



Report No: ACS18643

Islamic Republic of Pakistan

Strengthening Sector Decision Making through Water and Sanitation Service Delivery Assessments in Pakistan

{enter report sub-title here}

{enter report date here}

GWASS
SOUTH ASIA



Standard Disclaimer:

This volume is a product of the staff of the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/ The World Bank. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this paper do not necessarily reflect the views of the Executive Directors of The World Bank or the governments they represent. The World Bank does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this work. The boundaries, colors, denominations, and other information shown on any map in this work do not imply any judgment on the part of The World Bank concerning the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

Copyright Statement:

The material in this publication is copyrighted. Copying and/or transmitting portions or all of this work without permission may be a violation of applicable law. The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/ The World Bank encourages dissemination of its work and will normally grant permission to reproduce portions of the work promptly.

For permission to photocopy or reprint any part of this work, please send a request with complete information to the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA, telephone 978-750-8400, fax 978-750-4470, <http://www.copyright.com/>.



All other queries on rights and licenses, including subsidiary rights, should be addressed to the Office of the Publisher, The World Bank, 1818 H Street NW, Washington, DC 20433, USA, fax 202-522-2422, e-mail pubrights@worldbank.org.

Completion Summary

Pakistan

Strengthening Sector Decision Making through Water and Sanitation Service Delive

Created by Mohammad Farhanullah Sami on 06-Jun-2016

Last modified by Mohammad Farhanullah Sami on 06-Jun-2016

Form Status: DRAFT

Basic Information

Title	Strengthening Sector Decision Making through Water and Sanitation Service Delive						
Product Line	Technical Assistance (Non-lending)		Country, Region or Global	Pakistan	Task Team Leader(s)	Mohammad Farhanullah Sami	
Legal Name	Strengthening Sector Decision Making through Water and Sanitation Service Delivery Assessments in Pakistan		Report/Output Types	IAR-Advisory Services Document	Practice Manager/Manager	Soma Ghosh Moulik	
Responsible CC (e.g. OPCDR)	GWASS (7183)	Requesting CC (e.g. OPCDR)	SACPK (0000001539)	Completion Fiscal Year	2016	Status	Active
Audience			Reimbursable Advisory Services	No			
Parent GPP	Water and Sanitation Program	Associate Activity/Task				Final Output Report No	ACS18643

Activity Performance

Development Objective

The development objective of this TA is to improve decision making of the provincial government clients towards improved access and quality of water supply, sanitation, and hygiene services for all, including the poor, by identifying, recognizing and addressing service delivery bottlenecks and enable the poor to get improved and sustainable WASH services.

Overall Development Objective

	Rating	Explanation
Overall Development Objective	8-Effective	

Intermediate Outcome(s)

Intermediate Outcome	Rating	Explanation
Policy/strategy informed	8-Effective	<p>In Punjab an Action Committee was notified to follow up on the strategic recommendations of the SDA.</p> <p>The Sindh Sanitation Strategy currently being revised is also being informed by the findings of the SDA.</p> <p>In both Punjab and Sindh there was a heightened emphasis on the rural sanitation sector which the SDAs contributed to, given the severe weaknesses highlighted in this sector in the SDAs.</p> <p>In both Punjab and Sindh the "visual" tools of the SDA served to highlight in a powerful manner the severe structural weaknesses in service delivery pathways. This led to the notification of a committee to follow up recommendations. In the</p>

		<p>absence of a sector MIS, the SDAs served to collate information which had been dispersed, and bring a new awareness of the key issues.</p> <p>The analysis of institutional structures, financing and technical weaknesses, will also serve as the foundation of the new global research as part of the WASH poverty diagnostic.</p>
--	--	---

Indicator(s)	Rating
Government policy/strategy informed	8-Effective
Public debate stimulated/initiated	7-Moderately Effective
Contributed to stakeholder involvement	8-Effective
Dev't community/partner policy/strategy informed	9-Very Effective
Bank country strategy informed	7-Moderately Effective
Bank sector strategy informed	9-Very Effective

Intermediate Outcome	Rating	Explanation
Client capacity increased	8-Effective	<p>Based on the recommendations for Punjab, a new emphasis was accorded to rural sanitation with a new program emerging using CLTS based approaches to scale up sanitation.</p> <p>In Sindh the SDA highlighted severe weaknesses in the rural sanitation sector. This contributed to the development of new investments with innovative cross sectoral approaches to nutrition, sanitation and agriculture, and which scale up existing efforts in sanitation i.e. the Saaf Suthro Sindh initiative.</p> <p>The SDAs highlighted the shortcomings of existing approaches to rural sanitation. This has contributed to the development of a new generation of programming, which incorporates a multi-sectoral approach, and combines different mechanisms to scale up sanitation efforts. This is embodied in both the Punjab programs and the SSS in Sindh</p>

Indicator(s)	Rating
Design capacity strengthened	7-Moderately Effective
Implementation capacity strengthened	7-Moderately Effective
Monitoring & Evaluation capacity increased	9-Very Effective

Risks to Achieve Objective

Please rate and describe the principal risks to achieve the development objective within the time period envisaged and how they can be mitigated. Does the team seek any specific guidance?	Risk Rating	Explanation
	Moderate	1. Sector activities are spread across a broad range of agencies/departments. It will remain challenging to garner consensus across this fragmented group of

stakeholders and further to ensure that the recommendations are adopted through the sector and not just select actors. This risk will be mitigated to some extent by the adoption of a steering committee that spans the various stakeholders and is convened by the Planning and Development Departments of provincial governments which is cross-sectoral. Further, the stakeholder dialogues will be central, and will attempt to ensure that departments understand the value the SDA will add to their existing decision making processes, and how it can be effective in better utilizing existing and leveraging additional financing.

2. There is a consensus that there are severe data limitations in the context of Pakistan. Given that the SDA is based on secondary sources, this may constrain the exercise, especially since water and sanitation is mainly financed through local government budgets whose budget and expense details are not consolidated at the provincial level. In this context, it will be quite a challenge to compile financial data. To an extent the identification of data limitations and consensus on these will in itself be an important finding and learning outcome of the SDA process. It will highlight to provincial governments that there are key indicators which do require monitoring, and should feed into the design of new monitoring systems as a key sector requirement.

Bank Performance

Areas to be rated	Rating
Overall Bank Performance	8-Effective
Strategic Relevance & Ownership	8-Effective
Technical Quality	7-Moderately Effective
Client Engagement/Dissemination	9-Very Effective
Timeliness	9-Very Effective

Comments

The TA/ studies analyze sector bottlenecks in each sub-sector, and determine which specific weaknesses in the service delivery pathway are hampering the translation of investments into outcomes. They provide an overview of the range of service delivery approaches taken by specific provinces/ regions and how these translate (or not) to sector outcomes. A key component is the dialogue with sector agencies and governments during this analysis, to ensure an understanding of these issues, and how addressing these can result in more efficient and effective use of finances and sustainable services. Ultimately, the SDAs contribute to the attainment of sector goals and MDGs/SDGs.

In the absence of any concrete sectoral analysis and estimation of financial needs to 'enable a well functioning sector', SDAs serve as the principle tool for decision making within the government planning and design for water and sanitation sector. Special task forces have been constituted in each provincial government to assess and implement the recommendations of the report. The report has been highly beneficial to design Bank Operations such as Multi-Sectoral Action for Nutrition - P158769 and also helps the government to design sectoral projects such as the PKR 400 million PATS program addressing open defecation in Punjab. The data and analysis of the SDA have been instrumental to conduct the WASH Poverty Diagnostic at provincial level (P150794) especially the institutional analysis and political economy analysis.

Budget and Funding (Amount in USD)

Resources	Bank Budget	Bank-executed Trust	Other	Total
-----------	-------------	---------------------	-------	-------

		Fund		
Total estimated at Concept	0.00	675,325.00	0.00	675,325.00
Total Actual	0.00	327,884.40	0.00	327,884.40

Duration of Activity/Program

Concept Approval to Today's date 487 days

Management Endorsement of Delivery to Today's date 8 days

Milestone	Original	Actual
AIS Sign-off	17-Oct-2012	23-Oct-2012
Concept Review	30-Oct-2014	29-Jan-2015
Management Approval of Concept *	06-Feb-2015	05-Feb-2015
Decision Review	03-Mar-2016	20-May-2016
Management Endorsement of Deliverable *	10-Mar-2016	29-May-2016
Deliver Output to Client/Stakeholders	15-Mar-2016	02-Jun-2016
Final Delivery/Completion Summary *	31-Mar-2016	

Lessons Learned/Next Steps

1. Major Findings and Lessons Learned

There were some important lessons which have emerged during the SDA processes. These lessons have informed each subsequent SDA.

- i) It was challenging to induce interest in a study with no assurance of follow-on investments. It would be useful to sequence the SDA as part of a dialogue or preparation for future investments.
- ii) Client ownership and lead of the SDA is critical; in Pakistan the role of the Steering Committee and on a day to day basis, a technical "sub-committee" ensured "buy in" to the findings. While consultants can lead technically, several rounds of consultation and consistent engagement in developing technical findings and recommendations is key.
- iii) It is useful for a coordinating ministry to house the SDA exercise- in this case this was the Planning and Development departments.
- iv) Where secondary data alone is being used governments were skeptical of the utility of the exercise in introducing any new findings or thinking. It was difficult initially to get "buy-in" where no surveys or primary data collection was being undertaken. However, the analytical tools used (scorecard and access and financial projections), presented findings in a visual manner which encouraged sector dialogue and brought key constraining factors in the sector to the fore.
- v) In a data scarce environment, it may be useful to allow time and resources for some primary data collection as part of the SDA exercise, particularly in relation to critical financial data.
- vi) It would be useful to broaden the stakeholders involved to engage with other sectors such as education, health, agriculture and nutrition, as part of the exercise.
- vii) Agreement on mechanisms for follow up could usefully be built into the SDA process at an early stage.

2. Next Steps (Describe expected follow-up)

One of the key issues in relation to the SDAs is ensuring that these do not remain as static "one-off" exercises, and the findings and recommendations feed into future investments and sector reform. One way of ensuring this is, as mentioned in the key lessons, sequencing these as part of an on-going sector dialogue, and using the findings as an essential part of sector dialogue, not just by the Bank but by the range of donor agencies. This will require certain actions both on the part of the Bank and the governments involved.

- i. As part of the dialogue during the SDA, there should be an emphasis on forming an institutional vehicle for follow-up. This could comprise an official "committee" which could take the lead in following up on recommendations and engaging with donors. This was the case in the Punjab following the Punjab SDA, and there needs to be on-going dialogue with the Government of Sindh, KP and FATA for similar mechanisms.
- ii. The findings and recommendations of the SDAs need to be more widely disseminated. While findings have been shared with high level government officials as part of the Steering Committee overseeing the process, these need to be more widely disseminated both within government and across the range of sector stakeholders.

- iii. Sector donors need to be engaged with in discussing the findings of the SDA, so that these can inform future investments. The findings should be discussed within the WB to allow future sector work to be informed by these, and to make a case for new investments- a core need identified in the SDAs.
- iv. Updating the SDA, particularly in relation to the financial projections will be important on an annual or bi-annual basis.

Client Ownership

Did the client ask for this activity?

Yes

Did the client agree to the concept/scope/design?

Yes

Did the client participate in carrying out the activity?

Yes

Did client help finance the activity?

No

Comments

The Client asked for this activity and constituted a high - powered Steering Committee to oversee and approve the SDA. The Client further notified a Sectoral Committee involving all the relevant government departments to provide input to formulate the results of this study. These departments included Local Government, public health Engineering, Finance, City Government, District Government, Urban Unit and Urban Utilities.

Activity and Client Contact Information

Activity title (Edit if needed to make the title recognizable to any clients identified below.)

Supporting poor inclusive WSS Sector reform - strengthen sector decision making through water and sanitation service delivery assessments (SDAs)

Organization Name

Local Government Department, Government of Sindh

Organization Role

Organization Type

Country

Activity Core Team Member

Subnational/Local Government

Pakistan

First Name

Last Name

Title

Faheem

Junejo

Director

Preferred Language

Phone

Primary Email

English

923422277338

fmjunejo2000@hotmail.com

Include in Client Feedback Survey?

Yes

If the activity title provided above (just under the "Activity and Client Contact Information" bar) would be recognized by this client, please leave blank. Otherwise, provide an activity/output title recognizable to this client.

Organization Name

Planning and Development Department, Government of Punjab

Organization Role

Organization Type

Country

Subnational/Local Government

Pakistan

First Name	Last Name	Title
Salman	Yusuf	Deputy Secretary
Preferred Language	Phone	Primary Email
English	923644805985	salyusuf@hotmail.com

Include in Client Feedback Survey?

Yes

If the activity title provided above (just under the "Activity and Client Contact Information" bar) would be recognized by this client, please leave blank. Otherwise, provide an activity/output title recognizable to this client.

Partners

Were there one or more partners who are either funding this activity or contributing expertise?

No

Partners

Organization Name	Type	Contact	Title	Office Phone	Email
-------------------	------	---------	-------	--------------	-------

Is this a joint work with IFC? No

Practice Area Mapping

Practice Area (Lead)

Water

Contributing Practice Areas

Cross Cutting Topics

Cross Cutting Topics

- Climate Change
- Fragile, Conflict & Violence
- Gender
- Jobs
- Public Private Partnership

Sectors

Sector (Maximum 5 and total % must equal 100)

Major Sector	Sector	%
Water, sanitation and flood protection	Sanitation	50
Water, sanitation and flood protection	Water supply	50
Total		100

Themes

Theme (Maximum 5 and total % must equal 100)

Major Theme	Theme	%
Public sector governance	Decentralization	25
Public sector governance	Other public sector governance	20
Public sector governance	Managing for development results	45
Public sector governance	e-Government	10
Total		100

Climate Change

Did the activity address adaptation, mitigation or both through:

	Adaptation	Mitigation	Explanation
Diagnostic and Policy Advice	Yes	No	The tools of the study subscribe to policy and strategy that is climate friendly. It is an overarching solution for the sector including all strategic and cross-cutting aspects.
Tools and Data	Yes	No	The tools look into technology solution that are climate friendly such as water conservation, pollution control technologies for waste management and toilet construction in communities.
Knowledge Management	Yes	No	The propagated knowledge is dove-tailed with the latest climate knowledge and provides options to cater climate and disasters customized to specific environment.

Gender Tag

Does the activity include gender in any of the three dimensions listed below? Please select Yes or No for each:

Analysis and/or consultation on gender related issues

Yes

Specific actions to address the distinct needs of women and girls, or men and boys, or positive impacts on gender gaps

No

Mechanisms to monitor gender impact to facilitate gender-disaggregated analysis

No