

**JAMAICA**  
**Education Transformation Capacity Building Project**  
**Supervision Mission: 13 -17 June 2011**  
**Aide Memoire**

1. A World Bank Supervision Mission was conducted from 13 to 17 June 2011 to review the technical implementation of the Jamaica Education Transformation Capacity Building Project. The Mission team included Cynthia Hobbs (Team Leader/Senior Education Specialist), Althea Spence (Operations Analyst) and Yao Wottor (Senior Procurement Specialist, by VC). Mozammal Hoque (Senior Financial Management Specialist) carried out the fiduciary supervision on a separate visit on 7 June 2011. The findings and recommendations from his discussions are included in this Aide Memoire. The Mission met with counterparts in the Ministry of Education (MOE), the Ministry of Finance and the Public Service (MOFPS), and the Planning Institute of Jamaica (PIOJ) (*see Annex 1 for a complete list of participants*). The Mission wishes to express its sincere gratitude to the Jamaican authorities for their kind collaboration during the visit.
2. The main objectives of the mission were to:
  - Evaluate the progress towards achievement of the disbursement-linked triggers (DLTs) for FY2011-12;
  - Observe and discuss the capacity building efforts and overall progress made to establish the various roles and responsibilities of the National Education Institute (NEI), Jamaica Teaching Council (JTC), Regional Education Entities (REEs – now referred to as the Department of School Services/DSS), and the National Education Trust (NET);
  - Review procurement arrangements, the project procurement plan, and specific methods to be used for contract awards, and clarify procedures for Bank procurement review; and
  - Review financial management aspects of the project, including the accounting records, flow of funds, organization, staffing and procedures; the FM reporting mechanism (IFR); management of the Designated Account; and the status of the External Audit, and communication of TORs to the Auditor General, the project auditor.

**Overview**

3. The Education Transformation Capacity Building Project contributes to the Government's broader national Education System Transformation Programme (ESTP). The Mission was favourably impressed by all that has been achieved over the last year. The greatest challenge at the moment is the drafting of outstanding job descriptions in order to begin the movement of staff, as well as the legal processes required to establish the entities to support the ESTP. The change management work is critical to the success of the transformation and modernization processes.
4. Recognizing that there would be inherent changes in the transformation and modernization processes, the MOE carried out a culture change survey. The survey helped the MOE's HR and ESTP teams to better understand how MOE staff viewed these processes. Based on the

survey results, the MOE selected change champions and developed a communications strategy to sensitize staff to the changes upcoming. In addition, the MOE, Cabinet Office, trade unions and MOE staff developed an HR Transition Policy to guide staff from old to new structures and entities, allowing for transparency and equity in the system. ATOS developed a rapid training needs analysis, and the Management Institute for National Development (MIND) was commissioned to deliver training in selected areas, such as leadership at the middle management level, policy development, project management, and so forth.

5. The Mission team discussed progress made towards the achievement of disbursement-linked targets and towards the establishment of the new agencies. In this context, the MOE informed the Mission that the description in the Project Appraisal Document and Loan Agreement regarding the Regional Education Authorities should be revised to better describe the current model (DSS) which comprises changes and capacity building at both the central and regional levels. The Mission agreed to confer with Bank management regarding project restructuring requirements and the appropriate timing for the requested revisions.

***Disbursement-Linked Targets (DLTs):***

6. The following table outlines the progress made towards achievement of the next five DLTs, scheduled to be assessed in November 2011:

<b>DLTs</b>	<b>Status</b>
(i) At least 10 Quality Education Circles in operation	Achieved. Some 60 QECs have been established and are operating at different levels
(ii) Inspection handbook approved by MOE	The handbook has been drafted and is being reviewed. It should be approved by September 2011, in time for the start of the new academic year.
(iii) At least 3,000 teachers registered by the JTC	The development of the more robust system is ongoing. Information on 23,400 teachers is available and will be migrated into the new system to allow for distribution of individual registration numbers. If the current pace of work continues, this target should be met.
(iv) Communications plan for stakeholders developed and approved by MOE	Achieved. The plan has already been developed and approved and is being implemented.
(v) NET operational plan approved by MOE	The plan is under preparation and should be finalized by November 2011.

Source: Semester Report, World Bank/Government of Jamaica, Education Transformation Capacity Building Project, October 2010-March 2011.

***Technical Review of the ESTP***

7. Central Policy Ministry: Although the Project does not currently finance changes at this level, the shift from the current MOE structure to a central policy ministry is critical to the transformation and modernization processes. For this reason, it is important to document progress in this area. The MOE has developed a structure for the central policy ministry which has gone through several levels of review. In addition, the MOE has looked at TORs for first and second-tier staff positions with the Cabinet office. The work on the DSS will help to better define some of the responsibilities of the central policy ministry as they refer to support to schools. For the Finance and Human Resource Divisions, positions have been redefined and reclassified, and initial efforts have been made to match the new positions with current staff where possible. Internal advertising will be followed by interviews. Once the first and second-tier staff is in place, the transitioning of other members of staff can begin, using the Transition Policy as the foundation for decisions. The greatest challenge with the work on the Central Policy Ministry is the transition of roles and responsibilities while maintaining the current ongoing functions of the MOE.
8. National Education Inspectorate (NEI): The new inspection system is well underway. To date, 150 inspectors have been trained and 165 school inspections completed. Of these, 30 inspection reports are available on line, and 50 reports are awaiting approval of the Minister of Education. Approximately 40 of the inspectors were selected to comprise a core team of lead inspectors. They received intensive two-day training in writing and quality assurance of the reports, as well as an approach to looking at the whole school for effectiveness to ensure internal consistency of the reports (e.g. observed quality of teaching should correlate with student performance). Based on experience, the NEI has developed a protocol for small and large schools. Inspection teams are working more systematically, and the increased numbers of trained inspectors have allowed for improved rotation of team members. Most schools have expressed appreciation for the information provided through the inspections and are willing to implement the recommendations. The NEI has developed an inventory of recommendations, outlining the type of recommendation, the responsible agent, and the level of priority. The NEI then passes this information on to the corresponding agency (school, JTC, DSS/ regional offices) to facilitate follow-up and support to the schools.
9. There are DLTs tied to the work of the NEI for each year of the Project. By December 2010, the 10 pilot inspections had been carried out and the reports were publicly available on the MOE's website. The DLT for 2011 is the approval of the *Handbook for Inspections* by the MOE. The November 2010 Aide Memoire fully describes the content and framework of the handbook. The Handbook has been drafted and is under review, based on experience on the ground and feedback from focus groups of inspectors. Feedback is generally positive, and the review process should be finalized by the end of June. The Handbook will be approved in time to roll it out for the new academic year.
10. *Recommendations*: The inspection process has improved. The following would solidify the process and facilitate the MOE's transformation programme: (a) The Mission commended the NEI's initiative to develop an inventory of types of recommendations (policy or program) and required follow-up. The Mission encourages the MOE to systematize this type of follow-up to maximize the potential of the inspections to improve the quality of teaching and learning. This may require a more clearly defined and articulated strategic relationship

between the NEI, JTC and DSS. (b) Although the cadre of inspectors has been doubled (from 76 to 150 in six months), the NEI still requires additional staff inspectors to ensure faster turnaround of the inspection reports to the schools.

11. Jamaica Teaching Council (JTC): A consulting firm, BMAK, was hired to develop the web portal that will support the teacher registration and licensing systems, a database on teacher qualifications (critical for professional development planning), a virtual library (also to support professional development of teachers), and a blog to allow for communication between teachers and with teachers and the JTC. BMAK is very active and work is progressing quickly. It is expected that the system should be operational by December 2011.
12. The JTC distributed some 30,000 copies of the *Professional Standards for Educators in Jamaica* to regional offices and individual schools across the country. This will guide the licensing process. Teachers and principals have been invited to offer feedback. The JTC has accelerated teacher professional development, offering more targeted, information-driven teacher training. Much of the training happens through the QECs. The JTC has also added annual awards and rewards to provide professional incentives and has developed an in-service programme for new principals. The JTC is engaged in ongoing work with the teacher training institutes to upgrade the knowledge of lecturers in order to improve the level of training to new teachers.
13. The legislation for the JTC is still pending. The documents required for official drafting of were submitted to the Chief Parliamentary Council in 2009. The Mission expressed concern regarding the length of the process, especially given that approved legislation is required to give legal authority to the JTC to license teachers. This is a DLT for this Project and is also tied to a DLT for the Jamaica Early Childhood Development Project.
14. The conceptual framework for the National College for Education Leadership (NCEL) has been finalized and approved, and the new Director/Principal should be hired by mid-July 2011. The Director/Principal's initial focus will be to set up the NCEL and organize the programmes.
15. *Recommendation*: The Mission commends the MOE's initiative to seek to hire someone to assist the CPC with drafting of the legislation for the JTC. This and other strategies should be pursued to accelerate this process.
16. Department of School Services (DSS), formerly referred to as Regional Education Entities (REEs)/ Regional Education Authorities (REAs): The operation of the regional entities, as they were envisioned through the REEs/REAs, were not deemed feasible to carry out the objectives of the ESTP. It looked at the existing regional structure and proposed that the REEs/REAs function as autonomous bodies. However, it was important to have a coordination of the separate entities. The MOE reviewed several different options and decided to develop a Department within the MOE, with a head office at the central level and regional branch offices. Work has advanced significantly through the piloting in Regions 1 and 2, and approval was recently granted to include Region 3. An interim arrangement has been developed for the operation of the DSS, but its implementation depends on approval

from Cabinet, followed by “affirmative resolution” from Parliament. The process of operationalizing the DSS is ongoing. Roles and functions are being defined, and the governance arrangement is being finalized.

17. Once Cabinet approval has been received for the operation of the DSS, the MOE will work in an interim arrangement pending the transitioning of staff from the current structure into a central policy ministry, the DSS and other newly formed agencies (JTC, NEI, and NET). The work in Regions 1, 2 and 3 will focus, during the first year, on institutionalizing the School Improvement planning process (currently required but not practiced). The regional structure being developed under the DSS will support its implementation. A manual is being developed for the SIP, using the manual developed under the Bank-financed ROSE II Project and two other similar programmes.
18. *Recommendation:* (a) The Ministry’s work to draw the lines of responsibility between the central policy functions of the Ministry and the operational work of the regions through the DSS is critical at this stage. The MOE has sought to engage ATOS to assist with this work; they should be back on board by early July. Clarity must be achieved quickly in this area to proceed effectively, and communication regarding the changes should be prioritized.
19. National Education Trust (NET): The Board has approved the structure for the NET. Following this, all the senior job descriptions were prepared and submitted to the MOFPS where they are awaiting classification. There are no confirmed positions, but the interim CEO is in place and the MOE is moving rapidly to formalize the interim arrangements. The NET’s structure is fully autonomous and has received its own line-item budget from the MOFPS for FY2011-12. The NET’s operations still focus on construction of the two schools funded by the IDB. The contractors have been identified through an internationally competitive bid, and works should begin within the next few months. In the meantime, work is moving ahead to identify land for the first cluster of 10 new schools, pending Cabinet approval for a special programme to identify financing.
20. The GOJ, with grant resources from the IDB, has hired a firm to assist with the formulation of a PPP umbrella organization to legalize and regulate PPPs for different sectors. The NET has expressed interest in being the lead participant for the programme implementation. The CEO of the NET has received training on PPPs from the World Bank (held in Barbados in December 2009) and the IDB (held in Chile in November 2010), as well as a local PPP training seminar. He found all training to be especially worthwhile, as it used different industries and examples that were very relevant to the Caribbean region. USAID contracted the tax consultant to support management of PPPs through identification and lobbying for tax incentives (local and international) to encourage “gifting” and endowment of the NET. The first report has been submitted by the consultant and is being reviewed. Preparation of terms of reference is underway to engage a marketing consultant, to be financed through the World Bank loan, and the NET hopes to identify and contract a firm within this fiscal year.
21. There are DLTs tied to the work of the NET for each year of the Project. By November 2010, the NET had been formally established (incorporated as a Limited Liability Company). The operational plan is being prepared and should be finalized by November 2011. The training

of staff and initiation of the international marketing plan (DLTs for 2012 and 2013) are likely to happen ahead of schedule. The main challenges to the NET are the tax legislation and the IMF agreement, which may affect the PPPs and hence the infrastructure build-out.

22. **Communications:** The team developed a communications plan that covers internal and external communications and focuses on all aspects of the modernization and transformation process. Specific aspects highlight the role of the different agencies (NEI, JTC, DSS, and Modernization) to educate the general public and to facilitate the internal human resource changes that are ongoing. The team is also supporting the consultations for the National Education Strategic Plan (2011-2020), which is being undertaken by the National Council on Education (NCE). The external aspect of the communications has intensified, with informational meetings with community and teachers' colleges, as well as radio interviews with the Minister and ESTP Director. The feedback that comes out of the face-to-face meetings has helped to better define the content and communications strategy. For internal communications, some 35 Change Champions were identified. They provide updates on the process to staff and facilitate feedback in both directions (staff-management). The Change Champions meet monthly with the Permanent Secretary to share information and feedback. The staff suggestion boxes are placed throughout the MOE, although feedback has been sparse due to trust issues; lack of trust of management came out strongly in the Culture Change Survey (2009) and follow-up focus group sessions. As such, communications is also focusing on dispelling some of the negative perceptions of the modernization process. Finally, internal and external newsletters are being produced.
23. The Mission was informed that the MOE does not intend to renew the contracts for the two communications specialists working with the ESTP's Change Management Unit (CMU). At the time of the mission, one had already left and the other is scheduled to depart in early July. This is of grave concern, since the success of the ESTP and the modernization process require specialized attention, and the MOE's team is fully engaged with its day-to-day operational functions. Although the MOE's effort to rationalize the communications functions is laudable from a sustainability perspective, the timing seems inopportune, given the projected intensification of HR changes tied to the modernization process.
24. **Monitoring & Evaluation:** The Programme Monitoring & Evaluation Unit (PM&EU) within the Ministry continues to conduct formative evaluation of the NEI inspections on a random sampling of schools being inspected. The unit has begun planning for formative evaluation of the implementation of the QEC concept, as well as the training programmes to be undertaken by the JTC and future NEI Inspector training. An international firm was hired to carry out the Process Monitoring and is working closely with the PM&EU in the conduct of this evaluation. They have already undertaken the first of three process monitoring visits.

### ***Reporting Requirements***

25. The ESTP's CMU submitted to the Bank the Semestral Report, as stipulated in the Loan Agreement. This very comprehensive Report includes sections on the Status of Project Administration, Progress of Execution, Project Financing, Contractual Clause Compliance,

and a Risk Analysis. The GOJ expressed interest in preparing a joint report addressing both WB and IDB-funded activities.

### ***Financial Management Issues***

26. Overall, the CMU has established a good financial management system which is performing satisfactorily. The financial management capacity of the CMU has improved. The overall internal control environment is good. No transaction review was conducted during the Mission. A detailed review of the expenditures and the accounting system would be conducted during the next financial management supervision of the Project. The Mission was pleased to learn that the CMU has been granted access to Client Connection. This should facilitate submission of withdrawal applications for loan advances and close oversight of ongoing procurement processes.
27. Interim Financial Reports (IFRs). The GOJ and the Bank agreed to a revised format of the IFRs, which was reflected in a Revised Disbursement Letter dated 10 January 2011. The CMU submitted the IFRs for the quarter ended 31 March 2011, three weeks late. The IFRs are of acceptable quality. Going forward, the IFRs should be sent in a timely manner to comply with the requirements of the Loan Agreement.
28. Disbursements. The Bank has disbursed US\$3.54 million under the project representing about 22.13 percent of the project funds. There was a balance of US\$832,510 in the Designated Account (DA) as on 31 March 2011. The CMU reported US\$4.30 million as the total program expenditures as on 31 March 2011, which includes Bank-financed expenditures of US\$1.70 million and US\$2.60 million financed by the Government of Jamaica. The break-down of expenditures are as follows (figures in USD000's):

<b>Components</b>	<b>IBRD</b>	<b>GOJ</b>	<b>Total</b>
Enhanced Performance Accountability	682.55	2,256.11	2,938.66
Mobilization of Resources to National Education Trust	-	302.78	302.78
Communications, Project Management, M&E, and Retroactive Financing	983.28	39.15	1022.43
Front end fee	40	-	40.00
<b>Total USD 000's</b>	<b>1,705.83</b>	<b>2598.03</b>	<b>4,303.87</b>

29. External Audit: The accounts of the project are being audited by the Auditor General of Jamaica. The Bank agreed to the preparation of one audit report covering the entire ESTP, which includes the funds provided by the World Bank, IDB and the Government of Jamaica. This should make the audit more cost-effective and simplified. The audit is being conducted using the audit terms of reference prepared by the World Bank and IDB and acceptable auditing standards, such as, International Standards on Auditing and INTOSAI auditing standards. The annual audit report for FY2010-11 is due by 31 July 2011.



***Procurement Issues:***

30. The Mission's discussions focused on a specific procurement process, that of the contracting of a firm for software for the NEI. It appears that the bid was not advertised internationally. There were also lengthy delays in the review of the proposals such that at the time of presentation of the evaluation report, the bids were no longer valid. A decision was made during the mission to cancel the process and re-tender. It should be advertised in the Development Business. The minimum time required for advertising for ICB is 45 days, but the Bank would consider an exception to as few as 21 days. The CMU indicated that it would prefer 30 days. The CMU will reinitiate the process immediately and requests assistance from the Bank to expedite the process, since training and finalization of the *Handbook for Inspectors* hinge on the purchase of the software.

***Next Steps***

31. The following actions were agreed upon:
- The CMU will resubmit the bidding documents for the purchase of software for the NEI and will advertise in the Development Business.
  - The CMU will submit to the Bank the external audit report no later than 31 July 2011.
  - The next supervision mission will take place in approximately six months.

Jamaica, 17 June 2011

---

Audrey V. Sewell  
Permanent Secretary  
Ministry of Education

---

Cynthia Hobbs  
Senior Education Specialist  
World Bank

---

Barbara Scott  
Director  
External Cooperation Management Division  
Planning Institute of Jamaica

---

Darlene Morrison  
Deputy Financial Secretary  
Ministry of Finance and the Public  
Service

**JAMAICA**  
**Education Transformation Capacity Building Project**  
**Supervision Mission, 13-17 June 2011**

Name	Title
<b><i>Ministry of Education</i></b>	
Audrey V. Sewell	Permanent Secretary
Grace McLean	Chief Education Officer
Barbara Allen	Senior Director, Planning and Development Division
Jacinth Gordon Brown	Director, Project Management
Jean Hastings	Director, Education Transformation Programme (ESTP)
Winsome Gordon	Head, Jamaica Teaching Council (JTC)
Maureen Dwyer	Deputy Chief Inspector, NEI
Diann Campbell	Senior Director, Human Resource Management and Administration
Paul Matalon	CEO, National Education Trust
Alton Davis	Communications Specialist
Judith Sayle	Financial Manager, ESTP
Andre Henry	Procurement Manager, ESTP
Orphia Fennell	Project Assistant, ESTP
<b><i>Ministry of Finance and the Public Service</i></b>	
Darlene Morrison	Deputy Financial Secretary, Economic Management Division
Nadine James	Director, Loan Administration
<b><i>Planning Institute of Jamaica</i></b>	
Barbara Scott	Director, External Cooperation Management Division
Steven Kerr	Education Specialist, Social Policy, Planning and Research Division
Saskia Frater-Smith	Project Economist, External Cooperation Management Division
<b><i>World Bank Mission Team</i></b>	
Cynthia Hobbs	Senior Education Specialist
Althea Spence	Operations Analyst
Mozammal Hoque	Senior Financial Management Specialist
Yao Wottor	Senior Procurement Specialist