REFORMS TAKE PLACE IN THE WAKE OF A MAJOR SHIFT IN POWER AND BY A NEW ESTABLISHMENT. BUT IN
A TRANSITION PROCESS, TIME IS SHORT AND THERE ARE ALL TOO MANY Instances WHERE NEW ADMINISTRATIONS
HAVE COME TO POWER FULL OF PROMISES TO Clamp DOWN ON CORRUPTION, BUT HAVE BEEN distracted BY
OTHER ISSUES, WHO HAVE BEEN POWERLESS AS THEY HAVE INHERITED SYSTEMATICALLY CORRUPT SYSTEMS AND
WHO HAVE ALL TOO QUICKLY THEMSELVES SLUMPED INTO THE PRACTICES OF THE PAST. UGANDA HAS SHOWN

6 For example, The Gambia.
that if the opportunity is seized quickly, more time can be won for root and branch reform. There are others who have illustrated what happens when it is not.

The fourth is the "enclave" or "island of integrity" approach presently being developed in Ecuador. Ecuador is a country where corruption flourishes. It is systemic. It is everywhere. It costs $1,000 for a telephone connection; driving licenses cost $100; and everyone drives with money in the car for the unavoidable policeman in need of a tip. In public procurement exercises, the best estimates are that about 30 percent of the total sum for a project disappears in bribes. This is high—even by some African standards. The Vice President of Ecuador, happily also Chair of TI's Advisory Council, invited TI to develop a unique procedure to try to combat this. We have done just that, and it is now being tested on a major project.

The new procedure involves all those bidding also signing a pledge that they will not bribe. Then they agree that whoever wins the contract will have to make a disclosure (certified by the Chief Executive Officer of the successful company) of all payments to third parties in respect of the contract and all performance bonuses paid to staff in connection with it. Then comes the real sting. The unsuccessful tenderers are given the right to sue the successful tenderer if they can prove that corruption was a factor in the deal, and, if they wish, to sue for loss of profits as well. And civil society, through a civic organization, is invited to observe the whole process.

In these ways, the private sector (from where the bribes emanate) are first introduced to the new process and agree to it. They become active partners in the reform process. Then they are themselves empowered to police the contract either through the civil courts or through international arbitration. In these ways, the necessary confidence is built that the rules of the game are changing for everyone, and at the same time. That there will be no losses and no risks in being "first" or being out of step with competitors. They all move together. And the public, through civic involvement, can believe political statements that meaningful change has been achieved.

Initial indications are that those participating are confident with the pilot exercise, and have agreed to apply the same procedures to a second large procurement in a few weeks' time. The verdict by civil society is good, so far.

What this seems to demonstrate is that a partnership can, indeed, be established between civil society and government, including the private sector, in pursuing an issue in which all have a stake, and which each party views from slightly different perspectives.

And this is what Transparency International is all about: building these partnerships, these coalitions in which national chapters are established and talking to their governments in a constructive but independent and, where necessary, critical manner. And in this way helping in a catalytic fashion to start a process in which local people draw up solutions to local problems, but do so while able to tap into best practice from elsewhere.

And some of the best of this best practice comes from South Africa. I have not come here to praise our hosts, simply to speak frankly. TI has been deeply impressed by the efforts of the new government to come to grips with ethics, transparency and accountability. Let it be said that the apartheid state was characterized not just by racism, but by some of the worst financial excesses of one-party rule—not to mention secrecy. In those days, it was said that it was a long
way to drive from Johannesburg to Cape Town because you had to pass through the farms of
twelve cabinet ministers.

Within a short time after the elections, the African National Congress (ANC) introduced
codes of conduct and assets declarations for all its office holders and elected members, the so-
called Asmal Code. More seriously, we in Berlin may be ignorant, but we are not aware of any
other country where a political party has produced this mechanism, especially ahead of any
mechanism at the parliamentary level (though I understand that this, too, is being pushed
forward).

The opening of accountability through Parliament here has been spectacular, and the
work of the Speaker places her at the very forefront of the Commonwealth's parliamentary
speakers. The select committees must meet in public, and if they wish to go in to closed session
they must debate the reasons for this in public. The journalists, used only to processing pre-
prepared government handouts, are now complaining that there is too much for them to cover!
Parliamentarians, too, have been empowered to call civil servants to account, and the passage of
the estimates has been a frightening experience for senior civil servants, accustomed to getting
routine parliamentary approval for their budgets. Also, as quoted in the paper, the constitution of
the country actually guarantees open, fair and transparent government procurement, as well as
access to information and other guarantees of due process. In the hands of a high-powered
constitutional court such as has been appointed (again, in a very transparent fashion), these
constitutional provisions can be expected to bite.

The ANC is also arguing that the press should not be unduly restrained by the laws of
defamation when it comes to public figures in their public duties. Have any of us ever heard of a
government anywhere arguing that its critics should have a greater freedom to criticize them,
even if they may be mistaken in their assertions? Yet accountability through the media is a vital
strand in the whole process (even if in some countries, such as Singapore, a controlled press does
not seem to have impeded anti-corruption efforts).

Certainly, South Africa has daunting problems. But the reform system is driven by
committed leaders and with both intellectual depth and an instinctive "feel" for what makes for
democratic accountability and transparency.

Many of these individual strategies could be applied elsewhere in developing in
particular the "enclave" or "islands of integrity" approach, which has much to commend itself. A
mosaic of non-corrupt areas of government activity can be constructed, starting with key areas,
and in ways in which reformers do not take on too many vested interests at the same time.
Certainly, there needs to be a degree of leadership support if this is to endure. The classic case to
the contrary is in the Philippines where corruption was driven out of revenue collection. The tax
take soared - the lead reformer was promoted to a higher court. Today, the tax collection system
in the Philippines is as chunky as ever.

The final but most important point is that there are many stakeholders in a country's
integrity system - public service commissions, civil servants, law enforcers, the Auditor-General,
parliamentarians, the private sector and the general public. Here, more than ever, an holistic
approach is needed. A corrupt government system simply cannot be trusted to reform itself.
And ethics cannot be changed without the public participating in the process.
It is too easy to say that the problem is overwhelming. We know that a failure to act will only have one result—that the problem will get even worse. We need to look for new ways in which to approach the topic. Traditional methods have failed. Yet all but the corrupt have an interest in combating it. The constituency is there. It does not have to be created, but it does need to be empowered to act.
4. GUIDING PRINCIPLES ON CIVIL SERVICE REFORM

Background And Introduction

Civil Service Reform (CSR) programs are increasingly being adopted in a range of African countries and in many cases they are closely linked to structural adjustment efforts. The results have been mixed and the effectiveness of the aid provided in support of these programs has sometimes been limited. It is important to review CSR experience and to draw lessons that will enable Special Program of Assistance to Africa (SPA) donors to improve the impact of their aid in this area and to inform the policy dialogue with recipient governments. CSR is also considered necessary to complement donor programs at the sector level.

The following principles have been developed by the Working Group by drawing on a wide range of published material, the experiences of the donors in question and six case studies of major CSR programs in Uganda, Tanzania, Ghana, the Central African Republic, Benin and Burkina Faso. The case studies were specially commissioned by the Working Group to provide a more in-depth assessment of current CSR programs from a cross-section of African countries.

The paper is divided into six sections. The second section briefly outlines the purpose of the principles. The third three provides an overview of the general issues that need to be addressed or taken into account by donors when designing individual aid projects in support of CSR. The fourth section provides an overview of CSR design issues and the fifth covers implementation and monitoring issues. The last section identifies key issues for aid management.

The Purpose Of The Guiding Principles

The principles outlined in this paper are intended to provide general principles of guidance and pointers to donors wishing to assess the viability CSR programs developed by African governments. As such, they provide guidance on the overall requirements for effective CSR and on the critical issues that need to be considered in appraising CSR programs for possible donor support. This will help to promote a more consistent approach to the policy dialogue and donor support in this area.

---

7 Prepared by the Working Group on Civil Service Reform of the Special Programme of Assistance for Africa (SPA). The Guiding Principles were adopted by the SPA at its meeting in Paris in November 1995.
The second aim is to provide guidance to assist aid donors contemplating involvement in CSR to design more effective aid interventions in line with current best practice. The third objective is to identify areas of weakness in existing CSR programs and to propose corrective action that can be taken by donors and recipients.

Overall Approach

**Purpose and Scope of CSR**

The purpose of CSR is to improve the effectiveness and performance of the civil service. The ultimate goal is to raise the quality of services delivered to the population, support economic and social development and to enhance the capacity to carry out core government functions.

CSR programs therefore need to improve both core functions (e.g. revenue generation, financial management, personnel management, policy formulation, etc.) as well as sector-specific policy, management and organization. Both aspects need to be covered in a coordinated manner.

In many African countries, the effectiveness of the civil service is constrained by poor governance, structural factors such as excessive staff and inadequate incentives as well as by a lack of administrative capacity. If performance is to improve, all these aspects need to be simultaneously addressed in a comprehensive reform program.

**Economic Reform and Adjustment**

Adjustment programs often emphasize the need to redefine the role of government and to concentrate public sector activities on functions such as economic policy-making, revenue collection, infrastructure provision and the delivery of social services. In such cases, CSR should be designed to assist recipient governments to review the role and function of the civil service and to identify how services can be provided most efficiently and effectively. This may result in changes to the balance between public and private sector provision including corporatization and privatization.

In some countries, CSR can contribute directly to macroeconomic stabilization through supporting downsizing programs which reduce the size and cost of the civil service to an affordable and sustainable level. This can assist governments in restoring budgetary stability. In such cases, downsizing could be a key component of CSR and a high priority for donor support along with other measures such as strengthening revenue collection. Support for capacity building should also be given a high priority for donor support in the early stages of CSR.

In developing CSR programs and aid projects, recipients and donors need to ensure there is consistency with overall public expenditure plans, especially the target ceilings for the recurrent budget and the composition of expenditure. These will also affect the pace of some reforms and their longer-term financial sustainability. Planned improvements in civil service terms and conditions are particularly dependent on the availability of recurrent finance.

**Leadership and Commitment**

High-level political commitment and support is an essential prerequisite for successful CSR but is not sufficient in itself. Ownership of reform programs needs to be more broadly
based in Dialogue with recipients donors should underline the need for policy statements on CSR
to be endorsed at the highest level of government as a foundation for the development of detailed
programs. Windows of opportunity such as change of governments should be used to initiate
such dialogue and to build commitment:

The development of political commitment takes time and donors need to participate
actively in the process through policy dialogue and acting as advocates of reform. Although the
process of developing a reform policy and strategy must be led by domestic stakeholders, donors
can sometimes facilitate debate and help to build consensus and commitment through, for
example, supporting workshops. These should involve consultation and communication with
representatives from civil society.

Developing and sustaining political commitment often requires careful attention by
recipients and donors to the timing of commencement and implementation of CSR projects and
to the clear communication of reform objectives.

Donors should avoid taking the lead in diagnosing problems and devising reform
strategies. This is likely to undermine ownership and commitment. Recipients need to develop
their own reform strategies and to devise CSR programs which they own and are prepared to
implement. Where recipients lack technical capacity, donors should provide technical assistance
to facilitate this process

Taking Account of Governance

Good governance including accountability, transparency and the rule of law is conducive
to effective CSR. This requires commitment to a more professional civil service with a greater
emphasis on performance.

In developing CSR programs, donors need to review the position in the country
concerned and if appropriate, develop specific governance projects which complement efforts to
reform the civil service. There is likely to be a need for this where there is a high degree of
patrimonialism and endemic corruption.

Donor support for governance projects will typically go beyond the confines of the
executive branch of government to include activities such as support for development of
legislation governing the civil service, legal sector reform (including the relevant sections of the
judiciary) and anti-corruption measures. CSR can itself promote improved governance and
donors should aim to support activities which can help achieve this such as improving ethical
standards or enhancing accountability.

Program Design

 Diagnosis and Preparation

Prior to the detailed design of CSR programs, there is a need for an open and objective
analysis of the constraints faced and a stocktaking of the current situation. It is important that
this draws on the knowledge and experience of local decision-makers and officials in a
participative way to diagnose the problems faced. It may also require donor-funded consultancy
studies on particular issues or aspects of the civil service.
Close attention needs to be paid to the process involved in carrying out such a diagnostic. Donors should seek to support a structured and participative approach involving all stakeholders in an attempt to reach a consensus on the problems and the required corrective action. Following this, it should be possible to develop a strategy and reform action plan to which local stakeholders are committed.

**Vision and Strategy**

Donors should encourage recipients to develop a clearly articulated view about the scope and nature of the civil service they are trying to develop. Overall program objectives should be driven by the intended outcomes. This vision should be noted in the expectations of the public. It will provide a framework for objective setting and minimize the risk of programs (or individual components) being seen as ends in themselves which can sometimes lead to a build-up of resistance to reform.

Donors should aim to provide support for CSR in a programmatic framework. This requires a comprehensive reform strategy which addresses all the main constraints in an integrated way and sets specific objectives with targets/benchmarks against which progress can be judged. These should be linked to desired final outcomes such as improved service delivery or the size, structure and cost of the civil service.

**Sequencing and Timeframe**

Donors need to assess whether the proposed content, sequencing and pace of any CSR program for which aid is requested is realistic. In part this depends on the specific situation and initial conditions of the recipient country. In practice, the precise sequencing adopted is often influenced by the availability of finance, the ease of carrying out a program component and the degree of support for it amongst stakeholders.

The implementation phase of many African CSR programs has typically included most of the following components: rationalization and restructuring of Ministries and departments; reducing the size of the civil service through downsizing and rightsizing; improving pay levels and incentives. Donors should encourage recipients to identify the linkages between these program components and to implement them in a sequence which takes into account any interdependencies.

In general, downsizing and rightsizing programs should take place after Ministerial reviews because these will identify redundant posts and personnel to be retrenched. However, in some cases where there is a "ghost worker" problem and gross overstaffing, it may take place before this. Downsizing programs generally need to be preceded by efforts to establish a robust personnel information and establishment control system to prevent re-employment of retrenched personnel. Where pay reform is to be wholly or partially financed by downsizing, this will have to await the implementation of the latter.

**Process Approach**

Donor assistance for CSR needs to give higher priority to process issues. More participative methods should be used to develop and design CSR program components and aid projects. Greater use should be made of stakeholder analysis and other participatory techniques such as workshops and team-based project preparation methodologies. Donors should also
consider providing advisers and consultants with change management expertise and who adopt a more facilitative and supportive approach.

All the CSR components need to be developed in a participative way. However, the implementation of some components will require a more directive approach (setting global targets) led by higher-level authorities. Others (e.g. ministerial restructuring) will be implemented through further consultation.

Process approaches also require donors to adopt a flexible approach to project design so that programs can be adapted and changed in response to evolving circumstances.

**Strengthening Of Core Functions**

In developing CSR projects donors should aim to strengthen the core functions of government, thereby improving resource mobilization and allocation, policy-making capacity and the effectiveness and independence of the judiciary. This can involve action by the recipient and specific donor support to: increase the autonomy and accountability of revenue collection institutions; strengthen financial planning and budgeting systems; and strengthen policy-making through training and technical assistance.

Strengthening of core functions needs to take place across the civil service and to take into account sector-specific management needs. The Public Expenditure Working Group is also considering these issues.

**Ministerial Restructuring and Decentralization**

Functional reviews and restructuring of ministries are crucial to improving the effectiveness of service delivery. Donors should encourage recipients to use this process to help define sector objectives and to consider the appropriate division of responsibilities between government and NGO or private sector service providers.

The scope of ministerial reviews should be wide ranging and include an assessment of structures, establishment and staffing levels, and management systems. This must respect specific organizational and cultural factors, Management systems need to be introduced to encourage a strong focus on objective setting and to improve resource management. These will need to be consistent with civil service-wide systems managed by central ministries.

Where decentralization is envisaged or under way, donors should emphasize the need for the Ministerial reviews to be coordinated or integrated with these programs. Once an agreed division of responsibilities between the central and local government exists, this can form the basis for ministerial restructuring.

**Downsizing**

Some donors are increasingly willing to provide aid financing for downsizing and rightsizing programs, and it is important for them to ensure that recipients have well-designed and cost-effective programs. This will involve assessing the total cost of retrenchment options including both additional pension payments as well as the costs of the severance package and ensuring that these are in line with international experience.
It is also important to ensure that the present value of the cost savings that will accrue to government overtime from the retrenchment program outweigh the present value of the initial cost of retrenchment and any additional pension payments to those retrenched. In general, such programs, should have a quick payback period and generate net budget savings for the government budget within a few years.

Retrenchment programs can be difficult to design and there are usually several options to be considered. Donors should be prepared to provide technical assistance for this purpose and to help redesign and strengthen personnel management and control systems to prevent re-employment.

Particular attention needs to be given to the social consequences of retrenchment. Criteria for selection need to be open and transparent to prevent any discrimination on ethnic or gender grounds. Tracer studies of retrenched staff are also required to identify any adverse social consequences, to ensure the adequacy of severance packages and to consider the need for other measures.

**Pay and Incentives**

Inadequate terms and conditions for civil servants remain a major impediment to improving performance in the civil service. Successful CSR requires a commitment by recipients to move basic pay towards a Minimum Living Wage (MLW) over time and to reform pay and benefits structures by restoring differentials, introducing performance-related aspects and monetizing all benefits in kind. The performance-related element should be introduced as quickly as possible and should focus on measures such as attendance, achievement of agreed objectives.

Donors should encourage recipients to adopt pay reform as a key component of CSR and provide technical assistance to support the design and implementation of the program. Support for comparative surveys of pay and benefits in the private sector and the design of performance pay and now pay scales is often needed. Donors should also consider providing selective support to improve civil service offices and equipment.

**Capacity Building**

Donors should assist recipients to design and implement in-country training programs that would help to develop skills and build capacity in areas related to CSR. Such training should cover both technical as well as process aspects.

**Implementation, Monitoring And Evaluation**

**Management of Reform**

Donors should assist recipients to establish have adequate capacity to manage and implement CSR. Recipients need to establish a CSR management team with sufficient status and authority and for this to be overseen at the political level. This set-up requires adequate management and technical capacity to cope with CSR and the design of the program should be matched to the level of capacity available.
Donors should be prepared to assist the CSR management team by financing technical assistance which is capable of providing technical advice and support in a facilitative and supportive way whilst retaining local ownership. Such support can also build local capacity through developing staff motivation and skills, suitable administrative structures and participative working methods. Specialized training for change management could be offered in support of this.

Reform of service delivery also requires the leadership and active participation of officials from line ministries. This is likely to require the creation of ministerial teams and the development of capacity through team-building workshops and training.

The coordination and management of donor activities is an essential requirement for successful implementation of CSR. Donors should encourage recipients to lead the process and donor-funded experts or advisers should support the CSR management team to develop suitable coordination mechanisms. Joint donor and government project reviews should be held on a regular basis and the CSR management team should also develop a format for progress reports and supply these routinely to donors.

**Baseline Surveys and Service Delivery Surveys**

Donors should provide support for recipients to assess the impact of CSR, including the provision of technical assistance to help build local capacity in this area. There is a need for a baseline study to be developed at the design phase of the project and for regular surveys to be repeated thereafter. This should focus on service delivery standards and the level of involvement, utilization and access to public services by the poor and women. The initial survey should be used both to improve the design of CSR as well as to monitor the impact on service delivery. Repeat surveys should then be able to identify the need to take early corrective action to mitigate any adverse consequences.

Recipients and donors need to review the progress of the main program components against qualitative and quantitative indicators and targets established for the CSR programs. Monitoring systems and progress reporting should be designed to cover this aspect. Occasionally, specific studies of reviews of individual program components are also likely to be required. Tracer studies of personnel retrenched from the civil service would fall into this category. Donors should be prepared to assist with those studies if required.

**Donor Assistance**

CSR is a high-cost, resource-intensive activity which requires a consistently high level of commitment and financing from donors and recipients over an extended time period. In situations where recipients are meeting program targets, donors should be as flexible and responsive as possible in providing aid.

**Conditionality**

Carefully designed and selective conditionality is an important mechanism for stimulating initial action by recipients and as a means of allowing donors some influence over the pace and direction of reform. However, the conditions need to be realistic, developed jointly and negotiated with the recipient so that they are perceived as a government commitment to an agreed program rather than being externally imposed. Conditions on CSR in Structural
Adjustment Programs can be an important catalyst for the development of programs by recipients.

Policy Dialogue

Donors should pursue the policy dialogue on CSR in a coordinated fashion using the Consultative Group and Round Table process. This requires close consultation at the working level between bilateral donors and the multilateral agencies.

Aid Mechanisms

Where possible, donors should consider the provision of financial aid as well as technical assistance. Some donors may be able to consider providing recurrent financial support to the recipient budget over a limited time period and on a tapering basis. This mechanism could be used to support the introduction of pay reforms.

Donors should be prepared to consider a variety of options for the provision of technical assistance often over an extended period. The flexibility to recruit national consultants and experts can be particularly useful where local knowledge and contacts are required. While use of short-term periodic technical assistance should in general be encouraged, in certain circumstances the use of long-term advisers may be appropriate.

The quality of the technical assistance provided is crucial to the success of CSR. The terms of reference for consultants and experts should emphasize the importance of working in a facilitator and supportive manner with national personnel and the need for early skills transfer and capacity building. Donors should aim to provide consultants and experts with process and change management skills as well as expertise in the design and delivery of specific program components.

Local Compensation For CSR Management Team

The successful delivery of CSR programs often requires that monetary incentives be offered to personnel in the CSR implementation organization. Donors need to ensure that such arrangements are open and transparent and consistent with any government regulations covering local salary supplementation and secondment of civil servants. Where civil servants are involved, they should either be employed by government on short-term performance-related contracts or be seconded from the civil service for the period of the project.

Where the management team includes national consultants, they should be recruited in an open and competitive manner and their fees should reflect local labor market rates for their skills.

There is a need to manage the tension between the CSR team receiving incentives and other personnel who are responsible for implementing reform and are not included. Expectations need to be actively managed to prevent dissatisfaction and demotivation.
This discussion focuses on four themes which seem relevant for donors to consider in the future as they try to take on board the lessons of past experience with CSR.

It would be useful to review some of the main points that have emerged from the discussion so far, which have been raised by a number of participants, and which point to a need to re-evaluate the purpose of assistance to CSR. This has important implications for the way in which CSR is approached in future and donors will need to accommodate any shift of emphasis in the way they design their projects in future. The first theme concerns the need to re-evaluate the purpose of assistance to CSR.

- Discussion of the experience in a number of African countries suggests there has been a shift of emphasis toward the importance of service delivery in contrast to improving the civil service for its own sake.
- This implies that donor-funded programs have to deal with more than downsizing and/or improving the machinery of government by, for example, including developing management systems or organization restructuring, etc. This was an essentially top-down and technical approach.
- The new approach requires a stronger emphasis on consultation with users of government services and civil society generally; attention to governance issues; more emphasis on a bottom-up approach to improving the efficiency of government services through results-orientated management, e.g. the current Ghana program seems to have been developed along these lines. There has also been an emphasis on the need for systemic changes and for ensuring that the purposes of CSR is properly communicated to the public and the civil service.
- This does not imply that other aspects of CSR such as the need re-examine the role and function of government in support of economic development objectives is no longer relevant. Indeed, a focus on service delivery is likely to increase the perceived importance of restructuring around core functions such as law and order, social services, economic policy-making, etc. Similarly, there is still scope for improving efficiency by ensuring that services which can be delivered more efficiently by other agencies and the private sector should be left to them.
- It is also noticeable from the Ugandan experience (and from Kenya and Tanzania also), that in deciding to redefine the role of government and improve government

---

8 Presented by a group of multilateral and bilateral donors who participated in the Workshop on Civil Service Reform held in Cape Town, South Africa, in April 1995. The donors included the UNDP, UK/ODA and the World Bank.
services, these countries have also decided to address the issue of affordability by reducing the size of the civil service. This suggests that reducing the numbers of civil servants will remain an important component of reform for many countries. The requirement to increase funding for operations and maintenance and to provide adequate incentives also points in this direction.

- The challenge for donors and recipients is how to design programs which can deliver the depth of reform required in a politically acceptable and non-destabilizing way.

### The Donor Partnership

The emphasis at the workshop on the need for local ownership and home-grown programs suggests the need for several changes in the traditional donor relationship. First, this involves a shift away from traditional donor-driven CSR programs, whether or not associated with Structural Adjustment Lending programs. This implies trying to avoid an approach based on conditionality and programs designed by donor-funded experts as well as a shift away from blueprints to a more flexible process approach.

Second, it involves donors adopting a more facilitative and supportive role with the recipient taking the lead in developing the program. However, for this approach to be effective, the recipient must also be willing to take responsibility for the development of a program, to give it the necessary priority and to devote local resources to its implementation. As an example of this kind of approach, the Ugandan model suggests that even at an early stage, well-designed technical assistance to facilitate government efforts can improve the capacity to plan CSR programs without undermining ownership.

Nevertheless, the changing role of donors must still be consistent with their requirements for accountability in the use of aid funds. This implies that the donor role is to assist the development of CSR projects and programs which are credible and sustainable rather than just being sources of funding. Donors also have to be able to justify their support in terms of long-term developmental impact and value for money.

Achieving this means that any donor-funded CSR programs should demonstrate that they have overt political support (both in terms of overall strategy and for the implementation process) as well as clear objectives and reform targets, financing requirements, timetables, implementation arrangements, etc. The benefits also need to be sustained over time.

Donor-funded programs also need to demonstrate recipient commitment and even though this is hard to test effectively, it could, for example, require some evidence of action taken and progress with implementation prior to larger-scale donor support.

These conditions cannot be imposed by donors but should be the subject of a negotiated agreement representing a joint commitment. The key issue is whether governments and donors can accommodate these requirements.

### Improving Donor Programs and Projects

Donor evaluations, including the paper presented to the seminar on the World Bank experience, suggest that there has been a tendency in the past for projects to be over-elaborate in their design. Typically, they attempt to address too many objectives simultaneously and can sometimes be beyond the capacity of recipients to implement. In general, there is a need for
fewer and more realistic objectives, project design needs to be simpler and more flexible so that changes can be accommodated more easily as experience is gained.

Another important factor in project design is the need to prioritize reform efforts so that efforts are not dissipated and early successes are delivered.

There is also a need for greater recognition of the importance of flexibility on the part of donors in terms of what they are prepared to fund. For example, until recently, many donors were unable to provide recurrent budget support for retrenchment costs. This is changing with the recognition among some donors that CSR involves short-term costs which many governments are simply unable to meet.

It is also important that donors have the capacity to provide technical assistance in a flexible way that matches, the specific requirements and that terms of reference for advisers and consultants emphasize the need for training local staff and building capacity rather than carrying out a job that local staff can do.

The discussions on governance, including accountability and transparency, have suggested that improving public services also requires attention to the manner in which countries are governed, for example, in relation to the responsiveness of services to public demands and accountability for the use of public funds. Also, as the evidence from earlier discussions suggest, where corruption and patrimonialism are rife, this will constrain CSR. These issues also need to be addressed as a complement to CSR efforts. This may also involve donor assistance.

**Improving Donor Coordination**

The financing requirements and complexity of CSR often require a multi-donor involvement and this can create problems for recipients in terms of coordination, program management and administration. The experience of Uganda suggests the need for recipients to actively manage their relationship with the donors. This could be done, for example, through formal consultation involving program reviews attended by donors visiting Uganda, regular progress reporting and donor meetings, and a policy and planning group which can specifically respond to issues raised by donors.

These arrangements have been instrumental in increasing the level of program support in Uganda. The Uganda experience also highlights the importance of donors being willing to provide technical advisers who are available to all donor agencies interested in supporting the program and developing projects.

It would also be possible for donors to take a more pro-active role in attracting additional donor support to programs by, for example, displaying greater willingness to share information and documentation and by assisting government to generate donor confidence by making presentations to Consultative Groups or by a greater willingness to develop cofinancing arrangements.

Finally, it is also important that donors work closely together to synthesize the lessons of experience. For example, the SPA donors have established a working group to review the experience CSR and to prepare guidelines. It will be important to ensure that the results of this work are shared with African governments.
Summary of Key Issues

- How can donors reflect the changing objectives for CSR in the support that they provide for CSR?
- What changes are needed to reconcile donor and recipient concerns and to promote consensus and agreement?
- How can donors overcome present constraints on project effectiveness?
- How can donors cooperate more effectively to minimize the burden on recipients?
PART TWO

COUNTRIES' EXPERIENCE
6. CIVIL SERVICE REFORM IN BOTSWANA SINCE THE 1980s: LESSONS OF EXPERIENCE

Mogolori Modisi

Introduction

At independence in 1966, the Botswana Civil Service had a staff strength of only 6,000. This increased steadily through the years to the current (1995) level of 67,815 in the central government. The instruments used to manage personnel in the civil service were developed and adapted gradually to the increased size and complexity of services offered. The reforms of the Botswana Civil Service were thus evolutionary and pragmatic. In the 1980s and 1990s when of civil servants numbered over 50,000, further new structures and systems were developed as it became relevant and affordable to do so. In this paper, an attempt is made to underscore the value of commitment and dedication of the leadership of the civil service to ideals of continuous improvement and adaptation to changing circumstances as well as a mind-set that seeks optimum performance through a pragmatic or problem-solving approach.

From this paper, it can be inferred that Botswana was fortunate to have a strong consensual leadership which consistently mustered the collective will properly manage the affairs of the country. This led to sustained efforts from all concerned with a view to achieving improvement, which in turn led to a remarkable record of civil service reforms and good management. This was primarily a result of a democratic and participative leadership style with a clear vision for, and dedication to, providing an enabling environment for rapid and sustained economic development.

After a brief overview of the machinery of government, this paper reviews Botswana's experience in three selected areas: (i) human resource management and development; (ii) planning and budgeting; and (iii) measures for enforcing accountability and transparency in the management of public affairs.

Overview of the Machinery of Government

At the head of the machinery of government is an Executive President who is elected by the National Assembly from the majority party. He combines the functions of Head of Government and Head of State. Currently, he is assisted by a Vice-President who also serves as Minister of Finance and Development Planning. Legislative power is exercised by a National Assembly (Parliament). Members of Parliament (MPs) are elected from forty single-member electoral districts, with four additional members nominated by the President. The Parliament operates on parliamentary principles and procedures, with the majority party forming the government. Elections are held every five years, through party political competition (six successive and peaceful elections have been held since Independence). There is a fifteen-member House of Chiefs whose role is to advise government on any matter the Chiefs perceive
to affect customary laws and community affairs. Civil liberties are enumerated in the constitution and an independent judiciary interprets and administers the laws. An independent Judicial Service Commission recommends candidates to the President for appointment as judges. The common law courts are complemented by customary courts which have responsibility for civil and misdemeanor criminal disputes at the grassroots. The customary courts are presided over by Chiefs in the village Kgotla or by secular court presidents in urban areas. There is an established appeal procedure from customary courts to a Customary Court of Appeal.

The civil service which assists the executive in managing public affairs is insulated from political interference through a civil service commission. It is organized into ministries and departments at the center with field services in the districts. The central government comprises nine ministries and the Office of the President which is responsible for coordination of all government functions. There is a local government system comprising nine District Councils, one City Council (Gaborone) and four Town Councils. Councillors are elected to these bodies through party political competition at the same time as the national elections. Finally, as part of the local governance structure, there are Land Boards with allocative authority over communal lands and the village Kgotla which serves as the general assembly where decisions affecting village life are taken.

Human Resource Management And Development

The major issue in human resource management and development at Independence was the small number of qualified nationals available to serve in the civil service which was dominated by expatriate staff. Although the government was committed to a policy of localization (like other post-colonial African states), it also decided to continue to use expatriate staff (Technical assistance). This two-pronged approach was accompanied by a strong emphasis on training. Thus, in 1972, a Presidential Commission on Localization and Training in the Public Service of Botswana was established. Some other specific human resource management issues have also been addressed, notably organization and methods, pay and incentives and enhancement of productivity.

Localization and Use of Technical Assistance

The government decided that the Localization and Training Report of 1972 was to be implemented over a ten-year period. During this implementation period, formal follow-ups were made in 1977 and 1979. Three other Presidential Commissions to review Localization and Training in the Public Service were appointed in 1981, 1987 and 1994. Their reports followed the same format but with a number of changes to improve the content and details in reporting. In the earlier reports, dates of the likely localization of posts were left out and there was some ambiguity. In later reports, the specific dates of the month and year of localization were included. However, it was still not possible and realistic to have target dates of localization in the teaching service because of an acute shortage of teachers, particularly for science and mathematics.

By 1981, it became clear that government had to share educated manpower with other sectors. The Botswana Employers Federation and the National Employment and Incomes Committee (NEMTC) supported the view that there should be an equal sharing of manpower. The suggestion indicated that the pace of localization in the public service would be reduced through the process of people being allocated to other sectors. Concerned by this, the Commissioners wrote that consideration has to be given to the extent to which sharing might
reduce numbers to the public sector and, therefore, the extent to which direction and facilitative action might be impaired to the detriment of government service.

Table 1. Public Service Establishment And Non-Citizens, 1977 And 1987 (including teachers and local council officers)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1977</th>
<th>Sept. 1987</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Establishment (Permanent and pensionable)</td>
<td>11,388</td>
<td>25,967</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expatriate-held Positions</td>
<td>1,356</td>
<td>1,303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of Positions held by Non-citizens</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: This table excludes Industrial Class Workers Grouping which is completely localized.
Table 2. Expatriate By Categories Of Position, 1983 And 1987
(Excluding Local Council Officers)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Number of Expatriates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1983</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SII</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIII</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIV</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SV</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SVI</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRIE</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRI</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PR2</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PR3</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PR4</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAI</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GA2</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GA3</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GA4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TII</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TI2</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TI3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TI4</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TI</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T2</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T5</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N4</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N5</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>979</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* These are Judges.


As indicated in Tables 1 and 2, extracted from the Localization and Training Report of 1987, it can be seen that the Commissioners took the trouble to look at each post that was occupied by an expatriate and determined whether it should be localized. Those posts, which the Commissioners felt could be filled by graduates from universities and other schools, were localized readily. Although there were many other posts that could not be localized by inexperienced people, certain posts of managerial level in the professions were prematurely
localized. This meant that a decision to localize the post was taken with full knowledge that the occupants would need back-up support to cope. In such circumstances, advisory positions were created and filled with experienced expatriate personnel. The positions occupied by expatriates were established posts. Personnel provided through technical assistance support also filled established posts.

The advisory personnel were kept for long periods in the 1970s and 1980s. At that time, localization of their functions was a remote prospect for two real one. First, the advisers had the requisite experience and were needed. Second, officers who could be developed to occupy senior positions, were deployed elsewhere where their services were in greater demand.

Extensive use of internal training was made to prepare officers to assume positions occupied by expatriates. Many expatriates were expected to train locals on the job whilst many others were training officers in departmental training units. For instance, a training program was created in 1982 with training courses and full-time training officers to staff the Government Computer Bureau.

From 1982 onwards, extensive use was made of understudies. This meant that a post was established at one grade lower than the substantive post occupied by an expatriate. The understudy would have similar duties to those being performed by the senior expatriate officer. This arrangement is called a "shadowing". The expatriate was shadowed for a contract period of two to three years or more. When the expatriate officer's contract expired, the counterpart was ordinarily promoted to his or her position and the shadow post discontinued. This did not always work perfectly as many heads of departments used the shadow posts for a while anyway, as substantive posts where two local officers would be in position. When discovered, they invariably succeeded in demonstrating acute shortages of manpower and thus had the situation regularized. In 1994, the Minister of Finance and Development planning instructed that no new shadow posts be created until a thorough review was carried out. The review revealed that the abuse of shadow posts in many technical departments.

Training

With a view to localization, both the Ministry of Education and the Directorate of Public Service Management provided scholarships for pre-service and in-service training for citizens. Although it was recognized that expatriate personnel would continue to have a role to play in the Botswana economy, their replacement by citizens in established positions in the public service has been a consistent national objective. In the report of the Presidential Commission on Economic Opportunities, it was stated that localization is a long-term goal, but positive assistance provided by expatriate was recognized as essential to achieving national goals. This meant that a long-term solution had to be found to localization. A more systematic training program that looked beyond the replacement of existing expatriates in established posts by citizens needed to be established. The Directorate of Public Service Management (DPSM) was reorganized and two important divisions of Training and Development and Manpower Planning were created. The Manpower Planning division allocated the stock of graduates to government departments and the Training and Development division provided extensive in-service training.

Training was done overseas for long-term graduate and post-graduate studies. Most of the training took place in locally-established institutions such as the University, the Botswana Institute of Administration and Commerce, the Institute of Development Management, the Roads Training School, Meat inspection School, National Health Institute, Teacher Training College,
the Police College and the Botswana College of Agriculture which is now a faculty of the University. The Botswana Center for Accounting Studies and the Botswana National Productivity Center are the latest additions.

Regional institutes and schools were also approached for training places. The Universities of Dar-Es-Salaam, Nairobi, Ibadan, Zambia and Zimbabwe, in particular, were used extensively for training in medicine, veterinary medicine, architecture, geology, engineering, quantity surveying and land surveying. Following a focus on regional centers of teaming, schools in countries which provided technical assistance were the next line of focus. Thus, many Botswanan were educated in the UK, USA, Australia, Germany, Sweden, New Zealand and India where they were offered scholarships by donors in the countries concerned. Some countries accepted the concept of third-country training and thus offered scholarships tenable in schools other than those in their own countries.

In 1990, the DPSM Fund for in-service training was introduced. Until then, funding of courses outside Botswana was done entirely by donors from the industrial countries and international multilateral organizations. The establishment of the Fund meant that the government could exercise maximum control on the whole training program.

Following a Private Sector Conference in Francistown in 1987, a debate ensued whether people educated on government scholarships should be bonded to serve the government or just to serve in the country. At that stage, all scholars on government scholarships were encouraged to remain in the government service in the national interest for at least the same length of time it took to complete their studies.

A resolution was made that in-service officers on training should be bonded to the government while pre-service students would be bonded to the country. In spite of the bonding agreement, many people who enjoyed in-service training courses left government service to join the private and parastatal sectors for more pay. The bonding agreement was further strengthened through government refusing to accept the resignation of officers before the bonding period had lapsed and/or a full and lump sum repayment of the scholarship. Since the new bonding agreement was put in force, the government seems to have retained the staff it has trained for the period of the bond. There may, however, be other reasons such as the recession of the early 1990s, recent spate of retrenchment and high levels of unemployment influencing staff to remain in the civil service.

Other Human Resource Management Issues

The other important human resource management issues are control of the level of manpower increases and measures aimed at retaining an efficient and effective civil service. The major activities in these areas include job evaluation, restructuring of departments, manpower utilization and pay and incentives.

Management Services Function

This was introduced in 1979 in the Directorate of Public Service Management. It started with a job evaluation exercise that took ten years to complete. Job evaluation has provided a systematic method of appraising the value of each job in relation to other jobs. A large and complex organization such as the civil service needed a grading system that could be perceived as fair and objective. Simultaneously the Organization and Methods (O&M) Unit was being
developed with two expatriate officers and six local officers as understudies. By 1994, Management Services had grown into the largest division at DPSM with twenty-six local officers and one expatriate.

Organizational Restructuring Of Government.

This was launched in 1984 when the first ministerial O&M Report was published. Only the Office of the President remains to be covered. The other nine ministries have been reorganized. This means that all the nine ministries have clear corporate objectives and functions in line with current government policies, priorities and programs. These goals were reached after consultation and the express agreement of the senior staff of the ministries and in particular that of the Permanent Secretary and the Head of the Civil Service. The O&M reviews confirmed inadequacies of manpower in terms of numbers and skills. Because the approach of the reviews was problem-oriented, analytic and sought close involvement of the clients, it has now taken twelve years.

Manpower Utilization

An inspectorate was also set up to audit manpower in departments. This inspectorate called "the manpower utilization function" is aimed at ensuring that staff and work-load ratios were compatible. The main purpose is to ensure that manpower is optimally deployed and that there is an effective monitoring system of the productivity of individual workers by which the productivity of the whole workforce would be assured.

Pay and Incentives

In 1990, the salary structure was decompressed so that it would be competitive at senior levels. This was a departure from the normal policy and practice which encouraged increases of salaries at a higher rate in the bottom grades. However, labor unrest culminating in a week-long strike of over 13,000 industrial class workers in November 1991 and other political pressures persuaded government to increase salaries by slightly higher margins of 23.4 percent and 16 percent at the lowest levels and 15 percent across the board for the middle and senior levels in 1992.

It was further observed that professionals, technicians and artisans had stagnant to regressive salary scales in the 1980s. A Presidential Commission on Incomes Policy recommended enhanced entry salary scales for artisans, technical and professional personnel and an assured program of parallel progression to that enjoyed by administrative and management cadres. The progression was to be designed in such a way that it would encourage competition and that only the best would reach the highest levels equivalent to a Permanent Secretary.

In December 1991, a Committee consisting of eleven members drawn from a cross-section of civil servants in the administrative, professional and technical grades produced a Report on the Implementation of Parallel Progression. The report which was approved by government in November 1992 extended salary scales for professional, technical and artisan cadres. It took two years to implement the recommendations by designing new schemes of service for all the government departments.

During implementation, there was a concerted campaign to have the parallel progression incentive scheme implemented on more or less a discretionary basis as opposed to ensuring that
officers progressed only when there was proof of their academic and professional qualifications. The parallel progression incentive scheme provided improved prospects of promotion to new and higher levels on a systematic and agreed basis. For example, professional grades were opened up by as much as three grades offering an optimum salary 45 percent higher than the current grades.

This also encouraged officers to remain in their chosen vocations for six to nine years more in the hope of earning another promotion. As the scheme is only two years old, it remains to be seen whether it will achieve its objectives of retaining scarce, highly-trained and experienced officers within the civil service. Productivity and quality are two sides of the same coin and are ordinarily encouraged by training, experience and an appropriate reward system.

The Botswana Public Service relied on these three instruments to extract productivity and quality services from its workers. Following Independence, unprecedented feelings of zeal and pride in working for the Botswana Civil Service seemed the order of the day for some two decades. Much enthusiasm, diligence and dedication to duty was exhibited in spite of the comparatively low rewards that locals earned in salaries and benefits.

Following the increased revenues from diamonds, a decision was made to adjust salaries on the basis of the annual rate of inflation. This led to automatic annual salary adjustments. In 1982 and 1990, annual adjustments were followed by the award of a salary increase on the strength of recommendations of Presidential Salary Review Commissions. In those years, salaries were thus increased twice. Salaries in the last decade have increased as follows

Table 3: Evolution of Salaries in the Civil Service, 1983/84 - 1993/94.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>1983/84</th>
<th>1993/94</th>
<th>Folds of Increase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FO</td>
<td>21,768</td>
<td>124,728</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fl</td>
<td>21,012</td>
<td>108,456</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F2</td>
<td>18,984</td>
<td>94,320</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E1</td>
<td>17,460</td>
<td>82,008</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E2</td>
<td>16,428</td>
<td>71,316</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D1</td>
<td>15,408</td>
<td>62,004</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D3</td>
<td>14,388</td>
<td>48,456</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C1</td>
<td>13,476</td>
<td>37,872</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C2</td>
<td>9,948</td>
<td>30,792</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C3</td>
<td>6,984</td>
<td>25,056</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B1</td>
<td>6,996</td>
<td>16,080</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B2</td>
<td>4,920</td>
<td>13,464</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B3</td>
<td>3,972</td>
<td>10,992</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Directorate of Public Service Management (DPSM)

According to the 1995 DPSM Salaries and Benefits Survey, civil service salaries lag behind the corporate private sector and parastatals at the top, while at the bottom they generally
take the lead. Therefore, in spite of higher increases at the top as a result of decompression in
1990, civil service salaries have not yet caught up.

The in-service training fund was increased from P5 million (1 Pula = US$0.32, January
long-term training while the number increased to 1251 in 1991 and to 1490 in 1994. Similarly,
many more officers gained experience and higher technical and professional competence.
However, the general public became increasingly more vocal about low productivity and shoddy
services of civil servants.

*The Productivity Movement*

In response to the perceived productivity deficit, the government launched a productivity
movement in 1993 with two main features: (i) the introduction of Singapore-inspired Work
Improvement Teams and (ii) the establishment of a National Productivity Center.

A human resource management system to encourage team work, cooperation and
productivity was found in the Singaporean model of **Work Improvement Teams** (WITS).
WITs are an adaptation of the Japanese Quality Control Circles but are designed for the public
service and service industries. Work Improvement Teams were introduced in 1993 as the basis
for the Strategy for Productivity Improvement in the Public Service. A Work Improvement
Team is defined as a group of Civil Servants from the same work unit, irrespective of divisional
status who meet regularly to solve problems, examine improvement opportunities and develop
problem-solving skills.

The five major objectives of the Strategy for Productivity Improvement in the Public
Service are to establish a mind-set that seeks optimum performance, participative leadership and
team work, innovative work styles, strong client orientation and empowerment of people. The
mission of a civil servant was described as delivery of programs of government and assistance to
Ministers to devise effective policies and programs necessary for good government. A civil
servant was also given a set of values:

- Prompt and courteous service to people and loyalty to the government;
- Honesty and integrity, faithfulness to the principles of fairness and impartiality;
- Neutrality, transparency, and permanency of the service;
- Professionalism and quality service;
- frugality and prudence in the use of resources;
- perseverance and patience in the pursuit of good service; and
- respect for Ministers, parliamentarians, senior officials, members of the public and
  members of the public service.

The philosophy of work improvement teams is based, among other things, on the belief
that:
people want to contribute constructively.
people want to be part of a team;
people have self-esteem and desire recognition; and
people do not work for bread alone.

The Botswana Civil Service approached the Government of Singapore for assistance in establishing a productivity movement. Towards this, the Government of Singapore and the Commonwealth Fund for Technical Cooperation have for the past three years been involved in a specially designed program of training facilitators and team leaders for WITS. It is envisaged that by the end of 1995, there would be over 100 Work Improvement Teams established in government departments and that by the year 2001, there would be 1150 teams encompassing about 15,000 civil servants.

WITS’ concept of constantly seeking improvement and making it a daily routine in which all employees are involved is new and may represent a revolutionary approach to human resource management in the civil service.

The WITS or QCCs have been established because of the tremendous value they seem to add to the outlook of a person in the workplace and to the effectiveness of teams as seems to have been the experience of, in particular, Japan and Singapore. The WITS approach simultaneously stresses both the task-oriented nature of group activities and outputs as well as the process-oriented nature of problem-solving, solution formulation and communication skills. The WITS may, therefore, complement the hitherto task-oriented, pragmatic and evolutionary approach that characterized reforms in the civil service.

This can only accelerate the process and quantum of productivity in that when employees themselves, as opposed to their management, seek to improve the efficiency, quality or quality of work life, there is a strong likelihood of many more proposals on improvement, including in areas in which the service rendered is ordinarily considered adequate. A shift of paradigm would have occurred in that a mental attitude of seeking improvement will have permeated to technical and operational levels of the civil service. It is estimated that such a shift will take five to ten years before there are significant results.

In 1993, the government established the Botswana National Productivity Center (BNPC). The objectives of the center are, among other things, "to stimulate and generate productivity consciousness in Botswana". The scope of its activities covers both the public and private sectors. The center is building up its capacity to do its work with full government support and funding.

Planning and Budgeting

The planning process is a year-round affair culminating in the presentation to Parliament of the government budget for the next financial year. National Development Plans were processed on a five-year basis in the 1960s and 1970s and changed to a six-year format with a mid-term review after every three years. The report of the mid-term review would influence...
policy for the next Plan. For instance the mid-term review of National Development Plan 6 provided the basis for economic analysis and policy guidance for the preparation of National Development Plan 7.

As per National Development Plan 7, an economic model of Botswana was developed in the 1970s. The model was progressively upgraded as data sources improved and the economy became more sophisticated. It provides for a ten-year forecast of various economic indicators including gross output, and domestic product, for nineteen industrial sectors, income and expenditure for households, input output tables, employment by industry and wage groups, external and internal government debt, government service and expenditure and balance of payment including the levels of foreign reserves.

A number of basic assumptions are made for the forecast. A detailed analysis and set of assumptions are made on policies regarding taxes, subsidies, interest rates and regulations, taking into account that they could be varied with some effect. The importance that such factors have on economic development is ordinarily underscored at annual reviews or budgets. While the starting point is a ten-year vision, the planned development program is embodied in rolling six year plans with three-year comprehensive mid-term reviews.

The National Development Plan and the Annual Budgets are published by the government printer and distributed at government expense. The production of the National Development Plan is a small step in the whole process. The other processes are a series of consultative arrangements at central government and district council levels linking their plans to the annual budgets. Fortunately, both the planning and budgeting functions are under the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, assuring, more or less, that the left hand knows what the right hand is doing.

Much of the planning process focuses on the financial and manpower resources to implement policies and programs. A detailed analysis is made of availability of trained manpower, sources of materials and technology to complete projects and fulfill programs to the satisfaction of the general public. Painstaking presentation of requirements by government departments is done from unit to sections, from sections to departments, departments to ministries and ministries to central government agencies of the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning and the Directorate of Public Service Management. This process of budgeting takes eight months to complete from July to February, culminating in the budget speech to Parliament.

The most important aspect following planning and budgeting is the commitment and drive to implement. The following five factors have been identified in NDP 7 as influencing implementation efficiency:

- policies and programs must be designed so that their implementation is feasible;
- the responsibility for implementation must be clearly identified;
- those responsible for implementation must understand, and should be committed to the policy or program being implemented;
- when responsibilities for implementation are necessarily divided, an effective means of coordination must be established;
- when insurmountable difficulties are encountered during implementation, the nature of those difficulties must be quickly communicated back to decision-makers, so that the policies or programs affected can be rectified.
Linkages between the National Development Plan and the annual budget as well as actual expenditure is institutionalized. The Ministry of Finance and Development Planning has established a Project Review Committee. The Project Review Committee requires planning officers in the line ministries to make monthly reports on progress made in project implementation. The Project Review Committee recommends to the Estimates Committee whether any particular project should be allocated funds. If the project is not in the National Development Plan, the Project Review Committee would have no basis to recommend allocation of funds which are ordinarily scarce in the face of demand. Allocation of funds is announced in the budget.

At the final stage of planning and before implementation, Parliament is given the opportunity to debate the plan and the budget for it. During these processes, Parliament converts itself into a Committee of Supply. The process of parliament debates provides an essentially opportunity to make government accountable and responsible for its actions in the area of planning and budgeting.

Decentralized Development Planning

The effectiveness of the planning process is significantly enhanced by its decentralization to the sub-national level. The coordination and implementation at the District and regional level is the responsibility of the district Councils and District Development Committees. Consultation in the planning process also extends to the level of the village Kgotla where members of the Village Development Committee are officially nominated and elected. It is through the Village Development Committee that government supports community-related projects such as building of public toilets, bus and taxi shelters and rural roads. Similarly, a bottom-up planning approach is being practiced as well as an organized system of formal consultations with members of the public. The presence of the Chief, or his representative, is believed to give such meetings much more respectability than they would otherwise have.

Accountability and Transparency

Parliament and District Councils

The Government of Botswana bases governance on the constitution and democratic principles. The constitution provides for a multi-party democracy in which freedom of speech and freedom of choice and association continue to be the pillars of strength. The constitution has remained the same since it was adopted at Independence in 1966, save for an amendment in 1984 to provide for the nomination of the President by parliamentary candidates separately and prior to the general elections.

Government activities are, therefore, routinely discussed legally and formally in Parliament and the District Councils where there are members of the opposition. Ministers are, therefore, frequently queried on the actions of their ministries in Parliament. In Parliament and in the Councils, members of the opposition have increased in number as shown in Table 4. There are now more Councils with majorities from the opposition parties. In many of the Councils in which the ruling party has the majority, the opposition enjoys increased numbers. At any rate, the general level of education of members has also improved.
Table 4: Evolution Of Party Representation In Parliament And District Councils, 1989-1994

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>BDP</th>
<th>BNF</th>
<th>BPP</th>
<th>IEFP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Parliament</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>31 (64%)</td>
<td>3 (26%)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* 1994</td>
<td>26 (54%)</td>
<td>13 (37%)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Councils</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Compiled by the author from published sources.*

Parliamentary seats were increased by six in 1994 following the results of a Constituency Delimitation Commission of 1993 (Table 4). Because of the increased number of members of the opposition in the District Councils and Parliament, Ministers and Councillors of the ruling party have to answer many questions.

Parliament also serves as a watch-dog over government expenditure with the Auditor-General serving as its advisor. The Auditor-General's Reports are issued a year later. They are sold to members of the public for P1.00 at the Government Printer Bookshop. These reports, together with those of the Public Accounts Committee, form a basis for investigations and enquiries into financial and administrative affairs of government. For the past five years, these reports have been produced on time, except in 1990 when it was late by one month. The current Public Accounts Committee of Parliament consists of members with competencies in accountancy, management and journalism.

Parliament has direct access to Accounting Officers through the Public Accounts Committee. Access by parliamentarians is limited to areas where some wrongdoing may have been observed by the Auditor-General and for which no satisfactory explanation has been provided. The Public Accounts Committee sits once a year to hear cases of wrongdoing in the disbursement and use of government funds. The Committee has powers to demand the personal appearance of Accounting Officers who are ordinarily the Permanent Secretaries of ministries. The Auditor-General's Report and appearances at the Public Accounts Committee are unpopular among Accounting Officers. Consequently, much effort is made by Accounting Officers to avoid having to appear and be subjected to a series of needling questions mostly about issues that could have been avoided.

However, actual responsibility and accountability still largely lies in the administration of the various laws and the expenditure of funds disbursed to finance approved programs and projects. The Finance and Audit Act empowers Accounting Officers to take charge of funds for the use of which they would be answerable to the Minister of Finance and Development Planning. In the central government, where personnel are better trained and sufficient in numbers, government funds are generally considered to be much better protected than in the District Councils where there is still room for improvement in the training and supervision of staff.
**The Kgolla**

As already mentioned, the village Kgolla is an important part of the local governance structure. It also plays an important role in ensuring that public officials are accountable to the governed. Government Ministers and officials often request the Chief to call a public meeting at which they could explain government policies. Although it is not as common, the Chief and his tribesmen may also call upon a government department to come and explain its policies, programs and projects which directly affect them.

**The Press**

There are four weekly independent newspapers circulating in the urban areas. The circulation of newspapers from the private media has enriched the quality of criticism in some respects, while in others it has amplified the volume of criticism and swelled the number of critics. The government which was used to having a monopoly of the media in the 1960s and 1970s was in the 1980s and 1990s even faced with a privately-owned television station. The media also provide valued outlets for budding interest groups propagating different views on human rights, women, conservation and business.

The private press have occasionally sought assurances from government that it is free to print and broadcast whatever it deems in the public interest, taking into account that the National Security Acts prohibits publication of information considered to endanger national security. There have been two cases in the last five years in which the state accused a newspaper of having violated the National Security Act. The state took the culprit paper to court and lost both cases.

**Directorate on Corruption and Economic Crimes**

Although Botswana enjoys the reputation of being one of the few African countries with an honest government, the revelation of several cases of corruption and economic crime in the last few years convinced the government of the need for an anti-corruption campaign. The corruption cases uncovered through public inquiries relate to land deals, award of tenders, allocation of houses and contracts for the supply of spare parts and maintenance of vehicles. Several other cases on misappropriation, embezzlement and fraud were uncovered in the 1994 report of the Auditor-General. Extensive investigations were conducted in all these cases and disciplinary action was taken where appropriate. It was against this background that the Corruption and Economic Crime Act of 1994 was passed and a Directorate to investigate and prosecute corrupt officials and businessmen was established in the Office of the President.

A core group of investigators were recruited from Scotland Yard, the London Metropolitan Police in England and the Independent Commission against Corruption in Hong Kong. The mandate of the Directorate on Corruption and Economic Crime is to investigate cases and prosecute culprits and to provide public education and prevention. The Directorate has already recorded a spectacular case involving the prosecution of a Bank Manager accused of laundering funds close to P12 million. In 1995, the Director identified the goals of his Directorate as follows: "Our target therefore is a change of attitude amongst the people of Botswana. We must aim to establish a belief that corruption and economic crime cannot be tolerated in a decent democracy such as Botswana but further that those who are guilty of these offenses must be caught and punished."
**Ombudsman**

A law was passed in 1994 to establish the office of an Ombudsman. This law seeks to achieve and establish probity in the activities of civil servants. The Ombudsman will be empowered to investigate any action taken by or on behalf of a government department or authority, as a result of which any member of the public claims to have sustained injustice. Such a complaint may be investigated if it is made by the aggrieved person or made on his or her consent by Members of Parliament and Councillors. The Ombudsman may require the principal officers to remedy the situation if he is satisfied that indeed an injustice has been committed. To date, however, the Ombudsman is still to be appointed.

**Conclusion**

The Botswana Civil Service has a remarkable record of achievement through a pragmatic and evolutionary approach to management. Its leadership has always believed that its performance should be second to none. It, therefore, followed best practice wherever it found it and implemented systems and methods that were relevant for its needs. It is now embarking on major projects on productivity improvement and the eradication of all forms of corrupt practices. It is also introducing strategic planning, time management and performance management concepts in the civil service. As in the implementation of job evaluation, O&M reviews, parallel progression, all the other major reforms being launched will involve meticulous planning and a step-by-step phased implementation process in the true tradition of an evolutionary approach. Efforts to achieve improvement often involve a process of planning, consultations and implementation that may take as long as twelve years to achieve satisfactory results. In implementing reforms in human resource management and management systems, it is often very difficult to adhere to planned timetables.

Clarity of vision, the mustering of a consistent collective will, mutual social responsibility and the dedication and diligence of individuals in pursuit of improvement with a view to attaining set objectives, are the main ingredients to any program of civil service reforms. In sum, the experience of Botswana in managing civil service reforms can be aptly described as springing from a mental attitude that constantly strives for and achieves improvement in changing circumstances.
7. REGIONAL WORKSHOP ON CIVIL SERVICE REFORM IN FRANCOPHONE AFRICA: CASE STUDY - COTE D'IVOIRE

Alexis Hibault

Introduction

Once again, Cote d'Ivoire finds itself at a juncture when it has to make political choices of far-reaching consequences. It is faced with a number of unavoidable constraints over which it has no or very little control. The 3.8 percent growth rate of the population will cause it to double in eighteen years. The economy is still heavily dependent on external markets and agriculture has almost reached its optimum level of development. In such an environment, the choices to be made by the state, particularly with regard to the public service, will determine its capacity to quickly and effectively mobilize the maximum resources. To take up the challenges of the end of this century, it needs a strong, competent and efficient administration, attentive to the needs of the state, the citizens and the economic agents. It will, therefore, be necessary to draw up strategies and especially management methods for the major state departments to enable the administration to be, more than ever, an engine for development.

Cote d'Ivoire's case study tries to show the close correlation between the organizational development of the country's administration and its socioeconomic development. This case study will illustrate the basic role of certain organizational methods as well as the slippages that have hastened up and deepened the crisis. It will also show that what brings about a successful reform does not so much lie in the ability to analyze issues or propose solutions, but in the will and ability to implement the proposed solutions.

Cote d'Ivoire's case study will clearly show that:

- there can be no major reform without real political will at the top;
- significant changes may result where such a will exists and is demonstrated by effective implementation strategies;
- reforms which have been most successful are those that have had direct coordination at the highest governmental level.

Evolution Of Cote D'Ivoire's Administration Since The Colonial Period

Emergence Of The Administration In Cote d'Ivoire

Cote d'Ivoire's administration has emerged from the colonial administration. The colonial era's administration had a material and statutory infrastructure for the technical aspects which
served as a support for its presence and operations. The political changes that occurred have not fundamentally influenced the bases of such technical services.

Conversely, the civil service represented for the colonial power, a strictly reserved domain which was run from the metropolis. The colony's administration was conceived and drawn up in Paris or Dakar, and the local official only implemented instructions from Paris or Dakar. The transfer of the focal point of action in the colonial administration started in 1957. Indeed, a decision of 14 May 1957 terminated the duties of Directors and Departmental Heads of the territory appointed until then by the colonial authority. An ordinance of the same date established the Governing Council indicating, at the highest level, the first transfer of responsibility.

Lastly, the powers of ministries, including those of the ministry in charge of the civil service were outlined on 15 May 1957. These legal instruments not only created Côte d'Ivoire's administration, but also initiated the first actions of administrative reform which has since then continued to evolve.

Development Of The Administration

From the time of independence (1960) till the 1970s, the Ivorian economy saw a period of rapid growth during which the development strategy was characterized by two factors.

A constant enlargement of the administration's tasks and the priority accorded to education led to a rapid increase in the number of state employees. In terms number of staff, the last two decades are characterized by two major phases:

- a take-off, from 1957 to 1963, with the number of employees increasing at a rate of 12.5 percent per annum;
- a period of sustained growth, from 1964 to 1986, with the number of employees increasing at a rate of 8.75 percent per annum to reach 115,000 in 1986.

An increasing and diversified intervention of the state in the economy through a complex institutional mechanism, and especially, on the one hand, by the establishment of a large number of state enterprises and, on the other, by the state's participation in about 150 enterprises. The state's commitment was to ensure increased national presence in the form of capital in the strategic sectors and accelerate the employment of Ivoirien nationals.

In 1979, the state held 50 percent of the capital in all modern sector enterprises listed by the "Centrale des Bilans". The state's direct investments totaling CFA.F 200 billion (US$1 = CFA.F 250) show the dominant position of the public authorities in the production system.

A report on the cost of the civil service in Côte d'Ivoire prepared in 1989 estimated that the number of employees in state enterprises was more than 20,000. Besides, the total number employed by this sector was estimated at nearly 70,000 persons.

If, in terms of the number of civil servants, the "traditional" public sector was much bigger, the parastatal sector, through its economic functions, the volume of investments, the size of its turnover and especially the level of borrowing and the financial burden it represents for the state, has played a significant role in the public finance crisis. To some extent, this situation also explains the interest shown in public administration and the drastic and general measures applied, sometimes without much perspicacity.
Types Of Reform And How They Are Being Carried Out In Côte D'Ivoire

State Of Affairs

If one considers that public administration's main role is to help develop the country, i.e. design, initiate and manage change in all areas, it should be noted that it has not succeeded in fulfilling this role within the context of its structure and current operating system. Since the beginning of the 1960s, shortcomings have been noted in the functioning of the administration. Some of the observations made since the 1960s are still relevant and worth mentioning.

The 1960s.

During the preparatory deliberations on the 1964 Act defining the General Ordinance of the Civil Service, the following observations were made:

- the government's options, especially on recruitment, are not well-applied;
- lack of discipline and the sanctions laid down by the regulations are almost never applied;
- the system is inefficient;
- lack of fairness and equity in the system for rewards and promotions and not only based on effort and merit;
- incompetent employees;
- lack of sense of duty; and
- political officials interfere too often in an untimely manner asking for undeserved benefits on behalf of others;

The 1970s

The following observations were made at the time of drawing up the 1976-1980 five-year plan:

- overstaffing, with employees concentrated in Abidjan;
- the administration has no internal mechanism encouraging greater efficiency;
- the administration is autonomous and almost established as a self-defense system;
- it has lost its main mission as an agent for development;
- it has wide powers in the application of laws and implementation of judgments without such powers being matched with any accountability;
- it is unadapted to its principal mission, that of ensuring overall development;
- it is engaged in a bureaucratic phenomenon which renders uncertain a spontaneous re-adaptation;
- a real parallel administration has been set up with a number of public organs intended to carry out tasks which the normal administration proved incapable of executing. This duplication leads to a disintegration of the administration and break up of the administrative machinery, a widening gap between political functions and economic activities; and
- public and parastatal bodies most of the time undertake independent actions without any defined framework, without the administration exercising its indispensable role as coordinator within the specified context of planning and intersectoral programming objectives.
The 1980s

The document of the 1981-1985 Five-Year Plan recalled that the observations made in the 1976-1980 Plan were still valid, that actions envisaged should be pursued and that it intended to address the following issues:

- lack of an inventory of state functions;
- poor management methods and procedures which lead to loss of time and money;
- difficult and often poor relations between the administration and those administered;
- cumbersome and costly working methods;
- lack of cooperation on the part of the various partners in the administrative process;
- need to make better use of data processing methods;
- need to review the Civil Service Ordinance;
- poor planning methods of human resource requirements;
- weak planning-programming process in all ministries; and
- lack of coherence between medium-term planning and budgetary choices.

Constraints

The Colonial Heritage and its Impact on Côte d'Ivoire's Administration

It is important to closely examine the factors in a nation's past which explain the nature of constraints to progress.

**Continuity.** Given that the country opted for a liberal system, a spirit of openness and cooperation in the early years of independence, most of the civil servants in the colonial administration remained at post at all levels and in all departments. Consequently, there was continuity on wide bases and proven structures but actually there was no drastic change. Indeed, the Ivoirien concept of development was based on stability in change, but it is difficult to say that the change was desired by employees whose practices stemmed from procedures, management methods and choices of persons linked with the interests of the former metropolis.

**Poor Adaptation To Development Needs.** The poor adaptation of the administration to development needs has often been stigmatized and explained as a consequence of the colonial heritage, given that the colonial administration was not designed to satisfy such needs. Indeed, the new administration continued to be strongly marked by the characteristics of the former administration. Although well-structured, the former was designed in the last century to "administer" rather than "develop". Indeed, most of the officials were not trained both in terms of organization and method for the needs of the political situation. This administration therefore had considerable difficulties in fulfilling its basic objective which consisted of developing the country, i.e. conceive, cause and manage change in all areas. This administration was highly centralized and rather formal and has, above all, been a bureaucratic administration.

**Development Of A Parallel Public Sector.** The inability of the present administration to meet the demands of rapid development has led to other solutions that make it possible to get out of the hierarchical constraints that paralyze the traditional administration. This is how an actual parallel administration came into being with the blossoming of public and parastatal organs created to carry out the tasks of economic and social development which the "normal" administration proved incapable of doing.
Influence of Cultural Factors

In particular circumstances, certain aspects of traditional forms of organization may be an asset. But, in many respects, society's traditional forms of organization have seriously influenced attitudes and behaviors against progress in this respect. The importance of the Chief, the limited involvement of citizens in the taking of decisions affecting them, lack of delegation, respect for the elderly, among others, continue to be serious constraints. One of the most pernicious of them is undoubtedly the obligation of solidarity which leads to heavy responsibilities not commensurate with the official remuneration of civil servants.

The Economy and Various Reforms: A Link Between Short-term and Long-term Development Objectives

In view of the rapid population growth rate, the state should make efforts to achieve an economic growth rate that will satisfy the basic needs of Ivoiriens. A growth rate of about 4 percent is therefore necessary to maintain the status quo. To improve the situation, this rate should be exceeded. However, the growth rate depends, among other things, on prices of raw materials and level of investments in infrastructures and productive sectors. Although competitiveness has been partly restored, inflation brought under control and figures and facts show a relatively high level of activity, the level of private investment and growth of employment have remained inadequate. However, the results of adjustment measures adopted in recent years, in real terms and through the devaluation, as well as the development of new resources, give cause for moderate optimism.

To achieve the desired growth rates, the initiatives and support of the state machinery—and mainly that of public administration—should play a significant role. Among the necessary activities which to a large extent fall within the scope of public administration, mention may be made of:

- the return to a more rigorous and long-term planning of state actions within the framework of a strategy which, by recognizing the importance of short-term budgetary constraints, should, in addition, take account of social, political and cultural factors as well as the long-term effects of the measures proposed;

- the establishment of a statutory and fiscal framework which offers incentives;

- the accelerated mobilization of available internal and external resources but which calls for certain actions on the part of public administration;

- the speeding-up of agricultural redeployment towards greater diversification and moving from an extensive cultivation model—which has reached its saturation point—to an intensive cultivation model.

The Budget, a Necessary Tool for Conducting and Interpreting Constantly Changing Government Actions

To maintain the new trends observed in the economy, it is extremely important to keep the major expenditures in balance. State expenditures—and particularly personnel expenditures—should therefore be kept under close surveillance. Budget performance matrices have been
prepared for the major budget items and have been the subject of negotiations with donors. The performances achieved will determine their financial assistance. Moreover, the government's margin of maneuver will also depend on the ability of the state to increase internal resources mobilization. This ability depends, in turn, on the availability of resources and the capacity of public administration (customs, taxes etc.) to mobilize them. It is such constraints which will call for the carrying out on fiscal and budgetary reforms. However, there is some inertia in undertaking a major fiscal and budgetary reform and this continues to be a hindrance to improving the budget framework.

*The Effect of Population Growth Rate on the State's Fight against the Social Aspects of Underdevelopment*

The current demographic growth rate of 3.8 percent will double the population in eighteen years. The nation's needs will also double over the same period. The movement of populations to settle in urban centers also creates new needs in the areas of infrastructure, health and education. Moreover, the drop in per capita income resulting in a decrease in purchasing power, coupled with a reduction in the state's financial capacities, have led, over the past decade or so, to a decline in meeting the social service requirements of the population. If the pre-crisis situation is to be restored and improved, it will be necessary to mobilize new resources and especially make better use of existing ones. Such constraints will be a real challenge for the government in the coming years, a challenge which must, of course, be taken up by the public administration.

*Political Responsibility in the Face of the Demands of an Efficient and Neutral Administration*

Public administration is first and foremost a government instrument to help it achieve its targets. Given the close links between the political and administrative spheres, the characteristics of political functioning will affect the functioning of the administration. The functioning of the administration should therefore be adapted to the new political environment, and especially democratization, decentralization and a wider scope of maneuver available to organized social groups.

*Consequences On The Functioning And Efficiency Of The Administration*

The constraints noted above have had and continue to have major repercussions on the functioning and efficiency of the administration, and have led to a growing imbalance between the demand for services traditionally provided by the state and the reduced capacity of the latter to provide such services.

In terms of demand, as we have seen, the increase in population and the need to raise its standards of living create considerable needs which are constantly on the increase. Moreover, given the decrease in purchasing power resulting from the effects of the adjustment measures, the population's capacity to contribute has considerably declined with the result that unsatisfied needs keep on growing.

For several years, the provision of services by the administration has seen a relative quantitative stagnation and an undoubted qualitative deterioration. This situation stems from the effects of the constraints we have mentioned, including:

- decrease in the state's resources as a result of the recession;
• allocation of resources which favors the maintenance of salary expenditures to the
detriment of other operating costs. This has led to a situation where a large number of
public services can no longer function properly and some are completely paralyzed.
The health and education sectors are the most affected, and one of the objectives of the
programs in these sectors is to provide them with the indispensable means of operation
(teaching inputs for the education sector and consumable medical items for the health
sector);

• demotivation and demoralization of state employees: the decline in their purchasing
power, the widespread opinion that they are mainly responsible for the difficult
financial situation, and the credence given to this view by the priority accorded the
personnel and their wage bill by the adjustment programs have caused a growing
demoralization and demotivation manifested in several ways: (i) lateness, lack of
assiduity and initiative, poor attitude to the public who are users of public services, red
tape and negligence, bad example set by superiors, lack of supervision and monitoring
of subordinates; (ii) this demoralization as well as the rather poor working conditions
and declining purchasing power lead to strategies of adaptation such as the provision of
services in return for money, corruption, extortion and abuse of power. Such attitudes
constitute a strong obstacle to any initiative that would call into question such
practices.

Specific Actions To Reform Côte D'Ivoire's Administration

The 1960s

Côte d'Ivoire's administration showed concern at an early stage about the problems of cost
and efficiency of its reform action. A reform process was initiated as far back as 1963 aimed at
adapting the regulations to national realities, taking into account the government's options,
particularly as regards recruitment, and strengthening the administration. Act 64-488 dealing with
the General Civil Service Ordinance entered into force on 21 December 1964.

In spite of the improvements made by the new Civil Service Ordinance, the problems
persisted especially that of strengthening coordination in administrative reform by involving all the
technical ministries and representatives of the National Assembly and Economic and Social
Council in the activities of the ministry in charge of the Civil Service. In response to this, the
"Comité National de Réforme Administrative (CNRA)" was created on 12 June 1968 by decree 68-
296 dated 12 June 1968. However, the creation of CNRA only partly solved the problem. In fact,
CNRA was only a consultative organ without specific attributes and was therefore unable to
institute a really effective reform process.

The 1971-1975 Five-Year Plan

The document of this five-year plan is of the view that the administration's tasks and
structures should be determined by the prime objective which is development. It recognizes that
"we are far from our set target and the administrative machinery inherited is far from achieving the
desired goal".
**The 1976-1980 Five-Year Plan**

The overall objective is to "transform Côte d'Ivoire's current administration into one for development, i.e. into an administration adapted to the country's specific conditions and to the implementation of the development policy."

Operational objectives:

- change of the current image of Côte d'Ivoire's administration through: (i) reform of ENA; ii) review of the Civil Service Ordinance; (iii) raising the public service image; (iv) regular and precise briefing for civil servants.
- reform of the management structures and methods of Côte d'Ivoire's administration through: (i) measures intended to eliminate existing overlapping in the traditional administration and public and parastatal organs; (ii) design and establishment of a management system based on specific tasks; iii) measures intended to bring closer the administration and those administered; and
- raising of the Ivoirien population's awareness of, and participation in, the national cause.

**Other Initiatives Of The Period**

**Institutionalization of the Administrative Reform**

Decree N° 77-903 of 4 November 1977 provides for the reorganization of CNRA and establishes the "Secrétariat Général à la Réforme Administrative (SGRA)". This Secretariat is an organ of the ministry in charge of administrative reform and assists it in its task of implementing, coordinating and monitoring the reform process. The following actions were defined for the period 1981-1985:

- a strategy for the administrative reform;
- methodology of studies to be carried out;
- a detailed work program; and
- determining the kind of studies to be conducted.

**Communal Reform**

Côte d'Ivoire has initiated an ambitious program of decentralization. In this context, the communal reform is the most significant factor. Act 78-07 of 9 January 1978 institutes autonomous communes in Côte d'Ivoire and creates twenty-six new communes. In all, 135 municipalities have been created and since then, with the support of IBRD and USAID, a vast municipal development program has been implemented. However, although this reform is very ambitious on paper, its results are not yet fully satisfactory. The following observations must still be made:

- municipal governments' relationships with citizens still leaves much to be desired: the people do not appreciate the demands of communal taxation in regard to their rights as citizens;
- the institutional environment is not suitable for the demands of communal development; and
- Communal management capacities are still weak.
This reform must therefore be pursued.

**The 1981-1985 Five-Year Plan**

In its chapter entitled "administration for development", the 1981-1985 five-year plan outlined four main policies:

- improving the efficiency of the administration within the context of administrative reform;
- implementing the reform of state enterprises and public institutions;
- developing participatory and promotion structures; and
- strengthening the planning and programming process.

**Improving Efficiency of the Administration.** Three central themes were adopted, namely management and control issues, personnel issues, regional and local organization (decongestion and decentralization).

**The Parastatal Sector.** Implementing the reform of state enterprises and public institutions.

**Strengthening of Participation and Coordination Structures.** Support for the cooperative sector and encouragement of private enterprise.

**Pre-eminence of the Planning and Programming Process**

**Beginning Of The Economic Crisis: First Austerity Measures In The Public Sector**

**The First Structural Adjustment Programs (SAP)**

With the support of the World Bank, the government embarked upon a structural adjustment program in 1981 through three loans provided in 1981, 1983 and 1986. With this SAP, the government started applying a series of stabilization measures, including those aimed at controlling and reducing public expenditures and stabilizing losses in the parastatal sector.

The effect of such measures was particularly significant on public administration and the parastatal sector as well as on public sector services provided by the state. In fact, the adjustment measures affected not only public and parastatal sector employees but also, and especially, the general population for whom the administration provides services.

**The 1984 IMF Stand-by Agreement**

An agreement was signed with the International Monetary Fund (IMF) in May 1984. In the area of administration and the public sector, the following measures were envisaged:

- putting a stop to recruitment in the public sector;
- maintaining the salary freeze, suspension of promotions, automatic non-replacement of staff leaving the service;
- reduction of technical assistance staff; and
- conducting a census of civil servants.
The point here is the degree of success in calling into question any system by a bold and far reaching reform. Indeed, if it has been possible to carry out a radical reform within a relatively short period in a system which seemed unshakable, then there is hope with regard to reform of other sectors of the public administration.

The restructuring of the parastatal sector was a voluntary reform and demonstrated a strong political will. During the July 1977 reshuffle, a body known as "Ministère chargé de la Réforme des Sociétés d'Etat (MERSE)" was set up to carry out this reform. MERSE was assigned two objectives right from its establishment:

- In the short term, "rid the State of enterprises whose performance has turned out to be negative in terms of the results expected"; and
- in the long term, "provide those that will remain with a legal and administrative structure to enable them operate under efficient and profitable conditions".

Public opinion regarded these objectives as unrealistic, for the reform of the system put at stake considerable resources, a source of covetousness with all the ensuing consequences.

On 12 June 1980, the Head of State convened the National Council—a body regrouping senior party members and officials of the country's organized groups—and outlined measures that were proposed following MERSE deliberations held jointly with other ministries. Many organs were dissolved, others reorganized and placed under direct state control, while others were transferred to the private sector. Legislative instruments of 13 September 1980 and decrees enacted at the beginning of 1981 give a legal backing to these measures. Made public in 1977 and actually launched in 1980, this reform spread over several years and affected a large number of organs both in terms of their staff and leaders, as well as many interest groups.

Among the measures were:

- redefinition of the status of state enterprises and public institutions;
- liquidation and reclassification of certain enterprises;
- institution of stricter accounting and financial control;
- reduction of the wage bill;
- retrenchment of personnel;
- sale of State shares in semi-public corporations;
- thorough review of conditions and procedures in awarding administrative contracts;
- tightening of the state's approval policy.

Observations: Several aspects of this reform engage attention and provide factors to explain the reasons behind the success of a reform considered difficult.
National Origin of the Reform.

The initial preparatory measures for the reform—creation of a ministry in charge thereof, launching of studies, dissolution of a few organs etc.—date back to 1977 which was, nevertheless, a profitable year in terms of public finance. At that time, the donors' intervention was still limited and a study of the practical modalities of the reform had suggested a high degree of autonomy for state authorities. It was, therefore, a reform which involved a program wished for and designed by the Ivoirien government.

A Strong Political Will

The Head of State took the initiative and gave his full backing to the reform. This will was demonstrated by an effective design and implementation strategy.

An Effective Implementation Strategy

A strong institutional framework: creation of an ad hoc ministry, and its leadership were critical to design and tasking implementation machinery for the reform.

Participation in the drawing up process:

- MERSE started its operations in close collaboration with the Ministry of Economy and Finance, and with the expertise of the collaborators of this ministry;
- at each stage of designing the program, MERSE took the trouble to inform and solicit the approval of the Council of Ministers;
- at the design up stage, many discussions were held between senior ministry officials. Corrections and policy reorientations were made.

Lessons Learned

The salient points which characterized the reforms are:

- political will must be clearly demonstrated;
- internalization and national approval for the program as well as reduction of the mechanisms of indifference and rejection often shown when programs are designed, drawn up and imposed from outside with minimum collaboration on the part of those who should implement them;
- institutional framework adapted to the stakes, multisectoral aspects and hierarchical structures; the hierarchical level adopted for this framework is fundamental; and
- good circulation of information to ensure the participation of the entire citizenry.

UNDP Project (1986-1990)

The project aimed at improving the management of state employees through the ministry in charge of the civil service to ensure better control of personnel, and then extend the exercise to the entire administration (Organic Executives).

The project comprised the following activities:
reorganization of the Personnel Management Division which led to its restructuring into management units whose scope of work was determined by reference to the technical ministries;
- assistance in the study of personnel management procedures in relation to this reorganization;
- reform of state enterprises: analysis of draft decrees on the creation or reorganization of state enterprises and assistance in drafting and outlining measures of application of the legislation determining the general regulations on state enterprises;
- assistance in the establishment of the Programming and Staff Control Division;
- census of state employees in 1984;
- municipal reform exercise involving the drafting of regulations, decrees and ordinances concerning the essential areas dealt with by the reform as well as the participation of SGRA in the deliberations of the steering committee for a study on investment strategy in towns up-country; and
- carrying out a preliminary study on the establishment of an Administrative Data Bank.

The project, housed within the ministry in charge of the civil service, has only partly achieved its objectives since the results of studies conducted have not been implemented in the field.


The aim was to decompartmentalize the administration to bring about professional mobility and thereby facilitate internal adjustments. These new measures are being applied. The activities carried out under the Economic Management Support Project (EMSP), with the drawing up of the National Training Plan, should strengthen the impact.

Recent Initiatives Under The Medium-Term Economic Program

Since 1989, the government has drawn up and implemented a stabilization and recovery program outlined in the "Document Cadre de Politique Economique à Moyen Terme (DCPE)" (Medium-Term Economic Policy Framework Document). The program intended to implement the strategy in two phases:

- a macroeconomic phase comprising, among others, two activities which affect public administration:
  - restoration of the state's financial capacity and re-establishment of the major balances;
  - improvement of the implementation of state and public enterprise activities; and

- a sectoral phase including activities in the sectors of agriculture, industry, finance, energy, water and human resources; these activities comprise actions intended to control costs better, especially through better control of personnel and the wage bill.

To ensure the smooth implementation of its medium-term economic program, the government, with the help of its partners, has drawn up a set of projects and programs, several of which have direct links with public departments. These programs may be regrouped according to their areas of activity. Some of them happen to be in several groups at the same time. The regrouping may be done as follows:
Programs within the scope of the state enterprises restructuring exercise:

- **Privatization program**: initiated since 1990 and the focal point of a legislation since 1994, the privatization exercise is being pursued and concerns some sixty enterprises. It encourages greater investment and employment in the most dynamic enterprises and enables the development of national shareholding. Twenty-seven enterprises have so far been privatized;

- **Program of Voluntary Departures**: implementation of this program poses the problem of the departure of a large number of experienced civil servants, especially in the field of education and health;

- the National Agricultural Sector Adjustment Program; and

- the Road Maintenance Program.

Program of support for the control of personnel and wage bill:

- the Economic Management Support Program (EMSP)

Programs contributing directly to the improvement of economic and administrative performance:

- the Human Resources Development Program;
- the Adjustment and Rehabilitation Program of the Ministry of Education;
- the Financial Administration Support Program - including public accounts reform; and
- budget reform under EMSP.

**Economic Management Support Program (EMSP)**

**Overall Objective**

The overall objective of EMSP is to provide the government with the necessary logistic, human and financial capacities, on the one hand, for designing up a favorable macroeconomic framework and, on the other, for the implementation of a general economic policy and sectoral programs capable of restoring durable and sustained economic growth.

**Content: 3 Major Phases**

**Economic and Financial Management**

**Tax Reform.** Taxes have been reduced in order to consolidate the control of inflation and support incentives for investment. Mention may be made of the reduction of VAT, the waiving of tax on salaries and the tariff reform on customs duties. However, these measures are only timid actions which form part of a set of necessary marginal measures. A major tax reform needs to be introduced if Côte d'Ivoire wishes to set itself free from the debt burden.

**Budget Reform.** New policy guidelines on public accounts and the single budget have been outlined. They will be presented to the National Assembly within the context of a finance bill
and become operational in 1997. These new guidelines as well as their accompanying measures will enable the rationalization of administrative channels and better control of the entire public sector treasury. More particularly, the budget reform, through the single budget, should make it possible to have a better view of state expenditures and resources. Lastly, this reform should lead to a better appreciation of the impact of investments.

Parastatal Sector Reform

The focal point of the reform this time concerns the issues of management and performance control to help improve management performance, bring about flexibility in supervisory control, qualitative improvement of control, and accountability of leaders. The performance of leaders will be measured particularly on the basis of their ability to produce regular and positive results, produce within the specified periods reliable financial accounts and ensure the smooth functioning of the management and supervisory organs. An evaluation system based on sanctions and rewards applicable to all staff will be instituted.

Administrative Reform As A Back-Up Measure For Economic Reforms

This reform involves the following actions:
- consolidation of the census results through the harmonization of pay card indexes and the civil service as well as the establishment of a multiple access integrated data base system.
- institution of new methods and procedures for controlling the wage bill and personnel; and
- carrying out preliminary studies for a general civil service reform program.

Legal and judicial reform: attempt at strengthening the judiciary

This reform involves the following actions:
- strengthening of the capacity of the Ministry of Justice to manage the sector;
- management of legal and judicial information;
- modernization of economic legislation; and
- training.

Legal and judicial reform poses the thorny problem of the institutional framework for business in the economic sense of the term. If this reform is successfully implemented, it would provide a good institutional framework within which there would be prospects for commercial and industrial development.

Project Cost. The cost of the project amounts to CFA.F 9.5 billion (US$1 =250 CFA.F). Allocation priorities were decided in favor of the key departments in the financial sector. However, the facilities provided did not make it possible to carry out an overall reform. However, since the objective of EMSP were outlined at the beginning, it is hoped that the prospects for financing an institutional strengthening project capable of laying special emphasis on corrective actions during crisis situations will be clearly understood by all.

Financing. The project is being jointly financed by the World Bank (group leader) and "Coopération Française".
Structure of the Project. The general administration of EMSP has been entrusted to the Ministry of Economy and Finance which is in charge of the macroeconomic aspect. Officials of technical structures are in charge of their units. The Director of Studies and Administrative Organization of the ministry in charge of labor and the civil service will be responsible for administrative reform.

Carrying out the Administrative Reform

Objectives and Activities

Objective 1. Rationalize the sources of information on the computers of the Ministry of Labor and the Civil Service and the Pay Division of the Ministry of Finance from the data base created through the census.

Activities: Installation of data processing equipment.

Objective 2. Design and apply systems and procedures to enhance staff and wage bill control, and improve management.

Activities:

Improvement of computerized system of management through:

- harmonization of existing data files at the Ministry of Labor and the Civil Service with those of the Ministry of Finance;
- keeping of autonomous data files (budget, pay, civil service);
- use of harmonized and interconnected software product; and
- partial decentralization towards the ministries.

Forward Planning Management Process:

- census of state employees and computerization of data files resulting therefrom;
- updating of data on staff; production of "staff status"; study of posts / quantitative phase; report on overstaffing and possible understaffing; production of flow charts on activities / staff; study of posts / qualitative phase; compilation of personnel data base comprising information on initial training of an employee, his/her professional career, any further training had, etc.;
- evaluating staff strength - current and target - per division and post-function to have an "organic framework"; and
- preparation of budget estimate.

Improvement of Qualifications and Skills:

- identification of jobs and job profiles;
- evaluation of skills and assessment of training needs (staff category A: executives);
- drawing up of a training scheme: stages of this preparation are the following:
  * identification of main duties carried out;
  * taking a sample of 200 representative;
  * description of functions;
* validation of these analyses with those holding positions;
* identification of priority training needs through individual or group discussions;
* determining the content and implementation of a national training scheme;

Other Activities:
Rationalization of the system of bonuses and allowances
Establishment of an Administrative Data Bank (ADB);
Support for drawing up a chart for job forecasts;
Support for the Staff Programming and Control Division;
Establishment of the new Civil Service General Ordinance; and
Codification of the principal administrative procedures.

Objective 3. Conducting preliminary studies the planning of general reform of the management of the civil service. Of these studies, mention should be made of studies and legislative bills on rehabilitation and strengthening of inspection. This action, which forms part of the institutional strengthening program, was taken into account by EMSP during the mid-term review. It has a dual objective:

* establishing a system of control of projects implemented by the public sector; and
* serving as a link between government action and the Office of the President. By making the Office of President, through the IGE, supervise administrative reform activities, this second objective seems to be a solution to the poor collaboration between technical ministries in the reform process.

Conduct of Operation

The Ministry of Labor and the Civil Service is in charge of "administrative reform". The Coordinator is the Director of Studies and Administrative Organization (DSAO).

Immediate Results

* effects on personnel and wage bill: personnel and wage bill trend stabilized;
* report on overstaffing and understaffing;
* establishment of a "civil service" data base;
* establishment of a data base for better management of careers and skills;
* establishment of a system of "activities/personnel" flow charts to ensure better correlation between activities and personnel;
* rationalization of organization, work procedures and methods;
* installation of equipment; and
* drawing-up of a national training scheme.

Eventual Impacts

* consultation and consensus between administrators of the ministries in charge of finance and the civil service as well as technical ministries;
* raising the awareness of officials of all departments to the demands of personnel management;
* upgrading of the "personnel" function and improving personnel managers' skills at all levels; and
• control of staff and better monitoring of wage bill.

Evaluation And Recommendations

General Observations

- From the early days of the administration, and even during periods of prosperity, analyses and action programs have been ongoing activities;

- for thirty years, the same observations and recommendations have been made at regular intervals, although very little reference is made to past observations and initiatives. This situation should be a barometer to critically assess the will to effect any change on the part of the authorities and the government machinery, as well as the relevance of the analyses and strategies for carrying out reforms. This justifies the need for keeping track of administrative records and good coordination of all government activities;

- budgetary considerations have always played a key role in all reflections and decision-making;

- the dominant financial logic has often overshadowed other dimensions of the actions of public organs;

- the strictly quantitative and financial approach has shown its limitations. Admitted that the rationalization of allocation and resource utilization should be always pursued as an objective, it is, nevertheless, true that the institutional, psychological, social and political aspects as well as considerations of equity, access to basic services and their quality should be taken into account; and.

- the development of the political environment will also bring about profound changes both in terms of the expression of needs and the framework within which government action should be pursued.

Lastly, the reform of government action has been and is still necessary. But, at present, numerous constraints show the limitations of the mode of thinking and the strategies so far adopted. It will, therefore, be necessary to further consider government action in all its ramifications and create an administration whose modus operandi has to be defined. A strong political will and effective implementation strategies are essential conditions to carry out the necessary reforms.

Impact Of The Reforms On The Public Sector

The impacts and effects expected from a project such as EMSP have been briefly described in the text on the project. Such impacts clearly show the extent and limits of the reform activities in Côte d'Ivoire. To assess the impact of all the reforms, it is necessary to examine the impacts of the three main groups of programs.

Without going into details for each of these programs, the following observations should be made:
• the number of personnel and the proportions of the wage bill have been contained within reasonable limits;
• significant progress has been made in the area of human resource management. At the Ministry of Education, nearly half of whose staff are civil servants, the census of staff made it possible to build a computerized data file of the personnel. This data file, regularly updated, is the first step in the control of numbers and improvement of personnel management.
• the Human Resources Development Program which should improve the internal and external efficiency of the education/employment and health/population sectors has had encouraging results with regard to budgetary objectives and improvement of planning tools. As regards management methods, enhancement in the quality of services, improvement of access to services and implementation of population policy, the results expected have not been achieved;
• the Financial Administrations Support Program is proceeding smoothly. However, although the capacity of state revenue collection has improved, it is below the country's potential. and
• the impact of the reforms on the level of motivation of state employees has been negative as a result of the continuing decline of their purchasing power over more than ten years, worsened by the effects of the devaluation (January 1995), and because of poor communications with state employees.

Difficulties Encountered By Recent Initiatives

Lack Of Involvement Of The Organs Concerned

As in most programs and projects, certain implementation difficulties are caused by poor design. The organs which are to benefit from the support have not been adequately involved in the drawing-up of projects and the modalities of their implementation. Lack of involvement may lead to poor analyses and shortcomings in implementation strategy; in short, weaknesses in the very design of the projects. This may also lead to a passive attitude on the part of the organs concerned, an attitude which, in a number of cases, may become negative.

Among the factors which explain this situation, it is worth emphasizing the priority and urgency accorded, at that time, to short-term financial considerations. Indeed, the project had been accorded priority in terms of budgetary considerations to the detriment of psychological, political and social aspects. At the time the project was being drawn up, the government was faced with serious treasury problems and one of the main objectives consisted in obtaining additional aid from the donors at the earliest. For this, one of the main preliminary conditions was the adoption of a series of measures meant to ensure better control and reduction of state expenditures. Since operating expenses excluding salaries had already been reduced to a strict minimum - and in certain cases eliminated - measures to "rationalize" staff numbers and control personnel costs had become unavoidable. The urgency accorded the drafting of the basic text of the project then prohibited the involvement of a large number of organs. A second effect of the urgency and focus on budgetary considerations is the scant account taken of the socio-political and psychological aspects as well as the special requirements of the public service and a certain lack of imagination in the search for additional strategies.
Lack Of Information And Communication

In the absence of adequate efforts to improve the flow information and communication channels, the motivations and objectives of the program have often been wrongly interpreted. The aim of "rationalization" has often been perceived only in terms of reducing staff, and constituting a threat to the interests of certain groups.

Lack Of Support On The Part Of The Authorities

The design processes did not have the adequate support of the authorities. This situation will have repercussions on the credibility of projects and programs and make their implementation more difficult. This will lead to more difficult problems of coordination.

Difficulties Related to Management Methods

The reform projects are mainly a set of reforms comprising a large number of activities whose implementation involves many parties—individuals, institutions, ministries and divisions. They call for new initiatives, collaboration and high-level coordination and, lastly, a tremendous amount of work. In this type of projects, performance depends largely on the institutional framework established. This framework must include a structure which enjoys considerable prestige and has the necessary authority to ensure good coordination between the parties. It should also have adequate technical capacity with the required skills, resources and especially adequate time to achieve the set targets.

Difficulties Related to the Need for Coordination

Most projects which involve several ministries and/or institutions are faced with coordination problems at several levels:

- coordination between departments or units of a same ministry;
- coordination between various divisions;
- coordination with autonomous institutions but whose assistance or support is often indispensable;
- coordination between different projects pursuing similar objectives or being implemented in the same sectors; and
- coordination between donors.

Other Difficulties

Weak information systems leading to:

- imprecise knowledge about the resources available and how they are utilized; this weakness has caused difficulty for the Ministry Labor and the Civil Service in building a complete and reliable data base and will call for the development of mechanisms to improve the tracking of information from the decentralized organs to the Ministry;
- difficulty in monitoring and evaluating the functioning of the administration; and
- difficulty in making precise diagnoses, drawing-up and implementing corrective strategies;

Poor planning and management mainly due to:
- poor human resource utilization;
- lack of training in modern management techniques;
- absence of management by objectives;
- weak control mechanisms;
- lack of motivation systems and accountability.

Inadequate involvement of officials of ministries other than the one in charge of the civil service in the reform exercise.

A high degree of inertia on the part of public administration which stems from both the complexity of interactions between groups and the importance of the issues at stake.

Lack of structural and budgetary flexibility which has a direct influence on taxation. Indeed, the prime objective of the recent reforms is to reduce staff through the modernization of working tools and methods to make it possible - as part of the process of reorganizing national activities - to reduce state expenditures, and thereby those of enterprises through a relative decrease in tax deductions. Enterprises whose tax burdens are reduced will operate in an environment that would enable them to reorganize their activities and, where possible, to recruit those who might have been laid off in the public and parastatal sectors. However, the reality as regards the time difference between the application of measures and obtaining results in terms of the first socially painful actions, is quite another thing. If the populations concerned do not have the required patience and serious efforts are not made to absorb the serious shocks, the socio-political situation runs the risk of becoming explosive.

Difficulties Of Reinsertion

The civil servants laid off and made to retire are often experienced officials whose replacement may pose problems, as in the case of many teachers and nursing staff. Those laid-off experience difficulties of reinsertion on the labor market because the economic recovery is not yet reflected by a demand for skills which the laid off civil servants could satisfy and because the decentralization process which should create the need for administrative skills is not yet adequately developed. To make the labor market more flexible and more efficient, a new Labor Code has been adopted. The institutional framework for labor has been strengthened by the establishment of a labor monitoring mechanism and the "Agence d'Etudes et de Promotion de l'Emploi (AGEPE)" in charge, among other things, of supporting the various activities intended to improve the labor market.

Solutions For The Future

Conditions

The history of reform of the administration in Côte d'Ivoire shows that any far-reaching initiative intended to bring about real improvements is subject to three essential conditions

- the political will be reflected through the Head of State;
- a strong institutional machinery for implementation, placed above the ministries, equipped with a small, competent and motivated staff; and
- the provision of adequate human and material resources.
Recommendations

Reform Programs and Projects

- Base every reform approach on prior analysis/diagnosis which takes account of the following factors:
  * examine the diagnosis made in the past as well as analysis of causes;
  * make the diagnosis by taking account of situations observed compared to those desired;
  * examine previously implemented projects and programs and draw lessons of successes and failures;
  - during project design, factor in associate partners whose assistance will be required during implementation;
  - Plan on implementing information/communication programs intended on a priority basis for people, groups and institutions whose support has not been won;
  - Ensure coordination and coherence with other programs, especially those financed by donors.

Project Management and Implementation

- Particular attention to be paid to the planning of implementation. This should be carried out in detail and monitored with computer facilities. It should include monitoring and evaluation mechanisms that help to immediately detect slippages and difficulties not originally envisaged;
  - establishment of an institutional framework for effective management;
    * monitoring/piloting: a reform program involving several ministries and institutions calls for the collaboration of the various partners. Experience shows that under such conditions, to obtain active collaboration, coordination and monitoring should be at the highest level. Given the importance of the program and its multisectoral aspects, it is advisable that there be regular monitoring by the Office of the Prime Minister. This piloting which is to be done on a monthly or bi-monthly basis, should be taken over by a monitoring and inter-ministerial coordination body. The composition of this body should be decided at the ministerial level with the assistance of the divisions;
  * technical management: it is advisable that the day-to-day management be entrusted to a permanent secretariat headed by an experienced senior executive solely responsible for this body, and which will have technical support whenever necessary. The technical secretariat should have formally established sectoral units; and

- mobilization and maintaining the collaboration of partners and advocates of the reform.

Given the significance of the changes brought about by the reform program, the need for active support on the part of numerous individuals and institutions, and the effect that the changes
may have on the wider public, a continuous mobilization to ensure support for the program should be envisaged. This mobilization, initially related to internalization, should be addressed, not only during the period of the drawing-up of the program, but till the end of implementation. This is indispensable for several reasons, and especially:

* to overcome the natural inertia of bureaucracy;
* to resist the natural opposition of groups whose interests are at stake;
* to avoid the chronic instability of senior executives at a certain level of the public service while ensuring a constant renewal of competent persons.

To maintain effective collaboration, a targeted information / education / communication strategy is called for. This should include initiatives directed at the partners and especially those who may be identified as "hesitant" and/or poorly-informed. Specific initiatives should be targeted towards particular groups as well as the wider public and its opinion leaders.

**Staff motivation**

The Ministry for of Labor and the Civil Service has conducted studies to formulate a system of incentives to ensure better participation of state employees in the administration's program and especially a system for rationalization of allowances, bonuses and various benefits in public administration. Motivation may be developed through the following actions:

- improvement of personnel management techniques and revision of modes of remuneration;
- modernization of management methods and especially the development of management, planning and budget information systems to clearly define tasks and objectives at all levels;
- institution of a system of accountability accompanied by more effective rewards/sanctions.

**From Civil Service Reform To Institutional Strengthening**

Some of the problems encountered as a result of the priority given to budgetary considerations to the detriment of other important issues public service reform, especially access to it by the largest numbers, have been ignored. It is, therefore, necessary to consider management and human resources development as important factors of a multifaceted approach, the objective of which is to improve the efficiency of public administration. The approach which consists in reforming the civil service should be part of a series of other initiatives meant to achieve a better balance between the supply and demand of public services.

A study of such initiatives shows that:

- all sectors are involved;
- similar strategies are adopted in such reform programs across countries: strengthening of capacities for situation analysis, formulating policies as well as planning and management capacities; redeployment of state-assigned tasks and devolution of certain activities to the private sector; rationalization of resource allocation; mobilization of new resources; improvement of efficiency and quality of services etc; and
- many donors are involved in this exercise.
Such initiatives come up against several difficulties:

- difficulties of management in the civil service and more particularly, the lack of competent middle-level executives, weak mechanisms for drawing up and implementing budgets, and contract award procedures; lack of incentives and accountability, sense of fairness and equity in grades, salaries and job security; and

- no link between initiatives, and the absence of a technical body or political authority to ensure this link. This leads to duplication of efforts, incompatibility and unexpected results. It would be ideal to try and ensure, through appropriate measures, overall coherence, given the myriad of initiatives and to seek to develop synergies. The strengthening of the "Inspection Générale d'Etat" should contribute to solving this problem.

Beyond the "human resources" aspect, the objective should be to improve the functioning of public services. In this perspective, there is need to consider other resources: financial, material as well as intangible ones. Of the latter, it is to emphasize the importance of information, indispensable at all stages, but also culture, social organization, etc. Ways of mobilizing such resources as well as their allocation and implementation should also be considered.

Finally, account should also be taken of the ongoing democratization and decentralization process which offers opportunities but also imposes new constraints and demands. Indeed, the strengthening of democratic institutions provides a more appropriate framework for the development of an administration better-monitored and controlled, the actions of which are more transparent. Decentralization will lead to a rapprochement between the administration and those administered and offer the latter better opportunities to make their contribution. Besides, the administration may become, more than before, the link between groups, and this situation creates new constraints, the impact of which cannot yet be assessed.

All these considerations, the improvement of links and coordination of initiatives already started, as well as proposed fresh initiatives to bring about radical changes in administrative practices and attitudes should represent the framework of a vast support project for the public sector and for the development of its management capacities, a project referred to as "institutional strengthening".

Conclusion

At the end of this study, four observations can be made:

- in Côte d'Ivoire, there have been many reforms in several areas and sectors without any global policy on administrative reform;

- there has been no clear definition of the strategy of administrative reform and its corollary in terms of stated objectives and specifically-determined institutional means.

- there is lack of coordination in all the reforms and the last few years have seen ministries carry out reforms almost unilaterally. In the case of decentralization, economic reforms have had administrative implications (parastatal sector reform, privatization); and

- in tandem with the absence of an evaluation of social impacts, budgetary objectives have dominated all other aspects.
However, with the experience gathered and maturity attained by the Côte d'Ivoire administration, it is possible to carry out coherent administrative reforms, solid its design and time-frame, and resolutely geared towards the building of an effective and strong state without, however, being intrusive. The state's institutional capacity strengthening project, the reform of the "Inspection Générale des Services Publics" and implementation of the single budget are the forerunners of this desired state of affairs.
8. FROM MODERNIZATION OF THE ADMINISTRATION TO GOVERNANCE: BURKINA FASO

Mme Juliette Bonkoungou

Introduction

Burkina Faso became an independent nation on August 5, 1960. The country has a constitutional system with a secular, republican government. Presidential elections were held in December 1991, followed by parliamentary elections (May 1992) and municipal elections (February-March 1995. The country is often cited as a model of political stability and peaceful institutional development.

The Administration

Because of the weakness of the private sector, the civil service plays an important role in the life of the country, particularly as a source of employment. The civil service has 37,000 employees, i.e. 0.39 percent of the total population. Compared to other African countries, the size of the civil service in Burkina Faso is thus quite small. Nevertheless, it has steadily grown, indeed by a factor of six since 1960. Despite the relatively small size of the civil service, the wage bill consumes an ever-growing share of the national budget. Staff expenditures (for both civil and military personnel) have exceeded 50 percent since 1975 and rose from an average of 54 percent of total recurrent expenditures in the period 1985-87 to 69 percent for the year 1988-89.

The management system of the Burkina Faso civil service has always been, and continues to be, based on the principle of career service, governed by a statute and guaranteeing job security. In connection with efforts to modernize the administration, however, discussions have been held with a view to combining the career system with an employment system.

Efforts to Introduce Administrative Reform since Independence

In the wake of independence the public administration of Burkina Faso, as in most other African countries, appeared to be the most appropriate instrument for promoting the economic and social development of the country, given the inadequacy or lack of private initiative. This notion of the government as the engine of development logically led to a greater focus on public administration and, in particular, the civil service. Specifically, there was a call to reform the civil service in order to increase its capacity to promote development.

In practice, Law 22/AL of 1959, which was based on the French model and which established a career civil service, appeared to be poorly adapted to the social and economic context of Burkina Faso. A further complaint was that numerous exceptions and waivers were incorporated into specific statutes because of labor union pressure. This was not only a source of
frustration to many civil servants but also ultimately robbed the general statute of any real substance.

However, although civil service reform was officially announced shortly after the coup d'état of February 8 1974, it did not materialize until 1986, when statute AN IV 011 bis/CNR/TRAV of October 25 1986, establishing the General Statute of Public Employees, was adopted, an accomplishment that took twelve years, during which there were five successive regimes and eight ministers of the civil service. The reform targeted three major objectives: universality, justice and reducing the financial burden of the civil service.

The objective of universality was reflected in efforts to standardize the legal classifications then in effect. The notion of 'civil servant' was replaced by that of 'public employee,' i.e. any individual on the payroll of the state or any division thereof. Thus, the new statute applied not only to civil servants in the strict sense, but also to judges and the employees of all local and national authorities and public institutions.

With respect to justice, the reform focused on three main areas:

- narrowing the salary range to a ratio of 1 to 6;
- expanding the staff categories to take into account the academic or professional training of each employee and recognize the difference between employees with significantly different backgrounds; thus, an individual with a Bachelor's degree was no longer classified in the same category as one with a Master's degree; and
- treating temporary employees as civil servants.

No doubt for ideological reasons, it was considered unacceptable to exclude low-level employees of the administration from civil service status.

With respect to financial relief, the main thrust was to adopt a new wage scale (Scale 87). Without jeopardizing the salaries received by civil servants as of December 31 1986, the new scale (with indexes adjusted downward) effectively created a wage freeze for a certain period, in some cases for as long as fifteen years or more.

In spite of its numerous clear advantages, the reform was quickly and vehemently criticized by a majority of public employees, specifically for failing to find a fair balance between the interests of the administration and those of its employees.

This situation would lead, two years later, to a second reform, embodied in Zatu AN VI-008-FP/TRAV of October 26 1988, establishing the General Statute of the Civil Service.

While the 1988 statute remained within the general scope of the preceding one, it did include significant innovations.

---

it applies only to civil servants and not to military personnel, judges and the staff of public institutions and local public authorities, nor to individuals linked to the government by contract; and

it attempts to strike a more satisfactory balance between the interests of the administration and those of its employees and to motivate the latter by revising the wage scale. The new scale limits the effects of the wage freeze.

Overall, the focus of the first reform was on regulating the status of public employees in the belief that an effective civil service statute would translate into more productive and less expensive government.

The second attempt at reform, closely linked to the circumstances leading to the Structural Adjustment Program, took effect in the early 1990s. The primary focus is no longer to reform the General Statute of the Civil Service (although one might think that modifying certain provisions would make it possible to reach the stated objectives) nor to rethink public institutions, even if this is assumed to be necessary.

According to the terms of the first Structural Adjustment Program, signed in 1991, the main focus of the reforms was to re-establish the macro-economic balance, whose breakdown was attributed to, other among things, the fact that the wage bill had risen too rapidly, to the detriment of operating and investment expenditures.

Consequently, the objective of the policy framework paper was to reduce the wage bill from CFAF 57 billion (1990 commitment) to CFAF 54.72 billion in 1991 (i.e. 61 percent of the budget) and CFAF 53.78 billion in 1992-93 (i.e. 59 percent of the budget) and then to continue in the same direction.

These objectives were to be achieved through the following measures:

- early retirements;
- the replacement of retirees in key sectors (education, health, finance) with young, less expensive civil servants;
- the elimination of 50 percent of the housing allowances previously allocated to the Housing Fund; and
- a freeze on the financial impact of promotions within the civil service through 1993;
- finally, appropriate mechanisms to ensure that the savings generated through the above-mentioned measures were protected in the future and that there was no major increase in the wage bill.

(1) Temporary employees treated as civil servants on the basis of the General Statute of 1988 retained their status as civil servants.
(2) This distinction was initially implicit and subsequently formalized by Order 91-0053/PRES of September 5 1991.
Thus, the dominant characteristic of this approach is evidently its clear focus on budgetary and accounting aspects. It is within this context that the ministry charged with modernizing the administration was created in 1991.

Creation Of The Ministry Responsible For Modernization Of The Administration

The former Ministry of Labor, Social Security and the Civil Service was split into two distinct entities in June 1991: the Ministry of Employment, Labor and Social Security and the Ministry of Civil Service and Modernization of the Administration. This reorganization reflected a new political commitment and coincided with the beginning of the Fourth Republic. The justification for this division and, particularly, the establishment of the latter of the two departments, including adoption of a Modernization Action Plan, centered on the inadequate civil service management of previous years.

Justification Of The Modernization Action Plan

In spite of the two statutory reforms of 1986 and 1988, the civil service continued to suffer from inefficiency characterized by:

- the lack of a coherent regulatory framework that clearly defines the powers and responsibilities of the superstructures, and governs the creation, management, monitoring and control of government agencies;
- inadequate day-to-day personnel management, due to several factors including unreliable baseline data (incomplete or nonexistent individual files), significant delays and a lack of statistics on government human resources;
- procedures, work methods and equipment that were outmoded or poorly adapted to the work-load;
- laws and regulations that were inconsistent, incomplete and hard to apply;
- the absence of forward planning in human resources management;
- an inefficient performance evaluation system;
- the lack of an in-service training policy; and
- a complicated and demotivating system of remuneration.

The inefficiency of the civil service, combined with the heavy burden that the wage bill placed on the state budget, had the effect of undermining government policy and, at the same time, mortgaging economic growth. In addition, it imperiled the success of the Development Plans and the Structural Adjustment Program. Thus, there appeared to be an urgent need for a reform program focusing on both the short and long term. Such was the goal of the action plan to modernize the administration.
Objectives

The main objectives of the action plan are to modernize the organization and management of government structures, rehabilitate the human resources management system and improve both the work methods and management techniques of the administration in order to increase its productivity.

Results

The efforts to upgrade baseline data on the day-to-day management of government personnel (individual files with standardized contents) have been completed; a computer file has been compiled with procedures for updating the information. This preliminary work will be consolidated with the census results and standardization will be achieved between the civil service file and the current payroll file.

Further, in the area of day-to-day management, a personnel management software program has been developed and will be installed as soon as possible in the Administrative and Financial Affairs Departments (DAAFs) of the various ministries, concurrent with the computerization of administrative management which will be carried out through standardization of civil service management instruments and computerized data retrieval.

In the area of integrated management based on forward planning, specifically with respect to administrative structures, employment and personnel, the following tasks have been carried out or are now in progress:

- the identification and description of jobs and positions within the public administration, completed in March 1995. A public employment inventory is now being compiled; and
- the census of administrative structures (ministries, departments, divisions, work stations), has been carried out.

In addition, a comprehensive program of organizational audits covering all ministerial departments and institutions, for which an implementation schedule was adopted by decision of the Council of Ministers (cf. Council of Ministers, July 27 1994), has been initiated. A software program for management of personnel and administrative structures has been developed, along with an inventory of government agencies and procedures for updating it.

- For the organizational audits, data collection on both centralized and decentralized ministerial departments has been carried out. The audit reports have been completed for seven ministries; for the remaining ministries, the reports have been partially prepared and will be completed with the assistance of twenty-one recently recruited local consultants.

With respect to government productivity, large-scale training activities have been carried out including, in particular, the following:

- workshops on job description techniques and the identification of training needs, for the Directors of Administrative and Financial Affairs (DAAFs), the Directors of Public Employment (DEPs) and personnel managers;
- a training cycle in public management for the secretaries-general of the ministries, the general directors of centralized departments and the secretaries-general of the provinces;

- a new training cycle was begun in March 1995 with the objective of reaching all directors of centralized and decentralized departments in order to spread the management culture among the ranks of administration officials;

- a training cycle in human resources management is now being conducted for employees of the Ministry of Civil Service and will be offered to all human resources managers (DAAFs, DEPs, personnel managers).

**Support From Development Partners**

The United Nations Development Program (UNDP), the Management Development Program (MDP) and the World Bank have been, and continue to be, the main backers of the ministry charged with implementing actions to modernize the administration.

In addition to these agencies, the ministry has also received support, particularly in the area of training, from the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) through the PREFEP consulting group, from USAID and from the Hans Seidel Foundation.

UNDP support has been provided through the “Support for Modernization of the Administration” project, the two phases of which have received a total of US $2,619,676 (CFAF 1,313,537,888). Of this total amount, the MDP contribution comes to $800,250 (CFAF 390,522,000). The current phase of the project ends on June 30 1995. The Department of Development Support and Management Services (DDSMS) of the United Nations is responsible for technical implementation of the project.

Support from the World Bank has come in the form of a Public Administration Support Program, which assists not only the Ministry of the Civil Service and Modernization of the Administration but in fact several ministries (Finance, Justice, Communication, Civil Service). This program also receives support from various other sources, including UNDP and the government of Norway, France, and Germany. Total funding for the program comes to US $16,950,000.

PREFEP support has been provided through an agreement with the Ministry of the Civil Service concerning training in the area of job description techniques. This support includes consultation services plus funding in the amount of US $276,000.

Other backers, specifically USAID and the Hans Seidel Foundation, have provided targeted support for training seminars.

**Difficulties and Shortcomings**

Several kinds of difficulties and shortcomings have been encountered in the course of implementing modernization actions.
The emphasis on a policy of modernizing the administration, which is an explicit element of the institutional plan as evidenced by the creation of the Ministry of Modernization of the Administration, coincided with the onset of the democratization process in Burkina Faso.

Following the constitutional vote of June 1991, presidential elections took place in December 1991 and parliamentary elections in May 1992. It proved necessary to install three transitional governments during this initial phase.

The emergence of a law-based state is, of course, an intrinsically positive development. Yet, implementation of the modernization actions was made difficult by the very fact of a transitional period, giving rise to many uncertainties within the administration, as during any electoral process.

The second source of difficulties can be attributed to a weak national capacity to quickly assimilate new work methods and ideas and participate in implementation activities.

Certain remaining difficulties can be ascribed to the executing agency, for example with respect to recruiting international consultants to support the project, where several problems arose including the unavailability of certain consultants, their late arrival and the inappropriateness of their qualifications in relation to project needs.

Toward A Comprehensive And Forward-Looking Approach: Governance

In view of the role of the administration and its place within society, a purely technical approach to its modernization would today appear incomplete, inadequate or even outmoded. A comprehensive, integrated and systemic approach to the modernization and development of public management is required, incorporating a forward-looking dimension and based on the concept of administrative democracy or, in other words, effective governance.

Although consistent with the general objective of improving the performance of the public administration, specifically by targeting the issues of human resources management and modernization of administrative structures, the scope of the current modernization plan is becoming increasingly narrow, given Burkina’s current context.

Indeed, this approach to modernizing the administration (administration in the traditional sense) appears especially anachronistic in light of the new institutional configuration that has evolved in the wake of the emergence of a law-based state. The current action plan does not take into account the critical components of any democratic state, i.e. the judicial and legislative branches and other forms of checks and balances such as the press (private and public), consumer and human rights organizations, labor unions, etc.

If the ultimate goal of the administration is to satisfy the needs of the population, then, clearly, any credible program designed to modernize the administration cannot ignore the entities that are supposed to represent or protect the interests of the population, or that expose abuses which they may have suffered or protect others from them. In other words, it is no longer possible to conceive of modernization of the administration as an activity confined to the administration itself, in the traditional sense, and as being exclusively the province of civil servants, without jeopardizing the ultimate goal of modernization, which is the economic and social development of the population.
Thus, while it remains important to modernize traditional components of the administration, it is vital to focus immediately on the need to add a new dimension to the modernization policy, specifically by taking into account all aspects related to the country’s system of governance.

The need for a new and broader approach is evident on two levels: there are many sources of dissatisfaction with the present system and, within the new political context of democracy, citizens and the organizations that represent them are demanding to be heard with ever-greater frequency and expect to play a larger role in making the choices that affect them, as well as in the process of implementing such choices. This new context can be illustrated in the words of the president of the Assembly of People’s Deputies at the second parliamentary session of 1994:

"The feeling of the People, whose legitimate representatives we are, is that people with integrity should uphold morality in the country..."\(^1\)

**General Objective**

Effective governance thus appears to be an inescapable objective of the policy to modernize the administration. Indeed, it is now unanimously accepted that effective governance is a prerequisite for development, insofar as development and growth are no longer considered to be purely economic issues and therefore cannot be achieved by simply pulling a few levers. Development efforts must be accompanied by strategies designed to ensure political stability, strengthen institutions, involve the population in the decision-making process and protect human rights.

This means that any system of governance must seek to guarantee the basic rights of citizens, specifically through the security provided by a functioning judiciary and a system of public management that is transparent, accountable and participatory.

Accordingly, effective governance relies on an integrated and systemic model for modernizing and developing the management of government agencies. The model must incorporate a forward-looking dimension and embrace the principles of administrative democracy, including the concept of an administration that is close to the people, which entails decentralization, devolution of authority and participation. The rapid and widespread introduction of new management techniques and methods, including computerization and office automation, is also required. From this perspective, there is a need for diversified and coordinated external assistance.

**Specific Objectives**

Assistance in implementing a system of effective governance will target the following specific objectives:

- strengthening the democratic process and, in particular, its relevance and legitimacy in order to achieve the political stability required for development;

\(^{11}\) Speech by the President of the Assembly of People’s Deputies (cf. SIDWAYA 2629 of October 27 1994, p. 5).
modernizing the administration, with an emphasis on its efficiency and its capacity to provide quality services to citizens through improved government productivity;

ensuring effective management of public resources through greater transparency and accountability at all levels of public management, thus promoting closer adherence to development plans and programs; and

incorporating both a forward-looking dimension and traditional African values in order to increase the effectiveness and relevance of economic policies.

**Governance Development Programs**

**Strengthening Political Democracy**

The late 1980s were a turbulent period in the political, economic and social history of Burkina Faso. Society was subjected to a series of jolts reflecting significant changes in the life of the country. This situation resulted not only in a certain discontinuity within the system of political governance, but also, in terms of the economy, the perpetuation of a policy of massive and direct government involvement in the nation's system of production. Not content to be the one and only provider of a series of essential services (i.e. a welfare state), the government also took on tasks of pure production. Thus, the state was no longer just an organizer or equalizer, but also a social instigator and, above all, a producer. The political and economic logic and rationale for this highly planned system were battered by the flow of events and structural transformations taking place nationwide, including in particular the unstoppable momentum of popular aspirations, increasingly focused on administrative structures and systems of political governance that genuinely reflect the aspirations of the population. They were also shaken by certain external factors, including those related to an African and global socioeconomic environment in a state of crisis, which called into question the underlying economic justification for a highly planned and centralized system.

As a result of this political and economic climate, in 1991, by popular vote, Burkina Faso opted for a law-based government. The Constitution of Burkina Faso, which was adopted by referendum in June 1991, specifically defined the mission and organization of the system of political governance, including the precise role of each of the main actors in the system (the legislative, executive and judicial branches). Presidential, parliamentary and local elections served to institute and, subsequently, to consolidate the process of establishing the essential institutions of the new government structure. It quickly emerged that dynamic interaction among the various elements of the system of political governance is a necessary condition for actions that are efficient and acceptable to the population.

Governance and democracy are closely linked: it is impossible to develop democracy while ignoring the system of governance, while good governance itself can only take hold within a context of true democracy. Democracy must be rooted in the collective will, and the underlying mechanisms and institutions must be supported by the main actors of the society. As a result, the development of governance must focus first and foremost on strengthening the democratic process. This requires efforts at several levels.
The electoral system and its management: Some of the factors that have marked, and that continue to mark, the emergence of democracy in Africa include, on the one hand, the multiplicity of political parties (Burkina Faso has about sixty parties), leading to fragmentation and ever-greater complexity within the political arena, and, on the other hand, the fact that elections are systematically challenged or even boycotted. This may appear entirely justified, particularly if one considers that African countries are going through a learning process and that all learning processes have their awkward aspects. But it must be recognized that, if such developments should persist, they could actually jeopardize the democratic process itself.

As a result, the dual challenge that arises is to determine how to clarify and simplify the political checkerboard (voting system) and how to avoid disputed elections. The multiplicity of political parties and candidates often confuses the voters, particularly in rural areas (where more than 75 percent of voters reside). Farmers joke about "pick any one" elections. What they mean is that, faced with an impressive number of ballots on election day, they are never quite sure that they will recognize the candidate of their choice and sometimes settle for selecting a candidate at random. This issue raises the question of the transparency of elections and thus represents an important problem for the system of governance. Insofar as elections are the principal source of legitimacy and legality in a democratic system, the result could be to increase the risks of political instability, if this matter is not addressed.

Certain authors have proposed, as a solution, that the entity responsible for elections should be independent. Furthermore, to guarantee this independence, its terms of reference and the methods used to appoint its members should be defined, not by a regulation or a law, but by the Constitution. Resolving this fundamental dilemma could be considered as an initial goal for which support for the system of governance is needed in the form of:

- training;
- seminars;
- field trips; and
- technical assistance.

The financing of political parties: Conducting political outreach and presenting candidates for the various elections are essential elements of the vitality of any democratic system. However, they often entail considerable expense. The question therefore arises as to who should bear this expense (individuals, enterprises or the government) and what mechanisms should be used to cover such costs in a spirit of democracy. Another related question concerns the acceptable level of costs for elections.

These issues are highly complex. The option of corporations financing political parties may give rise to ethical problems (corruption, undue influence of powerful groups over public institutions, etc.) while government financing may create problems as regards the mechanisms required to guarantee the autonomy of political parties in relation to the government.

In addition, given the large number of political parties in Burkina Faso, direct financing of parties by the government could, without careful limits, have a ruinous effect on public finances, which would justifiably provoke a public outcry.

To overcome these various constraints, certain authors have advocated indirect government financing: individuals would finance the parties of their choice and, in return,
qualify for a tax deduction by filling out the proper form. There would, however, be a ceiling on individual contributions and allowable deductions.

With respect to the key problem inherent in the large number of political parties, the system of governance must allow for solutions to be proposed through discussions held throughout the country. The various solutions proposed could then be submitted to popular vote in the form of a referendum.

Support for the system of governance will include efforts to inform the public and all political players about these issues, the goal being to resolve them:

- exchanges of experience;
- field trips; and
- seminars, colloquiums, workshops.

Parliamentary proceedings and status of the parliamentary opposition: The role of the deputies, as citizens' representatives, is obviously to vote on laws. In addition, however, they must also debate the issues that are of concern to citizens. Yet very often, deputies in Burkina Faso are primarily engaged in voting on laws and in questioning the government while hardly debating or taking any position on the key issues of concern to citizens.

Furthermore, the Assembly of People's Deputies appears to exert only timid control over government action and, to date, no parliamentary commission of inquiry has ever been created. In addition, very little draft legislation comes from the deputies.

The situation of a strong parliamentary majority complicates the role that the deputies should play in overseeing government action and poses the risk of systematic agreement with the government in order to avoid "upsetting" the latter (which in many instances has arisen from their ranks).

This raises the problem of training deputies and institutional support for the Assembly, particularly in the case of a young democracy, as well as the issue of the status of the parliamentary opposition.

As regards strengthening democracy, one possible arrangement, used in certain countries to address the specific issue of the status of the parliamentary opposition, is for the leader of the opposition to occupy the number two position in the hierarchy of the Assembly, while the parliamentary commissions are organized in a way that ensures full participation of the deputies.

Efforts to strengthen democracy thus deserve significant support from development partners.

The role and place of women within the political system: In Burkina Faso, the unequivocal role of women in development has been affirmed for more than a decade. Women, in fact, make up more than 50 percent of the country's total population. Studies have demonstrated that women, as mothers and educators, are important vectors and key players in development.

Consequently, Burkina Faso has a reputation within Africa as a leader in this area, based on the efforts made on behalf of this category of citizens (support for income-generating activities for women, school enrollment of girls, etc.), still the issue of women's participation in the political process and the improvement of their economic position remains unresolved.
As a result, there must be a continued emphasis on advocacy and on comprehensive studies of the changing role of women in Africa, particularly within the forum of African summits. The goal is to reconcile the role of women with African traditions and values.

Promoting grassroots development: the issue of decentralization: The municipal elections of February and March 1995 provided an opportunity to give concrete form to the commitment to decentralization by having mayors and city council members in thirty-three towns and municipalities.

There is still important work to be done in defining the breakdown of responsibility between the state and the local communities. But there are no guarantees, because making progress assumes that local communities share a common voice, thus allowing them to discuss such issues with the government, and that they possess the necessary tools to understand the notion of decentralization and engage in meaningful discussions with government representatives concerning the implications of decentralization. A clarification of responsibilities is, however, desirable and even urgent, not just to avoid a situation in which the supervisory relationship between the government and the communities is or becomes essentially hierarchical. Some mayors have actually raised the issue of a government stranglehold over local communities, comparing the relationship between the mayors and the central authorities to the relationship between the subprefects and prefects of the past.

They deplore their inability to take action under the weight of the supervisory relationship that obliges them constantly to consult the Ministry of Territorial Administration and, accordingly, they demand that the government display a new level of trust by agreeing to share power and by allowing the decentralization process to reach its logical conclusion. 12

Another unresolved issue concerns the mechanisms for mobilizing and managing the resources required to carry out the tasks of development. In this regard, the tax system should be improved by strengthening the role of elected officials in determining the types and rates of taxation, as well as the manner in which tax revenues are split between the government and the communities. The mayors complain that because all revenues go into the same coffers, community revenues are paid to the Treasury even though communities have no role in managing the Treasury. 13

These needed changes cannot be implemented unless there is a major effort to educate the population. Indeed, the centralized management function long performed by the government (which provided health and education services and road and water infrastructure ‘free of charge’), coupled with the presence of charitable organizations in many regions of the country, has created a welfare mentality that could, if not addressed, become an obstacle to the viability of communities.

Burkina Faso.

Burkina Faso.
In conclusion, while grassroots development through decentralization is desirable and indeed possible, this process must be accompanied by appropriate efforts in the areas of training, awareness-raising, exchanges of experience, support for developing management tools and open dialogue.

An Administration in Service of Development

The current situation

In Burkina Faso, as in the rest of Africa, the public administration plays, and will continue to play, an important role in the life and development of the country. Based on staff qualifications, the administration appears to be, if not the sole, then at least the main repository of national expertise and experience. Today it is accepted that the role and mission of the administration must change, along with the thrust of its operations. Yet, it is impossible to imagine a situation in which its role could be eliminate. In developing countries like Burkina Faso, the fundamental mission of the state and the public administration is to stimulate and strengthen development.

Yet, if this premise is accepted, then one must ask what the state and the public administration have done in this regard, whether they have been effective and, above all, what needs to be done now?

Studies by eminent specialists have convincingly demonstrated that 'the social and political upheaval and economic crises that came on the heels of independence in sub-Saharan Africa can largely be attributed to the deficiencies', multiple dysfunctions and lack of regulation of public institutions.

This widely accepted line of thought underscores the importance of institutional capacities in the chain of development in Africa and highlights the impact of weak capacities on macroeconomic performance, the outcome of development projects and the ability of countries to react to changes in the economic environment. The clear implication is that one must go beyond short-term civil service reforms based on cost controls and staff reduction programs that provide mixed results, and look instead to qualitative, long-term improvements that link output to effectiveness.

The Rally for Democracy and Development Program assigns a high priority to the necessary task of reforming and modernizing the government. A new, modernized administration that is efficient, transparent with respect to its management and fair in its role of arbitrator, and led by civil servants of integrity and skill, must be established. To this end, the Ministry of the Civil Service and Modernization of the Administration was created.

Through its Modernization Action Plan, adopted in 1991, the ministry has initiated many actions designed to reorganize and reform the public administration, including an ongoing effort to perform organizational audits of all ministerial departments and institutions, with technical and financial support from UNDP, a requalification program for government employees with an emphasis on providing training in top management techniques and, more recently, job description workshops for the purpose of evaluating managers, as well as an effort to reform the procurement system, with support from the World Bank.
Simultaneously, the government has also incorporated into the administration a certain number of participatory management bodies, including in particular the management councils (Conseils de Direction or CDs), the joint technical committees (Comités Techniques Paritaires or CTPs) and the annual public administration conference (Conférence Annuelle de l'Administration Publique or CAAP).

The first CAAP, held in 1993, also had to acknowledge numerous public administration problems and specifically recommended that a true administrative democracy be installed. This concern led to the creation of the position of an ombudsman for Burkina Faso.

While all these reforms need more time to take root and must be evaluated in order for their role to be perfected, it is essential to go further and deeper.

Prospects:

The necessary redefinition of the government's role and mission

President Compaoré's Rally for Development and Democracy Program, which constitutes the nation's basic political frame of reference, specifically places an emphasis on: '...the need to break with the idea of a welfare state, which promotes incompetence and irresponsibility, and to work steadfastly to modernize and revitalize government in a way that will provide greater efficiency and make government more effective...’ The new governmental configuration should lead to a set of institutions that are efficient, unbureaucratic, transparent in terms of their management, fair and led by skilled staff who are committed to the public good.

For this reason and, additionally, to provide optimal conditions for introducing a system of planning with respect to government personnel, organizational audits of all ministerial departments have been carried out since July 1994. The purpose of these audits is to record the current condition of all branches of the public administration facilities from an institutional, organizational and procedural point of view, as well as the manner in which they utilize and mobilize resources, particularly human resources. The sector audit reports were completed by the end of July 1995.

A comprehensive and shared overview of sector assessments and recommendations on the organizational structure of the government will contribute to an appreciation of its role and mission with respect to specific sector policies. It will also facilitate the institutional grouping of various related government functions, a better distribution of human resources in relation to the real needs and capacities of the government, a redefinition of the nature of the relationship between the administration and civil society and, finally, a clearer understanding of the social compact regarding the content and structure of the administration.

The role of the new government will be more to provide an impulse than to engage in production. Government intervention will become more indirect; instead of producing goods and services that target specific actors, it will focus on the conditions that affect production and the framework for social action. Traditional government will assume a more modest and economical form and operate with fewer resources. It will become a catalyst for social change, a strategist for the living conditions of the population, a broker for the interests of groups and enterprises, and a contractor for the products of the marketplace.
Participation: The task of setting up an administrative democracy, specifically through participatory management, must be pursued and consolidated in terms of organizational structure and management. The institutional framework (CTP, CD, CASEM and CAAP) is in place, but its operational capacity must be improved. In particular, mechanisms must be developed and introduced to enable the various entities to operate more effectively and promote more efficient oversight and monitoring of efforts to implement recommended actions.

Another challenge in setting up an administrative democracy is to consolidate, organize and manage the participation of the population in the work of the localized administration (decentralized services and devolved authority). If decentralization is well designed, then it will open new opportunities at the regional level, promote employment and economic activity and strengthen popular participation in managing the nation.

One effect of the local elections in Burkina Faso was to set up management units. The task for locally elected officials is now to understand and internalize the notarial, regulatory and procedural functions. Community development programs that fully address the aspirations and expectations of rural communities and that are technically solid can only be designed if elected officials assimilate and understand management techniques and performance monitoring. The same can be said of the evaluation of existing development programs. Programs to provide broad support in setting up this process need to be planned and implemented.

In addition, the modernization of society in Burkina Faso has led to the emergence of many associations, sometimes with competing interests, on the public scene (human rights, consumers, environmental protection, hunters, pastoralists, etc.). The presence of these new actors in areas that were once the exclusive domain of the government raises the issue of their participation in government operations.

Experience has shown that opening up organizations (including, in particular, the government) to their surroundings can increase their effectiveness by providing feedback and by presenting a better public image. For governmental organizations, this openness can be achieved through various participatory mechanisms and techniques.

Participation can be viewed as both a management technique and an effort to democratize the operations of government organizations, because it serves not only to educate these organizations and thereby increase the effectiveness of their decisions in relation to their objectives, but also to educate and mobilize citizens and channel their aspirations through the government. The changes now occurring in the role of government in relation to society make it necessary and even natural for interest groups to participate in government operations. Participation may take the form of information, consultation, cooperation or co-management.

Burkina Faso supports the concept of social dialogue and could perhaps draw lessons from various experiences in order to strengthen the techniques and mechanisms of participation.
An administration of quality

Early modernization efforts should continue to be pursued. This means, first of all, strengthening the capacities of the administration with respect to management of the government's human resources. This will be accomplished at the operational level, specifically by greater mastery of the management system through simple rules and procedures. The day-to-day management operations will be accompanied by forward planning, which will entail the preparation of annual job and resource plans and both quantitative and qualitative staff projections for the medium-term.

The latter approach will provide the government with a powerful new tool for identifying medium term changes in human resource requirements, for anticipating the budgetary and financial impact of new staffing patterns and for forming judgments regarding staff qualifications (and training needs, including in-service training).

Subsequently, certain basic, intrinsic public administration functions will need to be strengthened. These include, in particular, the administration's capacity to translate the government's development policies into manageable action programs, as well as its capacity to identify the means required to implement such programs. But these capacities cannot be developed to the fullest extent without an overview of the entire subject, as well as a vision of future change. The capacity to foresee the future and thus to master it to some degree is one element of the effort to address the challenges of development within a particular field. The administration will need to embrace forward planning by adopting appropriate institutional and procedural mechanisms. For each sector in which the government operates, this planning will provide necessary and useful input for developing long-term positions, objectives and programs, extending well beyond the current planning horizon.

For the administration to be efficient and effective, the measures taken to institute a system of political and legal responsibility must be accompanied by other measures designed to increase the accountability of administrative structures. To this end, it will be necessary to closely monitor the performance of government agencies and employees and make full use of the office of the ombudsman to investigate any administration abuses or deficiencies and correct them. Improving the administration will essentially depend on the initiative and efforts both of the government and the people.

Some of the key elements of a quality administration are: the accountability of political and administrative structures, a solid judiciary, the rule of law, the protection of basic liberties and rights, a strengthening of the capacities of government agencies and, finally, human resources development.

A rapid administration: As the public administration of Burkina Faso acquires experience with the new management functions assigned to it and the new structures created to carry them out, it is important to further develop the existing capacities and organize specific training activities to facilitate the emergence of new types of relationships. A whole range of relatively new skills will be required. Instead of systematically awaiting orders from above, civil servants must acquire the ability to negotiate horizontally with other organizations. Emphasis must be placed on human resources development and, in particular, on teamwork and shared decision-making. A participatory organization needs a staff well trained in communication. Improving the flow of communication among departments and ministries is a critical element of a rapid administration. Coordination and monitoring capacities must also be strengthened within this context.
The communication component should be accompanied by greater mastery of information management, particularly at the technical level. Effective computer systems need to be developed in order to link together all the organizations and units of the same system in a productive relationship. Regardless of physical and organizational distance, computer technology can improve collaboration by making parallel processes possible and by facilitating reciprocal interdependence.

Developments in computer technology provide obvious opportunities for creating intra-governmental-governmental, intergovernmental, intersectoral and even international linkages. In general, except when national security is involved, it is always preferable to share information than to hoard it.

The development of information systems within the administration will clearly need to be supported by a national computer technology development plan that is consistent and comprehensive. Specifically, the main organizations responsible for what are generally referred to as the central administrative tasks, i.e. personnel management, financial affairs and planning, should all be linked together, particularly with respect to payroll, staffing, organizational structures and development planning.

A final step that can significantly influence the rapidity and reliability of administrative actions is to incorporate a certain number of tools and techniques into the steering mechanisms of the administration, for example Performance Charts and Management Information Systems. The Performance Chart is an instrument that can be made available to all managers of organizational units to facilitate the measuring and monitoring of progress made in various activities. It requires a program of activities and clear objectives and involves choosing a certain number of performance indicators that will serve as "signals" of the progress made. While the Performance Chart is already being used by some administrative units, its use should be generalized.

The Management Information System (MIS) is a tool closely linked to the use of computer technology. It includes the individuals, computer equipment, software, information and procedures needed to collect, transmit, process and store data. The information generated provides indispensable support for operational and managerial functions. The MIS concept includes the notion of information flows. There are four organizational levels at which the MIS is necessary and useful: operations, operations control, intermediate management and higher management.

Information circulates among the various levels and the MIS helps identify what type of information is needed by each manager and with what frequency, so that he or she will receive any and all necessary and helpful information and be in a position to make optimal decisions.

The MIS thus specifies who should receive what type of information, from whom and how frequently, in order to send it to whom and in what time frame. Differences between structured and non-structured decisions, between routine and non-routine information and between systems based on structured decisions and those designed to support the decision-making process are of great importance, because the critical information is increasingly of a non-routine character. The MIS influences the decision-making structure, the number of decision-makers and the nature of the decisions made. To date, there are no Management Information Systems within the administration. But increasing computerization of the ministries and current
shortcomings in managing information flows exposed by organizational audits makes their gradual introduction, beginning in 1996, an absolute priority for a more effective administration.

Promoting Ethics, Transparency And Accountability In The Management Of Public Affairs

There has been a deterioration in the management of public affairs and the professional behavior of public employees in recent years. This situation is reflected in a state of administrative crisis, accompanied by a considerable decline in public morality and government credibility. The real and growing danger is that an institutional and regulatory void could develop, quickly resulting in the emergence of rules and institutions based on values and practices that are inconsistent with the needs and priorities of the population. The negligent and sometimes complacent application of the rules and principles of public management creates potentially explosive social situations.

In Burkina Faso, while the situation is not as bad as in other some countries, and it should be noted that the country is often cited as a model, specifically by its development partners. However, the situation is still characterized by a weak system of checks and balances and a tendency toward less and less accountability on the part of some unit chiefs and managers. Too often, management is at best negligent and lacking in transparency or, at worst, based on personal advantage and patronage.

Accordingly, it is a matter of urgency that the modernization process now in progress be completed and that a more comprehensive approach, integrating the principles of effective governance, be developed. This means promoting ethics, transparency and accountability in the management of public affairs.

Governance As A Means Of Promoting Ethics In The Management Of Public Affairs

It is significant that the societies which have successfully developed themselves are also those that have managed to forge their own identity and hold up an ideal that is recognized and accepted by the majority. The ethical guidelines by which citizens judge the persons in power, assess what they can expect from the system of governance or how they can avoid their obligations to the nation are reflected in what specialists refer to as political idioms. A few examples:

- the idioms of law and religion;
- the idiom of tradition; and
- the idiom of sorcery or the idiom of the family.

These idioms lead to the suggestion that an ideal type of power is at the heart of African cultures. This power must facilitate the redistribution of wealth. The legitimacy of a regime will be judged on the basis of the government's ability to make redistribution happen. In this light, a variety of concerns become legitimate development objectives: the development of courses on civic instruction and their inclusion in the school curriculum; official adoption of instruments such as a code of ethics; the study and inclusion of traditional African values in efforts to develop governance as a way to improve ethics.

Indeed, the impact of African social and traditional values on the system of governance needs to be studied so that feedback is available to improve the system. It is clear that African
societies strike a unique balance between individual and collective values, between competition and solidarity.

The objective is to help develop and implement systems for managing public affairs, as well as methods and procedures, that meet the technical requirements of effective management but are also politically and socially acceptable and feasible within the specific national context.

Governance As A Means Of Promoting Transparency And Accountability In The Management Of Public Affairs

In any society, the mission of the government is, or should be, to contribute to the economic and social development of its people. A system of governance must guarantee the basic rights of citizens and establish an effective judiciary, as well as a transparent, accountable and participatory system of public management.

As a result, any assistance to a system of governance must strive to strengthen certain strategic institutions, particularly those that adopt and implement public policy or that are involved in conflict management.

Moreover, as stated above, there can be no effective governance without accountability. As democracy takes hold, laws and constitutions impose accountability. In Burkina Faso, the constitutional provisions have been complemented by the gradual emergence of a democratic culture. The ongoing learning process has translated into steady progress on the ground since 1991, but there is now a need to go further by strengthening the capacities of certain key institutions, particularly those that adopt and implement public policy or that are involved in conflict management, i.e. the parliament and the judiciary.

Parliament: The work of the Parliament may have to be better organized through:

- a training program for members of the parliament on techniques for evaluating government policies and programs;
- establishing independent financial audit units charged with auditing government accounts; and
- creating and managing a parliamentary information system by creating a data bank, and establishing and managing parliamentary archives.

Judiciary: It may be necessary to organize and administer the offices of the clerks of the court, as well as the courts themselves, particularly in the areas of information management and document storage through:

- a training program to upgrade the skills of the clerks of the court;
- a training program in forensic science;
- assistance in disseminating legislative and regulatory information; and
- a program of specialization for members of the Bench.
Support for the press and communication

There is a need to organize training and refresher courses in order to develop the professionalism of the press corps, which has a key role to play if democracy, transparency and accountability are to take root. Just as the financing of political parties is an important issue, support for the emergence and development of the private press is becoming an important question.

Organizations And Actors Involved In Governance

Support for the system of governance will entail support for a certain number of organizations and actors including, in particular, the following:

i. The Assembly Of People's Deputies

ii. The Judiciary

iii. The Political And Administrative Structure: The Government

iv. The Entities Responsible For Organizing Elections

v. The Public Administration

vi. The Ombudsman Of Burkina Faso

vii. Civil Society: political parties; press; labor unions; employers; religious and traditional communities; consumer groups; NGOs; and human rights organizations.
9. WORKING WITH DONORS TO IMPLEMENT CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS: THE UGANDAN EXPERIENCE

Dr. Mohammad A. M. Kisubi

Introduction

We all agree that our economies are such that we do not have enough resources to address all our needs. Yet there are pressures on all our governments by the citizenry to provide enough qualitatively good services. The people do not have enough economic activities to enable them to do or have all that they need. Governments have therefore, to find a way of getting additional help and one of the possible ways is to turn to donors. Indeed, donors have been instrumental in economic development of a number of countries. In fact Japan, after the second World War was able to come back and develop quickly because of donor assistance from the USA.

The presence of the World Bank, ODA, SIDA, CIDA, UNDP and other donors is an appreciation of the need for donor assistance. Yet the presence of these donors over a long time-span has, in many cases, not helped the countries develop. Indeed, in spite of assistance, many states are sinking deeper and deeper in development terms. This means something, somewhere is being done wrongly. It is in this context that we need to rethink donor assistance. How should we address this issue?

Background to the Uganda Civil Service Reform Program (CSRP)

It is important to note that right from the start of the CSRP, Uganda was very clear about her objectives and charted a course of action to improve the delivery of its services.

The Uganda Civil Service is the operational arm of government, charged with analysis, recommendation and administration of public policy. Because of this central role, many factors - historical, political and ideological - have shaped its function and structure. The civil service inherited from the colonial regime was relatively small, and had the limited objectives of maintaining good government, law and order. The civil service in independent Uganda has changed in its structure and functions. Besides being the custodian of good government, law and order, it has increasingly become the vehicle for social and economic development.

The ineffectiveness of the civil service, therefore, can undermine almost all development efforts as well as basic public administration. Weaknesses in the central functions of government are particularly damaging since they can affect all government activity and the economy as a whole. The capacity to make and implement policy is often reduced, revenues go uncollected, available resources are not well-utilized, and morale and motivation ebb away. These are both the effects of, and significant contributors to, poor economic performance and
crisis in government administration. This crisis is more serious at a time when Structural Adjustment Programs are requiring key central civil service institutions to plan and manage fundamental transformations of the economy.

The real challenge in this era of reform is to redefine the role of government in meeting the development needs of Uganda and to raise the efficiency and effectiveness of the public sector. More importantly, the Government of Uganda (GOU) is to put in place effective controls over public sector employment as a precondition for beginning to match more closely public sector employment and the needs of Uganda. Gaining effective control over employment in the public service is essential because of the need, within a tight budgetary constraint, to move towards providing civil servants with a minimum living wage. The changes are also essential in creating an institutional framework which will provide the incentives crucial for changing attitudes and behavior more in line with the needs of a results-oriented public sector.

**Background And Context Of The CSRP**

When the Uganda National Resistance Movement (NRM) government took over state power in 1986, it inherited a country traumatized by civil war and state terror, and reduced to penury through lawlessness, corruption and mismanagement. Over the past seven years, government has attempted to address these problems directing its efforts at two main areas i.e. macroeconomic policy reform and institutional reform to remove the political and structural weaknesses which devastated the country for almost two decades. The desire is to create a more effective balance between state power and state capacity on the one hand and economic management and the exercise of civic rights in society as a whole on the other.

This has produced four distinct initiatives:

- **constitutional reform**, now in its final stages, designed to democratize the national political system;

- **decentralization**, designed to increase the powers of democratic local authorities;

- **the civil Service Reform Program** (CSRP) to redefine the role of government, rationalize and streamline government structures eliminate redundant staff, restructure management systems, introduce a minimum living wage and create effective incentive structures for improved performance and service delivery; and

- **liberalization and privatization** designed to reduce state control over the economy within the macroeconomic stabilization and adjustment framework.

The Uganda Civil Service which was hailed as the best (in respect to efficient performance, motivated, well-paid and fully equipped work force) in Africa south of the Sahara had become inefficient, demoralized and unresponsive. Besides, indiscipline was rampant and the Standing Orders and other personnel regulations were flouted with impunity. The service therefore, needed drastic reorientation and revitalization. It was in this context that the government decided to set up the Public Service Review and Reorganization Commission (PSRRC) in 1989, to examine the situation and make appropriate recommendations. In particular, the Commission was to address itself to four key areas namely: Personnel
Management issues, Organizational Structure; Accountability/Financial Management; and Conditions of Service.

In September 1990, the PSRRC submitted its Report to the government making 255 recommendations. The cabinet, through an appropriate White Paper on the Report, considered and approved the recommendations with some amendments. The recommendations of the PSRRC form the basis of the CSRP whose ultimate goal is to improve the responsiveness, efficiency and effectiveness of the civil service in achieving Uganda's development objectives and, while doing so, gain public respect and confidence. Following the Commission's Report, a strategic implementation framework including a detailed action plan was developed.

Thus, in Uganda, the CSR was homegrown. It relied for its success on the cross-section of interest groups in Uganda, namely the politicians, the public officials, those in the private sector and most important the public, the eventual consumers of the services.

The foregoing emphasizes the most important aspect of dealing with donors. One you must have a properly worked-out plan of action, with specific objectives and strategies. The donors having seen that Uganda had a proper action plan with clear objectives, assisted substantially.

Donors should study and understand the environment they are entering

Donors, before committing any resources, should carry out an analysis/diagnosis of social, political, economic and cultural environment of a country seeking assistance/support.

In several instances, many donors operate as if they have a hidden agenda other than of assistance or support. Donors' role in assistance is not about leading and directing recipients. Their role is and should be limited to supporting and creating an enabling environment. The Uganda way has been to hold joint Uganda/Donors Review Meetings and discuss openly any issue that any of the stakeholders raise. Indeed in so doing, one does not expect donors to conditionalise their assistance. Instead, they should demand transparency and accountability for monies/materials used as specifically related to the grants or credits provided. Accordingly, donors in Uganda do not "police" the actual implementation of reforms but have been offering constructive criticism and advice. Donors have also brought in a lot of literature and the experiences of other countries for Uganda to learn from.

Donors should not implement reform/changes

Individual governments need to look inwards to determine the direction, course of action and speed of reforms. The donors can help to speed up the process by providing the necessary tools and skills for the implementation of actions and sustainability of reforms/changes.

Donors, by hiring their own experts or consultants, end up doing the implementation for the recipients. When such experts leave no one is able to sustain what the donors have put in place. Hence, "white" elephants are to be found all over Africa. Uganda's emphasis has been on recruiting locally whenever possible. Expatriate consultants, when hired, tend to be those with experience in developing countries. This has ensured the building of a local pool of expertise in reforms and, in addition, the local experts have acquired knowledge and skills from their expatriate counterparts. Indeed, Uganda is now offering this local expertise to other countries.
Several countries have been to Uganda to see for themselves how the reforms are being managed and implemented and have first-hand contact with the people behind the reform.

Thus, donors need to shift the focus from external experts/consultants to letting the local people be assisted in implementing their own programs. The external expatriates/consultants could be hired for the short term, but basically for capacity building of local expertise and skills. They should withdraw at the earliest opportunity leaving locals to take charge of their affairs. Therefore, the terms of reference of all external experts should include principally a requirement to build capacity in their local counterparts. In Uganda, every foreign expert has local counterparts who must be trained and allowed to take over in a given period of time. This is essentially to ensure the continuity and sustainability of the reforms.

Another lesson has been that external experts should only be recruited if there is no local person available. Even then, it is better to choose from the region because the countries share, more or less, similar problems. Accordingly, donors should work towards developing lists of regional consultants. Recipients should be involved in the selection of experts and have a say in the way they perform.

Lastly, donors should rethink long-term technical assistance. This should be kept to a minimum. Whenever there is need for such experts, at the end of each year, the country should reassess the need for continued technical assistance.

**Recipients also need to get their act together**

Often, developing countries impose conditionalities on themselves. They promise to do the impossible because of their desperate need for assistance. Countries should be able to refuse assistance which is destructive or counter to their national objectives. To do this, they need to be very clear about what they want to do, have a clear vision (output/outcome), clear objectives, and carefully articulate plans of action and timing and costing. If this is done, there is no way that a donor can impose conditionalities. Often, countries go to donor meetings to request for assistance without a carefully formulated action plan. In Uganda, review meetings with donors normally involve detailed action and activities indicating the specificities.

**Donors as constructive partners**

Donors need to come into the game as constructive partners. And because one is faced with so many donors, donors must be managed and required to play the game according to the country’s rules. For instance, they should be required to do joint reviews develop mutual trust. In Uganda, the way CSRP donors are managed is through a series of consultations and joint review meetings. Donors have agreed to cooperate and share information amongst themselves. At the end of the day, government officials meet with donors to jointly review the process of reform. This is usually twice a year.

One of the most important prerequisites for good donor support and partnership is openness and transparency. Constant interaction, a good flow of information and continuous communication between governments and donors is essential. Comprehensive and reliable communication strategies with donors and between donors need to be developed. Often, donors duplicate and overlap with each other. They should be brought to the table, say every six months, and all of them should work in a spirit of partnership.
It is surprising to note that while most donors require recipients to have codes of conduct, donors, by design or intention, have no code of conduct to govern their operations. The UNDP or the World Bank, should, perhaps, establish a code of conduct for donors. Perhaps the recipients should draw up a minimum code of conduct for donors.

**Selective assistance**

Often, donors provide cosmetic assistance which has no impact at all, and is not based on identified needs. Recipients should question the assistance they receive. Donors should be flexible and allow recipients to determine how resources are to be used as long as there is transparency and accountability on both sides. This has worked well in Uganda where donors pooled their money in one basket for Uganda to use on its CSRP.

Further, the country should be able to reverse or change action if the concerned initiative is not going as intended. In Uganda, when a particular course of action is not moving the country ahead, consultation and discussions with donors have helped them to understand why the country is changing its course and how the new course is more useful than the earlier one.

**Participatory development**

Participatory development is now seen as a priority. A review should be made of what has thus far been done in order to reinforce ongoing efforts and influence future initiatives in civil service reforms.

The use of a central coordinator for the review and monitoring of projects is recommended. Recipients must have a bigger role in reforms and help to chart the way. Civil service reform is a means to achieve better service delivery and economic development. Hence, it is crucial to concentrate efforts there. In order to create a better environment, it is important that policy units be established in partnership with the economic and planning ministries. There is also a need to sharpen planning skills and change organizational cultures. A redefinition of donor and recipient roles is, as mentioned earlier, also necessary.

**Improving Donor-financed Programs and Projects**

Civil service reform is a complex process and requires proper sequencing in relation to other reform programs such as retrenchment. Improved communication between donors and recipients, which should be sensitive to political considerations, is needed. Donors and recipients should understand each other's constraints and reach consensus. This will require flexibility and compromise.

Donor evaluations suggest that there has been a tendency in the past for projects to be overelaborate in design. Typically, they attempt to address too many objectives simultaneously and can sometimes be beyond the capacity of recipients to implement. In general, there is a need for fewer and more realistic objectives; project design needs to be simpler and more flexible so that changes can be accommodated more easily as experience is gained. Another important factor in project design is the need to prioritize reform efforts.
There is also a need for greater recognition of the importance of flexibility on the part of donors in terms of what they are prepared to fund. For example, until recently, many donors were unable to provide recurrent budget support for retrenchment costs. This is changing with the recognition among some donors that CSR involves short-term costs which many governments are simply unable to meet. It is also important that donors have the capacity to provide technical assistance in a flexible way that matches the specific requirements and that terms of reference for advisers and consultants emphasize the need for training local staff and building capacity rather than carrying out a job over the long term that local staff can do.

The discussions on governance, including accountability and transparency, have suggested that improving public services also requires attention to the manner in which countries are governed. Also, as the evidence from our discussions this week suggests, corruption and patrimonialism will constrain CSR. These issues also need to be addressed as a complement to CSR efforts. This may also involve donor assistance.

**Improving Donor Coordination**

The financing requirements and complexity of CSR often require multi-donor involvement and this can create problems for recipients in terms of coordination, program management and administration. The experience of Uganda suggests the need for recipients to actively manage their relationship with the donors. For example, this is done through formal consultation involving program reviews attended by donors visiting Uganda, regular progress reporting and donor meetings, and a policy and planning group which can specifically respond to issues raised by donors. These arrangements have been instrumental in increasing the level and quality of program support in Uganda.

The Uganda experience also highlights the importance of donors being willing to provide technical advisors who are available to all donor agencies interested in supporting the program and developing projects. It would also be useful for donors to take a more pro-active role in attracting additional donor support to programs through, for example, a greater willingness to share information and documentation and by assisting government in generating donor confidence by making presentations to Consultative Group meetings or through a greater willingness to develop cofinancing arrangements.

Finally, it is also important that donors work closely together to synthesize the lessons of experience. There are some examples of this happening. For example, the SPA donors have established a working group to review the experiences of CSR and to prepare guidelines. It is important that the results of this work are shared with African governments.14

Today, Uganda and the donors are the best partners I have ever seen. Indeed, this is so much so that some donors seem more committed to our efforts than some of us, Ugandans. And it would be correct to assert that without donor support, the rebuilding of our country could not

---

14 *Editors’ note:* The SPA “Guiding Principles on Civil Service Reform” are reproduced in this volume as Chapter 4. The Guiding Principles were formally adopted by the SPA in November 1995 and they have been widely shared with African governments.
have been possible so quickly and in such an excellent way. While we applaud such assistance, in Uganda, to reiterate, we are in charge of our affairs and donors are seen as supportive partners.

Other Lessons from the Uganda Experience

- Programs developed must be homegrown and meet the expectations of the recipient countries;

- there ought to be flexibility on the side of both donors and recipients; accordingly, there is need to avoid conditionalities which may adversely affect implementation of programs;

- short-term experts with targeted capacity-building programs are preferred and wherever possible, local expertise must be used;

- recipients should be clear regarding their needs and objectives, as otherwise projects will tend to be donor-driven;

- the coordination of different ministries within a country is important in order to avoid overlap and a commission or coordinating body needs to be put in place and made known to all partners;

- political commitment to the reforms is paramount;

- the recipient countries should create a mechanism which could coordinate all donor activities, and which could potentially establish a donor trust fund managed through a central office;

- donors must be sensitive to the socioeconomic and political environment of client countries, their internal arrangements and the point of entry and contact in the country;

- donor funding should have an exit point and the process of donor assistance should be one of moving from dependency relationships towards interdependence and partnerships;

- appropriate capacity building is needed on both sides: internal capacity needs to be identified, utilized, and strengthened to ensure homegrown implementation; donors must learn to play a partnership role and to move from a blueprint to a facilitative and flexible approach;

- internal partnerships between stakeholders in recipient countries is important; and

- a committee of change to oversee the change process in a country should be considered as was the case in Uganda - the Planning and Implementation Committee of the CSRP.
In Conclusion

- There is need to rethink donor assistance and approach. The new approach requires a stronger emphasis on consultation with users of government services and civil society generally; attention to governance issues; more emphasis on a bottom-up approach to improve the efficiency of government services through results-oriented management; and emphasis on the need for ensuring that the purposes of any program are properly communicated to the public and the civil service.

- The need for local ownership and homegrown programs suggests the need for several changes in the traditional recipient-donor relationship. Namely, a shift away from traditional donor-driven CSR programs whether or not associated with structural adjustment lending programs, avoiding an approach based on conditionality and programs designed by donor-funded experts, as well as a shift away from blueprints to a more flexible process approach.

- The challenge for donors and recipients is how to design programs which can deliver the depth of reform required in a politically acceptable and non-destabilizing way. Any donor-funded CSR program should demonstrate that they have overt political support (both in terms of overall strategy and for the implementation process) as well as clear objectives and reform targets, financing requirements, timetables, implementation arrangements etc. The benefits also need to be sustained over time.

- Donors should adopt a more facilitative and supportive role with the recipient taking the lead in developing the program. However, for this approach to be effective, the recipient must also be willing to take responsibility for the development of a program, to give it the necessary priority and to devote local resources to its implementation. As an example of this kind of approach, the Ugandan model suggests that even at an early stage, well-designed technical assistance to facilitate government efforts can improve the capacity to plan CSR programs without undermining ownership.

- The changing role of donors must still be consistent with their requirements to be accountable for the use of aid funds. This implies that the donor role is to assist the development of CSR projects and programs which are credible and sustainable, rather than just being sources of funding. Donors also have to be able to justify their support in terms of long-term developmental impact and value for money.
INTRODUCTION

The theories of government-controlled economic management and the welfare state are today being widely questioned, and it is now increasingly recognized that the “formal” sector is not the only efficient and effective provider of public services. The private sector, the NGOs and other community and volunteer organizations can play - and indeed are already playing - a key role in delivering high-quality services to the public. There are many lessons that can be drawn from experience to demonstrate the validity of the ‘institutional reconciliation’ paradigm as a basis for building relations of partnership between the state, the private sector and the tertiary sector. This partnership can be made operational in three ways: (i) the state can sub-contract the execution of a specific project to a local private firm, as in the AGETIP model in Senegal; (ii) the local community can mobilize its members to work with the state in delivering public services (the model followed by the NAAM groups in Burkina Faso, the Women’s Anti-AIDS Association in Uganda, the Bamako Initiative, the various indigenous institutions that provide primary health care in The Gambia and Zimbabwe); and (iii) a three-way partnership can be established between the state, the private sector and local communities to ensure proper management and delivery of services to beneficiary groups (the method used in South Africa).

The following is a brief review of four innovative approaches that show how the ‘institutional reconciliation’ paradigm can be applied to improve the delivery of public services, and examines some models that illustrate each of these approaches in order to highlight the lessons that can be learned from these experiments, and to indicate how they can be adapted to the specific context of each country.

LESSONS FROM EXPERIENCE

Private sector sub-contracting: the AGETIP model in Senegal

This experiment has already been so widely studied and hailed as an outstanding success that it is not necessary to go into details here. It is worth noting, nevertheless, that the success of this experiment in Senegal has led to its adoption in several countries of the Sahel (Mali, Niger, etc.). Despite their dependence on external funding, AGETIP projects have been able to instill a
sense of empowerment and project ‘ownership’ among local communities and beneficiaries, by encouraging their participation and consulting them with respect, for example, to the long-term maintenance of existing public infrastructure. The importance of this point is well illustrated in the World Bank’s *World Development Report 1994*, which pointed out that when infrastructure is created without any participation or contribution by its users, it will simply be looked on as a gift from the government, and will be happily accepted without much further thought. If the involvement of the beneficiaries is accepted as an essential condition for producing and delivering public services, then the sub-contracting of part of the work can lead eventually to full privatization and thus help reduce the size of the public sector.

*The empowerment of local communities*

*The NAAM Model in Burkina Faso*

NAAM groups are self-help organizations that were set up to provide services to their communities. Traditionally, ‘Kombi NAAM’, which originated in the northern Yatenga region of Burkina Faso, was a part-time, seasonal association of young people engaged in agricultural work. The man who founded the NAAM in the late 1960s, Bernard Ouedraogo, was inspired by a general sense of frustration at the dysfunctional nature and failure of modern institutions transplanted from abroad, which were rootless and fragile in many respects, and had proven themselves incapable of generating agricultural growth - in other words, incapable of promoting the development of the local communities into which they had been transplanted. This frustration led people to question the notion that modern institutions have a monopoly on the efficient production and delivery of public services. Local communities developed an awareness and a sense of empowerment, and began to take charge of their own affairs. The results were very instructive. For example, in 1986, members of several villages finally completed the hydroelectric dam on the Somiaga River, in the Yatenga Region. This structure, which was over 500 m long and took five or six years to finish, was built entirely by unpaid labor, except for certain portions of the spillway and the concrete buttresses. Today, this kind of organization represents an energetic and cohesive social force that can generate technological innovations, even under difficult circumstances.

From this episode and the history of the NAAM federations, we can draw three lessons: (i) Cultural heritage, with its values of solidarity, consensus, self-discipline, self-reliance, group dynamics, community ethic, etc. can help shape the local communities’ ability to create and reform institutions which can serve as vectors for their own social and economic development: (ii) such constantly evolving indigenous institutions can be the focal point for innovations that will respond to the needs and aspirations of local beneficiaries; (iii) this in turn can create the needed synergy for enhancing institutional effectiveness and economic performance.

*The Uganda model: Women’s Anti-AIDS organizations*

This model shows how Ugandan women have reacted - successfully - to the disturbing spread of AIDS in their country. Despite cultural taboos, a discriminatory legal framework, and their exclusion or under-representation in the male-dominated management of formal anti-AIDS agencies, women have been able to mobilize at the grassroots level and create local organizations of their own to cope with the scourge of AIDS in Uganda.
The AIDS Support Organization (TASO) is a Ugandan women’s organization created by eight women, seven of whom were HIV-positive, following a series of meetings in Kampala in October, 1986. Based on mutual help, moral support and prayer, this non-political and non-sectarian volunteer association offers assistance and counseling to AIDS sufferers. From a community assistance viewpoint, TASO’s work is focused on providing psychological and social assistance to patients and their families: It seeks to enlist all groups within the village in a partnership to provide social, psychological and financial support - without creating any kind of dependence - for people suffering from the disease. This approach is known as ‘social healing’. TASO also serves as a medical, social and financial counseling center for patients and their families. In this way, TASO plays an important social and economic role in the community. More than simply an AIDS prevention organization, TASO is also an assistance institution that helps local communities to develop economic activities and earn income, and promotes the general welfare of its clients and their families.

The success of TASO is closely linked to its ‘Afro-collective’ organizational culture, which has been able to reconcile the traditional values of community solidarity and participatory and decentralized decision-making with the use of modern management techniques. Through its ability to bring about the ‘convergence’ of indigenous needs and the new demands for delivery of high-quality services, it has had a major local impact. The key to its success is simple: it takes an original approach to advising and helping the poorest members of society to improve their living conditions by relying on locally available institutions and solutions as its immediate assets. The lessons to be drawn from this experience go well beyond the issue of caring for AIDS patients they highlight an overall process of psychological, social and economic healing. The shift of attitudes towards AIDS that TASO’s work has accomplished in Uganda is not only significant in the AIDS context itself, but may hold some lessons that can be adapted to help solve some of Africa’s other development problems.

The Bamako initiative on primary health care

Since its creation in 1988 (at the Bamako Conference of African Health Ministers, sponsored jointly by WHO and UNICEF), the Bamako Initiative has become widely recognized as a sustainable, low-cost approach to improving the quality and accessibility of essential health services. Under it, community members have agreed to pay a modest user fee at local health centers or pharmacies, to help defray the cost of health care and medications. Revenues so generated are retained at the health center and managed by a locally elected committee, which may invest them in medical supplies (through a revolving fund), or use them to pay incentive premiums to doctors or other health care providers. The centers also receive government and donor assistance in the form of low-cost, basic pharmaceutical products to help them provide more effective service.

The Initiative has an impressive record of achievements. By 1991, more than twenty countries in Africa and beyond (including Benin, Guinea, Cambodia, Myanmar, Peru, Vietnam, the Republic of Yemen) have taken this approach and adapted it successfully to their own circumstances. Preparatory work is now under way to introduce the concept in Bangladesh, the Comoros, Mongolia, Morocco, Nepal and Tunisia. Key factors in its success to date have included decentralizing the decision-making process from the national to the district level, reorganizing health care delivery by making use of local community institutions, the ability to rely primarily on community funding sources, and co-management of basic health services, including providing a minimum health care ‘package’ at the district level.
Community involvement is clearly the most important feature, and the key to the Initiative’s success. It has shifted the balance of power between service providers and users, and pointed the way to a new form of governance for public health systems. Henceforth, the principal beneficiaries of the health care system - the consumers - will be active partners, with an important voice in how it is run. Funds generated through the community contribution are not passed on to the central Treasury or the health ministry. They stay within the community, and are managed by a locally-elected committee. Surely, this is a prime example of a community taking over the decision-making process, and helping the poor to organize themselves and make their health needs known and addressed.

The lessons that can be drawn from the Bamako Initiative flow essentially from the following two premises. First, where public institutions are weak (as is generally the case in low-income countries), grass roots community action is an essential counterpart to centrally-planned health policy reforms. Second, even low-income households are ready to help pay for improved health care and more efficient services.

*Indigenous Institutions for Providing Primary Health Care: The Gambia and Zimbabwe Models*

The delivery of health care to all groups, without discrimination or distinction, is an ideal that most African countries are far from achieving. Clearly, the fact that individual lives are at stake makes it urgent to take decisive action. There are many possible approaches. The Gambia has opted to orient basic health care towards raising community awareness about health issues, using techniques for mobilizing and providing multi-purpose training to people in the villages. In cooperation with the WHO and other donors, for example, the government has launched primary health care programs for traditional midwives that offer them training in safe childbirth, sterilization methods, weight control and other basic health-related aspects. Village health officers provide advice on prenatal and postnatal care.

From these modest beginnings, primary health care has grown into a comprehensive and highly structured system. This of course represents a departure from the formal health system, under which the Health Ministry in effect ‘transplants’ health inspectors, who are then expected to dispense services in the conventional way, however limited their understanding of the actual health needs of the community. Local responsibility and community participation are thus crucial features in the delivery of primary health care in The Gambia.

Zimbabwe has pursued the goal of creating a symbiotic relationship between the formal health sector and traditional healers. It has established a legal framework under which the traditional healers’ association has been accorded official recognition as an institution. Interestingly enough, the current Vice-Chancellor of the University of Zimbabwe is the President of this association, and serves as a veritable human bridge between the traditional healers and the formal health policy authorities. Since its accreditation, the informal health sector has worked effectively with the formal sector to improve the delivery and quality of health services. Much of the research work on traditional medications is now being conducted jointly by the University of Zimbabwe’s medical school and the Healers’ Association. Some of these traditional medications have already been measured for doses, packaged in capsules, and approved for sale to the public. This is significant progress indeed.
South Africa's three-way partnership: public sector, private sector, local communities

In South Africa, the struggle for economic survival has led many local and regional communities to organize themselves as legally-recognized, democratic institutions to promote their own social and economic growth. They undertake community projects in such fields as education, housing, health, job creation, sport and recreational activities. Their structure and functions vary depending on the specific needs the community has identified as priorities. Generally speaking, they take the form of volunteer forums or non-profit trusteeships, or small works committees devoted to community development.

One of these South African cooperative institutions has adopted the form of a social contract between the public sector, the private sector and the community structure. This three-way partnership represents the outcome of a process of tripartite ‘reconciliation’, as part of the private sector’s efforts to contribute to the National Unity government’s program for reconstruction and development. The three parties have set up job-creation centers to attract investment. Abandoned or underutilized facilities have been rehabilitated and turned into information and training centers. Local businesses (especially SMEs) and industrial and mining concerns are encouraged to pursue an ‘affirmative buying policy’ in favor of local firms, and to keep their capital within the community. Community ‘facilitators’ are trained to act as catalysts for ‘reconciling’ the various cultures. In this way, the partnership has managed to supplant the notion of the ‘zero-sum game’ that typified relations under the old apartheid regime, and has succeeded in implanting convergence and synergy where confrontation once dominated. Diversity is now seen as an asset, not an obstacle.

CONCLUSION

This brief review of experiences serves to highlight the possibilities and advantages - despite some remaining but surmountable problems - inherent in the paradigm of ‘institutional reconciliation’ among the public sector, the private sector, NGOs, local communities and other voluntary organizations, as a way of producing, supplying and improving the quality of public services. From the models outlined here, it can be seen that partnership can be a major asset if it brings together all the parties affected by and involved in the delivery and improvement of public services, including the state. Such a partnership is best exemplified by South Africa’s social contract between government, society and the private sector. The analysis of these experiments also suggests that the solutions described have achieved a measurable impact at relatively low cost. The important point to recognize is that lasting results must be based on a partnership between all parties concerned.
PART THREE

WORKSHOP ON CIVIL SERVICE REFORM IN FRANCOPHONE AFRICA
11. THE WORKSHOP: SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

Guy de Lusignan

Background to the workshop

As the twentieth century draws to a close, the countries of sub-Saharan Africa, the francophone ones in particular, are in the midst of a far-reaching process of reform, involving democratization, a sounder approach to macro-economic policy, devaluation of the CFA franc, restructuring of the public and para-public sector, and institutional change. It must be hoped that these reforms will in the end produce conditions for making the State more efficient and less burdensome, more transparent and less dominating. There must also be a greater degree of synergy between the private and public sectors. Moreover, the growing respect for constitutions and the rule of law should ensure better governance. These are the major themes that inspired the Abidjan Workshop, which was planned as a forum where representatives of francophone African countries could exchange views and experiences among themselves, and with their counterparts from anglophone Africa and the industrialized world. The goal was to assess the quality of administration provided by the civil service, and discuss ways in which it could be improved, and in particular, to explore ways to enhance the use of domestic resources and also coordination among donors in promoting the reform process.

This workshop was a sequel to one held in April, 1995 in Cape Town, South Africa, on Civil Service Reform in anglophone Africa.

There was general agreement among the participants that the Abidjan Workshop fulfilled its mandate and expectations.

- It provided an excellent forum for interaction, where participants from the ten francophone African countries were able to express themselves frankly, directly and constructively;
- The various experiences presented by the experts from developing countries, industrial countries and multilateral and bilateral organizations served first of all to illustrate the

---

This chapter was prepared by Guy de Lusignan, General Rapporteur.

Benin, Burkina Faso, Congo, Côte d’Ivoire, Guinée/Conakry, Mali, Mauritania, Niger, Senegal and Togo.

Botswana, Uganda, the Observatoire des Fonctions Publiques Africaines (OFPA) (an African Civil Service Monitoring Agency), the African Capacity Building Foundation (ACBF), the French Ministry of Cooperation, the Belgian Civil Service Ministry (representing Belgium in the OECD Committee on Public Management), Transparency International (Berlin), the Public
scope of the problems of restructuring administrations and organizing work and employment in countries throughout the world, regardless of their level of technical or economic development. They also highlighted the need to take a comprehensive approach to civil service reform, in recognition of the fact that change can only be meaningful if it is reflected in all aspects of state machinery at the central, regional and local level.

- The workshop drew primarily on concrete examples to demonstrate that Administrative Reform and Civil Service Reform go hand-in-hand, and that to be effective they will require close cooperation between the public and private sectors.
- Finally, the working group discussions produced some valuable insights. These groups covered a wide variety of topics and sub-topics that could point the way to new lines of thought and innovation for the countries participating in the workshop.
- The workshop could have benefited, however, from greater public participation, e.g. by public service users, consumers’ associations, chambers of commerce, labor unions and public employees’ representatives.

Issues for discussion

The opening session was highlighted by a speech by His Excellency the Prime Minister of Côte d’Ivoire, which together with an earlier address by the Honorable Minister for Employment and the Civil Service set the tone for the entire workshop, by stressing the key issues that any reform must address.

- In Sub-Saharan Africa, the civil service has fallen short of its potential for contributing to economic growth. Instead of serving as a driving force, it has over the years proliferated into a complex and cumbersome apparatus that is a burden on the economy.
- A paradigm shift is urgently needed, to privatize commercial activities, for example, so that the state can concentrate its efforts in other areas such as policies for health, education and training. The goal should be to create, by the beginning of the twenty-first century, a public administration that is competent, lean and efficient, while reflecting the concept of a State dedicated to public service and to the values of loyalty, patriotism and equity.
- To achieve this goal will require a ‘forward-looking and creative mindset’ that will allow the current ‘impersonal’ style of administration to be replaced with one focused on providing effective and efficient ‘service’ to its users and consumers.

Exchanges of experience between developing and industrial countries

To put the situation in perspective, the workshop began with a comparative review of several industrial countries of the OECD. It was pointed out that countries around the world, regardless of their stage of development, had all faced a similar set of problems during the 1980s and in the period following the end of the cold war. The environment, difficulties of rural adjustment, urban violence, unemployment that spanned all social classes, and in particular the

---

19 By Mr. Jean-Marie Mottoul, Belgian representative to the OECD Committee on Public Management.
lack of job prospects for young people leaving school or university, and finally the globalization of national economies - all these are basic features of today’s world. Public opinion complains constantly about bureaucratic inefficiency. Administrations seem no longer equipped or capable of meeting public expectations and demands, and their paralysis is thrown into even starker relief by the media, which tend to dramatize these crisis factors as reflections of the population explosion, epidemics, immigration, and the impact of new technologies. As the OECD sees it, the key is to understand what has to be done, and how to do it - governments need to define and put into effect a strategy for making public administrations everywhere more efficient and effective. Evidence from countries such as Ireland, the United Kingdom, New Zealand, Canada and the United States clearly illustrates the following:

- Public administrations can no longer function in compartmentalized isolations.
- If central structures are to be able to provide leadership, civil servants must improve their image by learning to communicate more effectively with the public.
- What is needed is a gradual rather than a radical approach to reform, one that will modernize the civil service over time and bring it closer to the people it is supposed to serve.

A similar analysis can be applied to developing countries, where the issuing of top-down directives is now seen as less effective than an approach based on bottom-up communication. In Sub-Saharan Africa, one country has since its independence shown that, under certain circumstances, a state apparatus can demonstrate a great capacity to adapt. Botswana has achieved a remarkable record through its gradual and pragmatic approach to managing governmental administration. In its case, it was not a question of reforming the civil service, but rather of adopting a systematic policy to institute effective administrative structures and practices that would create a direct relationship between the providers and consumers of public services. Botswana’s experience has been characterized by a comprehensive vision, a strategic approach to planning, and a coherent collective will, as illustrated most notably by the adoption of a productivity-oriented human resource management system modeled on Singapore’s work quality improvement teams. In the final analysis, Botswana has been able since its independence to foster a progressive mentality, a true entrepreneurial culture shaped by the need to move forward in a constantly changing environment, and one that has stressed accountability, transparency and vigilance against corruption.

Elsewhere, the experience of Côte d’Ivoire is perhaps more directly relevant to the circumstances and problems of the ten countries participating in the workshop. In the first place, the history of the various phases and stages of that country’s public administration since independence has shown how difficult it is to impose radical changes in public service systems and to overcome the many obstacles to reform. At regular intervals over the last thirty years, the government of Côte d’Ivoire has launched initiatives to change and improve the administration and the civil service. But the onset of recession and the decline in state resources available for the upkeep of a swollen and expensive bureaucracy has led to a fall in the purchasing power of civil servants, and left them demoralized and without motivation. As a result, facing insecurity in their employment, many have turned to unacceptable behavior involving rent-seeking. Such factors have acted as an additional brake on progress. In short, as this case study concluded, while Côte d’Ivoire has attempted numerous reforms in many areas and sectors, it has never had a comprehensive policy of administrative reform. It is to be hoped that recent initiatives such as the institutional capacity-building project, the reform of the Civil Service Inspector General’s
office, and the establishment of a consolidated budget are an indication that the process of reform is getting under way again.

To the extent that development and growth are no longer regarded as strictly economic issues, what then should be understood by ‘good reforms’ and ‘good governance’? This was the question raised by the Minister for the Civil Service and Administrative Modernization of Burkina Faso, Mrs. Juliette Bonkoungou, who described her country’s experience in her speech to the workshop, and made a ringing appeal for good governance as being essential for development. Burkina Faso would seem to offer some concrete choices and perspectives on this question of governance, in light of the 1991 referendum, in which the people opted to establish the rule of law as part of a new Constitution. At the core of its civil service reform is a change in mentality and behavior. The Minister’s speech was illustrated by a humorous, twenty-minute film entitled ‘Roger the Civil Servant’. It recounted the story of a new recruit in one of the ministries, who took his work very seriously, and was dismayed at the laziness and absenteeism of his colleagues. In the end, poor Roger became an outcast because his very different behavior upset them.

As the Burkina Faso Minister for the Civil Service and Administrative Modernization sees it, the technology boom, with its new channels of information, the end of the cold war and the new international situation created by the emergence of economies-in-transition in the former Soviet Union and its one-time satellites, are having impacts that are both positive and negative, and that affect industrial and developing countries alike. One point however is clear. If Africa’s prospects are to improve, the state will have to address persistent underdevelopment and deepening poverty through greater attention to matters of regulation, social support and equity. Structural adjustment has tended to overshadow reform in the civil service. But at the same time, it has led to the emergence, during this decade, of a comprehensive model of governance that should exhibit the following features.

- On the one hand, the state is to retain its position of leadership, but must pay greater attention to the quality of governance.
- On the other hand, the processes of democratization and economic and social growth demand stability, and thus introduce a political dimension into any type of reforms.
- Finally, the people at large must be involved in every phase of reform and in all attempts to instill good governance. This will not only help promote a development ethic, but will encourage the kind of ‘bottom-up’ approach that will allow people to take responsibility for their own development. This, in turn, should lead to a new, long-run perspective that will rediscover and restore respect for traditional values and approaches that could enable individual citizens to better play their roles in making change more effective.

By the end of the first part of the workshop, a distinct dynamic had been established that shaped the second part. The principal players were of course the participants from the ten invited countries. This summary report attempts to highlight what those participants had to say, in particular in the thematic working groups that formed the core of the workshop. At the outset, we wish to recognize the enthusiasm and vigor with which they contributed to the discussions.

**Theme One: Strategies and timetables for civil service reform**

The purpose of this theme was to define and demonstrate the respective roles of the State, the government and the civil service and how they relate to the particular characteristics of
each country and its society, at a time when state paternalism is in retreat. Where policies and institutions work in favor of the ruling classes and elites, they will inevitably lead to administrative abuses (inefficiency and corruption), and can thus be classed as ‘bad’ governance. But if a political will for change emerges, then political and administrative reforms can be envisaged and applied. In this case, there are two possible approaches, the ‘functional’ and the ‘strategic’. The one will focus on operational capacity building, the other on planning and management capabilities. Some recent country experiences, as summarized above, illustrate how African decision makers appear more determined today to take charge of the reform in their institutions and administrations. This is very encouraging for the future of Sub-Saharan Africa.

The working groups focused on the issues of political will and the participatory process, the social costs of reform policies, and the interaction between the public and private sectors. The commentaries can be summarized as follows.

- It is essential to have political will, backing reform, at the highest levels of power. This means that the leadership must be prepared to install and support beachheads of reform throughout the civil service. Political will cannot be achieved without active public participation and communication. All the partners with an interest in change must be involved. Only their participation can guarantee the success of any reform.

- The social costs of reform will be less onerous than the costs of failing to undertake reform, over the medium and longer term. In any case, there must be a system for helping the victims of reform (those laid-off), and for reintegrating them and converting them to new skills. Leaders and managers must also be willing to delegate and share power, and must set an example of discipline in carrying out reforms. While it is important to make sure that everyone understands why reform is necessary, and what purposes it is to serve, it is only through concrete steps that yield visible short-term results that true reform can occur. Among such steps, priority should be given to personnel management (inventory of employees, establishing new general work code, unifying files); to organization, particularly the strengthening of the decision-making apparatus and the modernization of administrative services (informatics and computerization); and to introducing training plans and programs.

- Finally, there must be a degree of synergy between the public and private sectors, as discussed in Mamadou Dia’s book, *African Management in the 1990s and Beyond* (World Bank, 1996). This work takes an optimistic view, claiming that Africa has a sizable reservoir of talents and abilities that could help to provide local solutions for improving the performance of the continent’s economies and institutions. Such solutions would include having the state sub-contract to the private sector for the local execution of a given project, along the lines of the AGETIP, i.e. the Public Works and Employment Executing Agency model developed in Senegal, which has spread throughout the Sahel region and to other parts of Africa and the world. Inter-sectoral synergy can also be created by establishing one-stop windows for providing specific services. To this end, it is important to recognize that the private sector has a truly useful role to play in development, and not to treat it as an adversary, or as a ‘second fiddle’ or a ‘poor relation’, as one of the two private sector participants put it during the workshop. The private sector can in fact be a very useful tool for alleviating social costs and helping to take over some of the burdens of the state when it disengages from such services, or when it lacks the necessary resources (examples cited included women’s associations to combat AIDS in Uganda, and community health-care initiatives in Bamako).
Theme two: Improving the quality of public services

It is readily admitted that the public sector is no longer providing the level of services expected of it. Consumers and users are unanimous in complaining about inefficiencies and the lack of accountability on the part of civil servants. The latter, for their part, are poorly paid in comparison with the benefits enjoyed by their superiors, and indeed by all those who have a share, however small, in the existing power structure. Civil servants have lost their motivation, and may furthermore find themselves obliged to supplement their salaries - generally in arrears - by turning to other expedients in order to survive. This may help to explain why such poor use is made of the funds allocated to their countries, and indeed why a major portion of such funds tends to be siphoned off.

In other words, governments and public administrations can no longer be expected to provide all public services by themselves. In future, if real improvements are to be made in living conditions and social structures, society - the people at large - is going to have to involve itself more and more as a substitute for the civil service. The kinds of experiments in creating synergy between the public and private sectors (including NGOs) referred to above are steps in the right direction, but they are only a beginning. Their innovative nature, however, fully justifies their claim to represent a new paradigm of ‘institutional reconciliation’, one based on partnership and dedicated to building the capacity to offer a higher quality of public services in an ‘informal’ or private environment.

As part of its case-study approach, the workshop heard a presentation and subsequent comments on the situation in Mali, which is currently engaged in the process of reforming its civil service. This ongoing reform was originally oriented towards controlling civil service numbers and salary costs from an essentially fiscal and budgetary policy viewpoint. The reform was looked on as a means of gaining control over public financial and human resources. More recently, however, the focus has shifted towards results-oriented management, based on the principle that the efficiency of government can be measured by the quality of the services it provides to the public. The ultimate goal of the reform is thus to have an impact on society itself, and on the quality of the country’s economic and social life.

The working groups took advantage of this presentation to debate the comparative advantages of state and society, and to examine the role of consumers and users, and the importance of providing continuous training for state officials. It is useful to underline the following essential points:

- The mission of the state needs to be redefined. While it cannot give up those functions that are inherent to sovereignty, it can delegate powers and responsibilities through decentralization, sub-contracting, or abandoning certain activities that could be just as well performed by society itself. The state and the civil service would then be confined to the ‘higher function of setting objectives, regulation, control and monitoring’. Among specific examples cited were quality circles (Burkina Faso); transferring responsibility for

---

20 The Commissioner of Administrative Reform, Mr. Diossely K. Koné, gave a presentation on his country’s experience, and Mrs. Katrina Sharkey of the Economic Development Institute commented on the presentation.
management and maintenance of village waterworks to local management committees (Mali); and establishing public health centers for distributing pharmaceutical products on a cost-recovery basis that will generate funds for restocking medications. The value of 'one-stop shopping' windows to cut the time needed for handling files and delivering official documents was also stressed.

- Attention also focused on efforts to improve the way users are treated and provided with information and guidance. Taking their lead from what has been done in some anglophone African countries, participants expressed the desire to see francophone countries adopt a 'user's charter' to ensure respect for their rights vis-à-vis public services, and to promote greater accountability, both individual and collective, in the provision of such services. The OFPA (Observatoire des Fonctions Publiques Africaines, an agency that monitors African public services), based in Cotonou, Benin, has prepared a draft user's charter with the help of the Economic Commission for Africa (ECA), which is now reviewing the draft. Other steps of a similar nature have included the establishment of an anti-fraud monitoring agency in Benin, a committee to streamline administrative procedures and formalities (within a single office) in Senegal, and a business environment committee that is working to resolve regulatory problems (also in Senegal). In addition, setting up communication units within public administrations would help to improve the dialogue among officials, the various services and their users. Finally, if there is to be lasting improvement in the quality of public services, the establishment of a constitutional state based on the rule of law would seem essential, in order to avoid the kinds of abuse that the users of public service so often have to face (e.g. to ensure universal and open access to hospitals and health care).

- Another equally important point concerns the retraining of redundant state workers so that they can find themselves a new place in society. But retraining for officials who keep their jobs or are reassigned can be just as useful. One of the working groups quite rightly concluded that continuous training was a valuable form of education for helping people adapt to the changes that reform is supposed to bring about. Training encourages state employees to re-examine their behavior and attitudes, and to develop their sense of professionalism. It should therefore be regarded as a right, and a means of providing motivation. While training may be costly, those costs should be regarded as an investment that will make public administration more cost-effective and more competitive.

**Theme three: Ethics, transparency and accountability**

The Abidjan Workshop, like the one in Cape Town, was able to break the taboo of that 'unmentionable' word, corruption. There was a frank, lively and objective debate on public service ethics and, by extension, on the ethics of development, as well as on the accountability of those who serve the public and those who administer and govern.

This debate was launched by a statement from the former Director General for Development in the Commission of the European Union in Brussels, Mr. Dieter Frisch. The ensuing discussion generated a number of important points that deserve mention here.

---

21 Mr. Dieter Frisch was representing Transparency International, a non-governmental organization based in Berlin that has been working for the past three years to set up an information and support network to expose and combat aid-related corruption in developing and industrial countries.
In the first place, it must be remembered that corruption is by now a universal phenomenon. Thirty-five years ago, it had not yet become a general practice in third world countries. But since then, the series of oil crises - both the rise and the fall in prices - the adjustment crises of the 1980s, the world economic situation of the 1990s, the social crisis in Europe, the emergence of economies-in-transition in Eastern Europe, and the democratic process itself have all conspired to enhance the lure of quick and easy gains, the appeal to egoism, and the profits to be made from engaging in private deals.

Corruption and bribery are front-page news in the media of OECD countries, and have come to be accepted as normal practice in developing countries. Cynics maintain that corruption is a tool for promoting development. But on the contrary, it is the consequence of predatory economic policies that flow from a combination of Africa’s system of state ownership, nepotism and sheer greed for the ‘fast buck’. Corruption has advanced to the point where it now plays a significant role in the indebtedness of some countries.

Moreover, as Mr. Frisch very rightly pointed out, there is a direct link between corruption and poverty. At the end of the story about “Roger the Civil Servant” (see earlier text), poor Roger, ill-paid and under constant pressure from his family and village to get rich, is driven to take advantage of his position and the prevailing atmosphere to engage in corruption - something he had no intention of doing initially. This is what often happens with people like him: in order to survive, they are driven either to become corrupt, or to corrupt others, depending on the circumstances. Bribe-givers and bribe-takers can be found at all levels, from the lowliest clerk through the middle layers of officials to the big bosses, ministers and Heads of State - without forgetting all the foreign company representatives and local or outside political lobbyists. The list of examples is endless.

One approach to the problem, within the context of downsizing the civil service, might be found in revising salary scales and reducing staff by shedding those who are inefficient or unmotivated, or who demonstrate unacceptable behavior and attitudes. But as Mr. Frisch pointed out, cutting staff is not the answer in itself. For one thing, those who are let go must, in principle, be given another job, while those who remain may still lack motivation, or be ready to engage in various ‘sidelines’ and continue their corrupt activities.

It should be added that another negative effect of corruption is to repel potential investors and foreign aid partners. This too can act as a brake on development. How then can corruption best be combated? This question became one of the items of the agenda of the working groups constituted to discuss ethics, transparency and accountability. The following are the main recommendations of the participants:

- The legislative and institutional framework must be reformed to establish or sustain a legal system that outlaws illicit gains.
- Sanctions must be applied to the full, and the enforcement system must operate openly; it would also be appropriate to provide for joint control (donor and beneficiary country) over the use of external resources.
- It would also be helpful to introduce an ombudsman or some other system for arbitrating disputes, following the example of countries such as Tanzania, South Africa and Ghana.
- Senior officials should be required to declare their property and holdings before taking up office, and should be prosecuted for any instances of bribery or graft; this highlights the
importance of ensuring that strong and independent legal instruments for pursuing corruption are available to legislatures and the public.

- Efforts should be made to change the patronizing attitude that now characterizes the relationship between officials and users, and to prevent the political nepotism that is so common in the management of public affairs.
- Investigative journalism should be encouraged as a way of exposing unacceptable behavior by officials, and the print and audiovisual media should be used to denounce instances of corruption.
- In the end, a new concept of citizenship is needed that will make people more aware of the public interest and of their personal responsibility, while promoting and encouraging a form of governance that serves the citizenry.

**Theme four: Rethinking donor support for civil service reform**

Civil service reform will always be a painstakingly difficult and costly affair, in both financial and human terms. The final major issue dealt with by the workshop concerned the role of donors and the impact of their assistance on efforts aimed at bringing about real change in the machinery of public administration. Uganda's experience has highlighted the need for greater coordination among donors in this regard. Those donors that had taken part in the Cape Town workshop reviewed their own experiences, and stressed the need to work together more closely to ensure that aid is truly effective, and is accepted as such by the recipient country.

There is little point in complaining that external funding has been insufficient to meet the expectations of governments, administrations and the direct beneficiaries of aid. The problem lies, rather, in other areas - in poor analytical work with respect to objectives, needs and strategies, for example, or in faulty implementation of the reforms themselves (which may in fact betray a lack of willingness to take action: the texts may be ready, the studies may have been done, but still nothing happens). Or it may lie in the lack of appropriate legal instruments to impose and enforce the kind of measures needed to bring about a real change in the behavior of civil servants (by appealing to their professionalism, for example) and to establish a fairer basis for remunerating them. After its nightmare of terror, dictatorship and civil war, Uganda is now performing quite well. Thus, when the National Resistance Movement took power in 1986, it already had an action plan, a strategy and clearly-defined goals. It knew exactly what it wanted to do: re-establish peace and regain the public's confidence. It also knew that to achieve these goals, it must rely on the good will of donors, but it was determined to do so on its own terms. On the one hand, donors would have to understand the environment they would be operating in, while on the other hand, local expertise, i.e. Ugandan consultants, would be required to help put the reforms and changes into effect. Donors and their consultants would be asked for help only where it was needed. They would have to learn to act as constructive partners and to have confidence in local capabilities. If donors were operating at cross purposes in pursuit of their own interests, it would have to be clearly recognized that 'such assistance is a sham and will have no impact'. In the area of civil service reform in particular, which is so complex and delicate (issues relating, for example, to dismissals, compression and downsizing, job reclassification and re-employment), donors would absolutely have to coordinate their assistance, both among themselves and with the recipient country.

For Uganda, the most important thing, as was stated by Dr. Kisubi, an advisor to the Civil Service Reform Program, after all the horrors that the country had been through, was to
demonstrate a degree of pride in its dealings with donors, to lay its cards on the table, and to insist that Ugandans alone were in charge, and would never accept aid on terms or for projects that were contrary to their national interest. And yet, after several years’ experience, as Dr. Kisubi noted, “...the cooperation we have established is so good that certain donors seem more enthusiastic about our efforts than some of us. Without donor support, we could never have put our economy back on track in such a short time, and with such excellent results.” The donors’ message has been virtually the same: aid must be based on partnership, and donors must be willing to show greater flexibility, while working within clearly defined terms of reference. They have been the first to stress the climate of corruption and patronage as a key obstacle to civil service reform. At the same time, all parties involved in reform programs must accept the principle of self-evaluation, if these programs are to have a real impact.

Discussion in the working groups led to formulation of the following recommendations.

- While it is clear that there must be a frank and productive dialogue between donors and beneficiary countries, this must nonetheless take the domestic capabilities and expertise of the recipient country as its starting point. The approach to civil service reform must be participatory and ‘internalized’ within the state and civil society.
- Technical assistance and capacity building must therefore be one of the objectives of any dialogue between donors and recipients. Similarly, recipients must be able to make their own choices as to the type of assistance they are seeking, since they are in the best position to know how to adapt it to local conditions - a factor that might well call for south/south cooperation.
- Better coordination between donors and beneficiary countries could also strengthen the selection criteria for financing reform projects, and would facilitate their implementation; at the same time, it would be useful to appoint a national supervisor in the recipient country, to oversee coordination and execution of projects financed through external assistance. Finally, it might be desirable for donors to name a ‘lead coordinator’ who would monitor ongoing work under mutually accepted terms of reference.

Conclusions

Before winding up their work, participants held an exchange of views on follow-up to the workshop. To begin with, it was agreed that the forum organizers would provide all participants with copies of the final report and summary of the discussions. It was also agreed to give the widest possible distribution to the workshop’s conclusions, so that action could be taken in respect of specific themes and at the national and regional levels:

- Specific themes: As a backdrop, should the role of the state be redefined regarding the extent to which it should be the engine of development? Or rather, should it focus more on the strengthening of its managerial capacity in areas of its competence (i.e. related to constitutional duties and respect for the rule of law, macroeconomic policies, defense, security foreign affairs)? As a result, would the state leave to economic and social actors the responsibility to run all other sectors of activities? Thus, future seminars or workshops could focus on one or a combination of the following specific themes: decentralization and deconcentration; reinforcing the rule of law by strengthening the administration of justice; enhancing government capacity for policy formulation and implementation; improving public financial management; reducing corruption; and greater public involvement by users and consumers in the reform process.
• At the national level: implementing the suggestions and recommendations arising from the meeting; developing greater knowledge and understanding about individual countries, especially those that have successfully implemented or are about to implement reform in their civil service, by establishing domestic contacts at the grass-roots level (users/consumers, the public at large).

• At the regional level: taking advantage of the OFPA network (Observatoire des Fonctions Publiques Africaines) and the ACBF (Africa Capacity Building Foundation) to exchange information and experiences among African countries; OFPA and ACBF could promote visits and contacts to help countries learn more about each others’ experiences.

In addition, a third workshop is envisioned, this time for the countries of Portuguese-speaking Africa, which could then be followed by a workshop at the ministerial level that would cover the entire continent, south of the Sahara.

The issue of inter-agency coordination should also be pursued. In the first place, individual donors could set up their own monitoring units. Next could come a joint commitment by donors and recipient countries to support and pursue reform. Finally, the results of the reform process could be assessed against performance indicators adopted in conjunction with donor agencies.

In conclusion, what exactly was learned from the experiences presented during the workshop as to how countries should set about reforming their civil service? While many valuable and realistic recommendations and suggestions were made, it still remains to develop a new civil service ethic for achieving in-depth reform to instill the values and motivations that underlie a true public service, i.e. one that is devoted above all to serving the public. In the final analysis, public service must have a collective dimension, and this, in turn, demands that governments govern differently. This means, first of all, favoring a long-term viewpoint over impulsive and abrupt short-term decisions. Second, it means opening windows of opportunity to civil society: rulers and decision makers at all levels must learn to listen to the public if they are to understand where the obstacles and the possibilities lie. Only then can the reform process be properly launched in the spirit of tolerance that is essential to its success.
ANNEX A: SPEECH BY THE HONOURABLE MINISTER FOR EMPLOYMENT AND THE CIVIL SERVICE

Professor Atsain Achi

Mr. Prime Minister,
Madam Minister of the Republic of Burkina Faso,
Ministers,
Ambassadors,
Seminar Participants,
Directors,
Ladies and gentlemen,

Côte d’Ivoire is honored to be hosting this Regional Workshop on administrative reform in francophone Africa that is opening this morning in Abidjan, and that brings together almost a dozen countries, with the participation of a number of prestigious international institutions: the World Bank, the Observatoire des Fonctions Publiques Africaines, the European Community, the Technical Services of the United Nations and the French Ministry for Cooperation.

Mr. Prime Minister,

Your presiding over this ceremony is proof of the special interest that you have taken in the Department for which we are responsible.

Last week, the National School of Administration was honored by your presence to bestow your distinguished name on this year’s class.

This morning, you are among us once again for the official opening of the Regional Workshop on Administrative Reform in Francophone Africa.

Our country’s entire administration is infinitely grateful to you for the constant interest and support that you have shown.

Please accept our thanks and those of the organizers of this Workshop.

Mr. Prime Minister,

At a time when the government of Côte d’Ivoire is firmly engaged in taking steps to modernize our public services, this forum of international experts in public administration, from Africa and around the world, provides an opportunity to take stock of the measures pursued by Côte d’Ivoire and to compare them with the experiments that are under way in other countries.
Improving public services, and an emphasis on ethics, transparency and discipline, are the elements that underlie the Government’s efforts to enhance the performance of our civil service.

Generally speaking, developing a spirit of entrepreneurship, the constant search for administrative efficiency, the setting of performance criteria, the need to achieve results, and the search for competitiveness are ideas that are no longer foreign to any public administration that pretends to be modern, effective and productive.

To keep up with this change in thinking, neither the civil service nor public administration in francophone countries can afford to dismiss the many criticisms that have been leveled at our public services by their users.

How many times have we heard that the cost of public services provided to users is too high, whether in the private or the public sector?

These costs are swollen by practices that reflect essentially the pursuit of individual gain.

How many times have we heard people complain about the lack of transparency in our administrative services, and about the inequality of access and treatment accorded to the users of public services?

Must we stress once again the culture of loyalty, faithfulness and patriotism that is implied in the concept of the State and the institutions that make it up?

Since the State is an impersonal thing, its servants must distance themselves from any attempts to personalize it.

Indeed, this is the cardinal virtue that the President of the Republic, His Excellency Henri KONAN BEDIE, has tried to instill in all our citizens, and which underlies his personal philosophy about the role and functions of the State.

Ministers and honorable guests,

If some of the organizers have insisted on the participation of public service users, it was out of a desire to make accessible to everyone a public administration that is equipped to meet the needs of our society, which indeed is the central concern of this Workshop.

But then, what kind of State could fail to develop a forward-looking attitude among its civil servants, that takes account both of the existing situation and of foreseeable social changes, in its planning and operations?

We must not only be forward-thinking, we must also bring public administration closer to the user.

This is why decentralization should not be looked at as merely stripping bureaucrats of their power. On the contrary, a pragmatically-based decentralization that ensures that such roads do not lead to dead-ends will strengthen the central government’s authority, and is a goal that all new States such as those who have organized this regional Workshop should be pursuing.
The primary goal is to conduct our work so that we can arrive at an action program for equipping the countries of francophone Africa with a development-oriented administration that will serve our young economies well, and stimulate the private sector.

Let me express the hope that these four days of discussion will bring us closer to this central goal.

Thank you.
ANNEX B: SPEECH BY H.E. MR. DANIEL KABLAN DUNCAN, PRIME MINISTER

On the occasion of the opening ceremonies for the Regional Workshop on Administrative Reform in Francophone Africa, January 23-26, 1996

Madam Minister for the Civil Service and Modernization of Burkina Faso,
Mr. Minister for Employment and the Civil Service of Côte d'Ivoire,
Mr. Director for West Central Africa at the World Bank,
Distinguished representatives of multilateral and bilateral cooperation agencies,
Honored guests and participants, ladies and gentlemen,

In the month of April, 1995, a regional seminar on administrative reform in English-speaking countries was held in Cape Town, South Africa.

Today, I am particularly happy that, thanks to the initiative of the World Bank and the Côte d'Ivoire Ministry for Employment and the Civil Service, a workshop is being devoted to an in-depth exploration of ways of managing the civil service of the future in francophone Africa.

The holding of this forum demonstrates the tremendous interest that the Chief of State, His Excellency Mr. Henri Konan BEDIE, and his government attach to enhancing the efficiency of our national administrative systems.

In our countries, public administration has over the years come to represent a complex and cumbersome burden on the economy. The sums devoted to the operations of government have grown ever higher, and have led to a permanent imbalance in our public finances.

Instead of being an engine of economic growth, therefore, the civil service has begun to act more and more as a brake on growth, given its costs, its poor performance and the burdens it imposes.

This trend must be reversed urgently. In Côte d'Ivoire, we have already taken two essential steps in this direction.

The first has to do with privatization, where the government has decided to withdraw from all areas that can be handled by the private sector, and from commercial activities in particular. This will allow the State to concentrate the bulk of its efforts on the real business of government, in areas such as security, defense, education and health - which is not to say that the private sector does not also have an important contribution to make in education and health.
The second step has involved those National Public Corporations that remained in State hands following privatization. These must now be better managed, so that they will not become a burden on public finances as a result of the subsidies needed to cover their deficits.

In our African States, a great many reforms have been undertaken over the last few years in various areas and sectors, with greater or lesser degrees of success. Unfortunately, these reforms have not always benefited from proper coordination and a clear strategy.

It is this fact, and the need to deal with it through more consistent and effective joint action, that justifies the holding of this ‘Regional workshop on administrative reform in francophone Africa’, where many highly qualified people will spend four days in Abidjan thinking about these problems.

To come to terms with the challenges of the twenty-first century, we need right now to have a strong, capable and efficient public administration that is attentive to the needs of the State, the citizenry and the economy.

This workshop is thus very timely, and should help us to develop strategies and methods for managing the major services provided by the State that will support our government in its role as an engine of development.

This workshop will help our countries to examine their experiences and prepare new strategies for reforming the public administration and improving the quality of service provided, so as to make the best use both of our own resources and those of the funding agencies.

Performance should be an essential parameter of our administrative system.

Let us not forget that the success of the various economic reforms we have undertaken will depend in the end on the people in charge of carrying them out.

The effectiveness of the human factor is without a doubt one of the most decisive aspects of achieving real progress in our administrative systems.

In this regard, I should stress that we are going to have to move toward a smaller, more efficient and better-paid civil service.

We need to develop a formula for ensuring that remuneration is closer to those in the private sector. A good salary is an effective means for keeping the best performers, that is to say, people who demonstrate a high capacity for work.

On the other hand, it would be advisable to replace the current system of generalized and automatic promotion with one based on specific performance incentives, in order to reward those who make the greatest efforts at each stage of their career.

Ladies and gentlemen, we hope that this workshop will offer some conclusions that will help to shed light on some of the salient questions about civil service reform. These conclusions should help us identify specific actions that can be taken, both nationally and regionally, to improve training and skills development.
As I see it, developing skills and abilities means providing for greater mobility of personnel within the civil service. Such a formula should produce more versatile employees with multi-sectoral experience that can be put to use for the benefit both of the State and the employees themselves.

It is most gratifying that we have so many representatives from our own and other regions who have come together to share their abilities in the common interest.

In fact, thanks to the work that has been done, it should soon be possible to make the civil service fulfill its central role: to plan and oversee our economic development programs. One of the main ways of achieving that must be to make our public administration more and more open to the private sector, to understand it more thoroughly, and in the end to establish a real partnership between the State and the private sector.

Of course, we need to remember that any reform must take due account of our different political and cultural systems if it is to be effective. I am not going to underestimate the complex task you have in front of you.

As far as the Ivorian Government is concerned, we are determined to work to encourage and support a more far-reaching approach to reform. We have no shortage either of political will or of abilities. We are ready to examine closely any action programs you may propose for making our administration as efficient and effective as possible, and for making the best use of our available resources.

Let me express my sincere thanks to our various partners in development, most particularly the World Bank and the United Nations, who have made such a splendid contribution to the organization of this meeting. I wish you full success in your work. I now declare this ‘Regional workshop on civil service reform in francophone Africa’ to be officially opened.

Thank you.
ANNEX C: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Benin

Mr. Barnabé C. Konnigu, Deputy Director, MFPR
Mme Léontine Attolu, Director for Reform, Organization and Methods, MFPR
Mr. Eustache Kotingan, Representative, Private Sector

Burkina Faso

Mr. Félix Ye, Commissioner for Reform and administration
Mr. Seydou Bouda, Coordinator, PAGE

Congo

Mr. Jean Benoît Missamou Mbouity, Advisor to Prime Minister
Mr. Paul Mabiala-Mampassi, Director General, Ministry of Civil Service
Mr. Fulbert Bangayala, Advisor, Ministry of Civil Service, MTFPSS
Mme Romaine Aissi, Chief, Composante Référence Institutionnelle, DEPF

Côte d'Ivoire

Mr. Alexis Hibault, Directeur des études et de l’Organe administratif, MEFP
Mr. Mathias Akoubé, Deputy Director, Training, MEFP
Mr. Sylla Lassana, Director for Administrative and Financial Affairs, MEFP
Mr. Bouady Aké, Director, Person nel Management, MEFP
Mme Simone Tchinah, Directrice de la formation professionnelle et des concours, MEFP
Mr. Lazare A. Latte, Deputy Director, DEOA,
Mr. N’Guessan Ya, Director, DPCE, Ministry of Civil Service
Mr. Koffi Kouakou Christophe, Deputy Director, DEOA, Ministry of Civil Service
Mr. Diomandé Ali, Chargé d’Etudes, DEOA, Ministry of Civil Service
Mr. Jean-Baptiste Aboua, Consultant, DEOA, Ministry of Civil Service
Mme Allouko Françoise, Consultant, DEOA, Ministry of Civil Service
Mr. Aka Jean-Pierre, Deputy Director, DEOA, Ministry of Civil Service
Mr. Marie Jadot, Consultant, DEOA, Ministry of Civil Service
Mr. Schmidt Delavant, Consultant, DEOA, Ministry of Civil Service
Mr. Thierry Becheret, Consultant, DEOA, Ministry of Civil Service
Guinée/Conakry

Mr. Sékou Traoré, Membre de la Cellule d’appui technique du CCEF, Adviser, Ministry of Finance
Mr. Mohamed Bill Camara, Directeur national de la réforme administrative
Mr. Simon Pierre Lenaud, Chargé des dossiers des déflatsés de la fonction publique

Mali

Mr. Hamdy S. Ould Albachir, Chargé de mission à la Présidence de la République
Mr. Diossely K. Koné, Commissioner to administrative reform

Mauritania

Mr. Achour Ould Samba, Secretary General, Ministry of Plan
Mr. Ahmed Salem Ould Boubouit, University Professor/Adviser, MEP
Mr. Ahmedou Ould Mohamed Sultane, Director, Civil Service

Niger

Mr. Soumaila Ibrahim, Secretary General, Ministry of Civil Service
Mr. Ibrahima Mayaki, Secretary General, USTN
Mme Salifou Mariama, High Commissioner, HCRAD

Senegal

Mr. Mamadou Dia, Chef de cellule, CCEMS, MEFP
Mr. Souleymane Nasser Niane, Director, Ministry of Civil Service
Mme Coumba Thiam, Representative of SPIDS

Togo

Mr. Mawussi Djossou Semodji, Chargé de mission auprès du Premier Ministre

Participants from other African and International organizations

Mr. Pierre Vincent Ngambo Fonjo, Observatoire des fonctions publiques africaines (OFPA)
Mr. Joachim Fritz, GTZ, Benin
Mr. Garnier, French Ministry of Cooperation
Mr. R. Géppert, Chef de service pour la Coopération avec la DCS, la Guinée et le Libéria
Mr. Hallade Luc, Adviser to MCAC, Abidjan
Mr. Eric Lamouroux, French Ministry of Cooperation
Mr. A. Land, Centre européen pour la gestion de la politique du développement (ECDPM)
Dr. Rukudzo Murapa, UN/DDSMS-DPADM, United Nations
Mr. Apollinaire Ndarukwigira, African Capacity Building Foundation (ACBF)

World Bank

Mr. Ladipo Adamolekun, Sr. Public Sector Management Specialist, Africa Region
Mr. Armand Atomate, Consultant, Africa Region
Mr. Jean-Claude Balcet, Resident Mission, Côte d'Ivoire
Mr. Franz Kaps, Director, Operations Support, Africa Region
Mr. Manga Kuoh, Sr. Public Sector Management Specialist, Africa Region
Mr. Rachidi Radji, Economist, Resident Mission, Côte d'Ivoire
Mrs. Mary Oakes Smith, Division Chief, Africa Region
Mr. Mark Schacter, Public Sector Management Specialist, Africa Region
Mme Katrina Sharkey, Public Management Specialist, IDE

People-Resources

Mr. K. Appia, Consultant
Mme Juliette Bonkoungou, Ministry of Civil Service and modernization of administration, Burkina Faso
Mme Isabel Corte-Real, Consultant
Mr. Dieter Frisch, Consultant
Dr. Mohammed A.M. Kisubi, Consultant
Mr. Guy de Lusignan, Consultant
Mr. Mogolori Modisi, Consultant
Mr. Jean-Marie Mottoul, Consultant
ANNEX D: LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Adamolekun, Ladipo, Sr. Public Sector Management Specialist, Africa Region

Atomate, Armand, Consultant, World Bank

Bonkoungou, Juliette, Ministry of Employment and Civil Service, Burkina Faso

Hibault, Alexis, Directeur des études et de l'organisation administrative, Ministère de l'emploi et de la fonction publique, Côte d'Ivoire

Kaul, Mohan, Director, Management and Training Division, Commonwealth Secretariat, London

Kisubi, Mohammad, ex-Adviser, Civil Service Reform Program, Uganda

de Lusignan, Guy, ex-Deputy Director, Economic Development Institute, World Bank and Independent consultant.

Modisi, Mogolori, Independent consultant, ex-Director of Civil Service, Botswana

Pope, Jeremy, Director General of Transparency International, Berlin

Shand, David, In charge of Management and Public Administration, OCDE, Paris

No. 310 Elder and Cooley, editors, *Sustainable Settlement and Development of the Onchocerciasis Control Programme Area: Proceedings of a Ministerial Meeting*

No. 311 Webster, Riopelle and Chidzero, *World Bank Lending for Small Enterprises 1989-1993*

No. 312 Benoit, *Project Finance at the World Bank: An Overview of Policies and Instruments*

No. 313 Kapur, *Airport Infrastructure: The Emerging Role of the Private Sector*


No. 316 Schware and Kimberley, *Information Technology and National Trade Facilitation: Making the Most of Global Trade*

No. 317 Schware and Kimberley, *Information Technology and National Trade Facilitation: Guide to Best Practice*


No. 320 Srivastava, Lambert and Vietmeyer, *Medicinal Plants: An Expanding Role in Development*

No. 321 Srivastava, Smith, and Forno, *Biodiversity and Agriculture: Implications for Conservation and Development*

No. 322 Peters, *The Ecology and Management of Non-Timber Forest Resources*

No. 323 Pannier, editor, *Corporate Governance of Public Enterprises in Transitional Economies*

No. 324 Cabraal, Cosgrove-Davies, and Schaeffer, *Best Practices for Photovoltaic Household Electrification Programs*

No. 325 Bacon, Besant-Jones, and Heidarian, *Estimating Construction Costs and Schedules: Experience with Power Generation Projects in Developing Countries*

No. 326 Colletta, Balachander, Liang, *The Condition of Young Children in Sub-Saharan Africa: The Convergence of Health, Nutrition, and Early Education*


No. 328 De Geyndt, *Social Development and Absolute Poverty in Asia and Latin America*

No. 329 Mohan, editor, *Bibliography of Publications: Technical Department, Africa Region, July 1987 to April 1996*

No. 332 Pohl, Djankov, and Anderson, *Restructuring Large Industrial Firms in Central and Eastern Europe: An Empirical Analysis*

No. 333 Jha, Ranson, and Bobadilla, *Measuring the Burden of Disease and the Cost-Effectiveness of Health Interventions: A Case Study in Guinea*

No. 334 Mosse and Sontheimer, *Performance Monitoring Indicators Handbook*

No. 335 Kirmani and Le Moigne, *Fostering Riparian Cooperation in International River Basins: The World Bank at Its Best in Development Diplomacy*

No. 336 Francis, with Akinwumi, Ngwu, Nkom, Odihi, Olomajeye, Okunmadewa and Shehu, *State, Community, and Local Development in Nigeria*

No. 337 Young, *Measuring Economic Benefits for Water Investments and Policies*


No. 340 Rutkowski, *Changes in the Wage Structure during Economic Transition in Central and Eastern Europe*

No. 341 Goldstein, Preker, Adeyi, and Chellaraj, *Trends in Health Status, Services, and Finance: The Transition in Central and Eastern Europe, Volume I*

No. 343 Kottetel and Whitten, *Freshwater Biodiversity in Asia, with Special Reference to Fish*

No. 344 Klugman and Schieber with Heleniak and Hon, *A Survey of Health Reform in Central Asia*

No. 345 Industry and Mining Division, Industry and Energy Department, *A Mining Strategy for Latin America and the Caribbean*

No. 347 Stock and de Veen, *Expanding Labor-based Methods for Road Works in Africa*

No. 350 Buscaglia and Dakolias, *Judicial Reform in Latin American Courts: The Experience in Argentina and Ecuador*


No. 355 Lambert, Srivastava, and Vietmeyer, *Medicinal Plants: Rescuing a Global Heritage*

No. 356 Aryeetey, Hettige, Nismane, and Steel, *Financial Market Fragmentation and Reforms in Sub-Saharan Africa*